

AFRICAN DEVELOPMENT FUND



TOGO

PORTFOLIO REVIEW REPORT

**COUNTRY OPERATIONS DEPARTMENT
WEST REGION**

FEBRUARY 2001

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Pages
Executive Summary	i-ii
1. INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Objectives, Structure and Contents of the Report	1
1.2 Scope and Composition of the Portfolio	1
2. REVIEW OF ONGOING OPERATIONS	1
2.1 Review of Ongoing Operations by Sector	1
2.2 Aging and Potentially Problematic Projects	13
2.3 Assessment of the Frequency and Quality of Supervision	14
2.4 Crosscutting Themes	14
2.5 Overall Portfolio Performance Assessment	15
2.6 Disbursements	16
3. ASSESSMENT OF PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION AND MANAGEMENT CAPACITY	16
3.1 Performance of the Government and Executing Agencies	16
3.2 Bank Performance	17
4. COORDINATION WITH OTHER DONORS	17
4.1 Assessment of the Government's Capacity to Coordinate External Assistance	17
4.2 Assessment of the Bank's Capacity to Coordinate its Assistance with other Donors	17
4.3 Assessment of the Impact of Other Donors in Cofinanced Projects	18
5. LOAN REPAYMENTS	18
6. PORTFOLIO MANAGEMENT	18
6.1 Potential Problems and Recommended Solutions	18
6.2 Plan of Action to Improve Portfolio Performance	18
6.3 Lessons Learnt for Future Portfolio Reviews and CSPs	18
7. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	19

7.1	Conclusions	19
7.2	Recommendations	20

LIST OF ANNEXES

	<u>Number of Pages</u>
I. Table of Bank Group Commitments in Togo	2
II. List of Completed Projects in Togo	1
III. List of Completed Projects in Togo by Sector	1
IV. Summary of Ongoing Operations	1
V. Overall Portfolio Performance Assessment	1
VI. Project Briefs of Ongoing Projects	6
VII. Plan of Action to Improve the Portfolio	6
VIII. Matrix of Common Problems	1
IX. Matrix of Crosscutting Issues	1
X. Analysis of Project Status and Development Objectives	1

This Portfolio Review Report was prepared by the Togo Team comprising Messrs: G.E. GNIKPINGO, Principal Economist in OCDW.2, G. BAYEMI, Education Expert in OCDW.5 and K.Z. NYAKI, Transport Engineer in OCDW.6, following a mission to Togo from 1 to 12 October 2000. The following people contributed to the preparation of the Review Report Messrs. : N. KACEM, Agricultural Economist, OCDW.4, E. PORGO, Principal Education Expert, OCDW.5, Mrs. N. LAMBION, Health Expert, OCDW.5 and Mr. H. ALVES, Sanitary Engineer, OCDW.6. Further information may be obtained from Mr. E.G. TAYLOR-LEWIS, Director, OCDW, Extension 4041, Mr. M. AMDISS, Division Manager, OCDW.2, Extension 4134, E. DOTE, Ag. Division Manager, OCDW.4, R. CRESSMAN, Division Manager, OCDW.5, Extension 4112, H. KAMOUN, Division Manager, OCDW.6, Extension 4293.

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

\$US	:	United States Dollar
ADB	:	African Development Bank
ADF	:	African Development Fund
AFD	:	Agence française de développement
AIDS	:	Acquired Immuno-Deficiency Syndrome
BCEAO	:	Central Bank of West African States
BTD	:	Banque togolaise de développement
CEB	:	Communauté électrique du Bénin
CEET	:	Compagnie d'eau et d'électricité du Togo
CET	:	Technical Secondary School
CFA.F	:	Franc of the African Financial Community
CHR	:	Centre hospitalier régional (Regional Hospital)
CIDA	:	Canadian International Development Agency
CIF	:	Cost, insurance and freight
CIMAO	:	Cimenterie de l'Afrique de l'Ouest (West African Cement Works)
CIT	:	Centre togolais d'investissement (Togolese Investment Centre)
CRETFP	:	Centre régional de l'enseignement technique et de la formation professionnelle (Regional Technical Education and Vocational Training Centre)
DIVAE	:	Division d'assistance aux entreprises (Division for Assistance to Enterprises)
DJC	:	Donors' Joint Committee
ECOWAS	:	Economic Community of West African States
EIB	:	European Investment Bank
EPIU	:	Education Project Implementation Unit
ERSP	:	Economic Recovery Support Programme
ETRU	:	Teacher Training and Retraining Unit
EU	:	European Union
GCI.IV:	Fourth	General Capital Increase of ADB
GDP	:	Gross Domestic Product
HA	:	Hectare
IMF	:	International Monetary Fund
MUA	:	Million UA
NEAP	:	National Environmental Action Plan
NTF	:	Nigeria Trust Fund
OPTT	:	Office des postes et des télécommunications du Togo
OTP	:	Office togolais de phosphate (Togolese Phosphate Board)
PIU	:	Project Implementation Unit
PW	:	Public Works
SAP	:	Structural Adjustment Programme
SBEE	:	Société béninoise d'eau et d'électricité
SDA	:	Social Dimension of Adjustment
SDR	:	Special Drawing Rights
SME	:	Small and Medium-Size Enterprises

SMI	:	Small and Medium-Size Industries
T	:	Tonne
UA	:	ADB Unit of Account
UNDP	:	United Nations Development Programme
UNICEF	:	United Nations International Children's Fund
USAID	:	United States Agency for International Development
WAEMU	:	West African Economic and Monetary Union
WHO	:	World Health Organization

CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS
(AS AT 30 SEPTEMBER 2000)

UA 1 = US\$ 1.30480

UA 1 = Euro 1.46508

UA 1 = CFA.F 961.029

US\$ 1 = CFA.F 736.534

Euro 1 = CFA.F 655.957

Executive Summary

1. The last Bank Group Portfolio Review Report for Togo was presented in June 1996, ref. ADB /BD/WP/96/73, ADF/BD/WP/96/48. This report was prepared on the basis of the findings of the Bank's portfolio review mission to Togo from 1 to 12 October 2000 and the different supervision reports. Its objective is to review ongoing Bank-financed operations in order to speed up their implementation with the goal of improving the portfolio performance.
2. The Bank's portfolio in Togo of 6 ongoing projects comprises 3 in the social sector, 1 in the transport sector, 1 in the public utilities sector and 1 in the multisector. Three (3) of the six (6) projects, one of which is expected to be completed in June 2001, and two (2) in December 2001, are nearing completion. The entire portfolio was supervised in 1999, and in 2000, with the exception of the Study on Lome Sanitation and DWS in Twenty (20) Secondary Centres. The total amount of disbursements for those ongoing projects, as at 30 September 2000, was UA 14.24 million, for total commitments, net of cancellations, of UA 42.01 million, i.e. a disbursement rate of 34%. Following the lifting of sanctions for arrears in November 2000, the disbursement rate rose to 42.2% in December 2000.
3. Togo's portfolio is small, and comprises six (6) projects, 16.7% of which have problems compared with 11% for the Bank; 50% are potentially risky compared with 48% for the Bank. 39% of the projects in the portfolio are experiencing problems. The October 2000 operations review indicated that the Bank's portfolio performance in Togo was satisfactory with a score of 1.8 owing to arrears which affected project implementation, the suspension of disbursements since February 1999 on the Health Project Loan because of the operational audit, and the non start-up of a study in the public utilities sector. The score for the three (3) projects (50% of the portfolio) was 2.6. The frequency of monitoring and supervision missions over the last five years has made it possible to implement the recommendations of the last portfolio review report in 1996. Furthermore, the technical capacity of, and mastery of the Bank's rules of procedure by most of the Togolese Executing Agencies, have contributed to this satisfactory portfolio performance. However, the efforts to improve the portfolio must be pursued, not only in respect of monitoring, but also with regard to the implementation of the Bank-financed operations.
4. From the institutional standpoint, Bank-financed projects are monitored by the supervising Ministries, and coordinated by the Planning Coordination Directorate of the Ministry of Planning, Regional Development, Housing and Urbanism. This Directorate is responsible for the overall management of the entire portfolio, in particular issues concerning requests for project financing, the effectiveness of loans related to Bank-financed projects, disbursements, the submission of status and audit reports, and the repayment of Bank loans. This Directorate has a staff member responsible for Bank Group projects, who also coordinates field missions. Overall, this monitoring improved significantly from 1996 to 2000, except in the case of the study on Sanitation and DWS in Twenty (20) Secondary Centres, which was not initiated or supervised from 1998 to 2000, which explains the slippage on its effectiveness. Further progress must be made regarding adherence to project implementation schedules and familiarity with the Bank's rules and procedures by project executing agencies. In view of the public finance difficulties and governance problems which led to the suspension of cooperation with donors in 1998/1999, Togo often falls under sanction and disburses its

contribution to project financing with considerable delay. This situation is due to the poor performances in respect of activities and output, as well as regarding the project financial performance, whereas the project development objective is generally satisfactory. Efforts must, therefore, be made regarding project implementation, especially with regard to loan effectiveness where slippage of 6 to 12 months has been noted, as well as the submission of audit and status reports, which has been irregular.

5 There are six ongoing projects, as in the 1996 Review Report, but the total commitments of UA 42.01 million only represents 29% of the total compared with 40% in 1996 for commitments of UA 47.6 million. The average age of the portfolio rose from five to six years in 2000 and to 9 if projects approved in 1998 and 1999, which are not yet effective, or for which disbursements have not been released because of arrears, are excluded. It should be noted that one of the aging projects, the Project for Institutional Support to the Ministry of Planning, will be completed at the end of June 2001, and appropriate measures are planned to improve the management of the other aging projects in order to completed them by 31 December 2001. While the number of active projects is six, the 2000 review concerned 7 projects, including the East Mono Rural Development Project, which has not yet been formally approved by the Boards because of arrears, but has been discussed with the Togolese Authorities to demonstrate the need to ensure the rapid settlement of arrears.

6 The review mission identified two problem projects (the Project for the Rehabilitation of Regional Hospitals and the Strengthening of the Central Supplies Pharmacy with a rating of 1, the Lome Sanitation and DWS in Twenty (20) Secondary Centres with a rating of 1.2) and one potentially problematic project (the Lome-Notse Road Rehabilitation Project with a rating of 1.6) which require special monitoring by the Bank. The activities should concern: improved quality of dialogue between the Bank and Executing Agencies by beefing up supervision missions; the organization of seminars and working trips to the Bank's Headquarters; the systematic fielding of launching missions for all newly-approved projects; cancellation of loan balances for projects which have been completed or are about to be closed; a more adequate assessment of the costs and implementation periods of Bank-financed projects and the rapid replacement of promoted project leaders to prevent their new functions from affecting project implementation.

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Objectives, Structure and Contents of the Report

The last Bank Group Portfolio Review Report for Togo was presented on 10 June 1996, ref. ADB /BD/WP/96/73, ADF/BD/WP/96/48. This report was prepared on the basis of the findings of the Bank's portfolio review mission to Togo from 1 to 12 October 2000 and the different supervision reports. Its objective is to review ongoing Bank-financed projects with a view to speeding up their implementation with the goal of improving the performance of the portfolio. Following a brief presentation of the scope and composition of the portfolio, the report reviews the six ongoing operations. It then assesses the project implementation capacity and the capacity of the Government and the Bank to coordinate Togo's external assistance. Finally, it focuses on an assessment of the management of the portfolio.

1.2 Scope and Composition of the Portfolio.

Overview of the Portfolio

1.2.1 As at 31 December 2000, the Bank had financed 25 operations in Togo, comprising 17 projects, 3 Structural Adjustment Programmes, 1 Institutional Support Project for the Ministry of Planning and 4 studies. Total commitments, net of cancellations, stood at UA 145.35 million. 19 of the 25 operations are completed. Total disbursements, net of cancellations, stood at UA 111.90 million, i.e. a disbursement rate of 82%. However, this relatively high disbursement rate also reflects the high number of completed projects.

1.2.2 As indicated in Table 1 below, the beneficiary sectors are transport (32% of total commitments), the multisector (29 %), the social sector (27 %), public utilities (7%), and industry and banking (5 %).

Table 1
Breakdown of the Bank's Operations
Approved by Sector as at 31 December 2000 (in million UA)

Sectors	Number of Operations	Amounts Approved (net of cancellations)	% of the Total	Amounts Disbursed	% Disbursed
Transport	8	43.41	32	33.32	77
Multisector	4	39.28	29	39	99
Social	7	37.51	27	24.7	66
Public Utilities	3	9.39	7	7.26	77
Industry and Banking	3	7.52	5	7.52	100
Agriculture	0	0	0	0	0
TOTAL	25	137.11	100	111.90	82

2. REVIEW OF ONGOING OPERATIONS

2.1 Review of Ongoing Operations by Sector

2.1.1 In 2000, the Bank's portfolio in Togo of six (6) ongoing operations comprised 1 in the transport sector, 1 in public utilities, 3 in the social sector and 1 project for Institutional Support

to the Ministry of Planning. The six operations were broken down as follows: the social sector (61.58%), the transport sector (29%), the multisector (6.57%) and public utilities (2.86%) as indicated in Table 2.

2.1.2 The entire portfolio was supervised from 1996 to 2000 with the exception of the Health Project in 2000 with a supervision rate of 1 per year. Total disbursements for those projects, as at 30 September 2000, were UA 14.24 million, for total commitments, net of cancellations, of UA 42.01 million, i.e. a disbursement rate of 33.89%. Following the lifting of sanctions in November 2000, the amount disbursed reached 42.18%, as at 31 December 2000.

Table 2
Ongoing Projects by Sector
As at 31 December 2000

Sectors	Number of Operations	Net Commitments/*	Sectoral Breakdown (%)	Amounts Disbursed/*	% Disbursed
Transport	1	12.18	28.99	2.09	17.160
Public Utilities	1	1.2	2.86	0	0
Social	3	25.87	61.58	13.05	50.44
Policy-based Lending	1	2.76	6.57	2.58	93.48
Total	6	42.01	100	17.72	42.18

*/ In million UA

A - Social Sector

2.1.3 From 1972 to 10 October 2000, the Bank Group financed five (5) projects and studies, comprising two (2) projects in the health sector, two (2) projects in the education sector and one study in the population sector, which were awarded six (6) loans and one grant for a total amount of UA 37.51 million, net of cancellations. These commitments amounted to UA 1.96 million from ADB resources, UA 24.81 million from ADF resources and UA 4.45 million from NTF resources. The balances on cancelled loans amount to UA 6.09 million, including UA 6 million on the NTF loans for the Project for the Strengthening of Regional Hospitals and the Central Supplies Pharmacy. Two projects have been completed, namely the Construction and Equipping of Junior Secondary Technical Schools and the Project for the Construction and Equipping of the Lome Teaching Hospital. The three ongoing projects which are the subject of this review are: (i) the Project for the Strengthening of the Regional Hospitals and the Central Supplies Pharmacy; (ii) Education Project II and (iii) the Population Sector Study.

A.1 Project for the Rehabilitation of Regional Hospitals and the Strengthening of the Central Supplies Pharmacy

<u>Loan Amount:</u> UA 13.82 million No F/TOGO/REH-SAN/92/13 <u>Amount Cancelled:</u> UA 6 million (NTF)	<u>Initial Project Cost:</u> UA 22.07 million <u>Revised Cost:</u> UA 15.33 million <u>Sources :</u> ADF: UA 13.82 million <u>Government :</u> UA 1.51 million	<u>Amount Disbursed:</u> UA 5.74 million (41.5%) <u>Balance:</u> UA 8.08 million (58.5%)
<u>Approval Date:</u> 27/11/91	<u>Signature Date:</u> 13/05/92	<u>Effectiveness Date:</u> 02/09/1993
<u>Deadline for Final Disbursement:</u> 31/12/1999	<u>Executing Agency:</u> PIU at the Ministry of Health.	
<u>Audit of Accounts:</u> conducted until December 1998 <u>Date of Last Supervision Mission:</u> February 1999	<u>Status Reports:</u> Activity reports are submitted regularly to the Bank. The last report submitted at the end of June 2000, concerns the first quarter of 2000.	
<u>Project Objectives:</u> The project aims to improve the Government pharmaceutical supplies sector by providing the population of Togo with essential drugs and medical equipment at least cost. It also aims to improve health care delivery at regional level, to ensure ongoing maintenance of equipment and facilities and improve the control of AIDS and STD.		
<u>Project Description:</u> The project, initially expected to be implemented over a 48-month period, comprises the following five components: (i) strengthening of the country's pharmaceutical supplies and supply of essential drugs sector; (ii) rehabilitation of hospital facilities of 5 CHR (Atakpame, Dapaong, Kara, Sokode and Tsevie) ; (iii) establishment of a National Hospital Infrastructure and Equipment Maintenance Service at the Ministry; (iv) support to the National AIDS/STD Control Committee; and (v) Project Implementation Unit (PIU)		

2.1.4 Compliance with Conditions: the ADF loan became effective two years after its approval and sixteen (16) months after signature, which represents considerable slippage. Most of the conditions precedent were only fulfilled by the Government after July 1993. The PIU has submitted regular quarterly activity reports, in conformity with the required format. The annual audit of project accounts has not been conducted regularly. The related contract was only approved by the Bank in July 1997, for the 1993-1997 period. In addition, the Government has not submitted reports on time. The audit of the 1998 financial year has been conducted. Thus, compliance with the loan conditions is unsatisfactory.

2.1.5 Procurement Performance: two consulting firms were recruited under the project, responsible for the architectural drawings and the monitoring of civil works, and technical assistance for the project. Major shortcomings have been noted by the Bank in the performance of the duties assigned to the two firms owing to a lack of rigour in the Government's monitoring. The quality of the civil works is highly unsatisfactory on all the sites, the bidding documents (BDs) for equipment are of poor quality, and the terms of reference of the experts recruited for the project are not strictly complied with. Civil works contracts were awarded in conformity with the procedures. The BDs for biomedical equipment were finalized by the Government considerably behind schedule. The Bank approved the successful bids for those procurements, but, in February 1999, requested the Government to suspend the signing of the corresponding contracts, following its noting of poor performances in all project activities. However, several contracts were signed by the Government, but not approved by the Bank. In view of the gravity of the procurement-related problems, the Bank commissioned an external audit in March 1999, the findings of which were submitted to a Committee in January 2001, which will rule on its recommendations. The procurement performance is highly unsatisfactory.

2.1.6 Financial Performance: in light of the project situation, the loan has been suspended since 1999, pending the outcome of the operational audit and the deadline for the final disbursement, set at 31/12/99, has not been extended. The current disbursement rate is 41.5% on the ADF loan. With regard to the NTF loan of UA 6 million, no disbursements were released and the loan was cancelled by the Bank in February 1999, at the Government's request, in view of the revision of

some project components (rehabilitation of infrastructure instead of new construction work). The payment of the national counterpart is irregular, which has raised serious problems for the pursuit of the civil works, covered by the Government to the tune of 27%. In light of the low disbursement rate, and the problems encountered regarding the payment of counterpart funds, the financial performance is unsatisfactory.

2.1.7 Performance of Project Activities and Outputs: the project, which started up considerably behind schedule, only really entered its implementation phase in 1995 and 1996. Some of the project components were revised following proposals by the Government during the February 1997 mission. At present, since the loan is suspended and the national counterpart not fully paid to the contractors, the civil works, which were initially due to be finalized at the end of 1998, have still not been completed and most of the work has been suspended. It should also be noted that non-contract work was carried out at the Kara CHR and disbursed without the Bank's knowledge. Following the Bank's recommendations, a regularization contract was signed by the Government, taking into consideration the additional costs. With the exception of the PIU equipment, procured right at the start up of the project, all other procurements were suspended by the Bank (biomedical equipment, furniture and office automation equipment, etc). External training governed by a Memorandum of Understanding signed with the WHO has virtually all been finalized; local training has been suspended owing to a shortage of liquid funds on the project account. This lack of liquidity is due to a delay in the request for the replenishment of the revolving fund following the imposition of sanctions on the country. The performances of consulting firms responsible for the architectural studies and works monitoring are highly unsatisfactory in respect of the quality of works, which is unsatisfactory on all the sites. Best practices were not complied with and problems arose everywhere without any appropriate reaction from the consulting firm or technical assistance. The Bank's recommendations with regard to the quality of works, and compliance with contract specifications were not followed up. The performance of activities and outputs is unsatisfactory.

2.1.8 With regard to the procurement of essential drugs and consumables, the Government has obtained the Bank's consent to negotiate directly with the IDA Foundation and the Bank has approved the provision of essential drugs and consumables for a total amount of CFA.F 2.2 billion, to be released in three successive revolving funds. Two contracts have already been approved and performed in this context, the first in February 1997 and the second in May 1998 for a total amount of CFA.F 1.2 billion. The performance of those contracts encountered major difficulties with regard to customs clearance, and several containers remained blocked at Lome Port for six (6) months. Customs demanded the payment of import duties, whereas the contract was exempted. The problem was resolved after exchanges between the Ministry of Finance and of Health. CAMEG (The Essential Generic Drugs Procurement Centre) was registered as an association, and the CA was established on the Bank's recommendations. The project technical assistance provides for the utilization of 168 staff/months over an implementation period of forty-eight (48) months. On several occasions, the Bank has noted major shortcomings in the terms of reference of the technical assistance firm, without any appropriate reaction from the PIU or the Government.

2.1.9 Development Objective: in view of the situation of the project and the suspension of all procurement activities, the attainment of the project objectives has been seriously undermined. The pursuit, or otherwise, of the project now depends on the measures to be taken by the Bank following the findings of the operational audit. Despite this situation, there were positive outcomes in the pharmaceutical sector, which received considerable support under the project for the establishment of revolving funds for Essential Generic Drugs (EGD) and the operation of CAMEG, its supplies centre. But the likelihood of achieving the development objective is slim.

2.1.10 Overall Performance Assessment: the overall project performance, assessed on the basis of the following indicators, is unsatisfactory, and is summarized as follows:

Indicator	Loan Conditions	Procurement	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Objective	Overall Assessment
Rating	1	1.5	1	0.5	1	1

A.2 EDUCATION PROJECT II

Loan Amount: UA 11.05 million No F/TOG/EDU/92/12	Project Cost: UA 12.40 million Source : ADF : UA 11.05 million Government: UA 1.35 million	Amount Disbursed: UA 6.66 million (60.24%) Balance: UA 4.39 million (39.76%)
Approval Date: 16/12/91	Signature Date : 13/05/1992	Effectiveness Date: 18/05/1993
Deadline for Final Disbursement: 30/12/2001	Executing Agencies: PIU (National Education Component) and PIU (Technical Education and Vocational Training Component)	
Audit of Accounts: the audit reports were prepared for the 1993-1997 fiscal years. Those for the 1998, 1999 and 2000 fiscal years are being conducted. Date of Last Supervision Mission: October 2000	Status Reports: In all, 50 activity reports comprising 28 for the Project Unit of the Ministry of National Education and 22 for the Project Unit of the Ministry of Technical Education and Vocational Training have been prepared and submitted for approval.	
<p><u>Objective and Description</u> : the Education Project II, planned over a four (4) year period, aims to develop on the one hand, primary education in the disadvantaged central region and, on the other, adapt Technical Education and Vocational Training to regional requirements. It also aims to encourage the enrolment of girls in Primary, Technical and Vocational Education and comprises the following components: i) improvement of the Educational System; ii) Strengthening of Primary Education; iii) Restructuring of the two CET (Dapaong et Kpalime) into Regional Technical Education and Vocational Training Centres; iv) Support for the encouragement of girls' enrolment in primary and technical education, and vocational training; and v) Project Implementation Units.</p>		

2.1.11 Compliance with Conditions: the loan became effective thirteen (13) months after signature, which is unsatisfactory. On the other hand, the other conditions were fulfilled during the implementation of the project, in particular in 1996. The quarterly activity reports have been regularly prepared and submitted to the Bank since the effective start up of activities. In fact, fifty (50) reports in all, comprising twenty-eight (28) by the Project Implementation Unit for the Ministry of Education component and 22 by the PIU for the Ministry of Technical Education and Vocational Training component have been prepared and submitted for the Bank's approval. The reports submitted by the Technical Education and Vocational Training Component require further improvements. The audit reports for the 1993-1997 fiscal years have been prepared and submitted to the Bank for consideration. The audits for the 1998 to 2000 financial years are being conducted.

2.1.12 Procurement Performance: overall, the procurement of goods, works and services has been in conformity with the Bank's rules. The construction work on the Primary Education Inspectorates (including housing), the National and Regional Directorates of Education Planning, the Directorate of Primary Education, the Regional Technical Education and Vocational Training Centres have been completed. In addition, technical assistance, training, the establishment of a maintenance system, the modular concept for vocational training, the preparation of lists of equipment and communications have been carried out in conformity with the rules of the Bank. On the other hand, failure to comply with the procedures under the bidding for the construction works on 300 classrooms led to the reissuing of invitations to bid resulting in slippage on works start up. But, on the whole, the procurement performance is satisfactory.

2.1.13 Financial Performance: the project financial performance is unsatisfactory. In fact, since loan effectiveness in May 1993, only 60.24% of the loan has been disbursed. The project is faced with the problems of sanctions on the country and public finance difficulties which prevent the release of the necessary resources for the settlement of contractors' and suppliers' invoices.

Following the settlement of arrears in November 2000, the Bank paid the totality of outstanding invoices and proceeded with the normal disbursement of the loan.

2.1.14 Performance of Project Activities and Outputs: most of the activities have been completed. In fact, the architectural drawings and engineering designs have been prepared and the 5 Primary Education Inspectorates, 5 houses, the National and Regional Education Planning Directorates and the 300 Primary Education Classrooms have been terminated; the construction work on the Primary Education Directorate and those of the CRETFDs are nearing completion. Most of the equipment has been delivered, with the exception of that for the CRETFDs, which is being procured. The furniture has also been delivered.

2.1.15 All the technical assistance (training, establishment of a maintenance system, modular concept for vocational training, preparation of lists of equipment, communication) has been provided. In all, 56 people, including the primary school inspectors, received this training instead of 19 as originally planned. These training courses have enabled all the principal parties involved in education to improve their understanding of planning techniques, the concepts of school statistics and the school map. They have helped to improve the preparation of statistical year books and ensure a more rational distribution of schools in the areas concerned through the progress made in the application of the criteria of the school map. The initial training of teachers recruited under the World Bank-financed project, but who had never received teacher training before their assignment to classes, was dispensed for 300 participants instead of the originally planned 140. The continuing training of 469 teachers, compared with an originally estimated 160, has also been completed. With regard to Technical Education and Vocational Training, the training of Directors of the CRETFPs, the training of workshop leaders and advisers has been carried out. In light of the foregoing, the performance of activities and outputs is satisfactory overall.

2.1.16 Development Objective : it is highly likely that the project will achieve its objectives if the country does not fall under sanction again and if the public finance difficulties do not prevent disbursements to contractors and suppliers. Indeed, the rehabilitation and extension works on the National and Regional Education Planning Directorates, and those concerning the Regional Directorate and Inspectorates for Primary Education have helped to improve the management of the educational system overall, as well as the control and supervision of teachers. From the standpoint of increased intake capacity, the numbers of children in primary education rose from 569,388 pupils in 1988/1989, when the project was appraised, to 953,886 pupils in 1998/1999. The overall countrywide increase in pupils is, therefore, 384,498, i.e. an increase of 67.53% in 10 years, which is satisfactory. The gross and net enrollment rates rose respectively from 90.4% and 62.9% in 1988/1989 to 103% and 67% in 1998/1999. In particular in the central region, the project area, the numbers rose from 38,947 pupils in 1988/1989 to 109,320 pupils in 1998/1999, i.e. an increase of 70,373 (180%), which in itself is a real improvement.

2.1.17 With regard to the encouragement of girls' enrollment, the progress made could continue. In fact, the net enrollment rate, which was 57.9% in Tchoudjo in 1988/1999, rose to 60% in 1998/1999. In the Tchamba Schools' Inspectorate, the net enrolment rate was also up from 31.4% to 60%; progress was also made in Sotouboua (52.4% in 1998 compared with 60% over the same period).

2.1.18 The completion of the CRETFD rehabilitation and extension works and the equipment to

be installed, and their opening up to new market and employment stimuli, will be a reality. Finally, all the training dispensed will help to improve educational standards in Togo.

2.1.19 Overall Performance Assessment: despite slippage on implementation, the project performance, in light of the activities carried out, and the already tangible impact, is satisfactory. This performance may be summarized as follows:

Indicator	Loan Conditions	Procurement	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Objective	Overall Assessment
Rating	2	2	1.3	2	3	2.1

A.3 POPULATION SECTOR STUDY

Grant Amount: UA 1.0 million No F/TOG/DN-ET/POP/97/2	Cost: UA 1.058 million Source : TAF: UA 1.0 million Government : UA 0.058 million	Amount Disbursed: UA 0.65 million (65%) Balance: UA 0.347 million (35%)
Approval Date: 04/09/1997	Signature Date: 17/10/1997	Effectiveness Date: 12/12/1997
Deadline for Final Disbursement: 31/12/2001	Executing Agency: CECE at the General Directorate for Planning and Development	
Audit of Accounts: Not carried out Date of Last Supervision Mission: October 2000	Status Reports: CECE has published 9 quarterly activity reports since the start up of the study. In general, those reports are in conformity with the format required by the Bank.	
Objective and Description: the study aims to improve knowledge of population problems. More specifically, the objective of the study is to identify problems through socio-demographic analyses and propose concrete solutions to those problems in the form of projects. The study will be conducted in two stages: the first stage comprises three (3) complementary components, the results of which will be translated into operational recommendations to orientate development activities. This phase will be completed in six (6) to eighteen (18) months. The second six-month (6) phase will concern the preparation of detailed projects, based on the findings and recommendations of the first phase. The projects proposed will be prepared in conformity with the priorities of Government and ADF and will be set out in a project document. The study components are as follows: phase I comprises: i) the integrated population information system; ii) the family and; iii) migration and urbanization, and the objective of phase II is the preparation of projects.		

2.1.20 Compliance with Conditions: the study grant became effective eight (8) months after its approval by the Board and three (3) months after its signature, which represents an average performance. The Government has also fulfilled one (1) of the two (2) other conditions during the conduct of the study. Fulfillment of the second condition is related to the start up of phase II devoted to the formulation of projects. The CECE has published and submitted to the Bank nine (9) quarterly activity reports since 1998. The contract for the conduct of the audit of the study's accounts was signed in October 2000. Compliance with the grant conditions is satisfactory.

2.1.21 Procurement Performance: goods and services for the study were procured in conformity with the Bank's rules of procedure. The selection of the consulting firm and the procurement of equipment was carried out in conformity with the rules. Components II and III were to be implemented on the basis of an agreement between CECE and URD. On the other hand, the Bank required CECE to limit the number of local consultants from eleven (11) at start up to six (6) in conformity with the estimates of the appraisal report on the study. Lack of familiarity with the Bank's procedures at the start up of the study was gradually corrected as a result of missions to the Bank's Headquarters by the Director of CECE and supervision missions. The procurement performance is satisfactory.

2.1.22 Financial Performance: the financial performance of the study is satisfactory. The disbursement rate is approximately 65% in less than 18 months of activities. The foreign exchange and local currency are available, which facilitates timely disbursements. The national counterpart has been used for the refurbishing work on the premises of the Study Implementation

and Coordination Unit (CECE). It has also been used to finance operating costs (salary of the CECE director, water and electricity costs).

2.1.23 Performance of Activities and Outputs: on the whole, the study is being conducted normally to the extent that most of the activities have been implemented to the satisfaction of the country and the Bank. Indeed, the Integrated Population Information System (SII-POP) is now physically operational. It makes it possible to fully meet user requirements, to rapidly demonstrate the feasibility and usefulness of certain functions, and to assess the critical elements of the system, which went undetected during the study and the establishment of the system. The consulting firm has received most of the equipment required for the operation of the SII-POP.

2.1.24 With regard to the surveys on the family, migration and urbanization, the Demographic Research Unit (URD) of the University of Benin in Togo organized a feedback workshop on data collection equipment involving the scientific community of Lome, development agents and the representatives of Ministries and International Institutions. This activity continued through the finalization and translation of questionnaires in local languages, the preparation of training manuals and the training of 20 controllers to test the questionnaire. The preliminary survey provided satisfactory results despite the reluctance of some of the population to answer the surveyors' questions. Finally, the URD recruited 128 surveyors and input operatives who were trained for three weeks, in the use of survey questionnaires and the training of data input agents since 2 October 2000. Finally URD has already prepared plans for the use and analysis of the findings of the surveys.

2.1.25 Development Objective. The likelihood that the study will achieve its objectives is high. In general, the outcome of the study will contribute to the implementation of the population policy and the enhancement of national population and development skills. These outcomes will also make it possible to better understand the status of women within the family, the impact of migration on their status as family head, population shifts and will provide a framework for the Bank's investments in poverty reduction projects. The Integrated Population and Development Information System (SII-POP) will harmonize, standardize and make available to the Government and all the partners, useful socio-democratic information for the monitoring and evaluation of the implementation of the country's population policy. The information will be used to define urbanization, housing, decentralization and regional development programmes. Implementation of those programmes is essential for the protection of the environment.

2.1.26. Overall Performance Assessment: on the whole, the population sector study is being conducted normally in so far as the pilot test of the SII-POP has been carried out and the three (3) main surveys planned started up in late October 2000. Should this trend continue, the study will be completed on 31 December 2001, as planned at appraisal. The overall project performance is satisfactory and may be summarized as follows:

Indicator	Loan Conditions	Procurement of Goods and Services	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Objective	Overall Assessment
Rating	2.3	2.5	3	2.3	2.7	2.6

B. Transport Sector

2.1.27 The transport sector was the beneficiary of eight (8) loans including a supplementary loan for the Sokode-Bassar road. These loans permitted the financing of seven (7) projects, including four (2) road projects, two (2) railway projects and one (1) study on a road project. The amount of the loans is UA 10.00 million from ADB resources, UA 28.99 million from ADF resources and UA 8.74 million from NTF resources. The projects and studies financed in this sector have been completed with the exception of the Lome-Notse Road Project approved in April 1999, and which is ongoing.

Lome-Notse Road Rehabilitation Project

Loan Amount: UA 12.18 million No F/TOG/REH-RTE/98/13	Project Cost: MUA 13.53 Source : ADF: MUA 12.18 Government: MUA 1.35	Amount Disbursed: UA (2.09 million (17.16%)) Undisbursed Amount: UA 10.09 million (82.84%)
Approval Date: 27/04/1999	Signature Date: 10/05/1999	Effectiveness Date: 30/11/1999
Deadline for Final Disbursement: 31/12/2001	Executing Agency: DGTP, Ministry of Infrastructure, Mines, Energy and Posts and Telecommunications.	
Audit of Accounts: Procurement ongoing Date of Last Supervision: October 2000	Status Report: none to date	
<p>Objective and Description: The Togolese Government's objective in the transport sector is to improve the efficiency of the national system with a view to making the Togolese transit corridor competitive in the subregion, in order to support the revival of the economy and the increase in national and international trade.</p> <p>In particular, the project aims to: (i) support the recovery of the economy and contribute to economic growth and increased trade, (ii) improve the mobility of goods and persons; (iii) reduce poverty and (iv) lower vehicle running costs and the travel time on the North South highway. The project comprises: (i) the rehabilitation work on the Lome-Notse (88 km) road with a widening into 2X2 lanes over 8 kilometres in the urban section; (ii) works control and monitoring; (iii) the project audit and (iv) support to DGTP.</p>		

2.1.28 Compliance with Conditions: the loan became effective on 31/11/1999, i.e. seven (07) months after loan approval, which is acceptable. However, two of the other loan conditions have not been completely fulfilled, namely: (i) the quarterly replenishment, to the tune of CFA.F 160 million, of the counterpart funds account already opened under the project in a commercial bank and (ii) monitoring of the mitigative environmental measures. The fulfillment of the condition concerning the quarterly replenishment of the project account by the Government appears unlikely in light of the Government's present cash flow difficulties. For the moment, the Government has established a system for the payment of counterpart funds using FER and Public Treasury resources, but only the FER honours its obligations. This situation, which is unlikely to improve, requires that the Bank clarify this situation with the Government. The condition concerning the monitoring of environmental measures was partially fulfilled with the establishment of the Monitoring Committee and the preparation of the Environmental Management Plan (mitigative measures, training/sensitization of technical personnel, users and riparian communities and environmental monitoring programme during the works). The cost of the Environmental Management Plan will have to be reviewed in light of the real progress of the works, in order to improve the monitoring of the implementation of adequate measures. The Monitoring Committee's first report has not yet been submitted to the Bank. Since the start up of the works, no quarterly project status report has been submitted to the Bank. While, on the whole, compliance with the specific conditions is satisfactory, compliance with the general conditions applicable to loan agreements raises serious problems, which the Bank should monitor closely.

2.1.29 Procurement Performance: The services of the consultant responsible for works control and monitoring were procured satisfactorily and in conformity with the Bank's rules of procedure. The recruitment of the contractor and consultant was completed in 8 months, which is a satisfactory performance. On the other hand, the procurements provided for under the support to the DGTP, and the recruitment of the consultant responsible for the audit of the project are approximately six (6) months behind schedule. The support to DGTP, to be financed through a revolving fund, comprises (i) the recruitment of two engineers, (ii) the purchase of computer equipment, a photocopier and a vehicle, and (iii) travel and operating costs. Apart from the recruitment of engineers, the other components have not started up. The Administration has undertaken to take the necessary measures to complete the procurement for this component before the end of the first quarter of 2001. It is also finalizing the preparation of the bidding documents (TORs, Bank-type BDs, shortlist of consultants) for the audit in order to issue invitations to bid before the end of the first quarter of 2001. The Consultant responsible for works monitoring and control was recruited in March 2000 and assumed his duties in April 2000 within a reasonable time. In light of the foregoing, the overall procurement performance is satisfactory.

2.1.30 Financial Performance: the project has been seriously handicapped by the failure to pay disbursement requests submitted to the Bank until November 2000 and by the delay in payment by the Togolese Government of its counterpart in the projects. The Bank's failure to release payments was due to the fact that Togo was under sanction for non-payment of arrears. The Government's delay in the payment of the statements is due to the cash flow difficulties it is experiencing and which have prevented it from honouring all its commitments. However, following the settlement of its arrears, the Bank has released disbursements for the project (17%). The financial performance is unsatisfactory and the Bank will have to closely monitor that indicator.

2.1.31 Activities and Outputs: the works, which started up in July 2000, had an overall implementation rate of approximately 6% (5.5 km have been completely rehabilitated) before being suspended following non-payment by ADF and the Government of outstanding invoices of approximately CFA.F 1.9 billion presented by the contractor. Only production activities and those concerning the supply of materials are being carried out by the Contractor. Furthermore, preparation of the preliminary designs has made it possible to improve the technical solution of renewal of the existing base course with stabilization in certain places. In addition, some parts of the first 8 kilometres of the area to be widened have either become refuse dumps or marshlands owing to changes to some catchment areas. Insufficient attention has been paid to sanitation in urban areas. The consulting engineer is conducting studies with a view to assessing the amount of additional drainage, backfill and sanitation works required. Though the site is only partially operational, the Engineering Consultant is still ready to carry out the geotechnical controls at the level of the quarry and conduct additional geotechnical studies, especially in the area of the first 8 kilometres of widening to dual carriage way. The start up of the other components is expected in the second quarter of 2001. The performance of activities and outputs is unsatisfactory because of arrears and general public finance difficulties.

2.1.32 Development Objective: the development objectives of this project are not threatened. However, should there be slippage of over one year on implementation of the project, this would have a negative impact (delay) on the project's expected economic spin-off.

2.1.33 Overall Assessment: the overall project performance assessed on the basis of the previous

indicators is unsatisfactory, and may be summarized as follows:

Performance Indicators	Compliance with Conditions	Procurement of G & S	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Objective	Overall Assessment
Rating	1.3	2.5	1.5	0.9	1.8	1.6

C - Multisector:

2.1.34 ADF, along with other donors, participated in the financing of three Structural Adjustment Programmes (SAP) for a total amount of UA 36.52 million and awarded a grant of UA 2.763 million to finance a Project for Institutional Support to the Ministry of Planning. The three SAPs have been completed and the completion and audit reports prepared. The Project for Institutional Support to the Ministry of Planning and Development is ongoing and should be completed on 30 June 2001.

Project for Institutional Support to the Ministry of Planning

<u>Loan Amount</u> : UA 2.76 million	<u>Cost/project</u> : MUA 3.06	<u>Amount Disbursed</u> : UA 2.58 million (93.48%)
F/TOG/DN-AI/MIP/91/1	<u>Sources</u> : TAF: MUA 2.76 Government: MUA 0.30	<u>Undisbursed Amount</u> : UA 0.18 million (6.52%)
<u>Approval Date</u> : 17/12/1990	<u>Signature Date</u> : 01/02/91	<u>Effectiveness Date</u> : 30/08/1991
<u>Deadline for Final Disbursement</u> : 30/06/2001	<u>Executing Agency</u> : PIU at the Ministry of Planning, Regional Development, Housing and Urbanism	
<u>Audit of Accounts</u> : regular	<u>Status Reports</u> : Regular	
<u>Date of Last Supervision</u> : October 2000		
<u>Context, Objective and Description</u> : owing to the economic difficulties of the eighties and the efforts made by the Government to reorganize and strengthen the central and regional administration while implementing programmes for the stabilization and economic restructuring of the country, ADF had accepted the request submitted in 1987 for the financing of institutional support to the Ministry of Planning responsible for the design and conduct of the country's development policy. Owing to the socio-political disturbances of 1991-1993, the project, which was approved in 1990, was unable to start up its activities. In July 1994, at the Government's request, the project was restructured while retaining the original objective. The objective is to improve the macroeconomic management of the Government and promote the balanced and harmonious development of the country. This implies: (i) mastery of the project cycle and investment scheduling, (ii) improved formulation of development strategies and sectoral problems and (iii) better practical training of management staff to make them more operational. The project therefore comprises the following components: (i) long-term technical assistance (30 months) and short-term assistance (42 staff/months); (ii) staff training; (iii) construction of two (2) buildings in two regions of the country; (iv) logistic resources; (v) studies and supervision and (vi) operation.		

2.1.35 Compliance with conditions: the project was approved on 17 December 1990 and the Grant Protocol of Agreement was signed on 1 February 1991, i.e. three months later. But there was 7-months slippage on effectiveness owing to administrative delays. The audit of accounts and the activity report were not submitted to the Bank until the project was restructured in July 1994. From then, audit reports have been submitted regularly to ADF, as well as activity reports. The other conditions related to the submission of the CVs of applicants for external training and reports on the training and budgetary allocations for the maintenance of buildings have been fulfilled by the Government. Thus, on the whole, compliance with conditions is satisfactory.

2.1.36 Procurement Performance: the PIU has satisfied the Bank's requirements in respect of procurements agreed upon at appraisal. In fact, all the logistic resources have been procured on the basis of national shopping, and long and short-term technical assistance services have been procured on the basis of shortlists approved by the Bank. However, there was some delay in the assumption of duties by the long-term experts who performed their duties to the satisfaction of the Government and the Bank in the stipulated 30-month period. Overall, the procurements were made under relatively satisfactory conditions.

2.1.37 Financial Performance: 100% of the project foreign exchange costs have been financed by TAF as well as a part of the local currency costs thus providing the project with adequate

financial resources. In view of the public finance difficulties, disbursements of the national counterpart funds are released with considerable delay, especially in the financing phase of the “construction of buildings and local seminars” components, which have now been completed. The Government’s performance is therefore unsatisfactory. However, project costs have been efficiently managed, which has made it possible to finance more activities than expected, thus enabling the project to attain all its objectives. At present, the grant has been disbursed to the tune of 93.5%. The financial performance is satisfactory.

2.1.38 Activities and Outputs: There was slippage on the implementation of the different project components which led to three extensions of the original loan closure date of December 1998 after its effective start up in 1995: 31 December 1999, 31 December 2000 and 30 June 2001. Thus, adherence to the implementation schedule was not always satisfactory since the project Director had internal promotion, which affected his project monitoring work. Apart from the administrative delays, the technical assistance and firms provided and carried out the services and works satisfactorily. Thirteen remaining activities are nearing completion and should be completed by 30 June 2001. Despite the administrative delays, the performance in respect of activities and outputs is satisfactory.

2.1.39 Development Objective: the project strongly supports the Ministry of Planning, the technical Ministries and the five regional planning and development directorates in the area of macroeconomic management and capacity building. The likelihood of the project development objectives being attained is fairly good. However, in light of the public finance difficulties, the likelihood of sustaining the level of investments is slim, though the State budget provides for an annual package for maintenance and investment, which is disbursed with difficulty owing to the lack of liquidity of the Public Treasury. But, with the revival of cooperation and economic reforms planned after the parliamentary elections, the likelihood of maintaining the positive project impact is high. The project has undoubtedly made a significant contribution to building institutional capacity, due to the importance of the component on “training of Togo’s senior central and regional administration staff”, and the methodological instruments established by technical assistance. Finally, the project development objective is highly satisfactory.

2.1.40 Overall Performance Assessment: the overall portfolio assessment is satisfactory. The final ratings obtained on the basis of the different above-mentioned criteria are summarized below:

Performance Indicators	Compliance with Conditions	Procurement of G&S.	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Objective	Overall Assessment
Rating	2	3	2.3	2.2	3	2.5

D – Public Utilities Sector

2.2.41 ADB has financed one (1) electricity project and ADF has financed one (1) telecommunications project for respective amounts of UA 2.8 million and UA 5.53 million. In 1998, TAF approved a study on Lome Sanitation and DWS in Twenty (20) Secondary Centres for an amount of UA 1.2 million. Both projects have been completed. The study has not yet started.

Study on Lome Sanitation and DWS in Secondary Centres

<u>Loan Amount:</u> UA 1.20 million No F/TOG/DN-	<u>Cost :</u> UA 1.26 million <u>Source :</u> TAF: UA 1.2 million Government: UA 0.06 million	<u>Amount Disbursed:</u> 0 (0%) <u>Undisbursed Amount:</u> UA 1.2 million (100%)
<u>Approval Date:</u> 15/07/1998	<u>Signature Date:</u> 27/04/1999	<u>Effectiveness Date:</u>
<u>Date of Final Disbursement:</u> 31/12/2001	<u>Executing Agency:</u> Monitoring Committee- General Directorate for Water and Energy	
<u>Audit of Accounts:</u> <u>Date of Last Supervision:</u> None	<u>Status Reports:</u> None	
Objective and Description: the studies aim to update the Lome Sanitation Master Plan, determine the feasibility of a priority sanitation phase in Lome and prepare detailed engineering designs for the DWS systems in 20 Secondary Centres. They comprise two components: Lome Sanitation and the Study on DWS in Twenty (20) Secondary Centres. Each of the components will be implemented in three (03) phases totalling 16 months.		

2.1.42 Compliance with Conditions: the necessary elements for the effectiveness of the grant were submitted to the Bank on 20 January 2000, i.e. one-and-a-half years after the signing of the Grant Protocol of Agreement and to date, the Grant is not yet effective. Compliance with the conditions of the grant is therefore highly unsatisfactory.

2.1.43 Procurement Performance: there was considerable delay in recruiting a consulting firm to update the Master Plan. In fact, the limited shopping after preselection of consulting firms took place in February 2000 and bids were submitted on 29 March 2000. However, the bid analysis report was only submitted to the Bank on 21 July 2000, i.e. 4 months after the submission of bids. The procurement performance is unsatisfactory.

2.1.44 Financial Performance: since the Grant is not yet effective, no disbursement has been released in respect of this study. Furthermore, in light of the Government's cash flow difficulties, the positioning of the national counterpart is not guaranteed. The financial performance is unsatisfactory and will be regularly monitored by the Bank.

2.1.45 Activities and Outputs: the only ongoing activity is the process of recruiting a consultant to conduct the studies. It has encountered difficulties. The performance of activities and outputs is unsatisfactory.

2.1.46 Development Objective: the likelihood of achieving the objectives of the study remain high if a good consulting firm is recruited.

2.1.47 Overall Assessment: the final ratings relating to the different criteria are summarized below:

Performance Indicators	Compliance with Conditions	Procurement of G & S	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Objective	Overall Assessment
Rating	1	1	1	1	2	1.2

2.2 Aging and Potentially Problematic Projects

2.2.1 **Aging Projects.** The Bank's portfolio in Togo is fairly small, 1.7% of a total of 357 projects (the average age was 5 years in 1996 compared with 6 in 2000) and aging. Total commitments for the six ongoing projects in 2000 are UA 42.01 million, i.e. 29% of the total compared with 40% in 1996, and the average age 6 years compared with 5 in 1996, but rises to over 9 years if the 3 projects approved in 1998 and 1999 are excluded. The three aging projects are in the social sector (2) and in the multisector (1). The latter is expected to be completed on 30 June 2001 and one of the two social sector projects, Education II, is planned for the 31

December 2001. While the implementation of the two projects is now satisfactory, the third project, the Project for the Rehabilitation of Regional Hospitals and the Strengthening of the Central Supplies Pharmacy is experiencing serious management problems identified by an operational audit in 1999, the report on which was submitted for consideration in September 2000.

2.2.2 Problem Projects. The portfolio review mission identified two problem projects, 33% compared with 11% for the entire Bank and 1 **potentially problematic project, i.e. 16.7% compared with 11% for the Bank.** The problem operations were the Project for the Rehabilitation of Regional Hospitals and the Strengthening of the Central Supplies Pharmacy and the Study on Lome Sanitation and DWS in Twenty (20) Secondary Centres. The first project was analyzed in 2.2.1. above. The Study on Lome Sanitation and DWS in 20 Secondary Centres was approved in 1998, and the Grant Protocol of Agreement is not yet effective, i.e. approximately 20 months later. Measures have been taken to speed up consideration of the documents, which have finally been submitted to the Bank, to ensure the effectiveness of the study before the end of December 2000. The potentially problematic project, 50% compared with 48% and rated 1.6 out of 3, was the Lome-Notse Road Rehabilitation Project. Owing to public finance difficulties, the special account opened under the project is not yet replenished quarterly by CFA.F 160 million as planned, and the country does not honour the due dates on Bank Group loans, which has led to the suspension of disbursements for the project. The contractor, having been partially paid from the Road Maintenance Fund (FER), suspended the works, 6% (5.5 km) of which had been completed as at 30 September 2000. It was agreed to amend the loan agreement to take into consideration the financial situation of the country, which paid the arrears accumulated since August 1999 in November 2000 in November 2000, thus permitting the disbursement of CFA.F 1.8 billion for the project. The Bank will monitor this project very closely.

2.3 Assessment of the Frequency and Quality of Supervision

From 1996 to 2000, the entire portfolio was supervised at least once a year with the exception of the Study on Lome Sanitation and DWS in 20 Secondary Centres, which has not yet started, and the Health Project in 2000. The Health Project (Rehabilitation of Regional Hospitals and the Strengthening of the Central Supplies Centre) was not supervised in 2000 for the reasons already mentioned. Thus, the stepping up of supervision missions, combined with improvements in their quality, led to the identification of management problems concerning the Health Project. The non-performing NTF loan relating to it was cancelled in February 1999 and the balances on several loans, for which the projects had been completed, were cancelled. However, special attention should be paid to the composition of the supervision missions, which should be expanded to include the Bank's support departments, in particular FPRU and OESU.

2.4 Crosscutting Themes

2.4.1 The Environment. Some ongoing projects were approved prior to the adoption by the Bank of the policy for the environmental classification of projects. Some were approved after the adoption of this policy, and take it into consideration. This was the case of the Lome-Notse Road Rehabilitation Project, which set up a committee to monitor the mitigative environmental measures. The other operations approved after the adoption of this policy are studies, which have no negative environmental impacts. Furthermore, the implementation of

development projects in Togo is governed by strict regulations, the objective of which is to protect the natural environment from all forms of degradation and deterioration. Monitoring of the environmental impact of development and infrastructure projects is the responsibility of Ministry of the Environment and the Coordination and Monitoring Unit for the preparation and implementation of the National Environmental Management Programme. This unit will be transformed into a National Environmental Management Agency with financial autonomy in order to ensure greater efficiency in the area of environmental protection.

2.4.2 Impact of Classrooms on the Environment under the Education Project II. The classrooms were built in rural areas. Their construction took into consideration open space planning, while preserving the aesthetic appearance of the natural landscape, and did not involve expropriation; plantations, including tree plantations, were established thus limiting the risks of erosion, which could be caused by the construction work. Each school built was provided with the required sanitary and security equipment; the pupils were sensitized to the need to preserve the physical and human environment.

2.4.3 Gender Issues. Togo is making efforts to mainstream gender issues in its development programme. To that end, it has established a Ministry for the Advancement of Women, which implements its policy in this area. Most of the projects approved by the Bank Group in Togo contribute to the attainment of that objective. Thus, Education Projects I and II have helped to encourage the enrollment of girls in the different levels of education (primary, secondary, general and technical). In addition, the sensitization campaigns carried out have led to increased awareness of the importance of human rights, which constitutes outstanding progress on gender relations in the overall framework of the Government's development process, and aims to increase the enrolment of girls, female literacy education and the vocational and technical education of girls.

2.4.4 Participation: the projects financed in Togo prior to 1995 do not apply the method of beneficiary participation.

2.4.5 Poverty Reduction. The projects financed in Togo by the Bank do not only take into consideration the rate of return but also the social impacts and the contribution to the well-being of the target population of the projects. However, much remains to be done in that area. This approach could include an assessment of the contribution of the project to lowering unemployment and the recovery of the economy. The Bank could also consider financing specific projects by targeting the vulnerable populations in urban and peri-urban areas. Thus monitoring of the impact of Bank-financed projects in the fight against poverty should be part of the Bank's efforts in this area.

2.4.6 Population. All the projects financed in Togo take the population problem into

consideration. These include public utilities, health, education and road projects which contribute directly to the improvement of living conditions of the most vulnerable segments of the population. The population sector study will make it possible to identify specific projects in that area.

2.4.7 Overall, the portfolio review mission sensitized the Authorities to crosscutting themes and enabled them to identify the need to systematically integrate them in the preparation, appraisal and monitoring of projects. In fact, while the environment is still taken into consideration in some projects, this does not apply to poverty reduction, gender and integration issues. It should, however, be noted that the Lome-Notse Road Rehabilitation Project contributes to subregional integration and the education and health projects, as well as the Project for Institutional Support to the Ministry of Planning, take intersector concerns into consideration.

2.5 Overall Assessment of the Portfolio Performance

2.5.1 The overall portfolio performance rating is 1.8. A project by project review reveals that 50% of the Bank's portfolio is being satisfactorily implemented, while 50% has specific problems requiring special attention of the Bank and Government. Indeed, from 1997 to 2000, there was a significant improvement in the performance of the executing agencies, concerning their understanding and application of the Bank's rules of procedure, in the case of the Project for Institutional Support to the Ministry of Planning, the Education Project II, and the Population Sector Study, with scores of 2.2 for implementation status and 2.8 for development objective. On the other hand, the Project for the Rehabilitation of Regional Hospitals and Strengthening of the Central Supplies Pharmacy, Lome-Notse Road Rehabilitation Project and the Study on Lome Sanitation and DWS in 20 secondary Centres have an overall rating of 1.2 and a development objective rating of 1.6 (refer to Annex X).

2.5.2 In light of the foregoing, the overall implementation and development objective ratings are 1.7 and 2.3 respectively, compared with 2.1 and 2.9 in 1996. The overall implementation rating shows that the portfolio is potentially problematic owing to public finance difficulties, which have impacted negatively on the performance of activities and outputs of projects financed by the loans. The Project for Institutional Support to the Ministry of Planning and the Population Sector Study financed by the Grants were unaffected by the sanctions which led to the suspension of the Bank's disbursements. Since September 2000, the Government has made efforts, which, in November 2000, led to the settlement of arrears with a view to relaunching projects. The Bank will have to closely follow the entire portfolio, the overall performance of which is summarized in the table below.

Indicator	Compliance with Conditions	Procurement Performance	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Objective	Overall Assessment
Average	1.6	2.1	1.7	1.5	2.3	1.8

2.6 Disbursements

2.6.1 As at 30 September 2000, total disbursements amounted to UA 14.24 million for total commitments, net of cancellations, of UA 42.01 million, for the 6 ongoing projects, i.e. a disbursement rate of 33.89%. This fairly low rate is partially due to the large number of new projects in the portfolio and the suspension of loan disbursements because of arrears. The total amount of pending disbursements, as at the end of October 2000, was CFA.F 2.5 million,

including CFA.F 1.9 million for the Lome-Notse Road Project and CFA.F 0.6 million for the Education II project which were released after the lifting of sanctions. The total disbursement rate, as at 31 December 2000, then attained 42%.

2.6.2 The disbursement rates by sector are as follows: policy-based loans (93.48 %), transport sector, (17.16 %), social sector (50.44 %) and public utilities (0 %). The disbursement rates reflect the problems encountered by projects financed from the loans (Education II and the Lome-Notse Road), disbursements relating to which were suspended owing to arrears. They also reflect public finance difficulties, which prevent the State from making counterpart funds available to projects. The institutional support project and the population sector study financed by grants did not experience any of those problems resulting in high respective disbursement rates of 93% and 65%. The Sanitation and DWS study is not yet effective.

3. ASSESSMENT OF PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION AND MANAGEMENT CAPACITY.

3.1 Performance of the Government and Executing Agencies

3.1.1 From the institutional standpoint, monitoring of the implementation of Bank-financed projects falls within the purview of the Supervising Ministries, coordinated by the Planning Coordination Directorate of the Ministry of Planning, Regional Development, Housing and Urbanism. This Directorate is responsible for monitoring the management of the entire portfolio, in particular matters relating to requests for project financing, the effectiveness of loans for Bank-financed projects, disbursements, and the submission of status and audit reports. The repayment of Bank loans is effected by the Public Debt Directorate at the Ministry of the Economy, Finance and Privatization. The Planning Coordination Directorate is also responsible for coordinating the activities of the Bank's field missions. Overall, this coordination improved over the 1996-2000 period, and substantial progress was made in respect of the implementation of ongoing projects owing to compliance with the Bank's rules of procedures by the Government and executing agencies. In fact, these agencies have competent project management and monitoring staff. But, the country's economic situation and public finance difficulties have prevented the attainment of satisfactory project implementation and loan disbursement rates, which have remained very low, apart from grant-financed projects and studies.

3.1.2 The Government will have to make efforts to improve the economic situation, as well as the financial, activity and output performances of projects. It will also have to make efforts regarding loan effectiveness, where slippage of eight (*) months was observed on average, with peaks of twelve (12) months, as well as with regard to audit and status reports, which are certainly submitted, but infrequently.

3.2 Bank Performance

The different activities carried out by the Bank from 1996 to 2000 have helped to speed up the implementation of Bank-financed projects, but the State's financial situation and the suspension of disbursements for arrears have prevented any improvement in the implementation and financial performances of projects. The Bank has carried out the training of managerial staff at local seminars, and in Cotonou, and sent 26 managerial staff, including the Head of Coordination of Assistance at the Ministry of Planning, for external training in macroeconomics, planning, budgeting, project monitoring and evaluation, and in the accounting and financial management of projects in all the country's Technical Ministries. Moreover, the Bank stepped up the number of

supervision missions of all those projects from 1996 to 2000, while improving their quality by systematically cancelling non-performing loans, and the unspent balances on loans for completed or closed projects. The portfolio performance could be improved by the regular organization at the Bank's headquarters, of working and training sessions for representatives of the executing agencies for ongoing Bank-financed projects, and the systematic fielding of launching missions for all new projects.

4. COORDINATION WITH OTHER DONORS

4.1 Assessment of the Government's Capacity to Coordinate External Assistance

From 1996 to 2000, Togo was prudent in the mobilization of external resources to finance investment. But problems of governance appeared in 1998 reducing the possibility of mobilizing external resources by the Ministry of Planning, Regional Development, Housing and Urbanism, because of the suspension of cooperation by some donors. Nevertheless, it maintained some ties with most multinational donors, which provided it with concessional resources, so as not to increase debt service payments. The resumption of cooperation with all donors will make it possible to revitalize the coordination structures within the Ministry of Planning and resume the roundtable mechanisms and sectoral meetings, which are the preferred instruments of aid coordination.

4.2 Assessment of the Bank's Capacity to Coordinate its Assistance with other Donors.

The Bank has stepped up its efforts to improve the coordination of its operations with the Bretton Woods institutions and some donors represented in Lome. These institutions play a key role in the mobilization of resources for Togo. From 1996-2000, the Bank cofinanced the SAP III with the IMF, the World Bank and Japan. The programme, which was appraised in 1996, was fully disbursed in 1997 as planned. Three (3) ongoing projects were cofinanced in 1995, but no project was cofinanced in 2000, in order to avoid delays stemming from the different rules and procedures of donors. Nevertheless, the appraisal and supervision missions meet regularly with other donors in the context of aid coordination.

4.3 Assessment of the Impact of other Donors in Cofinanced Projects

The Bank's experience in project cofinancing, especially with the World Bank, IMF and Japan is satisfactory. This cofinancing mainly concerned the third policy-based programme in 1997 (SAP III). Apart from SAP III, the Bank had no other projects cofinanced from 1996-2000 compared with three (3) projects cofinanced in the 1996 Review Report. The Bank has also improved its relations with the other donors regarding exchanges of information.

5. LOAN REPAYMENTS

Togo often accumulates arrears in respect of loan repayments. Sanctions were imposed on Togo several times between 1996 and 2000. The last occasion was in August 1999 for a 16-month period. During the portfolio review mission in October 2000, the authorities undertook to settle their arrears for an amount of UA 2.27 million, with UA 1.9 million from the ADF window and UA 0.37 million from NTF. In November 2000, all arrears were settled. But, since 1 February 2001, Togo has once again been under sanction for the due date of 1 January 2001 for an amount of approximately UA 567,000 for ADF and NTF.

6. PORTFOLIO MANAGEMENT

6.1 Potential Problems and Recommended Solutions

The Portfolio Review Mission identified potential problems and recommended solutions. The mission identified three (3) projects, which were potentially problematic because of the country's sociopolitical situation, which prevented it from contributing its counterpart funds for the projects. The resumption of cooperation with donors and the strengthening of economic reform measures will enable the country to solve the problems.

6.2 Plan of Action to Improve Portfolio Performance

As mentioned in Annex VI, the plan of action for the improvement of the portfolio will primarily concern activities related to monitoring, and the training of project executing agency staff.

6.3 Lessons Learnt for Future Portfolio Reviews and CSPs

6.3.1 **For the Portfolio.** Since the portfolio is aging, the Bank will have to, with the settlement of arrears, speed up the appraisal of projects in the priority sectors recommended by the 1999-2001 CSP, and through policy-based loans, help the country to resolve the problem of project counterpart funds. Furthermore, the project may be significantly improved in the following areas:

- (i) expansion of project appraisal, supervision and launching missions to include other Departments of the Bank (FPRU, OESU, etc), in order to enhance consideration of the concerns expressed by a wide range of experts, with a view to reducing poverty;
- (ii) the organization of more training seminars of executing agencies on the Bank's new rules of procedure with regard to procurement and new financial products;
- (iii) the systematic launching of all Bank-financed projects;
- (iv) continuation of the systematic cancelling of loan balances for projects which have been completed, or are about to be closed;
- (v) better estimation of costs, especially counterpart funds and project implementation periods;
- (vi) inclusion of project exemptions in the effective contribution of States with public finance difficulties;
- (vii) the sizing of projects so as to take into consideration the State's financial capacity to support the national counterpart and debt service; and
- (viii) the rapid replacement of any promoted project leader, who should not accumulate his/her new functions with the management of the project.

6.3.2 **For the CSP.** The Bank's strategy must henceforth take into consideration Togo's new

requirements after three (3) years of sociopolitical crisis. The Bank's future operations strategy will have to take into consideration the country's need to improve the competitiveness of its economy and the disengagement of the State from the productive sectors in favour of the private sector, which is called upon to play a key role in the country's development. Concessional resources will be allocated to the country under ADF VIII to implement the poverty reduction programme, the rehabilitation of production and liaison roads with the landlocked Sahelian countries, and to support the country's economic reform programme for the 2001-2002 period.

6.3.3 The matrix of common problems in Annex 8 shows that all the projects suffer from problems concerning counterpart funds, the failure to submit activity and audit reports and the weak capacity of executing agencies and delays in the physical implementation of projects.

7. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 Conclusions

7.1.1 The portfolio review mission was carried out five (5) years after that of December 1995, which did not permit the relaunching and/or restructuring of old projects despite the intensification of supervision missions. Frequent missions are necessary for the timely detection of general and specific problems and to trigger the project restructuring and/or reorientation process. The actual frequency will depend on the size of the portfolio and should be between 1 and 3 years. Furthermore, the country's difficult economic situation and recurrent arrears since the 1990-1993 crisis are the fundamental reasons for the general counterpart fund problem of all the projects in Togo, and the frequent suspension of loan disbursements between 1996 and 2000 including the period from August 1999 to November 2000.

7.1.2 The adaptation of loan agreements to that situation is necessary by establishing mechanisms to monitor the payment of counterpart funds relating to project financing. In that context, the Bank will have to step up its financial support to Togo, for the States have a problem in defining domestic resource allocation priorities and appreciating the gains to be made by effecting timely loan and subscription payments. Support for economic reforms and good governance could help in this area.

7.2 Recommendations

7.2.1 In light of all the foregoing, it is recommended to the Government to:

a) At the economic level

- i) resume the economic reforms with a view to stabilizing the macroeconomic framework, and rationalizing the management of public finances in order to make sufficient budget savings to cover the State counterpart funds in projects; and
- ii) resume cooperation with all donors through the organization of free and transparent legislative elections in order to obtain more external aid for the support of public finances and the financing of public investments; etc.

b) From the Project Management Standpoint

- i) effect loan repayments on the due date in order to prevent suspension of disbursements which could prevent adherence to the project implementation schedule;
- ii) implement projects according to best practices and adhere to their implementation schedule (Project for the Rehabilitation of Regional Hospitals and the Strengthening of the Central Supplies Pharmacy, etc);
- iii) closely monitor technical assistance services and take emergency measures in the event of any shortcomings noted (Project for the Rehabilitation of Regional Hospitals and the Strengthening of the Central Supplies Pharmacy);
- iv) implement supervision mission recommendations within the deadlines (all projects);
- v) promptly replace any promoted project leader (Project for Institutional Support to the Ministry of Planning);
- vi) monitor the critical points of the performance assessment, namely the conditions of effectiveness, the procurement process, the project management institutional capacity and the flow of loan disbursements and counterpart funds, the activity and output performances (all projects);
- vii) develop the participatory approach involving all the stakeholders in the life of the projects from identification until completion, especially during the preparation and different supervision stages (all projects);
- viii) improve the integration of crosscutting themes in the design, preparation and appraisal of projects and ensure their supervision;
- ix) assess projects on the basis of detailed technical, economic and financial studies in order to minimize physical contingencies (the Lome-Notse Road Rehabilitation Project);
- x) avoid delays in the preparation and submission to the Bank of quarterly status reports and project accounting and financial audit reports; and
- xi) recruit project staff with proven technical and professional competence.

7.2.2 It is recommended to the Bank to continue to:

- i) support the Government's economic reform efforts with a view to restoring the internal and external balances, especially with regard to public finances, in order to build the State's project financing capacity;
- ii) strengthen specific measures to enhance the quality of the portfolio from past experiences of risky projects, at all stages of the project cycle, in particular those which, upstream from the projects, will help to improve the quality of operations on entry;
- iii) help the country to prepare detailed technical, economic and financial studies of projects prior to their appraisal ;
- iv) review the Bank's financial rules which exclude duties and taxes in the presentation of Government contributions to the financing of projects, minimizing their effective contribution to projects;
- v) bring the contributions of countries into line with the level of taxes, duties and the usual budgetary, especially for countries with acute public finance difficulties;

- vi) include in the team for project preparation, appraisal and supervision, experts from the support departments as required (OESU, FPRU, OCOC, private sector, etc.) for the supervision, among others, of better indicators of crosscutting themes;
- vii) reinforce its presence in the country by frequent portfolio, economic and sectoral review missions, policy dialogue and macroeconomic and sectoral programmes.

TOGO
PORTFOLIO REVIEW REPORT
TABLE OF BANK GROUP COMMITMENTS IN TOGO
31/12/2000 (in million UA)

	Contribution by Sector	Window	Approval Date	Signature Date	Effectiveness Date	Deadline Last Disbursement	Amount Approved	Amount Disbursed	Amount Cancelled	Balance To be disbursed	Commts. Net Of Cancellations	Net Disbursement Rate	Status
Transport	31.66%												
1 Cimao Railway		ADB	20/12/76	09/02/77	29/09/77	30/06/82	5.00	4.97	0.03	0.00	4.97	100%	Completed
2 Sokode-Bassar Road		NTF	25/03/75	06/05/75	25/10/78	01/03/79	4.14	4.14	0.00	0.00	4.14	100%	Completed
3 Sokode-Bassar Road (suppl.)		NTF	07/06/78	07/07/78	//	07/07/78	4.60	4.53	0.07	0.07	4.53	100%	Completed
4 Yegue-Longobou Road Study		ADF	18/09/75	04/02/76	//	30/09/80	0.23	0.23	0.00	0.00	0.23	100%	Completed
5 Construction of the Yegue-Longobou Road		ADF	26/04/79	17/05/79	15/07/80	01/03/84	7.37	7.37	0.00	0.00	7.37	100%	Completed
6 Kara-Ketao Road and Ketao-Kpakouda Link Road		ADF	08/04/82	20/03/84	04/12/84	30/06/94	9.21	4.99	4.21	0.00	4.99	100%	Completed
7 Construction of Tibiligo-Lome Port Railway		ADB	18/12/76	09/03/77	31/12/77	31/12/81	5.00	5.00	0.00	0.00	5.00	100%	Completed
8 Lome-Notse Road		ADF	26/11/98	10/05/99	//	//	12.18	2.09	0.00	10.09	12.18	17%	Ongoing
TRANSPORT SUBTOTAL							47.73	33.32	4.31	10.09	43.41	77%	
Social Sector	27.36%												
1 Lome CHU		ADB	17/10/78	29/11/78	10/06/80	31/12/82	2.00	1.96	0.04	0.00	1.96	100%	Completed
2 Lome CHU		NTF	17/10/78	29/11/78	10/06/80	31/12/82	4.50	4.45	0.05	0.00	4.45	100%	Completed
3 Education : Technical Junior Secondary School		ADF	23/03/78	04/05/78	30/06/79	30/06/94	5.24	5.24	0.00	0.00	5.24	100%	Completed
4 Rehabilitation of Regional Hospitals and Strengthening of the Central Supplies Pharmacy			27/11/91	13/05/93	02/09/93	31/12/98	13.81	5.74	0.00	8.07	13.81	42%	Ongoing but will be cancelled
5 Rehabilitation of Regional Hospitals and Strengthening of Government Pharmaceutical Supplies Centres			27/11/91	13/05/92	8/09/93	31/12/98	6.00	0.00	6.00	0.00	0.00	0%	Loan Cancelled
6 Education II		ADF	16/12/91	13/05/92	18/05/93	31/12/01	11.05	6.66	0.00	4.39	11.05	60%	Ongoing
7 Population Sector Study		TAF	04/09/97	17/10/97	12/12/97	31/12/01	1.00	0.65	0.00	0.35	1.00	65%	Ongoing
SOCIAL SECTOR SUBTOTAL							43.60	24.70	6.09	12.81	37.51	66%	
Public Utilities	6.85%												
1 Electricity		ADB	27/06/74	13/11/74	21/7/76	30/06/78	2.80	2.67	0.14	0.00	2.67	100%	Completed
2 Telecommunications		ADF	16/01/90	20/04/90	06/02/91	31/12/94	5.52	4.59	0.00	0.93	5.52	83%	Completed
3 Study on DWS in Semi-Urban Centres		TAF	15/07/98	//	//	//	1.20	0.00	0.00	1.20	1.20	0%	Ongoing
PUBLIC UTILITIES SUBTOTAL							9.52	7.26	0.14	2.13	9.39	77%	
Agricultural Sector													
East Mono Development Project* (PM) (Not included in commitments) but is under discussion with the Togolese Authorities		ADF					8.24	-	-	8.24	8.24	-	Not yet approved because of arrears from Aug 1999 to Nov. 2000

	Contribution by Sector	Window	Approval Date	Signature Date	Effectiveness Date	Deadline Last Disbursement	Amount Approved	Amount Disbursed	Amount Cancelled	Balance To be disbursed	Commts. Net Of Cancellations	Net Disbursement Rate	Status
Industry and Banking 5.48%													
1	Line of Credit to BTB (phase 1)	ADB	20/06/72	07/09/72	//	31/12/75	1.35	1.35	0.00	0.00	1.35	100%	Completed
2	Construction and Equipment of an Oil Refinery at Lome	ADB	19/09/77	24/11/77	08/12/80	31/12/82	3.81	3.80	0.01	0.00	3.80	100%	Completed
3	Line of Credit to BTB (phase 2)	ADB	25/03/80	26/06/80	30/06/82	31/12/90	3.50	2.37	1.12	0.00	2.37	100%	Completed
INDUSTRY AND BANKING SUBTOTAL							8.66	7.52	1.13	0.00	7.52	100%	
Multisector 28.65%													
1	Sectoral Adjustment Programme (SAP I)	ADF	24/06/88	21/11/88	//	30/06/94	13.81	13.81	0.00	0.00	13.81	100%	Completed
2	Institutional Support to the Ministry of Planning and Regional Development	ADF	17/12/90	10/02/91	30/08/91	31/06/01	2.76	2.58	0.00	0.18	2.76	93%	Ongoing
3	Sectoral Adjustment Programme (SAP II)	ADF	24/08/92	09/10/92	30/09/93	31/12/96	11.51	11.51	0.00	0.00	11.51	100%	Completed
4	Structural Adjustment Programme (SAP III)	ADF	21/05/97	29/05/97	//	31/12/99	11.20	11.20	0.00	0.00	11.20	100%	Completed
MULTISECTOR SUBTOTAL							39.28	39.1	0.00	0.18	39.28	99%	
GRAND TOTAL							148.79	111.90	11.67	25.21	137.11	82%	
TOTAL ADB							23.46	22.12	1.34	0.00	22.12	100%	
TOTAL ADF + TAF							106.09	76.66	4.21	25.21	101.87	75%	
TOTAL NTF							19.24	13.12	6.12	0.07	13.12	100%	

TOGO
List of Completed Projects
Portfolio Review Report

Name of Project	Approval Date	Loan/Grant Amount in M. UA	Sources
1. <u>List of Completed Projects</u>			
a) <u>Projects for which Completion Reports have been prepared</u>			
	26-04-79	7.71	ADF
1. Project for the Upgrading and Asphaltting of the Yegue-Langabou Road	24-06-88	13.82	ADF
2. SAP I	16-01-90	5.53	ADF
3. Telecommunications Project	24/08/92	11.51	ADF
4. SAP II 1992 – 1996	21-05-97	11.20	ADF
5. SAP III - 96/98	19-08-87	6.87	ADF
6. Electric Power Dispatching, Generation and Transmission Centre			
b) <u>Projects for which Completion Reports have not been prepared</u>	20-06-72	1.35	ADF
	27-06-74	3.50	ADB
1. Line of credit to BTD	25-03-75	4.15	ADF
2. Extension of the Lome Electric Power Network	07-07-78	4.61	ADF
3. Upgrading and Asphaltting of the Sokode-Bassar Road I and II	18-09-75	0.33	ADF
	20-12-76	5.00	ADF
4. Feasibility and Engineering Study on the Yegue-Langabou Road	19-09-77	3.81	ADB
5. Tabligbo – Lome Port Railway	17-10-78	2.00	ADB
6. Construction of a Palm and Cotton Seed Oil Mill		4.50	NTF
7. Construction and Equipment of the Lome Teaching Hospital (CHU)	23-03-78	5.25	ADF
	25-03-80	3.50	ADB
8. Construction and Equipment of the Technical Junior Secondary School (C.E.T.)	08-04-82	9.21	ADF

9. Second Line of Credit to BTD	None	None	None
10. Kara-Ketao-Kemerida Road and Ketao-Kpagouda Link Road			
2. <u>List of Cancelled Projects</u>			

TOGO
List of Completed Projects by Sector
Portfolio Review Report

Name of Project	Approval Date	Signature Date	Loan/Grant Amount in M.UA	Completion Date	Sources
I. List of Completed Projects					
a) Projects for which Completion Reports have been prepared					
Multisector					
1. SAP I	24-06-88	21-11-88	13.82	31-12-93	ADF
2. SAP II	24-08-92	09-10-92	11.51	31-12-95	ADF
3. SAP III	21-05-97	29-05-97	11.20	30-05-98	ADF
Public Utilities					
1 Electric Power Dispatching, Generation and Transmission Centre	19-08-87		6.87		ADF
2. Telecommunications Project	16-01-90	20-04-90	5.53	31-12-91	ADF
3. Extension of Lome Electric Power Network	27-06-74	13-05-79	3.50	31-12-77	ADB
Projects for which Completion Reports are no longer necessary					
Banking and Industry					
1. Line of Credit to BTD	20-06-72	07-09-72	1.35	31-12-79	ADF
2. Second Line of Credit to BTD	25-03-80	26-06-80	3.50	31-12-79	ADB
3. Construction of a Palm Oil and Cotton Seed Oil Mill	19-09-77	24-11-77	3.81	31-12-81	ADB
Transport					
1. Upgrading and Asphaltting of the Sokode-Bassar Road I and II	25-03-75 07-07-78	06-05-75	4.15 4.61	01-03-78	ADF ADF
2. Feasibility and Engineering Study on the Yegue-Langabou Road	18-09-75	04-02-76	0.33	30-09-79	ADF
3. Taligbo-Lome Port Railway	18-12-76	09-03-77	5.00	31-12-80	ADF
4. Project for the Upgrading and Asphaltting of the Yegue-Langabou Road	26-04-79	17-05-79	7.71	01-03-83	ADF
Social Sector					
1. Construction and Equipment of the Lome Teaching Hospital (CHU)	17-10-78		2.00		ADB
c) Projects for which Completion Reports have not been prepared					
Transport					
1. Kara-Ketao-Kemerida Road and the Ketao-Kpagouda Link Road	08-04-82	20-03-84	9.21	30-06-93	ADF
Social Sector					
Construction and Equipment of the Technical Junior Secondary School (C.E.T.)	23-03-78	04-05-78	5.25	30-06-93	ADF
II. List of Cancelled Projects	None	None	None	None	None

TOGO
Summary of Ongoing Projects
Portfolio Review Report

N°	Approval Date	Name of Project	Source	Signature Date	Loan/Grant Amount	Disbursed Amount	Undisbursed Amount	Percentage	Date of Closure
1	<u>Multisector</u> 17-12-90	Support to M.P.A.T.	TAF	01-02-91	2.76	2.58	0.18	93.48	30-06-2001
1	<u>Human Resources Sector</u> 27-11-91	Rehabilitation of Regional Hospitals and Strengthening of the Central Supplies Pharmacy	ADF	13-05-92	13.81	5.74	8.08	41.5	Proposed on 31-12-1998 but the project will have to be cancelled
2	16-12-91	Education II	ADF	13-05-92	11.05	6.66	4.39	60.24	
3	04-09-97	Population Sector Study	TAF	17-10-97	1.0	0.65	0.35	65	
1	<u>Public Utilities Sector</u>		TAF		1.2	-	1.2	0	30-03-2001

	15-07-98	Study on Lome Sanitation and Drinking Water Supply in Semi-urban Centres		-					-
	Transport Sector	Rehabilitation of the Lome-Notse Road	ADF	10-05-99	12.18	2.09	10.09	17.16	31-12-2001

ANTOGO.1

TOGO
PORTFOLIO REVIEW REPORT
OVERALL PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT
BY SECTOR

Sector/Project	Loan Conditions	Procurement of Goods and Services	Financial Performance	Activities and Outputs	Development Objective	Overall Assessment
SOCIAL SECTOR						
1. RCHRRPCA	1	1.5	1	0.5	1	1
2. Education II	2	2	1.3	2	3	2.1
3. Population Sector Study	2.3	2.5	3	2.3	2.7	2.6
Average	1.8	2	1.5	1.6	2.2	1.8
TRANSPORT SECTOR						
1. Rehabilitation of the Lome-Notse Road	1.3	2.5	1.5	0.9	1.8	1.6
Average	1.3	2.5	1.5	0.9	1.8	1.6
MULTISECTOR						
1. Project for Institutional Support to the Ministry of Planning	2	3	2.3	2.2	3	2.5
Average	2	3	2.3	2.2	3	2.5
PUBLIC UTILITIES						
1. Study on Lome Sanitation and DWS in Secondary Centres	1	1	1	1	2	1.2
Average	1	1	1	1	2	1.2
Average	N.A	N.A	N.A	N.A	N.A	N.A
OVERALL AVERAGE	1.5	2.1	1.6	1.4	2.3	1.8

TOGO
PORTFOLIO REVIEW REPORT
PORTFOLIO ASSESSMENT

A.1 : PROJECT FOR THE REHABILITATION OF REGIONAL HOSPITALS AND THE STRENGTHENING OF THE CENTRAL SUPPLIES PHARMACY

PROJECT PERFORMANCE CRITERIA		
Indicators	Previous Report	This Project
A. Loan Conditions	<u>1</u>	1
1. Compliance with Conditions Precedent to Effectiveness	1	1
2. Compliance with General Conditions	1	1
3. Compliance with Other Conditions	1	1
B. Procurement of Goods and Services	2	1.5
1. Procurement of Consultancy Services	2	2
2. Procurement of Goods and Works	2	1
C. Financial Performance	1.5	1
1. Availability of Foreign Exchange	2	2
2. Availability of Local Currency	1	1
3. Disbursement Flow	1	1
4. Cost Management	2	1
5. Performance of Cofinanciers	N.A.	N.A..
D. Activities and Outputs	1.25	0.50
1. Adherence to Implementation Schedule	1	1
2. Performance of Assistants or Technical Assistants	2	0
3. Performances of Contractors	1	1
4. Performance of Project Management	1	0
E. Development Objective	2.66	1
1. Likelihood of Achieving Project Objectives	3	1
2. Likelihood of Sustaining Benefits beyond the Project Investment Phase.	3	1
3. Project Contribution to Institution Building	2	1
4. Expected Rate of Return	N.A.	N.A.
F. Overall Assessment	1.68	1
1. At present	2	1
2. Trend over time	2	1
Legend		
3 = Highly Satisfactory		
2 = Satisfactory. Occasional problems		
1 = Unsatisfactory. Bank should monitor closely		
0 = Highly Unsatisfactory. Serious problems		
* Ratings of 1996 Review Report		

TOGO
PORTFOLIO REVIEW REPORT
PORTFOLIO ASSESSMENT
A.2 : EDUCATION PROJECT II

PROJECT PERFORMANCE CRITERIA		
Indicators		
	Previous Report	This Report
A. Loan Conditions	1.66	2
1. Compliance with Conditions Precedent to Effectiveness	2	2
2. Compliance with General Conditions	2	2
3. Compliance with Other Conditions	1	2
B. Procurement of Goods and Services	2	2
1. Procurement of Consultancy Services	2	2
2. Procurement of Goods and Works	2	2
C. Financial Performance	1.75	1.3
1. Availability of Foreign Exchange	2	2
2. Availability of Local Currency	2	1
3. Disbursement Flow	1	1
4. Cost Management	2	1
5. Performance of Cofinanciers	N.A.	N.A.
D. Activities and Outputs	2	2
1. Adherence to Implementation Schedule	2	1
2. Performance of Assistants or Technical Assistants	2	3
3. Performance of Contractors	2	2
4. Performance of Project Management	2	2
5. Quality of Outputs	2	2
E. Development Objective	3	3
1. Likelihood of Achieving Project Objectives	3	3
2. Likelihood of Sustaining Benefits beyond the Project Investment Phase.	3	3
3. Project Contribution to Institutional Building	3	3
4. Expected Rate of Return	N.A.	
F. Overall Assessment	2.08	2.1
1. At present	2.0	2.5
2. Trend over time	3.0	3.0
Legend		
3 = Highly Satisfactory		
2 = Satisfactory. Occasional Problems		
1 = Unsatisfactory. The Bank should monitor		
0 = Highly unsatisfactory. Serious problems		

* Assessment in 1996 Review Report		
------------------------------------	--	--

TOGO
PORTFOLIO REVIEW REPORT
A.3. : POPULATION SECTOR STUDY

PROJECT PERFORMANCE CRITERIA		
Indicators	Previous Report *	This Report
A. Loan Conditions	N.A.	2.3
1. Compliance with Conditions Precedent to Effectiveness	N.A.	3
2. Compliance with General Conditions	N.A.	2
3. Compliance with Other Conditions	N.A.	2
B. Procurement of Goods and Services	N.A.	2.5
1. Procurement of Consultancy Services	N.A.	3
2. Procurement of Goods and Works	N.A.	2
C. Financial Performance	N.A.	3
1. Availability of Foreign Exchange	N.A.	3
2. Availability of Local Currency	N.A.	3
3. Disbursement Flow	N.A.	3
4. Cost Management	N.A.	N.A.
5. Performance of Cofinanciers	N.A.	N.A.
D. Activities and Outputs	N.A.	2.3
1. Adherence to Implementation Schedule	N.A.	2
2. Performance of Assistants or Technical Assistants	N.A.	2
3. Performance of Contractors	N.A.	3
4. Performance of Project Management	N.A.	2
E. Development Objective	N.A.	2.7
1. Likelihood of Achieving Project Objectives	N.A.	3
2. Likelihood of Sustaining Project Benefits beyond the Project Investment Phase	N.A.	3
3. Project Contribution to Institution Building	N.A.	2
4. Expected Rate of Return	N.A.	N.A.
F. Overall Assessment	N.A.	2.6
1. At present	N.A.	2.70
2. Trend over time	N.A.	2.80
Legend		
3 = Highly Satisfactory		
2 = Satisfactory. Occasional		
1 = Unsatisfactory. The Bank should monitor		
0 = Highly Unsatisfactory. Serious problems		
* New Project		

TOGO
PORTFOLIO REVIEW REPORT
PORTFOLIO ASSESSMENT
B : LOME-NOTSE ROAD REHABILITATION PROJECT

PROJECT PERFORMANCE CRITERIA		
Indicators		
	Previous Report *	This Report
A. Loan Conditions		1.3
1. Compliance with Conditions Precedent to Effectiveness	N.A.	2
2. Compliance with General Conditions	N.A.	2
3. Compliance with Other Conditions	N.A.	0
B. Procurement of Goods and Services	N.A.	2.5
1. Procurement of Consultancy Services	N.A.	2
2. Procurement of Goods and Works	N.A.	3
C. Financial Performance	N.A.	1.5
1. Availability of Foreign Exchange	N.A.	3
2. Availability of Local Currency	N.A.	1
3. Disbursement Flow	N.A.	0
4. Cost Management	N.A.	2
5. Performance of Cofinanciers		N.A.
D. Activities and Outputs	N.A.	0.9
1. Adherence to Implementation Schedule	N.A.	0
2. Performance of Assistants or Technical Assistants	N.A.	2
3. Performance of Contractors	N.A.	2
4. Performance of Project Management	N.A.	2
E. Development Objective	N.A.	1.8
1. Likelihood of Achieving Project Objectives	N.A.	2
2. Likelihood of Sustaining Benefits beyond the Project Investment Phase	N.A.	2
3. Project Contribution Institution Building	N.A.	1
4. Expected Rate of Return	N.A.	2
F. Overall Assessment	N.A.	1.6
1. At Present	N.A.	2
2. Trend over time	N.A.	2.2
Legend		
3 = Highly Satisfactory		
2 = Satisfactory. Occasional problems		
1 = Unsatisfactory. The Bank should monitor closely		
0 = Highly unsatisfactory. Serious problems		
* New Project		

TOGO
PORTFOLIO REVIEW REPORT
PORTFOLIO ASSESSMENT

C :PROJECT FOR INSTITUTIONAL SUPPORT TO THE MINISTRY OF PLANNING

PROJECT PERFORMANCE CRITERIA		
Indicators	Previous F *	Present Report
A. Loan Conditions	1	2
1. Compliance with Conditions Precedent to Effectiveness	1	2
2. Compliance with General Conditions	1	2
3. Compliance with Other Conditions	1	2
B. Procurement of Goods and Services	2	3
1. Procurement of Consultancy Services	2	3
2. Procurement of Goods and Works	2	3
C. Financial Performance	1.66	2.3
1. Availability of Foreign Exchange	N.A.	3
2. Availability of Local Currency	1	1
3. Disbursement Flow	2	2
4. Cost Management	2	3
5. Performance of Cofinanciers	N.A.	N.A
D. Activities and Outputs	2	2.2
1. Adherence to Implementation Schedule	1	2
2. Performance of Assistants or Technical Assistants	3	2
3. Performance of Contractors	2	2
4. Performance of Project Management	2	3
E. Development Objective	2.33	3
1. Likelihood of Achieving Project Objective	3	3
2. Likelihood of Sustaining Benefits beyond the Project Investment Phase.	2	3
3. Project Contribution to Institution Building	2	3
4. Expected Rate of Return	N.A.	N.A
F. Overall Assessment	1.8	2.5
1. At present	2.1	2.6
2. Trend over time	2.5	2.8
Legend		
3 = Highly Satisfactory		
2 = Satisfactory, occasional problems		
1 = Unsatisfactory. The Bank should monitor closely		
0 = Highly Unsatisfactory. Serious problems		
*Assessment in 1996 Review Report		

TOGO
PORTFOLIO REVIEW REPORT
D : STUDY ON LOME SANITATION AND DWS IN 20 SECONDARY CENTRES

PROJECT PERFORMANCE CRITERIA		
Indicators	Previous Report*	This Report
A. Loan Conditions	N.A.	1
1. Compliance with Conditions Precedent to Effectiveness	N.A.	1
2. Compliance with General Conditions	N.A.	1
3. Compliance with Other Conditions	N.A.	1
B. Procurement of Goods and Services	N.A.	1
1. Procurement of Consultancy Services	N.A.	1
2. Procurement of Goods and Works	N.A.	N.A.
C. Financial Performance	N.A.	1
1. Availability of Foreign Exchange	N.A.	1
2. Availability of Local Currency	N.A.	1
3. Disbursement Flow	N.A.	N.A.
4. Cost Management	N.A.	N.A.
5. Performance of Cofinanciers	N.A.	N.A.
D. Activities and Outputs	N.A.	1
1. Adherence to Implementation Schedule	N.A.	1
2. Performance of Assistants or Technical Assistants	N.A.	1
3. Performance of Contractors	N.A.	1
4. Performance of Project Management	N.A.	1
E. Development Objective	N.A.	2
1. Likelihood of Achieving Project Objectives	N.A.	2
2. Likelihood of Sustaining Benefits beyond the Project Investment Phase	N.A.	2
3. Project Contribution to Institution Building	N.A.	2
4. Expected Rate of Return	N.A.	N.A.
F. Overall Assessment	N.A.	1.2
3. At present	N.A.	1
4. Trend over time	N.A.	1
Legend		
3 = Highly Satisfactory		
2 = Satisfactory, occasional problems		
1 = Unsatisfactory, the Bank should monitor closely		
0 = Highly Unsatisfactory, serious problems		
* New Project		

TOGO
Portfolio Review Report
Plan of Action to Solve Problems

PROJECTS	PROBLEMS IDENTIFIED	ACTIONS TO BE TAKEN	RESPONSIBLE BODIES	TIME FRAME
<p><u>Transport Sector</u></p> <p>Lome-Notse Road Rehabilitation Project</p>	<p>a) Non fulfillment of other loan conditions (quarterly payment of 160 million to project account).</p> <p>b) Failure to monitor mitigative environmental measures</p> <p>c) Some project areas have become marshy and insufficient consideration of sanitation in built-up areas</p> <p>d) Failure to establish a revolving fund for support to DGTP.</p> <p>e) delay in the preparation of the</p>	<p>a) Pay 160 million regularly into the project account.</p> <p>b) Assessment by the Monitoring Committee of environmental measures, the cost of those measures and the financial package and submit to the Bank within a maximum of six months the report on the follow-up measures.</p> <p>c) Conduct the geotechnical study to determine the volume drained and backfill and an assessment of the additional sanitation works</p> <p>d) Submit to the Bank a request for the first tranche of the revolving fund in the project account in</p>	<p>a) Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Planning; Ministry of PW</p> <p>b) DGTP</p> <p>c) DGTP</p> <p>d) DGTP</p> <p>e) DGTP</p>	<p>a) Quarterly on 30/10/2000 for the request</p> <p>b) 30 April 2001</p> <p>c) 31 December 2000</p> <p>d) 30 October 2000</p> <p>e) 30 October 2000</p>

	<p>file for the acquisition and installation of support staff.</p>	<p>Lome. e) Prepare the bidding documents for the audit, equipment and supplies in respect of support to DGPT and submit a request to the Bank to cover the cost of a secretary</p>		
--	--	---	--	--

<p><u>Social Sector</u></p> <p>1- Rehabilitation of Regional Hospitals and Strengthening of Central Supplies Pharmacy</p>	<p>a) Repeated suspensions of disbursements by the Bank because of sanctions</p> <p>b) Suppliers and even the Administration no longer accept Public Treasury cheques</p> <p>c) Non extension of the deadline for disbursements (31 December 1998) by the Bank</p> <p>d) Shortage of cement owing to country-wide power outages</p> <p>e) Payment of taxes by the Project</p> <p>f) Shortcomings of the Firm of Architects (BEA) :</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> . consistency of BDs . technical supervisory staff <p>g) Shortcomings of Technical Assistance (TA)</p>	<p>a) Regularly pay loan amounts due and the project counterpart funds</p> <p>b) Make the project funds available to the Public Treasury.</p> <p>c) Extend the deadline for disbursements to 31 December 2002 if the operational audit is positive</p> <p>d) Ensure the availability of cement</p> <p>e) Consultation between the interested services: - Technical Ministries and Ministries of Finance</p> <p>f) Beef up the supervision team with top-level experts or terminate their contract and have the remainder of the works monitored by the PIU staff.</p> <p>g) Beef up the supervision team with top-level experts or terminate their contract and have the remainder of the works monitored by PIU staff.</p>	<p>Public Treasury</p> <p>Public Treasury</p> <p>ADB</p> <p>Togolese State</p> <p>Ministry of Planning</p> <p>SODETEG/AEN Grouping, Ministry of Health</p> <p>SERT ROCHE Ministry of Health</p> <p>ADB Public</p>	<p>Six (06) months</p> <p>Immediately</p> <p>Immediately</p> <p>Ongoing</p> <p>Immediately</p> <p>Immediately</p> <p>Immediately</p> <p>From</p>
---	--	---	--	--

<p>2- Education II ETPP Component</p>	<p>of structures and equipment</p> <p>s) Award of contracts to bidders on the basis of the least evaluated bid criterion in terms of cost and quality.</p> <p>a) Slippage on the construction of the CRETFF</p> <p>b) Slippage on the preparation of the manual for the maintenance of infrastructure and furniture.</p> <p>c) Delay in the organization of a sensitization seminar for inspectors and pupil's parents.</p>	<p>the experience of bidders.</p> <p>a) Regularly settle invoices</p> <p>b) Prepare the Maintenance Manual</p> <p>c) Organize the seminar</p> <p>d) Select the Firm of Auditors and submission of shortlist to ADB</p> <p>e) Payment of counterpart funds and arrears on repayments</p>	<p>Gvt + ADB if sanctions lifted</p> <p>PIU</p> <p>PIU</p> <p>PIU EDU II</p> <p>Gvt + ADB if sanctions lifted</p>	<p>30 October 2000</p> <p>30.11. 2000</p> <p>31.12.2000</p> <p>30.11.2000</p> <p>15 October 2000</p>
<p>Education II (National Education Component)</p>	<p>d) Delay in the submission of the 1998 and 1999 audit reports</p> <p>e) Low disbursement rate</p> <p>a) Delay in the payment of the counterpart funds</p> <p>b) Failure to comply with the procurement of goods and services</p>	<p>a) Invite the Government to position the amount to be made available to the project annually in a special account in a commercial bank.</p> <p>b) Sensitize the members of the National Procurement Committee to the procurement procedures for ADB Group-financed goods and services.</p> <p>c) Organize a training workshop seminar on the management of projects by the ADB Group.</p>	<p>Ministry of Planning and Development and Finance, the Economy and Privatization, the Office of the Prime Minister.</p> <p>The ADB Group.</p>	<p>30.11.2000</p>

<p>3 – Population Sector Study</p>	<p>c) Shortcomings of Project Executing Agency staff.</p> <p>d) Slippage on implementation</p> <p>1- Slippage on the endorsement of orientations and options retained.</p> <p>2- Shortcomings of the Population Planning Directorate</p> <p>3- Share of the State in the financing not specified</p> <p>4- Contribution of State not known by ADB</p> <p>5- Lack of coordination meetings organized by CECE.</p> <p>6- Lack of resources for surveys and the cabling of SII-POP sites</p>	<p>d) Comply with the procedures and make the financial resources available.</p> <p>1- Establish the Interministerial Consultative Committee</p> <p>2- Submit to the Bank a plan to strengthen the DPP.</p> <p>3- Accurately calculate the State's contribution</p> <p>4- Communicate this assessment to the ADB.</p> <p>5- Organize administrative coordination meetings</p> <p>6- Authorize supplementary expenditure of CFA.F 47 million and 23 million respectively to carry out those operations.</p>	<p>Already done in Cotonou in 1999.</p> <p>Ministry of Finance and ADB Group if sanctions are lifted</p> <p>Ministry of Planning</p> <p>Ministry of Planning</p> <p>Ministry of Planning</p> <p>Ministry of Planning</p> <p>Ministry of Planning</p> <p>Ministry of Planning</p> <p>ADB</p>	<p>30.11.2001</p> <p>Ongoing</p> <p>1-11-2000</p> <p>15-12-2000</p> <p>20-10-2000</p> <p>31-10-2000</p> <p>Ongoing</p> <p>31-12-2000</p>
<p>Public Utilities Sector</p>		<p>1) ensure grant</p>	<p>Ministry of Transport</p>	<p>30 October 2000</p>

<p>Studies on Lome Sanitation and DWS in Secondary Centres</p>	<p>1) Non effectiveness of grant</p> <p>1) Delay in consideration by ADB of the effectiveness documents for the projects submitted</p> <p>2) Delay in consideration of consultancy recruitment documents by the Bank.</p> <p>3) Lack of familiarity of PIU with the Bank's rules.</p> <p>5) Lack of monitoring of the study by the Bank and Government</p>	<p>effectiveness</p> <p>2) speed up the review by the Bank of documents submitted</p> <p>3) speed up the review by the Bank of consultancy documents submitted.</p> <p>4) see to the training of members of the PIU who should seek information from the other executing agencies and the Ministry of Planning regarding the Bank's rules and procedures.</p> <p>5) ensure regular monitoring of the study by the Government and the Bank.</p>	<p>and Water Resources, Ministry of Planning</p> <p>Infrastructure and Industry Division of the Bank</p> <p>Infrastructure and Industry Division of the Bank</p> <p>Ministry of Transport and Water Resources, the Ministry of Planning.</p> <p>Ministry of Planning, the Ministry of Transport and Water Resources and the Infrastructure and Industry Division of the Bank.</p>	<p>30 October 2000</p> <p>30 October 2000</p> <p>Ongoing</p> <p>Ongoing</p>
---	--	--	---	---

TOGO

Portfolio Review Report
Matrix of Common Problems

Problems	Rehabilitation of the Lome-Notse Road	Education II	Strengthening of Hospitals and the Central Supplies Pharmacy	Population Sector Study	Study on Sanitation and DWS in Secondary Centres	Institutional Support to the Ministry of Planning	East Mono Development Project
Availability of Counterpart Funds	X	X	X		X	X	N.A.
Non Compliance with the Procurement Rules of Procedure			X		X		N.A.
Non Submission of Activity Reports	X						N.A.
Management Problem			X		X		N.A.
Weak Capacity of the Executing Agency	X	X	X		X	X	N.A.
Slippage on Physical Implementation of Project	X	X	X		X	X	N.A.
Slippage on Effectiveness		X	X		X	X	N.A.
Failure to Conduct Audit	X	X		X			N.A.

TOGO
Portfolio Review Report
Matrix of Crosscutting Issues

Crosscutting Issues	Rehabilitation of the Lome-Notse Road	Education II	Rehabilitation Of Regional Hospitals and the Central Supplies Pharmacy.	Population Sector Study	Study on Sanitation and DWS in Secondary Centres	Institutional Support to the Ministry of Planning	East Mono Rural Development
Environment	X	X	X		X	X	X
Gender Issues	X	X	X	X		X	X
Participatory Approach	X	X			X		X
Poverty Reduction	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Population	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Microcredit							X
Regional Integration	X						
Social Issues	X	X	x	x	X	x	X

TOGO
2000 PORTFOLIO REVIEW REPORT
Analysis of Implementation Status (I.S.) and Development Objectives (D.O.) of
the Portfolio in October 2000
Concerning Projects being Satisfactorily Implemented and Potentially
Problematic Projects.

I. PROJECTS BEING SATISFACTORILY IMPLEMENTED

	I.S.	D.O.
Education II	1.8	3
Support Project	2.4	3
Sectoral Study	2.5	2.7
Total	2.2	2.9

II. POTENTIALLY PROBLEMATIC PROJECTS

Health Project	1	1
Lome-Notse Road	1.6	1.8
Sanitation Study and DWS	1	2
Total	1.2	1.6

III. OVERALL PORTFOLIO ASSESSMENT

Grand Total	1.7	2.3
-------------	-----	-----