

**AFRICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK
AFRICAN DEVELOPMENT FUND**



MAURITANIA

PORTFOLIO REVIEW REPORT

**COUNTRY DEPARTMENT
WEST REGION
DECEMBER 2004**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>List of Annexes and Tables; Acronyms and Abbreviations; Executive Summary</i>	<i>i-iii</i>
I. INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Objectives, Structure and Content	1
1.2 Portfolio Size and Composition	1
1.2.1 Portfolio Overview	1
1.2.2 Overview of Ongoing Operations.....	2
II. REVIEW OF ONGOING PROJECTS.....	3
2.1 Review of Ongoing Operations by Sector and by Project.....	3
2.1.1 Agriculture and Rural Development.....	3
2.1.2 Transport Sector.....	16
2.1.3 Public Utilities Sector – Water Sub-sector	20
2.1.4 Social Sector	23
2.1.5 Multisector	37
2.2 Ageing and Problem Projects.....	39
2.3 Assessment of Frequency and Quality of Supervision.....	40
2.4 Cross-cutting Themes.....	41
2.5 Overall Assessment of Portfolio Performance	42
2.6 Disbursements	44
III. ASSESSMENT OF PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION AND MANAGEMENT CAPACITIES	44
3.1 Performance of Government and Executing Agencies	44
3.2 Bank Performance	45
3.3 Cancellation of Loan and Grant Amounts.....	46
IV. COORDINATION WITH OTHER DONORS	46
4.1 Assessment of the Government’s Coordination Capacity.....	46
4.2 Assessment of Bank’s Coordination with other Donors	47
4.3 Assessment of Co-financiers	47
V. REPAYMENT OF LOANS AND CONTRIBUTION TO THE BANK’S CAPITAL	47
VI. PROACTIVE PORTFOLIO MANAGEMENT	48
6.1 Potential Problems and Recommended Solutions.....	48
6.2 Plan of Action.....	48
6.3 Lessons to be Learned for Future Portfolio Reviews and CSPs	48
VII. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	49
7.1 Conclusions	49
7.2 Recommendations	46

LIST OF ANNEXES

ANNEX 1	:	List of Completed or Cancelled Bank Group Operations
ANNEX 2	:	Portfolio of Ongoing Operations
ANNEX 3	:	Detailed Project Assessment
ANNEX 4	:	Summary of Assessment by Sector and by Project
ANNEX 5	:	General Matrix of Follow-up Measures
ANNEX 6	:	Matrix of Specific Measures
ANNEX 7	:	Matrix of Common Problems
ANNEX 8	:	Matrix of Cross-cutting Issues

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1:	Summary of total Bank operations in Mauritania
Table 2:	Summary of ongoing operations in Mauritania

This report was prepared following a mission to Mauritania from 21 February to 5 March 2004, by Mr. HM. CARIOU, Economist, OCCW. Any questions on this portfolio review report should be referred to Mr. MURANGO, Principal Economist, OCCW, Mr. A. ZEJLY, Division Manager, OCCW, or Mr. J.M. GHARBI, Director, OCCW.

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	:	African Development Bank
ADF	:	African Development Fund
ADFES	:	Arab Fund for Economic and Social Development
AFD	:	Agence française de développement
AMEXTIPE	:	Mauritanian Public Works Agency
BD	:	Bidding Documents
CAPEC	:	People’s Savings and Credit Fund
CCM	:	Central Tenders Commission
CDHLPI	:	Office of the Commissioner for Human Rights, Poverty Reduction and Social Integration
CIDA	:	Canadian International Development Agency
CSP	:	Country Strategy Paper
DEAR	:	Environment and Rural Development Directorate
DF	:	Finance Directorate
DGRH	:	Human Resources Management Directorate
DPE	:	Programming and Studies Directorate
EU	:	European Union
GDP	:	Gross Domestic Product
GTZ	:	German Agency for Technical Cooperation
IEC	:	Information, Education and Communication
IFAD	:	International Fund for Agricultural Development
MAED	:	Ministry of Economic Affairs and Development
MFI	:	Multilateral Financial Institution
MRO	:	Ouguiya (Country’s Currency Unit)
MTEF	:	Medium-term Expenditure Framework
OB	:	Outboard (Engine)
PAN	:	Autonomous Port of Nouadhibou
PIU	:	Project Implementation Unit
PK	:	Point kilométrique (kilometer marker)
PMFI	:	Partner Micro-finance Institutions
PRSP	:	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
SECF	:	Secretariat of State for Women ‘s Affairs
SME	:	Small and Medium Enterprises
SMI	:	Small and Medium Industries
SNIM	:	National Investment Mining Company
SONADER	:	National Rural Development Company
TAA	:	Technical Assistance Account
TAF	:	Technical Assistance Fund
UA	:	Unit of Account
UNPFA	:	United Nations Fund for Population Activities
WHO	:	World Health Organization

Executive Summary

1 Since 1972, when the African Development Bank carried out its first operation in Mauritania, up until end March 2004, the Bank Group has provided loans and grants worth a total of UA322.58 million, exclusive of cancellations, to finance 48 operations : 35 projects, 5 studies, 4 economic reform programmes, 2 loans under the Supplementary Financing Mechanism, and two lines of credit. Of this amount, UA96.25 million were in ADB funds (representing 29.8% of total commitments), UA215.05 million were from the ADF (66.7%), UA5.28 million from TAF resources (1.6%), and UA6.00 million from the NTF (1.9%).

2 The overall evaluation of the portfolio which consists of 11 active operations, is considered to be satisfactory with an average rating of 2.0. This overall performance represents a slight drop from 2001, when the rating at the end of the last evaluation was 2.2. It is due mainly to the performance criterion in respect of activities and outputs being ranked lower (1.6 in 2004 as against 2.1 in 2001) ; overall the performance under the other criteria remains stable or very slightly lower. It should also be borne in mind that the rating for overall performance has been affected by two operations (the Nouakchott DWS Project and the Rosso-Boghé Road Project), which were not yet effective at the time of the country review (March 2004), and which are experiencing difficulty in the start-up of activities. On the operations side, the most notable performance is in the agriculture and rural development sector and in the social sector, with an overall rating of 2.1; the weakest performance is in the public utilities sector (1.5) the result of delays in the start-up of the Nouakchott DWS Project. The most successful operations were the Poverty Reduction Project (2.8) and the Artisanal Fisheries Project II (2.7).

3. Efforts to improve the institutional and regulatory framework for operations implementation and management were pursued, in compliance with the recommendations of the Bank supervision missions and those contained in the report on the review of the post evaluation of the Bank's operations for the 2001-2002 period prepared by OPEV in 2004. Also, the Bank and the Mauritanian Administration are paying increasingly heightened attention to the lapses and shortcomings noted with regard to project preparation, contract award and implementation monitoring, as can be seen from the performance of the operations implemented since the 2001 portfolio review.

4. However, despite the efforts of both parties, this portfolio review reveals some remaining problems, particularly : i) shortcomings with regard to the physical monitoring and coordination of projects, which often causes slippages in the implementation of the activities ; ii) lack of familiarity with Bank procurement rules and the cumbersome contracting procedure; iii) failure to conduct audits of accounts, or delays and insufficient or failure to use the relevant reports; or indeed iv) non submission of status reports on project activities or delay in their submission.

5. The Bank will continue discussions with the government to study possibilities for joint action to improve portfolio quality and performance. Recommendations are made at the end of this review and these will be followed up during the next meetings with the Mauritanian authorities.

I. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Objectives, Structure and Content

1.1.1 This portfolio review is based on information gathered in the course of the portfolio review mission to Mauritania from 21 February to 5 March 2004, and on recent status or supervision reports on ongoing operations. The previous portfolio review report on Bank Group loans and grants in favour of Mauritania (ref.: ADB/BD/WP/2001/123 - ADF/BD/WP/2001/192) was approved by the Boards on 29 December 2001. This report reviews Bank operations in Mauritania, the status of ongoing projects, and the lessons to be drawn from the Bank's experience in the financing and monitoring of projects in the country. It also provides an overview of aid coordination in Mauritania and assesses the situation with regard to loan disbursements and repayments as at 30 November 2004. Lastly, the report makes recommendations for improving portfolio performance.

1.1.2 This report contains, in addition to this introduction, (I), a review of ongoing projects (II); an assessment of management and implementation capacities (III) ; aid coordination with donors (IV) ; repayments of loans and arrears (V); actions required to improve portfolio quality (VI) ; and conclusions and recommendations (VII).

1.2 Portfolio Size and Composition

1.2.1 *Portfolio overview*

1.2.1.1 The Bank's intervention in Mauritania covers 48 operations, comprising 35 projects, 5 studies, 4 economic reform programmes, 2 loans under the Supplementary Financing Mechanism, and 2 lines of credit. Of these 48 operations, 35 have been completed and 13, consisting of 12 projects and 1 line of credit, are ongoing. The total amount of loans and grants, net of cancellations, stands at UA32.58 million. Of this amount, financing from ADB resources stands at UA96.25 million (29.8% of total commitments), ADF financing is UA215.05 (66.7%), UA5.28 million (1.6%) was provided from TAF resources, and UA 6.00 million (1.9%) from FSN.

1.2.1.2 With regard to commitment by sector, industries and mines are the primary recipients of Bank assistance with 26.9% of net commitments. The social sector accounts for 16.9% of net commitments, multisector operations for 15.6%, agriculture for 15.4%, public utilities represents 15.1%, transport 7.0% and, lastly, the private sector accounts for 3.1%.

1.2.1.3 On the disbursement side, approximately UA276 million has been disbursed in total, representing a disbursement rate of 85.5%, a marked improvement from the disbursement level noted in the 2001 review (76%).

Table 1
Summary of Bank Group Operations in Mauritania as at 30 November 2004

UA Million

Sectors	No of Projects	Net Commitments					Sector Distribution (%)	Disburs. ^{ts}	Disburs. ^{ts} (%)
		ADB	ADF	TAF	NTF	Total			
Agriculture	11	-	48.26	1.54	-	49.80	15.4%	42.91	86.2%
Social	10	-	53.77	0.70	-	54.47	16.9%	41.58	76.3%
Transport	2	-	16.15	0.50	6.00	22.65	7.0%	8.03	35.4%
Industry & Mines	5	74.79	12.00	0	-	86.79	26.9%	85.55	98.6%
Public Utilities	11	14.84	32.26	1.50	-	48.60	15.1%	38.14	78.5%
Finance & Private* Sector	2	6.62	3.47	0	-	10.09	3.1%	10.09	100.0%
Multisector	7	-	49.13	1.05	-	50.18	15.6%	49.61	98.9%
TOTAL	48	96.25	215.05	5.28	6.00	322.58	100.0%	275.91	85.5%

1.2.2 Overview of ongoing operations

1.2.2.1 The active portfolio consists of 11 operations representing a total of UA67.65 million : UA59.36 million for ADF, UA2.29 million for TAF, and UA6.00 million for NTF. Portfolio distribution by sector is as follows : 40.7% for the social sector, 21.6% for transport, 21.3% for agriculture, 14.8% for the public utilities sector and 1.5% for multisector. It is pertinent to note that, among these operations, the Rosso-Bogu  Road Project (transport) which accounts for a significant part of the distribution by sector, and the Nouakchott Drinking Water Supply Project (public utilities) were not yet effective by the date of the portfolio review and have since reached start-up phase. As was noted in the 2001 review, the social sector accounts for most of the active Bank commitments.

1.2.2.2 The significant improvement in the portfolio disbursement rate should be noted : 35.8% in November 2004, compared to 26.0% during the 2001 review. As for the age of the active portfolio, the Bank noted 4 projects that were less than 3 years old, 5 projects between 3 and 5 years, and only 2 projects that were over 5 years¹ old.

¹ The Fisheries Support Project, approved in 1993 and the Poverty Reduction Project, approved in 1997, were ongoing when the review mission took place but were completed on 30 September 2004 and 30 June 2004 respectively.

Table 2
Summary of Ongoing Operations in Mauritania as at 30 November 2004

UA Million

Sectors	No of Projects	Net Commitments					Sector Distribution (%)	Disburs. ^{ts}	Disburs. ^{ts} (%)
		ADB	ADF	TAF	NTF	Total			
Agriculture	4	-	13.69	0.75	-	14.43	21.3%	8.12	56.2%
Social	4	-	27.55	-	-	27.55	40.7%	14.65	53.2%
Transport	1	-	8.12	0.50	6.00	14.62	21.6%	0.94	6.4%
Public Utilities	1	-	10.00	-	-	10.00	14.8%	0.00	0.0%
Multisector	1	-	-	1.05	-	1.05	1.5%	0.48	45.6%
TOTAL	11	0.00	59.36	2.29	6.00	67.65	100.0%	24.19	35.8%

II. REVIEW OF ONGOING PROJECTS

2.1 Review of Ongoing Operations by Sector and by Project

2.1.1 *Agriculture and Rural Development*

2.1.1.1 Status of the sector. The share of the primary sector in GDP was around 18.70 % for the 1998-2002 period, in almost constant decline for the past five years.² Livestock breeding represents 12.80 %, agriculture 5 %, and artisanal fishing less than 1 %. The country's production, which covers only 30 % of its needs, is made up mainly of local cereals, essentially millet and sorghum, rice, dates, vegetables and animal and fish products. The national market shows a poor spatial distribution of productions (the major resources are concentrated in the Senegal River valley); this is aggravated by poor yields and heavy dependence on food imports and aid. The Ministry of Rural Development and Environment (MDRE) has primary responsibility for implementing government policy on agricultural development and environmental protection. At institutional level, the Directorate of Policy, Monitoring and Evaluation of Public Investment (DPSE) monitors and evaluates public investments, analyses and disseminates rural statistics and information, and drives the implementation of land use reform through its Land Registry and Mapping Department.

2.1.1.2 From 1979 to date, 11 operations have been implemented in the sector, of which 10 projects and one study, for a grand total of UA49.80 million, net of cancellations, representing 15.1% of net commitments. Of these operations, 7 have now been completed at a total financing cost of UA 35.37 million. As at the preparation of the review, the Bank was also financing 4 other ongoing operations at a total cost of UA 14.43 million, representing 21.3% of the active loans and grants portfolio. The fisheries sector support project was completed on 30 September 2004.

2.1.1.3 Project implementation in the primary industry faced many challenges, essentially adverse weather, poor quality of the basic studies which led to cost overruns and extension of the implementation period of the projects; budgetary constraints which prevented the authorities

² According to the IMF, Mali's primary sector in 1998 accounted for 21.1% of GDP but was only 18.3% in 2002.

from making available the counterpart funds, and the lack of familiarity with Bank procurement procedures of the project executing agencies. The assessment of ongoing operations is presented below.

A.1 FISHERIES SECTOR SUPPORT (Completed on 30 September 2004)

A.1.1 *Basic administrative and financial data*

<u>Initial Loan Amount</u> : UA10.131 million <u>Cancelled Amount</u> : UA6.444 million <u>Net Loan Amount</u> : UA 3. 687 million	<u>Source</u> : ADF : UA3.687 million Gov : UA1.718 million	<u>Disbursed Amount</u> : UA3.655 million (99.1%) <u>Balance</u> : UA32 249 (0.9%)
<u>Approval Date</u> : 1st September 1993	<u>Signature Date</u> : 24 October 1993	<u>Effectiveness Date</u> : 14 July 1995
<u>Deadline for Final Disbursement</u> 30 September 2004 – PROJECT COMPLETED	<u>Executing Agency</u> : Project Implementation Unit at the Ministry of Fisheries and Maritime Economy	
<u>Date of Last Supervision</u> : August-September 2004	<u>Audit of Accounts</u> : 2001 and 2002 reports were submitted to the Bank. An auditor for 2003 and 2004 is being recruited (bid invitations issued). <u>Reports</u> : Regular reports were submitted to the Bank.	
<u>Objectives and Description</u> : The project aims to enable unloading of 25.000 tonnes/yr of fish catches through artisanal and semi-industrial production by establishing port facilities in the south of the country (Nouakchott region), improve quality of production, increase exports of fish products, improve industrial fishing, and promote job creation in the sector.		

A.1.2 *Compliance with Conditions*

2.1.1.4 The loan agreement became effective on 14 July 1995 and the project was completed on 30 September 2004. The assessment of its performance in respect of compliance with loan conditions has already been treated in the previous portfolio review (2001). As regards institutional monitoring, activity and audit reports were submitted to the Bank regularly. However, the project audits for 2003 and 2004 have not yet been conducted. Now that the project has been completed and the loan amount practically exhausted, the audits will be financed from the balance of the revolving fund in the project special account. Recruitment of an auditor had already begun by 30 November 2004, (the Bank has approved the BD and the IFB has been published). The result of the technical offers are to be submitted to the Bank in February 2005. The overall performance with respect to conformity with the loan conditions is considered satisfactory.

A.1.3 Procurement Performance

2.1.1.5 The project encountered some difficulties at start-up, mainly because the Project Implementation Unit was unfamiliar with Bank rules of procurement for goods and services. Also, a lack of rigor on the part of the departmental commissions handling the contract awards led to some disputes by the bidders. In addition, slippage on the conduct of studies was because the timeframes indicated in the BD specifications were wrongly assessed, and also because of the change in site of the fishing wharf, initially planned for Nouakchott. Following the recommendations made in the last portfolio review, those from the different Bank supervision missions which the Bank has since conducted, and the evaluation report on Bank assistance in the agriculture sector carried out by OPEV, considerable progress has been made as regards conformity with Bank rules of procedure and document processing times. The procurement performance is therefore rated as satisfactory.

A.1.4 Financial Performance

2.1.1.6 The initial cost of the project was UA11.85 million, of which UA10.13 million was from ADF funds and UA1.72 was in local (counterpart) funding from the national budget of Mauritania. The first studies conducted on the fishing wharf indicated a risk of erosion at the foot of the south groyne of the port, not far from the planned site of the proposed structure, which would have affected the firmness and durability of the infrastructure. In addition, apart from the serious silting on the northern end of the port, the studies indicated that vessels would be exposed to roughness that would exceed generally accepted levels. The component (B) relating to the construction of a fishing wharf in the initial zone was therefore abandoned and the initial loan was the subject of a partial cancellation of UA 6.444 million. The net loan amount after cancellation stood at UA3.687 million.

2.1.1.7 As at 30 September 2004, the project closing date, the ADF disbursed amount stood at UA3.655 million, representing a disbursement rate of 99.1%. The balance (UA32 249) has already been committed towards the remaining payment for services rendered by the consultant who prepared the environmental studies. Counterpart funds, amounting to MRO 247.8 million, about UA825, 552, were mobilized instead of the estimated UA1.718 million. The difference is in regard to the amount that had been earmarked for the fishing wharf component, which was abandoned. On the cost management side, there was a significant cost overrun on the construction of the pipeline linking the refinery to the Nouadhibou fishing wharf. Estimated at US\$1 million at appraisal, the cost was updated at US\$ 4 million in the engineering design. The change in the site of the fishing wharf also resulted in a considerable cost overrun. The Bank and the Borrower have thus decided to postpone implementation of this vital component till a later date. Lastly, no problems were encountered regarding the availability of foreign exchange and local currency. The project financial performance is therefore considered as satisfactory overall.

A.1.5 Performance of Activities and Outputs

2.1.1.8 At project closing, the three subcomponents of the project's Component (A) had been fully implemented: i) supply of fire-fighting materials and equipment to the Autonomous Port of Nouadhibou (PAN); ii) rehabilitation of the wastewater treatment plant; and iii) building of a 9 km. pipeline to link the SMIR depots to the PAN gas-oil distribution points for fishing vessels. The (B) component relating to the construction of a fishing wharf in Nouakchott was cancelled (§2.1.1.6) and converted into a preparatory study

on the future project to establish a development pole for artisanal and coastal fisheries at Tanit. The technical and environmental studies as well as the report on the preparation of the new project have already been conducted using funds for the project. Finally, with regard to the C component, (support to the PIU), the project has been provided with adequate staff to carry out its mission successfully. An ad hoc technical assistance was made available, in August 2000, to accompany the studies on the new Tanit project. The expert recruited carried out his action programme over the course of three missions, working in conjunction with the technical committee chosen by the Government to monitor the studies. The PIU now has serviceable vehicles and its computerized network is operational. It has also attained all its set programme objectives. However, the project duration was extended from 5 to 11 years because of the delay in project start-up, caused by lack of familiarity with Bank rules of procedure and by technical difficulties with the construction of the Nouakchott fishing wharf. These achievements notwithstanding, the abandonment of a vital project component has negatively affected performance on activities which is considered unsatisfactory.

A.1.6 Development Impact

2.1.1.9 The building of the pipeline, rehabilitation of the sanitation network and the port's treatment plan and the procurement of firefighting equipment have improved land-based services at the Nouadhibou port and contributed to the development of fishing activities. However, the fact that the proposed fishing wharf in the Nouakchott region has been abandoned vastly reduced its local development impact, particularly as regards the improvement of conditions for artisanal and semi-industrial fisheries in that region and increasing production of fresh fish for export. For that reason, the project performance in respect of development impact is considered to be unsatisfactory.

A.1.7 Overall Performance Assessment

2.1.1.10 The project recorded a considerable slippage on its initial schedule owing to several problems : i) delay in fulfillment of the loan conditions ; ii) wrong estimation of the cost of the components owing to the poor quality of the designs ; and iii) problems with the award for certain contracts. Also, cancellation of the ' fishing port' component significantly lessened project impact in the Nouakchott region and was to lead to serious cost overruns on the Tanit site. Despite these serious problems and since the last portfolio review, the Mauritanian authorities have taken note of different Bank recommendations in its various audit, OPEV and supervision reports. During the last supervision mission (August-September 2004), it was noted that there had been compliance with 6 of the 7 recommendations of the previous supervision mission (December 2003). The overall project performance was rated as fairly satisfactory.

Indicator	Loan Conditions	Procurement of Goods and Services	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Impact	Overall Assessment
Rating	2.2	2.0	2.0	1.5	1.5	1.8

2.1.1.11 Problems and Recommended Solutions: Since the project has been completed, the Bank suggests the following recommendations designed to ensure sustainability of the outcomes :

Recommendations	Deadline
Finalize and submit the project completion report to the Bank.	January 2005
Make necessary arrangements for a donors meeting with a view to mobilizing funding for the new Tanit project.	Continuous action

A.2 ARTISANAL FISHERIES DEVELOPMENT PROJECT (II)

A.2.1 *Basic administrative and financial data*

<u>ADF Loan Amount</u> : UA5.00 million	<u>Source</u> : ADF : UA 5.00 million	<u>Disbursed ADF Amount</u> : UA 2.41 million (48.2%)
<u>Cancelled Amount</u> : 0	OPEC : UA3.10 million Gov : UA0.92 million	<u>Balance</u> : UA2.59 million (51.8%)
<u>Approval Date</u> : 15 December 1999	<u>Signature Date</u> : 11 February 2000	<u>Effectiveness Date</u> : 20 November 2000
<u>Deadline for Final Disbursement</u> : 31 December 2006	<u>Executing Agency</u> : Project Management Unit at the Ministry of Fisheries and Maritime Economy	
<u>Date of Last Supervision</u> : August-September 2004	<u>Audit of Accounts</u> : 2001, 2002 and 2003 reports submitted to the Bank. The process of recruiting an external auditor is in progress.	
	<u>Reports</u> : Reports were regularly submitted to the Bank and in conformity with the accepted format.	
<u>Objectives and Description</u> : The project aims to train 1230 apprentice fishermen, retrain 675 deep sea fishermen, and train 500 women in post-catch fish processing and marketing techniques. It will increase fish production by 10,500 tonnes, encourage fishermen to settle on the sites chosen, and promote protection of the marine environment as well as the establishment of a credit fund for the trained fishermen and women. To do so, the project will : (i) rehabilitate the two existing training centres at Blawakh and PK 28 ; (ii) build a new training centre and establish a development pole at PK 144 ; and (iii) build a retraining centre and the project headquarters in Nouakchott.		

A.2.2 *Compliance with conditions*

2.1.1.12 The loan became effective in November 2000 and the previous portfolio review (2001) has already assessed the performance on compliance with conditions for loan effectiveness, which was rated as satisfactory. The project status reports have always been

submitted regularly to the Bank in conformity with the standard format. The accounts were audited regularly since project start-up in January 2001 and audit reports have been submitted to the Bank for the 2001, 2002 and 2003 financial years. The 2003 audit report is being studied by the Bank. The auditor's contract has now expired and the Bank has requested Management to take necessary action to recruit an auditor to carry out the financial audits for 2004. The overall performance with regard to compliance with loan conditions is therefore considered highly satisfactory.

A.2.3 Procurement Performance

2.1.1.13 Since February 2001, the PMU has prepared the bidding documents, and initiated national competitive bidding for the procurement of boats, fishing gear, outboard engines, vehicles, solar energy equipment and equipment for the surveillance of the South Coastline. All the BDs have been prepared in conformity with the Bank's standard model. The procurement performance is therefore considered highly satisfactory.

A.2.4 Financial Performance

2.1.1.14 As at 30 November 2004, ADF and OPEC loan amounts had been disbursed to the tune of UA2.41 et UA1.58 million respectively, making a disbursement of rate of 48.2% and 51%. The low commitment of ADF loan is due essentially to the delay in the start-up of the credit subcomponent, which accounts for 56.2% of the loan. A total of MRO 291 million (app. UA0.54 million) of the local currency resources has been disbursed, a disbursement rate of more than 58%. For this reason, the financial performance is considered to be highly satisfactory.

A.2.5 Performance of Activities and Outputs

2.1.1.15 The implementation status of the project activities is highly satisfactory. Indeed, with the exception of the credit component, which recorded significant slippage on its initial schedule, all the project components were carried out in a satisfactory manner. Under Component (A) relating to training and retraining of artisanal fishermen, the last supervision mission (August-September 2004) noted that since, starting up, the project has attained 46.5% of its initial objectives with regard to the training of artisanal fishermen, 52.2% for the retraining of sea fishermen, and 80 % for training for women. Also, the project has taken delivery of all equipment and machinery procured for the trainings as well as the vehicles and vessels meant for the training centres, and the specialized services involved in the project implementation; these are all operational on the different sites. The aim under the project's Component (B) is to establish a development pole at PK 144 with a view to providing the necessary conducive conditions for the fishermen to stay in the sites. Work has not yet begun because construction works on the access roads have rendered the site inaccessible. Implementation of the credit component (Component C) was delayed to enable a study to be conducted on micro-credit institutions since the institutions identified at appraisal to administer credit ran into financial difficulties. The project has since opted for the establishment of a Savings and Credit Mutual Fund for the development of artisanal fisheries (MECPA), and this has received approval from the Central Bank of Mauritania. The procedures manual is being finalized and will be submitted to the Bank for approval. The 'resource planning' subcomponent of Component (D) aimed to introduce scientific and resource management monitoring and fisheries surveillance. Scientific and resource management surveillance is carried out by the Mauritanian Oceanographic and Fisheries (IMROP) while fisheries surveillance is undertaken by the Delegation for Fisheries Surveillance and Control of the Sea

((DSPCM) on the basis of agreements. All the necessary equipment has been delivered. The action plans for 2001, 2002 et 2003 are being properly implemented in accordance with the provisions of the agreement and quarterly and annual reports as well as reports on the restitution of the workshops are regularly submitted to the project and to the ADB. Similarly, the ‘ environmental measures’ subcomponent of Component (D) aimed to establish a 23 ha plantation and build 2 wells. A total of 10ha have been planted and the 2 wells have been built. The overall project implementation rate is considered to be highly satisfactory.

A.2.6 Development Impact

2.1.1.16 The project consolidates the achievements of the first phase while bringing a global approach to the development of artisanal fisheries in Mauritania by targeting not only the training of vulnerable groups (youth, unemployed, sea fishermen, women from poor urban areas), but also by fostering a sustainable development perspective for this sector of activity. By establishing a training, retraining and micro-credit distribution system, the project will take into account the basic requirements of the poorest segments by facilitating their access to the modern economy. Consequently, its impact is rated as satisfactory.

A.2.7 Overall Performance Assessment

2.1.1.17 Project activities commenced in January 2001 and, with the exception of the credit component, all its components are proceeding satisfactorily. The project staff have been provided and have started work. The different trainings have reached an advanced stage relative to the initial objectives and are proceeding satisfactorily. Construction work has begun on all the sites. The overall project performance is considered as highly satisfactory.

Indicator	Loan Conditions	Procurement of Goods and Services	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Impact	Overall Assessment
Rating	2.7	2.5	2.8	2.8	2.7	2.7

2.1.1.18 Problems and Proposed Solutions :

Problems	Proposed Solutions	Schedule
Recruitment of an auditor for 2004 financial year	Take necessary measures to prepare the project's financial audit for 2004 and the request for proposals for the Bank's non-objection to the ADB.	January 2005

A.3 LIVESTOCK DEVELOPMENT AND RANGE MANAGEMENT PROJECT

A.3.1 *Basic administrative and financial data*

<u>ADF Loan Amount</u> : UA5.00 million <u>Cancelled Amount</u> : 0 <u>Net amount</u> : UA5.00 million	<u>Source</u> : ADF : UA5.00 million OPEC : UA2.55 million Gov. : UA1.75 million	<u>Disbursed ADF Amount</u> : UA1.30 million (26.1%) <u>Balance</u> : UA3.70 million (73.9%) <u>Disbursed OPEC Amount</u> : 0 <u>Balance</u> : UA2.55 million (100%)
<u>Approval date</u> : 4 April 2001	<u>Signature Date</u> : 15 June 2001	<u>Effectiveness Date</u> : 3 July 2001
<u>Deadline for Final Disbursement</u> : 31 December 2006	<u>Executing Agency</u> : Ministry of Rural Development and Environment	
<u>Date of Last Supervision</u> : August-September 2004	<u>Audit of Accounts</u> : 2001 to 2003 audits were submitted to the Bank. Recruitment of an auditor for 2004 finalized. <u>Reports</u> : Reports were regularly sent to the Bank and in conformity with the Bank format.	
<u>Reports</u> : The project's specific objective is to improve cattle production in Mauritania while boosting the income of herders by protecting and rehabilitating grazing areas and assisting the structures involved in the livestock sub-sector. In that regard, its contribution to the sectoral plan will be to : (i) guarantee food security, (ii) combat poverty and (iii) ensure sustainable development through the protection and conservation of natural resources. The main project activities are divided into 4 components: a) Protection and rehabilitation of rangeland ; b) livestock development ; and c) support to other intervention structures, and d) project management.		

A.3.2 *Compliance with conditions*

2.1.1.19 The ADF loan was approved in April 2001 and became effective in July 2001, three months after the loan approval. The ADF and OPEC loan conditions have all been complied with. In the area of institutional monitoring, activity reports have been submitted to the Bank with the necessary frequency and in conformity with standard Bank format. The audits for 2001 to 2003 financial years have been conducted and submitted to the Bank. The process of recruiting an auditor to carry out the 2004 audit was finalized during the 3rd quarter of 2004. The performance on compliance with the loan conditions is therefore considered satisfactory.

A.3.3 Procurement Performance

2.1.1.20 The PIU has prepared the bidding documents for the procurement of equipment and computers, office machinery and vehicles and has initiated the various studies envisaged under the project. However, during the last supervision mission (August-September 2004), the Bank noted that insufficient knowledge of its rules and procedures was a potential source of problems and that it could delay the implementation of activities. In fact, it identified two inconclusive and one problematic tender. The Project Implementation Unit also needs to ensure the quality of the bids which it intends to submit to the Bank. For this reason, the procurement performance is considered unsatisfactory.

A.3.4 Financial Performance

2.1.1.21 As at 30 November 2004, the amount of ADF loan disbursed was UA1.304 million, a disbursement rate of 26.1%. No disbursement was made from the OPEC loan which covers project activities which are still being prepared. In accordance with loan agreement, the Mauritanian government included an amount of 50 000 000 MRO in its 2004 budget, roughly UA144 893, for its counterpart funds. A first tranche totaling 22 000 000 MRO has been made available to the Treasury for the use of the project. The remaining balance is currently being drawn. Despite the delay noted, the project has experienced no problems with obtaining counterpart funding. For this reason, the financial performance is considered as more than satisfactory.

A.3.5 Performance of Activities and Outputs

2.1.1.22 There was a considerable slippage on project start-up. This was due to the difficulties that surrounded the establishment of the Project Implementation Unit and the fulfillment of the loan conditions. Under its Component (A) relating to ‘ Range protection and rehabilitation’, the project initiated the process of consultations, which led to the sites being chosen for the first 2 boreholes and for the planned 9 pastoral wells (20% of the total). The delay is due to the late procurement of logistical resources. Other sites will be identified after the joint commission at the end of 2004. A consulting firm was also commissioned to carry out the hydro-geological and geophysical studies and to prepare the BD for the first boreholes and wells. With regard to its pastoral regeneration and improvement objective, the project has so far enabled reforestation of 140ha, the establishment of pastoral reserves (1000 ha) and the training of nurserymen. Activities under Component (B) - Livestock Development- centred essentially on recruiting a consultant specialized in credit, identification of 16 sites for the construction of immunization posts, and constitution of a revolving fund for the procurement of veterinary inputs. Lastly, project activities under Component (C) pertained to the elaboration and implementation of agreements with the Livestock and Agriculture Directorate (DEA), the Directorate of Cooperation and Monitoring-Evaluation Policy (DPCSE), the Research, Training and Extension Directorate (DRFV). The participatory approach built into the project also necessitates prior awareness and training activities among beneficiaries and grassroots professional associations, and this resulted in project implementation delays. The performance with regard to project output is considered satisfactory.

A.3.6 Development Impact

2.1.1.23 This project constitutes a new phase in the continuing livestock development programme and is aimed at increasing the sector's productivity and efficacy through the protection and conservation of natural resources, while giving special consideration to the participatory approach which involves the beneficiaries in the management. Through its system for the training of herdsmen, capacity building for the ACPs and professional grassroots and credit-granting associations, the project is catering to the fundamental needs of the poorest segment by facilitating their access to the modern economic environment. The project performance with respect to development impact is considered satisfactory, based on the outputs as at 30 November 2004.

A.3.7 Overall Performance Assessment

2.1.1.24 The project became effective immediately but was slow to start up because of delays related to : the establishment of the Project Implementation Unit, the sensitization process, the participatory approach, the time it takes to obtain a response from the Bank, and ignorance of Bank procedures for procurement of goods and services. This delay can however be made up once the Bank's recommendations from the last supervision mission (August-September 2004) are complied with and its procedures adhered to. The Bank should also refer to the results of the post-evaluation of Bank Group operations, 2001-2002, and to the report prepared by OPEV in August 2004. Reviewing the performance of the Bank and the Borrower on operations in the agriculture and rural development sector, the report highlighted the need for a participatory approach, ' an essential factor for project success and sustainability'. It also notes that the Borrower can improve its performance by: a) making its executing agencies more effective in the areas of project supervision, surveillance and coordination ; and by b) releasing country counterpart funds in a timely manner to avoid disappointing outcomes and implementation delays. In order to improve the overall performance of this project, particular attention must be given to these aspects. The overall project performance as at now is considered satisfactory.

Indicator	Loan Conditions	Procurement of Goods and Services	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Impact	Overall Assessment
Rating	2.3	1.5	2.4	1.8	2.0	2.0

2.1.1.25 Problems and proposed solutions :

Problems	Proposed Solutions	Deadline
Lack of familiarity with Bank procurement rules	- Comply strictly with ADB procedures for procurement of goods and services.	Continuous action
	- Improve the quality of technical and financial bid evaluation reports.	Continuous action
Insufficient implementation oversight	Prepare activity reports showing quantities and percentage of implementation for each activity.	Continuous action
Delays in the implementation of activities	- For the Bank: Take all necessary measures to speed up the processing of documents for procurements of goods and services for the project.	Continuous action
	- For the project: anticipate all procurements under the project in order to cut down on the delays noted.	Continuous action

A4 SPECIAL FOOD SECURITY PROGRAMME – PILOT PROJECT**A.4.1 *Basic administrative and financial data***

<u>Grant Amount</u> : UA750 000	<u>Source</u> : ADF : UA750 000 Gov. : UA124 323 Others : UA218 767	<u>Disbursed ADF Amount</u> : UA747 841.75 (100%)
<u>Cancelled Amount</u> : UA2 158.25		<u>Balance</u> : 0
<u>Net Grant Amount</u> : UA747 841.75		
<u>Approval date</u> : 19 June 2000	<u>Signature Date</u> : 8 March 2001	<u>Effectiveness Date</u> : 29 March 2001
<u>Deadline for Final Disbursement</u> : 31 December 2004 – EXTENSION REQUIRED	<u>Executing Agency</u> : Ministry of Rural Development and Environment (MDRE)	
<u>Date of Last Supervision</u> : August-September 2004	<u>Audit of Accounts</u> : Nil <u>Reports</u> : Reports were submitted to the Bank with the expected frequency.	
<u>Reports</u> : The project's specific objective is to test methods and means of achieving a participatory rehabilitation of small irrigation schemes, and intensify and diversify agricultural production. The project will thus contribute, within the sectoral plan, to improving food security and the living conditions of rural dwellers by improving nutrition within its area of implementation. The project's main components are: (i) Strengthening the management capacities of the farmers associations; (ii) Rehabilitation of irrigation schemes; (iii) Intensification and diversification of production (iv) Project management.		

A.4.2 Compliance with conditions

2.1.1.26 The loan agreement became effective on 29 March 2001, less than a month after its signature. The conditions precedent to first disbursement made the provision of a grant and its disbursement contingent on evidence of the conclusion of a memorandum of understanding with FAO for the implementation of the project, and prior Bank approval of the covenants which MDRE is required to sign with UNCACEM and SONADER. The project coordination team was set up in December 2001, 18 months after loan approval. With regard to institutional monitoring and the general conditions, no audit report on the utilization of the grant resources and no project status report was submitted to the Bank. During the last supervision mission (August-September 2004), the Bank requested the Mauritanian authorities to take necessary action to submit these reports as rapidly as possible. Performance on compliance with loan conditions is therefore rated as fairly unsatisfactory.

A.4.3 Procurement Performance

2.1.1.27 FAO was given responsibility for project implementation. The Implementation Unit is part of the coordination of the Mauritania Integrated Irrigated Agriculture Development Programme (PDIAM), by virtue of which it receives support from the FAO representation. The considerable slippage on the initial procurement schedule was due to the delay in fulfilling the loan conditions, the difficulties inherent to the emplacement of the Implementation Unit and the Chinese technicians, and most particularly, by the burdensome FAO administrative procedures which extended the timelines considerably. On these issues, the last Bank supervision mission recommended that the Mauritanian authorities take necessary steps to reduce the length of time it takes to approve letters of agreement with the different service providers working on the project, and the time it takes for them to be paid by FAO. The procurement performance is therefore considered unsatisfactory.

A.4.4 Financial Performance

2.1.1.28 The grant was disbursed in full in one single tranche in favour of FAO. Foreign exchange and local currency are readily available.. The Government's contribution, estimated at UA124 323 is essentially for salaries and provision of premises. During the supervision missions the Bank underlined the contrast between disbursing the grant in one single payment and the difficulties experienced in the implementation of the works and the significant implementation delays that occur when funds are not readily available. In view of the above, the financial performance is considered satisfactory.

A.4.5 Performance of Project Activities and Outputs

2.1.1.29 The grant became effective in March 2001, but started-up only in March 2002, one year later. Since then, steps have been taken to draw up a work programme through national coordination, preliminary information and sensitization activities among the beneficiaries (15 training courses were organized for 240 beneficiaries, 80% of them women), organization and legalization of associations, ratification of framework-agreements with the project beneficiaries and partners (UNCACEM, SONADER) and procurement of logistical means (one 4x4 vehicle, 6 motorcycles) and equipment (2 micro-computers and office supplies.). The engineering designs for the 1st phase of the rehabilitation works (130 ha) have been approved and the contract has been awarded. Work started on 1 August 2004. Engineering designs for the 2nd phase (80 ha) were undertaken by the Consultant Engineer and the BD have been initiated for

the rehabilitation of the 80 ha. FAO must take urgent measures to advance implementation of the project. The performance on activities and outputs is considered as unsatisfactory.

A.4.6 Development Impact

2.1.1.30 The delay in effecting the work on the development of farming schemes and activities to intensify and diversify agricultural production will likely lessen the project development impact, in particular on the improvement of the income and condition of the beneficiaries (notably women in the irrigation schemes). Despite this problem which will need to be monitored closely, the project performance in respect of development impact is considered satisfactory.

A.4.7 Overall Performance Assessment

2.1.1.31 The start-up of the project activities in the field was extremely slow. In fact, the rehabilitation works have only just started and the line of credit for the beneficiaries is still not positioned. FAO and the Mauritanian authorities must take necessary measures to accelerate the pace of project implementation. This requires giving greater attention to the recommendations from the last Bank supervision mission and complying strictly with deadlines. Because of the late start-up of the project activities, it is necessary to extend the closing date by at least one year to 31 December 2005, to complete the remaining activities, which should now proceed without any problems. The overall project performance is considered satisfactory but a vigilant eye must be kept on the project adherence to the updated implementation schedule.

Indicator	Loan Conditions	Procurement of Goods and Services	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Impact	Overall Assessment
Rating	1.5	1.5	2.0	1.5	2.0	1.8

2.1.1.32 Problems and proposed actions :

Problems	Proposed Solutions	Deadline
Failure to submit activity reports and audit reports regularly to the Bank.	FAO should submit to the Bank as soon as possible the project financial audit for 2002 and 2003.	1st quarter 2005
Delays caused by FAO administrative procedures for procurement of goods and services.	FAO should act urgently to expedite project implementation.	Continuous action
Initial closing date is unrealistic considering the activities that still need to be implemented.	Submit a request to the Bank for an extension on the closing date of the grant for non-objection.	31 December 2004

2.1.2 Transport Sector

2.1.2.1 Status of the sector. The transport and communication sector accounted for around 9.6% between 1998 and 2002, in constant progression over the period.³ The Ministry of Infrastructure and Transport oversees implementation and coordination of all sector activities in the country. Mauritania in 1998 drew up a Transport Plan which seeks, on the one hand, to rationalize management of the sector and, on the other hand, to ensure its development through a more coherent programming encompassing all modes of transport. With this objective in mind, the authorities implemented a transport infrastructure development policy for the periods 1998-2002, then 2003-2007, to underpin and accompany economic and social development. The major investments in the transport and communication sector represent some 20 % of the public investments programmes implemented from 2002-2005, half of these on roads. A MTEF for transport infrastructure was also drawn up in 2002.

2.1.2.2 Major activities undertaken in the sector since 2003 have focused mainly on opening up the production areas internally and externally and strengthening the competitiveness of the economy. The most notable are in relation to : (i) continued construction works on the Nouakchott-Nouadhibou and Aioun-Niuro roads and start-up of Rosso-Boghé, Kiffa-Boumdeid and Tiguent-Nimjatt roads and the rehabilitation of the Maghta Lahjar-Diouk segment, (ii) enhancing the financial resources of the National Road Maintenance Company (2 billion Ouguiyas in 2003 and 2004), (iii) construction works by CDHLCPI to open up the interior (iv) completion of the feasibility studies on Nouakchott airport and beginning of construction works on Zouérate airport, and (v) conduct of several studies on port facilities.

2.1.2.3 The Bank has implemented two projects for a total amount, net of cancellations, of UA22.65 million, i.e.70% of net commitments. The Akjoust-Atar section of the Trans-Maghreb Highway, approved in 1996 for a net amount of UA8.03 million, was completed in 2001. The Bank is also financing the ongoing Rosso-Boghé Road project, for an amount of UA14.62 million: 6 million from NTF, representing 21.6% of active loans and grants. As the loan and grant agreement for this operation was not effective at the date of the review, its assessment is based on the reports of the supervision mission carried out in November-December 2004.

³ According to the IMF, in 1998, the transport sector accounted for 8% of GDP while in 2002 it represented 11.4%.

B.1 ROSSO-BOGHE ROAD PROJECT

B.1.1 *Basic administrative and financial data*

<u>ADF Loan and Grant Amount :</u> UA8.12 million <u>ADF Grant Amount :</u> UA0.50 million <u>Cancelled Amount :</u> 0	<u>Source :</u> ADF : UA8.62 million NTF : UA6.00 million E.U. : UA35.25 million OPEC : UA3.15 million Govt. : UA3.29 million	<u>Disbursed ADF Amount :</u> Loan: UA0 .576 million (7.1%) Grant : 0 <u>Disbursed NTF Amount :</u> UA0.362 million (6.0%) <u>Balance :</u> UA14.62 million (100%)
<u>Approval date :</u> 02 July 2003	<u>Signature Date:</u> 16 December 2003	<u>Effectiveness Date:</u> 08 March 2004
<u>Deadline for Final Disbursement :</u> 31 December 2007	<u>Executing Agency :</u> Public Works Directorate (DTP) / Ministry of Infrastructure and Transport (MET)	
<u>Date of Last Supervision :</u> November-December 2004	<u>Audit of Accounts :</u> An auditor is being recruited (Evaluation of technical and financial bids is being finalized by the PIU) <u>Reports :</u> The 1st status report (covering the 4th quarter of 2004) will be submitted to the Bank in January 2005.	
<u>Objectives and Description :</u> The project's objective is to help to open up and develop the right bank of the Senegal River. There are four main project components : A.) Road construction, including road works and development related to the construction of a 211.5 km highway ; works monitoring and supervision, and public sensitization on health, road safety, environmental protection, land issues and micro-finance ; B) project management, including project financial audit, and monitoring of its socio-economic impact.		

B.1.2 *Loan Conditions*

2.1.2.4 The loan agreement became effective on 8 March 2004, less than 3 months after the signature date and the conditions for 1st disbursement were fulfilled on 15 September 2004. The only other condition that was not complied with concerned the management of the weighbridges. The Bank requested, in that regard, that the MET should entrust the management of the weighbridges to the Road Management Agency. The Order to this effect was never promulgated. As regards institutional monitoring, the Project Coordinator was to have prepared a work programme for 2005 as well as the 1st project status report for the 4th quarter of 2004. The format for the report was discussed during the December 2004 supervision mission. With respect to the financial audit, the Bank has given its non-objection on the results of the technical bid and the only bid received and has made observations on the evaluation of the financial bid.

These will need to be taken into account and the final results of the overall assessment submitted to the Bank for non-objection. The performance with regard to the loan conditions is considered satisfactory.

B.1.3 Procurement Performance

2.1.2.5 On the whole, the project complies with the Bank's rules of procedure. An auditor is being recruited to carry out the audit of the project's accounts. An NGO association was selected following bidding organized by the government (this sub-component is wholly financed by the Mauritanian Administration). The mission made observations on the draft contract submitted for information and these were reflected when the contract was being finalized prior to its signature. Conversely, however, the procurement of goods and works, the documents for the national bidding for rehabilitation/reconstruction works on the schools at Legatt and Dar el Barka, and the borehole repairs must be reviewed completely and submitted afresh to the Bank for non-objection. The overall procurement performance is unsatisfactory.

B.1.4 Financial Performance

2.1.2.6 As at 30 November 2004, the amount of ADF loan disbursements stood at UA0.576 million, i.e. a disbursement rate of 7.1%. These are in respect of payments made as a start-up advance to the contractor.

2.1.2.7 On the cost management side, during the processing of the technical dossier by the audit mission (MDC), discrepancies were noted between some of the quantities mentioned in the technical study and in the bill of quantities (under-estimation of quantities under certain headings, particularly in respect of earthworks – stripping, cuts, etc). Administration and the MDC should work together to find ways of curtailing quantity overruns, which reflect on costs. In addition, it appears that the financing expected from the European Union is no longer available. The Government therefore needs to explore other avenues for obtaining donor funds as quickly as possible. The overall performance in this area is unsatisfactory.

B.1.5 Performance on Activities and Outputs

2.1.2.8 At the date of the supervision mission, (November-December 2004), the project's physical implementation rate was estimated at 15%. The services were already behind schedule due to the late payment of start-up advances, itself caused by the delay in fulfilling the condition for first disbursement relating to the compensation for expropriations. The Bank also noted insufficient monitoring reflected in the unexplained delays in processing the documents. The contract for works monitoring, notified to the consultant in May 2004, did not reach the Bank until November 2004. Furthermore, the contract for awareness activities and for monitoring-evaluation of the project's socio-economic impact has not yet been finalized even though the NGO association was declared the successful contractor over four months previously. Yet, these were services that should have begun before works start-up. Road construction works (earthworks on the first 20 kilometres) effectively started up on 9 September 2004 although the contract had been awarded since 3 May 2004. Also, job site installation (domestic site) is not yet complete. Lastly, the job specification that should have been provided 45 days after notification of the contract would eventually be available only on 15 January 2005. The performance in this area is considered unsatisfactory and close Bank monitoring of the problems noted is required.

B.1.6 Development Impact

2.1.2.9 The project is certain to have significant development impact. The construction of the Rosso-Boghé road is expected to open up access to the communities situated in its path and improve their living conditions, reduce the cost of transporting food products, increase the comfort and safety of passengers, and lastly, establish permanent road links between the two towns. The actual project impact is difficult to measure in light of its low implementation rate. (15%). The performance with regard to the development impact will be considered as ‘theoretically’ satisfactory.

B.1.7 Overall Performance

2.1.2.10 The loan agreement was not yet effective at the date of the previous portfolio review (February-March 2004). During the 1st Bank supervision mission (November-December 2004), the project was only at the start-up phase: coordination was not yet operational, the support staff (secretary, driver, etc..) was not yet in place and the rented premises had not yet been equipped. Implementation of activities was expected to be completed on 31 October 2006; the contractor felt that this completion date was still feasible in spite of the four-month start-up delay. The recommendations made by the Bank during its supervision mission should, however, make it possible to make up this delay. The problems noted in the technical studies and in the contract estimates under the BD point to defective project monitoring by the Administration, as confirmed by the conclusions of the post-evaluation mission undertaken by OPE in October 2004. This insufficient monitoring is itself the result of the weak capacity of the coordinator and/or the fact that he was juggling many responsibilities, which left him with too little time to devote to the project (the officer in question has just been promoted as Deputy Director of Public Works). It follows that the overall project is rated as unsatisfactory.

Indicator	Loan Conditions	Procurement of Goods and Services	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Impact	Overall Assessment
Rating	2.3	1.5	1.4	1.0	2.0	1.6

2.1.2.11 Problems and proposed solutions:

Problems	Proposed Solutions	Schedule
Disparities between the estimates in the works contract and those of the technical study	- The Administration should monitor the overruns on quantities for certain earthworks pending availability of the complete working drawings. - The Bank should field a mission if necessary.	1st quarter 2005
EU financing not available for the works delegated to it.	Seek financing from other donors for the rehabilitation of the Nouakchott-Rosso road section.	Continuous action
Insufficient involvement of Administration in project monitoring	- Centralize coordination by combining the responsibilities of the coordinator, who should be available exclusively for the project. - Timely preparation of project monitoring documents (BD, Status reports, annual work programme, etc.).	Continuous action

Slippage on implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Organize a fresh bid for the reconstruction of schools and rehabilitation of boreholes. - Finalize and sign the contract with the NGO association for awareness activities and the socio-economic impact assessment among the surrounding communities. 	1st quarter 2005
----------------------------	---	------------------

2.1.3 Public Utilities Sector – Water Sub-Sector

2.1.3.1 Status of the sector. The Ministry of Water Resources and Energy is charged with implementing a policy that seeks to achieve better mainstreaming of the water sector into economic and social development. The Water Directorate is under the responsibility of the Ministry of Water Resources and Energy which also has responsibility for SONELEC (urban water and electricity distribution) and OMVS (Organisation for the Development of the Senegal River Basin). The duties of the DH are in the area of conducting hydro-geological studies, mobilization of resources, as well as project supervision; the DH is responsible for the drilling of wells and boreholes. It is also responsible for water distribution networks in the secondary centres that are not served by SONELEC.

2.1.3.2 The water sector is one of the priority areas of the Strategic Poverty Reduction Framework. The adoption of a sectoral MTEF has strengthened planning in this field, as has the preparation of two regional investment plans for Brakna et Hodh Echargui wilayas. Also, the water delivery rate, in terms of the number of individual connections for every 1,000 inhabitants, has risen from 34.6% in 2001 to 36.1% in 2003. Expanded access has been made possible through : (i) the financing secured for the Aftout Es Saheli project, (ii) improved evaluation of water resources, particularly in the Dhar at Hodh Echargui and the Boulenouar waterwell, (iii) completion of 96 % of the DWS to the city of Kiffa, (iv) commencement of activities to strengthen DWS to several cities (Nouakchott, Nouadhibou, Rosso, Nema and Atar), (v) launching of preparatory activities on the rehabilitation of the Nouakchott network, , (vi) better maintenance of the thermal dewatering systems by the National Drinking Water and Sanitation Agency, and (vii) upgrading of drinking water infrastructure in five isolated areas (Tichitt, Rachid, Bir Moghreïn, Oualata and Tamchekett).

2.1.3.3 The Bank, at its own level has, from 1972 to date, implemented 11 operations in this sector, of which 9 Projects and 2 studies, for an overall amount, net of cancellations, of UA 48.60 million, representing 15.1% of net commitments. 10 of these operations have now been completed for financing amounting to UA 38.60 million. The Bank is also financing the ongoing Nouakchott Drinking Water Supply Project for the amount of UA 10 million, 14.8% of the active loan and grant portfolio. Assessment of the operation which was not yet effective at the date of the review was based on the earliest findings of the (ongoing) supervision mission.

C.1 NOUAKCHOTT DRINKING WATER SUPPLY PROJECT

C.1.1 *Basic administrative and financial data*

<u>ADF Loan Amount:</u> UA10 million	<u>Source :</u> ADF : UA10.00 million AFESD: UA70.35 million Gov. : UA24.37 million Others : UA51.06 million	<u>Disbursed ADF Amount :</u> 0
<u>Cancelled Amount :</u> 0		<u>Balance :</u> UA10 million (100%)
<u>Approval date :</u> 24 September 2003	<u>Signature Date:</u> 16 December 2003	<u>Effectiveness Date :</u> 08 March 2004
<u>Deadline for Final Disbursement :</u> 31 December 2009	<u>Executing Agency :</u> Water Corporation (SNDE)	
<u>Date of Last Supervision :</u> December 2004	<u>Audit of Accounts :</u> NA <u>Reports :</u> NA	
<u>Description of objectives :</u> The sector goal is to improve drinking water access and help to enhance the living conditions of the population and reduce poverty by providing easy access to drinking water. The specific objective is to increase coverage of drinking water delivery to residents of Nouakchott by increasing the daily production of drinking water from the current 36,000 m ³ /d to 170,000 m ³ /d by 2020, and up to 226,000 m ³ /d in 2030. The main project components are : A) Waterworks at Aftout, Béni Nadji and Nouakchott ; B) Aqueducts from Béni Nadji to Nouakchott ; C) Distribution network and well fields at Idini ; D) Institutional support ; et E) Works monitoring and supervision.		

C.1.2 *Loan Conditions*

2.1.3.4 The loan agreement was not effective at the date of the review. It came into effect on 8 March 2004, 3 months after the signature date. The status with regard to the fulfillment of conditions precedent to first disbursement during the last supervision was as follows : i) : the Memorandum establishing the Project Implementation Unit (UGPA) has been signed since March 2004 by the appropriate authority, represented by the Director-General of the SNDE in his capacity as the Executing Agency and project owner appointed by the Minister of Water Resources and Energy ; ii) : the appointment of the Director of UPGA and his senior management staff was done in March and September 2004 respectively, by the SNDE ; iii) : the Order establishing the Special Procurement Commission and defining its composition and functions was signed by the competent authority in January 2004 ; iv) : the Order establishing and defining the composition and functions of the Project Consultation Committee was signed by the competent authority in December 2004 ; v) : the Budget Act including the amounts for payment of compensations to communities in the path of the pipeline earmarked under the project was adopted by the National Assembly in 2004. A written commitment to this effect, signed by the Minister of Finance, is being prepared. Pending the formal compliance with this last condition, the Bank has requested the Executing

Agency to take on the following operations to help achieve the rapid and effective start-up of the project: i) prepare the invitations to bid for the different project bid packages (works, goods and services); ii) publish the bid invitations; and iii) award and sign the contracts. Notification of the commencement of the different activities was dependent on the satisfaction in full of the conditions precedent to first disbursement. This is expected to be released no later than by 31 January 2005. Out of the five other conditions, compliance has been achieved in respect of the only one that needed to be fulfilled before 31 December 2004 and which concerned the adoption of a Water Code (the deadline for the remaining four is 31 December 2005). The performance in respect of compliance with loan conditions is considered satisfactory despite the slippage on fulfillment of the conditions for 1st disbursement.

C.1.3 Procurement Performance

2.1.3.5 At the date of the review, the loan agreement was not yet effective. As at 30 November 2004, due to a one year slippage on project start-up, the activities have still not begun and no procurement has been effected. An assessment of procurement performance is therefore not possible at this stage. The last supervision mission however took necessary measures as regards the procedures and schedule of procurements for the works, goods and services to enable work to start quickly on the different project components to allow the disbursements to be released.

C.1.4 Financial Performance

2.1.3.6 ADF financing amounts to UA10 million and will cover the entire foreign exchange component to be used for: (i) works on drinking water conveyance and the 5000 m³ reservoir (Component E), (ii) conduct of a study on DWS for rural communities located along the Aftout aqueduct (Component F), (iii) provision of computers and sundry equipment and tools for the SNDE to enable it respond to any urgent equipment needs; (iv) payment for the services of a consultant environmentalist under the technical assistance component of the project (Component F) and (v) financing the project audit (Component G). The Government counterpart funds for a total of UA 24.37 million for the entire project, and UA3 million for the ADF components, will be in the form of cofinancing of each of the project components. The loan is expected to be disbursed over a maximum period of forty-five months from the date of first disbursement. However, as at 30 November 2004, the project had not started up and no disbursement had been released. It is therefore not possible to assess the performance in this area at this stage.

C.1.5 Performance on Activities and Outputs

2.1.3.7 The implementation schedule established at appraisal had set the start-up of project for 2004. The physical works implementation was planned to begin at end-2004 with the first works completed as from March 2006 (water tower reservoir). In the present context, and despite a one year delay on the initial programme, the Bank believes that it should still be possible to complete the works by the same date, if no delays occur in the preparatory procedures. The entire lot under ADF funding could then be completed in December 2008, the date originally established for works completion, and the last disbursement would be released in December 2009. The project clearly no longer has any margin of flexibility as regards its timetable and there must be strict adherence to the schedule updated during the supervision mission. The performance, at this stage, is considered unsatisfactory.

C.1.6 Development Impact

2.1.3.8 The project should have significant development impact. The project for the supply of drinking water to the city of Nouakchott is consistent with the country 's poverty reduction strategy and that of the Water Initiative . Its objective is to provide the capital with a sustainable supply of drinking water drawn from the Senegal River. The project will help to improve the capacity of the city of Nouakchott to face up to any breakdown in the present production system. In particular, it will prevent overtapping of the Trarz water well thus helping to protect a rare resource. When completed, the project will increase the daily production of water by an additional 64,000 m³ in 2005, 99,000 m³ in 2010, 170,000 m³ in 2010 and 226,000 m³ in 2030. The connection rate in the city of Nouakchott will be increased from 35 to 80%. The project has not yet started up and its actual development impact can thus not be measured at this stage.

C.1.7 Overall Performance

2.1.3.9 At 30 November 2004, the project had not started up and no funds had been disbursed. In collaboration with the PIU, the December 2004 project supervision mission carried out prepared an updated timetable for every planned activity to enable work to begin by the initial date fixed, notwithstanding the slippage of one year since the Bank approved the project. Close monitoring and extreme vigilance by the Bank is of the essence to ensure adherence to the new timetable. The overall performance at this stage is considered unsatisfactory.

Indicator	Loan Conditions	Procurement of Goods and Services	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Impact	Overall Assessment
Rating	2.0	-	-	1.0	-	1.5

2.1.3.10 Problems and proposed actions :

Problems	Proposed Solutions	Timeframe
Slippage on the effective start-up of activities	- Fulfill the last condition for first disbursement and issue bid invitations to enable activities commence without delay.	January 2005

2.1.4 Social Sector

2.1.4.1 Status of the sector. The Ministry of Health and Social Affairs has principal responsibility for implementing government policy as it relates to the development of social policies. The priority status of the social sector led to the adoption of a sectoral MTEF. An assessment of Bank Group assistance in the social sector (OPEV/ADB, August 2004) indicates that 46.3% of the Mauritanian population were living below the poverty line in 2000, and that the incidence of poverty in the rural area was 61.2% as against 25.4% in the urban area. Massive efforts have been made in the fields of human resource development and extension of basic services. In the education sector, the implementation of the priority plan under the PRSP necessitated increasingly higher spending, raising the sector's share of GDP from 4.5% of GDP in 2000 to 5.9% in 2003. The sustained pace of investments and the measures taken to improve the education system increased the gross enrolment ratio from 88% in 2000 to 91% in 2003. The

major steps taken were to develop infrastructure and expand access and improve quality through continuing education for teachers. This significantly raised the number of teachers in basic schools (+9.3 between 2002 and 2003) and was accompanied by a slight progression in the rate of school completions, and in the number of girls who remained and enrolled in school. The efforts made in the health sector doubled the health spending which grew as a percentage of GDP from 1.6% to 3.4% in 2003. Other activities relating to the Health Support Master Plan 1998 - 2003 increased the intake capacity by building more health facilities and equipping them, by ensuring better supply of drugs, continued immunization programmes and providing staff training. Consequently, the rate of DTC3 immunization increased from 70% in 2002 to 75% in 2003 and health coverage within a 5km radius improved to 75%. The objectives for 2010 are to reduce infant mortality from 87 to 60 per 1000, infant and child mortality from 135 to 103 per 1000 and maternal mortality from 747 to 500 per 100 000. Drinking water delivery, in terms of mains connection per 1000 inhabitants increased from 34.6% in 2001 to 36.1% in 2003. Efforts to implement the CSLP saw more measures being taken to entrench growth within the sphere of the poor through: ii) implementation of the emergency plan to limit the impact of drought on the poor and on grazing land; ii) consolidation and extension of programmes to reduce poverty, including those in Aftout South and Karakoro which constitute the largest pockets of poverty in the country, and the vast urban development programme in the areas around Nouakchott; and iii) development of micro-finance with an over 55% increase in the volume of credit distributed by microfinance institutions (MFI) and adoption of microfinance development strategy.

2.1.4.2 From 1976 to date, 10 operations, comprising 2 studies and 8 projects have been implemented in the sector, for a total amount, net of cancellations, of UA 54.47 million, i.e. 16.9% of net commitments. Six of these operations have been completed and represent a financing of UA 26.92 million. The Bank is also financing four ongoing operations, for an amount of UA 27.55 million, representing 40.7% of active loans and grants.

2.1.4.3 Ongoing operations in the social sector are focused on health education but comprise, in addition, a specific operation on poverty reduction. The status and performance of these activities are summed up below.

D.1 POVERTY REDUCTION PROJECT (Completed as at 30 June 2004)

D.1.1 Basic administrative and financial data

<u>Loan Amount</u> : UA3.23 million	<u>Sources</u> : ADF : UA3.23 million CIDA : UA0.52 million IDA : UA0.19 million Gov. : UA0.55 million	<u>Disbursed Amount</u> : UA3.22 million (99.6%)
<u>Cancelled Amount</u> : 0		<u>Balance</u> : UA0.01 million (0.4%)
<u>Approval date</u> : 5 November 1997	<u>Signature Date</u> : 18 November 1997	<u>Effectiveness Date</u> : 8 October 1998
<u>Deadline for Final Disbursement</u> : 30 June 2004 – PROJECT COMPLETED	<u>Executing Agency</u> : Commission for Human Rights, Poverty Reduction and Integration	

<u>Date of Last Supervision :</u> July 2003	<u>Audit of Accounts :</u> Audits of 1999 to 2003 accounts were conducted and the audit reports were submitted to the Bank. <u>Reports :</u> Regular progress reports were submitted.
<u>Objective and Description:</u> the objective of the project is to help to reduce poverty by building the capacities of poor households and informal sector operators, in particular women, to start up and develop income-generating activities. To that end, the project was designed around the following activities: credit, training, IEC, functional literacy education and the establishment of People's Savings and Credit Funds (sensitization, physical and institutional establishment of CAPEC).	

D.1.2 Loan Conditions

2.1.4.4 The loan agreement became effective on 8 October 1998. The project closed on 30 June 2004. The previous portfolio review (2001) had already rated the performance with regard to compliance with the loan conditions. Two 'other conditions' concerning the adoption of a National Micro-Finance Promotion Strategy and a National Micro-Enterprise Promotion Strategy had, however, remained unfulfilled. Compliance was achieved in July 2003. The performance in this area is therefore considered highly satisfactory. Status reports were regularly submitted to the Bank, and were in conformity with the standard format. Audits were conducted for the 1999 to 2003 financial years and the audit reports forwarded to the Bank. The Bank is partially responsible for the delay in the conduct of the audits these past few years (2001 to 2003), the documents relating to the recruitment of an audit firm having been misplaced during its relocation; project monitoring was also discontinued despite several representations from the Project Implementation Unit

D.1.3 Procurement Performance

2.1.4.5 The Project Implementation Unit coordinated and supervised the procurement of goods, works and services right from project start-up. Contrary to the observations made in the previous review, no breaches of Bank procurement rules and procedures were found during the 2004 portfolio review. The performance in this respect is therefore considered more than satisfactory.

D.1.4 Financial Performance

2.1.4.6 At project closing, the total amount disbursed under the ADF window stood at UA 3.22 million, representing a 99.6% disbursement rate and constituting a sharp increase from the 36.3% rate in 2001. The Government disbursed a total of 417.42 million Ouguiyas in counterpart funds, a disbursement rate of more than 200% caused by the fact that certain activities that were not initially planned by the authorities, were included in the project. A request for cancellation of the balance (13 414 UA) is under consideration by the Bank and will be the subject of discussion with the authorities during the project completion mission scheduled for January 2005. The performance in this respect is therefore highly satisfactory.

D.1.5 Performance of Activities and Outputs

2.1.4.7 Activities have proceeded smoothly since the 2001 portfolio review. The project has been completed since 30 June 2004. The project's overall physical implementation at closing was estimated at over 100%, its outcomes having, for the most part, exceeded the objectives set at appraisal. Under the credit component, 20,751 loans were granted, 4,809 of them from ADF resources, for a total amount of UA 8.5 million. Women received over 60% of the loans, which were disbursed through the intermediary of 37 institutions. The average recovery rate of these MFIs is 93%. The capacities of the target groups were strengthened as 3,859 clients of the MFIs were taught to read and write. However, the objective of providing management training for more than 75% of the clients of these MFIs was not realized for several reasons : (i) the trainers within the MFIs who had been trained for the purpose of passing that training on to their clients failed to honour their commitments and (ii) in place of management training, illiterate clients were given training in different professions. On the component relating to support for the development of CAPEC, only 7 out of the targeted 21 were established and received assistance from the project. Their members number more than 32,000 with total combined savings of over UA 4 million and UA2.2 million in credits outstanding. The performance in respect of activities and outputs is considered highly satisfactory.

D.1.6 Development Impact

2.1.4.8 The project's development impact is evident in the enthusiasm of the people for savings and credit (**interest in and participation of managers in training courses**) which is a marked departure from the mentality of the Mauritians, and in the growth of micro-finance which it has brought about (the number of MFI established). The performance with regard to the development impact is therefore considered as highly satisfactory and the Bank will lend support a second phase as early as 2005.

D.1.7 Overall Performance Assessment

2.1.4.9 Apart from the delay in starting up, and the slippage on the conduct of the audits, (partly as a result of lack of Bank monitoring) project implementation is satisfactory and in accordance with the Bank's rules and requirements. The project has enormous development impact, and the Bank is planning to implement a second project phase devoted specifically to micro-credit (the appraisal mission will take place in January 2005). The overall performance is considered to highly satisfactory.

Indicator	Compliance with conditions	Procurement Performance	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Impact	Overall evaluation
Rating	2.7	2.5	2.8	2.7	3.0	2.8

2.1.4.10 Problems and proposed actions :

Problems	Proposed Solutions	Deadline
The financial statements of the micro-finance institutions involved in the project have never been audited due to financial constraints	Mobilize the funds needed to carry out the audit of the financial statements of the MFI, no later than 31 December 2004. The Government has again been contacted in this respect but no reply has been forthcoming. This issue will be discussed during the project completion mission, scheduled for January 2005.	January 2005
Balance for cancellation	The Bank is currently considering a request for cancellation of the balance (UA13,414) It will be discussed during the project completion mission scheduled for January 2005.	January 2005

D.2 SUPPORT PROGRAMME TO THE HEALTH AND SOCIAL AFFAIRS MASTER PLAN (PAPDSAS)

D.2.1 Basic administrative and financial data

<u>Loan Amount</u> : UA10.11 million	<u>Sources</u> : ADF : UA10.11 million	<u>Disbursed Amount</u> : UA7.03 million (69.6%)
<u>Cancelled Amount</u> : 0	Gov. : UA1.14 million	<u>Balance</u> : UA3.08 million (30.4%)
<u>Approval date</u> : 17 March 1999	<u>Signature Date</u> : 20 April 1999	<u>Effectiveness Date</u> : 2 May 2000
<u>Deadline for Final Disbursement</u> : 31 December 2004	<u>Executing Agency</u> : Investments Management Directorate (DGI) / Ministry of Health and Social Affairs (MSAS)	
<u>Date of Last Supervision</u> : Oct.-Nov. 2004	<u>Audit of Accounts</u> : 2000, 2001 and 2002 accounts were audited; Audit of 2003 et 2004 accounts began in December 2004. <u>Reports</u> : Very few activity reports, not prepared in accordance with the required frequency, and poorly documented. 4 reports in total were submitted, the last covering the period June 2003 – March 2004.	
<u>Objectives and Description</u> : The programmer's objective is to improve the social well-being and health of the population by improving the delivery of and access to quality health care, improving efficiency and financing of the sector, strengthening efforts to combat malaria, promoting social welfare activities and improving the health environment.		

D.2.2 *Loan Conditions*

2.1.4.11 The loan agreement having become effective on 2 May 2000, the previous portfolio review (2001) has already assessed the performance in respect of compliance with loan conditions, which was considered satisfactory. Very few activity reports were submitted (since its start-up, the project has prepared four reports, the last one for the period June 2003 - March 2004), and these were poorly documented and not submitted with the required frequency. The financial audit reports and the project audits were conducted for 2000, 2001 and 2002. The Bank's observations were taken into account by the DGI. The auditor for 2003 and 2004 has been selected and is expected to start work as from December 2004.

D.2.3 *Procurement Performance*

2.1.4.12 Right from the start-up of activities, the Bank noted certain difficulties in the award and supervision of contracts (review of the dossier on the recruitment of a firm to oversee construction works on the 33 health posts, objection on the bid evaluation report for the construction of these health posts). Moreover, delays in the procurement of certain goods (contract for the supply of cold room equipment, contract for the supply of maintenance equipment, incinerator and material handling equipment) limit the performance with regard to procurement, which is considered unsatisfactory.

D.2.4 *Financial Performance*

2.1.4.13 The total amount disbursed under the ADF window as at 30 November 2004 stands at UA 7,031 million, representing a disbursement rate of 69.6%. As a result of recent efforts to improve the implementation rate, it has risen considerably in comparison with 9.8% in the previous review (2001). The Government's counterpart funds have been disbursed in full. The financial performance is satisfactory.

D.2.5 *Performance on Activities and Outputs*

2.1.4.14 Sustained efforts have been made to achieve the programmer's objectives of improving health care delivery and access.. The PAPDSAS resumed civil engineering works on the 8 health posts which no longer meet standards of building and finishing. By 30 November 2004, 4 of the centres were completed on 4 of the centres and work had started on the remaining four. The last supervision mission, however, noted that the contractor carrying out rehabilitation works had not fully complied with the specifications (sub-standard building materials, sub-standard wastewater and waterproofing system). The Bank, in October 2004, declared the bidding conducted by the government for the construction of the 33 health posts inconclusive. The sites of these posts have been identified. AMEXTIPE is, therefore, expected to commence the work without delay. As part of the efforts to improve delivery and access to essential drugs, ADF provided support to the elaboration of the pharmaceutical policy. This policy has been approved but the implementing orders are yet to be passed. The Bank noted that a lack of qualified resources would jeopardize the construction of the quality control laboratory (a contract had been signed with an architectural firm in November 2003). The Bank therefore proposed that a feasibility study be conducted; the TOF and the list of shortlisted firms should be submitted to it before December 2004. Lastly, in the context of strengthening efforts to combat diseases and improve the competencies of health care staff, WHO was able, with ADF financing, to establish the National Health Information System (SNIS) and to assist in the implementation of the specialized programmes. It is expected that WHO will, in the future, organize trainings and recruit a consultant to carry out the priority

studies identified by the MASS, with ADF resources. There is considerable slippage on project implementation. Despite the efforts made since the previous review and full compliance with all the recommendations from the last supervision mission in June/July 2003, the deadline for final disbursement has had to be extended a second time by one year and project completion is now scheduled for 31 December 2005. The performance on activities and outputs is considered unsatisfactory.

D.2.6 Development Impact

2.1.4.15 Significant efforts have been made towards achieving the Programme's objective of making health services accessible to 80% of the population. The PAPDSAS has brought about the establishment of SNIS and contributed in large measure to disease control in Mauritania. Since 2002, however, the project's emphasis has shifted to infrastructure to the detriment of capacity building. The authorities should work speedily to evolve a maintenance policy in order to ensure the sustainability of the investments committed. For the above reasons, the performance in respect of the development impact is considered highly satisfactory.

D.2.7 Overall Performance Assessment

2.1.4.16 The overall performance of the programme is rated as satisfactory. All the recommendations made during the last portfolio review and the 2003 Bank supervision mission have been taken into consideration. The project, is however, experiencing implementation problems and there is considerable slippage on the implementation of its activities. In addition, on several occasions, the Bank noted difficulties in complying with the rules of procedure for procurement of goods and services. During the last supervision mission, it was recommended that, in order to boost current capacities, the Bank should envisage a second health project which would include a vital component relating to maintenance of health infrastructure and human resource development. It should be noted, lastly, that the frequent rotation of the task manager at the Bank is impacting adversely on the project.

Indicator	Compliance with conditions	Procurement Performance	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Impact	Overall Assessment
Rating	2.0	1.5	2.0	1.5	2.7	2.0

2.1.4.17 Problems and proposed actions:

Problems	Proposed Solutions	Target date
Insufficient planning	Prepare and implement the 2 nd Health MTEF (2005-2007) which should fine-tune planning and monitoring instruments. The 2005 Annual Operations Plan should be submitted for Bank consideration.	January 2005
The Bank is not involved in the planning and review of PAPDSAS objectives	The Bank should send a representation to the annual reviews.	Continuous action
Delay in using the engineering studies and civil works	Use the findings of the studies and carry out the works as soon as possible. The Government should also request an extension (1 year) to enable implementation of the priorities of the MSAS.	1st quarter 2005
Lack of coordination between the DGI and WHO	The Planning, Cooperation and Statistics Directorate should be responsible for technical coordination of needs expressed by the expense centres and verify their appropriateness relative to the planning of the MSAS before forwarding them to WHO. The Bank should establish an implementation schedule for tasks delegated to WHO and adhere strictly to this schedule.	1st quarter 2005
Absence of a maintenance policy	To ensure sustainability of the rehabilitated and newly constructed infrastructure, maintenance of structures and machinery should be included in the programme.	Continuous action
Late submission of quarterly activity reports ; non-conformity of documents	Submit status reports within the allotted timeframes and in conformity with Bank procedures and format.	Continuous action

D.3 EDUCATION DEVELOPMENT SUPPORT PROJECT (PADSE)

D.3.1 *Basic administrative and financial data*

<u>Loan Amount:</u> UA5.92 million <u>Cancelled Amount :</u>	<u>Source :</u> ADF: UA5.92 million Gov. : UA1.09 million	<u>Disbursed Amount :</u> UA3.56 million (60.1%) <u>Balance :</u> UA2.36 million (39.9%)
<u>Approval date :</u> 30 June 1999	<u>Signature Date :</u> 17 September 1999	<u>Effectiveness Date :</u> 1 October 2000
<u>Deadline for Final Disbursement :</u> 31 December 2005	<u>Executing Agency :</u> Directorate of Education and Training Projects (DPEF)	
<u>Date of Last Supervision :</u> June 2004	<u>Audit of Accounts :</u> Audited accounts prepared for 2001, 2002 and 2003. Recruitment of an auditing firm for fiscal 2004 and 2005 is in progress. <u>Reports :</u> Regular status reports.	
<u>Objectives and Description :</u> The project aims to consolidate the achievements of the education system by focusing on removing disparities and improving the quality of basic and secondary education (first cycle). It comprises the following four components: (i) Consolidation of the intake capacity and improved quality of basic and secondary education; (ii) Increased enrolment of girls and literacy education for women; (iii) Capacity building at the Ministry of Education in respect of planning, management, teaching supervision, evaluation and production of teaching aids ; and (iv) support to the project management structure.		

D.3.2 *Loan Conditions*

2.1.4.18 The loan agreement was not yet effective on 1 October 2000, and the previous portfolio review (2001) already contained an assessment of the performance with regard to compliance with loan effectiveness and general conditions, which was considered to be satisfactory. Following up on the recommendations made during the last Bank supervision mission (June 2004), the Government has submitted to the Bank the administrative Act establishing the Girls' School Enrolment Support Fund (FASF). Compliance has been achieved on all the conditions. The project has prepared 9 status reports covering the period from start-up to 30 June 2004. These were regularly submitted to the Bank in conformity with the Bank format. Project audits were conducted for the 2001, 2002 and 2003 financial years. Observations made by the Bank were noted and the shortcomings were corrected. An auditor is being recruited for the 2004 and 2005 financial years (the dossier has been submitted to the Bank). The performance with respect to compliance with loan conditions is considered as more than satisfactory.

D.3.3 Procurement Performance

2.1.4.19 The previous portfolio review was not able to assess procurement performance because the increase in the costs for the construction of schools delayed the award of contracts. Since then, the DPEF has coordinated and supervised the procurement of goods, works and services since the beginning of the project. Contract award procedures were conducted satisfactorily. DPEF must however ensure that all contracts are completed on schedule, and where there is default, impose late delivery penalties stipulated in the contracts. Following the recommendations of the last bank supervision mission, the contract for the procurement of classroom furniture for the basic schools was cancelled. The Government was to organise a fresh bid using the BD already approved by the Bank. Furthermore, it is crucial that the DPEF should constantly monitor the implementation of contracts awarded and evaluate the performance of contractors and consultants on completion of their contracts. Procurement performance is satisfactory overall.

D.3.4 Financial Performance

2.1.4.20 The amount of ADF funds disbursed as at 30 November 2004 stood at UA3.56 million, representing a disbursement rate of 60.1%. This is a clear improvement on the 10% disbursement rate in the previous review (2001). 30% of Government counterpart funds had been disbursed. The overall performance in this respect is therefore satisfactory.

D.3.5 Performance of Activities and Outputs

2.1.4.21 The project activities had not started up when the last review was conducted. At end-November 2004, the project implementation rate was estimated at 60%. The main project activities concerned the construction of 209 classrooms in basic schools and five colleges with six classes each; language retraining for over 110 elementary (basic) school teachers, and provision of vehicles, computer equipment, projectors, and reprographic equipment for the structures attached to the Ministry of Education (MEN) as well as consumables for the science workshop at the Directorate of Secondary Education. This implementation rate, which is average one year to the deadline for last disbursement, is caused by delays in implementing the following activities : (i) construction of colleges, caused by the difficulty in obtaining a start up advance with the authorized project owner of AMEXTIPE, contracted to build 10 secondary schools under the project; (ii) establishment of the Girls' School Enrolment Support Fund and literacy training for women (the FASF is still not functioning even though it was set up in 2002, and literacy training planned for 1000 women has not really started up) ; (iii) training of teachers (the project aims to provide retraining/ for 10 300 elementary and secondary school teachers, whereas only 1500 teachers have so far been trained). The project performance with regard to activities and outputs is considered unsatisfactory.

D.3.6 Development Impact

2.1.4.22 The slow implementation progress on this activity which targets school enrollment of girls and literacy training for women is likely to undermine the project's development impact. However, based on the status of the other components and the overall implementation of all the activities, the project has a satisfactory impact on development in general. These problems aside, the overall performance in this area is rated as satisfactory.

D.3.7 Overall Performance Assessment

2.1.4.23 The project was still in the start-up phase during the previous review and the first few activities implemented were satisfactory. Since then, the project has experienced delay in the implementation of the components. The likely impact of this on the educational development and poverty reduction components detracts from the project's performance which, overall, remains satisfactory despite these problems. The last supervision mission (June 2004) stresses the fact that the recommendations of the 2003 supervision missions have received only limited application with 6 out of the 12 recommendations not yet implemented.

Indicator	Fulfillment of conditions	Procurement Performance	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Impact	Overall Assessment
Rating	2.3	2.0	1.8	1.3	2.0	1.8

2.1.4.24 Problems and proposed solutions :

Problems	Proposed Solutions	Timeframe
Sluggish implementation of activities (literacy, FASF and training and training)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Contact UNESCO again to finalize arrangements for the recruitment of a consultant to prepare the literacy campaign plan. - Submit to the Bank a concerted proposal on the new orientations of the FASF, the revised FAST manual of procedures, and the documents on consultation in respect of tenders for the recruitment of a consultant to design, implement and evaluate the results of the FASF. - Submit to the Bank the BD for the procurement of teaching materials for the literacy campaign. - Submit the evaluation reports on the training conducted to the Bank. 	1st quarter 2005
Delays in the implementation of activities under AMEXTIPE	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Organize a fresh NCB for the construction of Rosso College. - Conform with Bank procurement rules to avoid delay on the signing and launching of contracts. 	1st quarter 2005 Continuous action
Delay in the implementation of certain goods contracts (classroom furniture for the basic schools)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Organize a new NCB for the procurement of classroom furniture for the basic schools, using the BD already approved. - Comply with Bank procurement rules . 	1st quarter 2005 Continuous action

D.4 SUPPORT PROJECT TO THE EDUCATIONAL SYSTEM DEVELOPMENT DECADE PROGRAMME

D.4.1 Basic administrative and financial data

<u>Loan Amount:</u> UA8.29 million	<u>Source :</u> ADF : UA8.293 million Gov. : UA1.407 million	<u>Disbursed Amount :</u> UA0.85 million (10.2%) <u>Balance :</u> UA7.44million (89.8%)
<u>Cancelled Amount :</u> 0		
<u>Approval date :</u> 28 November 2001	<u>Signature Date :</u> 16 December 2001	<u>Effectiveness Date :</u> 1 August 2002
<u>Deadline for Final Disbursement :</u> 31 December 2007	<u>Executing Agency :</u> Directorate of Education Training Projects (DPEF)	
<u>Date of Last Supervision :</u> June 2004	<u>Audit of Accounts :</u> 2003 audit was performed. <u>Reports :</u> Regular status reports..	
<u>Objectives and Description:</u> The project's sector goal is to develop human resources and thus enhance the competitiveness of the country's economy, improve the quality and performance of services and eradicate the causes of poverty. Its activities will therefore focus on the centres of interest that are integral to, or cut across, the social sector and which must be developed and consolidated as the first step towards establishing a scientific and technical pole, which is an imperative of the moment. The specific objective is to diversify education, improve the quality of teaching and research with a view to training intermediate (senior technical) and senior management staff (engineers) in the agro-pastoral, forestry and food technology fields. The project has the following components : (i) Development of basic infrastructure (ISET at ROSSO), (ii) Institutional capacity building, (iii) Support to research-development and teaching and technological innovations , and (iv) Support to the project management institution.		

D.4.2 Loan Conditions

2.1.4.25 The loan became effective on 1 August 2002, approximately 9 months after the signature date. This slight delay was because the government wanted to process all donor-funded projects under the educational system decade development programme. There was full compliance on all the conditions precedent to loan effectiveness and those for first disbursement. The last supervision mission (June 2004) assessed the situation regarding compliance with the ' other conditions' It found slippage on compliance with 3 of the other 6 conditions concerning: i) evidence of the establishment of a Management Committee for the ISET (ISET has not yet admitted its first intake of students) ; ii) the FARS manual of procedure (a version was sent to ADF and IDA, but the corrections made by the two partners are not yet incorporated) ; and iii) proof that the Borrower has deposited the amount of its contribution to FARS. The project prepared 4 status reports covering the period from start-up to 30 June 2004. Future activity reports should reflect the Bank's observations regarding the acceptable format, and the DPEF's assessment of the performance of contractors and

consultants to be used should be taken into consideration in future reports. The audit report for the 2003 financial year was submitted to the Bank in May 2004 and the Audit Department made its observations in December 2004. The performance in respect of compliance with loan conditions is highly satisfactory.

D.4.3 Procurement Performance

2.1.4.26 The DPEF coordinated and supervised the procurements of goods, works and services as from the beginning of the project (recruitment of the firm to prepare the architectural drawings for the ISET at Rosso and the audit firm for the project audits, and the consultant to draw up the specifications for the technical and teaching equipment). Contracting was conducted in conformity with the Bank rules of procedure. By contrast, procurement of goods and services were not yet done because of the non-validation of the architectural studies for the ISET. Neither the rehabilitation or construction works nor the procurement of furniture and equipment for ISET can begin until the Bank approves the consulting firm's preliminary estimates for the new constructions and rehabilitation works, considered too high (3.3 times higher than the allocated budget). The performance in this area is considered unsatisfactory, given the problems on the ground.

D.4.4 Financial Performance

2.1.4.27 As at 30 November 2004, the amount of ADF resources disbursed was UA0.847 million, representing a disbursement rate of 10.2 % of the total amount. The local counterpart funds, meant essentially for the ' works' (rehabilitation) and goods (equipment) categories, is available though the disbursement flow is slow (app. 5%). Cost management should be a primary focus of attention and care should be taken to keep within the budget allocated for rehabilitation and construction as estimated by ISET. However, the financial performance is considered satisfactory at the present stage.

D.4.5 Performance of Activities and Outputs

2.1.4.28 The project implementation level at end-November 2004 is estimated at 12%. The principal activities carried out are the following: i) recruitment of consultancy firms for the architectural and technical studies for the construction of the Higher Institute for Technical Studies (ISET) at Rosso, prepare the regulatory framework for institutions of higher learning and the staff regulations for staff in Higher Education ; ii) preparation of the plans and specifications of the preliminary design for the construction of ISET, and writing of preliminary reports on the regulatory framework for institutions of higher learning and the staff regulation for staff in Higher Education ; iii) elaboration of a draft Guide to Procedures of the Scientific Research Support Fund (FARS). This relatively low implementation rate twenty six months into project implementation is due primarily to the delay encountered, between 2002 and mid-2004C, in carrying out activities relating to the design and technical studies for the construction of ISET, the training of teachers for higher institutions of learning and the establishment of FARS. The architectural programme for the building of the ISET still need to be revised in order to bring the consulting firm's construction estimates within the budget allocated by ADF. Also, after virtually two years of intense negotiations between the General Directorate of Higher Education, the DPEF, the Office of the Vice Chancellor of the University and the lecturers, a training programme for lecturers in institutions of higher learning was finalized in June 2004 and the training has since commenced. Finally, the

administrative order establishing the FARS was issued by the government in May 2004 and submitted to the Bank in June 2004. The manual of procedures for FARS, currently being finalized, must, however, be submitted to the Bank. The performance with regard to activities and output is unsatisfactory.

D.4.6 Development Impact

2.1.4.29 Given the present implementation rate of planned project activities, it is difficult, at the moment, to assess its development impact. Nevertheless, the recent start-up of the training segment under the institutional capacity building component is certain to impact positively on the quality of teaching. The performance in respect of this criterion is therefore rated as satisfactory at this stage.

D.4.7 Overall Performance Assessment

2.1.4.30 The project is experiencing delay in the implementation of its activities pertaining to the design and technical studies for the construction of IST, training of teachers for Higher Education and establishment of FARS, and this accounts for the low implementation rate mentioned earlier. However, the recommendations from the 20003 Bank supervision mission have been applied and the 2004 supervision mission observed that there is now good progress in implementation performance. If this pace is maintained, it will be possible to make up the delay experienced since project start-up, and the activities could still be implemented before the deadline for final disbursement, scheduled for December 2007. Despite these difficulties with regard to its outputs, the overall performance is considered satisfactory and is presented as follows:

Indicator	Compliance with conditions	Procurement Performance	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Impact	Overall Assessment
Rating	2.7	1.5	1.8	1.3	2.0	1.9

2.1.4.31 Problems and proposed actions :

Problems	Proposed Solutions	Deadline
Delay in the provisioning of the Scientific Research Support Fund (FARS)	The administrative order establishing FARS was submitted to the Bank in June 2004. The revised manual of procedures should be forwarded, together with the observations of ADF and IDA.I	February 2005
Very high estimates for the construction of the ISET	Review the cost estimates for the building of the ISET, a vital precondition to the start-up of rehabilitation and construction works.	1st quarter 2005
Delays in implementation of training of teachers for Higher Education	Submit to the Bank the bidding documents in respect of the recruitment of the consultant to prepare training programmes for strengthening management systems, budget planning and programming, and for their implementation .	February 2005

2.1.5 Multisector

2.1.5.1 For operations covering several sectors, the Bank Group has, to date, financed seven (7) operations for a total amount of UA 50.66 million representing 17% of the total amount of net commitments. Bank-financed multisector operations in Mauritania aim essentially to support the authorities to implement reform in the management of public funds. From 1988 to date, the Bank has financed 7 multisector operations, of which 4 programmes, 2 operations under the Supplementary Financing Mechanism, and 1 project, for a total amount, net of cancellations, of UA 50.18 million, or 15.6% of net commitments. Six of these operations have been completed and represent financing of UA 49.135 million. The Bank is also financing an ongoing institutional support project for a total amount of UA1.045 million, which accounts for 1.5% of the active loans and grants portfolio.

2.1.5.2 The ongoing project places emphasis on building capacity in the Ministry of Economic Affairs and Development, and the status of and performance assessment on this activity are detailed below.

E.1 MULTISECTOR INSTITUTIONAL SUPPORT PROJECT (PAIM)

E.4.1 *Basic administrative and financial data*

<u>Grant Amount</u> : UA1.045 million	<u>Source</u> : TAF : UA1.045 million Gov. : UA0.134 million	<u>Disbursed Amount</u> : UA0.501 million (47.9%) <u>Balance</u> : UA0.544 million (52.1%)
<u>Cancelled Amount</u> : 0		
<u>Approval date</u> : 7 July 2000	<u>Signature Date</u> : 29 September 2000	<u>Effectiveness Date</u> : 12 March 2001
<u>Deadline for Final Disbursement</u> : 31 December 2004	<u>Executing Agency</u> : Permanent Secretariat for the Steering Committee of the Ministry of Economic Affairs and Development (MAED)	
<u>Date of Last Supervision</u> : February-March 2004	<u>Audit of Accounts</u> : The financial audits for 2001, 2002 and 2003 are still pending. An auditing firm is being recruited. <u>Reports</u> : Quarterly activity reports for 2003 were submitted in August 2003 and January 2004 respectively. Quarterly activity reports submitted for 2004.	
<u>Objectives and Description</u> : The project's objective is to help build capacities to formulate and implement development strategies and programmes. More specifically, the project aims to consolidate and develop the programming, implementing and monitoring instruments for public investment programmes by focusing on training and human resource development as well as on the improvement of the functional ties between the MAED and technical ministries to ensure greater consistency between macroeconomic and sector projections. The expected project outputs are as follows : (i) building project programming, implementation and monitoring capacities ; (ii) strengthening the information system and improvement of the consultation system; (iii) support to computerized project management ; and (iv) project management support.		

E.4.2 Loan Conditions

2.1.5.3 The loan came into effect on 12 March 2001 and the previous portfolio review (2001) has already analyzed the project performance in respect of fulfillment of conditions for effectiveness, which was considered highly satisfactory. It had been agreed, during the previous review, that the Mauritanian authorities would initiate diligent action to fulfill the only remaining general condition by January 2002. At end- November 2004, three years after, full compliance has still not been achieved on this condition relating to implementation of public service reform. Also, slippage on the submission of status reports and the absence of audits for the 2001 to 2003 financial years are serious problems which limit the project performance with respect to compliance with loan conditions. The audits are expected to be conducted shortly since the Bank is currently studying the contracting proposal. The PIU must be particularly vigilant in this domain. Moreover, the Mauritanian authorities should initiate necessary measures regarding public service reform and thus fulfill the only general condition remaining. In spite of these problems and in view of the positive measures taken in this regard in 2004, the performance is rated as fairly satisfactory.

E.4.3 Procurement Performance

2.1.5.4 The bid documents submitted (project technical assistance, purchase of vehicles, procurement of computer equipment) are in conformity with Bank rules and procedures. However, the slippage on the initial schedule for their submission to the Bank should be noted. This affects the smooth implementation of project activities and limits the performance in respect of procurements, which is considered unsatisfactory.

E.4.4 Financial Performance

2.1.5.5 The grant amount disbursed as at 30 November 2004 is UA0.501 million, a disbursement rate of 47.9% three years after effectiveness and one month to the disbursement deadline of 31 December 2004. This low disbursement rate at this stage is the result of the chronic delays in the start-up of training activities and procurement of computer equipment for the MAED; it does not, however, denote any problems with the availability of foreign exchange and local currency or the performance of the co-financier. Thus, the project financial performance is considered more than satisfactory.

E.4.5 Performance of Activities and Outputs

2.1.5.6 Three years after effectiveness, the project's activities have not really started up. Technical assistance began in January 2003 (the date initially fixed for its completion in the ADB action programme in 2000), and the country experts to strengthen the four Directors were all recruited in September 2003. By contrast, all the other activities planned under the project components (training of management staff, procurement of computer equipment) encountered prolonged delays. Training for senior management staff started only in December 2004 - it was originally scheduled to have ended in the latter half of the year 2004. The call for tenders in respect of the computerization of the MAED departments had to be repeated as the previous exercise proved inconclusive. All the remaining project activities will be completed provided the deadline for last disbursement of the grant is extended to end-December 2005. The project performance in respect of this criterion is considered unsatisfactory.

E.4.6 Development Impact

2.1.5.7 The project will help to build administrative and technical capacities through training focused on the identification, programming, physical and financial monitoring of projects, as well as the preparation of investment budgets and formulation of macroeconomic and sector policies. It will thus improve the effectiveness of the Government's activities, will rationalize the use of public resources and consequently be the preferred instrument for the programming and monitoring of the implementation of the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper adopted in February 2001. From the first year of implementation, the project impact has already been satisfactorily noted through the coordination by the Steering Committee of public investment programming and implementation activities. The delay in the implementation of its activities is a non-negligible potential danger to the project's development impact. The performance in this area is considered highly satisfactory.

E.4.7 Overall Performance Assessment

2.1.5.8 During the previous review, the project was still at launching phase. Since then, very little progress has been made. This has caused a significant delay in implementation and considerable slippage on the initial schedule, due partly to lack of Bank monitoring pursuant to its relocation. Several measures taken to accelerate the pace of project implementation yielded results as the computerization of the MAED's departments and the training of senior staff in the administration started up in the 4th quarter of 2004. They are expected to proceed without problems. In spite of these problems, which the Bank should monitor closely, and given the positive upward trend of implementation activities since mid-2004, the overall performance is considered satisfactory.

Indicator	Fulfillment of Conditions	Procurement Performance	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Impact	Overall Assessment
Rating	1.7	1.5	2.6	1.3	2.3	2.0

2.1.5.9 Problems and proposed actions :

Problems	Proposed Solutions	Schedule
Delays in the start-up of activities on training and computerization of the MAED	Carry out the training and computerization of the MAED services in conformity with the last implementation schedule adopted.	Continuous action
Delays in the submission of audit accounts and status reports	- Submit project activity reports on schedule. - Begin financial audits for fiscal years 2001, 2002 et 2003.	Continuous action January 2005

2.2 Ageing and Problem Projects

2.2.1 **Ageing projects.** As at end-November 2004, the average age of the active loans portfolio was approximately 54 months, i.e. 4 and half years. At the date of the review (March 2004), the active portfolio included two ageing projects that were five years or older, representing a total of UA 6.917 million, 7% of ongoing portfolio net commitments: i) the

Fisheries Support Sector Project, signed in September 1993 and effective in October 1995 ; and ii) the Poverty Reduction Project, signed in November 1997 and effective in February 1999. These two projects have been completed since 30 September 2004 and 30 June 2004 respectively.

2.2.2 Problem Projects. Problem projects are defined as operations with a rating of 1.5 or less in respect of the criterion on compliance with conditions for loans and other commitments or the criterion on development impact. The portfolio thus includes two problems, both in the agriculture and rural development sector : the Fisheries Support Project which scores low on development impact, (1.5) and the Food Security Programme, ranked at 1.5 for the criterion relating to compliance with loan conditions. In the first case, the cancellation of an important component of the project (the fishing wharf) reduces the impact on both development and the beneficiaries. The project has since been completed and the cancelled component is included as part of a new development project, in the Tanit region. The Food and Security Programme, managed by FAO, performed poorly in terms of compliance with conditions because it has submitted no project status or audit reports since it started up. This shortcoming is all the more inexcusable in that the same remark had been made in the 2001 portfolio review in respect of other projects, and the Bank has since made its observations known to the Mauritanian authorities during supervision missions.

2.2.3 More broadly, in terms of the fulfillment of loans and grants conditions criterion, three projects (27%) are rated between 1.6 and 2, four projects (36%) score between 2.1 and 2.5 and three projects (27%) are ranked well above 2.5. Regarding the development impact criterion, five projects (45%) are rated between 1.6 and 2, one project (9%) has a rating of between 2.1 and 2.5 and three projects (27%) are rated well above 2.5.

2.2.4 Potentially problematic projects. Potentially problematic projects are projects which have experienced prolonged delays on their implementation schedule set at appraisal, with ultimately detrimental consequences on their development impact. In addition to the Food Security Project which is considered a problem project, other problem projects are the following : i) the Education System Support Project whose activities relating to the construction of colleges, school enrolment of girls and training of teachers have fallen behind schedule , jeopardizing their overall project development impact ; and ii) the Support Project to the Education System Decade Development Project ; iii) the Multisector Institutional Support Project whose activities relating to management staff training and computerization of the MAED's services have not started up whereas they should by now be nearing completion. The Rosso-Boghé road Project and the Nouakchott DWS Project, not effective at the date of the review and which have since been at the start-up phase, are also encountering problems as they cannot regain the momentum lost because of the difficult contracting process and the lack of in-country monitoring of the unit.

2.3 Assessment of the Frequency and Quality of Supervision

Since the previous review in 2001, and until this current review in 2004, the average number of supervision missions on each project has been near the target rate of 1.5 per year. The performance in respect of supervision of the two projects in the social sector (education and health) and in the multisector institutional support project was, however, unsatisfactory. The Food Security Programme is significantly different inasmuch as it has been delegated to the FAO. Also, and based on the recommendations of the report on the review of the results of the post-evaluation of Bank operations (2001-2002), prepared by OPEV in 2004, the quality of supervision missions improved with the strengthening of

multidisciplinary teams during missions. The Bank also paid special attention to the participatory approach in its reviews and its supervision of projects and reminded the authorities, during the missions about the measures to be taken to improve portfolio quality. Finally, it should be noted that workshops to familiarize the executing agencies with Bank rules and procedures for procurement of goods and services, in particular, during launching missions for new operations, have been re-introduced into the 2005 programme.

2.4 Cross-cutting Issues

2.4.1 Bank operations in Mauritania have been designed principally to help improve the living conditions of the population, in particular that of women, to develop human resources, protect natural resources and the environment and remote regional integration. The Bank has, in the past few years, systematically built the participatory approach into project design and implementation. This is expected to increase the impact of Bank operations on poverty reduction and development in the country, as is evidenced by the following analysis of cross-cutting issues.

2.4.2 **The Environment.** Virtually all the ongoing operations were the subject of environmental classification prior to appraisal. This classification made it possible to incorporate in the appraisal report measures to mitigate the environmental impact, with special focus on projects with definite impacts listed in categories 1 and 2. The Government and Executing Agencies have been sensitized to the implementation of these measures and some projects such as Fisheries Sector Support, Rural Water Supply in the South-East, the strengthening of Primary Health Care and the Atar-Akjout Transmaghreb Road, have all been the subject of a technical environmental supervision mission in order to confirm the effective implementation of the mitigative measure.

2.4.3 **Gender.** The gender dimension is factored into all operations in the loans portfolio, at least in their design. Some operations, however, place particular emphasis on reducing gender disparities. One example is the Rosso-Boghé Road Project one of whose components is designed to monitor the project impact on vulnerable groups including women. Its outreach activities include gender issues. The Health Master Plan Support projects aims, among others, to reduce these disparities in respect of access to primary health care and essential drugs. The Educational System Support Project prioritizes an increase in the enrolment rates for girls in urban and rural areas at the level of primary and secondary education. The Poverty Reduction Project which comprises several activities such as functional literacy education, IEC, a line of credit intended to promote and support income-generating activities, and management training which aims to reach approximately 50% of women. All the operations therefore include specific actions designed to reduce gender disparities and responsibilities for implementing these measures are clearly specified.

2.4.4 **Poverty reduction.** The ongoing operations respond to the objective of reducing poverty, consistent with the Bank's Operations Strategy for Mauritania adopted in the framework of ADF VII, VIII and IX. These operations emphasize the improvement of the economic sphere and access to basic social services by the rural population, particularly women, through support provided by ongoing projects in agriculture and rural development (4) and in the social sector (4). These priorities will be retained in the 2004 loan programme and in the CSP 2005-2007.

2.4.5 Micro-credit. Three projects show that micro-finance can be a vital poverty reduction instrument for the promotion of income-generating activities and micro enterprise. The projects are the: i) Poverty Reduction Project ; ii) the Livestock and Range Management Project ; and iii) the Artisanal Fisheries Support Project (Phase II). To date, the analysis of the use that the final beneficiaries make of credit and adherence to payment deadlines by the PMFI and their clients has been positive. However, there is sometimes a lack of coordination in the Bank's activities with regard to microfinance. For example, a new Savings and Credit Fund (MEPCA) for fishery development activities had to be created within the framework of the artisanal fisheries project, at the same time that the Bank was assisting the network of Peoples Savings and Credit Fund (CAPEC) to meet the credit demands of socio-professional groups. The project managers explained that the initial agreement was that two financial intermediaries, the Credit Maritime (COPA) and the CAPEC would administer the loans for apprentices and sea fishermen. Ultimately, however, these institutions could not cope with the demand for loans from apprentices and sea fishermen, which exceeded their credit limit. A specialized study commissioned as a result concluded that the credit would be best administered by a credit mutual fund. This lesser performance in respect of the coordination of the Bank's activities will be examined as part of the appraisal of the new microcredit support project planned for the first quarter of 2005 and designed to consolidate the achievements of Bank-financed projects.

2.4.6 Population. Several activities being implemented in the framework of ongoing projects are aimed at improving the social indicators on population. Thus, the Support Project to the Health and Social Affairs Master Plan will expand safe motherhood activities throughout the country by improving infrastructure, making contraceptives available, as well as other pharmaceutical products, by training midwives; the Educational System Development Support and Poverty Reduction Projects comprise IEC activities concerning population issues. The expected progress in these areas will help, in the medium and long term, to assess population growth and a better impact on income distribution and poverty reduction.

2.4.7 Regional integration. Although the ongoing portfolio contains no operations that specifically target regional integration, it should be noted that a road construction project linking Rosso - Bogue, for an amount of UA14.62 million, was signed in December 2003 and became effective in February 2004. This road infrastructure project, which will start up in 2004, will strengthen economic integration in the sub-region.

2.5 Overall Assessment of Portfolio Performance

2.5.1 The overall portfolio performance assessment, on the basis of the aggregate of ongoing project performance ratings, is considered satisfactory with an average score of 2.0 as shown in the Table below. The performance by sector and by project is presented in Annex 4.

Overall Assessment of 2004 portfolio review

Indicator	Loan Conditions	Procurement of Goods and Services	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Impact	Overall Assessment
Rating	2.2	1.8	2.2	1.6	2.2	2.0

Overall Assessment of 2001 portfolio review

Indicator	Loan Conditions	Procurement of Goods and Services	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Impact	Overall Assessment
Rating	2.2	2.1	2.2	2.1	2.5	2.2

2.5.2 Compared with the 1998 overall performance following the previous evaluation (1.9), this performance shows significant progress resulting from the efforts made both by the Mauritanian Authorities and the Bank. The overall performance (2.0) is very slightly lower than the rating obtained in 2001, at the end of the previous assessment (2.2). It is due essentially to the lower rating for performance on activities and outputs (1.6 in 2004 compared to 2.1 in 2001) with the performance in respect of the other criteria remaining stable or very slightly lower. The difficulties experienced in the start-up of activities on the Nouakchott DWS and Rosso-Boghé Road projects adversely affected the rating for the performance on activities and outputs, and more broadly, affected the overall portfolio performance. The agriculture and rural development sector, as well as the social sector, are the highest rated sectors with an overall rating of 2.1 while the public utilities sector ranks lowest (1.5) due to the start-up problems with the Nouakchott DWS Project. The two highest rated operations were the Poverty Reduction Project (2.8) and the Artisanal Fisheries Project (2.7).

2.5.3 The assessment of all operations by standard criteria gives rather disparate ratings but the performance is satisfactory overall. The trend in the performance in respect of the criteria compared to the previous review is as follows :

- i) The criterion on fulfillment of loan conditions remains stable (2.2), resulting from the sustained efforts by the authorities to fulfill conditions precedent to loan effectiveness as well as general and other conditions. Close attention must be paid to the submission of status reports and conduct of audits for the Food Security Programme being managed by FAO.
- ii) There is a slight drop in the rating for procurement of goods and services (1.8 against 2.1), underlining the long road ahead for the Bank in its efforts to familiarize project implementers in the country with its own internal rules and procedures. The recommendations of the review report prepared by OPEV envisage that the Bank will provide procurement and disbursement training to Borrowers before project start-up.
- iii) The financial performance criterion remained stable (2.2) despite the fact that certain projects are experience challenges to the implementation of their activities (Rosso-Boghé Road Project, Nouakchott DWS Project). It is more than satisfactory.
- iv) The rating for the activities and outputs criterion has dropped the most sharply (1.6 from 2.1). The two education projects, the Multisector Institutional Support project and, more recently, the Rosso-Boghé Project and the Nouakchott DWS Project are rated as unsatisfactory, reflecting the recurrent challenges that confront efforts to implement activities according to a fixed schedule, or to even start up activities, as in the second project. The Nouakchott DWS Project is rated as unsatisfactory

and reflects the recurrent problems that have prevented it from implementing its activities on schedule, or even from starting at all, as in the last two cases.

- v) The development impact criterion remains more than satisfactory (2.2 compared to 2.5) but continues to receive a low rating because of difficulties experienced by the Fisheries Support Project. The delays in the implementation of some its activities are likely to compromise their development impact.

2.6 Disbursements

2.6.1 The total amount disbursed as at 30 November 2004 for all operations amounts to UA 275.98 million, i.e. 85.5% of commitments net of cancellations. As of the same date, total loan and grant disbursements in respect of ongoing operations were UA 24.21 million, or 35.8% of ongoing net commitments. This is a vastly improved disbursement rate compared to the last review (26%) despite a lower rating on financial performance and activities and outputs. This is attributable to i) better monitoring of Bank disbursement rules and procedures by the authorities ; and ii) the fact that there were two projects nearing completion (completed since the third quarter of 2004) with a disbursement rate above 99%.

2.6.2 The main factors militating against any substantial improvement in disbursement performance in Mauritania, and which the Mauritanian authorities and the Bank should constantly seek to address are : i) delays in processing disbursement requests ; ii) the communication gap between the Bank and executing agencies and rejection of disbursement requests, every so often, because of procedural breaches or the absence of documentary evidence ; and iii) irregularities in the submission of accounting and financial monitoring of loans and grants (disbursement vouchers, etc.).

III. ASSESSMENT OF PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION AND MANAGEMENT CAPACITIES

3.1 Performance of the Government and Executing Agencies

3.1.1 Bank operations in Mauritania are under the supervision of the technical ministries and their monitoring and coordination is the responsibility of the Finance Directorate at the Ministry of Economic Affairs and Development. Thus far, MAED capacities have been boosted by programmes to support the previous balances of payments⁴, more particularly by the multisector institutional support programme currently being implemented. Also, there has been a substantial reduction in the timeframes for loans and grants to come into effect. This is due to the improvement in the technical capacities in

⁴ Moreover, an organizational and operational audit of the government economic and financial services was conducted in 1997 and resulted in the implementation of a series of measures aimed at building their administrative and technical capacities. The measures taken comprise the restructuring and strengthening of planning services (in particular for the Ministry of Economic Affairs and Development) in order to improve the preparation and monitoring of the implementation of multi-year investment programmes and the annual tranches of the latter. The Administration has also established technical monitoring committees for major projects which are responsible, among others, for the review of annual programmes and periodic activity reports in respect of these projects.

charge of projects in the country, but also because loans and grants now come with realistic conditions, allowing activities to start-up earlier and facilitating disbursements in the first few years. Over the past five years, Government has, in addition, regularly fulfilled its obligations to the Bank thereby avoiding frequent sanctions for arrears on loan repayment, which, in the past, slowed down project implementation.

3.1.2 Nevertheless, a number of shortcomings persist which impede the smooth management of Bank operations in Mauritania, essentially:

- i) Project managers are unfamiliar with Bank rules and procedure for procurement of goods and services ;
- ii) Absence of physical project monitoring, often caused by some project managers serving in several capacities at a time, and an opaque definition of responsibilities between the PIU and the supervising ministry, a situation that often militates against proper and effective government monitoring of projects ;
- iii) Chronic delays in the conduct of audits, which are sometimes not prepared at all, and non-submission to the Bank of quarterly status reports, despite some progress having been made in this regard since the previous review.

3.1.3 The Bank and the Mauritanian authorities should establish close dialogue with a view to assessing the performance of project managers and/or heads of PIUs. Cases of recurrent difficulties and shoddy performance should raise the issue whether the composition of the Unit at project effectiveness should really be retained in order to avoid bottlenecks and ensure that planned activities are implemented effectively and with due diligence.

3.2 Bank Performance

3.2.1 The Bank has helped to improve the implementation of operations through the following activities i) maintaining frequent supervision missions in a constant concern to ensure their broad-based composition ; and ii) improving the quality of supervision missions owing to the efforts made by experts to visit most of the project sites. All these ongoing operations, including those which might encounter problems, have been the subject of regular supervision, even though the Bank's relocation at end-2002 disrupted operations somewhat, and caused frequent delays in the processing of documents submitted by the executing agencies.

3.2.2 Ageing and potentially problematic operations had design weaknesses. This led to supplementary studies and works, which lengthened the implementation periods. Such situations can best be avoided through careful technical and financial preparation of future projects. Consequently, over the past few years, the Bank has attached considerable importance to the in-depth identification and preparation of each new operation.

3.2.3 Despite the progress made, the Bank still needs to pursue its efforts to reduce the time it takes to react to the outcome of contract awards and to provide greater assistance to projects at start-up. Its actions in this direction should focus on: i) monitoring adherence to the schedule drawn up at appraisal in order to avoid chronic delays in the implementation of activities ; ii) posing effectiveness conditions which demand the minimum legal requirements and do not stall activities; iii) training staff of project implementation units on the Bank's rules of procedure once loans and grants are approved. The Bank will also provide better

information on disbursements (establish a website) and will gradually return to a normal payment period once it acquires more familiarity with the SAP information system.

3.3 Cancellation of Loan and Grant Amounts

3.3.1 Two projects among the portfolio of ongoing operations have been the subject of partial cancellation of the loan amount. They are : the Food Security Programme, for an amount of UA2.158 and, in particular, the Fisheries Support Project , for an amount totaling more than UA6.44 million. This substantial cancellation, which represents 5.66% of the total commitments signed by the Mauritanian authorities under the portfolio of ongoing operations, is due to the cancellation of a vital component of the project. It highlights the need to prepare appraisals better and pay close attention to ensuring the quality of technical and economic feasibility studies, and validating them before projects are approved.

3.3.2 In order to improve the quality of its portfolio operations and its financial standing, the Bank has, in early 2004, cancelled the balances on four completed projects. The total amount of loans cancelled stands at UA 3.11 million.

IV. COORDINATION WITH OTHER DONORS

4.1 Assessment of the Government's Coordination Capacity

4.1.1 The Ministry of Economic Affairs and Development (MAED) is primarily responsible for the coordination of external aid in Mauritania through the responsibilities of its three principal Directorates: The Programming and Designs Directorate (DPE), Financing Directorate (FD) and the Human Resources Management Directorate (DGRH). In close collaboration with the planning services and Executing Agencies under the technical ministries, the DPE plays a role in the selection, programming and monitoring of the implementation of externally-financed projects, the DFI coordinates their financial management while the DGRH coordinates their training and retraining programmes. These two Directorates receive TAF assistance through the Multisector Institutional Support Project which aims to build institutional capacity and improve their operational ties with the programming services of other ministries.. The sectoral programming services of the most important ministries (Rural Development and Environment, Mines and Energy, Fisheries and Maritime Economy, Education, Health and Social Affairs and the State Commission of Human Rights, Poverty Reduction and Social Integration) have received additional assistance from other development partners (particularly World Bank, GTZ and UNDP).

4.1.2 Mauritania takes part in the Consultative Group, an aid coordination instrument of the World Bank administered by the World Bank.⁵ Coordination is organized through sector meetings presided in rotation by the donors. These meetings – the last one was held in December 2001 – cover several sectors such as education, health, rural development, governance, environment etc..

⁵ The Consultative Group is an assembly of donors who meet periodically to review with a given country the progress that it has made in terms of economic reform, its sectoral strategies and its public investment programme (PIP)

4.2 Assessment of Bank Coordination with Other Donors

The Bank has placed particular emphasis on co-financing over the past few years. The 2002-2004 CSP recommends this approach which advocates coordination of efforts among partners and several working groups have met on this subject⁶. In fact, the majority of ongoing operations are co-financed with other partners: the Artisanal Fisheries Project, the Livestock Development and Range Management Project and the Rosso - Boghé Road Project are financed jointly by the OPEC Fund ; The Poverty Reduction Project is co-financed by IDA and CIDA ; and the Nouakchott DWS, which is co-financed by ADFES, the Kuwait Fund and the Saudi Fund. Joint financing make it possible to : i) gain a keener perception of problems and ways to resolve them at field-level, ii) avoid duplication of effort, and iii) undertake concrete development actions in conjunction with all partners. Nonetheless, coordination among donors can sometimes turn out to be ineffective. A case in point concerns the Food Security Programme, managed by FAO, with which agency the Bank has had difficulties, notably as regards their administrative procedures and long contracting procedure. The coordination effort should be continued and any difficulties encountered should be resolved in the pursuit of better information sharing and uniform rules of procedure and performance indicators.

4.3 Assessment of Co-financers

4.3.1 Collaboration with the country's other development partners has improved in recent years since there are an increasing number of joint identification, preparation, appraisal and supervision missions. This coordination of efforts has had a positive impact on the harmonization of donors' approaches and on exchanges of experience. The ADB Group and the World Bank have also organized, for two years now, an annual review of the health sector, chiefly to discuss operational results and plans for the implementation of this master plan. A similar annual meeting for the joint monitoring of the Educational System Support System is recommended from 2002 and should group together the representatives of ADB, the World Bank, IDB and AFD. The UNDP Office in Nouakchott represents the Bank on the Poverty Reduction Project Steering Committee. Joint supervision missions for this project have, moreover, been carried out with CIDA in 1999 and 2001. As part of the efforts to coordinate aid, the UNDP office in Nouakchott organizes quarterly consultative meetings to which the Bank missions to the country are regularly invited. In the past these meetings provided useful information, in particular concerning the monitoring of the programme under preparation for the building of institutional capacities and the advancement of good governance. Until now, the experience of cofinancing with the other donors and consultation between Mauritania's principal partners at each stage of the project cycle is satisfactory.

V. LOANS REPAYMENT AND CONTRIBUTION TO THE BANK'S CAPITAL

5.1 Mauritania regularly honors its loan repayment obligations to the Bank Group. It should continue in this direction in order to ensure the sustainability of financing for ongoing projects and to confirm the country's performance, which has been taken into account in the allocation of resources under ADF IX (2002-2004) and ADF X (2005-2007).

⁶ The resumption of exchanges between the Bank and AFD to strengthen co-financing is significant from this point of view

5.2 By contrast, Mauritania's arrears on subscriptions to the Bank's capital since May 2000 (date corresponding to Coupon n°1 of AGC-IV-1) at 30 November 2004 were UA1 984 000.

VI. PROACTIVE PORTFOLIO MANAGEMENT

6.1 Potential Problems and Proposed Solutions

Despite the efforts made to build the technical and administrative capacities of the Executing Agencies and supervising Ministries, the absorptive capacity remains weak. The Bank will support the Government's efforts to fine-tune the multiyear programmes of priority sectors such as health, education and rural development.

6.2 Plan of Action

A plan of generic and specific measures, as well as a corresponding implementation schedule have been prepared for each ongoing operation treated in this review. Implementing the proposed measures, presented in matrix form in Annexes 5 and 6, the systemic inclusion of launching missions and maintaining an adequate level of supervision in 2004 and 2005 will help to improve the implementation of projects and disbursement performance on the ongoing portfolio. The action plan that has been prepared should bring about an increase in total disbursement on the active portfolio from 35.8% as at 30 November 2004 to at least 45% in November 2005.

6.3 Lessons to be Applied towards Future Portfolio Reviews and CSPs

This portfolio review has focused on the fact that some of the problems encountered in the implementation of projects stem from shortcomings in their design and preparation. This observation suggests that special attention should be paid to the stages of the project cycle preceding appraisal. It is also useful for the sectors of the Bank's aid focus such as rural development, education and health to be the subject of comprehensive studies. The project preparation facility established from ADF VIII should be used to advantage to improve the quality of projects in the pipeline. This meticulous preparation of future operations will make it possible to prevent the technical problems which led to cost overruns such as the geodesic data on the sites for the future location of the project infrastructure. Consideration of the crosscutting aspects of each project requires multidisciplinary teams in their preparation/appraisal. The shortening of the deadlines for effectiveness of loan agreements observed over recent years are due to the realistic nature of the definition of conditions, which should be pursued. In recent years, launching missions have been systematically organized for new operations. Efforts should be made to pursue the systematic organization of these missions while diversifying their composition. The annual programmes and reviews of project activities will be thoroughly reviewed by the Bank. This activity should be strengthened within the framework of the annual public spending reviews especially for sectors prioritized under the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper. Finally, heightened attention must be paid to the submission of status and audit reports, and to the conclusions drawn in the project audits. In this latter regard, the authorities and staff of the Executing Agencies must be reminded of the outcomes and conclusions of these project audits so that they can incorporate them and refine the performance in respect of each of the assessed criteria.

VII. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 Conclusions

The results of this review show that the performance of the Bank's portfolio is satisfactory overall (Rating of 1.9). The review however raises some generic or specific problems, most of them mentioned in the previous review, which continue to impede the smooth implementation on certain operations. First, the Bank drew the attention of the different project task managers to a number of slippages on the agreed implementation schedule, as well as some delays in the processing of documents. The Bank also noted shortcomings (omissions or delays) in the conduct of audits, and failure to use their recommendations and to disseminate them to other government monitoring institutions. The Mauritanian authorities were also informed that, according to the Bank's internal provisions, disbursements would be suspended if these conditions were not fulfilled. Lastly, the assessment of ongoing projects indicate that attention must continue to be given to ensuring compliance with Bank rules and procedures for procurement of goods, works and services.

7.2 Recommendations

7.2.1 As allocation of ADF resources is based on portfolio performance, measures must be taken to improve the absorptive capacity and effective management of projects. The 2001 review contained several recommendations, including the following actions to be taken by the Government :

- Submit reports to the Bank in respect of the building of institutional capacity and the advancement of good governance ;
- Improve the selection and programming of projects and submit annually to the Bank the updated status of the medium-term indicative public investment programme;
- Systematically establish and adhere to annual project activity plans, then use the annual reviews to improve project implementation ;
- Ensure closer physical and financial monitoring of projects by the supervising and coordination services;
- Strictly implement the recommendations of the launching and supervision missions and the project audit reports.

7.2.2 Although the first two recommendations have been applied on the whole, the last three still need to be addressed and efforts should continue to see that they are implemented.

7.2.3 Similarly, recommendations were made to the Bank, designed to improve the quality of its monitoring of operations. Among other things, the Bank was to :

- continue to dialogue with the Mauritanian authorities on the reforms aimed at building technical and administrative capacities ;
- Improve coordination between the country's development partners ;
- Seek project quality-at-entry to the portfolio by paying special attention to the identification, preparation and appraisal stages ;
- Maintain the frequency of launching and supervision missions with special attention to potential problem projects, and diversify, as much as possible,

the composition of these missions to cover all aspects including cross-cutting issues ;

- Maintain the seminars/workshops on the rules and procedures for the procurement of goods, works and services in the training programme for Mauritania ;
- Participate in annual public spending reviews including, in particular, the reviews of the priority sectors of the PRSP.

7.2.4 While some of these recommendations are being successfully applied (the first three), it should be noted that the majority of them are still pending, underlining the need to continue efforts on the monitoring of operations.

7.2.5 To that end, and pursuant to the assessment of ongoing portfolio operations in 2004 and the incomplete implementation of the recommendations made during the 2001 review, this review contains fresh general recommendations of necessary actions by the Government and by the Bank. The specific measures recommended for each project are shown in the matrix of measures set out in Annex 4.

For the Government :

- i) Submit regular quarterly activity reports, including the status of other loans and/or grants ;
- ii) Prepare and submit to the Bank implementation completion reports on completed projects ;
- iii) Monitor compliance with the audit obligation and submit audit reports to the Bank ;
- iv) Establish a management chart on compliance with the conditions for loans and grants and establish a line of communication between the MAED, the supervising ministries, the project executing agencies and the Bank.
- v) present payment requests supported by all necessary documentary justification in order to shorten the processing time within the Bank ;
- vi) accelerate the preparation and submission of bid evaluation reports for the award of public contracts ;
- vii) improve the coordination of actions initiated by the Bank, and more broadly, by the different development partners.

For the Bank :

- i) process disbursement requests within the set timeframe ;
- ii) send a monthly statement of disbursements to project managers and the MAED ;
- iii) speed up processing of requests for non-objection on invitations to bid;
- iv) systematization of project launching workshops;
- v) monitor implementation of ongoing projects and recommendations made in this report by the Bank's Regional Office in Dakar which covers operations in Mauritania.

7.2.2 The Boards are invited to take note of the conclusions of the general portfolio review in Mauritania and adopt the above recommendations.

ANNEX 1

MAURITANIA
LIST OF COMPLETED OR CANCELLED OPERATIONS
As at 30 November 2004

Name of Project/ Programme	Approval Date	Signature Date	Fin. Source	Net Amount (UA)	Amount Disbursed (UA)	% Disbursed	Completion Date
Agriculture							
1. BOGHE IRRIGATION DEVELOPMENT	26-Nov-74	18-Dec-74	ADF	3,960,870.00	3,960,870.00	100.0%	Jun-05
2. CONSTRUCTION OF CEREALS STORAGE SHEDS	22-Nov-78	16-May-79	ADF	5,600,935.21	5,600,935.21	100.0%	Jun-85
3. LIVESTOCK DEVELOPMENT	18-Jun-86	16-Feb-87	ADF	6,931,396.56	6,931,396.56	100.0%	Jan-99
4. HYDRO-AGRIC. DEVELOPMENT PROJECT	26-Jun-87	15-Feb-88	ADF	10,269,730.00	10,110,487.57	98.4%	Mar-00
5. ARTISANAL FISHERIES DEVELOPMENT	22-Jun-88	31-Aug-89	ADF	5,268,417.00	5,148,080.69	97.7%	Aug-99
6. BOGHE IRRIGATION DEVELOPMENT (SUPPL.)	11-Nov-82	24-Mar-83	ADF	2,543,165.07	2,543,165.07	100.0%	Aug-90
7. FISHERIES SECTOR SUPPORT PROJECT	01-Sep-93	01-Sep-93	ADF	3,687,071.00	3,634,113.14	98.6%	Mar-04
8. WEST BRAKNA IRRIGATION STUDY	20-Nov-97	05-Feb-98	ADF	790,000.00	452,707.27	57.3%	Jul-03
Agriculture Total				39,051,584.84	38,381,755.51	98.3%	
Secteur social							
9. ENLARGEMENT OF HEALTH COLLEGE	27-Feb-76	22-Mar-76	ADF	1,163,870.25	1,163,870.25	100.0%	Jul-93
10. CEG TEACHER TRAINING CENTRE	30-Apr-81	22-May-81	ADF	5,526,312.00	5,181,432.63	93.8%	Dec-02
11. HEALTH SECTOR STUDY	13-Feb-85	26-Jul-85	ADF	1,221,270.25	1,221,270.25	100.0%	May-93
12. EDUCATION SECTOR RESTRUCTURING	17-Jan-89	03-Aug-89	ADF	11,739,039.42	11,739,039.42	100.0%	Jan-00
13. INSTITUTION BUILDING SOCIAL DIMENSION	18-Mar-91	09-May-91	ADF	702,946.80	702,946.80	100.0%	Sep-96
14. STRENGTHENING OF PRIMARY HEALTH CARE	23-Mar-92	29-Jan-93	ADF	9,210,520.00	6,913,778.36	75.1%	Jun-02
Social Sector Total				29,563,958.72	26,922,337.71	91.1%	
Industry and Mines							
15. GUELBS I IRON ORE	21-Nov-78	21-Dec-78	ADB	5,000,000.00	5,000,000.00	100.0%	Mar-86
16. GUELBS II IRON ORE	23-Jan-79	15-Feb-80	ADB	5,000,000.00	5,000,000.00	100.0%	Feb-82
17. SNIM REHABILITATION	22-Jun-88	13-Jan-89	ADB	12,003,183.46	12,003,183.46	100.0%	Aug-93
18. M'HAOUAT IRON ORE	17-Dec-90	08-Feb-91	ADB	45,005,236.21	45,005,236.21	100.0%	Nov-96
Industry & Mine Total				67,008,419.67	67,008,419.67	100.0%	
Transport							
19. TRANSMAGHREB AKJOUST-ATAR ROAD	12-Sep-96	03-Oct-96	ADF	8,027,499.85	8,027,499.85	100.0%	Jul-01
Transport Total				8,027,499.85	8,027,499.85	100.0%	
Equipements collectifs							
20. TELECOMMUNICATIONS	14-Dec-72	17-May-73	ADF	850,000.00	850,000.00	100.0%	Apr-77
21. DAMS IN TANGANT	16-Jan-74	04-Oct-74	ADF	165,391.83	165,391.83	100.0%	Aug-82
22. NOUAKCHOTT WATER SUPPLY	10-May-74	04-Jun-74	ADF	3,315,787.22	3,315,787.22	100.0%	Jun-82
23. TELECOMMUNICATION (SUPPLEMENTARY LOAN)	14-Oct-75	19-Feb-76	ADF	800,000.00	800,000.00	100.0%	Nov-79
24. NOUAKCHOTT WATER SUPPLY (SUPPLEMENTARY LOAN)	22-Nov-76	21-Jan-77	ADF	746,206.03	746,206.03	100.0%	Jun-85
25. OPERATION WELLS (36 BOREHOLES)	28-Feb-78	05-Apr-78	ADF	2,924,498.66	2,924,498.66	100.0%	Jul-86
26. NOUAKCHOTT ELECTRIC POWER PLANT	21-Dec-82	24-Mar-83	ADB	14,841,254.62	14,841,254.62	100.0%	Feb-92
27. REHAB. OF DRINKING WATER SUPPLY/SANITATION	12-Dec-85	30-Apr-86	ADF	6,724,736.76	6,724,736.76	100.0%	Jul-94
28. RURAL WATER SUPPLY IN THE SOUTH EAST	25-Feb-91	09-May-91	ADF	6,732,900.00	6,209,781.82	92.2%	Dec-02
29. DRINKING WATER SUPPLY 10 TOWNS	02-May-91	12-May-92	ADF	1,498,835.73	1,498,835.73	100.0%	Apr-96
Total Equipements collectifs				38,599,610.85	38,076,492.67	98.6%	
Finance							
30. LINE OF CREDIT	18-Mar-86	30-Apr-86	ADF	3,474,461.09	3,474,461.09	100.0%	Mar-92
Finance Total				3,474,461.09	3,474,461.09	100.0%	
Multisecteur							
31. STRUCTURAL ADJUSTMENT PROGRAMME	27-May-88	16-Nov-88	ADF	13,815,780.00	13,815,780.00	100.0%	May-89
32. P.E. ADJUSTMENT PROGRAMME	28-Aug-91	03-Dec-91	ADF	13,815,780.00	13,815,780.00	100.0%	Jan-93
33. PUBLIC RESOURCES MANAGEMENT PROGRAMME	17-Dec-96	20-Dec-96	ADF	7,800,000.00	7,386,344.99	94.7%	Dec-99
34. PUBLIC RESOURCES MANAGEMENT PROGRAMME	16-Dec-98	13-Jan-99	ADF	2,177,081.65	2,177,081.65	100.0%	Dec-99
35. 1999 SUPPLEMENTARY FINANCING PROGRAMME	12-Nov-99	15-Dec-99	ADF	1,995,000.00	1,995,000.00	100.0%	Jan-00
36. FISCAL ADJUSTMENT PROGRAMME	21-May-01	30-May-01	ADF	10,000,000.00	9,944,545.45	99.4%	Aug-03
Multisector Total				49,603,641.65	49,134,532.09	99.1%	
TOTAL				235,329,176.67	231,025,498.59	98.2%	

MAURITANIA - PORTFOLIO OF ONGOING OPERATIONS

30-Nov-04

Name of Project / Programme	Status	Approval	Signat.	Effective ness	Closure	Last Disburs.	Currency Value	Net Amount	Amount Disbursed	Amount Outstanding	Disbrs. Ratio (%)
Agriculture											
1 FISHERIES SECTOR SUPPORT (Completed since 30/06/04)	Comp	Sep-93	Sep-93	Oct-95	Jun-04	Apr-04	UAC	3,687,071.00	3,654,822.09	32,248.91	99.1
2 SPECIAL FOOD SECURITY PROGRAMME	OnGo	Jun-00	Mar-01	Apr-01	Dec-04	Oct-01	UAC	747,841.75	747,841.75	0.00	100.0
3 ARTISANAL FISHERIES DEVELOPMENT (Phase II)	OnGo	Dec-99	Feb-00	Jan-01	Dec-06	Mar-04	UAC	5,000,000.00	2,409,669.61	2,590,330.39	48.2
4 PASTORAL AND RANGE-LAND MANAGEMENT PROJECT	OnGo	Apr-01	Jun-01	Mar-02	Dec-06	Oct-03	UAC	5,000,000.00	1,303,903.06	3,696,096.94	26.1
Sub-Total								14,434,912.75	8,116,236.51	6,318,676.24	56.2
Social Sector											
5 POVERTY REDUCTION PROJECT (Completed since 30/09/04)	Comp	Nov-97	Nov-97	Oct-98	Jun-04	Feb-04	UAC	3,230,000.00	3,216,586.23	13,413.77	99.6
6 HEALTH SECTOR SUPPORT PROGRAMME	OnGo	Mar-99	Apr-99	Aug-00	Dec-03	Mar-04	UAC	10,108,000.00	7,030,994.50	3,077,005.50	69.6
7 EDUCATION SYSTEM DEVELOPMENT SUPPORT	OnGo	Jun-99	Sep-99	Oct-00	Dec-05	Mar-04	UAC	5,920,000.00	3,559,064.02	2,360,935.98	60.1
8 EDUCATION SYSTEM DECADE PROGRAMME SUPPORT	OnGo	Nov-01	Dec-01	Oct-02	Dec-07	Feb-04	UAC	8,293,000.00	847,238.34	7,445,761.66	10.2
Sub-Total								27,557,000.00	14,653,883.09	12,897,116.91	53.2
Transport											
9 ROSSO-BOGHE ROAD CONSTRUCTION	OnGo	Jul-03	Dec-03	Mar-04	Dec-07		UAC	14,620,000.00	938,291.12	13,681,708.88	6.4
Sub-Total								14,620,000.00	938,291.12	13,681,708.88	6.4
Public Utilities											
10 NOUAKCHOTT DWS Project (Aftout Essaheli)	OnGo	Sep-03	Dec-03	Mar-04	Dec-09		UAC	10,000,000.00	0.00	10,000,000.00	0.0
Sub-Total								10,000,000.00	0.00	10,000,000.00	0.0
Multisector											
11 MULTISECTOR INSTITUTIONAL SUPPORT PROJECT	OnGo	Jul-00	Sep-00	mar-01	Dec-04	Mar-04	UAC	1,045,000.00	500,896.05	544,103.95	47.9
Sub-Total								1,045,000.00	500,896.05	544,103.95	47.9
TOTAL								67,650,912.75	24,209,306.77	43,441,605.98	35.8

DETAILED ASSESSMENT BY PROJECT

A1. : FISHERIES SECTOR SUPPORT

PROJECT PERFORMANCE CRITERIA		
Indicators	Previous Report	This report
A Loan Conditions		
Compliance with Conditions Precedent to Effectiveness	1.5	1.5
Compliance with General Conditions	2	2
Compliance with other conditions	2	3
B Procurement of Goods and Services		
Procurement of Consultancy Services	1.5	2
Procurement of Goods and Works	1.5	2
C Financial Performance		
Availability of Foreign Exchange	2	2
Availability of Local Currency	2	2
Disbursement Flow	1	2
Cost Management	1	2
Performance of Cofinanciers	2	-
D Activities and Outputs		
Adherence to Implementation Schedule	1	1
Performance of Assistants or Technical Assistants	1.5	1
Performance of Contractors	1.5	2
Performance of Project Management	2	2
E Development Impact		
Likelihood of Achieving Project Objectives	1	1
Likelihood of Sustaining Benefits beyond the Project Investment Phase	2	2
Project Contribution to Capacity Building	2	2
Expected Rate of Return	2	1
F Overall Assessment		
At present	1.64	1.8
Trend over time	3	1.7
Key :		
3 = Highly satisfactory		
2 = Satisfactory, Occasional problems		
1 = Unsatisfactory, Bank should monitor closely		
0 = Highly unsatisfactory, Serious problems		

DETAILED ASSESSMENT BY PROJECT**A2. : ARTISANAL FISHERIES DEVELOPMENT PROJECT PHASE II**

PROJECT PERFORMANCE CRITERIA		
Indicators	Previous Report	This report
A Loan Conditions		
Compliance with Conditions Precedent to Effectiveness	2	2
Compliance with General Conditions	2	3
Compliance with other conditions	2	3
B Procurement of Goods and Services		
Procurement of Consultancy Services	2	2
Procurement of Goods and Works	-	3
C Financial Performance		
Availability of Foreign Exchange	3	3
Availability of Local Currency	2	3
Disbursement Flow	1	2
Cost Management	2	3
Performance of Cofinanciers	-	3
D Activities and Outputs		
Adherence to Implementation Schedule	2	2
Performance of Assistants or Technical Assistants	2	3
Performance of Contractors	2	3
Performance of Project Management	2	3
E Development Impact		
Likelihood of Achieving Project Objectives	2	3
Likelihood of Sustaining Benefits beyond the Project Investment Phase	2	2
Project Contribution to Capacity Building	2	3
Expected Rate of Return	-	-
F Overall Assessment		
At present	2	2.7
Trend over time	3	2.4
Key :		
3 = Highly satisfactory		
2 = Satisfactory, Occasional problems		
1 = Unsatisfactory, Bank should monitor closely		
0 = Highly unsatisfactory, Serious problems		

DETAILED ASSESSMENT BY PROJECT**A3. : LIVESTOCK DEVELOPMENT AND RANGE MANAGEMENT PROJECT**

PROJECT PERFORMANCE CRITERIA		
Indicators	Previous Report	This report
A Loan Conditions		
Compliance with Conditions Precedent to Effectiveness	-	3
Compliance with General Conditions	-	2
Compliance with other conditions	-	2
B Procurement of Goods and Services		
Procurement of Consultancy Services		2
Procurement of Goods and Works		1
C Financial Performance		
Availability of Foreign Exchange	-	3
Availability of Local Currency	-	3
Disbursement Flow	-	2
Cost Management	-	2
Performance of Cofinanciers	-	2
D Activities and Outputs		
Adherence to Implementation Schedule	-	1
Performance of Assistants or Technical Assistants	-	2
Performance of Contractors	-	2
Performance of Project Management	-	2
E Development Impact		
Likelihood of Achieving Project Objectives	-	2
Likelihood of Sustaining Benefits beyond the Project Investment Phase	-	2
Project Contribution to Capacity Building	-	2
Expected Rate of Return	-	-
F Overall Assessment		
At present	-	2.0
Trend over time	-	2.0
Key :		
3 = Highly satisfactory		
2 = Satisfactory, Occasional problems		
1 = Unsatisfactory, Bank should monitor closely		
0 = Highly unsatisfactory, Serious problems		

DETAILED ASSESSMENT BY PROJECT

A4. : SPECIAL FOOD SECURITY PROGRAMME – PILOT PROJECT

PROJECT PERFORMANCE CRITERIA		
Indicators	Previous Reports	This report
A Loan Conditions		
Compliance with Conditions Precedent to Effectiveness		2
Compliance with General Conditions		1
Compliance with other conditions		-
B Procurement of Goods and Services		
Procurement of Consultancy Services		1
Procurement of Goods and Works		2
C Financial Performance		
Availability of Foreign Exchange		2
Availability of Local Currency		2
Disbursement Flow		3
Cost Management		1
Performance of Cofinanciers		2
D Activities and Outputs		
Adherence to Implementation Schedule		1
Performance of Assistants or Technical Assistants		2
Performance of Contractors		2
Performance of Project Management		1
E Development Impact		
Likelihood of Achieving Project Objectives		2
Likelihood of Sustaining Benefits beyond the Project		
Investment Phase		2
Project Contribution to Capacity Building		
Expected Rate of Return		2
		-
F Overall Assessment		
At present		1.8
Trend over time		1.8
Key :		
3 = Highly satisfactory		
2 = Satisfactory, Occasional problems		
1 = Unsatisfactory, Bank should monitor closely		
0 = Highly unsatisfactory, Serious problems		

DETAILED ASSESSMENT BY PROJECT

B1 : ROSSO-BOGHE ROAD PROJECT

PROJECT PERFORMANCE CRITERIA		
Indicators	Previous report	This report
A Loan Conditions		
Compliance with Conditions Precedent to Effectiveness		3
Compliance with General Conditions		2
Compliance with other conditions		2
B Procurement of Goods and Services		
Procurement of Consultancy Services		2
Procurement of Goods and Works		1
C Financial Performance		
Availability of Foreign Exchange		2
Availability of Local Currency		2
Disbursement Flow		1
Cost Management		1
Performance of Cofinanciers		1
D Activities and Outputs		
Adherence to Implementation Schedule		1
Performance of Assistants or Technical Assistants		-
Performance of Contractors		1
Performance of Project Management		1
E Development Impact		
Likelihood of Achieving Project Objectives		2
Likelihood of Sustaining Benefits beyond the Project		
Investment Phase		2
Project Contribution to Capacity Building		
Expected Rate of Return		2
		-
F Overall Assessment		
At present		1,6
Trend over time		1,6
Key :		
3 = Highly satisfactory		
2 = Satisfactory, Occasional problems		
1 = Unsatisfactory, Bank should monitor closely		
0 = Highly unsatisfactory, Serious problems		

DETAILED ASSESSMENT BY PROJECT

C1 : NOUAKCHOTT DRINKING WATER SUPPLY PROJECT

PROJECT PERFORMANCE CRITERIA		
Indicators	Previous report	This report
A Loan Conditions		
Compliance with Conditions Precedent to Effectiveness		2
Compliance with General Conditions		2
Compliance with other conditions		-
B Procurement of Goods and Services		
Procurement of Consultancy Services		-
Procurement of Goods and Works		-
C Financial Performance		
Availability of Foreign Exchange		-
Availability of Local Currency		-
Disbursement Flow		-
Cost Management		-
Performance of Cofinanciers		-
D Activities and Outputs		
Adherence to Implementation Schedule		1
Performance of Assistants or Technical Assistants		-
Performance of Contractors		-
Performance of Project Management		1
E Development Impact		
Likelihood of Achieving Project Objectives		-
Likelihood of Sustaining Benefits beyond the Project Investment Phase		-
Project Contribution to Capacity Building		-
Expected Rate of Return		-
F Overall Assessment		
At present		1.5
Trend over time		1.5
Key :		
3 = Highly satisfactory		
2 = Satisfactory, Occasional problems		
1 = Unsatisfactory, Bank should monitor closely		
0 = Highly unsatisfactory, Serious problems		

DETAILED ASSESSMENT BY PROJECT

D1 : POVERTY REDUCTION

PROJECT PERFORMANCE CRITERIA		
Indicators	Previous Report	This report
A Loan Conditions		
Compliance with Conditions Precedent to Effectiveness	3	3
Compliance with General Conditions	2	2
Compliance with other conditions	2	3
B Procurement of Goods and Services		
Procurement of Consultancy Services	2.5	2
Procurement of Goods and Works	3	3
C Financial Performance		
Availability of Foreign Exchange	3	3
Availability of Local Currency	3	3
Disbursement Flow	3	3
Cost Management	2	2
Performance of Cofinanciers	3	3
D Activities and Outputs		
Adherence to Implementation Schedule	2	2
Performance of Assistants or Technical Assistants	3	3
Performance of Contractors	-	-
Performance of Project Management	2	3
E Development Impact		
Likelihood of Achieving Project Objectives	2	3
Likelihood of Sustaining Benefits beyond the Project Investment Phase	2	3
Project Contribution to Capacity Building	3	3
Expected Rate of Return	-	-
F Overall Assessment		
At present	2.53	2.8
Trend over time	3	2.6
Key :		
3 = Highly satisfactory		
2 = Satisfactory, Occasional problems		
1 = Unsatisfactory, Bank should monitor closely		
0 = Highly unsatisfactory, Serious problems		

DETAILED ASSESSMENT BY PROJECT

D2 : SUPPORT PROJECT TO THE HEALTH AND SOCIAL AFFAIRS MASTER PLAN (PAPDSAS)

PROJECT PERFORMANCE CRITERIA		
Indicators	Previous report	This report
A Loan Conditions		
Compliance with Conditions Precedent to Effectiveness	2	2
Compliance with General Conditions	2	2
Compliance with other conditions	2	2
B Procurement of Goods and Services		
Procurement of Consultancy Services	2	2
Procurement of Goods and Works	2	1
C Financial Performance		
Availability of Foreign Exchange	3	2
Availability of Local Currency	-	2
Disbursement Flow	2	2
Cost Management	-	2
Performance of Cofinanciers	3	2
D Activities and Outputs		
Adherence to Implementation Schedule	2	1
Performance of Assistants or Technical Assistants	-	2
Performance of Contractors	-	1
Performance of Project Management	2	2
E Development Impact		
Likelihood of Achieving Project Objectives	3	3
Likelihood of Sustaining Benefits beyond the Project	-	3
Investment Phase	-	3
Project Contribution to Capacity Building	2.5	2
Expected Rate of Return	-	-
F Overall Assessment		
At present	2.30	2,0
Trend over time	3	2.1
Key :		
3 = Highly satisfactory		
2 = Satisfactory, Occasional problems		
1 = Unsatisfactory, Bank should monitor closely		
0 = Highly unsatisfactory, Serious problems		

DETAILED ASSESSMENT BY PROJECT

D3 : EDUCATIONAL SYSTEM DEVELOPMENT SUPPORT PROJECT (PADSE)

PROJECT PERFORMANCE CRITERIA		
Indicators	Previous Report	This report
A Loan Conditions		
Compliance with Conditions Precedent to Effectiveness	2	2
Compliance with General Conditions	2	3
Compliance with other conditions	2	2
B Procurement of Goods and Services		
Procurement of Consultancy Services	-	2
Procurement of Goods and Works	-	2
C Financial Performance		
Availability of Foreign Exchange	2	2
Availability of Local Currency	2	2
Disbursement Flow	2	1
Cost Management	-	2
Performance of Cofinanciers	-	-
D Activities and Outputs		
Adherence to Implementation schedule	2	1
Performance of Assistants or Technical Assistants	-	2
Performance of Contractors	-	1
Performance of Project Management	2	1
E Development Impact		
Likelihood of attaining Project Objectives	2	1
Likelihood of Sustaining Benefits beyond the Project Investment Phase	2	2
Project Contribution to Capacity Building	2	3
Expected Rate of Return	-	-
F Overall Assessment		
At present	2.00	1.8
Trend over time	3	1.9
Key :		
3 = Highly satisfactory		
2 = Satisfactory, Occasional problems		
1 = Unsatisfactory, Bank should monitor closely		
0 = Highly unsatisfactory, Serious problems		

DETAILED ASSESSMENT BY PROJECT

**D4. : SUPPORT PROJECT TO THE EDUCATIONAL SYSTEM DECADE
DEVELOPMENT PR**

PROJECT PERFORMANCE CRITERIA		
Indicators	Previous report	This report
A Loan Conditions		
Compliance with Conditions Precedent to Effectiveness	-	3
Compliance with General Conditions	-	3
Compliance with other conditions	-	2
B Procurement of Goods and Services		
Procurement of Consultancy Services		2
Procurement of Goods and Works		1
C Financial Performance		
Availability of Foreign Exchange	-	2
Availability of Local Currency	-	2
Disbursement Flow	-	2
Cost Management	-	1
Performance of Cofinanciers	-	-
D Activities and Outputs		
Adherence to Implementation schedule	-	1
Performance of Assistants or Technical Assistants	-	1
Performance of Contractors	-	-
Performance of Project Management	-	2
E Development Impact		
Likelihood of Achieving Project Objectives	-	2
Likelihood of Sustaining Benefits beyond the Project Investment Phase	-	2
Project Contribution to Capacity Building	-	2
Expected Rate of Return	-	-
F Overall Assessment		
At present	-	1.9
Trend over time	-	1.9
Key :		
3 = Highly satisfactory		
2 = Satisfactory, Occasional problems		
1 = Unsatisfactory, Bank should monitor closely		
0 = Highly unsatisfactory, Serious problems		

DETAILED ASSESSMENT BY PROJECT

E1. : MULTISECTOR INSTITUTIONAL SUPPORT PROGRAMME (PAIM)

PROJECT PERFORMANCE CTITERIA		
Indicators	Previous reports	This report
A Loan Conditions		
Compliance with Conditions Precedent to Effectiveness	3	3
Compliance with General Conditions	2	1
Compliance with other conditions	-	1
B Procurement of Goods and Services		
Procurement of Consultancy Services	2	2
Procurement of Goods and Works	-	1
C Financial Performance		
Availability of Foreign Exchange	3	3
Availability of Local Currency	3	3
Disbursement Flows	0	2
Cost Management	-	2
Performance of Cofinanciers	-	3
D Activities and Outputs		
Adherence to Implementation schedule	2	1
Performance of Assistants or Technical Assistants	-	1
Performance of Contractors	-	-
Performance of Project Management	2	2
E Development Impact		
Likelihood of Achieving Project Objectives	3	2
Likelihood of Sustaining Benefits beyond the Project Investment Phase	-	3
Project Contribution to Institutional Capacity Building	3	2
Expected Rate of Return	-	-
F Overall Assessment		
At present	2.30	2.0
Trend over time	-	2.1
Key :		
3 = Highly satisfactory		
2 = Satisfactory, Occasional problems		
1 = Unsatisfactory, Bank should monitor closely		
0 = Highly unsatisfactory, Serious problems		

SUMMARY OF PERFORMANCE EVALUATION BY SECTOR AND BY PROJECT

Indicator	Loan Conditions	Procurement of Goods and Services	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Impact	Overall Assessment
AGRICULTURE AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT						
<i>Fisheries Sector Support Programme</i>						
Rating	2.2	2.0	2.0	1.5	1.5	1.8
<i>Artisanal Fisheries Project (Phase II)</i>						
Rating	2.7	2.5	2.8	2.8	2.7	2.7
<i>Livestock Development and Range Management Development Project</i>						
Rating	2.3	1.5	2.4	1.8	2.0	2.0
<i>Food Security Programme</i>						
Rating	1.5	1.5	2.0	1.5	2.0	1.8
Overall sector evaluation						
Rating	2.2	1.9	2.3	1.9	2.0	2.1
TRANSPORT						
<i>Rosso-Boghé Road Project</i>						
Rating	2.3	1.5	1.4	1.0	2.0	1.6
Overall sector evaluation						
Rating	2.3	1.5	1.4	1.0	2.0	1.6
COLLECTIVE FACILITIES – WATER						
<i>Nouakchott DWS Project</i>						
Rating	2.0	-	-	1.0	-	1.5
Overall sector assessment						
Rating	2.0	-	-	1.0	-	1.5

Indicator	Loan Conditions	Procurement of Goods and Services	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Impact	Overall Assessment
SOCIAL						
<i>Poverty Reduction Project</i>						
Rating	2.7	2.5	2.8	2.7	3.0	2.8
<i>Support Programme to the Health and Social Affairs Master Plan (PAPDSAS)</i>						
Rating	2.0	1.5	2.0	1.5	2.7	2.0
<i>Educational System Development Support Project (PADSE)</i>						
Rating	2.3	2.0	1.8	1.3	2.0	1.8
<i>Support Project to the Educational System Development Decade Programme (PAPDDSE)</i>						
Rating	2.7	1.5	1.8	1.3	2.0	1.9
Overall sector assessment						
Rating	2.4	1.9	2.1	1.7	2.4	2.1

MULTISECTOR						
<i>Multisector institutional support project</i>						
Rating	1.7	1.5	2.6	1.3	2.3	2.0
Overall sector assessment						
Rating	1.7	1.5	2.6	1.3	2.3	2.0

OVERALL PORTFOLIO ASSESSMENT						
Indicator	Loans conditions	Procurement of Goods and Services	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Impact	Overall Assessment
Rating	2.2	1.8	2.2	1.6	2.2	2.0

**MAURITANIA : 2004 PORTFOLIO REVIEW
MATRIX OF GENERAL FOLLOW –UP MEASURES**

Problems identified	Measures to be Taken	Deadline	Responsibility
Slippage on loan and grant effectiveness	Discuss conditions since preparation and implement them rapidly to avoid these becoming a sticking point.	Effectiveness no later than 3 months after signature	- ADB - MAED Technical Ministries concerned
Payment periods are often long	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Document payment claims properly - Verify that claims are in conformity with the contract clauses before submitting them to the Bank - Submit list of payments more than two months overdue regularly to the Bank <p>Adhere to the Bank's time frame for processing of disbursements requests</p> <p>Submit regular updated contacts within the Bank to the Mauritanian authorities (organization charts, task managers, contact information)</p>	Maximum 1 month	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Project Implementation Unit - ADB
Absence / delays in the submission of audit reports	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Comply with the obligation to submit audit reports - Speed up consideration of requests for non-objection on tenders Initiate the process of recruiting consulting audit firms and commission the audit <p>Initiate procedures for recruitment of the audit firms and commission the audits.</p> <p>Submit audit reports to the Bank (one management chart showing, for each Bank-funded project, the fiscal year-ends, type of procurement chosen, and the deadlines for initiating the selection procedure for external auditors).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 3months after close of financial year. <p>Within 6 months of fiscal year-end</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Project Implementation Unit - ADB - Project Implementation Unit

Problems Identified	Measures to be Taken	Deadline	Responsibility
Absence of / delays on quarterly status reports	- Submit quarterly status reports to ADB, and copy MAED	- 1 month following the quarter covered by the report	- Project Implementation Unit
Absence / delay in the submission of works completion reports	- Submit regular works completion reports to ADB, and copy MAED.	- No later than 6 months after project completion	- Project Implementation Unit

**MAURITANIA : 2004 PORTFOLIO REVIEW
MATRIX OF SPECIFIC MEASURES**

Projects	Problems Identified	Measures to be Taken	Responsibility	Deadline
Fishery Sector Support Project	Project completed	Finalize and submit project completion report to the Bank. Make necessary arrangements for a donors meeting to mobilize funding for the new Tanit project.	Ministry of Rural Development and Environment	January 2005 Ongoing
Artisanal Fisheries Development Project (II)	Recruit an auditor for 2004 financial year.	Take necessary measures to conduct the audit of project accounts for 2004, and submit documents requesting the Bank's non-objection to the ADB.	Ministry of Rural Development and Environment	January 2005
Livestock Development and Range Management Project	Ignorance of Bank rules of procurement.	- Ensure strict conformity with ADB rules for procurement of goods and services. - Improve the quality of technical and financial evaluation of bids.	Ministry of Rural Development and Environment	Continuous action
	Inadequate monitoring of works implementation.	Prepare implementation reports that show quantities and percentage implementation for each activity.	Ministry of Rural Development and Environment	Continuous action
			ADB	Continuous action
	Slippage on implementation of activities.	- For the Bank : take every necessary step to expedite processing of documents for procurements of goods and services for the project. - For the project : anticipate all possible procurements under the project to reduce the delays noted .	Ministry of Rural Development and Environment	Continuous action Continuous action

Projects	Problems identified	Measures to be Taken	Responsibility	Deadline
Food Security Programme (PSA)	Failure by FAO to submit regular activity reports and audit reports to the Bank.	FAO should submit to the Bank, as quickly as possible, the audit reports for fiscal years 2002 and 2003 ; and the implementation unit should submit the activity reports.	FAO	1st quarter 2005
	Delays caused by FAO administrative procedures for procurement of goods and services	FAO should act urgently to accelerate project implementation.	FAO	Continuous action
	Initial closing date unrealistic in light of activities that are still pending	Submit a request to the Bank for an extension on the non-objection grant	Ministry of Rural Development and Environment	31 December 2004
Rosso-Boghé Road Project	Disparity in the works contract estimates and those of the technical study	- Administration to monitor those headings where quantities were exceeded, pending availability of the complete working drawing.	Ministry of Infrastructure and Transport	1st quarter 2005
	Funding for the EU segment of the works no longer available	- The Bank should dispatch a mission if necessary. - Seek funding from other donors for the rehabilitation of the Nouakchott-Rosso segment.	Ministry of Infrastructure and Transport	Continuous action
	Insufficient project oversight by Administration	- Centralize coordination by combining the responsibilities of the coordinator, who should be available exclusively for the project.		Continuous action
	Slippage on implementation	- Timely preparation of document monitoring documents (BD, progress reports, annual work programme, etc.). - Review the BD for the reconstruction of schools and rehabilitation of boreholes. - Finalize and sign the contract with NGO associations to conduct awareness raising and project socio-economic impact assessment within the affected communities.	Ministry of Infrastructure and Transport	1st quarter 2005

Projects	Problems identified	Measures to be Taken	Responsibility	Deadline
Nouakchott DWS Project	Slippage on the effective start-up of activities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Accelerate establishment of the implementation unit and discuss problems before project start-up. - Take measures to coordinate the activities of donors. 	Ministry of Water Resources and Energy	December 2004
Poverty Reduction Project	<p>2001, 2002 and 2003 audit of accounts has still not been conducted</p> <p>Financial audits of the microfinance institutions have never been conducted owing to financial constraints.</p> <p>Balance remaining after project completion.</p>	<p>Take immediate action to conduct outstanding audits (the consultation mission to the Mauritanian authorities in September 2004 emphasized that all measures to this effect must be taken by 30 November 2004)</p> <p>Mobilize funds needed for the audit of the financial statements of the MFIs no later than by 31 December 2004. The matter has been brought to the attention of the Government but no response is forthcoming. It will be discussed during the project completion mission, scheduled for 2005.</p> <p>A request for cancellation of the balance (13,414 UA) is under consideration at the Bank. It will be discussed at the project completion meeting, scheduled for 2005.</p>	<p>CDHLPI</p> <p>CDHLPI</p> <p>ADB</p>	<p>January 2005</p> <p>January 2005</p> <p>January 2005</p>

Projects	Problems identified	Measures to be Taken	Responsible agency	Deadline
Support programme to the Health and Social Affairs Master Plan (PAPDSAS)	Inadequate planning	Prepare and implement the 2 nd MTEF Santé (2005-2007) which should fin-tune the planning and monitoring instruments. The Annual Health Operational Plan should be submitted to the bank for consideration.	Ministry of Health and Social Affairs	January 2005
	Bank not involved in the planning and review of objectives of the PAPDSAS	The Bank should be represented at annual reviews.	ADB	Continuous action
	Delays in the implementation of engineering studies and civil works	Use the studies and civil works as soon as possible. Government should request an extension (1 an) to enable it implement priorities under MSAS.	Ministry of Health and Social Affairs	1st quarter 2005
	Lack of coordination between DGI and WHO	The Planning, Cooperation and Statistics Directorate should be responsible for technical coordination of needs expressed by the expense centres, verify their appropriateness relative to the planning of the MSAS before forwarding them to WHO. The Bank should establish an implementation schedule for tasks delegated to WHO and adhere strictly to this schedule.	Ministry of Health and Social Affairs	1st quarter 2005
	Absence of a maintenance policy	Carry out maintenance of structures and equipment financed under the Programme to ensure sustainability of rehabilitated and new infrastructure.	Ministry of Health and Social Affairs	Continuous action
	Late submission of quarterly activity reports; non-conformity of documents	Adhere to the deadlines for submission of status reports and comply with the relevant Bank procedures and format.	Ministry of Health and Social Affairs	

Projects	Problems identified	Measures to be Taken	Responsibility	Deadline
Education System Development Support Project (PADSE)	Slow take-off of activities (literacy, FASF and training)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Contact UNESCO again to finalize the recruitment of the consultant to prepare the literacy campaigns. - Send a concerted proposal to the Bank on new orientations for the FASF, the revised FASF Manual of Procedures, and documents on consultation for the AO regarding recruitment of a consultant to design, implement and evaluate the results of the FASF. 	Ministry of Education	1st quarter 2005
	Delays in the implementation of activities under AMEXTIPE	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Send the BD for procurement of teaching materials for each literacy campaign to the Bank. - Submit evaluation reports on the trainings conducted to the Bank. 	Ministry of Education	1st quarter 2005 Continuous action
	Slippages in the implementation of certain goods contracts (classroom furniture for the basic schools)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Take up the matter of the Rosso College with the national AO. Conduct a fresh tender for the construction of Rosso College. - Comply strictly with Bank procurement procedures to avoid delaying the signing and launching of contracts - Reinvite bids for the procurement of classroom furniture for the basic schools in conformity with approved BD - Comply with Bank procurement procedures. 	Ministry of Education	1st quarter 2005 Continuous action

Projects	Problems identified	Measures to be Taken	Responsibility	Deadline
<p>Support to the Education System Development Decade Programme (PAPDDSE)</p>	<p>Delay in the provision of the Scientific Research Support Fund (FARS)</p> <p>Extremely high estimated construction costs for ISET</p> <p>Organization of training activities for teachers in higher education is behind schedule.</p>	<p>The administrative order establishing FARS was submitted to the Bank in June 2004. The revised manual of procedures needs to be sent, and should include the observations of the ADF and IDA.</p> <p>Review the cost estimate for the ISET construction works, which is crucial for the commencement of rehabilitation and construction works.</p> <p>Submit to the Bank documents on consultations for recruitment of a consultant to prepare and implement training programmes for strengthening management, planning and budget programming in the training institutes.</p>	<p>Ministry of Education</p> <p>Ministry of Education</p> <p>Ministry of Education</p>	<p>February 2005</p> <p>Continuous action</p> <p>February 2005</p>
<p>Multisector Institutional Support Project (PAIM)</p>	<p>Prolonged delays in the take-off of training and computerization-related activities at MAED.</p> <p>Considerable slippage on the start up of training and computerization activities at the MAED</p> <p>Delay in the submission of status and audit reports</p>	<p>Organize the training of staff of the MAED and computerization of its departments, in accordance with the last implementation schedule adopted.</p> <p>- Submit project activity reports within the allotted timeframe.</p> <p>- Conduct the audits for 2001, 2002 and 2003 financial years.</p>	<p>Ministry of Economic Affairs and Development</p> <p>Ministry of Economic Affairs and Development</p>	<p>Continuous action</p> <p>Continuous action</p> <p>January 2005</p>

MATRIX OF COMMON PROBLEMS

	P1	P2	P3	P4	P5	P6	P7	P8	P9	P10	P11
Slippage on effectiveness	X						X	X	X		
Slippage on implementation	X		X	X	X	X		X	X	X	X
Poor mobilization of counterpart funds		X	X								
Irregular submission of quarterly reports				X				X			X
Irregular submission of audit reports				X			X	X			X
Weakness of project accounting services											
Problems of communication with the Bank				X			X				X
Procurement delays	X			X	X	X			X		X
Delays in processing of Bank files						X	X				X
Suspension of disbursements											
Weak management capacity of project management				X	X	X			X		

List of Ongoing Operations

- P1 : Fishery Sector Support programme
- P2 : Artisanal Fisheries Project (Phase II)
- P3 : Livestock Development and Range Management Project
- P4 : Food Security Programme
- P5 : Rosso-Boghé Road Project
- P6 : Nouakchott DWS Project
- P7 : Poverty Reduction Project
- P8 : Support Programme to the Health and Social Affairs Master Plan Support Project
- P9 : Education System Development Support Project
- P10 : Support Project to the Education System Development Decade Programme
- P11 : Multisector Institutional Support Project

MATRIX OF CROSSCUTTING ISSUES

	P1	P2	P3	P4	P5	P6	P7	P8	P9	P10	P11
Environment	X	X	X	X	X	X		X	X	X	
Gender issues	X	X			X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Poverty reduction	X	X	X	X		X	X	X	X	X	
Micro-Credit	X	X					X				
Population issues			X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Participation	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Regional integration					X						

List of ongoing operations

- P1 : Fishery Sector Support Programme
- P2 : Artisanal Fisheries Project (Phase II)
- P3 : Livestock Development and Range Management Development Project
- P4 : Food Security Programme
- P5 : Rosso-Boghé Road Project
- P6 : Nouakchott DWS Project
- P7 : Poverty Reduction Project
- P8 : Support Project to the Health and Social Affairs Master Plan
- P9 : Education System Development Support Project
- P10 : Support Project to the Education System Decade Development Programme
- P11 : Multisector Institutional Development Support Project