

**AFRICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK GROUP**



**CAPE VERDE**

**THE EDUCATION SYSTEM RESTRUCTURING AND  
EXPANSION PROJECT**

**Project Performance Evaluation Report (PPER)**

**OPERATIONS EVALUATION DEPARTMENT  
(OPEV)**

**23 July 1999**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Pages</u>
<b>CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS, ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS</b>	<b>(i)</b>
<b>PREFACE</b>	<b>(ii)</b>
<b>PROJECT BASIC DATA</b>	<b>(iii–v)</b>
<b>1. EVALUATION SUMMARY</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 Objective and Scope	1
1.2 Implementation Performance	1
1.3 Institutional Aspects	2
1.4 Project Impact	2
1.5 Sustainability	3
1.6 Conclusions	3
1.7 Feedback and Recommendations	3
<b>2. PROJECT BACKGROUND</b>	<b>5</b>
2.1 Country Economic Context	5
2.2 History of Operations in the Sector	7
2.3 Project Formulation	7
2.4 Project Rationale	8
2.5 Objectives and Scope of the Evaluation	8
2.6 Financing Arrangements	8
2.7 Evaluation Methodology and Approach	9
<b>3. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION</b>	<b>9</b>
3.1 Loan Effectiveness	9
3.2 Changes in Project Scope	9
3.3 Implementation Schedule	10
3.4 Reporting	11
3.5 Procurement of Goods and Services	11
3.6 Project Cost	11
3.7 Disbursements and Sources of Financing	11
3.8 Compliance with Loan Conditions and Covenants	12
<b>4. PERFORMANCE EVALUATION</b>	<b>12</b>
4.1 Operating Performance	12
4.2 Financial Performance	13
4.3 Economic Performance	13
4.4 Institutional and Social Performance	14
4.5 Impact on Women	15
4.6 Environmental Performance	15
4.7 Performance of Consultants, Contractors, Suppliers and Borrower	16
4.8 Bank Group Performance	16
<b>5. PROJECT SUSTAINABILITY</b>	<b>17</b>
5.1 Physical Sustainability	17
5.2 Sustainability of Project Impacts	17

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS (cont.)**

	<b>Pages</b>
<b>6. PERFORMANCE RATINGS</b>	17
6.1 Implementation Performance	17
6.2 Bank Group Performance	17
6.3 Performance Outcome	18
<b>7. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	18
7.1 Overall Assessment	18
7.2 Feedback and Recommendations	18
7.3 Follow-up Action	21

### **APPENDICES:**

	<b><u>No. of Pages</u></b>
1. Retrospective Project Logical Framework	4
2. Matrix of Recommendations and Follow-up Action	3
3. System of Overall Assessment of Project Performance	4

---

This report was prepared by Messrs. M. THIAM, Principal Post Evaluation Officer, Mission Leader; B. KWINDJA, Consultant Social Economist, following a project performance evaluation mission concerning the Education System Restructuring and Expansion Project, to the Republic of Cape Verde from 1 to 15 February 1999. Questions on this document should be referred to Mr. G. M. B KARIISA, Director, OPEV (Extension 4052).

---

**CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS**

<u>Currency Unit</u>	<u>At Apprs.</u> <u>(Dec. 1987)</u>	<u>At Completion</u> <u>(Sept.1997)</u>	<u>At Audit</u> <u>(Feb. 1999)</u>
<b>UA 1</b>	<b>ECV 79.6568</b>	<b>ECV 131.4830</b>	<b>ECV 132.6960</b>
ECV 1	UA 0.0102	UA 0.0076	UA 0.0076
UA 1	US\$ 1.08493	US\$ 1.36521	US\$ 1.38977
US\$ 1	UA 0.92172	UA 0.73248	UA 0.71954

**UNITS OF MEASURE**

1 metre (m)	=	3.28 feet
1 kilometre (km)	=	0.6 mile
1 square metre (m <sup>2</sup> )	=	10.76 square feet
1 square kilometre (km <sup>2</sup> )	=	0.38 square mile
1 hectare (ha)	=	2.47 acres
1 kilogramme (kg)	=	2.2 pounds
1 litre (l)	=	1.06 quarts

**FINANCIAL YEAR**

1 January - 31 December

**ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS**

ADB	African Development Bank
ADF	African Development Fund
ASMS	Autonomous Scholarships Management Service
BETTC	Basic Education Teacher Training College
ECV	Cape Verdean Escudo
EPMS	Education Planning and Management Service
ESREP	Education System Restructuring and Expansion Project
EVGC	Educational and Vocational Guidance Centre
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GEDSE	Consulting Firm for the Development of Education Systems
GEP	Planning Consulting Firm
HEI	Higher Education Institute
ME	Ministry of Education
MESYS	Ministry of Education, Science, Youth and Sports
MEU	Monitoring and Evaluation Unit
OCDW	Country Department - West
OPEV	Operations Evaluation Department
PCR	Project Completion Report
PIU	Project Implementation Unit
PPER	Project Performance Evaluation Report
SCU	Schools Construction Unit
STTC	Secondary Teacher Training College
TAPU	Teaching Aids Production Unit
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

## **PREFACE**

1. This Project Performance Evaluation Report (PPER) concerns the Education System Restructuring and Expansion Programme for which the Bank granted an ADF loan of UA 10.22 million on 19 October 1989.
2. The project goal was to contribute to the development of human resources. The activities to be carried out under the project were fully in keeping with this goal of the education reform adopted by the Government following the country's independence on 5 July 1975. The specific objectives were to promote the expansion of basic education and general and technical secondary education to promote the democratization of education and to contribute to the improvement of the quality of education.
3. The loan was intended to support the Government's efforts to implement the education reform which would permit the development of the human resources needed by the country to ensure its economic, social and cultural development. ADF has financed the totality of the foreign exchange costs and 50% of the local currency costs, i.e. 90% of the total project cost. The Government's contribution covered 50% of the local costs i.e. 10% of the total cost.
4. The Project Completion Report (PCR, ADF/BD/IF/98/20) prepared by the Bank in October 1997, mentioned that all the objectives of the project as well as the strategies adopted were appropriate, in light of the satisfactory results obtained. The report also raised a number of problems concerning the non-completion of the Cidade Velha school and the failure to establish an independent service for private education supervision. However, it should be noted that there is insufficient intake capacity at general secondary, technical and vocational level owing to the success of the reform (integration and extension of basic education and the spread of secondary education). Such problems required the scheduling of a project performance evaluation mission to assess them more closely, specify to what extent the sectoral and specific objectives set at appraisal had been attained or were likely to be attained. It would also review the PIU and the operation of the other structures established under the project, and, finally, draw lessons from the impact of the project on the country's development.
5. This report was prepared following a performance evaluation mission by the Bank to the Republic of Cape Verde from 1 to 15 February 1999. It refers to the appraisal and completion reports, and is based on: (i) information obtained from the Bank's project files; (ii) statistical, economic and financial data gathered during the mission; and (iii) discussions and meetings held by the mission with the Authorities and senior officials of the Ministries of Education, Science, Youth and Sports, as well as Finance which were concerned by the project, the directors of the schools established, the UNDP representative and the Director of the World Bank PIU.
6. The PPER complements the findings, analyses and conclusions of the PCR and comprises an evaluation of the performance, outcome and sustainability of the impacts of the project from the socioeconomic and institutional standpoints over the 1991/1997 period. It draws lessons from them and formulates recommendations for the Borrower and the Bank regarding consolidation of the project benefits, and for its short-and medium-term development.
7. Copies of the PPER were submitted to the Government of Cape Verde as well to the operations departments of the Bank. Their comments have been taken into consideration in the final version of the report.

**PROJECT BASIC DATA****A. Preliminary Data**

1. Country	:	Republic of Cape Verde
2. Project	:	Education System Restructuring and Expansion
3. Loan	:	ADF-F/CAV/EDU/88/13
4. Borrower	:	Government of Cape Verde
5. Beneficiary	:	Ministry of Education
6. Executing Agency	:	Project Implementation Unit (PIU)

**B. Project Basic Data**

	<u>ESTIMATED</u>	<u>ACTUAL</u>
1. Official Request	-	-
2. Loan Amount (UA millions)	10.22	9.85
3. Service Charge	0.75 % per year on amounts disbursed and outstanding.	
4. Repayment	1% of the principal per year from the eleventh (11 <sup>th</sup> ) to the twentieth (20 <sup>th</sup> ) year and 3% thereafter.	
5. Duration	Fifty (50) years, with a ten (10) year grace period.	
6. Appraisal	December 1989	-
7. Loan Negotiation	21/04/88	-
8. Board Approval	May 1988	27/05/88
9. Loan Signature	-	19/10/89
10. Loan Effectiveness	-	05/02/90

**C. Project Basic Data**

## 1. Total Project Cost (million UAs)

Categories	Estimated	Actual	Difference
A. Construction	7.25	7.86	0.61
B. Furniture and Equipment	1.44	1.60	0.6
C. Technical Assistance	0.77	0.72	- 0.05
D. Training	1.62	0.62	- 1.00
E. PIU Operating Costs	0.27	0.18	- 0.09
<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>11.35</b>	<b>10.98</b>	<b>- 0.37</b>

## 2. Financing Plan (million UAs)

Donors	Commitments			Disbursements			Differences		
	F.E.	L.C.	Total	F.E.	L.C.	Total	F.E.	L.C.	Total
ADF	9.09	1.13	10.22	9.06	0.79	9.85	- 0.03	- 0.34	- 0.37
Government	-	1.13	1.13	-	1.13	1.13	-	-	-
<b>Total</b>	<b>9.09</b>	<b>2.26</b>	<b>11.35</b>	<b>9.06</b>	<b>1.92</b>	<b>10.98</b>	<b>- 0.03</b>	<b>- 0.34</b>	<b>- 0.37</b>

	<u>EST.</u>	<u>ACT.</u>	<u>DIFF.</u>
3. Deadline for first disbursement	31/12/89	15/06/90	5.5 months
4. Deadline for final disbursement	31/12/93	31/12/96	36 months

#### **D. Performance Indicators**

1. Cost Overrun	None		
2. Project Implementation Period	1/07/88–31/12/92	15/10/90 – 31/11/96	54 mths
3. Number of Extensions of the Deadline for the Final Disbursement	-	3	
4. Project Status	Completed		
5. Implementation Performance	Unsatisfactory		
6. ADB Performance	Satisfactory		
7. Overall Performance	Satisfactory		

#### **E. Missions**

Types of Mission	Number of Missions	Responsibility	Dates or Period	Number of Members	Staff/days
Identification	1	UNESCO	February 1983	2	42
Preparation	3	UNESCO/ADF/Consultant	06/83; 05/87; 09/87	4	60
Appraisal	1	ADF	December 1987	2	30
Launching	1	ADF	March 1989	1	15
Monitoring	2	ADF	05/90; 07/92	4	60
Technical Supervision	4	ADF	06/91;07/92;07/94; 07/95	8	120
Completion (PCR)	1	ADF	Sept.1997	2	30
PPER	1	ADF	February 1999	2	30
<b>Total</b>	<b>14</b>			<b>25</b>	<b>387</b>

#### **F. Estimated and Actual Disbursements (million UAs)**

YEAR	ADF		GOVERNMENT	
	At Appraisal	At Post Evaluation	At Appraisal	At Post Evaluation
1988	0.32		0.06	
1989	3.62		0.30	0.033
1990	3.70	0.21	0.40	0.162
1991	2.17	0.56	0.32	0.187
1992	0.41	2.86	0.05	0.190
1993	-	3.43		0.181
1994	-	1.63		0.174
1995	-	0.91		0.173
1996	-	0.25		0.030
<b>Total</b>	<b>10.22</b>	<b>9.85</b>	<b>1.13</b>	<b>1.13</b>

#### **G. Principal Contractors and Suppliers**

Ref. PCR pages (iv); (v); (vi); and (vii)

### H. Other Social Sector Projects Financed by the Bank Group

N°		Year of Approval	Loan /Grant (UA millions)	Status	Date of PCR Mission	Date of PPER Mission
1.	Economic and Financial Study of the Mindelo Health Plan	19/10/78	0.23	Cancellation procedure initiated	N.A.	N.A.
2.	Staff Training and Health Facilities Development	02/02/81	7.36	Virtually completed	-	-
3.	Study on the Education System Restructuring Project (ESREP)	24/08/84	1.10	Completed	N.A.	N.A.
4.	Education II	06/05/97	4.00	Ongoing	Not carried out	Not carried out

## **1. EVALUATION SUMMARY**

### **1.1 Objectives and Scope**

1.1.1 This Project Performance Evaluation Report (PPER) concerns the Education System Restructuring and Expansion Programme for which the Bank granted an ADF loan of UA 10.22 million on 19 October 1989.

1.1.2 The project goal was to contribute to the development of human resources. The activities to be carried out under the project were fully in keeping with this goal of the education reform adopted by the Government following the country's independence on 5 July 1975. The specific objectives were to promote the expansion of basic education and general and technical secondary education, to foster the spread of education, and to contribute to the improvement of the quality of education.

1.1.3 The loan was intended to support the Government's efforts to implement the education reform which would permit the development of the human resources needed by the country to ensure its economic, social and cultural development. ADF has financed the totality of the foreign exchange costs and 50% of the local currency costs, i.e. 90% of the total project cost. The Government's contribution covered 50% of the local costs, i.e. 10% of the total cost.

### **1.2 Implementation Performance**

1.2.1 UNESCO was responsible for the identification and preparation of the project. It was appraised by the Bank in Cape Verde on the basis of wide-ranging discussions of all aspects of the project with the authorities concerned, and the study of documents. Its contribution was the financing of the feasibility study on education reform, the building of schools, the provision of furniture and equipment, technical assistance, and training.

1.2.2 The Government fulfilled the conditions of loan effectiveness with considerable difficulty. Indeed, the first disbursement was only released nineteen (19) months later and there was slippage of fifty-four months on implementation. This was mainly due to the failure to fulfill the conditions precedent to loan effectiveness, difficulties in establishing the Project Implementation Unit (PIU), lack of familiarity of the Government with the rules and procedures for the procurement of goods and services, the stopping of project coordination at the institutional level by the former-GEP, the incompetence of the accounting assistant responsible for the financial and accounting management of the project, and irregular payment of the national counterpart funds.

1.2.3 In all, 169 classrooms were completed (40 new schools and 35 schools extended) while 160 were planned for basic education. Furniture and equipment were supplied for the 160 classrooms planned; the Government furnished the nine other classrooms. With regard to general and technical secondary education, 63 classrooms were accepted and three secondary schools in São Felipe, Ribeira Grande and in Praia. A further eight (8) classrooms were completed and nine (9) classrooms at the Achada S. Filipe secondary school in Praia as part of the supplementary works. However, the private sector supervision service was not established as planned in the appraisal report, which made it impossible to assess the role of the private sector in the educational system.

1.2.4 On the whole, the buildings constructed in the different institutions and schools are fairly well laid out from an architectural standpoint, and all the structural components have been in satisfactory condition since the commissioning of the educational structures in 1991. The sanitary fittings in most schools have not been installed owing to a lack of running water. It should be noted that some buildings are cracked in places, which has led to the deterioration of the structures and lowered the physical life of the buildings.

1.2.5 Technical assistance was provided for the activities planned. It concerned an architect for 37 staff/months, and engineer for 37 staff/months and 18 consultants for 29 staff/months each. The technical assistance contributed to an improvement in the management

system of the PIU, the STTC and the scholarship management service. All the training courses planned under the project were dispensed. These enabled the beneficiaries to acquire know-how in different educational areas.

1.2.6 With regard to the fulfillment of the general loan conditions, the Borrower only submitted ten (10) half-year status reports and one completion report. The audit of accounts was not carried out in conformity with the loan agreement. The components planned were implemented without cost overruns. The project was 54 months behind its initial schedule. The current utilization of the schools built is more than optimal. The performance was considered unsatisfactory.

### **1.3 Institutional Aspects**

Reorganization of the ME resulted in modifications of the organizational structures. Under the new arrangements, basic education and general and technical secondary education, as well as post secondary education are the responsibilities of the ME. The strengthening of the administration of education at the central, regional and local levels is an important and determining aspect of the education reform. The organic law of the Ministry of Education, Science, Youth and Sports defines the new administrative structure and provides for the different departments, units and services which would permit greater decentralization of the educational system, while facilitating its efficient management. On the whole, the institutional impact on basic education, general secondary and technical was reflected in the implementation by GEDSE and the PIU of activities concerning the organization and preparation of programmes to improve national educational structures, which made it possible to achieve a highly satisfactory educational performance over the last six years. The institutional performance is satisfactory.

### **1.4 Project Impact**

1.4.1 Those primary and secondary schools, which were designed for respective intakes of 5,600 and 2,500 students, now have 9,072 and 16,296 respectively. In view of the enthusiasm which led to overutilization of the project installations, the Government requested the Bank Group's contribution to the financing of the remaining activities concerning the building of additional classrooms for secondary education (2nd cycle), the design of new programmes and textbooks, the initial training of teachers, the retraining of those employed in general secondary education (3<sup>rd</sup> cycle), in order to complete the reform of the educational system (Education Project II).

1.4.2 The project, strengthened by the contributions of complementary operations of donors such as the World Bank and UNDP, have contributed to the democratization of education through the correction of inequalities of access to education observed both at the regional and social levels. The project has made it possible to achieve massive basic and secondary education enrollment, which is both equitable and adapted to the needs of the country. It has contributed to the training of local staff who, in different capacities, are contributing to the revitalization of the different sectors of the national economy.

### **1.5 Sustainability**

1.5.1 The saturation and overutilization of the premises arising from the strong demand for education on general and technical secondary schools, is worsening the deteriorating condition of those facilities. The decentralization of education services and the development of central, local and municipal structures that would benefit from education management would be a major asset if socio-economic conditions were to improve.

1.5.2 The financing of recurrent costs remains a serious problem. The operating budget of the schools built under the project and the financial contributions of the pupils' parents to the tune of 38.7% of the said budget in order to have the means to cover recurrent costs, including the maintenance of infrastructure, remain insufficient.

## **1.6**                    **Conclusions**

1.6.1                    Despite difficulties during the implementation of the project, all those aspects of the education reform, for which the project was necessary, have been satisfactorily covered. Significant financial contributions from the Government and the Bank under the Education Project II have not only made it possible to consolidate the achievements of the project, but to resolve the problem of a bottleneck in secondary education created by the success of the ESREP.

1.6.2                    The shortage of teaching aids in general and technical secondary education could handicap the overall satisfactory performance of the ESREP.

## **1.7**                    **Feedback and Recommendations**

1.7.1                    The PPER preparation mission adheres to the conclusions and recommendations of the PCR (Section 11). The principal lessons other than those of the PCR are the following:

### **a)                    Feedback**

**Lesson 1:**            Any request for payment concerning the procurement of goods for use during the implementation of the project, should be accompanied by supporting documents such as delivery notes, and the receiving slips issued by the PIU confirming that the orders have been effectively received. (paragraph 3.2.3).

**Lesson 2:**            Slippage on project implementation periods leads to monitoring problems and jeopardizes the efficiency of the project (paragraph. 3.3.2).

**Lesson 3:**            The direct negotiation of the construction contract for the civil works with the municipalities because of the difficulty of access to the project site could result in slippage on implementation (paragraph. 3.5.2).

**Lesson 4:**            The recruitment of skilled staff and their assignment to the PIU for the duration of the project are prerequisites for the success of the project (paragraph. 4.4.3).

**Lesson 5:**            The organization of training seminars on the method of management of high intake schools, monitoring and evaluation for the mastery of education management of schools and the operating budget, for the directors of the PIU, schools and teachers, would enable them to play an active role in the operation of the structures established under the project. (paragraph 4.4.4).

**Lesson 6:**            The project mid-term review makes it possible to verify whether the objectives are likely to be attained and to take corrective measures where necessary (paragraph. 4.7.4).

### **b)                    Recommendations**

1.7.2                    In order to help it to improve the attainment of its development objectives in the education sector and the continuing implementation of the education reform, it is recommended to the Government to:

- (i)                    encourage the cofinancing of projects in a spirit of complementarity for the benefit of the target populations (definition of a joint programme to be backed by each donor in conformity with its own procurement rules) (paragraph 2.3.3);
- (ii)                    produce payment requests concerning the procurement of project goods, accompanied by supporting documents (delivery notes, final acceptance slip, etc) (paragraph 3.2.3);
- (iii)                    strengthen GEDSE by a monitoring and evaluation unit with a view to preparing all the documents relating to the post evaluation of projects and assisting the Ministry of Education in the cohesive monitoring of projects and studies, and providing information to the donors and cofinanciers of the said projects (paragraph 4.4.3);

- (iv) propose seminars for Chief Educational Officers, PIU managers, directors of schools and teachers, which will focus on: (a) the method of management of high intake schools; (b) monitoring and evaluation for the mastery of education management of schools and the operating budget ; (c) maintenance and upkeep problems; and (d) integration of young people following their vocational training (paragraph 4.4.4);
- (v) seek the contribution of donors (ADF) for future operations in the country (paragraph 4.4.5);
- (vi) with the donors define a common strategy for: (a) the development of vocational training for the revitalization of the infrastructure created and to be created in the context of future projects and make it productive; and the (b) design and production of textbooks (paragraph 4.4.5);
- (vii) establish a schools construction unit within the Schools Administration Directorate of the Ministry of Education which should cooperate with the PIUs established by the donors in agreement with the Government (paragraph 5.2.3);
- (viii) continue to apply its policy of replacing teaching and operating equipment with a view to facilitating the smooth monitoring of projects following the departure of the donors (paragraph 5.2.4);
- (ix) grant priority to future projects which focus on poverty reduction, women in development, funds for the integration of young people into working life, and environmental protection; (paragraph 7.1.2); and
- (x) provide a budgetary package for the preparation of future projects in collaboration with the donors (paragraph 7.1.2).

1.7.3 It is principally recommended to the Bank to:

- (i) continue to become more closely involved in the identification, preparation and appraisal of projects for cofinancing with other donors (paragraph 2.3.3);
- (ii) specify the social indicators during the identification, preparation and appraisal of projects to improve the supervision and post evaluation of the said projects (paragraph 2.5.2);
- (iii) require that payment requests submitted to it be accompanied by an original copy of the invoice, order form, a delivery note and/or reception slip prepared by the PIU (paragraph 3.2.3);
- (iv) strengthen GEDSE by the recruitment of two national experts in monitoring and evaluation and provide the necessary resources for the operation of the said monitoring/evaluation unit (paragraph 4.4.3);
- (v) finance training seminars for the monitoring/evaluation of school buildings (paragraph 4.4.4);
- (vi) support the Government in cooperation with other donors with a view to financing the following future projects: (a) strengthening of the already existing structures for the training of trainers; (b) strengthening of the vocational training subsector; (c) strengthening of secondary schools; (d) design and production of textbooks and teaching aids; and (e) the transfer of the headquarters of the HEI to a more appropriate site (paragraph 4.4.5); and

- (vii) support the Government through the Schools Administration Directorate of the MESYS for the establishment of a schools construction unit within it (paragraph 5.2.3) ;

## 2. PROJECT BACKGROUND

### 2.1 Country Economic Context

2.1.1 The Republic of Cape Verde is an archipelago comprising ten (10) islands, nine (9) of which are inhabited. It is situated approximately 659km west of the coast of Senegal. Its scarce natural resources, adverse weather conditions and narrow domestic markets have created austere conditions for a population of around 412,000, and encouraged a spectacularly high level of emigration. Water resources are primarily underground in most of the islands. There are few rainwater reservoirs and dams. The problem of water is one of the biggest constraints on Cape Verde's development.

2.1.2 In early 1991, the new Government formed by the opposition following the democratic transition, began to implement the objective of reducing the Government's role in the economy. It adopted structural reforms with a view to: (i) simplifying the public administration and the unwieldy administrative procedures; (ii) transferring the governmental portfolios in public enterprises to the private sector; (iii) developing the Government's strategy and analytical capacity; and (iv) restricting public investment to basic infrastructure and social services.

2.1.3 Despite the lack of natural resources and other structural constraints on the economy, GDP growth (at market prices) averaged 4% per year over the 1993/1995 period. This trend was maintained in 1996 owing to the adoption and implementation of practical economic policy measures. GDP structure is, however, dominated by the tertiary sector which accounts for 63.3% (i.e. 51.8% for the construction sector, 26.4% for the trade and transport sector, and 21.8% for the administration), the secondary sector for 22.3% and the primary sector for only 14.4%. Between 1980 and 1996 the GDP trend was as follows:

Table 2.1.1: GDP Trend (in million dollars) and Growth Range from 1980 to 1996

Year	1980	1985	1990	1991	1992	1993	1994	1995	1996
GDP in dollars	242	287	373	545	402	422	442	462	482
Growth Rate	-	-	0<3	6<8	3<6	3<6	3<6	3<6	3<6

Sources : United Nations, ESC, 1997 Report on Africa's Economic and Social Situation.

2.1.4 On the basis of the structural reforms adopted under the 2<sup>nd</sup> National Development Plan (1986-1990), the Government of Cape Verde had provided for a programme for the creation of 3,250 new jobs per year in processing industries, fisheries, tourism, transport and communications, construction and administration. This programme requires a significant increase in the number of middle management and supervisory staff. It was also planned to improve the qualifications of poorly educated staff to improve their productivity. The implementation of those measures assumed the existence of a functional and efficient educational system, adapted to the requirements of national development, and democratic.

2.1.5 The Cape Verdean educational system comprised a six-year basic education of two cycles, Elementary Basic Education (EBE) lasting four years and Complementary Basic Education (CBE) lasting two years. Secondary education also has two cycles. The first, known as Basic Secondary Education (BSE) lasts three years, while the second, known as Complementary Secondary Education (CSE) lasts two years. Only post secondary teacher-training activities were carried out in the country. These are mainly two-year training courses for CBE and secondary teachers. University studies are done abroad.

2.1.6 This system was plagued by problems such as the inadequacy of basic education facilities, the lack of qualified teachers, unsuitable curricula, a shortage of textbooks and teaching materials. All those shortcomings constituted constraints on the country's development, and prompted the Government to take a number of measures such as the restructuring of education, the democratization of education, improvement of the quality and efficiency of education, administrative restructuring and institution building, with a view to encouraging the expansion of the education system and improving its quality to achieve a closer match between education and its socioeconomic relevance.

2.1.7 More specifically, the reforms initiated are: (i) the restructuring of education; (ii) expansion of the education system and the extension of education; (iii) improving the quality and efficiency of education (activities concerning the training and retraining of teachers and other supervisory staff; the local preparation and production of textbooks and teaching aids, and the adaptation of curricula); and (iv) administrative restructuring and institution building.

## **2.2 History of Operations in the Social Sector**

2.2.1 The Bank Group's first operation in the social sector in the Republic of Cape Verde was in 1978. The Bank has financed one study and three (3) projects representing total commitments of UA 21.58 million for ADF and UA 1.10 million for TAF. The totality of the loans, amounting to UA 22.68 million, is allocated to education projects. These operations are summarized in Table H on page (v).

2.2.2 Of the three (3) social projects and one study financed by the Bank in the Republic of Cape Verde, only one project, namely Education II, is ongoing. This project, which is a continuation of the ESREP, has the specific objectives of increasing the intake capacity of general secondary education, improving the quality of general secondary education, strengthening the MESYS planning and management capacities, and developing informal education. The expected outputs are as follows: (i) expansion of general secondary education; (ii) improvement in the quality of secondary education; (iii) support for post-literacy education, while the grant for an amount of UA 0.23 million to be used to finance the economic and financial study of the Mindelo Health Plan was cancelled.

## **2.3 Project Formulation**

2.3.1 The Education System Restructuring and Expansion Project was appraised in December 1987, following a decision by the Government to implement an education reform which would permit the development of the human resources needed by the country for its economic, social and cultural development. This project, which was in keeping with the 2<sup>nd</sup> National Development Plan (1986-1990) comprised indicators, presented in the appraisal report, as follows: (i) abolition of the three shift system; (ii) increase in time allocated to pupils by teachers; (iii) access to primary education for 5,600 children and to secondary education for 2,500 children from rural and semi-urban areas; (iv) training of 130 student teachers, 130 teachers and organization of seminars for 18 local specialists in the design and production of teaching aids.

2.3.2 Following identification and preparation missions to Cape Verde by UNESCO in February and June 1987 respectively, the Bank agreed to finance the feasibility study on education reform involving a diagnostic review of the education system, the proposal of solutions to address the constraints on this system and the detailed preparation of all the technical aspects which would allow the smooth preparation and implementation of the said project.

2.3.3 The project components were selected on the basis of the conclusions of the study on education reform approved by the Bank and Government, following a Bank preparation mission in May 1987, and prepared in detail by the consultant in September 1987 in the performance of his duties. The ESREP, which complements and extends the World Bank project, is multifaceted and concerns basic education, general secondary education, technical secondary education, the training of trainers, and institution building. The detailed preparation of the project enabled the Bank to

field an appraisal mission in December 1987. Approved in May 1998, an ADF loan for an amount of UA 10.22 million was granted to the Republic of Cape Verde on 19 October 1989.

## **2.4 Project Rationale**

2.4.1 The Cape Verdean Government had to meet urgent economic, social and cultural needs of the population under difficult material and economic conditions following independence in 1975. This required primarily the building of technical institutional and socioeconomic capacities which were essential for the effective management and absorption of external transfers.

2.4.2 Education had been perceived as having to play a key role in this process of socioeconomic change since no real development process can be triggered without an adequate human resources development policy. To address the constraints on the education system, the Government decided to implement an education reform under the 2<sup>nd</sup> National Development Plan (1986-1990). A study on this reform, which, in addition to the major orientations of the restructuring of the education system proposed by it, also identified and prepared among others this project, which is likely to facilitate the implementation of the reform.

2.4.3 Bank strategy, as defined in the 1996-1998 Country Strategy Paper, aims to assist the Republic of Cape Verde in attaining sustainable growth and reducing the country's external dependence. Also, as part of its operations, the Bank intends to prioritize the development of the transport and agriculture sectors, the strengthening of the social sector and the promotion of income-generating activities.

## **2.5 Objectives and Scope of the Evaluation**

2.5.1 At appraisal, the aim of the project was to contribute to the development of human resources and the specific objectives to permit the expansion of basic education and general and technical secondary education, to promote the extension of education, and to contribute to improving the quality of education. The quantitative sectoral objectives, as well as the expected outcomes of the structural reforms of the education system following the implementation of the project, were specified in the appraisal report..

2.5.2 The logical framework of measures was not prepared for the appraisal report. However, the report clearly stated the goals and objectives, as well as the expected outcomes. For the purposes of the post evaluation of this project, a retrospective logical framework of measures has been prepared (Annex 2) and performance and impact indicators identified for the assessment of performances regarding the outcomes and attainment of the objectives of this project (Annex 3).

## **2.6 Financial Arrangements**

2.6.1 The estimated project cost was UA 11.35 million. The project was to be cofinanced by the Government and the ADF to the tune of UA 1.13 and 10.22 million respectively. The ADF loan was to be used to finance the totality of the foreign exchange costs, and around 50% of the local currency costs. The Government was to finance the local currency costs.

2.6.2 Prior to the first disbursement, the Government was to undertake to make regular appropriations in its budget to finance its share of the project costs in conformity with the financing plan, and to secure supplementary financing in the event of overruns on the estimated project costs.

## **2.7 Evaluation Methodology and Approach**

2.7.1 The post-evaluation methodology used consisted of a comparison between the project outcomes and the objectives set at appraisal. The following activities were carried out: (i) a review of the documents available at the Bank, the PIU, the MESYS, the Ministry of Finance, and UNDP; (ii) working sessions with officials of the PIU, GEDSE, the schools visited, the BETTC, UNDP, the HEI and the Director of the World Bank-financed Education Project and former director of the PIU under the ESREP; (iii) a comparison of outputs to estimates; (iv) site inspections; and (v) a wrap-up meeting with the PIU Management.

2.7.2 These activities were carried out in close cooperation with the services of the Ministry of Education, Science, Youth and Sports.

### **3. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION**

#### **3.1 Loan Effectiveness**

The conditions of loan effectiveness are set out in paragraph 4.1.1. of the completion report. The Government had difficulties in complying with conditions (1) and (7) concerning the appropriation in the annual budget to meet its share in the project costs, and evidence of the lands selected as project sites having been allocated exclusively to the project without charge. There were two types of difficulties: (i) the problem of availability of resources and budget programming; and (ii) difficulties related to the number of land subdivisions, the requirements of the owners and the joint ownership of land by persons resident outside Cape Verde. Since the conditions precedent to the first disbursement were only fulfilled nineteen (19) months later, the project only became effective on 5 February 1990.

#### **3.2 Changes in Project Scope**

##### **A. Project Location**

3.2.1 Since the site of the Cidade Velha School to be rehabilitated, initially identified at appraisal, had become too small in relation to the scale of the rehabilitation programme, the Government, therefore, opted for a new site on the outskirts of Cidade Velha. This change of site did not have any impact on costs, for the new site was on public land.

##### **B. Construction Work**

3.2.2 The buildings were designed and built as simple solid structures with the use of materials requiring little maintenance. The foundations, beams and poles are made of locally made reinforced concrete. The above-grade walls are of heavy hollow blocks of cement mortar, coated with three coats of paint on the two sides. For multi-storey buildings, a flat roof system was used covered with several layers of water proofing. The Government completed eight (8) additional classrooms and nine (9) classrooms respectively for the basic education component and the secondary school of Achada S. Filipe in Praia under supplementary works. The carpentry, internal doors, entry doors are of hard wood. The flooring and walls of the toilets are of imported tiling. The sanitary fittings in most schools have not been installed for difficulties with running water. The costs were kept down by using local expertise..

##### **C. Furniture and Equipment**

3.2.3 The eight (8) classrooms for basic education and the nine (9) classrooms for the secondary school of Achada S. Filipe have been fully equipped. The purchase of four (4) vehicles (3 Toyota Landcruisers and one Toyota Corolla) for an amount of BF 2,668,000, i.e. UA 63,094.85 under the project have not, as of the date of the post-evaluation mission, been delivered by the supplier. Following unsuccessful approaches to the supplier in question for the delivery or repayment of the amount disbursed, the Bank and Government learnt that the successful bidder had gone bankrupt ( ref. final internal audit report No. FR/93/17 of the ESREP).

##### **D. Technical Assistance**

3.2.4 The services to be provided under technical assistance for training were negotiated with UNESCO which has the skills required in the performance of similar tasks financed by the Bank. This technical assistance for the planned activities (organizational and teaching assessment of the SETTC, adjustment of the curricula and training programmes of the SETTC, strengthening of the Education General Inspectorate, education planning, establishment of the independent educational and vocational guidance centre, private education supervisory service and scholarships management service) has been provided. The curricula for the 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> cycles were prepared

with the financial and technical assistance of other donors such as the European Union.. The institutions which received technical assistance have improved their organization and management system.

3.2.5 The training and retraining sessions organized for directors, delegates, teachers and technicians have made it possible for the beneficiaries to acquire know-how in the areas of planning, management, computers and educational psychology..

### **E. Training**

3.2.6 The six-month educational psychology training course for 7 teachers in Portugal was covered by bilateral cooperation of the Cape Verdean Government with Portugal under the ESREP. They are all employed by the MESYS. By carrying out training in mathematics, physical science and geography in conformity with teaching requirements, they will contribute to improvements in the quality of education.

### **3.3 Implementation Schedule**

3.3.1 The appraisal report had estimated a project implementation period of four and a half (4½) years, as from August 1988. The project started with a delay of 19 months and there were respective slippages of 29 months, 23 months, 27 months and 30 months on the implementation of categories of expenditure such as civil works, the supply of furniture and equipment, technical assistance and training..

3.3.2 The original schedule was not adhered to. There were several reasons for the slippage on the implementation of all categories of expenditure, namely: (i) difficulties encountered in fulfilling the conditions precedent to loan effectiveness (ref. paragraph 3.1); (ii) difficulties in establishing the Project Implementation Unit (PIU); (iii) the Government's lack of familiarity with the rules and procedures for the procurement of goods and services; (iv) the suspension of project coordination at the institutional level by the former GEP; (v) the incompetence of the accounting assistant responsible for the project's financial and accounting management; and (vi) the irregular payment of Government counterpart funds.

3.3.3 The different problems encountered led to slippage on the overall implementation schedule of activities. The changes to the implementation schedule resulted in changes to the expenditure schedule. Disbursements began in late 1990 (ref. paragraph F page iv).

### **3.4 Reporting**

The Loan Agreement specified that the Borrower produce and submit quarterly works and financial status reports, certified true copies of the project financial statements immediately following verification of the relevant accounts three months after the end of the financial year, as well as a project completion report. The Government only submitted ten (10) half year project status reports and a completion report prepared and submitted to the Bank in February 1997. Since the project accounts were not audited, the financial statements were not submitted to the Bank.

### **3.5 Procurement of Goods and Services**

3.5.1 Overall, the method of procurement recommended in the appraisal report was finally adhered to by the Government despite difficulties concerning lack of familiarity with the rules and procedures for the procurement of goods and services observed at the start-up of the project.

3.5.2 In chapter 5.2 of the appraisal report it was specified that Category C works would be implemented on force account, in view of the difficulties of access to the areas concerned, as well as low estimated costs, by the Ministry of Public Works which had competent technical services, and which was said to have considerable experience in the implementation of construction work in relatively inaccessible areas. This recommendation has not yet been implemented for the

construction work on Cidade Velha primary school which had been awarded to the municipality of Praia, which had tremendous difficulty in finishing the work. The Government was compelled to call on civil servants from the Ministry of Public works to complete the construction work on the said school..

### **3.6 Project Cost**

The original project cost was UA 11.35 million, of which UA 9.09 million in foreign exchange and UA 2.26 million in local currency. Overall, the budget forecasts of the appraisal report were maintained within reasonable limits. However, it should be noted that cost overruns of approximately 8.9% were noted in the “construction” and “furniture and equipment” expenditure categories.

### **3.7 Disbursements and Sources of Financing**

3.7.1 ADF disbursements originally planned over 5 years, were finally released over a 7 year period. There were no disbursements in 1988, 1989 owing to the postponement of the deadline for the effective starting date of project activities. By the end of the last five years, disbursements stood at UA 8.69 million, i.e. 84.14%. The total amount of ADF disbursements for all categories of expenditure combined was UA 9.84 million, i.e. 96.37% of the loan amount. There was a balance of approximately UA 0.37 million, i.e. 3.63%, on the ADF loan, whereas the text books and teaching aids for secondary education were still to be supplied. It would be necessary to use the balance of UA 370,000 for the purchase of textbooks which is a serious problem for the Government.

3.7.2 The counterpart funds (UA 1.13 million) were mainly used to honour the Government’s undertakings in respect of construction work, furniture and equipment, as well as the operating costs of the PIU. In late 1992, the final year for disbursements as planned at appraisal, Government disbursements represented 50.61% of the estimated amount. They were spread over 8 years owing to the financial difficulties of the country whose public resources were steadily dwindling. This situation constantly forced project management to utilize the ADF revolving fund to meet the project requirements. It should be noted that these drawdowns were repaid as soon as the Government released funds for the project.

### **3.8 Compliance with Loan Conditions and Covenants**

The loan conditions are repeated in the PCR (Section 4.1). The loan conditions, in the form of undertakings, were fulfilled with considerable difficulty by the Government. Those difficulties were related to insufficient counterpart funds, their irregular payment, and to the acquisition of title deeds for the land selected as sites for the said project. This led to considerable slippage on the project implementation schedule (ref. paragraph 3.3.3). The first disbursement was only released nineteen (19) months later. The Government of Cape Verde did not regularly submit project status to the Bank.. No audit of accounts was conducted. The other conditions, however, were fulfilled without difficulty. In view of the difficulties encountered by the Government in fulfilling conditions (1) and (7), the financial arrangements specified in the loan agreement were justified.

## **4. PERFORMANCE EVALUATION**

### **4.1 OPERATING PERFORMANCE**

4.1.1 Available information and site visits confirmed the physical existence of all the structures and equipment procured with the exception of four vehicles for the “technical education” component and the PIU for reasons described in paragraph 3.2.3.

#### **a) Basic Education Schools**

4.1.2 The project has contributed to the medium-term attainment of the Government's priority objective to ensure countrywide coverage for basic education. A 4.1% average growth in

the school enrollment rate was observed between 1996 and 1998. The basic education schools, which came on stream following final acceptance, are operating normally. Designed for an intake of 5,600 students, they now have approximately 9,072 students. The gross and net enrollment rates rose from 95% and 83% respectively in 1988-1987 to 118% and 96% in 1998-1999 (the high rate of 118% is partly due to the double shift system: one classroom is used twice in the same day). Furthermore, the repeater rate, which was 16.9% in 1993-1994, fell to 7% in 1998-1999, with the dropout rate also falling to 1.8% from 3.6% over the same period. The proportion of girls to the number of children enrolled in basic education is estimated at 49%. The number of qualified teachers rose from 2,740 in 1994-1995 to 3,254 in 1998-1999. The percentage of qualified teachers rose from 54.9% in 1994-1995 to 62.3% in 1998-1999. Despite the Government's efforts, it was, however, noted that scarcely 39.5% of the existing teachers had the necessary skills to teach an uninterrupted 6-year cycle. To resolve this problem, the Government made provision in its 3<sup>rd</sup> National Development Plan (1997-2000) for the training of 640 teachers and the retraining of 600 existing teachers.

#### **b) General and Technical Secondary Education.**

4.1.3 As from 1987, secondary education expanded rapidly as the conditions were reached for the countrywide implementation of the education reforms and as the efficiency of the schools network improved. This was due to the rapid increase in the enrollment of children in the 13 to 18 age bracket, until the countrywide adoption of the 6-year basic education cycle impacted on secondary education. This situation led, therefore, to a mismatch between the secondary education structure and human resource development requirements and insufficient intake capacity of the education system, etc. The project, in the context of the education system reform, made possible the building of 61 new classrooms in the secondary schools of São Felipe, Ribeira Grande, and Praia, as well as 9 classrooms in the secondary school of Achada S. Felipe as part of the supplementary works, thus meeting the country's requirements, and in conformity with the project objectives.

4.1.4 From 11,461 pupils in 1991-1992, the total number of pupils rose to 16,167 in 1994-1995, and to 37,290 in 1998-1999. The respective gross and net enrollment rates were 55.1% and 45.8%, with a repeater rate of 9.9% in 1998-1999. The female enrolment rate rose from 5,616 in 1991-1992 to 19,017 in 1998-1999, i.e. an average growth rate of approximately 1.2% per year. The number of teachers rose from 408 in 1991-1992 to 1372 in 1998-1999. However, only 60% of the 1372 teachers were suitably qualified. It should be noted that this outstanding improvement in the education system was not entirely due to the Bank-financed Education System Restructuring and Expansion Project. However, the project had a real impact on the education system in that it contributed to an improvement in the intake capacity of general and technical secondary education. The operating performance was considered satisfactory.

#### **4.2 Financial Performance**

**4.2.1 The local currency counterpart funds were not often available, resulting in the frequent use by the PIU Management of the revolving fund to cover its immediate requirements.**

4.2.2 Order No 17/97 of the 21 April 1997, concerning the financial contribution of pupils' parents to the operating budgets of schools where their children are enrolled, has enabled the directors of such schools to constitute a revolving fund for the financing of their activities. In Cape Verde, this budget is estimated at between ECV 750 and 9,000 (UA 1 = ECV 696 as at 31 January 1999) per child per year after the seventh year in the case of secondary education. Although primary education is free, the parents of pupils at the primary schools of Cidade Velha and 13 Janeiro will, however, contribute to the tune of an average of 1,200 escudos per child per year, which is significant. This represents a source of income of approximately 14.5% of the operating budget of those schools, which enables the Directors to be financially autonomous and to cover recurrent costs (upkeep and maintenance costs, wages of non-teaching staff). Furthermore, the canteens in basic education schools are supplied through the World Food Programme (WFP). The financial performance is considered satisfactory.

### 4.3 Economic Performance

4.3.1 The “construction” expenditure category was an integral part of the expanded public investment programme that was one of the determining factors of GDP growth. The real growth rate of around 1.7% in 1989-1991 rose to an annual average rate of 4% in 1991-1995. On the whole, the project outputs and the resulting payments have boosted commercial activities. The different training courses dispensed, as well as the teaching aids acquired, have made it possible to improve the quality of education, which is vital for the development of high calibre human resources for the different growth sectors, including the economy.

4.3.2 At appraisal, it had been noted that few resources had been allocated to the financing of education. This led to a high unit cost per pupil in EBE and CBE, as well as in general and technical secondary education, of ECV 5,048 in 1986-1987, i.e. UA 63.41. By 1998-1999, the unit cost per pupil had risen to ECV 35,618, i.e. UA 268.42. Indeed, the project was instrumental in the Government’s decision to increase its general budget appropriation for education to an annual average rate of 17.71%. However, the unit cost per pupil remains very high in comparison with that of Senegal of UA 150. The economic performance is considered satisfactory.

### 4.4 Institutional and Social Performance

#### a) Institutional Development

4.4.1 The reorganization of the Ministry of Education led to changes in the organizational structures. Under the new arrangements, basic education, general and technical secondary education, as well as post secondary education, fall within the purview of the Ministry of Education. The administration of the education system is carried out at central level by the Office of the Minister and by the technical departments under it, especially the General Directorates of Studies and Planning, Administration, Education, and Out-of-School Education, as well as the General Inspectorate.

4.4.2 In each of the islands of the country the central administration is represented by delegates and subdelegates grouping together the principal technical skills within the central bodies of the MESYS. Against this administrative background, the primary schools and high schools are managed by directors (in the case of primary schools) and principals (in the case of secondary schools). The general supervision of secondary and primary schools is carried out by schools inspectors based in Praia, but who visit the different schools periodically.

**4.4.3 The institutional impact on basic education, as well as general and technical secondary education, has resulted in the implementation by GEDSE and the PIU, of programme monitoring, organization and preparation activities in order to improve national educational structures, which have made it possible to achieve highly satisfactory education performances over the past three years. The return home of trainee teachers from abroad to work in the different schools built under the ESREP project, is dependent on sound organization and rigorous management of the PIU, secondary education and GEDSE. The Government’s priority is to train teachers at the Higher Education Institute that cannot meet the Government’s current teacher requirements unless it is restructured to be able to full play its teacher training role.**

4.4.4 Despite the efforts made to introduce new management models and modern equipment, human resource management weaknesses persist, following the evaluation of the implementation of projects in the organic framework, and in the area of coordination. There are still shortfalls in human resources, especially in the areas of education management and administration and education planning. The institutional performance was considered satisfactory.

4.4.5 In the education sector, a RoundTable will make it possible to harmonize the activities of the Bank and its partners. Prior to, and following this, donors meetings will be organized to ensure that each operator selects and specifies his priorities. A mid-term review of the Education Project II will enable the Operations Evaluation (OPEV) and Country Operations

(OCDW) Departments to take part in all the meetings to put into practice the lessons drawn from the ESREP project. The Bank's performance was considered satisfactory.

**b) Efficiency of Management and Organization**

4.4.6 The management model of the education system operates basically at two levels: the central level, and local and municipal level. Changes have occurred with regard to decentralization and representativeness. Some legal provisions and instruments have been introduced to legitimize the structural changes of the system, especially the fundamental law of the educational system, the teachers' career statute, a new organic law concerning the Ministry of Education, and the organization of decentralized services. Compliance with, and application of, school timetables have improved the efficiency of the management and organization of schools. It should be noted that the decentralization information system has not yet been assimilated by the different services responsible for the implementation of the programme and its monitoring.

**c) Socio-economic Impact**

4.4.7 The building of the different schools has provided many Cape Verdean children of school age with the opportunity of basic education as initially planned at appraisal. Indeed, the implementation of the ESREP has not only facilitated access to education, but has also made possible the countrywide expansion of integrated basic education. Furthermore the project, strengthened by the contributions of complementary operations of donors such as the World Bank and UNDP, has contributed to the expansion of education by correcting the inequalities of access to education observed prior to the project, both at the regional and social levels.

4.4.8 The project created one hundred and sixty eight (168) classrooms for thirty-nine (39) new schools and thirty-six (36) expanded primary schools, and created sixty-one (61) classrooms for three secondary schools, in order to attain its objective of creating an improved and equitable teaching environment. It has also helped to increase the total number of students enrolled in the education system from 65,879 in 1986-1987 to 133,769 in 1998-1999. Furthermore, it has strengthened the Government's education reform policy which will permit the development of the human resources required by the country to address the challenge of its economic, social and cultural development. The socio-economic performance is satisfactory.

**4.5 Impact on Women**

Girls are not disadvantaged, either in the teaching dispensed, or in the quality of the education. However, as a result of the project, which has established new school structures, more girls have the opportunity of being enrolled in basic education and secondary (general and technical) schools. Girls represent around 58% of all pupils enrolled in all the schools established under the project. Women play a major role in the Cape Verdean education system, since they account for 42.1% of all teachers and 44.8% of primary school teachers

**4.6 Environmental Performance**

The buildings and different civil works structures of the schools completed have no environmental impact, and stand out in the surrounding countryside. Modern in style, they provide a pleasant environment. Their appearance and level of finishing are satisfactory. The piping problems have been resolved and the system is operating normally. For those reasons, the environmental performance is satisfactory.

**4.7 Performance of Consultants, Suppliers, Contractors and the Borrower.**

**a) Performance of Consultants**

4.7.1 The consultants performed all their assigned duties in conformity with the terms of reference of their mission. The performance of the consultant responsible for the architectural design of the entire project, in particular, the engineering designs and works supervision, was satisfactory.

**b) Performance of the Contractors and Suppliers**

4.7.2 The contractors, who carried out the construction work, built sound structures in conformity with standard practices within the allotted time frames, despite difficult working conditions. All the structures have been in only partially satisfactory condition since their commissioning, in so far as the electricity circuit is inappropriate for school buildings.

**4.7.3 The acceptance reports indicate that supplies were of high quality and delivered within the contractual periods. However, four vehicles were not delivered for the PIU and for the “technical education” component for reasons described in paragraph 3.2.3. The furniture is not sound, which raises problems of sustainability. For those reasons, the performance of the suppliers is considered partially satisfactory.**

**c) The Borrower’s Performance**

4.7.4 The Government of Cape Verde fulfilled the conditions of loan effectiveness. However, the first loan disbursement was only released nineteen (19) months later. This led to slippage on the implementation schedule. As underlined in paragraph 4.2.1, the national financial counterpart was not always available during the project implementation period. This situation compelled the PIU Management to make use of the revolving fund to honour its commitments. The annual audit of project accounts, which was to be conducted by the Government in conformity with the Loan Agreement, was not carried out. However, the Government successfully carried out its structural reforms and introduced major changes to the education system during the period of project implementation. For all those reasons, the Borrower’s performance is considered satisfactory.

**4.8 The Bank's Performance**

4.8.1 The project was identified by UNESCO, and the Bank intervened in its preparation and appraisal.. The appraisal was conducted at Praia, and in the other islands, with a view to discussing the different aspects of the project’s implementation.

4.8.2 Project implementation was monitored by the Bank’s operations departments, in cooperation with the Borrower. The Bank allocated 210 staff/days in the field, primarily to the monitoring, technical supervision and preparation of the completion report. The technical supervision missions made it possible to resolve some problems relating to the procurement of goods and services, in particular the preparation and management of updated lists of goods and services. These measures strengthened the project’s implementation capacity.

**5. PROJECT SUSTAINABILITY**

**5.1 Physical Sustainability**

The saturation and overutilization of the premises resulting from the high demand for education on primary and general and technical secondary schools built have worsened the deterioration of the facilities. It should be noted that, in some schools, walls are cracked and the desk-benches have been weakened in places, resulting in the deterioration of the structures and lowering the physical sustainability of the buildings.

**5.2 Sustainability of Project Impacts**

5.2.1 In 1992, the Government prepared, adopted and launched its Third National Development Plan and an Economic Reform Programme, based, inter alia, on the establishment of an integrated basic education and vocational and technical training system, the broadening of the scope of secondary education, the provision of institutional resources to plan and manage education and training programmes.

5.2.2 The political environment is stable due to an effective democratic transition, and good governance.

5.2.3 The decentralization of the education services and the development of central, local and municipal structures that would benefit from education management constitute assets, provided that the socioeconomic conditions improve.

5.2.4 The financing of recurrent costs remains a serious problem. The operating budget of the schools built under the project and the financial participation of pupils' parents to the tune of 38.7% of the said budget, in order to constitute the resources to cover recurrent costs, including the maintenance of infrastructure, remain insufficient..

## **6. PERFORMANCE RATINGS**

The performance ratings tables are presented in Annex 3

### **6.1 Implementation Performance**

The implementation performance was considered satisfactory. The Government started the project activities 19 months behind schedule, owing to difficulties concerning the fulfillment of conditions (1) and (7) precedent to the first disbursement, in conformity with the Loan Agreement. Overall, there was 54 months slippage on the original implementation schedule. The four indicators retained obtained scores of between 1 and 3.

### **6.2 The Bank's Performance**

The Bank's performance was satisfactory. The four indicators retained obtained scores of between 2 and 3. Indeed, the Bank participated in the identification of the project by agreeing to finance the feasibility study which was to include a diagnostic review of the education system on the one hand, and monitored the activities of the organization responsible for the conduct of the said study, namely UNESCO, on the other. Project preparation and appraisal were carried out in Praia and in the other islands with a view to selecting the project components and discussing the different aspects of implementation. The Bank allocated 210 staff/days to project monitoring and supervision.

### **6.3 Performance of Outcomes**

On the whole the outcomes are satisfactory but the individual scores awarded vary considerably from one indicator to another. For institutional development. the objectives were satisfactorily achieved since the four individual indicators obtained scores of between 2 and 3. The scores vary from 1 to 3 for the sustainability indicators, for which the overall average is 1.87, with three indicators unsatisfactory, namely economic and financial viability including cost recovery systems, and environmental viability with the lowest score. On the other hand, the relevance and attainment of objectives indicator obtained an average of 2.29. It was noted that the objectives of promoting an efficient educational system were attained..

## **7. CONCLUSIONS ET RECOMMENDATIONS**

### **7.1 Overall Assessment**

7.1.1 Despite difficulties during the implementation of the project, all those aspects of the education reform, for which the project was necessary, have been satisfactorily covered. Significant financial contributions from the Government and the Bank under the Education Project II have not only made it possible to consolidate the achievements of the project, but to resolve the problem of a bottleneck in secondary education created by the success of the ESREP project.

7.1.2 Significant financial contributions by the Government, the Bank and the other donors will make it possible to resolve the following problems: (a) the strengthening of already financed training structures (extension, furniture, equipment, textbooks, training and retraining of

teachers); (b) the establishment of one or two technical and vocational training centres (furniture and equipment and reinsertion fund), and the strengthening of the Vocational Training Board; (c) the strengthening of secondary schools to resolve the problem of the bottleneck created by the success of the ESREP; (the design and production of textbooks and teaching aids for all levels of education (training of designers for 2 to 3 years); (e) the solution of sanitary problems in rural schools (latrines) in the form of concrete proposals to the Bank; and (f) an acute lack of teaching aids in general and technical and secondary education.

## **7.2 Feedback and Recommendations**

7.2.1 The PPER preparation mission adheres to the conclusions and recommendations of the PCR (Section 11). The principal lessons other than those of the PCR are the following:

### **a) Feedback**

**Lesson 1:** Any request for payment concerning the procurement of goods for use during the implementation of the project, should be accompanied by supporting documents such as delivery notes, and the receiving slips issued by the PIU confirming that the orders have been effectively received. (paragraph 3.2.3).

**Lesson 2:** Slippage on project implementation periods leads to monitoring problems and jeopardizes the efficiency of the project (paragraph. 3.3.2).

**Lesson 3:** The direct negotiation of the construction contract for the civil works with the municipalities because of the difficulty of access to the project site could result in slippage on implementation (paragraph. 3.5.2).

**Lesson 4:** The recruitment of skilled staff and their assignment to the PIU for the duration of the project are prerequisites for the success of the project (paragraph. 4.4.3).

**Lesson 5:** The organization of training seminars on the method of management of high intake schools, monitoring and evaluation for the mastery of education management of schools and the operating budget, for the directors of the PIU, schools and teachers, would enable them to play an active role in the operation of the structures established under the project. (paragraph 4.4.4).

**Lesson 6:** The project mid-term review makes it possible to verify whether the objectives are likely to be attained and to take corrective measures where necessary (paragraph. 4.7.4).

### **b) Recommendations**

7.2.2 In order to help it to improve the attainment of its development objectives in the education sector and the continuing implementation of the education reform, it is recommended to the Government to:

- (i) encourage the cofinancing of projects in a spirit of complementarity for the benefit of the target populations (definition of a joint programme to be backed by each donor in conformity with its own procurement rules) (paragraph 2.3.3);
- (ii) produce payment requests concerning the procurement of project goods, accompanied by supporting documents (delivery notes, final acceptance slip, etc) (paragraph 3.2.3);
- (iii) strengthen GEDSE by a monitoring and evaluation unit with a view to preparing all the documents relating to the post evaluation of projects and assisting the Ministry of Education in the cohesive monitoring of projects and studies, and providing information to the donors and cofinanciers of the said projects (paragraph 4.4.3);
- (iv) propose seminars for Chief Educational Officers, PIU managers, directors of schools and teachers, which will focus on: (a) the method of management of high intake schools; (b)

monitoring and evaluation for the mastery of education management of schools and the operating budget ; (c) maintenance and upkeep problems; and (d) integration of young people following their vocational training (paragraph 4.4.4);

- (v) seek the contribution of donors (ADF) for future operations in the country (paragraph 4.4.5);
- (vi) with the donors, define a common strategy for: (a) the development of vocational training for the revitalization of the infrastructure created, and to be created, in the context of future projects, and make it productive; and the (b) design and production of textbooks (paragraph 4.4.5);
- (vii) establish a schools construction unit within the Schools Administration Directorate of the Ministry of Education which should cooperate with the PIUs established by the donors in agreement with the Government (paragraph 5.2.3);
- (viii) continue to apply its policy of replacing teaching and operating equipment with a view to facilitating the smooth monitoring of projects following the departure of the donors (paragraph 5.2.4);
- (ix) grant priority to future projects which focus on poverty reduction, women in development, funds for the integration of young people into working life, and environmental protection; (paragraph 7.1.2); and
- (x) provide a budgetary package for the preparation of future projects in collaboration with the donors (paragraph 7.1.2).

7.2.3 It is principally recommended to the Bank to:

- (i) continue to become more closely involved in the identification, preparation and appraisal of projects for cofinancing with other donors (paragraph 2.3.3);
- (ii) specify the social indicators during the identification, preparation and appraisal of projects to improve the supervision and post evaluation of the said projects (paragraph 2.5.2);
- (iii) require that payment requests submitted to it be accompanied by an original copy of the invoice, order form, a delivery note and/or reception slip prepared by the PIU (paragraph 3.2.3);
- (iv) strengthen GEDSE by the recruitment of two national experts in monitoring and evaluation and provide the necessary resources for the operation of the said monitoring/evaluation unit (paragraph 4.4.3);
- (v) finance training seminars for the monitoring/evaluation of school buildings (paragraph 4.4.4);
- (vi) support the Government, in cooperation with other donors, with a view to financing the following future projects: (a) strengthening of the already existing structures for the training of trainers; (b) strengthening of the vocational training subsector; (c) strengthening of secondary schools; (d) design and production of textbooks and teaching aids; and (e) the transfer of the headquarters of the HEI to a more appropriate site (paragraph 4.4.5); and
- (vii) support the Government through the Schools Administration Directorate of the MESYS for the establishment of a schools construction unit within it (paragraph 5.2.3) ;

### **7.3 Follow-up Measures**

The matrix of recommendations and follow-up measures is presented in Annex 1. In order to safeguard the investment already made and preserve the benefits of the project impact on the country's socio-economic development, the Bank will have to support the Government in strengthening the existing structures for the training of trainers, the vocational training subsector and secondary schools, and help it to design and produce textbooks and teaching aids.

**REPUBLIC OF CAPE VERDE**  
**EDUCATION SYSTEM RESTRUCTURING AND EXPANSION PROJECT**  
**RETROSPECTIVE PROJECT LOGICAL FRAMEWORK**

HIERARCHY OF OBJECTIVES	OBJECTIVELY VERIFIABLE INDICATORS			MEANS OF VERIFICATION	ASSUMPTIONS (VERIFICATION)
	At Appraisal	On Completion	Post-Evaluation		
<b><u>SECTOR GOALS:</u></b>					
1. Contribute to human resource development.	1.1.E 160 classrooms built (39 new schools and 36 expanded schools) for basic education, 61 classrooms (3 secondary schools) for secondary education, 416 teachers retrained, 72 coordinators trained and 120 teachers trained..	1.1.A Idem.	1.1.P Idem.	1.1.1 Bank appraisal and technical supervision reports and quarterly status reports of the PIU, World Bank and EEC.	
<b><u>SPECIFIC OBJECTIVES:</u></b>					
2. Expansion of basic education and general and technical secondary education.	2.1.E (i) Number of classrooms up from 1,056 in 1986/1987 to 1,253 in 1990/1991	2.1.A (i) Number of classrooms up from 1,056 in 1986/1987 to 1,900 in 1996/1997.	2.1.P (i) Number of classrooms up from 1,056 in 1986/1987 to 2,408 in 1998/1999.	2.1.1 (i) MESYS statistical data, Appraisal Report and PCR..	2.1.1.1 (i) bidding launched and contracts executed..
3.Improved access to education.	3.1.E (ii) Number of pupils (basic education, general and technical secondary) up from 65,879 in 1986/87 to 73,979 in 1990/1991. Net enrollment down from 95% in 1986-1987 to 83% in 1990-1991	3.1.A (ii) Number of pupils (basic and general and technical secondary education) increased from 65,879 in 1986/1987 to 113,594 in 1996/1997.	3.1.P (ii) Number of pupils (basic and general and technical secondary education) up from 65,879 in 1986/1987 to 133,760 in 1998/1999. The net enrollment rate increased from 83% in 1986-1987 to 96% in 1998-1999.	3.1.1 (ii) Idem.	3.1.1.1 (ii) Teachers are well trained and the new programmes have been implemented
4. Improve the quality of education	4.1.E The average repeater and dropout rates fell from 30% and 35% in 1986/1987 to 22% and 26% in 1993/1994. The number of teachers increased from 2,013 in 1986/1987 to 2,273 in 1993/1994. The pupil /teacher ratio fell from 33/1 to 28/1 for the same period.	4.1.A (iii) Number of teachers increased from 2,013 in 1986/1987 to 4,190 in 1996/1997. The pupil/teacher ratio fell from 33/1 to 24/1 over the same period.	4.1.P The repeater and dropout rates fell from 30% and 35% in 1986/1987 to 7% and 1.8% in 1998/1999. The number of teachers increased from 2,013 in 1986/1987 to 5,062 in 1998/1999. The ratio fell from 33/1 to 26/1 over the same period..	4.1.1 (iii) Idem.	4.1.1.1 (iii) Idem.

**REPUBLIC OF CAPE VERDE**  
**EDUCATION SYSTEM RESTRUCTURING AND EXPANSION PROGRAMME**  
**RETROSPECTIVE PROJECT LOGICAL FRAMEWORK**

HIERARCHY OF OBJECTIVES	OBJECTIVELY VERIFIABLE INDICATORS			MEANS OF VERIFICATION	ASSUMPTIONS (VERIFICATION)
	At Appraisal	On Completion	Post Evaluation		
<b>OUTPUTS:</b>					
5. Construction of basic education schools.	5.1.E 160 classrooms, 15 kitchens and pantries, 11 storerooms, 29 toilet facilities for teachers and pupils, 8 general purpose rooms, 4 administrative areas.	5.1.A 169 classrooms, 15 kitchens and pantries, 11 storerooms, 29 toilet facilities for pupils and teachers, 8 general purpose rooms; 4 administrative areas.	5.1.P A 165 classrooms, 12 kitchens and pantries, 9 storerooms, 25 toilet facilities for pupils and teachers, 6 general purpose rooms, 4 administrative areas.	5.1.1 Bank Appraisal and Technical Supervision Reports and quarterly PIU status reports, the PCR of the Borrower, and the ADB.	5.1.1.The technical coordinators properly monitor the sites
6. Construction of general and technical secondary education schools.	6.1.E 57 classrooms; 3 administrative areas comprising 4 meeting rooms, 3 libraries, 10 teachers' offices, 9 administrative offices (management), 3 documentation rooms, 10 storerooms, 3 canteens; 3 communal service areas comprising 9 utility rooms, 3 kitchens, 16 toilets and 1 cafeteria.	6.1.A 61 classrooms; 3 administrative areas comprising 4 meeting rooms, 3 libraries, 10 teachers' offices, 3 teachers' rooms, 9 administrative offices (management), 3 documentation rooms, 10 storerooms, 3 canteens; 3 communal service areas comprising 9 utility rooms, 3 kitchens, 16 toilets and 1 cafeteria.	6.1.P A 63 classrooms; 4 administrative areas comprising 4 meeting rooms, 3 libraries, 13 teachers' offices, 5 teachers' rooms, 9 administrative offices (management), 4 documentation rooms, 14 storerooms, 5 canteens; 4 communal service areas comprising 7 utility rooms, 5 kitchens, 14 toilets, 1 cafeteria.	6.1.1 Idem.	6.1.1.1 Bidding was launched and the contracts executed..

**REPUBLIC OF CAPE VERDE  
EDUCATION SYSTEM RESTRUCTURING AND EXPANSION PROJECT  
RETROSPECTIVE PROJECT LOGICAL FRAMEWORK**

HIERARCHY OF OBJECTIVES	OBJECTIVELY VERIFIABLE INDICATORS			MEANS OF VERIFICATION	ASSUMPTIONS (Verification)
	At Appraisal	On Completion	Post-Evaluation		
<b>OUTPUTS (Cont.):</b>					
7. Furniture and equipment for primary and general and technical secondary schools.	7.1.E 72 items of furniture and equipment comprising desk-benches, chairs, cupboards, blackboards, workshop and laboratory equipment delivered.	7.1.A Idem.	7.1.P 85 items of furniture and equipment comprising desk-benches, chairs, cupboards, blackboards, workshop and laboratory equipment.	7.1.1 Bank appraisal and technical supervision reports and PIU quarterly status reports.	7.1.1.1 The technical coordinators correctly monitor the sites
8. Furniture and Equipment for the General Inspectorate, the EPMS, EVGC, ASMS and the PIU.	8.1.E 16 office desks, 16 swivel chairs, 3 drawing boards, 9 table lamps, 11 filing cabinets, 9 cupboards with drawers, 1 map storage unit, 3 typewriter tables, 3 typewriters (or word processors), 2 photocopiers, 58 tables and chairs for the workroom, 1 duplicator, 1 slide projector and 4 vehicles have been delivered.	8.1.A Idem.	8.1.P 18 office desks, 18 swivel chairs, 4 drawing boards, 9 table lamps, 14 filing cabinets, 9 map storage units, 3 type writer tables, 3 typewriters (or word processors), 2 photocopiers, 78 tables and chairs for the workroom, 1 duplicator, 1 slide projector.  9.1.P 1 Architect for 37 staff/months, 1 engineer for 37 staff/months, 18 consultants for 20 staff/months.	8.1.1 Idem.  9.1.1 Idem.	8.1.1.1 Bidding is launched and the related contract executed.  9.1.1.1 Technical assistance has been recruited.
9. Technical Assistance	9.1.E 1 Architect for 37 staff/months, 1 engineer for 37 staff/months, 18 consultants for 20 staff/months have been recruited	9.1.A Idem.			
10. Retraining and training of resource persons.	10.1.E The existing 120 teachers, 135 student teachers, 40 teaching assistants, 50 inspectors and assistant inspectors in educational psychology, 6 coordinators of the textbook production project, 24 technicians in computers, 10 directors in computer science, 30 directors and deputy directors in planning and education management, 8 technicians for the documentation centre have been retrained and trained.	10.1.A The 335 existing teachers, 120 teachers beginning training, 25 teachers and technicians, 72 coordinators, 56 trainers of trainers, 23 people in computer science, 16 delegates and 6 technicians in planning and management, 10 directors in computer science, 30 directors and deputy directors in planning and management, 2 documentation clerks, 3 computer engineers, 18 teachers in educational counseling.	10.1.P 345 existing teachers, 124 teachers beginning training, 30 teachers and technicians, 75 coordinators, 66 trainers of trainers, 27 people in computer science, 16 delegates and 6 technicians in planning and management, 2 documentation clerks, 3 computer engineers, 28 teachers in educational counseling.	10.1.1 Idem.	10.1.1.1 The training institutions have been selected.

**REPUBLIC OF CAPE VERDE  
EDUCATION SYSTEM RESTRUCTURING AND EXPANSION PROJECT  
RETROSPECTIVE PROJECT LOGICAL FRAMEWORK**

HIERARCHY OF OBJECTIVES	OBJECTIVELY VERIFIABLE INDICATORS	MEANS OF VERIFICATION	ASSUMPTIONS (VERIFICATION)	
<p><b><u>ACTIVITIES :</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Prepare the bidding documents for the construction, equipment and furniture for the primary, general and technical secondary schools</li> <li>- Recruit technical assistance</li> <li>- Select training institutions.</li> <li>- Monitor sites.</li> <li>- Prepare payment requests.</li> </ul>	<b><u>BUDGETARY RESOURCES (in million UAs)</u></b>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The democratic process and good governance are consolidated.</li> <li>- The macroeconomic performances are satisfactory.</li> <li>- Government and ADF resources are made available to the project and are regular.</li> <li>- The country is not under sanction.</li> </ul>	
	<b><u>Components:</u></b>			
		<u>Est.</u>		<u>Actual</u>
	Basic Education	5.14		4.95
	General Secondary Education	4.13		3.96
	Technical Education	0.87		0.87
	Institution Building	0.36		0.33
	PIU Strengthening	<u>0.85</u>		<u>0.87</u>
	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>11.35</b>		<b>10.98</b>
	<b><u>Expenditure Categories:</u></b>			
		<u>Est.</u>		<u>Actual</u>
	Construction	7.25		7.86
	Furniture and Equipment	1.44		1.60
	Technical Assistance	0.77		0.72
	Training	1.62		0.62
Operating Costs	<u>0.27</u>	<u>0.18</u>		
<b>TOTAL COST</b>	<b>11.35</b>	<b>10.98</b>		
<b><u>Sources of Financing:</u></b>				
	<u>Est.</u>	<u>Actual</u>		
ADF	10.22	9.85		
Government	<u>1.13</u>	<u>1.13</u>		
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>11.35</b>	<b>10.98</b>		

**REPUBLIC OF CAPE VERDE**  
**EDUCATION SYSTEM RESTRUCTURING AND EXPANSION SYSTEM**  
**MATRIX OF RECOMMENDATIONS AND FOLLOW UP MEASURES**

PRINCIPAL FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS	RECOMMENDATIONS	FOLLOW UP MEASURES	RESPONSIBILITY
<p><b>1. <u>Project Formulation and Rationale</u></b></p> <p>1.1 The Appraisal Report did not deal with the problems of technical and vocational training under the education reform.</p> <p>1.2 The project's social impact was not properly assessed (different measures taken to encourage the social integration of young people trained under the project) in the appraisal report.</p> <p><b>2. <u>Project Implementation</u></b></p> <p>2.1 The project was 54 months behind the original schedule.</p> <p>2.2 There was 19 months slippage on the release of the first disbursement.</p> <p>2.3 The different reports prepared by the Government on the overall project status were not regular. The four vehicles procured under the project were not delivered.</p>	<p>1.1.1 The Bank will have to take the necessary measures to ensure that Education project identification, preparation and appraisal missions focus on technical and vocational training, which was one of the project components.</p> <p>1.2.1 The Government will have to clearly define and prepare policy measures regarding the social integration of young Cape Verdeans trained under the project through the Mindelo Industrial and Commercial school</p> <p>1.2.2 The Bank will have to make provision for an "integration" expenditure category in future projects.</p> <p>2.1.1 Ensure, in future projects, that the project management experience acquired by the PIU management team is efficiently used.</p> <p>2.2.1 The Bank should help the Borrower to fulfill the conditions of the Loan Agreement as soon as possible.</p> <p>2.3.1 The Government will have to honour its commitments made in conformity with the Loan Agreement concerning the submission of the different project status reports.</p> <p>2.3.2 Require that payment requests submitted to it be accompanied by an original copy of the invoice, an order form, and a delivery note and/or reception slip issued by the PIU.</p>	<p>1.1.1.1 Schedule identification, preparation and appraisal missions, comprising multidisciplinary teams (vocational training expert, education economist, architect and specialist in teaching aids.)</p> <p>1.2.1.1 Bring on stream the Fund for the Promotion of Employment and Vocational Training.</p> <p>1.2.2.1 Make provision for the amounts required to finance the "integration" expenditure category.</p> <p>2.1.1.1 Adequately involve the PIU Management in activities relating to the implementation of future Education projects; organize frequent country missions.</p> <p>2.2.1.1 Schedule at least two mid-term evaluation missions per year.</p> <p>2.3.1.1 Idem.</p> <p>2.3.2.1 Idem.</p>	<p>* Bank (Country Department-West).</p> <p>*Borrower"</p> <p>*Bank (OCDW)</p> <p>*Borrower; Bank (OCDW)</p> <p>*Bank (OCDW)</p> <p>*Borrower/Bank (OCDW).</p> <p>*Borrower/Bank (OCDW)</p>

**REPUBLIC OF CAPE VERDE**  
**EDUCATION SYSTEM RESTRUCTURING AND EXPANSION PROJECT**  
**MATRIX OF RECOMMENDATIONS AND FOLLOW-UP MEASURES**

PRINCIPAL FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS	RECOMMENDATIONS	FOLLOW-UP MEASURES	RESPONSIBILITY
<p><b>3. <u>Compliance with Conditions of Loan Agreement</u></b></p> <p>3.1 The fulfillment of conditions (1) and (7) concerning appropriations in the annual budget to finance its share of the project cost, and evidence of the allocation, free of charge, for the exclusive use of the project of the land selected for the project sites, has been affected by insufficient resources and a lack of budgetary programming, on the one hand, and the problem of obtaining title deeds.</p> <p><b>4. <u>Evaluation of Project Performance and Outcomes</u></b></p> <p>4.1 The implementation performance is considered unsatisfactory. In fact, the project was 54 months behind schedule. There was also a cost overrun. Non-compliance with conditions (1) and (7) within the deadlines led to a delay of 19 months.</p> <p>4.2 On the whole, the control and supervision of works by the consultants were carried out satisfactorily. However, an in-depth geological study could enable land-use control in so far as the problem of water represents one of the most serious constraints on the development of Cape Verde.</p>	<p>3.1.1 The Bank should increase technical supervision missions in order to enable the Borrower to comply with the conditions of the Loan Agreement..</p> <p>3.1.2 The Bank and Borrower should jointly verify and control the effective implementation of the operating budget.</p> <p>4.1.1 The Bank should closely monitor the project activities by scheduling regular quarterly technical supervision missions where necessary.</p> <p>4.2.1 The Bank and Government shall beef up the technical supervision teams.</p>	<p>3.1.1.1 Mete out the necessary sanctions.</p> <p>3.1.2.1 Idem.</p> <p>4.1.1.1 Adequately involve the PIU Management in activities concerning the implementation of Education projects to benefit from the experience acquired during the ESREP project.</p> <p>4.1.2.1 Provide training for the staff involved in the management of future projects by organizing seminars and training courses.</p> <p>4.2.1.1 Prepare the study terms of reference.</p>	<p>* Bank (OCDW).</p> <p>*Borrower/Bank (OCDW).</p> <p>*Borrower</p> <p>*Bank (OCDW)</p> <p>*Borrower/Bank (OCDW).</p>

**REPUBLIC OF CAPE VERDE**  
**EDUCATION SYSTEM RESTRUCTURING AND EXPANSION SYSTEM**  
**MATRIX OF RECOMMENDATIONS AND FOLLOW-UP MEASURES**

PRINCIPAL FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS	RECOMMENDATIONS	FOLLOW-UP MEASURES	RESPONSIBILITY
<p><b>4. Evaluation of Project Performance and Outcomes: (cont.)</b></p> <p>4.3 The acceptance reports mention that the goods delivered were of high quality. However, two vehicles were not delivered in conformity with the appraisal report.</p> <p>4.4 The reasons for the Borrower's partially satisfactory performance are because project performances were affected by difficulties in obtaining the title deeds of land earmarked for the project sites, lack of familiarity with the Bank's rules and procedures, and especially the irregular availability of counterpart funds for the financing of local costs.</p> <p><b>5. Sustainability</b></p> <p>5.1 The installation of sanitary fittings in most of the schools, the problem of running water and of the cracking of walls in some schools require the allocation of a significant budget for maintenance and upkeep in order to ensure the sustainability of the project.</p> <p>5.2 The saturation and overutilization of premises as a result of the strong demand of education on schools is worsening the deterioration of the facilities.</p>	<p>4.3.1 Closely monitor project activities by regularly scheduling field supervision missions.</p> <p>4.4.1 Ensure that appropriations are regularly made in the operating budget and that the land earmarked for project sites is made available.</p> <p>5.1.1 The Cape Verdean Government will have to endeavour to resolve the problems of maintenance and upkeep.</p> <p>5.2.1 The Bank will have to consolidate the investment already made by strengthening the achievements of the ESREP project, and approve the use of the undrawn balance for the purchase of the remaining textbooks.</p>	<p>4.3.1.1 Establish an action plan of follow-up measures and clearly define suppliers contracts with appropriate specifications.</p> <p>4.4.1.1 Mete out sanctions where necessary.</p> <p>5.1.1.1 Set up a maintenance team in each school and allocate the necessary financial resources to them..</p> <p>5.2.1.1 Issue instructions for the use of the undrawn balance for the purchase of textbooks and assist the Government in consolidating the achievements of the ESREP project.</p>	<p>* Bank (OCDW)/Borrower</p> <p>* Idem.</p> <p>* Borrower</p> <p>* Bank (OCDW)</p>

REPUBLIC OF CAPE VERDE

PERFORMANCE EVALUATION REPORT ON THE EDUCATION SYSTEM RESTRUCTURING AND EXPANSION PROJECT

**FORM 1**  
**IMPLEMENTATION PERFORMANCE**

Indicators	Score (1 to 4)	Observations
1. Adherence to Schedule	1	There was a delay of 19 months on the start up of project activities owing to difficulties relating to the fulfillment of conditions (1) and (7) precedent to the first disbursement in conformity with the loan agreement. Overall the total delay was 54 months.
2. Adherence to Cost Schedule.	3	A difference of approximately UA 0,37 million was noted, for the Bank did not approve the utilization of the undrawn balance to finance the production of textbooks and teaching aids which are urgently needed by the educational system. However, on the whole, the Borrower has been able to control the different costs.
3. Compliance with Covenants	1	The Borrower did not comply with the deadline for the fulfillment of the conditions precedent for the first disbursement of the loan agreement (frequent non-availability of counterpart funds)
4. Adequacy of Monitoring and Evaluation and Quarterly Satus Reports.	1	A project implementation unit was established but the Borrower has not regularly submitted quarterly project status reports..
5.Satisfactory Operations (if applicable)	3	The number of pupils (basic, and general and technical secondary education) increased from 65,879 in 1986/1987 to 133,760 in 1998/1999. The repeater and dropout rates in basic education were brought down from 30% and 35% in 1986/1987 to 7% and 1.8% in 1998/1999 and the pupil/teacher ratio fell from 33/1 in 1986/1987 to 26/1 in 1998/1999.
<b>Overall Assessment of Implementation Performance</b>	<b>1.8</b>	<b>Unsatisfactory.</b> The Bank will have to require realistic conditions precedent to the release of the first loan disbursement which would permit their easy fulfillment by the Borrower.

REPUBLIC OF CAPE VERDE

PERFORMANCE EVALUATION REPORT ON THE EDUCATION SYSTEM RESTRUCTURING AND EXPANSION PROJECT

**FORM 2**  
**BANK PERFORMANCE**

Indicators	Score (1 to 4)	Observations
1. At Identification	3	At the Bank's request, the project was identified by UNESCO. It monitored the activities of the said organization. Furthermore, it financed the feasibility study to prepare the diagnostic review of the Cape Verdean Education system.
2. At Preparation of Project	3	The Bank's participation in preparation made it possible select the components of the said project.
3. At Appraisal	2	Teh project appraisal was carried out in Praia and the other islands with a view to discussing the different aspects of project implementation. The quality of the appraisal report was satisfactory, but does not contain an exhaustive analysis of the vocational technical training aspects of the education system.
4. At Technical Supervision.	3	The Bank allocated 210 staff/days, primarily to project monitoring and technical supervision.
<b>Overall Assessment of Bank Performance</b>	<b>2.8</b>	<b><u>Satisfactory.</u></b>

REPUBLIC OF CAPE VERDE

PERFORMANCE EVALUATION REPORT ON THE EDUCATION RESTRUCTURING AND EXPANSION PROJECT

**FORM 3**  
**PROJECT OUTCOME**

N°	INDICATORS	Score (1 to 4)	OBSERVATIONS
<b>1</b>	<b>Relevance and Achievement of Objectives</b>	<b>2.28</b>	<b>Has attained its objectives of promoting an efficient education system.</b>
(i)	Macro-economic Policy	2	The project was implemented against a background of democratic transition and macroeconomic framework undergoing rapid restructuring. The structural reforms adopted by the Government in 1991 have made it possible to reduce the Government's role in the economy. The project was implemented as part of the global objectives and orientations of the 1 <sup>st</sup> (1982-1985) and 2 <sup>nd</sup> (1986-1990) National Development Plans of the Republic of Cape Verde.
(ii)	Sector Policy	3	Although the retrospective matrix was not designed and established, the project sector goals were clearly defined in the appraisal report. Furthermore, this report adequately defined the development of the education system.
(iii)	Physical Achievements (incl. Production)	3	On the whole, all the infrastructure was correctly established and managed in conformity with standard practices. The schools built and expanded under the project were provided with all the furniture and equipment allocated to them. However, the sanitary fittings were not installed owing to a lack of running water.
(iv)	Financial Results	2	The frequent non-payment of counterpart funds affected the project in so far as the PIU Management frequently used the revolving fund. The financial contributions of pupils' parents to the tune of 14.5% of the operating budget of secondary schools. This source of income provides headmasters with the necessary funds to cover recurrent costs (maintenance and upkeep costs, non-teaching staff, etc)
(v)	Poverty Reduction, Social Aspects and Women in Development	2	Girls represent around 58% of all pupils in primary, general and technical secondary schools. Furthermore, women play a key role in the Cape Verdean education system, since 42% of all teachers and 44.8% of primary school teachers are women. However, the project socio-economic impact was not apparent especially regarding the Mindelo industrial and commercial college which produces graduates without jobs.
(vi)	Environment	3	The physical infrastructure was established in harmony with the surrounding countryside despite the climatic conditions of the country characterized by occasional violent sand storms.
(vii)	Private Sector Development.	1	The lack of drive in the private education supervision sector did not permit the perception of any tangible effect on the development of the private sector.
(viii)	Others (Specify)	N.A.	N.A.

**REPUBLIC OF CAPE VERDE**  
**PERFORMANCE EVALUATION REPORT ON THE EDUCATION SYSTEM RESTRUCTURING AND EXPANSION PROJECT**  
**FORM 3 (cont.)**  
**PROJECT OUTCOME**

N°	INDICATORS	Score (1 to 4)	OBSERVATIONS
<b>2.</b>	<b>Institutional Development</b>	<b>2.5</b>	<b>Overall, the objectives were attained.</b>
(i)	Institutional framework, including restructuring	3	The project correctly addressed the restructuring and educational reform (the reorganization, decentralization and decongestion of the organizational structures) requirements of the education system, especially the general supervision of primary, general and technical secondary schools, which is carried out by the education inspectors.
(ii)	Financial and Management Information Systems, including Audit Systems.	2	The project audit of accounts was not carried out. Adequate attainment of the objectives of improving the different management instruments. The PIU information system is not reliable. This is due to the departure from the PIU of the former Director assigned to the World Bank Education Project.
(iii)	Transfer of Technology	3	The training and retraining sessions organized for directors, delegates, teachers and technicians have made it possible to acquire know-how in the areas of planning and management, computer science and educational psychology.
(iv)	Staffing by Qualified Persons (including turnover), Training and Counterpart Staff.	2	Since the start up of the project, the Government has assigned qualified, but inexperienced staff to the management of projects. The technical supervision, carried out by the Bank, has helped to strengthen their project management capacities.
<b>3.</b>	<b>Sustainability</b>	<b>1.87</b>	<b>The Likelihood of Sustaining the Project Impacts is Low.</b>
(i)	Continued Borrower Commitment	2	In 1992, the Borrower prepared, adopted and launched a Third National Development Programme and Economic Reform Programme, based, inter alia, on the following key strategic options: opening up of the economy, restoration of macroeconomic balance, the introduction of an integrated basic and vocational and technical education system, expansion of the scope of secondary education, provision of institutional resources to plan and manage the education and training programmes.
(ii)	Political Environment	3	It is characterized by political stability through an effective democratic transition and good governance.
(iii)	Institutional Framework	3	The decentralization of education services and the development of central, local and municipal structures which were to benefit from education management would be an asset if the socioeconomic conditions were to improve.
(iv)	Technical Viability and Staff Retraining	2	Apart from the failure to install sanitary fittings owing to a lack of running water, which causes problems of hygiene, the equipment is of high quality. The retraining of staff was carried out under the project. It should, however be noted that there are insufficient qualified teachers. The qualitative and quantitative development of human resources is one of the key strategic options of the education reform.
(v)	Financial Viability, including cost recovery systems	1	Many bilateral and multilateral donors operate in the sector, but organization of the financing of the education system, including cost recovery, is still embryonic, and may not be completed for some time.
(vi)	Economic Viability	1	It is dependent on the maintenance and deepening of economic reforms.
(vii)	Environmental Viability	1	Soil erosion control, the efficient development and management of water resources will allow the supply of running water for the toilets in those schools. This will permit environmental protection and will ensure good hygiene in the said schools.
(viii)	O&M Facilitation (availability of recurrent funding, foreign exchange, spare parts, workshop facilities, etc)	2	The financing of recurrent costs is a problem. The operating budget of the schools built under the project and financial contributions of pupils' parents in the said budget to ensure the availability of resources to cover recurrent costs, including the maintenance of infrastructure, remain insufficient.
<b>4</b>	<b>Internal Rate of Return</b>	<b>N.A.</b>	
	<b>Overall Assessment of Outcome</b>	<b>2.25</b>	<b>The overall outcome of the project is satisfactory.</b>