

**AFRICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK
AFRICAN DEVELOPMENT FUND**



CHAD

PORTFOLIO REVIEW

COUNTRY DEPARTMENT
CENTRE WEST REGION
DECEMBER 2001

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Currency Equivalents, Abbreviations and Acronyms	(iii)-(iv)
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	
1. INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Purpose of Report	1
1.2 Scope and Composition of the Portfolio	1
II. REVIEW OF ONGOING PROJECTS	2
2.1 Agriculture and Rural Development Sector	2
2.2 Social Sector	11
2.3 Transport Sector	16
2.4 Aging and Problem Projects	18
2.5 Evaluation of the Regularity and Quality of Supervision	19
2.6 Cross-cutting Issues	19
2.7 General Evaluation of Portfolio Performance	21
2.8 Disbursements	21
III. EVALUATION OF THE PROJECT MANAGEMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION CAPACITY	21
3.1 Government Performance	21
3.2 Bank Performance	22
IV. ASSISTANCE COORDINATION	22
4.1 Evaluation of Government Capacity	22
4.2 Evaluation of Bank and Other Donor Coordination	23
V. STATEMENT OF LOANS AND ARREARS REPAYMENT	23
VI. INITIATIVES TO IMPROVE PORTFOLIO QUALITY	23
6.1 Problems Encountered in Project Implementation	23
6.2 Solutions and Action Plans	24
6.3 Lessons to Draw for the Future CSPs and Portfolio Reviews	25
VII. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	25
 <u>ANNEXES</u>	
1. Matrix of Actions for Improving Quality of Active Portfolio	
2. Bank Group Commitment in Chad	
3. Ongoing Bank Group Operations in Chad	
4. Evaluation of Performance of Ongoing Operations	
5. Performance of the Polder and Mamdi Irrigation Development Project	
5.1. Performance of the Cash Crop and Cotton Production Project	
5.2. Performance of the Lake Chad Prefecture Development Programme	
5.3. Performance of the Run-off Water Development Project	
5.4. Performance of the Fishery and Fish-farming Sub-sector Study	
5.5. Performance of the Education IV Project	
5.6. Performance of the Primary Health Care Strengthening Project	
5.7. Performance of the Poverty Reduction and Gender-Oriented Action Project	
5.8. Performance Massaguet-Ngoura Road Project	
6. Matrix of Common Portfolio Problems	
7. Matrix of Cross-cutting Portfolio Issues	

CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

(December 2001)

UA 1	=	US\$ 1.26608
UA 1	=	CFAF 933.348
UA 1	=	FF 9.33348
UA 1	=	EURO 1.42402
US\$ 1	=	CFAF 737.195

Fiscal Year

1 January - 31 December

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

ABEDA	:	Arab Bank for Economic Development in Africa
ADF	:	African Development Fund
BD	:	Bidding Documents
BET	:	Borkou - Ennedi - Tibesti
BID	:	Islamic Development Bank
BTP	:	Building and Public Works
CFAF	:	CFA Franc
CFD	:	French Development Fund
COTONTCHAD	:	Chad Cotton Authority
DNPE	:	National Education Projects Directorate
DPAE	:	National Planning and External Assistance Directorate
DPFSP	:	Directorate of Programme/Project Planning, Financing and Monitoring
DTN	:	New Works Division
EEC	:	European Economic Community
EPCP	:	Economic Prospects and Country Programming
ESAF	:	Enhanced Structural Adjustment Facility
FAC	:	Assistance and Cooperation Fund
GDP	:	Gross Domestic Product
GIS	:	Geographic Information System
IDA	:	International Development Association
Inh/km ²	:	Inhabitant to square kilometre
NETCBB	:	Société Djong Yang
NGO	:	Non-Governmental Organisation
OFNAR	:	National Road Board
ONDR	:	National Rural Development Office
ONHPV	:	Natural Office for Stock and Village Water Supply
ONPT	:	Post and Telecommunications
PIP	:	Multi-annual Investment Programme
PIU	:	Project Implementation Unit
SAP	:	Structural Adjustment Programme
SFM	:	Supplementary Financing Mechanism
SME/SMI	:	Small and Medium Enterprises/Small and Medium Industries
SNER	:	National Road Maintenance Board
SODELAC	:	Lake Development Company
SONASUT	:	Chad National Sugar Company
SPA	:	Special Programme for Africa
STC	:	Chad Construction Company
STECHE	:	Chad Engineering and Water Structure and Equipment Company
STEE	:	Chad Electricity Board
TAA	:	Technical Assistance Account
TAF	:	Technical Assistance Fund
TIT	:	International Telecommunications Company of Chad
TSP2	:	Transport Sector Project II
UA	:	Unit of Account
UDEAC	:	Central African Economic and Customs Union
UNDP	:	United Nations Development Programme

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. This third portfolio review report of Bank Group operations in Chad informs the Boards of Directors of the progress made since 1997 with its operations underway in the country and formulates recommendations for improving the quality of the portfolio and meeting the objectives of the projects financed. This report was prepared using the last portfolio review report that dates back to 1997, the results of the supervision and dialogue missions fielded since then, audits and minutes of quarterly meetings of the project managers and the conclusions of the portfolio review mission conducted from 23 July to 6 August 2001.

2. From 1974 to 31 December 2001, the Bank Group has financed 46 operations, totalling a net commitment volume of UA 322.96 million in the form of loans and grants. These include 28 projects, 16 studies and institutional support operations and 2 structural adjustment programmes. Based on the net amounts approved, the agriculture and rural development sector is the lead beneficiary of Bank Group resources (37.04%) because of its importance in the national economy. It precedes the social (18.69%), multi (18.028%), transport (15.62%), public utilities (9.65%) and industry and banks (0.49%) sectors. The overall disbursement rate has been 68.92% and out of 46 projects 33 have been completed and 1 cancelled.

3. Since the last portfolio review in 1997 when focus was on 18 operations, the Bank portfolio has registered completion of 18 and the entry of 12 new operations during 1998-2001, financed by the ADF and TAF. In all, as at 31 December 2001, 13 operations were underway. 8 projects were actually at the implementation phase, including 1 in the transport sector (Massaguet-Ngoura road project) for which the loan is effective but disbursement is still pending, 3 projects were approved in the agriculture (Biltine rural development project), education (Education V) and health (HIV/AIDS project) sectors in 2001 but were still not effective as at 31 December 2001 and SAP III, approved in February 2002, but made part of the 2001 operations as it was financed with the ADF balance.

4. The portfolio reviewed comprises 9 operations 8 of which were actually implemented and representing a net commitment amount of UA 98.27 million. The agricultural sector accounts for 65.02% of net commitments against 22.76% for the social sector and 12.21% for the transport sector. The disbursement rate of the portfolio has been 34.23% and is higher in the social (64.8%) than in the agricultural sector (30.9%).

5. The projects of the active portfolio are 4.7 years old on average. As at 31 December 2001, the following 3 operations were more than 6 years old: (i) the Mamdi irrigation scheme, 13 years old; (ii) the Education Project IV, 8 years old; and (iii) the primary health strengthening project, 7 years old. The 7 new operations approved during 1998-2001 have revitalized the active portfolio. In relation to the criterion of status the following 4 projects may be considered as problem projects: (i) Cotton and Cash Crop Production; (ii) Run-off Water Development; and (iii) Primary Health Care Strengthening. The Mamdi Irrigation Scheme Project took off late 1998 although for reasons mainly external to the project; nonetheless, implementation since start-up has been satisfactory.

6. Ongoing operations contribute to better living conditions especially of women in the rural area, to human resources development, better economic management, micro-credit promotion, conservation of natural resources, and economic integration. The participatory approach has been systematic in recent years; consequently, Bank operations should have a better impact on poverty reduction and Chad's development.

7. The 8 ongoing operations have been rated 1.8 whereas the 18 ongoing operations of 1997 had been rated 2.1, indicating a slight decline in the overall performance of the portfolio. The average rating is 1.7 for the agriculture and rural development sector and 1.9 for the social sector. Overall, the performance of the criteria “status” “procurement of goods and services” and “financial performance” rated the lowest of the five criteria, all projects combined. Emphasis must be laid on improving the above-mentioned criteria of those projects concerned if the quality of the portfolio must rise.

8. In latter years, efforts have been made by the Government and Bank to improve project implementation. The Bank has increased its project launching and supervision missions and organised training workshops the last of which was in September 2001, on disbursement and procurement procedures. For its part, with a view to improving the public finance situation, the Government endeavoured to fulfil its financial commitments mobilising counterpart funds for projects and regularly repaying loans. The Government took measures to build the institutional capacity to mobilise and manage project resources, in view of a greater impact on development. The ongoing economic programme aims at the reform of public contracts and better and controlled public spending. Notwithstanding, there is still ground to cover for reducing the time frame for the entry into force of loan agreements, and improve goods and services procurement and spending performance.

9. Aid is coordinated at local administration level and through sector round tables and direct consultations between the Bank and lead donors represented in Chad. In addition, regular contacts are kept with other donors present in the country during preparation, appraisal and supervision missions with the purpose of harmonising respective field operations and identifying co-financing opportunities. The key role played by the PRSP in defining operational strategies in the country should enable an improvement of aid coordination.

10. In spite of the efforts mentioned earlier, the Bank’s active portfolio in Chad is still lumbered by: (i) long periods taken by the Government to fulfil conditions precedent to first disbursement; (ii) lack of familiarity of some executing agencies with Bank rules of procedure for the procurement of goods and works; (iii) persistent delay on the part of Government to release its contribution to some projects; and (iv) frequent changes of project managers. Improving the quality of the portfolio must be seen as a long-term process that requires large-scale action and specifically project-oriented measures (as recommended in Annex 1 of the report) for which both the Bank and Government must take responsibility. Application by the Government and Bank of the recommendations made at the end of this exercise should lead in short and medium terms to an improvement of the quality of the Bank Group portfolio in Chad.

11. The Boards of Directors are invited to consider the status and conclusions of this portfolio review report.

I. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Purpose of Report

The report is intended to inform the Boards of Directors of the progress made since 1997, with implementation of operations in the country, formulate recommendations aimed at improving the quality of the portfolio and reaching project objectives. This review comes four years after the second that dates back to 1997, subject of document ADB/BD/WP/98/18-ADF/BD/WP/98/14, approved by the Boards in February 1997. It was prepared using the 1997 portfolio review report, the outcome of supervision and dialogue mission fielded since then, audits and summary records of the quarterly meetings of project managers, as well as the conclusions of the portfolio review mission carried out from 23 July to 6 August 2001.

1.2 Scope and Composition of Portfolio

Overview

1.2.1 Between 1974 and 31 December 2001, the Bank Group financed 46 operations for a total of net commitments of UA 332.96 million in loans and grants. These operations include 27 projects, 16 studies and institutional support and 3 structural adjustment programmes. Based on the amounts approved, the agriculture and rural development sector is the lead beneficiary of Bank Group resources (37.54%) because of its importance in the national economy. It precedes the social (18.69%), multi-sector (18.02%), transport (15.62%), public utilities (9.65%) and the industry and banking (0.49%) sectors. The overall disbursement rate has been 68.92%. Out of 46 projects 34 have been completed.

**Table 1 : Sector Breakdown of Net Commitments
12/31/2001**

Sectors	Number Operations	Net Commitment (UA million)	% net commit. by sector	Amounts Disbursed (UA million)	% Disbursed
Agriculture and rural develop	17	121.23	37.54	66.49	54.85
Social	11	60.37	18.69	38.44	63.67
Transport	5	50.42	15.61	35.34	70.09
Multisector	4	58.2	18.02	49.58	85.19
Public Utilities	8	31.15	9.65	31.15	100.00
Industry and banks	1	1.59	0.49	1.59	100.00
TOTAL	46	322.96	100.00	222.59	68.92

b) Overview of Ongoing Operations

1.2.2 Since the last portfolio review in 1997 when focus was on 18 operations, the Bank portfolio has registered completion of 18 and the entry of 12 new operations during the 1998-2001 period, financed by the ADF and TAF. In all, as at 31 December 2001, 13 operations were underway. 8 projects were actually at the implementation phase, including 1 in the transport sector (Massaguet-Ngoura road project approved in April 2000) the loan of which was effective although disbursement was still pending, and 3 were approved in the agriculture (Biltine rural development project), education (Education V approved in March 2001), health (HIV/AIDS project approved in March 2001) sectors, but were yet to enter into force as at 31 December 2001. SAP III, approved in February 2002, was made part of the 2001 operations as it was financed with the ADF VIII balance.

Table 2
Summary of Ongoing Operations as at 31/12/01
 (Amounts in UA million)

Sectors	Number of Operations	Net Commitments			Amounts Disbursed			Disbursement Rate		
		ADF	TAF	TOTAL	ADF	FAT	TOTAL	ADF	TAF	TOTAL
Agric. And Rural De	6	68.60	4.3	72.9	19.59	0.20	19.79	28.6%	4.7%	27.1%
Social	5	32.5	2.60	35.1	14.49	0.00	14.49	44.6%	0.0%	41.3%
Transport	1	12.00	0.00	12.0	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Multisector	1	8.70	0.00	8.7	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
TOTAL	13	121.8	6.9	128.7	34.08	0.20	34.28	28.0%	2.9%	26.6%

1.2.3 Apart from the introduction, this report contains the following six parts: (i) a review of projects at the implementation stage; (ii) an assessment of the capacity to manage and implement projects; (iii) aid coordination; (iv) status of loan and arrears repayment; (v) measures for improving the quality of the portfolio; and (vi) the main conclusions and recommendations.

II. REVIEW OF ONGOING PROJECTS

The portfolio reviewed comprises 9 operations of which 8 have actually been implemented for a net commitment amount of UA 98.27 million. The agricultural sector accounts for 65.02% of net commitments against 22.76% for the social sector and 12.21% for the transport sector. The disbursement rate of the portfolio reviewed is 34.23%, and higher in the social (64.8%) than the agricultural sector (30.9%). The transport project has entered into force but related disbursement is still pending.

2.1 Agriculture and Rural Development Sector

2.1.1 The Bank Group has five operations underway in the agricultural and rural development sector. The first is the North Guera Food Security Project financed by IFAD for which the Bank is playing the role of cooperating institution. The other five operations are: (i) the Mamdi Irrigation Scheme Project; (ii) the Cotton and Cash Crop Production Project; (iii) the Run-off Water Development Project; (iv) the Lake Prefecture Development Project; and v) the Fisheries and Fish Farming Study. The average rate of disbursement of these operations is 30.9%. The project to improve the cotton sub-sector has recently been completed. The Biltine Department Rural Development Project is yet to become effective.

A. The Mamdi Irrigation Scheme Project

A1. Basic Administrative and Financial Data

Loan Number: CS/TCH/AGR/IR/86/9

<u>Loan Amount:</u> UA 11.44 million	<u>Sources:</u> FAD	<u>Disbursement:</u> UA 7.29 million
<u>Date of approval:</u> 18/06/86	<u>Date of signature:</u> 7/07/86	<u>Date of entry into force:</u> 18/03/88
<u>Deadline for last disbursement:</u> 30/12/2002 <u>Date of last supervision mission:</u> 27/11 to 11/12/2001 <u>Number of supervision missions since 1997:</u> 8 <u>Date last audit report submitted:</u> financial year 1999: 15 March 2001 <u>Number of audits since 1997:</u> 3	<u>Executing Agency:</u> SODELAC	
<u>Objectives and components:</u> The project aims at: (i) an increase in grain production, (ii) opening up the Lake region. The project comprises the following seven components: i) Irrigation scheme; (ii) equipment and vehicles; (iii) agricultural development; iv) engineering designs; v) technical assistance and works inspection; (vi) national staff; and (vii) follow-up evaluation		

A2. Compliance with Precedent Conditions/Undertakings

2.1.2 Conditions precedent to first disbursement were met 14 months behind schedule and the loan agreement entered into force 21 months after project approval. The other conditions tied to the ADF loan were also met. The quarterly activity reports were sent on time to the Bank. Three project account audit reports have been prepared since 1997. The last audit report for the year 1999 was submitted in March 2001. Groundwork for the recruitment of an auditor for the 2001 and 2001 financial years is being laid by the Executing Agency. Despite the considerable delay in project effectiveness, on the whole, the Government complied with the loan agreement conditions. Performance has been judged satisfactory.

A3. Procurement Performance

2.1.3 There was some incompetence over the recruitment of the consultant responsible for works and the procurement of equipment and vehicles but measures to address the situation were taken accordingly. Concerning project works, the bid analysis report was sent to the Bank on 30/8/01. By and large, Bank rules of procedure for the procurement of goods and works were complied with. Performance has been judged satisfactory.

A4. Financial Performance

2.1.4 The ADF loan was used to finance 43.10% of total project cost and disbursement rate was 56.06%. The remaining project costs were financed by the IDB and ABEDA to the tune of 46.57%, and the Government 10.33%. ABEDA and IDB funds were disbursed normally. The Government regularly released its contribution for the project's implementation. A problem arose over the replenishment of the revolving fund because the quarterly portion applied for is irreconcilable with the minimum requirement for a disbursement request (UA 20,000). The issue was addressed by making the revolving fund request part of the audit mission budget. The disbursement rate is relatively low for a project that became effective in 1988. Performance has been judged satisfactory.

A5. Activities and Outputs

2.1.5 Approved in 1986, the Mamdi Polder Project was considerably delayed mainly because of: (i) the time lag for approving the loan agreements by the 3 donors; (ii) a restart of basic engineering designs; (iii) insecurity in the country, (iv) repeated sanctions imposed on the country by the 3 donors; and (v) unilateral termination in August 1997 of the first civil works contract by the contracting enterprise two years after its award. Works on the project actually took off in September 1998, after the four-party meeting in N'djamena of representatives of the three donors (IDB, ABEDA, ADF), co-financiers of the project and the Chadian Government. Outputs were as follows: i) delivery of three sets of pumps for the draining station and thirteen others for the irrigation stations; ii) supply of irrigation and drainage equipment delivered finally in the factory; iii) delivery of all PVC tubes and hydro-mechanical equipment; iv) signature on 9 July 2001 of the contract for installing the main irrigation canals worth CFAF 6.949 million; v) invitation to bid for the conduct of internal works (installation of PVC pipes and hydro-mechanical equipment) published in *Development Business* on 16 July 2001 and opening of bids in October 2001. The technical and financial analyses have been approved by the Bank; v) start-up of activities for the agricultural development of the polders; vii) conduct of all engineering designs for works, and technical assistance; viii) construction of 143 km of feeder roads and development of 586 ha of off-flood crops and 31 ha of market garden crops; and ix) training of professionals and farmers. Performance has been judged satisfactory despite the late take-off of the project and relatively low disbursement rate.

A6. Impact on Development

2.1.6 The probability that the project's development objectives (water control and initiation of farmers to the techniques of managing the irrigated schemes and production of grain in sufficient quantity for the population) are met, is relatively high. The project took off late for the reasons mentioned above. However, the project has actually started. Given project activities and outputs, it is possible to assert at this stage that it has contributed to better living conditions and more incomes. Performance has been judged satisfactory.

A7. Overall Performance Evaluation

2.1.7 The indicators below make it possible to determine overall project performance which has been satisfactory.

Indicators	Status	Procurement of goods and services	Financial performance	Activities and outputs	Impact on development	Overall evaluation
Evaluation	1	2	1.5	2	2	1.7

B Cotton and Cash Crop Production

B1. Basic Administrative and Financial Data

Loan number: F/TCH/AGR/24

<u>Loan amount:</u> UA 18.95 million	<u>Source:</u> ADF	<u>Disbursement:</u> UA 11.61 million
<u>Date of approval:</u> 2/09/93	<u>Date of signature:</u> 21/03/95	<u>Date of entry into force:</u> 11/07/96
<u>Deadline for last disbursement:</u> 31/12/2001 <u>Date of last supervision mission:</u> 17/11 au 02/12/01 <u>Number of supervision missions since 1997:</u> 8	<u>Executing Agency:</u> Project Implementation Unit	
<u>Date last audit report submitted:</u> 31/10/2000 : 19/03/01 <u>Number of audit since 1997 :</u> 3		
<u>Objectives and components:</u> The primary project objectives are to contribute to boosting food security and improving the standard of living of people in the Sudanese zone. Accordingly, it aims at increasing cotton and cash crop production and incomes. The project comprises the following six components: (i) production development;(ii) research, training and outreach activities;(iii) training; (iv) marketing;(v) management assistance to Cotontchad; and (vi) project management unit.		

B2. Compliance with Precedent Conditions/ Undertakings

2.1.8 Conditions precedent to first disbursement were met 10 months late and the loan agreement entered into force 35 months after project approval. The other conditions tied to the ADF loan were met. Quarterly activity reports were sent regularly to the Bank. The 2000 audit report has still not been sent, because disbursements in respect of the project have now been suspended. The overall performance has been judged satisfactory.

B3. Performance of Goods and Works Procurement.

2.1.9 Cotonchad purchased fertilisers for the 1998/99 and 99/00 seasons totally disregarding Bank procurement rules. That and poor management of the revolving fund made the Bank suspend disbursement on the loan on 25 July 2001 and request in a letter dated 25 July 2001, application of all the recommendations made therein and repayment of the sums committed prior to 30 September 2001. Various meetings between the Bank and the Chadian side were organised in order to find a solution to the issue. Procurement performance has been judged less than satisfactory.

B4. Financial Performance

2.1.10 The ADF loan financed the entire foreign exchange and part of the local currency costs. The ADF loan disbursement rate was about 61.3%. AFD (former CFD) co-financed the project, providing 14.4% of its total cost. The Government's contribution to the project was 10.8% of the total cost. Arrears amounting to CFAF 2.4 billion may jeopardise the sustainability of the line of credit intended to purchase inputs for which an initial CFAF 7.16 billion had been earmarked. A plan for settling the arrears of village associations on loan for outputs has been prepared. There is therefore a delay in the implementation of the project's credit component the duration of which will exceed the deadline for last loan disbursement set at 31 December 2001. In addition, the duration of the contract of the consultant responsible for the silk culture study financed by the Bank will exceed the deadline for last loan disbursement. Financial performance has been judged less than satisfactory.

B5. Activities and outputs

2.1.11 The project's physical outputs are: i) procurement of agricultural inputs by Cotontchad for CFAF 7.16 billion, which was distributed as credit to cotton growers as of 1998 and has helped attain the projected production level of 200,000 tonnes of seed cotton over the 2001-2002 season, 184,000 ha out of a total of 306,000 ha productivity areas; ii) distribution of 620 tonnes of improved seeds to producers during the 2001/2002 season; iii) equipment by ONDR with the project's assistance, of 163,057 supervised farms with ploughs (33.33% of the farms) and 36,314 others with carts (7.7% of the farms); iv) installation of 5 central woodlots and 51 village woodlots; v) production of 151,000 of fruit stock; vi) distribution of 4,129 seed plants and 65,000 of finished plants; vii) construction of 6,200 m of fire break walls, 5820 m of hedge and 3073 m of windbreakers around the village plantations; viii) organisation of 104 market garden demonstrations for 6,375 farmers; ix) growing of 13,000 forest seedlings and cuttings, 167 ha covered in organic manure with rainy season compost; x) planting of 10,576 of hedges and clearing of 160 ha under the topic "reasonable clearing" to enable protection of the useful species in the 17 new villages built on the pilot sites, within the framework of land management activities; xi) conduct of 234 tests and experiments including 167 on-farm, for 600 producers in the context of the cash crop research-development activities; xii) conduct of 376 experiments/tests on 135 ha and involving 337 farmers under the pre-extension activity component; xiii) supervision of 1,479 villages in connection with ONDR's project-assisted extension activities; xiv) organisation of training sessions on topics relating to the condition of market garden plants and planting of cassava cuttings, for 381 producers, including 315 men and 66 women; xv) organisation of 41 training sessions for 1,625 producers in improved tree-planting techniques; xvi) start of the study on silk culture with the planting of 10,000 mulberry trees ready for a first nurturing of silk worms; xvii); setting up of a follow-up-evaluation mechanism; xviii) organisation of 18 training sessions for facilitators of the rural savings and credit funds or 595 trainees, and sensitisation of a further 154 people to the importance of creating the COOPECs, for a total of 749 trainees; xix) training of 198 blacksmiths; xx) organisation of 5 training sessions for trainers of rural associations involving 80 participants; xxi) training of 26 facilitators of the seed producer associations; xxii) organisation of 7 training sessions for producers in improved tree-growing techniques and market gardening for 305 participants, including 59 women; xxiii) organisation of 4 training sessions for farmers in yam seed fragmentation techniques for 76 participants; xxiv) organisation of 2 training workshops for producers in improved natural resource management techniques for 81 participants from 64 villages including 24 committees established via the delegates so trained; xxv) training of 120 women in the use of improved stoves as a means of protecting the environment; xvi) organisation of training sessions for project line staff; xvii) equipment and installation of the Moundou rural radio; and xviii) establishment of a contract information system. The performance of activities and outputs has been judged satisfactory.

B6. Impact on development

2.1.12 As illustrated by the range of project activities and outputs, the positive impact of the project on cotton and cash crop production, income-generation, enhanced capacity of the farmers and promotion of women's access to means of production is undeniable. Although project implementation started late, impact on development has been judged satisfactory.

B7. Overall Performance Evaluation

2.1.13 The indicators shown below make it possible to determine overall project performance which has been judged less than satisfactory and the project, a problem.

Indicators	Status	Procurement of goods and works	Financial performance	Activities and outputs	Impact on development	Overall evaluation
Evaluation	1.3	0	1	1.75	2.2	1.2

C Lake Prefecture Development Project

C1. Basic Administrative and Financial Data

Loan number: F/DN/DEV-RUR/99/30

Grant number: F/TCH/DEV-RUR/99/30

<u>Loan amount:</u> UA 17.3 million	<u>Source:</u> ADF	<u>Disbursement:</u> UA 0.07 million
<u>Grant amount:</u> UA 3.06 million	<u>Source:</u> TAF	<u>Disbursement:</u> UA 0.0 million
<u>Date of approval:</u> 17/03/99	<u>Date of signature:</u> 25/05/99	<u>Date of entry into force:</u> 4/09/2000
<u>Deadline for last disbursement:</u> 31/12/2004		<u>Executing Agency:</u> SODELAC
<u>Date of last supervision mission:</u> 21/04 to 11/05/01		
<u>Number of supervision missions since 1997:</u> 2		
<u>Date last audit report submitted:</u> still not forthcoming.		
<u>Objectives and components:</u> The objective of the project is to boost the country's food security through a net increase in food crop and animal productions and a general improvement of the living conditions of people living in the Lake prefectures. The project comprises the following four components: (i) development of the polders; (ii) agricultural development; (iii) livestock development; (iv) and project management.		

C2. Compliance with Precedent Conditions/Undertakings

2.1.14 The conditions precedent to the first disbursement were met 3 months late and the loan agreement entered into force 7 months after project approval. The other conditions tied to the ADF loan were met. The performance of precedent conditions/undertakings has been judged satisfactory.

C3. Procurement Performance

2.1.15 The project is at the start-up phase and the first bids have just been launched. Performance is judged satisfactory.

C4. Financial Performance

2.1.16 The ADF loan was used to finance the entire foreign exchange and part of the local currency costs. The TAF and beneficiaries co-financed the project to the tune of 13% and 3% of the total cost, respectively. The disbursement rate of the ADF loan was approximately 0.4%. The Government disbursed CFAF 62.5 million in the form of salaries. The Bank repaid expenditure eligible under the ADF and with a CFAF 6,500.000 assistance from the Government for the April/mid-June 2001 period. The financial performance of the project has been judged satisfactory.

C5. Activities and outputs

2.1.17 The project is at the start-up phase and outputs are as follows: i) most of the national staff were seconded to the project; ii) the Government provided the project with buildings in Bol; (iii) the Bank approved award of the contract for recruiting technical assistance to the firm AGRER, for CFAF 1.092.180.000; (iv) the BDs for the procurement of equipment, generator, office supplies are being finalised. The performance of activities and outputs has been satisfactory.

C6. Impact on development

2.1.18 The objective of the project is to boost the country's food security through an increase in food crop and animal productions and a general improvement of the standard of living of people living in the Lake prefecture. The probability that these development objectives are reached is high given the rapid entry into force of the loan and the level of activities and outputs.

C7. Overall Performance Evaluation

2.1.19 The overall performance of the project has been satisfactory. The indicators shown below make it possible to determine the overall project performance which is satisfactory.

Indicators	Status	Procurement of goods and works	Financial performance	Activities and outputs	Impact on development	Overall evaluation
Evaluation	2	2	1.5	2	2	1.8

D/ **Superficial Run-off Water Development Project in 4 Prefectures (Batha, Guera, Biltine and Ouaddai)**

D1. Basic Administrative and Financial Data:

Loan number: F/TCH/VAL/EU-RUI/98/29

Grant number: F/ TCH /DN-ET/VAL/EU-RUI/98/29

<u>Loan:</u> UA 11.90 million	<u>Source:</u> FAD	<u>Disbursement:</u> ADF: UA 0.62 million
<u>Grant:</u> UA 0.51 million	<u>Source:</u> TAF	<u>Disbursement</u> TAF: UA 0.00 million TAF
<u>Date of approval:</u> 29/04/98	<u>Date of signature:</u> 29/05/98	<u>Date of entry into force:</u> 15/9/99
<u>Deadline for last disbursement:</u> 31/12/2005 <u>Date of last supervision mission:</u> 8 to 23 October 2001 <u>Number of supervision missions since 1997:</u> 3 <u>Date last audit report submitted:</u> still not forthcoming. Number of audits since 1997 0		<u>Executing Agency:</u> Directorate of Rural Engineering and Agricultural Water Management (DGRHA) – Ministry of Agriculture.
<u>Objectives and components:</u> the project aims to boost the country's food security. It involves collecting and controlling superficial runoff water in the 4 prefectures for off-flood and market garden farming and for stock watering. The project comprises the following 4 components: (i) civil works; (ii) agro-pastoral development; (iii) accommodating actions; (iv) project management		

D2. Compliance with Precedent Conditions/Undertakings

2.1.20 The conditions precedent to first disbursement were met 15 months late and the loan agreement and grant memorandum of understanding entered into force 16 months after approval of the study. The activity report of the second quarter 2001 was sent to the Bank for the lapse-of-time procedure and approval. The project accounts audit report for the year 2000 is not yet available. Performance at this level has been judged satisfactory.

D3. Procurement Performance

2.1.21 The PIU recruited contract staff, a technical assistant and procured topographical material. The following documents were sent to the Bank for the lapse-of-time procedure and approval: (i) bidding documents for the selection of an operator for the training, sensitisation and village organisation component; and (ii) the bid evaluation sub-commission report on the selection of operators for training, sensitisation, village organisation and agricultural credit. The contract with the CTT enterprises for the procurement of computer material and office equipment is being signed. Performance of goods and services procurement has been judged satisfactory.

D4. Financial Performance

2.1.22 The project entered into force in 1999. The disbursement rate has been low at around 4.99%. The revolving fund was disbursed by the Bank on 18 October 2001. As its counterpart contribution, the Government disbursed CFAF 30 million for 1999, CFAF 40 million for 2000 and CFAF 20 million for 2001. The financial performance of the project has been judged satisfactory.

D5. Activities and outputs

2.1.23 The project implementation schedule could not be complied with. Outputs were: i) recruitment of contractual staff; ii) secondment of national staff by the Ministry of Agriculture; iii) topographic survey of the dam sites and runway centre-line; iv) preparation of agreements with technical operators; v) organisation of beneficiary sensitisation campaigns; vi) procurement of topographic material; and vii) recruitment of technical assistant. The following documents were sent to the Bank for approval: (i) the geo-technical study report on 9 micro-dams and 143 km of feeder roads in the Ouaddaï; (ii) agreement between ONDR and PVERS; and (iii) agreement with ONDR for the agro-pastoral component. Another project manager should be recruited. Performance has been judged satisfactory.

D6. Impact on development

2.1.24 The project is about to take off; since its implementation context has not changed, it can realistically suppose that with the arrival of the technical assistant, the probability of the project attaining its objectives remains high. Thanks to the run-off water control dams, boreholes and market garden wells, inhabitants will be able to practice farming activities for 9 months instead of the current 4, improve livestock activities and living conditions. Performance has been judged satisfactory.

D7. Overall Performance Evaluation

2.1.25 Overall project performance could be slightly affected by the delay in the effectiveness of the loan and grant memorandum of understanding. However, given ongoing activities, the PIU could make up for lost time. Its performance now is less than satisfactory.

Indicators	Status	Procurement of goods and services	Financial performance	Activities and outputs	Impact on development	Overall evaluation
Evaluation	1	2	1.6	1.6	2	1.6

E/ **Fisheries and Fish-farming Sub-sector Study**

E1. Basic Administrative and Financial Data
Grant number: F/TCH/DN-ET/PEC-PIS/2000/12

<u>Grant amount:</u> UA 0.74 million	<u>Source:</u> TAF	<u>Disbursement:</u> UA 0.20 million
<u>Date of approval:</u> 10/12/99	<u>Date of signature:</u> 19/01/00	<u>Date of entry into force:</u> 10/07/2000
<u>Deadline for last disbursement:</u> 31/12/2004 <u>Date of last supervision mission:</u> 06 au 13/03/01: <u>Number of supervision missions since 1997:</u> 1 <u>Date last audit report submitted:</u> Not yet forthcoming. Number of audit since 1997:		<u>Executing Agency:</u> CPEP/Ministry of Water Resources and Environment
<u>Objectives and components:</u> The objective of the study is to step up the contribution of the Fisheries and fish-farming sub-sector to better food security, poverty reduction and diversification of the economy.		

E2. Compliance with Precedent Conditions/Undertakings

2.1.26. The loan agreement entered into force 7 months after project approval. The other conditions tied to the TAF grant were met. The project has not yet been audited. Performance has been judged satisfactory.

E3. Procurement Performance.

2.1.27 In connection with the project, the consulting firm responsible for the study has been recruited. 2 vehicles have been delivered. The process for the purchase of Canoes and office equipment is underway. A request to modify the list of goods and services was sent to the Bank. The environmental expert has resigned. The Government has rehabilitated the premises of the PIU. A request for its replacement has been sent to the Bank. Procurement performance has been judged satisfactory.

E4. Financial Performance

2.1.28 The TAF grant was used to finance the entire foreign exchange and part of the local currency costs. The grant disbursement rate was 18.81%. In respect of its contribution the Government disbursed CFAF 20.4 million. The Government disbursed a further CFAF 8,844.968 for equipping and repairing the premises of the implementation unit. Financial performance has been satisfactory.

E5. Activities and outputs

2.1.29 Although the grant became effective on 10/07/2001, the study took off only on 22/08/01. The findings of the study were not yet available as at 31/12/01. The performance of activities and outputs has been less than satisfactory.

E6. Impact on development

2.1.30 The objective of the study is to step up the contribution of the Fisheries and fish-farming sub-sector to food security, poverty reduction and diversification of the economy. The probability of attaining these development objectives is high if the findings of the study are relevant. The study's impact on development could be positive. The performance of the study could be satisfactory.

E7. Overall Performance Evaluation

2.1.31 The project's overall performance has been judged satisfactory. The indicators shown below suggest that overall project performance has been satisfactory.

Indicators	Status	Procurement of goods and works	Financial performance	Activities and outputs	Impact on development	E Overall evaluation
Evaluation	2.3	2.5	2	1	2	1.9

2.2 Social Sector

2.2.1 As at 31/12/01, the social sector accounted for the following 3 projects: (i) Education IV: secondary education standard improvement; (ii) poverty reduction and women-oriented measures; and (iii) strengthening of primary health care. The disbursement rate of the 3 ongoing operations is 64.8%. As indicated earlier, the Education V and HIV-AIDS projects were approved in March and November 2001 respectively, but are yet to become effective.

A. Education IV – Improvement of the Standard of Secondary Education

A1. Basic Administrative and Financial Data

Loan No.: F/TCH/AME-EDU/92/23)

Loan amount: UA 7,556.8 million	Source: FAD	Disbursement: UA 5. 795 million Partial cancellation: UA 1.653 million
Date of approval: 28/08/91	Date of signature: 22/04/92	Date of entry into force: 30/03/93
Date of last disbursement: 31/12/2001 Date of last supervision mission: 15-29/09/2001 Number of supervision missions since 1997: 06 Date of submission of last audit report: 15/06/2000 (Audit 1999) Number of audits since 1997: 03	Executing Agency: Directorate of Education Project, Ministry of National Education	
Objectives and components: The project aims to improve secondary school infrastructure in the region of Borkou, the prefectures of Batha, East Logone, Guera, Tanjilé and N'djamena. To do so, plans have been made for the construction of a CEG, the rehabilitation of 5 high schools, training of secondary school teachers, purchase of textbooks and teaching aids and assistance to the Directorate of Education Projects (DPE) of the Ministry of Education. The project whose implementation was scheduled to span 4 years comprises the following components: (i) Rehabilitation of 5 secondary schools; (ii) Extension of Secondary education in N'djamena; (iii) Strengthening of secondary education; (iv) Assistance to the Directorate of education Projects.		

A2. Compliance with Precedent Conditions/Undertakings

2.2.2 The loan became effective 19 months after its approval. Project implementation was disrupted by several delays in the award of contracts for construction and procurement of goods and services. Quarterly activity reports were sent regularly to the Bank. Accounts for the 1997 to 1999 financial years have been

audited while that for the 2000 financial year is still pending. Despite the delay in implementation, performance has been judged satisfactory.

A3. Procurement Performance

2.2.3 The process for awarding the contracts for the procurement of textbooks and teaching aids was delayed as a result of non-compliance with the rules of procedure for bid documents and analysis. Consequently, the Bank rejected the bidding documents and competition was re-launched. The implementation of the agreement signed with UNESCO for technical assistance to train trainers was held up for over three years before being re-launched in March 2000 by a memorandum of understanding between the Ministry of National Education and UNESCO. Procurement performance has been judged less than satisfactory.

A4. Financial Performance

2.2.4 The OPEC fund contributed US\$ 5 000 000 (FUA 4 032 000) and the Government CFAF 1 200 000 000. OPEC's contribution is intended to fund the Construction component and that of the Government the Construction and Operating components. The ADF loan was disbursed to the tune of 80.88% account taken of the partial cancellation of UA 1.653 million. OPEC's share was disbursed to the tune of 78% and that of the Government 82.52%. The OPEC component was closed on 31/08/2000. It is worth pointing out that the physical implementation of the project (construction and procurement) has exceeded the 85% mark. The gap between the disbursement level and physical implementation can be explained by the substantial savings made especially for the civil works category which accounted for 71% of total project cost. The deadline for last disbursement expired on 31/12/2001. Financial performance has been judged satisfactory.

A5. Project Activities and Outputs

2.2.5 The lower comprehensive school (CEG) was built and 5 high schools fully rehabilitated/extended and are operational. Furniture for these institutions have been purchased and delivered. Regarding textbooks and teaching aids, only one of the three suppliers complied fully with contract obligations and delivered the textbooks. The other two requested an upward price adjustment that the Bank refused. The Government should take action against the parties concerned with a view to obtaining delivery of the manuals in accordance with the terms of the contract. UNESCO's technical assistance services (local training sessions for teaching staff, supervision and management) have been completed. The training of teachers and professionals of the Higher Institute of Education Sciences (ISSSED) initially scheduled in Canada (University of Laval) was organised in France because of difficulties in obtaining visas for Canada. The training session took off 5 months behind the initial schedule. The performance of activities and outputs has been judged satisfactory.

A6. Impact on development

2.2.6 The project is of support to the country's development because it has increased access to quality secondary education for girls and boys in the regions concerned especially in the prefectures of Batha, East Logone, Guéra, Tanjilé and the town of N'djamena. Under the project, a lower secondary school was built and 5 high schools rehabilitated or extended and equipped. Teachers and education management and inspection staff were given training or further training. Access of young and girls and boys in regions concerned, to quality secondary education has increased. The project helped reduce regional differences of access to secondary education and therefore promoted fair socio-economic development countrywide. The

CEG of N'djamena is now the largest secondary school for girls in the country with a roll of over 1,200 girls from all the country's regions. The performance of impact on development has been judged satisfactory.

A7. Overall Performance Evaluation

2.2.7 Overall performance has been satisfactory. There has been a significant trend in project implementation despite the initial and ongoing delay arising from various difficulties.

Indicator	Status	Procurement of goods and services	Financial performance	Activities and works	Impact on development	Overall evaluation
Evaluation	1.7	1	2	1.75	2.3	1,7

B. **Poverty Reduction and Actions in Favour of Women**

B1. Basic Administrative and Financial Data

Loan No. F/TCH/REPA-FEM/97/28

Grant No F/TCH/REPA-FEM/97/9

<u>Loan amount:</u> UA 5,00 million	<u>Source:</u> FAD	<u>Disbursement:</u> UA 0.720 million
<u>Grant amount:</u> UA 0.300 million	<u>Source:</u> TAF	<u>Disbursement:</u> UA 0.0 million
<u>Date of approval:</u> 04/09/97	<u>Date of signature:</u> 09/10/97	<u>Date of entry into force:</u> 4/02/99
<u>Date of last disbursement:</u> 31/12/2003 <u>Date of last supervision mission:</u> 10-17/10/2001 <u>Number of supervision missions since 1999:</u> 5 <u>Date last audit report submitted:</u> N/A <u>Number of audits since 1997:</u> 1		<u>Executing Agency:</u> Project Implementation Unit, Ministry of Social Welfare and Family
<u>Objectives and components:</u> The project aims at improving the living conditions of the vulnerable especially women in rural areas of the prefecture of Chari-Baguirmi, by assuring them of a better access to productive resources and building the capacity of civil society organisations and project partners for poverty reduction and gender mainstreaming. The project comprises the following four components: (i) establishment of a social development fund; (i) building the capacity of the Ministry of Social Welfare and Family to design and follow-up poverty reduction and gender mainstreaming activities; (iii) building the capacity of project partners to intervene at local level; and (iv) establishment of the project implementation unit.		

B2. Compliance with Precedent Conditions/Undertakings

2.2.8 Conditions precedent to first disbursement were fulfilled 11 months late and the loan agreement entered into force 17 months after project approval. Quarterly activity reports were sent regularly to the Bank. The first audit of project accounts was conducted in 2001. Performance has been judged satisfactory.

B3. Procurement Performance

2.2.9 Works (rehabilitation of premises) goods (equipment, furniture, vehicles) and services (technical assistance for the PIU) were procured on the whole in compliance with Bank rules of procedure. The Principal Technical Adviser who resigned was replaced by his consulting firm in less than one month. A new accountant has been recruited to replace the accountant who was no longer available. Procurement of goods and works has been judged satisfactory.

B4. Financial Performance

2.2.10 Effective in February 1999, 13.60% of the loan has been disbursed. The start of activities concerning the social development and micro-credit fund will soon enable an increase in the disbursement rate shortly. The counterpart resources for 2000 and 2001 have not yet been released. Financial performance has been less than satisfactory.

B5. Activities and Outputs

2.2.11 PIU staff has been recruited and put in place. Premises have been rehabilitated and equipment, furniture and vehicles purchased. Technical assistants have been appointed and started work. The CTP who resigned and the absentee accountant have been replaced. The procedures manual has been finalised, endorsed, translated into Arabic and widely distributed. The computerised account management system has been installed. In building the capacity of the supervisory ministry (MASF) to design and follow-up poverty reduction and gender mainstreaming operations, equipment has been purchased and an organisational audit conducted. Bidding documents for the rehabilitation of the regional delegation and training have been prepared and bids will be launched once counterpart funds are released. Concerning the establishment of a social development fund, studies relative to: (i) the identification of partner NGOs, (ii) micro-finance institutions; and (iii) the communication plan have been completed. A list of 10 micro-finance institutions and NGOs has been drawn. Micro-finance and infrastructure construction activities will start as of first quarter 2002 after the recruitment of the consulting firm responsible for designs and works supervision. Accounts for the 1999 and 2000 financial years are ongoing. Performance has been satisfactory.

B6. Impact on Development

2.2.12 Judging from the set objectives the project should impact significantly on improving the economic and living conditions of rural dwellers especially women. The performance of impact on development has been judged satisfactory.

B7. Overall Performance Evaluation

2.2.13 Overall performance has been judged satisfactory.

Indicator	Status	Procurement of goods and services	Financial performance	Activities and works	Impact on development	Overall evaluation
Evaluation	2	2	1.2	2	2	1,8

C. Primary Health Care Strengthening

C1. Basic Administrative and Financial Data

ADF Loan No F/TCH/REN-SAN/93/25

<u>Loan amount:</u> UA 9.210 million	<u>Source:</u> ADF	<u>Disbursement:</u> UA 7.893 million
<u>Date of approval:</u> 5/05/1993	<u>Date of signature:</u> 12/05/1993	<u>Date of entry into force:</u> 12/05/1994
<u>Date of last disbursement:</u> 30/06/2002	<u>Executing Agency:</u> Project Implementation Unit, Ministry of Health	
<u>Date of last supervision mission:</u> 30/04-11/05/2001		
<u>Number of supervision missions since 1997:</u> 4		
<u>Date last audit report was submitted:</u> N/A		
<u>Number of audit missions since 1997:</u> 0		
<u>Objectives and components:</u> The purpose of the project was to reinforce the national health policy by building the capacity to plan and manage human, material and financial resources at central ministerial level and improve the general health condition of the inhabitants of the three prefectures in the country's south through better geographic and financial access to health care. The project was scheduled to be implemented in three years and comprised the following components: (i) institution building; (ii) Construction, rehabilitation and equipment of health infrastructure in the three prefectures; (iii) project implementation unit.		

C2. Compliance with Precedent Conditions/Undertakings

2.2.14 Conditions precedent to first disbursement were fulfilled six months behind schedule and the loan became effective 12 months after its approval. The project actually took off only in 1995 with the launching of bids. Quarterly activity reports are sent regularly to the Bank. Audits of the 1995 and 1996, 1997 and 1998 financial years were sent to the Bank but have not been approved because they were carried out by the consulting firm responsible for technical assistance. A firm is being selected to conduct the audit in question. Fulfilment of the "other" conditions has been judged less than satisfactory.

C3. Procurement Performance

2.2.15 Bank rules of procedure for the procurement of works and services were not always complied with. Fees for the services of the biomedical engineer were paid in advance although the said services had already been mentioned in the specifications of the bidding documents relative to the supply of equipment and maintenance assistance provided by the supplier. Procurement performance has been less than satisfactory.

C4. Financial Performance

2.2.16 As at 31/12/2001 the Bank had disbursed UA 7.89 million or a disbursement rate of about 85.7%. There were 19 contracts to the project and only three have not been fully disbursed. The Government's contribution of 10% was regularly released. There is a balance of UA 1.22 million on the loan and the Government has introduced a request for its utilisation on additional works and purchases. The Government's request has been approved. The deadline for last disbursement has been extended to 30/6/2002. Financial performance has been satisfactory.

C5. Performance of Project Activities and Outputs

2.2.17 The PRSSP project has now been completed. All health centres have been built/renovated and equipped (33 health centres have been built and equipped). With the exception of 10 man/months not filled by the consultant technical assistance was provided. All staff training sessions have been completed. Three seminars out of the scheduled four were organised locally. From the start the project was faced with difficulties, especially concerning faults in the detailed engineering studies that could have been avoided, but which meant additional works. Accordingly, the Chadian Government made known its wish to use the loan balance for additional works that were required to make the health centres operational. Performance has been judged satisfactory.

C6. Impact on development

2.2.18 The Ministry of Health's capacity to plan and manage human, material and financial resources was built. The health infrastructure established and the assorted training courses provided for various levels of health staff increased the capacity of national structures to tackle diverse aspects of primary health care management. The complementary activities planned with the loan balance will contribute to strengthening the quality of PHC services and the impact of the project on development. Impact on development has been satisfactory.

C7. Overall Performance Evaluation

2.2.19 Overall performance has been judged satisfactory.

Indicator	Status	Procurement of goods and services	Financial performance	Activities and works	Impact on development	General evaluation
Evaluation	1.3	1	2	1.5	1.7	1.5

2.3 Transport Sector

2.3.1 In the transport sector, the Bank has one ongoing operation, the Massaguet-Ngoura road project approved on 27 April 2000 for a total of UA 12 million. The loan agreement entered into force on 9 October 2000, but there has been no disbursement on the loan. The project launching mission took place in November 2000.

A/ Massaguet-N'Goura (Bisney-N'Goura section) Road

A1. Basic Administrative and Financial Data

Loan No. F/TCH/AME-RTE/00/31

<u>Amount:</u> UA 12.00 million	<u>Source:</u> ADF	<u>Disbursement:</u> UA 0.00 million
<u>Date of approval:</u> 27/04/2000	<u>Date of signature:</u> 18/05/2000	<u>Date of entry into force:</u> 09/10/2000
<u>Date of last disbursement</u> :30/06/2004 <u>Number of supervision mission since 2000:</u> 1 <u>Date of last supervision mission:</u> 4-14/09/01	<u>Executing Agency:</u> Ministry of Public Works, Transport, Housing and Town Planning	
<u>Objectives description/components:</u> the overall project objective is to improve access to more efficient means of transport and better domestic and external transport services. It aims in particular at reducing the operating cost of vehicles and improving the socio-economic conditions of the inhabitants of the project impact area. The project also aims at strengthening the institutional capacity of the Ministry of Public Works, Urban Planning and Housing. The loan will be used to finance: (i) road works; (ii) works inspection and supervision (iii) procurement of axle weighing machine and vehicles, (iv) drilling of boreholes equipped with solar-powered pumps and borrow ponds for cattle; v). audit of project accounts and training.		

A2. Compliance with Precedent Conditions/Undertakings

2.3.2 The loan agreement entered into force on 9 October 2000, or slightly less than six months after project approval. Such good performance indicates that the loan conditions were fulfilled by the Borrower within the deadline prescribed in the loan agreement. Performance has been satisfactory.

A3. Procurement Performance

2.3.3 Bidding documents for road works and a consulting firm for works inspection and supervision were prepared and launched in compliance with Bank rules of procedure. Bidding documents for the procurement of axle weighing equipment and vehicles were finalised with the approval of the Bank. Tender documents and short list for the selection of an audit firm have gone through the Bank's no-objection procedure and competition is underway. As a result of the proposals made by the Government concerning a change of road surface, the date for bid submission initially scheduled for 15 May 2001 has been postponed to 30 August 2001 with the Bank's approval. To date, four bids have been received and the results of their analysis sent to the Bank on 9/11/01 for the lapse-of-time procedure. After an exchange of correspondence, the Bank sent its comments on the results of the bid evaluation on 1 March 2002. Concerning competition for works inspection, the Bank rejected the initial bid evaluation results. The final comments on the results of the second evaluation were sent to the Bank on 16 January 02 and examination is being finalised. Only one bid was received during competition for mobile axle-weighing equipment. The bid amount was well above the budget planned during project appraisal. The Bank has sent its comments on the results of the evaluation of this bid and the executing agency has been invited to re-launch bids with specifications on the equipment chosen during project appraisal. Procurement performance has been less than satisfactory.

A4. Financial Performance

2.3.4 The project's procurement process is ongoing and the contract is yet to start. Thus, neither the loan nor the Government's counterpart has been disbursed. However, it must be said that this means a delay on the provisional schedule that had been drawn. Project performance has been less than satisfactory.

A5. Performance of Project Activities and Outputs

2.3.5 Road construction works have not yet started. Performance has been less than satisfactory.

A6. Impact on Development

2.3.6 The project will help provide the country with a cheaper link between towns in the interior and the capital N'djamena; furthermore, it will help promote agro-pastoral, industrial and socio-economic activities in the project impact area. The project will also contribute to opening up the country to its neighbours, thereby furthering Chad's economic integration alongside other countries in the sub-region.

A7. Overall Performance Evaluation

2.3.7 Overall project performance evaluation is not applicable. Indeed, financial performance as that of activities and outputs as well as impact on development cannot at this stage be evaluated as the table below shows.

Indicator	Status	Procurement of goods and services	Financial performance	Activities and works	Impact on development	General evaluation
Evaluation	2	1	0	N/A	N/A	N/A

2.4 Aging And Problem Projects

a) **Aging Projects**

2.4.1 Projects of the active portfolio are on average 4.7 years old. As at 31 December 2001, the following 3 operations were more than 6 years old: (i) Mamdi Irrigation Development Project (effective since 18/03/88) is more than 12 years old but was closed on 31/12/02; (ii) Education IV (effective on 1/04/93) is over 8 years old and its closing date was set for 31/06/01; its deadline for last disbursement was extended by 4 months to 31/12/01 at the request of the Chadian Government; and (iii) Primary Health Care Strengthening (effective on 12/05/94) which was over 7 years old. Its closing date was extended to 31/06/02, at the request of the authorities to enable utilisation of the loan balance for additional activities. The entry of 7 new operations approved during the 1998-2001 period rejuvenated to some degree the active portfolio.

2.4.2 The long delays registered for project implementation are due primarily to external factors (the case of the Mamdi project), the poor administrative capacity of the executing agencies, non compliance with Bank rules of procedure for the procurement of goods and services, slow processing of documents by the Bank, lack of transparency in the management of resources and non-availability of counterpart funds.

b) **Problem Projects**

2.4.3 Problem projects are defined as operations that have been rated less than 1.5 for criteria relative to status or impact on development. In relation to the criterion "status", the following projects are considered problem projects: Mamdi irrigation (rated 1); (ii) cotton and food crop production (rated 1.3); (iii) run-off water control (rated 1) and primary health care strengthening (rated 1.3).

2.4.4 The above mentioned aging and problem projects have been the subject of close field monitoring and a regular follow-up of measures recommended at the end of the supervision missions. These measures are given in the Matrix of Actions in Annex II.

2.5 Evaluation of the Regularity and Quality of Supervision

a) Regularity of Supervision

2.5.1 **Agriculture and Rural Development Sector:** whether in relation to the date of entry into force or to 1997, the norm of 1.5 supervision mission per annum was respected for all projects in the agriculture and rural development sector. The last supervision mission for the Mamdi project took place between 27 November and 12 December 2001. The run-off water control project was last supervised between 8 and 23 October 2001. The cotton and food crop production project was supervised for the last time between 17 November and December 2001. The Lake Prefecture Development and Fisheries and Fish Farming Projects were supervised for the last time on 21 April to 11 May 2001 and 6 to 13 March 2001 respectively.

2.5.2 **Social Sector:** the norm of 1.5 supervision mission per annum was complied with for the Education IV and Poverty Reduction and Actions in Favour of Women Projects since 1997 and 1999 respectively. The norm was not complied with for the Primary Health Care Strengthening Project. The former two were last supervised between 10 and 17 October 2001 and the third was last supervised between 30 April 2001 and 11 May 2001.

2.5.3 The Transport Sector: the Massaguet Ngoura Road Project entered into force on 9 October 2001, and was supervised from 4 to 14 November 2000.

2.5.4 On the whole supervision missions of projects in the portfolio have been regular.

b) Quality of Supervision

2.5.5 The quality of the supervision mission is sometimes affected by its short duration and the fact that it is often combined with other activities (CSP, PRSP, portfolio review, identification, etc) that limit the time devoted to the task of supervision. Moreover, supervision is often entrusted to a single sector task manager who cannot visualise all key problems and make the relevant recommendations restricting thus the quality of supervision.

2.6 Cross-Cutting Issues

2.6.1 Bank operations in Chad were designed primarily to contribute to enhance living conditions especially of rural women, develop human resources, protect natural resources and the environment and promote regional integration. With the participatory approach which has been systematic in recent years one should expect a better impact of Bank operations on reducing poverty and developing Chad as a review of the cross-cutting issues below illustrate (see Annex V).

2.6.2 **Gender Issues:** women account for 52% of Chad's total population and therefore deserve special attention. In the agricultural sector, the cotton and food crop production project promotes productive activities for women contributing thereby to their training in farming techniques. In the social sector, the poverty reduction and action in favour of women project aims at improving the living conditions of the most vulnerable especially women in the rural areas of the Chari-Baguirmi Prefecture while assuring them of a better access to productive resources.

2.6.3 **Human Resources and Governance**: because active projects in Chad have a significant component concerning human resource development and capacity building of the Ministries of agriculture, education and health, they contribute to improving economic governance.

2.6.4 **Regional Integration**: the Bank has backed the reform programmes undertaken in the country since 1988. These have facilitated the adoption of tax, budget and legal harmonisation measures or those designed to establish a common external tariff and macroeconomic unification. Such measures are bolstered by integration-oriented projects financed by the Bank particularly in the transport sector. Thus, the Massaguet-Ngoura Road project will help open up the country to its neighbours favouring thus trade and travel between Chad and other countries of the sub-region.

2.6.5 **Environment**: all the Bank's active projects in Chad have been subject to environmental impact assessments and related issues were dealt with by classification, during project preparation.

2.6.6 **Participatory Approach**: this approach is now used in the preparation and implementation of Bank projects in Chad. It was used in the preparation of projects recently approved in the agricultural, social and transport sectors. Involved were grass-root associations, economic interest groups, chiefdoms and NGOs in particular.

2.6.7 **Population Issues**: projects in the agricultural and social sectors contribute directly to improving social indicators. Indeed, these projects help to improve nutrition, health, enrolment rate especially in the rural areas and limit ignorance.

2.7 **General Evaluation of Portfolio Performance**

2.7.1 The Massaguet-Ngoura road development project was not taken into consideration in the general evaluation of the portfolio (see Annex II) since its overall evaluation was judged irrelevant for reasons already mentioned.

2.7.2 **Overall Evaluation**: the average rating of the 8 ongoing operations is 1.79. The average mark is 1.67 for the agriculture and rural development sector and 1.9 for the social sector. The overall situation of the portfolio may be considered as satisfactory despite the problems pointed out.

2.7.3 **Evaluation by Sector**: as shown in Annex II, the performance of the criteria "Status" and "Financial Performance" of the agriculture and rural development sector is poor at around 1.52. In the social sector the performance of the criteria "procurement of goods and services" and "financial performance" is low at around 1.57.

2.7.4 **Evaluation by Criterion**: generally, the performance of the criteria "Status" and "Procurement of Goods and Services" and "Financial Performance" are rated lowest of the five criteria all projects combined (in the already mentioned sectors) with the respective ratings of 1.59, 1.52 and 1.63.

2.7.5 Compared with the last portfolio review (1997) of 18 operations, when the overall rating was 2.1, the quality of the overall portfolio has lowered. These results imply that special attention must be given to problems that sub-tend the performance of "Status", "Financial Performance" and "Procurement of Goods and Services" during supervision missions with a view to improving portfolio status.

2.8 Disbursement

2.8.1 As at 31 December 2001, the total disbursed for ongoing projects is UA 34.23 million out of an approved total of UA 98.28 million net, or a disbursement rate of 34.8%. The social sector accounts for the highest disbursement rate (64.8%) followed by the agricultural sector (30.9%). In the agricultural sector, no funds have been disbursed for components financed with the grant to the Run-off Water Control and Lake Prefecture Rural Development projects. The same applies to the poverty reduction and action in favour of women project. Moreover, no disbursement has been made for the Massaguet-Ngoura road development project.

2.8.2 The main reasons for a poor portfolio disbursement rate are: (i) long periods for processing disbursement requests; (ii) problems of fund transfer between the African Development Bank and beneficiary banks; (iii) poor communication on partial payment of requests and rejection of disbursement requests; (iv) irregular submission (or failure to submit) of accounting and financial control documents on loans and grants: ledger, disbursement vouchers, etc.

III. EVALUATION OF PROJECT MANAGEMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION CAPACITY

3.1 Government Performance

3.1.1 Bank-financed projects in Chad are implemented under the supervision of the various technical ministries and coordinated by the Ministry of Programme and Project Planning and Land Development. The responsibility for such a task within the Department, falls on the Directorate of Programme and Project Planning, Financing and Follow-up (DPFSPP) which has since 1990 benefited from institutional support from the Bank the implementation of which was completed at the end of June 1999.

3.1.2 The measures taken by the Government to improve project performance are nonetheless inadequate as a result of the delays still registered at the project start-up phase and the sometimes rather slow pace of some projects especially in the agricultural sector. However, efforts are being made: (i) for public contract reform especially through a review of the contract award ceilings and delegation of powers for approving public contracts; (ii) for project follow-up and inspection as revealed by the regular submission of activity reports to the Bank and fewer cases of delay in the audits. In addition, considerable progress has been made in recent years for the release of counterpart project funds and at the same time the expenditure channel has been simplified and streamlined to make it possible to shorten the stages of control and reduce the related phases.

3.1.3 The reasons for such delays that have an adverse effect on the absorption capacity of the resources put at the country's disposal are of an institutional and technical nature and can be identified from the following two vantage points:

- During the project start-up phase, it takes from between 6 and 35 months for loans to become effective. This is due in particular to the long periods spent on preparing and approving decrees ratifying loan agreements and the difficulties encountered by the administration and executing agencies in fulfilling specific conditions.
- During project implementation, the delays encountered are due primarily to the inadequate capacity of the executing agencies to manage the bid preparing and launching plan (problem of staff qualifications and mobility in the implementation units), to delays in preparing architectural and

engineering designs for some projects and signing of contracts, as well as technical and financial fragility of local enterprises which lead to overruns on the contractual deadlines.

3.1.4 Aware of these constraints that weigh down heavily on the national resource absorption capacity, the Government has recently taken measures aimed at reducing the ratification deadlines. Concurrently, the Government is pursuing its efforts at sensitising members of the National Assembly so as to arrive at a systematic priority procedure for ratifying agreements signed with donors.

3.1.5 In order to improve the project management and implementation capacity and make it possible for the projects to fully attain their objectives, it is vital that the Government and executing agencies take specific measures to: (i) ensure the maturity of new projects prior to their entry into the PIP and negotiation with the Bank (preparation of studies, identification of and authorisation for land allocation, identification of NGOs and support institutions) with a view to accelerating loan effectiveness; (ii) provide support to local credit structures; (iii) limit the mobility of the project managers and officers in order to capitalise on achievements and ensure continuity in project implementation; (iv) consolidate the follow-up-evaluation system in line with the ongoing budget reform; (v) streamline the procedures for contract award and inspection at governmental level; and (vi) make internal project audits systematic.

3.2 Bank Performance

3.2.1 The Bank's performance in the area of project assistance, follow-up and supervision has been satisfactory in the last four years. In order to familiarise those concerned with Bank contract and disbursement procedures, a seminar was organised in September 2001 in N'djamena for project managers and officers of the Directorate of Public Contracts, the Competition Appeal Board, the Ministries of Economic Promotion and Development, and Finance and Planning. The periodicity and composition of launching and field supervision missions have improved and made it possible to assist projects at the start-up phase and address problems during implementation. However, the heavy responsibility of the task masters and other Bank officers (GECL, PPRU, FFCO) involved in project management continues to affect deadlines for processing project documents submitted which despite progress made, are still below standard.

3.2.2 The Bank will pursue efforts aimed at reducing deadlines for approving bidding documents and contracts, processing requests for revolving funds and repayments and for dispatch of disbursement notices to the executing agencies.

3.2.3 Moreover, in 1999, the Bank established in the UNDP premises in N'djamena, a unit for the administrative follow-up of all its ongoing operations. Thanks to the human and material means at the unit's disposal, the Bank hopes to improve the quality of its portfolio of projects in Chad.

IV. ASSISTANCE COORDINATION

4.1 Evaluation of Government Capacity

4.1.1 At local level, assistance coordination is the responsibility of the Ministry of Economic Promotion and Development (MPED), through its technical directorates: Development Planning, Programme and Project Programming, Financing and Follow-up (DPFSP). An Inter-ministerial High Commission and a Technical Committee responsible for monitoring sector meetings were established by Decree N° 225 /PR/00 of 6 June 2000.

4.1.2 External assistance is also coordinated via the periodic Round Tables organised by the Government with the sponsorship of the UNDP. Round Tables bring together Chad's donors and development partners focusing on the country's development programmes and plans with a view to analysing and discussing the development strategies and priorities, and coordinating their operations both at technical and financial levels. In that connection, since the last portfolio review in 1997, a Donor Round Table was organised in 1998 (Geneva IV) in order to mobilise the resources required for financing the country's reconstruction and socio-economic development and capacity building programmes. In addition to such international meetings of Chad's external development partners, the country organises regularly, sector meetings for the purpose of determining the contents of these sector strategies, obtaining the support of traditional donors for the proposed development strategies and receive their technical and financial assistance. It is fitting to underscore that in the context of the sector consultation on education and training organised in January 2000 with Bank technical and financial assistance within the framework of the Geneva IV Round Table, the Bank was chosen as sector leader.

4.2 Evaluation of Bank and Other Donor Coordination

4.2.1 Since 1997, the allocation and utilisation of assistance have also been reviewed during meetings of members of the Special Programme for Africa (SPA) and during annual and midterm reviews of the Government's medium-term Development Programmes backed by lead donors including the Bank. Assistance (project and programme loans) is also coordinated when Bank-financed structural adjustment programmes are evaluated and implemented and the country poverty reduction strategy paper (PRSP) is prepared.

4.2.2 Alongside the ISDB and ABEDA, the Bank jointly financed the Mamdi Polder Irrigation Development Project. Three-party (Government/ADF/ABEDA) meetings were organised according to needs with a view to reviewing problems arising from the operation's implementation, and devising the appropriate solutions. In the education sector, the Education IV project was co-financed by OPEC whose contribution covered 36.40% of the cost of rehabilitation and construction works. It ended on 31/08/2000 upon completion of civil works. Concerning the poverty reduction and action in favour of women project, the preparation of the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) and the studies for identifying profitable markets and on the poverty profile were conducted in coordination with the UNDP and World Bank.

V. STATEMENT OF LOANS AND ARREARS REPAYMENT

Thanks to the economic upturn since 1995, Chad regularly repays maturities on its debt to the Bank Group. On the other hand, it owes subscriptions to the ADB capital which as at 31 December 2001, stood at UA 432.000 UC in respect of GCI-IV.

VI. INITIATIVES TO IMPROVE PORTFOLIO QUALITY

6.1 Problems Encountered In Project Implementation

6.1.1 Despite efforts undertaken to improve the quality of the portfolio, project implementation will continue to suffer from the persistent generic problems outlined in paragraphs 3.1 and 3.2 and summarised hereafter:

Start-up Phase

- (i) Long delays in the preparation and approval of decrees ratifying loan agreements;
- (ii) Difficulties encountered by the administration and executing agencies in fulfilling specific conditions.

Procurement of Goods and Services:

- (i) long delays in the award of contracts including difficulties in preparing bidding documents and slow contract award and approval procedures,
- (ii) non-compliance with Bank rules of procedure for procurement,
- (iii) poor structural capacity (organisation and means) of national enterprises in the private sector to implement contracts,
- (iv) inadequacy of the database on national suppliers;

Project Organisation and Management:

- (i) shortage of qualified staff;
- (ii) instability of project implementation staff;
- (iii) poor accounting and financial management;
- (iv) Non-compliance with Bank rules of procedure for the recruitment of project managers (coordinator, accountant, other);
- (v) lack of follow-up by counterparts;
- (vi) problem of project documents archiving;
- (vii) inadequate monitoring and management of contracts (consultants, entrepreneurs and suppliers);
- (viii) poor follow-up of Bank recommendations;
- (ix) activity reports not produced;
- (x) audit reports not regular.

Financial Problems:

- (i) Government breach of financial commitments to mobilise without delay budgeted counterpart project funds;
- (ii) halt in project implementation due to disbursement suspension; and
- (iii) long delays by the Bank to disburse project funds

6.1.2 If such problems are not solved they could for a long time adversely affect the assistance absorption capacity and macro-economic performance, which could mean a low rate of PIP implementation and disbursement.

6.2 Solutions And Action Plans

A plan of action and updated implementation schedule have been prepared for each ongoing operation reviewed. Specific measures, as shown in Annex I and a continued satisfactory level of supervision in 2001 and 2002 should improve the pace of implementation. Therefore, the tempo of implementation of aging projects should improve and the latter completed in 2001/2002, leading to a better assistance absorption capacity.

6.3 Lesson to Draw for Future CSPs and Portfolio Reviews

Within the framework of the Bank's operational strategy to be defined in the 2002-2004 CSP, special attention should be paid to measures aimed at giving the Government support in implementing the general and specific recommendations highlighted in this portfolio review (see § VII) to improve the quality of existing projects. This will mean backing actions aimed at perfecting the institutional framework for project management, addressing the structural and sectoral constraints of the Chadian economy and enhancing good governance. The Bank must support the ongoing public contract reform. Special consideration must be given to the quality of projects entering the pipeline and their effective impact on poverty reduction, since the poverty reduction strategy paper is now part and parcel of the CSP and should facilitate aid coordination.

VII. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 A review of ongoing Bank projects suggests that the quality of its portfolio in Chad is on the whole satisfactory. Nonetheless, implementation of Bank projects is hindered by the generic difficulties mentioned earlier. In order to maintain and step up the Bank's financial support to Chad's economic and social development, Bank field missions must be intensified in 2002 and 2003 and so must project identification if the Bank reserve of projects is to increase. In addition, the Bank must double its efforts with other partners of Chad with a view to identifying new projects to co-finance. Lastly, given the ground covered since 1995 to sanitise the country's macroeconomic framework and the initiatives made by the authorities to found a legal and regulatory framework conducive to the development of business, the Bank should endeavour to finance projects in the private sector.

7.2 Generally it has been recommended that:

A) The Government:

- i) Organise and introduce in the Ministry of Economic Planning and Development, a reliable accounting and implementation supervision system for all ongoing projects;
- ii) Introduce in the same Ministry a system for efficiently monitoring implementation of Bank projects;
- iii) Release regularly its share in the financing of Bank projects;
- iv) Take the necessary steps to fulfil within the required deadlines, conditions for entry into force of the loans and grants, and regularly submit project implementation status reports;
- v) Prepare and send regularly to the Bank reports on completed projects; and
- vi) Refrain from frequent change of project managers.

B) The Bank:

- i) Pursue dialogue with Chad while judiciously making use of the Bank's administrative project implementation monitoring unit in UNDP, N'djamena;
- ii) Ensure that recommendations of project audit reports have indeed been applied by the Government; and
- iii) Prepare project evaluation reports so as to enhance sustainability on the country's economic and social development.

7.3 Specifically it has been recommended that:

- (i) For the aging and problem projects mentioned earlier, the Bank field more supervision missions in 2002. On the other hand, the Government and executing agencies should apply the recommendations of the supervision missions in order to improve implementation of such projects in the next two years.
- (ii) For the three new projects effective since 1999/2000 (Lake Prefecture Rural Development, Fisheries and Fish Farming Sub-Sector Study, Massaguet-Ngoura Road Development), the Bank programme missions to assist the Government with a view to speeding up disbursements.

7.4 The Boards are invited to consider the conclusions of the general review of the portfolio in Chad and apply the above recommendations.

CHAD: PORTFOLIO REVIEW

MATRIX OF ACTIONS TO IMPROVE IMPLEMENTATION OF ONGOING PROJECTS

Operations	Problems Raised	Actions Required	Deadline
GENERIC PROBLEMS			
Start-up Stage	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Long delays for preparation and approval of the decree ratifying loan agreements. 2. Difficulties encountered by the administration and executing agencies in fulfilling specific conditions. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. <u>Government</u>: find a regulatory solution that will enable ratification of agreements within a maximum period of 3 months starting from date of signature. 2. <u>Bank</u>: improve knowledge of the Administration and executing agencies on specific conditions. 2. <u>Government</u>: develop human resource and build institutional capacity. 	March 2002
Procurement of goods and services:	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Long delays in the award of contract including difficulties in preparing bidding documents and slowness in the respective contract award and approval process 2. Non-compliance with Bank rules of procedure for procurement 3. Low structural capacity (organisation and means) of national enterprises of the private sector to implement contracts, 4. Inadequacy of the database on national suppliers. 	<p><u>Government</u>: develop human resource and build institutional capacity in order to improve procurement of goods and services.</p> <p><u>Bank</u>: Organise training seminars on Bank rules of procedure for procurement of goods and services.</p>	Permanent
			Permanent
Project organisation and management:	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Shortage of qualified staff; 2. Instability of project implementation staff; 3. Poor account and financial management; 4. Failure to comply with Bank rules of procedure for the recruitment of project managers (coordinator, accountant, other); 5. Lack of follow-up by counterparts; 6. Problem of archiving project documents; 7. Inadequate follow-up of contract management (consultants, entrepreneurs and suppliers); 8. Inadequate monitoring of Bank recommendations; 9. No activity reports produced; audit reports not systematic. 	<p><u>Government</u></p> <p>-develop human resources and build institutional capacity to improve project organisation and management;</p> <p>- produce systematic audit reports;</p> <p>- ensure follow-up of recommendations</p> <p>- maintain project implementation staff in their positions.</p> <p><u>Bank</u>: Organiser training seminars on Bank rules of procedure.</p>	Permanent
			Permanent
Financial problems:	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Breach of financial commitments on the part of the Government to mobilise in time its budgeted share of project financing. Halt of project implementation due to disbursement suspension. 3. Long delays by the Bank to disburse project funds. 	<p><u>Government</u>: systematically pay within the prescribed deadlines counterpart funds for projects.</p> <p><u>Bank</u>: organise training seminars on fund disbursement procedures.</p>	Permanent

Name of Project	Problems Raised	Actions Required	Deadline
AGRICULTURAL SECTOR			
1. Mamdi Polder Irrigation Development Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The pumps received (bid package 1) were out of order after 600 to 900 h of pumping; 2. Duration of works on bid package 4 bis will exceed the deadline for last disbursement set at 31 December 2002; 3. Contract period of the consulting firm required to supervise works will end late April 2002, does not cover the entire duration of works implementation. 4. Delay in submitting the audit report for the 2000 financial year. 5. Delay in the payment of the Government's counterpart. 6. No separate project accounts are kept. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Call upon the supplier of the pumping sets to repair the three faulty pumps delivered. 2. Start with the sections financed by the ADF, during implementation of bid package 4 bis in order to disburse the entire portion financed by the ADF. 3. Take steps to ensure supervision of works between March and December 2002. 4. Take measures to submit the audit report for the 2000 financial year. 5. Refer to the Minister of Finance for payment of the 2001 tranche included in the State budget. 6. Recruit an accountant to manage separate project accounts. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 31 December 2001 2. 31 December 2002 3. 30 March 2002 4. 31 December 2001 5. 31 December 2001 6. 31 December 2001
2. Cotton and Food Crop Production Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Suspension of disbursements following an audit that revealed that agricultural inputs were purchased without complying with Bank rules of procedure; 2. Delay in the start-up of the credit component; 3. Delay in the payment of the Government's counterpart. 4. No steering committee meeting scheduled. 5. Delay in the submission of the audit report for the 2000 financial year 6. Delay in processing procurement documents. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Take the necessary steps to lift sanctions. 2. Make the ONDR credit service independent to enable take off of the credit component 3.1 Refer to the Minister of Finance for payment of arrears for 2000 currently in the process of payment at the Treasury (CFAF 50 million) 3.2 Refer to the Minister of Finance for payment of the tranche for 2001 included in the State budget (CFAF 208 million). 4. Hold national steering committee meeting during the first quarter of every year with the participation of all members especially Cotontchad. 5. Speed up evaluation of bids for the recruitment of the auditor. 6. Speed up processing of procurement documents by the Bank. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 31 December 2001 2. 31 December 2001 3.1 31 December 2001 3.2 31 December 2001 4. 30 March 2002 5. 31 December 2001 6. 31 December 2001
3. Lake Prefecture Development Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Delay in submission of the audit report for 2000 financial year. 2. Delay in the payment of the Government counterpart 3. Delay in the processing of repayment requests. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Accelerate bid evaluation for recruitment of auditor. 2.1 Refer to the Minister of Finance for payment of arrears for year 2000. 2.2 Refer to Minister of Finances for payment of tranche for 2001 included in the State budget. 3. Accelerate processing of repayment requests by the Bank. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 31 December 2001 2. 31 December 2001 3. 31 December 2001

Name of Project	Problems Raised	Actions Required	Deadline
AGRICULTURAL SECTOR (contd.)			
4. Surface Run-off Water Development	1. Delay in signing the contract for the procurement of computer and office equipment; 2. Delay in the payment of the Government counterpart;	1. Arrange for the signing of the contract to procure computer and office equipment. 2.1 Refer to the Minister of Finance for payment of arrears for the year 2000; 2.2 Refer to the Minister of Finance for the payment of the 2001 tranche included in the State budget.	1. 31 December 2001 2. 31 December 2001
3 Fisheries and Fish Farming Study	1. No arrangements for audit of the project in the grant appraisal report.	1. Submit to the Bank a request to modify the list of goods and services for financing by the Bank with the grant resources of the project audit.	1. 31 December 2001
SOCIAL SECTOR			
4. Education IV	Audit of project accounts for the 2000 financial year yet to be conducted. Situation due to delay in the transfer of revolving fund.	<u>Government:</u> - audit the 2000 financial year and sent the report to the Bank. - audit the financial year 2001 and send the report to the Bank.	28/02/2002 31/03/2002
	Two suppliers out of three award winners of packages for textbooks and teaching aid request price revision using as pretext a rise in the price of raw material.	<u>Government</u> take action against the 2 suppliers for execution of the orders in line with the contracts.	30/11/2001
5. Strengthening of Primary Health Care	Utilisation of the balance to carry out some additional activities (building of staff quarters approved by the Bank, boreholes for the supply of water, procurement of ambulances, replenishment of the revolving fund).	<u>Government:</u> Conduct activities scheduled before expiry of the deadline for last disbursement.	30/06/2002

Name of Projects	Problems Encountered	Actions Required	Deadline
SOCIAL SECTOR (contd.)			
Poverty Reduction and Actions in Favour of Women	Counterpart funds not released thereby delaying the conduct of some activities (works to rehabilitate the Regional Delegation, for instance).	<u>Government:</u> Resources should be budgeted in accordance with budget projections.	31/12/2001
	Delay in the start of micro-credit and social infrastructure construction activities.	<u>Government</u> - Accelerate the recruitment of the consulting firm responsible for preparing operations guides and design and works supervision.	15/02/2002

CHAD : BANK GROUP OPERATIONS

(in UA thousand)

ANNEX II

			31/12/01						
	PROJECTS BY SECTOR	WINDOW	Approval date	Date of signature	Date of entry into force	Closing date	Net amount approved	Amount disbursed	Disbursement rate (%)
A	AGRICULTURE AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT								
1	POLDERS BOWL IMPROVEMENT	ADF	12/12/1975	1/15/1976	11/12/1976	12/31/1992	4,142.8	4,142.8	100.0
2	SATEGUI-DERESSIA IRRIGATION DEVELOPMENT	ADF	4/14/1986	#	#	#	0.0	0.0	0.0
3	APPUI INSTITUTIONNEL AU GENIE RURAL	ADF	4/14/1986	5/7/1986	3/13/1987	6/30/1994	948.7	948.7	100.0
4	MAMDE POLDER IRRIGATION DEVELOPMENT	ADF	6/18/1986	7/17/1986	3/18/1988	12/31/2002	11,448.7	7,292.5	63.7
5	LAKE CHAD REGION MASTER PLAN STUDY	ADF	3/23/1987	6/10/1987	3/18/1988	12/31/1999	1,777.6	1,629.5	91.7
6	LAKE REGION DEVELOPMENT RECOVERY PROGRAMME	ADF	5/18/1987	6/10/1987	3/18/1988	6/30/1999	14,046.0	14,024.9	99.8
7	NATIONAL LIVESTOCK PROJECT	ADF	4/29/1988	5/29/1989	12/29/1989	6/30/2000	10,896.0	10,328.7	94.8
8	SKIN AND LEATHER SUB-SECTOR DEVELOPMENT	ADF	2/23/1989	5/28/1989	9/15/1989	12/31/1996	503.0	503.0	100.0
9	RUN-OFF WATER UTILISATION STUDY	ADF	5/14/1990	5/30/1990	6/11/1991	12/31/1999	1,155.9	1,155.9	100.0
10	COTTON SUB-SECTOR IMPROVEMENT PROJECT	ADF	8/28/1991	4/22/1992	5/8/1992	12/31/2000	13,815.8	13,043.5	94.4
11	COTTON AND FOOD CROP PRODUCTION PROJECT	ADF	9/2/1993	3/21/1995	7/11/1996	12/31/2001	18,950.0	11,616.0	61.3
12	BILTINE RURAL DEVELOPMENT PROJECT STUDY	ADF	10/13/1993	1/13/1995	5/20/1996	7/31/2001	670.0	598.6	89.3
13	SPIRULINA PRODUCTION DEVELOPMENT PRE-FEASIBILITY STUDY	ADF	4/15/1997	5/29/1997	3/23/1998	6/30/2001	369.0	320.1	86.7
14	ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT OF RUN-OFF WATER DEVELOPMENT	ADF	4/29/1998	5/29/1998		12/31/2005	510.0	0.0	0.0
14	SUPERFICIAL RUN-OFF WATER CONTROL DS 4	ADF	4/29/1998	5/29/1998	9/3/1999	12/31/2005	11,900.0	620.0	5.2
15	FISHING AND FISH FARMING STUDY	ADF	3/17/1999	5/25/1999		12/31/2004	3,060.0	0.0	0.0
15	LAKE CHAD PREFECTURE RURAL DEVELOPMENT	ADF	3/17/1999	5/25/1999	9/4/2000	12/31/2004	17,300.0	67.3	0.4
16	FISHING AND FISH FARMING STUDY	ADF	12/10/1999	1/19/2000	7/10/2000	12/31/2004	737.2	200.6	27.2
17	BILTINE RURAL DEVELOPMENT PROJECT STUDY	ADF	19/09/01	20/12/01	#	31/12/07	9,000.0	0.0	0.0
	TOTAL SECTOR						121,230.7	66,492.1	54.8
D.	TRANSPORT								
1	ROAD MAINTENANCE PROGRAMME	ADF	8/24/1978	1/4/1978		12/31/1982	0.0	0.0	0.0
2	EMERGENCY PROGRAMME	ADF	12/4/1981	12/15/1981	9/30/1982	6/30/1994	12,978.0	12,978.0	100.0
3	ROAD REHABILITATION - MAINTENANCE	ADF	10/26/1987	3/23/1988	12/30/1988	12/31/1998	12,194.1	12,194.1	100.0
4	DJERMAYA ROAD DEVELOPMENT PROJECT	ADF	1/23/1997	2/11/1997	7/30/1997	12/31/2000	13,250.0	10,173.2	76.8
5	MASSAG ROAD DEVELOPMENT PROJECT	ADF	4/27/2000	5/18/2000	10/9/2000	6/30/2004	12,000.0	0.0	0.0
	TOTAL SECTOR						50,422.1	35,345.3	70.1
E	WATER AND SANITATION								
1	SANITATION	ADF	26/10/76	8/2/1976	2/4/1977	12/31/1992	4,605.3	4,605.3	100.0
2	N'DJAMENA RAIN WATER DRAINAGE	F.A.D.	9/23/1986	1/4/1986	2/8/1990	6/30/1994	396.0	396.0	100.0
3	SATIGUI-DERESSIA IRRIGATION (OMVSD)	FAD	3/22/1974	5/10/1974	2/2/1975	12/31/1992	3,684.2	3,684.2	100.0
4	SATIGUI-DERESSIA IRRIGATION (OMVSD)	FAD	10/26/1976	1/11/1996	3/10/77	3/12/92	3,684.2	3,684.2	100.0
5	SUDANESE AREA MASTER PLAN STUDY	F.A.D.	9/17/1990	1/8/1991	1/3/1992	3/31/2001	1,430.1	1,430.1	100.0
	TOTAL SECTOR						13,799.8	13,799.8	100.0

In UA Thousand

	PROJECTS BY SECTOR	WINDOW	Date of approval	Date of signature	Date of entry into force	Closing date	Amount approved net	Amount disbursed	Disbursement rate (%)
F	ENERGY								
1	ELECTRICITY SUB-SECTOR MASTER PLAN STUDY (GRANT)	ADF	12/16/1991	4/22/1992	12/10/1992	12/31/2000	940.2	940.2	72.9
	TOTAL SECTOR						940.2	940.2	100.0
G	COMMUNICATIONS								
1	INFRASTRUCTURE REHABILITATION T	ADF	12/18/1986	2/5/1987	8/26/1987	12/31/2002	14,273.7	14,273.7	100.0
2	INSTITUTIONAL SUPPORT TO ONPT-NDJAMENA	ADF	2/15/1990	3/9/1990	7/5/1990	3/31/2001	2,135.4	2,135.4	100.0
	TOTAL SECTOR						16,409.1	16,409.1	100.0
H	FINANCE								
1	INSTITUTIONAL SUPPORT TO BDT.	ADF	2/23/1989	2/23/1989	3/27/1990	12/31/1994	1,590.0	1,590.0	100.0
	TOTAL SECTOR						1,590.0	1,590.0	100.0
I	SOCIAL								
1	SCHOOL OF SCIENCES (I.N.S.E.)	ADF	11/22/1976	12/11/1976	7/31/1977	12/31/1994	3,921.8	3,921.8	100.0
2	HYGIENE SECTOR STUDY	ADF	3/23/1987	6/10/1987	6/21/1988	6/30/1994	488.4	488.4	100.0
2	HYGIENE SECTOR STUDY	ADF	3/23/1987	6/10/1987	6/21/1988	6/30/1994	963.4	963.4	100.0
4	EDUCATION PROJECT SECTOR STUDY	ADF	4/23/1987	6/10/1987	1/10/1989	12/31/1994	500.6	500.6	100.0
5	REHABIL.OF SCHOOLS IN CHAD	ADF	9/20/1988	5/28/1989	11/30/1989	12/31/1996	10,776.3	9,535.5	88.5
6	BORKOU PRIMARY SCHOOL REHABILITATION	ADF	9/18/1989	10/10/1989	5/30/1990	6/30/2000	8,623.8	8,543.3	99.1
7	PROJET EDUCATION IV	ADF	8/28/1991	4/22/1992	4/1/1993	6/30/2001	7,557.0	5,795.7	76.7
8	PRIMARY HEALTH STRENGTHENING PROJECT	ADF	5/5/1993	5/12/1993	5/12/1994	12/31/2000	9,210.5	7,893.6	85.7
9	POVERTY REDUCTION & ACTION IN FAVOUR OF WOMEN	TAF	9/4/1997	10/9/1997	2/4/1999	12/31/2003	300.0	0.0	0.0
9	POVERTY REDUCTION AND ACTIONS IN FAVOUR OF WOMEN	ADF	9/4/1997	10/9/1997	2/4/1999	12/31/2003	5,300.0	806.6	15.2
10	EDUCATION PROJECT V	TAF	3/1/2001	5/29/2001	//	12/31/2007	1,300.0	0.0	0.0
10	EDUCATION PROJECT V	ADF	3/1/2001	5/29/2001	//	12/31/2007	5,431.0	0.0	0.0
11	HEALTH SYSTEM STRENGTHENING AND HIV/AIDS CONTROL	ADF	21/11/01	20/12/01	//	30/06/05	5,000.0	0.0	0.0
11	HEALTH SYSTEM STRENGTHENING AND HIV/AIDS CONTROL	TAF	21/11/01	20/12/01	//	30/06/05	1,000.0	0.0	0.0
	TOTAL SECTOR						60,372.8	38,448.9	63.7
K	MULTI-SECTOR								
1	RESTRUCT.ECONOMIC AND FINANCIAL PUBLIC SECTOR	ADF	1/18/1989	2/23/1989	4/10/1989	6/30/1982	27,631.6	27,631.6	100.0
2	INSTITUTIONAL SUPPORT TO 3 MINISTERIES	ADF	12/17/1990	1/8/1991	5/15/1991	6/30/1999	3,868.4	3,837.50	99.2
3	STRUCTURAL ADJUSTMENT PROGRAMME II	ADF	10/2/1997	10/9/1997	11/28/1997	12/31/1999	18,000.0	18,107.8	100.6
4	STRUCTURAL ADJUSTMENT PROGRAMME III	ADF	6/2/2002	8/2/2002	//	31/12/02	8,700.0	0	0.0
	TOTAL SECTOR						58,200.0	49,576.9	85.2
	TOTAL COUNTRY						322,964.7	222,602.3	68.9

REPUBLIC OF CHAD
Summary of Ongoing Operations
(as at 2/10/2001)
(in UA million)

Project	Source	Year of Approval	Date of Signature	Date of Entry Into Force	Net Loan/Grant Amount	Net Amount Disbursed	Net Undisbursed Amount	Disburse. Rate	Date of Closure
AGRICULTURAL SECTOR									
1. Mamdi Polder Irrigation Development	ADF	18/06/86	17/07/86	18/03/88	11.45	7.29	5.03	56.06	31/12/2002
2. Cotton and Food Crop Production	ADF	02/09/93	21/03/95	11/07/1996	18.95	11.61	7.33	61.3	31/12/2001
3. Run-off Rain Water	ADF	29/04/98	29/05/98	03/09/99	11.90	0.62	11.30	4.99	31/12/2005
4. Lake Prefecture Rural Development	ADF	17/03/99	25/05/99	04/09/00	17.30	0.067	17.23	0.4	31/12/2004
5. Fisheries and Fish Farming Sub-Sector Study	TAF	17/03/99	25/05/99	04/09/00	3.06	0.00	3.06	0.0	31/12/2004
	TAF	10/12/99	19/01/00	10/07/00	0.74	0.20	0.59	0.0	31/12/2004
TRANSPORT SECTOR									
6. Massaguet-Ngoura Road	ADF	27/04/00	18/05/00	09/10/00	12.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	30/06/2004
SOCIAL SECTOR									
1. Strengthening of Primary Health Care									
2. Education IV	ADF	05/05/93	12/05/93	12/05/94	9.21	7.89	1.32	85.7	31/12/2000
3. Poverty Reduction and Action in Favour of Women.	ADF	28/08/91	22/04/92	01/04/93	7.56	5.79	1.77	76.7	30/06/2001
	ADF	04/09/97	09/10/97	04/02/99	5.30	0.80	4.58	13.6	31/12/2003
	TAF	04/09/97	09/10/97	04/02/99	0.30	0.00	0.00	0.00	31/12/2003

Activity Sectors/Performance criteria			Performance	Works	Develop.
Agricultural Sector	1.52	1.7	1.42	1.67	2.04
Mamdi Polder Irrigation Development	1	2	1.5	2	2
Lake Prefecture Development	2	2	1	2	2
Cotton and Food Crop Production	1.3	0	1	1.75	2.2
Fisheries and Fish Farming Study	2.3	2.5	2	1	2
Run-off Water Development	1	2	1.6	1.6	2
Social Sector	1.67	1.3	1.7	1.8	2.0
1. Education IV	1.7	1	2	1.75	2.3
Primary Health Care Strengthening	1.3	1	2	1.5	1.7
Poverty Reduction and Action in Favour of Women	2	2	1.2	2.0	2
Transport Sector					
Massaguet Ngoura Road Development	2	1	S.0	S.0	S.0
Overall Average Performance	1.59	1.52	1.58	1.71	2.02

* Excluding the Transport Sector

MAMDI POLDER IRRIGATION DEVELOPMENT

PROJECT EVALUATION		
INDICATORS	RATINGS	
	Previous Report	This Report
A. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION		
1. Compliance with conditions precedent to entry into force of loan agreement	2	1
2. Compliance with general condition	2	1
3. Compliance with other conditions	3	1
B. PROCUREMENT PERFORMANCE		
1. Procurement of consultancy services	1	2
2. Procurement of goods and works	1	2
C. FINANCIAL PERFORMANCE		
1. Availability of foreign exchange	2	2
2. Availability of local currency	3	2
3. Disbursement performance	2	1
4. Cost management/recovery	N/A	-
5. Performance of co-financiers (if need be)	1	1
D. ACTIVITIES AND WORKS		
1. Adherence to implementation schedule	0	2
2. Performance of consultants or technical assistants	N/A	2
3. Performance of enterprises	1	2
4. Performance of project management	2	2
	1	
E. IMPACT ON DEVELOPMENT		
1. Likelihood of achieving project objectives	2	2
2. Likelihood that benefits will be realised and sustained beyond the project investment phase	2	2
3. Likely contribution of the project towards increased institutional capacity	2	2
4. Current rate of return	1	2
F. OVERALL ASSESSMENT OF PROJECT		
1. At present	1.6	1.7
2. Trend over time	2	2
<p>Code : 3 = Highly satisfactory, no problem 2 = Satisfactory: occasional problems, Bank should monitor 1 = Unsatisfactory: problems, Bank should monitor closely, but no immediate action required 0 = Highly unsatisfactory, serious problems : Bank action required</p>		

FOOD CROP AND COTTON PRODUCTION

PROJECT EVALUATION		
INDICATORS	RATING	
	Previous Report	This Report
A. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION		
1. Compliance with conditions precedent to entry into force of loan agreement	1	1
2. Compliance with general condition	2	1
3. Compliance with other conditions	1	2
B. PROCUREMENT PERFORMANCE		
Procurement of consultancy services	3	0
Procurement of goods and works	3	0
C. FINANCIAL PERFORMANCE		
1. Availability of foreign exchange	3	1
2. Availability of local currency	3	1
3. Disbursement performance	1	1
4. Cost management/recovery	N.A.	1
5. Performance of co-financiers (if need be)	2	1
D. ACTIVITIES AND WORKS		
2. Adherence to implementation schedule	2	2
3. Performance of consultants or technical assistants	N.A.	2
4. Performance of enterprises	N.A.	2
5. Performance of project management	2	1
5. Project Achievements	2	
E. IMPACT ON DEVELOPMENT		
1. Likelihood of achieving project objectives	3	3
2. Likelihood that benefits will be realised and sustained beyond the project investment phase	3	3
3. Likely contribution of the project towards increased institutional capacity	2	2
4. Current rate of return	2	1
F. OVERALL ASSESSMENT OF PROJECT		
1. At present	2.2	1.2
2. Trend over time	3	2
Code : 3 = Highly satisfactory, no problem 2 = Satisfactory: occasional problems, Bank should monitor 1 = Unsatisfactory: problems, Bank should monitor closely, but no immediate action required 0 = Highly unsatisfactory, serious problems: Bank action required		

LAKE CHAD PREFECTURE DEVELOPMENT PROJECT

PROJECT EVALUATION	
INDICATORS	RATING
	This Report
A. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION	
2. Compliance with conditions precedent to entry into force of loan agreement	2
3. Compliance with general condition	2
4. Compliance with other conditions	2
B. PROCUREMENT PERFORMANCE	
4. Procurement of consultancy services	2
5. Procurement of goods and works	2
C. FINANCIAL PERFORMANCE	
1. Availability of foreign exchange	
2. Availability of local currency	1
3. Disbursement performance	1
4. Cost management/recovery	-
5. Performance of co-financiers (if need be)	-
D. ACTIVITIES AND WORKS	
1. Adherence to implementation schedule	2
2. Performance of consultants or technical assistants	-
3. Performance of enterprises	-
4. Performance of project management	2
E. IMPACT ON DEVELOPMENT	
1. Likelihood of achieving project objectives	2
2. Likelihood that benefits will be realised and sustained beyond the project investment phase	2
3. Likely contribution of the project towards increased institutional capacity	2
4. Current rate of return	-
F. OVERALL ASSESSMENT OF PROJECT	
1. At present	1.8
2. Trend over time	2
Code : 3 = Highly satisfactory, no problem 2 = Satisfactory: occasional problems, Bank should monitor 1 = Unsatisfactory: problems, Bank should monitor closely, but no immediate action required 0 = Highly unsatisfactory, serious problems: Bank action required	

RUN-OFF WATER DEVELOPMENT IN THE PREFECTURES

PROJECT EVALUATION	
INDICATORS	RATING
	This Report
A. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION	
1. Compliance with conditions precedent to entry into force of loan agreement	1
2. Compliance with general condition	1
3. Compliance with other conditions	1
B. PROCUREMENT PERFORMANCE	
1. Procurement of consultancy services	2
2. Procurement of goods and works	2
C. FINANCIAL PERFORMANCE	
1. Availability of foreign exchange	1
2. Availability of local currency	2
3. Disbursement performance	2
4. Cost management/recovery	-
5. Performance of co-financiers (if need be))	-
D. ACTIVITIES AND WORKS	
1. Adherence to implementation schedule	1
2. Performance of consultants or technical assistants	2
3. Performance of enterprises	-
4. Performance of project management	2
E. IMPACT ON DEVELOPMENT	
1. Likelihood of achieving project objectives	2
2. Likelihood that benefits will be realised and sustained beyond the project investment phase	2
3. Likely contribution of the project towards increased institutional capacity	2
4. Current rate of return	-
F. OVERALL ASSESSMENT OF PROJECT	
1. At present	1.6
2. Trend over time	2

Code :

- 3 = Highly satisfactory, no problem
- 2 = Satisfactory: occasional problems, Bank should monitor
- 1 = Unsatisfactory: problems, Bank should monitor closely, but no immediate action required
- 0 = Highly unsatisfactory, serious problems: Bank action required

FISHERIES AND FISH FARMING SUB-SECTOR STUDY

PROJECT EVALUATION	
INDICATORS	RATING
	This Report
A. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION	
1 Compliance with conditions precedent to entry into force of loan agreement	3
2 Compliance with general condition	2
3 Compliance with other conditions	2
B. PROCUREMENT PERFORMANCE	
1. Procurement of consultancy services	3
2. Procurement of goods and works	2
C. FINANCIAL PERFORMANCE	
1. Availability of foreign exchange	2
2. Availability of local currency	2
3. Disbursement performance	2
4. Cost management/recovery	-
5. Performance of co-financiers (if need be)	-
D. ACTIVITIES AND WORKS	
1. Adherence to implementation schedule	1
2. Performance of consultants or technical assistants	1
3. Performance of enterprises	-
4. Performance of project management	1
E. IMPACT ON DEVELOPMENT	
1. Likelihood of achieving project objectives	2
2. Likelihood that benefits will be realised and sustained beyond the project investment phase	2
3. Likely contribution of the project towards increased institutional capacity	2
4. Current rate of return	
F. OVERALL ASSESSMENT OF PROJECT	
1. At present	1.9
2. Trend over time	2.0
<p>Code : 3 = Highly satisfactory, no problem 2 = Satisfactory: occasional problems, the Bank should monitor 1 = Unsatisfactory: problems, Bank should monitor closely, but no immediate action required 0 = Highly unsatisfactory, serious problems: Bank action required</p>	

EDUCATION PROJECT IV

PROJECT EVALUATION			
INDICATORS		RATING	
		Previous Report	This report
A.	<u>Project Status</u>		
	1. Compliance with loan conditions	2	2
	2. Compliance with loan agreement commitments	2	1
	3. Compliance with other conditions	2	2
B.	<u>Procurement Performance</u>		
	1. Procurement of Services	2	1
	2. Procurement of Goods	2	1
C.	<u>Financial Performance</u>		
	1. Availability of foreign exchange	3	2
	2. Availability of local currency	3	1
	3. Disbursement performance	2	1
	4. Cost management/recovery	N/A	N/A.
	5. Performance of co-financiers	N/A.	2
D.	<u>Activities and outputs</u>		
	1. Adherence to implementation schedule	2	2
	2. Performance of consultants or technical assistants	2	2
	3. Performance of enterprises	2	1
	4. Performance of project management	2	2
E.	<u>Impact on development</u>		
	1. Likelihood of achieving project objectives	3	2
	2. Likelihood that benefits will be realised and sustained beyond the project investment phase	3	3
	3. Likely contribution of the project towards increased institutional capacity	2	2
	4. Current rate of return	-	-
F.	<u>Overall evaluation</u>		
	1. At present	2.3	1.75
	2. Trend over time	3	2.5
<p>Code :</p> <p>3 : Highly satisfactory,</p> <p>2 : Satisfactory, no problem.</p> <p>1 : Unsatisfactory: problems, Bank should monitor closely, but no immediate action required</p> <p>0 : Serious problems: Bank action required.</p>			

PRIMARY HEALTH CARE STRENGTHENING PROJECT

PROJECT EVALUATION			
INDICATORS	RATING		
	Previous Report	This Report	
A	<u>Project Status</u>		
1.	Compliance with loan granting conditions	1	2
4.	Compliance with commitments made in the loan agreement	1	1
5.	Compliance with other conditions	2	1
B	<u>Procurement Performance</u>		
1.	Procurement of Services	1	1
2.	Procurement of Goods	2	1
C	<u>Financial Performance</u>		
1.	Availability of foreign exchange	3	2
2.	Availability of local currency	2	2
3.	Disbursement performance	2	2
6.	Cost management/recovery	N/A.	N/A.
7.	Performance of co-financiers	N/A	2
D	<u>Activities and outputs</u>		
1.	Adherence to implementation schedule	1	1
2.	Performance of consultants or technical assistants	2	2
3.	Performance of enterprises	1	1
4.	Performance of project management	2	2
5.	Project achievement	2	
E	<u>Impact on development</u>		
1.	Likelihood of achieving project objectives	2	2
2.	Likelihood that benefits will be realised and sustained beyond the project investment phase	2	1
	Likely contribution of the project towards increased institutional capacity	N/A	2
4.	Current rate of return	N/A.	N/A
F	<u>Overall evaluation</u>		
1.	At present	1.7	1.5
2.	Trend over time	2	2
Code :			
3	:	Very satisfactory.	
2	:	Satisfactory, no problem.	
1	:	Unsatisfactory: problems, Bank should monitor closely, but no immediate action required	
0	:	Serious problems: Bank action required.	

POVERTY REDUCTION AND ACTIONS IN FAVOUR OF WOMEN

PROJECT EVALUATION		RATING	
INDICATORS		Previous Report	This Report
A.	<u>Project Status</u>		
	1. Compliance with loan granting conditions	-	2
	2. Compliance with commitments in the loan agreement	-	2
	3. Compliance with other conditions	-	2
B.	<u>Procurement Performance</u>		
	1. Procurement of Services	-	2
	2. Procurement of goods	-	2
C.	<u>Financial Performance</u>		
	1. Availability of foreign exchange	-	2
	2. Availability of local currency	-	1
	3. Disbursement performance	-	1
	4. Cost management/recovery	-	1
	5. Performance of co-financiers	-	N.A
D.	<u>Activities and outputs</u>		
	1. Adherence to implementation schedule	-	2
	2. Performance of consultants or technical assistants	-	2
	3. Performance of enterprises	-	2
	4. Performance of project management	-	2
E.	<u>Impact on development</u>		
	1. Likelihood of achieving project objectives	3	2
	2. Likelihood that benefits will be realised and sustained beyond the project investment phase	3	2
	3. Likely contribution of the project towards increased institutional capacity	N.A	2
	4. Current rate of return	-	-
F.	<u>Overall evaluation</u>		
	1. At present	3	1.8
	2. Trend over time	3	2.0
Code :			
3	:	Very Satisfactory.	
2	:	Satisfactory, no problem.	
1	:	Unsatisfactory: problems, Bank should monitor closely but no immediate action required	
0	:	Serious problems: Bank action required.	

MASSAGUET-NGOURA (SECTION BISNEY-NGOURA) ROAD PROJECT

PROJECT EVALUATION	
INDICATORS	RATING
	This Report
A. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION	
1. Compliance with conditions precedent to entry into force of loan agreement	2
2. Compliance with general condition	2
3. Compliance with other conditions	N.A.
B. PROCUREMENT PERFORMANCE	
1. Procurement of consultancy services	1
2. Procurement of goods and works	1
C. FINANCIAL PERFORMANCE	
1. Availability of foreign exchange	1
2. Availability of local currency	1
3. Disbursement performance	1
4. Cost management	1
5. Performance of co-financiers (if need be)	1
	N.A.
D. ACTIVITIES AND WORKS	
1. Adherence to implementation schedule	
4. Performance of consultants and technical assistants	2
5. Performance of enterprises	
6. Performance of project management	N.A.
4. Project achievements	N.A.
E. IMPACT ON DEVELOPMENT	
1. Likelihood of achieving project objectives	N.A.
2. Likelihood that benefits will be realised and sustained beyond the project investment phase	N.A.
3. Likely contribution of the project towards increased institutional capacity	N.A.
4. Current rate of return	N.A.
F. OVERALL ASSESSMENT OF PROJECT	
1. At present	N.A.
2. Trend over time	N.A.
Code :	3 = Highly satisfactory
	2 = Satisfactory: occasional problems, Bank should monitor
	1 = Unsatisfactory: problems, Bank should monitor closely, but no immediate action required
	0 = Highly unsatisfactory, serious problems: Bank action required

CHAD: MATRIX OF COMMON PROBLEMS OF THE PORTFOLIO

Generic Problems	Mamdi Irrigation	Cotton and Food Crop Production	Lake Prefecture	Run-off Water Development	Fisheries and Fish Farming Study	Education IV	Strengthening Health Care	Women Poverty Reduction
1.Long delays in preparing and approval of the decree ratifying loan agreements.	x	x		x		x	x	x
2. Difficulties encountered by the administration and executing agencies to fulfil specific conditions.	x	x		x		x	x	x
3.Long delays in the award of contracts including difficulties in preparing the bidding documents and slow process for awarding and approving contracts.	x	x		x	x			
4.Non-compliance with Bank rules of procedure for procurement.	x	x		x				
5.Poor structural capacity (organisation and means) of the national private sector enterprises to implement contracts.	x	x		x		x		
6.Database on national suppliers inadequate.						x		
7 Shortage of qualified staff.			x					
8.Instability of project implementation staff.			x	x				x
9.Poor accounting and financial management.	x	x						x
10.Procedure for the recruitment of project managers counter to Bank rules (coordinator, accountant, other).								
11.Poor follow-up and management of contracts (consultants, entrepreneurs and suppliers).	x	x		x				
12. Inadequate monitoring of Bank recommendations.	x	x		x				
13.No activity reports produced; audit reports not systematic.	x	x	x	x	x	x		x
14. Government's financial commitments to mobilise counterpart funds in time not met although funds budgeted.	x	x	x	x				x
15. Halt in project implementation because of suspension of disbursement.	x							
16. Long delay on the part of the Bank to disburse project funds.	x	x	x			x	x	x

