

AFRICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK GROUP



**OPERATIONS EVALUATION OFFICE:
1995 WORK PROGRAMME (Revised)**

**OPERATIONS EVALUATION DEPARTMENT
(OPEV)**

28 February, 1995

INTRODUCTION

1. In November 1994, OPEV's 1995 work programme was submitted for the Boards' consideration. This document (ADB/BD/WP/94/124 - ADF/BD/WP/94/105) comprised two parts:
 - i) 1994 Work Programme - Status of Implementation;
 - ii) The Draft 1995 Work Programme.
2. Prepared on the basis of information at the end of October 1994, these two parts of the report have now been updated as at 31 December 1994, taking into account ongoing tasks which could be implemented or the problems encountered and the approval of the 1995 budget which changes OPEV's initial proposals concerning its 1995 work programme.

II. 1994 WORK PROGRAMME - STATUS OF IMPLEMENTATION

- 2.1 The 1994 Annual Report of the Operations Evaluation Office (ADB/OPEV/95/01) which was finalized is being handled by ALAD for distribution to the Board. It gives all details of the status of implementation of the 1994 work programme. This document which should be considered as the first part of OPEV's revised work programme may be summarized as follows:

Resources

- 2.2 OPEV had 567 staff-weeks (s/w) of human resources (instead of 628 s/w) for the implementation of the 1994 work programme (Management 84 s/w); staff: 379 s/w and 86 s/w of consultancy services. Compared with budget allocations, there was a shortage of 23 s/w with regard to regular staff and 38 s/w of consultancy services. Because of these resources, OPEV obtained the following results in 1994:
 - i) 4 PPAR - Programmes and 11 PPAR - Projects which had been initiated in 1993. These PPARs are at various stages of processing in ALAD for distribution to the Board.
 - ii) 1 PPAR - Programme and 3 PPAR - Projects which had been launched in the course of the year were finalized.
 - iii) 6 Completion Report Reviews were prepared whereas six (6) other PCRs were submitted as they were to the Board.
 - iv) The "project quality" study and the "AMTA" study were finalized and distributed to the Board.
 - v) A total of six (6) periodic reports out of an estimated seven (7) were produced. Only the preparation of the five-year synoptic report 1988/92 was postponed to 1995 and will cover the seven-year period 1988/94.

- vi) OPEV took part in about forty inter-departmental meetings, considered several documents and project briefs and noted that the MPDE practice is becoming regular in various appraisal reports.
- vii) OPEV continued to follow the SPEI system. Exchanges of experiences were made with other cooperative institutions including BOAD which requested ADB assistance in that area. SPEI has proved to be a perfect instrument for dissemination of post-evaluation results and lessons and a factor for reducing time spent by users in seeking data.
- viii) OPEV undertook thirteen (13) missions out of an estimated fourteen (14) for projects/programmes post-evaluation. Under the coordination of post-evaluation activities in cooperative institutions, OPEV also undertook four (4) missions to participate in two DAC/OECD meetings, a seminar on country programmes evaluation and the annual meeting of cooperation with the IBRD and the Inter-American Development Bank.

Constraints

- 2.3 The problems encountered in the implementation of the 1994 work programme concerned long sick leaves which prevented the use of certain experts on full-time basis. It is desirable, under the forthcoming staff redeployment, to take account of these in order to improve OPEV's performance which was 80.86% in 1994. It will also be necessary to resolve, under the redeployment, the problem of integrating into the staff the fourth secretary of the experts and the two Programme Analysts of SPEI.
- 2.4 Concerning logistics problems, the cycle of processing OPEV documents in ALAD is still long. Following meetings organized by OPEV with the operational departments and through the intervention of Senior Management, the number of -completion reports received in 1994 stood at 49, representing, twice those received annually in past years. Because of better programming by the operational departments, a greater number of PCRs will be received during the coming years, and this will enrich OPEV's three-year rolling programming.
- 2.5 Table 1 below gives a comparative statement of estimates and actuals of OPEV in 1994.

Table 1**1994 WORK PROGRAMME INDICATORS****Comparative Synoptic Table Between Estimates and Actuals**
(31/12/1994)

ACTIVITIES	OUTPUT		OPEV		CONSULTANT		TOTAL (s/w)		
	In. ¹	Fin. ²	In.	Fii.	In.	Fin.	In.	Fii.	
- PPARs	12.	8	236	211	102	72	338	283	-55
- Studies	2	2	56	56	18		74	56	-18
- Seminars	3	3	18	4			18	4	-14
- Periodic reports	7	6	48	25		8	48	33	-15
- Inter-Departmental meetings (feedback)	36	40	18	28	-		18	28	10
- Computer Prog. (SPEI)	12	45	14	23	4	6	18	29	11
- Admin./Supervision			30	44			30	44	14
- Aid Coordination				6				6	6
Total			420	397	124	86	544	488	61
- Directorate		-			-		84	84	-
- Support staff		-			-		308	308	-
- Temporary		-			-		164	164	-

¹ (In.) Initial Proposals

² (Fin.) Final Outputs

- 2.6 Annex 1 contains the summary of activities and the resources and results of OPEV as regards the implementation of OPEV's work programme in 1994 (ADB/BD/WP/94/28).

III. 1995 WORK PROGRAMME

- 3.1 The initial 1995 work programme of the Operations Evaluation Office (ADB/BD/WP/94/124 - ADF/BD/WP/105) which was distributed on 14 November 1994 had been prepared on the basis of OPEV's budget proposals submitted to Management in October 1994. These proposals took into account particularly the strengthening of OPEV's staff through the provision of four additional experts. OPEV wanted to have a total of 770 s/w of professional services to implement this work programme (Directorate: 84 s/w; regular staff: 504 s/w; consultants: 182 s/w).
- 3.2 In December 1994, the Bank's budget was adopted. Following the memorandum of the FINP Director dated 16 December 1994, OPEV reviewed its work programme to suit it to the resources approved for it:
- i) 546 s/w of own resources instead of 588 requested (including the Director and his deputy);
 - ii) 143 s/w of consultancy services financed on the bank's budget;
 - iii) 70 s/w of consultants to be procured under the bilateral cooperation programme.
- 3.3 In accordance with the approved budget allocations, OPEV will have 759 s/w (instead of 770) of professional and Directorate resources for the implementation of its 1995 work programme which has been revised and which will involve the following activities and results:

A. Project/Programme Performance Audit Report (PPAR)

- 3.4 Project/programme post-evaluation activities will be centred on:
- i) Continuation and completion of eleven (11) PPARs initiated in 1994 (in addition to the 8 PPARs originally planned, should be added three others whose missions could not be completed at the end of the year).
 - ii) Launching and completion of:
 - 26 PPAR Reviews (instead of 30 initially anticipated);
 - 8 abbreviated PPARs (instead of 10);
 - 18 full PPARs (instead of 20).

Annex II gives the comparative breakdown between the original and revised proposals of the 1995 work programme.

B. Studies

3.5 The studies proposed in the original version of the work programme were maintained except that on the SAL/SECAL synoptic report, i.e.:

- i) completion of the delays study;
- ii) launching and completion of the sugar study;
- iii) launching of the rice study;
- iv) preparation of the methodology and guidelines for impact assessment, country reviews, lending process evaluation, country programmes evaluation, sector policy reviews, feedback and review of project briefs and evaluation capacity development of member countries.

C. Periodic Reports

3.6 The usual periodic reports will be produced by OPEV in 1995 in addition to the launching of the second synopsis of the post-evaluation results which, because of inadequate resources, will cover the period 1988/92 instead of 1988/94 as originally planned. In accordance with the timetable for the production of periodic reports, the annual report on OPEV activities in 1994 has been completed and is in ALAD for processing and distribution to the Board.

D. Feedback and Lesson Dissemination

3.7 OPEV will participate in 30 (instead of 50) inter-departmental meetings on the consideration of loan proposals and other policy and country reports.

E. System for Post-Evaluation Information

3.8 Compared with the original work programme, no major change was made to this activity which, benefiting from USAID funding, will be the subject of an OPEV interim audit. This audit will cover the efficiency of the system through the data indicators at the beginning of its establishment. Indeed, the SPEI has become an incomparable and efficient source of data enhancing the preparation of country studies, the synopsis of results and other thematic studies. That is why the equivalent of 21 s/w of contractual services will be devoted to the maintenance of data programmers responsible for its permanent functioning.

F. Other Activities

3.9 OPEV's other activities in 1995 (seminars, DAC/OECD meetings and annual meetings of the World Bank and the Inter-American Development Bank) were maintained intact. It should however be stated that the monitoring of DAC/OECD activities is henceforth regarded as a regular task of OPEV.

G. Human Resources

- 3.10 As indicated earlier, OPEV will have 759 s/w in 1995 (instead of 770 s/w) of professional resources to implement the revised work programme (i.e. 84 s/w of Directorate, 462 s/w of experts, 143 s/w of consultants financed on the Bank's budget and 70 s/w of consultants to be recruited under bilateral cooperation).
- 3.11 Concerning support staff, in accordance with the recommendations of the General Audit Committee, OPEV suggests as soon as possible the integration into the staff of the temporary personnel essential for implementation of its activities (a fourth secretary for the experts and consultants and two computer analysts to handle the SPEI).
- 3.12 The Table hereunder shows the utilization in 1995 of the human resources allocated to OPEV to execute its revised work programme. Similarly, Annex 2 gives details of the activities which will be undertaken during 1995.

Table 2
1995 WORK PROGRAMME: RESOURCES/RESULTS
(Resource Utilization)

Activity	Resources						Results	
	Staff x Week				Total		Number	
	OPEV		Consultants					
	In. ¹	Rev. ²	In.	Rev.	In.	Rev.	In.	Rev.
Performance Audit	387	367	112	118	499	485	68	63
Studies	48	20	44	54	92	74	6	6
Periodic Reports	39	27	26	16	65	43	7	7
Seminars/Conferences	14	11	-	-	14	11	3	3
SPEI	10	4	-	25	10	29	-	-
Feedback	30	20	-	-	30	20	50	30
Management/Administration	60	11	-	-	60	11	-	-
Aid Coordination		2	-	-	-	2	-	-
Management	84	84	-	-	84	84	-	-
Total	588	546	182	213	770	759	-	-

(1) In. = Initial Proposals

(2) Rev. = Revised Proposals

H. Missions

- 3.13 In accordance with budget allocations, OPEV will undertake 36 missions during the year for project/programme post-evaluation, for the preparation of studies and for participating in international meetings on cooperation in project evaluation.

I. Training

- 3.14 The external training of OPEV staff was not budgeted for in 1995 because of the limited number of permanent staff and the Board's rejection of any staff training outside the Bank. However, seminars organized within the Bank, particularly SPEI, will offer the staff additional training opportunities.

IV. CONCLUSIONS

- 4.1 In addition to the conclusions drawn from the initial work programme for 1995 (ADB/BD/WP/94/105- ADF/BD/WP/94/124), it should be stated that OPEV, despite its limited resources, will concentrate its efforts to contribute further to the improvement of project quality.
- 4.2 The number of completion reports (PCRs) received in 1994 was 49. This figure will continue to increase in the coming years according to the new programming established by the operational departments. The introduction in OPEV of the three-year work programme, coupled with the diversity and volume of the PCRs, will enable OPEV to establish a strong database on the Bank's operations.
- 4.3 Thanks to the SPEI, the dissemination of the Bank operations evaluation results will be disseminated at all levels with, in particular, the interconnection to the network of the Development Aid Committee of OECD.

1995 WORK PROGRAMME (Revised)

Status of Implementation of the 1994 Work Programme

PROG 94B.wk1

ACTIVITIES	PERSON / WEEKS				OUTPUT	STATUS
	OPRV	CONSULTANT	B.T.A.*	TOTAL		
A. PPAR PROGRAMME/PROJECT IN 1995						
A1. PROGRAMMES						
1. Mali - SAL (Abbr.)	8.6	0	0	8.6	1	Finalized
2. Uganda - SAL	0.2	0	0	0.2	1	Finalized
3. Chad - SAL	1.2	0	0	1.3	1	Finalized
4. Zambia - SECAL Industry	2.2	0	0	2.2	1	Finalized
	0	0	0	0	0	
Sub-Total A1	12.2	0	0	12.2	4	
A2. PROJECTS						
1. Benin - Technical Education	16.4	8	0	24.4	1	Finalized
2. Morocco - Education	16.6	0	8	24.6	1	Finalized
3. Swaziland - Hydro-electric Energy	12	0	13	25	1	Finalized
4. Swaziland - Health	2.8	0	6	8.8	1	Finalized
5. Mauritania - Rice - Boghé Plain	3.8	0	0	3.8	1	Finalized
6. Zimbabwe - Health	7	0	8	15	1	Finalized
7. Tunisia - ELOC (5 Banks)	1.6	0	0	1.6	1	Finalized
8. RWANDA - PFUNDI-MULINDI Tea (Abbr.)	3.8	0	0	3.8	1	Finalized
9. CAMEROON - Poultry Project (Abbr.)	2.2	0	0	2.2	1	Finalized
10. CAR - Animal Production (Abbr.)	1.6	0	0	1.6	1	Finalized
11. NIGER - School of Mines	1.2	0	0	1.2	1	Finalized
	0	0	0	0	0	
Sub-Total A2	69	8	35	112	11	
Sub-Total A	81.2	8	35	124.2	15	
B. 1994 PPAR						
B1. PROGRAMMES						
1. Mauritius - SAL Industry	17.6	0	0	17.6	1	Finalized
2. Guinea Bissau - SAL (Abbr.)	9	0	0	9	1	Completed
3. Togo - SAL (Abbr.)	5	0	0	5	1	Initiated
4. Mali - PASEP (Abbr.)	5	0	0	5	1	Initiated
5. Guinea Conakry - SAL	7.8	0	0	7.8	1	Initiated
	0	0	0	0	0	
Sub-Total B1	44.4	0	0	44.4	5	
B2. PROJECTS						
1. Benin/Togo - Nangheto Hydroelectric Dam (Abbreviated)	5	0	0	5	1	Finalized
2. Mali - Health (Abbreviated)	8.8	0	0	8.8	1	Finalized
3. CAR - Bassongo Oil Palm	9.8	6	0	15.8	1	Finalized
4. Tunisia - Rural Electrification	3.6	7	0	10.6	1	Completed
5. Tunisia - Urban Electrification	3	7	0	10	1	Completed
6. Lesotho - Health I & II	9	9	0	18	1	Completed
7. Seychelles - Victoria Sewerage (Abbreviated)	11	0	0	11	1	Completed
8. Mali - Line of Credit	2.3	0	0	2.3	1	Initiated
9. Madagascar - Analariva Sugar	7.4	0	0	7.4	1	Initiated
10. Cameroon - Mbalmayo-Ebolowa Road	2.6	0	0	2.6	1	Initiated
11. TUNISIA - LC to BDET	0.8	0	0	0.8	1	Initiated
	0	0	0	0	0	
Sub-Total B2	63.3	29	0	92.3	11	
Sub-Total B	107.7	29	0	136.7	16	

1995 WORK PROGRAMME (Revised1)

Status of Implementation of the 1994 Work Programme

PROG 94B.wk1

ACTIVITIES	PERSON / WEEKS				OUTPUT	STATUS
	OFEV	CONSULTANT	B.T.A.*	TOTAL		
C. PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT REVIEW						
1. Algeria – Industrial Line of Credit	0.2	0	0	0.2	1	Finalized
2. Mauritania – LC to UBD	0.2	0	0	0.2	1	Finalized
3. Togo – CHU	2.4	0	0	2.4	1	Finalized
4. Rwanda – LC I BRD	0.2	0	0	0.2	1	Finalized
5. Botswana – Slaughter house (Review)	1.4	0	0	1.4	1	Finalized
3. Botswana – Hospital (Review)	1.2	0	0	1.2	1	Completed
6. Mozambique – Maputo Water Supply (Review)	2	0	0	2	1	Finalized
9. Zaire – SOTEXKI	0.2	0	0	0.2	1	Finalized
10. Zimbabwe – Water Supply (Review)	2	0	0	2	1	Finalized
10. CAMEROON – ENIET Education (Review)	2.4	0	0	2.4	1	Finalized
11. SOMALIA – Mogadishio Sewerage	1.6	0	0	1.6	1	Finalized
12. Equatorial Guinea – ENAM Education (Review)	1.4	0	0	1.4	1	Finalized
13. EGYPT – Bilanzia Control	1	0	0	1	1	Initiated
14. MAURITIUS – Plaisance Road	1	0	0	1	1	Initiated
15. Gambia – Jahaly Pachar Rice	4.6	0	0	4.6	1	Initiated
16. LESOTHO – Road Maintenance	1	0	0	1	1	Initiated
Sub–Total C	22.8	0	0	22.8	16	
Sub-Total A+B+C	211.7	37	35	283.7	47	
D. STUDIES						
1. Project Quality	36.8	0	0	36.8	1	Finalized
2. AMTA	0.4	0	0	0.4	1	Finalized
3. Logical Health Framework	0.6	0	0	0.6	1	Finalized
4. Delay Study	5.6	0	0	5.6	1	Initiated
5. SAL/SECAL Review	9.2	0	0	9.2	1	Initiated
6. Rice Study	3	0	0	3	1	Initiated
7. Sugar Study	0.2	0	0	0.2	1	Initiated
	0	0	0	0	0	
Sub–Total D	55.8	0	0	55.8	7	
E. PERIODIC REPORTS						
1. Annual Meeting	4.2	0	0	4.2	1	Finalized
2. Abstracts and Directory/Concordance	1	0	0	1	1	Finalized
3. Budget	4.2	0	0	4.2	1	Finalized
4. 1995 Work Programme	7	0	0	7	1	Finalized
5. Quarterly Reports to the President	2.2	0	0	2.2	1	Finalized
6. Review of PPARs of 1992–1993	6.2	8	0	14.2	1	Completed
7. Synopsis 1988–1992	0	0	0	0	1	postponed 1995
	0	0	0	0	0	
Sub–Total E	24.8	8	0	32.8	7	
F. FEEDBACK – PROJECT BRIEFS EVALUATION						
	28.2	0	0	28.2	0	
	0	0	0	0	0	
	0	0	0	0	0	
Sub–Total F	28.2	0	0	28.2	0	
OTHER ACTIVITIES						
G. SPEI Activities	22.9	6	0	28.9		
H. seminars	3.8	0	0	3.8		
I. Management/Miscellaneous	43.8	0	0	43.8		
J. DAC/Aid Coordination Meeting	6	0	0	6		
	0	0	0	0		
Sub-Total G+H+I	76.5	6	0	82.5		
TOTAL I EXPERT	397	51	35	483		
DIFF. / EXPERT	355	9	-7	441		
MANAGEMENT	84	0	0	84		
TRAINING	0	0	0	0		
GRAND TOTAL FOR 1994	481	51	35	567		
For information: Total 1993 indications	504	54	16	574		

PCR which was the subject of a special memo to the Resident BTA* Bilateral* : Assistance Technique Bilatérale

1995 WORK PROGRAMME - INPUT/OUTPUT
(Utilization of Resources)

Activities	OPEV staff		Input						Total		Output	
			Consultants								Number	
			OPEV Fund		Technical Assistance Fund		TOTAL					
	Init. HIS	Rev. H/S	Init. H/S	Rev. H/S	Init. HIS	Rev. HIS	Init. HIS	Rev. HIS	Init. HIS	Rev. HIS	Init. HIS	Rev. HIS
1. Performance Audit												
- Carry over from 1994 (1)	12	28	-	13	-	-	-	13	12	41	8	11
- PCR Review	45	39	-	-	-	-	-	-	45	39	30	26
- PPAR Abbreviated	50	40	-	-	-	-	-	-	50	40	10	8
- PPAR Complete	280	260	48	67	64	38	112	105	392	365	20	18
Sub-Total	387	367	48	80	64	38	112	114	499	485	68	63
2. Studies												
- Delays	10	6	-	10	-	-	-	10	10	16	1	1
- Sugar	14	4	-	-	14	14	14	14	28	18	1	1
- Rice	4	4	-	-	-	14	-	-	4	18	1	1
- SAL/SECAL (2)	12	-	-	-	14	-	14	-	26	-	1	-
Methodologies & Guidelines	8	6	16	16	-	-	16	16	24	22	3	3
Sub-Totals	48	20		26	28	28	44	54	92	74	7	6
3. Periodic Reports											7	
- 1994 Annual Report	2	2	-	-	-	-	-	-	2	2		
- Review of 1994 Results	10	8	-	-	-	-	-	-	10	8		
- 1988/1992 Synoptic Report	16	6	26	16	-	-	26	16	42	22		
- 1994 Budget	4	4	-	-	-	-	-	-	4	4		
- 1996 Work Programme	3	3	-	-	-	-	-	-	3	3		
- 1994 Abstracts	1	1	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	1		
- Quarterly Reports	3	3	-	-	-	-	-	-	3	3		
Sub-Total	39	27	26	16			26	16	65	43		
4. Seminars/Conferences	14	11	-	-	-	-	-	-	14	11	3	3
5. SPEI	10	4	-	21	-	4	-	25	10	29	-	-
6. Feedback	30	20	-	-	-	-	-	-	30	20	50	30
7. Aid Coordination	2	2	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	2		
8. Administration and Miscellaneous	-	11	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	11		
9. Management(3)/Directorate	-	84	-	-	-	-	-	-	84	84		
Total Needs	585	462	90	143	92	70	182	213	770	759		

Init. = Initial Proposals

Rev. = Revised Proposals

1 = Three projects whose missions could not be effected in the 4th quarter 1994 were postponed.

2 = Study postponed.

3 = 24 s/w of Directorate time is spent on examining documents to ascertain their quality.