

AFRICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK GROUP



**STATUS OF PROJECT COMPLETION REPORTS (PCR)
ARREARS AS AT 30 SEPTEMBER 1997**

**OPERATIONS EVALUATION DEPARTMENT
(OPEV)**

11 March 1998

STATUS OF PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT (PCR) ARREARS
AS AT 30 SEPTEMBER 1997

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
1. <u>Introduction</u>	1
2. <u>Analysis of the status of PCR arrears as at 30/9/97</u>	2
3. <u>Conclusion</u>	5
4. <u>Recommendations</u>	5

Annexes

- Annex 1: Breakdown of projects without PCR by department, sector and approval period as at 30/09/97
- Annex 2 : Breakdown of projects without PCR by department, cause of arrears and period of approval as at 30/09/97
- Annex 3 : PCR preparation procedures : Borrower's contribution

STATUS OF PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT (PCR)¹ ARREARS
AS AT 30 SEPTEMBER 1997

1. **Introduction**

1.1 According to the guidelines* of the Bank, the Project Completion Report (PCR) represents the final report on project implementation and therefore the last stage of supervision. It also constitutes the basis for the preparation of project evaluation reports (PER) and impact assessments and for the evaluation of the project portfolio quality. The principal objectives of the PCR are to :

- (i) **certify that project implementation is completed;**
- (ii) **give a detailed description of all the components of the project at its completion; including all the important recovery measures to be taken or applied by the borrower/executing agency or the Bank;**
- (iii) **assess the project, results, the efficiency and return of the resources used to achieve them;**
- (iv) **reassess the contribution of the project to development as well as its viability;**
- (v) **provide a self-evaluation mechanism by the operations departments and the Borrower with a view to enhancing the quality of future projects;**
- (vi) **from the operational standpoint, identify lessons that are or could be useful for on-going or future operations of the Bank or the Borrower;**

1.2 The completion report should be prepared within six months of the project/programme completion. In practice, difficulties subsist in the application of this guideline owing to the requirement that the completion report prepared by the Borrower or its executing agency should be obtained prior to the preparation of the PCR by Bank staff. To ensure that this report is submitted on schedule by the Borrower, the Bank's second last supervision mission should lend him assistance and give the necessary indications. Moreover, the completion date is not explicitly linked to the closing date of the loan³. Other difficulties subsist in the absence of specific indications as to the authorized number of extensions of the closing date of the loans, or in the event of suspension of the projects over a protracted period.

1.3 Under the current procedures, the project officers (Task Managers) are the best placed to observe the completion of the project during the full physical implementation of the major project components and to initiate the preparation process of the PCRs, whatever the utilization rate of the loan resources.

¹ This document was submitted to the Country Operations and Central Operations Departments for observations and comments which were on the whole taken into account and incorporated in the present document.

² Operations Manual: Chapter 8 ; Section 8.7 (February 1995)

³ Only reference is made to operations/programmes in support of reforms the PCR of which should be prepared within the six months of the disbursement date of the last tranche.

- 1.4 Arrears in the production of **PCRs**, as pointed out in the report of the Task Force on project quality (April 1994) reached the level of 220 projects and programmes as at 31/12/1993. Board decisions were taken to implement the **recommendations** of the working group according to which «The backlog of overdue completion reports should be eliminated by the end of 1997. Given the size of the task, the lack of data and the limited value of older projects, the task force suggests that all projects initiated after 1982 be covered and that earlier projects be forgiven,».
- 1.5 From 1st January 1994 to 30 September 1997, 172 **PCRs** were submitted to the Boards or OPEV for information (in the original language) by the operations departments, and about 35 **PCRs** were in the process of finalization as at 30/09/97.
- 1.6 At the 3 October 1997 meeting of the Operations Committee and Development Effectiveness (CODE), OPEV was asked to collect the statistics on PCR preparation by the operations departments during 1997.

2. **Analysis of the Status of PCR arrears as at 30 September 1997**

- 2.1 To grasp the level of PCR arrears, and out of a concern for exhaustiveness, two criteria were applied :
- (i) Inventory in the Country Operations Departments of projects declared completed during 1995, 1996 and 1997 whose **PCRs** had not been prepared as at 30/09/97 ;
- (ii) Determining of projects whose loan amounts had been disbursed to the tune of 99 % as at 30/09/97 and whose **PCRs** had not been prepared.

Annex 1 gives a breakdown of the projects without PCR by Country Operations Department, by sector and by approval period.

- 2.2 A list of 164 projects⁴ (corresponding to 170 loans) meeting the criteria defined above was obtained. The projects are divided by sector and approval period as follows:

⁴ Certain projects group one or several loans

Table1 : Breakdown of projects without PCR by sector and approval period as 30/09/97

Approval period	Agriculture & Rural Dev.	Education & Health	Industry	Energy	Transport & Telecom.	Water & Sanitation	Multisector.	Total
1982-1986	30	9	9	1	28	7		84
1987-1991	13	8	6	4	14	8	9	62
1992-1995	6		3		2		7	18
Total	49	17	18	5	44	15	16	164

According to this table, 51% (i.e. 84 projects) fall under projects approved during the period 1982-1986, 38% (i.e. 62 projects) during the period 1987-1991 and only 11% (i.e. 18 projects) during the period 1992-1995. Of these projects, 30% (i.e. 49 projects) go to agriculture and rural development, 27% (i.e. 44 projects) to telecommunications and transport and 43% (i.e. 71 projects) to the other sectors (Education and health, Industry, Energy, Water and Sanitation, and Multisectors). Over the period 1982-1986, 36% (or 30 projects) belonged to Agriculture and Rural Development, 33 % (or 28 projects) to Telecommunications and Transport and 3 1% (or 26 projects) to the other sectors (Education and Health, Industry, Energy, Water and Sanitation).

2.3 The breakdown of projects without PCR by operational department and by approval period is as follows :

Table 2 : Breakdown of projects without PCR by Department and by approval period as at 30/09/97

Period Approved .	OCDW	OCDS	OCDE	OCDC	OCDN	OPSD	Total
1982-1986	37	10	15	11	11		84
1987-1991	27	3	13	4	15		62
1992-1995	4	2	3	3	4	2	18
Total	68	15	31	18	30 ⁵	2	164

According to this Table, the West Region has 42% (i.e. 68 projects) of all the projects without PCR, the East Region 19% (i.e. 31 projects), the North Region, 18% (or 30 projects), and the Central and South Regions 21% (or 34 projects). Only two (2) of the projects belong to the Private Sector Department. The breakdown of

⁵ The PCRs of six (6) of these projects were transmitted to OPEV at a date after 30/09/97

projects without PCR by approval period shows that the West Region counts 44 % (i.e. 37 projects) of the projects approved during the 1982-1986 period, 44 % (i.e. 27 projects) of those approved during the 1987-1991 period, and 22 % (i.e. 4 projects) of those without PCR approved during the period 1992-1995.

- 2.4 The review of projects without PCR by year of approval and cause of arrears (Breakdown of projects by cause of arrears, by department and approval period is given in Annex 2), shows that projects implemented in countries currently in conflict (Somalia, Liberia, Sudan) or highly insecure (Burundi) represent 8 % (i.e. 13 projects) of the total projects without PCR. PCRs which were in the process of finalization in 1997 (35 in number) represent 21 % of the total, those programmed in 1998 represent 26 % (i.e. 43 projects). Can also be noted the small percentage of projects the PCRs of which were not submitted by the Borrowers (7 projects). Nevertheless, more than 30 % (i.e. 49 projects) are currently in arrears for various reasons, namely non-availability of data, or the projects are still active notwithstanding the high disbursement ratio.
- 2.5 Thirteen percent (13 %) of the projects approved during the 1982-1986 period (i.e. 11 projects) fall under the case of countries in conflict, and only 7 % (i.e. 6 projects) fall under the case of projects whose PCRs were not submitted by the borrowing institutions. PCRs nearing completion in 1997 or programmed for 1998 represent 33% (i.e. 28 projects), 42 % (i.e. 35 projects) are currently in arrears whereas among the projects approved from 1987, only 2 projects belong to countries in conflict, there was no PCR on only one project and the PCRs nearing completion or programmed for 1998 represent 68 % of the cases (i.e. 50 projects). Finally, it should be pointed out that the loan balance of 17 projects (i.e. 10 % of the cases) was cancelled⁶ or reallocated but there was no PCR on them.

2.6 The breakdown according to these criteria is given in the following Table :

Table 3 : Breakdown of projects without PCR by approval period and cause of arrears as at 30/09/97

Year approved.	Countries in conflict or state of insecurity	Borrower's PCR not submitted	PCR nearing finalization (1997)	PCR programmed in 1998	Loan balance cancelled	Other arrears	Total
1982-1986	11	6	9	19	4	35	84
1987-1991	1	1	21	20	11	8	62
1992-1995	1	-	5	4	2	6	18
Total	13	7	35	43	17	49	164

⁶ The current guidelines on the cancellation or utilization of loan balance are not clear on the necessity to prepare the PCR of projects ((suspended or restructure)) but whose unused loan balance is reallocated or cancelled.

3. Conclusion

- 3.1 Considerable efforts have been made by the operations departments to mop up PCR arrears for good. As at 30/09/97, these arrears were on 164 projects 84 of which were approved during the period 1982-1986. Out of this total number of arrears, 35 (i.e. 21%) were being finalized in 1997⁷, 43 (i.e. 26%) were programmed for 1998, 13 projects (or 8%) were located in countries in conflict and the loan balance of 17 projects (i.e. 10%) was cancelled. There were no PCRs on the remainder, i.e. 56 projects (34 %) for various causes of delay. Consequently, there was no reduction in the volume of these arrears, especially with regard to projects approved during the period 1982-1986. At the sectoral level, the PCR arrears are in the agricultural and transport sectors which constitute the bulk of Bank Group portfolio.
- 3.2 Therefore, other efforts will have to be made to limit the pending PCRs to their minimal level.

4. Recommendations

- 4.1 In view of the limited value, in terms of the lessons to be drawn, of the projects approved during the 1982-1986 period, and of the almost lack of data on these projects, limit the preparation of PCRs to projects approved from 1987, on which the operational departments should concentrate. The application of this recommendation would reduce the overall level of arrears by 51% .
- 4.2 Set up an ad-hoc task force comprising the representatives of the operational departments concerned and the Central Operations department (OCOD) in order to review, on the basis of data available at the headquarters, projects approved during the period 1982-1986 on which there were no PCRs. An operational link should be established between these projects and the priority operational sectors selected under the country strategy paper (CSP) approved by the Bank.
- 4.3 Specify, within the framework of the new guidelines for the preparation of PCRs by Bank staff⁸, that PCRs should be prepared within the six months following the last loan closing date. The limitation of the number of extensions of the loan closing date should also be specified in the guidelines for loan utilization. Furthermore, the specific procedures for preparing PCRs should be followed for projects suspended over a protracted period or whose loan balance has been cancelled or reallocated under the country portfolio restructuring.
- 4.4 Monitor, in the operations departments, the actual completed projects/PCRs coverage ratio (number of PCRs produced during the year over the number of projects whose

⁷ The PCRs of ten or so of these projects were transmitted to OPEV (in the original language) during the period of 01/10/97 to 15/02/98. Only three (3) PCRs were transmitted to the Boards for information.

⁸ This recommendation has right now been taken into account in the draft Operations Manual of 30/09/97 (Chapter 8, Section 8.7) which is being finalized by OCOD.

loan closing date falls in the same year and therefore necessitates the preparation of the PCR)⁹. This ratio should, to the extent possible, be close to 100 %.

- 4.5 Involve the borrowers and their executing agencies more in the preparation of the PCR by Bank staff, notably for those that do not have adequate capabilities for preparing good quality PCR. Their contribution would consist in evaluating the implementation performance and the technical, economic, financial, social and environmental achievements as well as assessing the role of the various parties involved in the implementation of the project. The Bank's requirement for the production of a separate completion report by the Borrower could be specifically fulfilled by this contribution. The contribution (separate PCR or performance evaluation) should be annexed to the PCR prepared by Bank staff (see matrix in Annex 3).
- 4.6 Include, in the preparation of the completion report by Bank staff, a « prospective » evaluation by assessing the institutional arrangements during the operating phase of projects (for the commissioning of the facilities and installations put up) and the long-term viability of the projects completed.
- 4.7 Draw up integrated guidelines for the preparation of completion reports as well as the performance evaluation (PER) of projects falling under sectors not currently covered. These are essentially private sector operations and technical assistance activities (activities in support of the project cycle and institution building). These guidelines shall include performance indicators (benchmarks), the periodicity and format of PCRs and PERs, etc....
- 4.8 Introduce the projects and programmes global evaluation rating system, To that end and for purposes of harmonization with the performance evaluation system adopted by OPEV, it is advisable to review the performance rating system in the whole project cycle (at portfolio entry, active projects and at completion).
- 4.9 Comply, as soon as possible, with the principal rules and the best PCR preparation practices, as proposed for harmonization in multilateral development banks (MDB) in application of the findings of the comparative study on the methods of preparing the PCR by the various MDBs.

⁹ This ratio determined on the basis of the 1995 statistics, was 46 % in 1996 (see Comparative Analysis fo MBD, Completion Reporting and Performance Review – Septemeber 1996- ADB/BD/IF/97/210 – ADF/BD/IF/97/163)

Breakdown of projects without PCR by Department, Sector and Approval Period as at 30109197

1. OCDW Department

Year approved.	Agriculture & Rural Dev.	Education & Health	Industry	Energy	Transport & Telecom.	Water & Sanitation	Multisector.	Total
1982-1986	15	5	4		13			37
1987-1991	6	2	3		8	6	2	27
1992-1995	1		1		1		1	4
Total	22	7	8		22	6	3	68

2. OCDS Department

Year approved	Agriculture & Rural Dev.	Education & Health	Industry	Energy	Transport & Telecom.	Water & Sanitation	Multisector.	Total
1982-1986	1	2	1		6			10
1987-1991	1	1			1			3
1992-1995	1				1			2
Total	3	3	1		8			15

3. OCDE Department

Year approved	Agriculture & Rural Dev.	Education & Health	Industry	Energy	Transport & Telecom.	Water & Sanitation	Multisector.	Total
1982-1986	4	1	1		4	5		15
1987-1991	5	1		1	2	2	2	13
1992-1995	1				-		2	3
Total	10	2	1	1	6	7	4	31

Breakdown of projects without PCR by Department, Sector and Approval Period as at 30/09/97

4. OCDC Department

Year approved	Agriculture & Rural Dev.	Education & Health	Industry	Energy	Transport & Telecom	Water & Sanitation	Multisector.	Total
1982-1986	4		1		5	1		11
1987-1991	1		1		1		1	4
1992-1995	1						2	3
Total	6		2		6	1	3	18

5. OCDN Department

Year approved	Agriculture & Rural Dev.	Education & Health	Industry	Energy	Transport & Telecom.	Water & Sanitation	Multisector.	Total
1982-1986	6	1	2	1		1		11
1987-1991		4	2	3	1	1	4	15
1992-1995	1		1				2	4
Total	7	5	5	4	1	2	6	30

Breakdown of projects without PCR by Department, Cause of Arrears and Period of Approval as at 30/10/1997

1. OCDW Department

Year approved	Countries in conflict or state of insecurity	Borrower's PCR not submitted	PCR nearing finalization in 1997	PCR programmed for 1998	Loan balance cancelled	Other Arrears	Total
1982-1986	6		6	3	1	21	37
1987-1991			12	7	4	4	27
1992-1995	1					3	4
Total						28	68

2. OCDS Department

Year approved	Country in conflict or state of insecurity	Borrower's PCR not submitted	PCR nearing completion in 1997	PCR programmed for 1998	Loan balance cancelled	Other Arrears	Total
1982-1986			2	1		7	10
1987-1991						3	3
1992-1995				1		1	2
Total			2	2		11	15

3. OCDE Department

Year approved	Country in conflict or state of insecurity	Borrower's PCR not submitted	PCR nearing completion in 1997	PCR programmed for 1998	Loan balance cancelled	Other Arrears	Total
1982-1986	1			4	3	7	15
1987-1991	1		3	2	6	1	13
1992-1995			1	1	1	-	3
Total						8	31

Breakdown of projects without PCR bu Department , Cause of Arrears and Approval Period as at 30/09/97

4. OCDC Department

Year approved	Countries in conflict or state of insecurity	Borrower's PCR not submitted	PCR nearing completion in 1997	PCR programmed for 1998	Loan balance cancelled	Other Arrears	Total
1982-1986	2	6		3			11
1987-1991		1	1	1	1		4
1992-1995			1	1	1		3
Total	2	7	2	5	2		18

5. OCDN Department

Year approved	Countries in conflict or state of insecurity	Borrower's PCR not submitted	PCR nearing completion in 1997	PCR programmed for 1998	Loan balance cancelled	Other Arrears	Total
1982-1986	2	-	1	8	-		11
1987-1991	-	-	5	10	-		15
1992-1995	-	-	3	1	-		4
Total	2		9	19	-		30

PCR Preparation Procedures

CONTRIBUTION OF THE BORROWER TO PCR PREPARATION

Description	Bank Staff	Contribution of the Borrower /Executing Agency
I- Introduction 1.1 Socio-economic Background 1.2 General Overview of the Sector	- Bank's commitment in the country and sector and lessons drawn from past experience	- Most recent economic data - Most recent sectoral data
II-Sectoral objective and project objective 2.1 Sectoral objective 2.2 Project objective 2.3 Output and activities (components)	- Matrix of the project logical framework - Major assumptions and risk factors - Institutional objectives/Economic objectives	- Integration of the project into the framework of the national economic and social development plan - Institutional objectives/Economic objectives
III- Project Formulation 3.1 Origin 3.2 Preparation, appraisal, negotiation and approval	Integration of the project into the CSP Role of the parties in the upstream phase of project implementation - Retrospective analysis of the conduct of the identification, preparation, appraisal, negotiation and approval process	- Role of the Borrower/Executing Agency - Assessment of the development process of the identification, preparation, appraisal, negotiation and approval phases

PCR Preparation Procedures

Description	Bank Staff	Contribution of the Borrower /Executing Agency
<p>IV- Project Implementation</p> <p>4.1 Entry in force and Start-off</p> <p>4.2 Modification of the initial project</p> <p>4.3 Implementation schedule</p> <p>4.4 Reports and auditing of accounts</p> <p>4.5 Procurement of goods and services</p> <p>4.6 Sources of finance and disbursement</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Fulfilment of the conditions precedent and impact on the start-up and implementation schedule - Modifications made, reasons for changes and impact on the objectives and schedule - Effects of the resizing of certain components - Degree of completion of the components, meeting of the implementation schedule and reasons for delays - Effects of the external factors - Assessment of the frequency and quality of progress reports, audit reports - Compliance with the procurement rules and difficulties encountered - Determination of the total costs and by component - Compliance of the donors and the Borrower with the financial commitments - Compliance with the disbursement schedule and effects of the disbursement modalities and methods on project implementation - Causes of disbursement delays and impact on project implementation - Causes of loan cancellations 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Assessment of the difficulties encountered in meeting the conditions precedent - Reasons for scaling down the project and resizing its components - Degree of completion of the components and causes of the delays - Appraisal of the Bank's reaction to the problems raised in the reports - Determination of the costs of the works (basis of the contracts concluded) in UA, foreign exchange and local currency Determination of the total costs (basis of Bank/other donors disbursements and counterpart funds) Compliance of the parties with the financial Commitments - Compliance with the disbursement schedule and impacts of the disbursement methods used on project implementation - Reasons for loan cancellations or modification in the respective contributions

PCR Preparation Procedures

Description	Bank Staff	Contribution of the Borrower /Executing Agency
<p>V- Operational performance</p> <p>5.1 Overall evaluation 5.2 Operating results</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Operational performance evaluation of the infrastructure and installations on the basis of the handover report Evaluation of the measures taken to enhance operational performance Retrospective evaluation of the overall project design in view of the technology chosen and the lower cost solution adopted - Evaluation of the operating conditions and adequacy of the management costs - Evaluation of the technical or operating results or output in relation to estimates - Impact of the external and internal factors on these results and output - Assessment of the performance, monitoring-evaluation indicators and comparison with the sectoral ratios 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Results of the provisional or final handover report - Evaluation of the measures taken to enhance operational performance - Principal monitoring-evaluation indicators and presentation of the management information system

PCR Preparation Procedures

Description	Bank Staff	Contribution of the Borrower /Executing Agency
<p>VI- Institutional performance</p> <p>6.1 Management and organizational efficiency</p> <p>6.2 Staff recruitment, training and development</p> <p>6.3 Performance of consultants, contractors, suppliers and Borrower</p> <p>6.4 Management consultant</p> <p>6.5 Clauses and conditions</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Extent of achievement of the institutional objectives and adequacy of the structural reforms proposed and implemented - Assessment of the institutional capacity improvement of the Borrower and his executing agencies - Effectiveness of the institutional measures and training programmes implemented - Effectiveness of the organizational and management structure of the operating agency and measures implemented at that level - Effectiveness of the information, financial control and commercial, technical, accounting and financial management systems - efficiency of the policy and staff training, development and incentive structure - Evaluation of the performance of consultants, contractors and suppliers - Evaluation of the Borrower's technical and management capacity all during project implementation - Evaluation of the Bank's role and commitment with a view to enhancing the administrative capacity - Close match of the institutional clauses and conditions with the objectives and goals pursued by the project 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Difficulties encountered in implementing the institutional measures and structural reforms planned - Evaluation of the quality of the training programmes implemented and integration of the staff trained - Organization chart of the operating agency - Data on personnel management (Rotation, technical and administrative Supervision) - Description of the commercial, technical, accounting and financial management systems - Performance evaluation of the consultants, suppliers and contractors - Difficulties in taking over from technical assistants and measures envisaged - Assessment of the Bank's role and commitments in the area of institutional support - Difficulties encountered in meeting the institutional conditions and clauses stipulated
<p>VII- Financial performance</p> <p>7.1 Financial results</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Evaluation of the financial results and ratios in 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Analysis of the Financial Statements and

PCR Preparation Procedures

Description	Bank Staff	Contribution of the Borrower /Executing Agency
7.2 Rate of return 7.3 Application of the financial conditions and clauses	relation to estimates - Causes and origins of the gaps , impact of the exchange variations and inflation - Revaluation of the IFRR and causes of the gaps - Extent of application of the financial clauses and conditions - Close match of the financial clauses and conditions with the goals and objectives pursued	provision of activity reports - Difficulties in fulfilling the financial conditions and clauses
VIII- Economic performance 8.1 Economic justification 8.2 Economic rate of return and actual benefits	- Actual economic benefits in comparison with estimates - Determination of the ERR and validity of the assumptions used at appraisal - Impacts of the internal and external factors on the economic return	- Data on the direct or indirect economic impacts of the project (value added and/or additional incomes, etc. .)
IX- Social impacts	- Impact on poverty reduction and women in development - Analysis of the direct and indirect social consequences	- Data on the social impacts (job creation or consolidation, role of women, poverty reduction)
X- Environmental impacts 10.1 Situation before project 10.2 Situation after project 10.3 Proposed measures	- Environmental impacts and results of the measures implemented to mitigate the negative impacts	- Environmental impacts and evaluation of the effects and adequacy of the mitigating measures undertaken

PCR Preparation Procedures

Description	Bank Staff	Contribution of the Borrower /Executing Agency
<p>XI- Sustainability of achievements</p> <p>11.1 Operational servicing & maintenance capacity</p> <p>11.2 Institutional factors of sustainability</p> <p>11.3 Economic and financial factors</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Evaluation of the adequacy and reliability of the action and management plan (or call order contract) proposed - Analysis of the economic and institutional factors of sustainability of the project benefits - Assessment of the economic, financial and institutional viability of the project 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Plan of action for infrastructure and installations management and operation (or performance contract agreed with the supervising authorities) - Servicing and maintenance programmes and budgets - Beneficiaries' participation programmes - The State's financial commitment and contribution to the recovery of recurrent expenses and social costs
<p>XII- Performance of the Bank, Borrower and other Co-financiers</p> <p>12.1 Performance of Bank</p> <p>12.2 Performance of Borrower</p> <p>12.3 Performance of other Co-financiers</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Performance evaluation of the Bank all during the project cycle - Taking into account of the key risks and variables - Co-ordination between co-financiers - Degree of commitment of the Bank and other parties (adequacy and composition of supervision missions, contribution to the solution of problems) - Analysis of the Borrower's performance (respect of the commitments and adequacy of 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Performance evaluation of the Bank (frequency and composition of supervision missions, contribution to the solution of the difficulties and problems encountered during implementation) Assessment of the direct and indirect Institutional Contribution Evaluation of the co-ordination between donors

PCR Preparation Procedures

Description	Bank Staff	Contribution of the Borrower /Executing Agency
	its contribution to the size of the project)	
XIII- Overall performance evaluation	- Classification of overall performance in the achievement of the development objectives, results of project implementation and the Bank's performance.	
XIV- Conclusions, Lessons and Recommendations 14.1 Conclusions 14.2 Lessons 14.3 Recommendations a) to the Borrower and Executing Agency b) to the Bank Group	- Overall performance (success or failure) and results of the experience acquired - Lessons drawn in order to improve future operations - General and specific recommendations to the project, at the sectoral level or with regard to the policies and procedures of the Bank or of the Government	- Lessons learnt from experience - General and specific recommendations about the project - Recommendations concerning the sector or the policies and procedures of the Bank or of the Government