

PROGRAMME COMPLETION REPORT (PCR)

A. PROJECT DATA AND KEY DATES

I. BASIC INFORMATION

Project Number P-BJ-IZ0-001	Project Title Human Resource Development Programme (HRDP)	Country Republic of Benin
Lending ADF Loan	Instrument(s)	Sector Social Sector
Environmental Category II		
Original Commitment Amount ADF loan: UA 10 million TAF grant: UA 2 million	Amount Cancelled	Amount Disbursed UA 8.28 million UA 2.00 million
% disbursed ADF loan: 82.8% (Payments for additional activities have to be disbursed) TAF grant: 100%		
Borrower: Government of the Republic of Benin		
Executing Agencies: MPDEPP - CAG: Ministry of Forward Planning, Development, Public Policy Evaluation and Coordination of Government Action		
Co-financiers and Other External Partners: Government: UA 1.88 million, OPEC loan: UA 5.58 million		

II. KEY DATES

Project Concept Note Cleared by Ops. Com. NA	Appraisal Report Cleared by Ops. Com. NA	Board Approval: 15 March 2000	
Restructuring(s): This project was not restructured. However, it was extended 4 times.			
	Original Date	Actual Date	Difference in months [between original date and actual date]
EFFECTIVENESS	August 2000	17-Dec-2001	16 months
MID-TERM REVIEW	2004 (2 years after commencement of activities)	Sector Portfolio Improvement Plan prepared in February 2007	36 months
CLOSING	31-Dec-2005	30-Sept-2010	57 months

III. RATINGS SUMMARY

CRITERIA	SUB-CRITERIA	RATING
PROJECT OUTCOME	Achievement of Outputs	2
	Achievement of Outcomes	2

	Timeliness	1
	OVERALL PROJECT OUTCOME	2
BANK PERFORMANCE	Design and Readiness	3
	Supervision	2
	OVERALL BANK PERFORMANCE	2
BORROWER PERFORMANCE	Design and Readiness	2
	Execution	2
	OVERALL BORROWER PERFORMANCE	2

IV. RESPONSIBLE BANK STAFF

POSITIONS	AT APPROVAL	AT COMPLETION
Regional Director	N/A	Mr. Janvier LITSE
Sector Director	Mr. R. SPENCER	Ms. Agnès SOUCAT
Task Manager	Mr. J.E PORGO	Mr. Massissou N. HATHOURA
PCR Team Leader	N/A	Mr. Massissou N. HATHOURA
PCR Team Members	N/A	One Consultant Architect and one Education Consultant

B. PROJECT CONTEXT

Summarize the rationale for Bank assistance. State: -what development challenge the project addresses-the borrower's overall strategy for addressing it, -Bank activities in this country (ies) and sector over the past year and how they performed, and -ongoing Bank and other externally financed activities that complement, overlap with or relate to this projectPlease cite relevant sources. Comment on the strength and coherence of the rationale. 00 words maximum. Any additional narrative about the project's origins and history, if needed, must be placed in Annex 6: Project Narrative]

Development challenge addressed by the project: The challenge targeted by the project is poverty reduction, which is the primary objective of the Government's Policy Plan. In 1998, 34% of the population suffered from monetary poverty; according to the HDI (0.378), Benin was ranked in the 145th position in the world.

Sectorchallenges:

(i) The education sector was characterized by: (a) the lack of primary (in rural areas) and secondary education infrastructure; (b) Low internal efficiency due to a shortage of inspectors and weaknesses in training teachers. Vocational training mechanisms did not meet the expectations of economicstakeholders.

(ii) The health sector was characterized by insufficient infrastructure coverage leading to inadequacies in maternal and child health, as well as in malaria and HIV/AIDScontrol.

(iii) Community development was hampered by the fragile status of women on the educational, economic, legal and medical front.

Borrower's overall strategy for addressing this challenge – Upstream, the PDRH sought to build the institutional capacity of sector ministries in planning and monitoring/evaluation (Health, Education, Family). Downstream, it tackled infrastructure and service problems on the ground. The programme pursued twin objectives: (i) synergy between the various areas of human development (education, health, gender, vocational training); (ii) sensitize the planning departments of sector ministries to needs expressed by the population. The ultimate goal was to guarantee the population's access to basic services defined as the Common Social Minimum (CSM).

Bank activities in this country and sector over the last year - Social projects (4) represent 21% of the active portfolio and focus on education (Education IV, UA 12 million), health (UA 2-.7 million) and poverty reduction (UA 11 million).

On-going Bank and other externally financed activities that complement, overlap with or relate to this project - The WB operates in the following areas: (i) health (USD 88.8 million), (ii) poverty reduction (grant of USD 30 million), and (iii) primary education (Fast-track Initiative). The European Union is involved in local development (EUR 45 million over the 2008-2010 period). Bilateral partners (Germany-GTZ, United States-USAID, Belgium, Japan, France, Denmark) also intervene in the community development, vocational training and primary education sectors. The TFPs set up a consultative mechanism to coordinate their operations in the health and education sectors. Sources: Appraisal Report, Supervision Report, Portfolio Review Report of May 2010, WB and bilateral cooperation websites. Details of the context are given in Annex 6.

C. PROJECT OBJECTIVES AND LOGICAL FRAMEWORK

1. State the Project Development Objective(s) (as set out in the appraisal report)

The programme's sector objective is to contribute to poverty reduction through human capital development. To that end, the programme targets the following specific objectives: (i) capacity-building for human resource and planning departments under the Ministries of Health, Education and the Family; and (ii) community access to basic services, especially in rural areas.

2. Describe the major project components and indicate how each will contribute to achieving the Project Development Objective(s).

The programme is underpinned by an integrated human resources development approach in health, education, gender, social development, training and employment. Upstream, it targets capacity-building for the ministries and, downstream, it seeks to ensure the availability of services and infrastructure that guarantee the CSM. The project comprises the following components

Component 1 – Institution Building

This component seeks to build the capacity of services under the Ministries of Family and National Solidarity (MFSN), Education and Health (MH) to enable them to address the needs of grassroots communities through implementation of the Common Social Minimum. The activities focus on technical assistance, training, construction and the supply of furniture and equipment.

(i) Gender and development: human capacity-building (training, technical assistance) for the MFSN; supply of equipment and furniture to the Directorate of Communication and Social Mobilisation and the Directorate of Programming and Forward Planning.

(ii) Education: human and material capacity-building for the Ministry of Education. Apart from the corps of inspectors, the training also targets the Directorate of Programming and Forward Planning (DPP) and the Directorate of Human Resources (DRH). Technical assistance for the preparation of a Technical Education and Vocational Training (TEVT) strategy, the setting-up of a statistics system and preparation of school mapping. The DRH is equipped with furniture and equipment for its functioning.

(iii) Health: human and material capacity-building for the MH: a training and technical assistance programme on planning, management, monitoring/evaluation is organized to support the Directorate of Programming and Forward Planning. OPEC finances the construction and equipment of the DRH of the MH.

Component 2 – Improving Community Access to Basic Services

Activities under this component seek to create concrete conditions for community enjoyment of the Common Social Minimum. Such activities focus on the building of infrastructure in the social, education/training, and health sectors; procurement of equipment and furniture; and training.

(i) Community development: construction of classrooms, school canteens, village health units and boreholes. Birth attendants are trained.

(ii) Gender and development: construction/rehabilitation of Social Promotion Centres (SPCs), training of social assistants and female community workers. Awareness-raising and training campaigns for the community, especially women, on the Persons and Family Code (CDPF), maternal and child health, nutrition monitoring, environmental health, hygiene, family planning are conducted by NGOs and taken over by previously trained community relay officers.

(iii) Employment and vocational training: construction of 2 new apprenticeship centres with an intake capacity of 250 and a boarding capacity of 100 places. These centres are for out-of-school youth, drop-outs, adults, unemployed graduates and craftsmen. A prospective study on rural unemployment has been conducted.

(iv) Health: The programme plans to rehabilitate/construct 23 health centres (HCs) with OPEC financing. Apart from the training of medical and para-medical human resources, the programme provides for a prevention campaign which includes capacity-building for medical relay officers and awareness-raising through IEC, under the NMCP and NACP. Provision is also made for the procurement of diagnostic kits and laboratory equipment for material capacity-building in malaria control.

Component 3 – Programme Implementation

This component aims at providing the necessary resources to structures involved in programme implementation

(i) Technical capacity-building: The capacity of the human resource service of the National Directorate of Planning and Forward Planning (DNPP) under the MPDEPP-CAG needs to be developed through technical assistance in management, auditing, procurement, accounting systems and architecture, and through the supply of additional furniture and equipment. The technical ministries (Education, Health, Family, Planning) were provided with 4 vehicles for activity monitoring.

(ii) Miscellaneous operating costs, allowances for sector coordinators (Education, Health, Family, Plan), the main coordinator and support staff, as well as office rental.

3. Provide a brief assessment (up to two sentences) of the project objectives along the following 3 dimensions. Insert a working score, using the scoring scale provided in Appendix 1.

PROJECT OBJECTIVES DIMENSIONS		APPRAISAL	SCORE
RELEVANT	a) Relevant to the country's development priorities	The project is relevant to the Government's Policy Plan, the Population Policy Declaration (DEPOLIPO 1996-2016) which sets out the strategic guidelines later retained in the 2003-2005 Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper, namely: (i) human resource development mainly through improvement of community access to basic services: education (basic, secondary and technical education as well as vocational training to boost economic diversification), health (reproductive health, malaria and HIV/AIDS control), drinking water; (ii) institution building for the social ministries.	3

ACHIEVABLE	b) Objectives deemed achievable considering the contributions to the project and the envisaged timeframe	- Given the excessive bureaucracy in Benin (delays in signing documents, bottlenecks at the DNMP and CAA) that all TFPs have complained about, it would have been preferable to explore the possibility of setting deadlines for the speedy processing of documents. - The complexity of a multi-sector project (Health, Education, Gender and Development) is based on many untested assumptions: (i) the capacity of the Project Management Unit to coordinate activities; (ii) equal ownership of the project by the 3 sector ministries; (iii) coordination of activities between the sector ministries at both the central and district levels to promote synergy between the networks and set up; (iv) ownership of the project by local councils, so that they can contribute to the smooth running and integration of services and infrastructure.	2
CONSISTENT	c) Consistent with the Bank's country or regional strategy	The programme is consistent with CSP 1999-2001: poverty reduction is based mainly on investment in social sectors to improve schooling, access to basic health services, training/employment and the status of women. These actions should contribute to building human capacity to address labour market needs and improve the status of women.	3
	d) Consistent with the Bank's corporate priorities	The programme is consistent with the pursuit of the Millennium Development Goals since it supports poverty reduction (MDG1), universal primary education (MDG2), gender equality and women's empowerment (MDG3), reduction of infant mortality (MDG4) and maternal death (MDG5). Specifically, the programme is consistent with the priorities of the Bank's Gender Action Plan (2004-2007 and 2009-2011), malaria and HIV/AIDS control strategies (MDG6) (capacity-building for decentralized services and community units, awareness-raising campaigns, screening).	3

4. Lay out the logical framework. Summarize the log. frame. If a log. frame does not exist, complete the table below, indicating the overall project development objective, the major components of the project, the major activities of each component and their expected outputs, outcomes, and indicators for measuring the achievement of outcomes. Add additional rows for components, activities, outputs or outcomes if needed.

COMPONENTS	ACTIVITIES	OUTPUTS	EXPECTED OUTCOMES	INDICATORS TO BE MEASURED
Component 1 – Institution Building	Activity 1 – Gender and development. Capacity-building for MFSN / equipment and furniture	Output 1 – procurement of furniture and equipment for the Directorate of Communication and Social Mobilisation and the DPP	Outcome 1 – MFSN's material capacity is enhanced.	- Reception of equipment

Activity 2 – Gender and development. Capacity-building for MFSN / Training/technical assistance	Output 2- - Training of 2 officials in development planning, 3 in gender/development, 3 in cooperative economics, 5 in IEC and social mobilisation; - Technical assistance (i) 60 (P/M) to plan MFSN activities; (ii) 36 P/M to collect, process and disseminate social statistics	Outcome 2 – MFSN’s human capacity is enhanced; it has an intervention plan accompanied by a monitoring/evaluation plan, and gender-sensitive social statistics	- Social statistics - Conduct of training - Technical assistance reports
Activity 3 – Education, training/material capacity-building	Output 3 - Equipment and furniture for the DRH	Outcome 3 – MENRS’ material capacity is enhanced.	- Reception of equipment
Activity 4 – Education, Training/human capacity-building	Output 4 -- Training of: (i) 24 secondary school inspectors; (ii) DPP: 3 officials in education planning, 4 in statistics; (iii) DRH: 16 officials in record keeping, 16 in budget preparation, execution and control, 10 in administrative techniques and 3 in human resource management; - Technical assistance to: (i) define the Technical Education and Vocational Training (TEVT) policy through preparation of a sub-sector master plan; (ii) set up a system for the collection, effective processing and dissemination of school statistics (60 P/M) and preparation of school mapping	Outcome 4 - - MENRS’ human capacity is enhanced; - MENRS has a TEVP strategic plan; - MENRS has a system to collect, process, and disseminate statistical data, and school mapping which ensures the equitable geographic distribution of schools and teachers based on enrolments.	- Preparation of school mapping - Preparation of technical education and vocational training (TEVT) policy - End-of-course dissertations of inspectors - Setting-up of a statistical data collection system
Activity 5 – Health / construction and equipment	Output 5 - - Construction and equipment of the DRH of MH with OPEC funds	Outcome 5 – Construction of the DRH increases the efficiency of the ministry	- Building constructed
Activity 6 – Health/capacity-building	Output 6 - Training of 24 DPP officials in design, planning, monitoring, evaluation	Outcome 6 - - MH’s human capacity is enhanced;	- Request for the monitoring/evaluation

		and coordination of activities; - Technical assistance of 12 P/M for the design, planning, monitoring, evaluation and coordination of activities.	- The MH has an intervention framework coupled with a monitoring/evaluation plan	plan prepared with technical assistance
Component 2 – Improving community access to basic services	Activity 1 – Community development infrastructure /	Output 1 - Construction and equipment of 51 classrooms and 10 school canteens; - Construction and equipment of 20 village health units (VHU) and 10 boreholes; activities executed in the districts of Atlantique, Atacora, Borgou and Zou.	Outcome 1 - Infrastructure and training ensure access to the Common Social Minimum (MSC): access to health centres is within 5 km; - School canteens improve the nutritional status of children	In the target project areas: - number of classrooms built; - number of canteens built; - number of pupils benefitting from the canteen in project areas; - distance to the health centre; - number of VHUs; - number of and distance from boreholes
	Activity 2 – Community development / training	Output 2 – Training of 20 birth attendants	Outcome 2 – Decline in infant mortality and maternal death, control of population growth	- Maternal death and infant mortality rates in project areas
	Activity 3 – Gender and development / construction	Output 3 - Construction / rehabilitation of 8 SPCs in Atlantique, Borgou, Ouémé and Zou	Outcome 3 - Women’s capacity to participate in development is enhanced through improvement of their educational, economic, health and legal conditions. About 4800 additional women attend the SPC and about 5000 children benefit from nutrition monitoring - Construction of the SPCs enables women to improve their knowledge of managing the micro-credit granted them.	- % of children suffering from malnutrition in the target regions

	<p>Activity 4 – Gender and development / training, adoption of and awareness-raising on the family code</p>	<p>Output 4 -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Retraining of 30 social assistants and training of 30 female community workers in home and social economics, hygiene, maternal and child health (MCH), family planning, and environmental health; - Adoption of the Persons and Family Code not later than August 2002; - Awareness-raising campaign and training for the population, especially women (2 million), on women's rights, the persons and family code, MCH, nutrition, hygiene and family planning by NGOs and continued by 250 trained community relay officers. 	<p>Outcome 4 -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The rights of women, persons and the family are enforced such that women and the family are better protected. - CDUs become the primary actors in the improvement of social wellbeing. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Number of persons affected.
	<p>Activity 5 – Employment and vocational training / construction and equipment</p>	<p>Output 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Construction and equipment of 2 new apprenticeship centres in Niki and Pahou (intake capacity of 250 trainees, including 100 boarders) to provide vocational training to out-of-school youth, drop-outs, unemployed adults and craftsmen. Fields of specialization: (i) Nikki: embroidery, weaving, dyeing, leathercraft, cattle rearing, fish farming, vegetable farming; (ii) Pahou: refrigeration, air conditioning, plumbing, ornamental metal work, welding, metal construction work, stockbreeding and vegetable farming - Operating costs of the centres provided by the government, local councils, associations, revenue from production centres and counterpart training costs paid by the youths themselves. 	<p>Outcome 5 – The training centres make it possible to address production sector demand. Access to such training is facilitated for beneficiary out-of-school youth and dropouts. About 500 additional youth are trained each year.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Proportion of women in the total workforce; - gender-sensitive success rate in final exam; - gender-sensitive drop-out rate; - percentage of trained youth who secure employment 6 months after training; - strategic plans of the establishments as well as progress reports.
	<p>Activity 6 – Employment and vocational training; Training and technical assistance</p>	<p>Output 6 -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Retraining of trainers; - Technical assistance of 6 S/M to conduct the prospective study on rural employment. 	<p>Outcome 6 –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The training is of good quality, the drop-out rate is low. - The study on rural employment finetunes the TEVT strategic framework 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Gender-sensitive drop-out rate; - success rate in exam; - conduct of the study.

<p>Activity 7 – Employment and vocational training / Start-up funding</p>		<p>Output 7 – A start-up fund (CFAF 350 million = UA 0.41 million) makes it possible to launch graduates of the apprenticeship centres into business. Each graduate receives CFAF 700,000, of which CFAF 600,000 as loan for the procurement of tools and equipment necessary for the conduct of productive activities. The graduates have to pay training costs of CFAF 100,000. Selection criteria: project viability/profitability, priority given to beneficiaries organised into groups and to women. Funds managed by FECECAM. Monitoring by: Department of Vocational Development, Coordination of New Employment Initiatives and Projects (CIPEN), CAA.</p>	<p>Outcome 7 – Start-up fund improves access rate to employment. 500 youths develop productive activities</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 500 youths develop productive activities; - percentage of women beneficiaries; - survival rate of created micro-enterprises after 3 years, per sector; - start-up fund strategic plan.
<p>Activity 8 - Education</p>		<p>Output 8 -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Construction and equipment of 150 classrooms for primary schools (in Atacora, Borgou and Mono Districts) and 4 general secondary schools (4 classrooms in each of the following districts: Atacora, Borgou, Atlantique, Mono); - Construction and equipment of a centre for young girls in Ouidah to improve secondary education for young girls. 	<p>Outcome 8 -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Infrastructure construction increases the gross enrolment ratio (GER) in the project regions, thus reducing regional inequalities; - About 9,045 additional pupils are admitted annually into primary schools; - About 650 additional students are admitted annually into secondary schools; - the GER in primary schools rises from 75.8% in 1998 to 85.5% in 2004 (GER for girls rises from 59.7% to 69.5%); - the GER in secondary schools rises from 14.6% in 1998 to 20% in 2004 (GER for girls rises from 9.24% to 13% in 2004). 	<p>In project regions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Boy/girl ratio in primary and secondary education; - General and gender-sensitive GER in primary and secondary education.
<p>Activity 9 - Health</p>		<p>Output 9 - (OPEC financing)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Construction / rehabilitation and equipment of 23 health centres, including 5 CSSPs and 18 CCSs (Mono, Atlantique, Atacora Districts); - Protocol agreement certifying OPEC's commitment. 	<p>Outcome 9 – Construction of health centres leads to improvement of health indicators (infant and maternal mortality). The educational, health and legal operations of the programme make it possible to control population growth, reduce maternal death and infant mortality, giving women a greater role in improving the lives of households.</p>	<p>In project regions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - maternal death and infant mortality rates; - number of births assisted by qualified health staff.

	Activity 10 – Health training	<p>Output 10</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Training of 36 para-medics and 60 sanitation workers in INMES, 20 officials of AOMPCS centres trained at the National Healthcare Institute (INMES); - Malaria control: 268 health workers, 200 community relay officers, 20 laboratory technicians trained. Health centres provided with 77 diagnostic kits and 24 laboratory equipment kits, production of IEC media: 1000 posters on coma, mosquito nets, chemoprophylaxis; - AIDS control: 200 community relay officers trained (targeted areas Dogbo, Djakotomey, Lokossa, Aplahoué, Savalou); IEC media - 10,000 leaflets and 10 broadcasts per year in national languages. 	<p>Outcome 10 -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Human resource training at the health centre leads to improvement of indicators; - Percentage of malaria cases in total consultations drops from 34% in 1998 to 20% in 2004; - Of total HIV/AIDS transmissions, the rate of sexually-transmitted cases declines from 92% to 40%. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Rate of malaria consultations; - HIV/AIDS sexual transmission rate
Component 3 – Programme Implementation	Activity 1 – Capacity-building	<p>Output 1 -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Technical assistance: 60 S/M for administration/management, 20 S/M for auditing of accounts, 60 S/M for procurement, 10 S/M for the establishment of an accounting system; 60 S/M for the architect; - Conduct of the project accounts audit 	<p>Outcome 1 -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Building the technical capacity of the project implementation unit allows for successful implementation of activities; - The unit produces quarterly, annual and completion reports; - The financial management of the project is consistent with Bank rules. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Preparation of progress and completion reports
	Activity 2 - Operation	<p>Output 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Additional furniture and equipment, purchase of cars for the ministries (Education, Health, Family, Planning); - Salaries of sector coordinators (Education, Health, Family, Plan), Main Coordinator, office staff salaries (2 secretaries, 6 drivers, 1 messenger), office rental costs. 	<p>Outcome 2-</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The sector coordinators and the implementation unit carry out management and monitoring/evaluation work involving field visits. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Number of supervision missions; - preparation of audit reports.

5. For each dimension of the log. frame, provide a brief assessment (up to two sentences) of the extent to which the log. frame achieved the following. Insert a working score, using the scoring scale provided in Appendix 1. If no log. frame exists, score this section as a 1 (one).

LOG. FRAME DIMENSIONS		APPRAISAL	SCORE
LOGICAL	a) Presents a logical causal chain for achieving the project development objectives	Logical framework is largely incomplete. The causal chain / activities / outputs / outcomes are not discussed in detail. The document does not give details of the conditions necessary for sustainability of activities financed.	1
MEASURABLE	b) Expresses objectives and outcomes in a way that is measurable and quantifiable	The appraisal document proposes some indicators to measure project impact. These indicators need to be targeted, measureable, specific, clear and, if necessary, gender-specific (justification in Annex 6).	2
THOROUGH	c) States the risks and key assumptions	Three (3) risks identified: (1) difficulty in coordinating a programme involving 5 ministries; (2) delay in the disbursement of counterpart funds; (3) difficulty in providing the staff necessary for operating the infrastructure set up. These risks have really affected the project. Two risks have not been mentioned although they caused delays: (i) the weakness of local construction enterprises; and (ii) administrative bottlenecks.	2

D. OUTPUTS AND OUTCOMES

I. ACHIEVEMENT OF OUTPUTS

In the table below, assess the achievement of actual vs. expected outputs for each major activity. Import the expected outputs from the log. frame in Section C. Score the extent to which the expected outputs were achieved. Weight the scores by the activities' approximate share of project costs. Weighted scores are auto-calculated by the computer. The overall output score will be auto-calculated as the sum of the weighted scores. Override the auto-calculated score, if desired, and provide justification.

MAJOR ACTIVITIES		Working score	Proportion of project costs in percentage (as mentioned in the appraisal report)	Weighted score (auto-calculated)
Expected Outputs	Actual Outputs			
Component 1 Output 1 – Procurement of furniture and equipment for the Directorate of Communication and Social Mobilisation and the DPP	Equipment and furniture procured	4	1.56	0.06
Component 1 Output 2 – - Training of 2 officials in development planning, 3 in gender/development, 3 in cooperative economics, 5 in IEC and social mobilisation; - Technical assistance: (i) 60 P/M for planning of MFSN activities; (ii) 36 P/M for the collection, processing and dissemination of social statistics.	- Training (i) 13 training courses organised: 3 employees in cooperative economics at the Institut Supérieur Panafricain d'Economie Coopérative (ISPEC) for 3 years, 3 in gender and development, planning and development and social mobilisation, 2 in development planning, 5 in IEC and social mobilisation. (ii) 2 study trips were organised to Mali and Burkina focusing on city management in the context of decentralisation (10 persons) and management of a thrift-and-loan system (7 persons). - Technical assistance Establishment of a Gender-based	3	4.13	0.12

	Social Information System by the firm IDECOM. This unplanned activity required additional financing of CFAF 116,723,500 submitted to the ADB at the request of the main coordination team.			
Component 1 Output 3 - - Equipment and furniture for the DRH	DRH provided with equipment and furniture	4	0.01	0.00
Component 1 Output 4 – - Training of: (i) 24 secondary school inspectors; (ii) DPP: 3 officials in education planning, 4 in statistics; (iii) DRH: 16 officials in recordkeeping, 16 in budget preparation, execution and control, 10 in administrative techniques and 3 in human resource management; - Technical assistance to: (i) define the Technical Education and Vocational Training (TEVT) policy through preparation of a sub-sector master plan; (ii) set up a system for the collection, effective processing and dissemination of school statistics (60 P/M) and preparation of school mapping	- Training of: (i) 24 secondary education inspectors at INFRE following a change of the mode of procurement approved by the Bank; (ii) 3 employees, including 2 at IIEP; (iii) 16 employees in record-keeping; (iv) 4 in statistics in Canada; (v) 10 in administrative techniques; (vi) 3 in HR management in Canada. The employees trained abroad are exclusively male, women trained in Benin are a minority. - Technical assistance (i) technical and vocational education master plan prepared by TECSULT: the plan remains very general and is more of a global methodology rather than an in-depth analysis of the situation in Benin; (ii) data collection, processing and dissemination system established, experimental school mapping for the Abomey Calavi Region prepared. Ministry experts trained.	3	7.45	0.22

Component 1 Output 5- Construction and equipment of the DRH of MH with OPEC funding	The construction of the Human Resources Directorate of the Ministry of Health, budgeted on OPEC funding, was carried over to the 2009 Public Investment Programme (PIP). However, the current shortage of public resources has led to the postponement of investments.	1	0.02	0.00
Component 1 Output 6 – - Training of 24 DPP officials in design, planning, monitoring, evaluation and coordination of activities; - Technical assistance of 12 P/M for the design, planning, monitoring, evaluation and coordination of activities.	- Training of 28 employees in planning, programming, budgeting and monitoring (PPBM) conducted by AFRIQUE ETUDES. - Technical assistance to MH for the design, planning and coordination of sub-sector activities provided by IDECOM, but hardly appropriate.	3	1.20	0.04
Component 2 Output 1 – - Construction and equipment of 51 classrooms and 10 school canteens; - Construction and equipment of 20 village health units (VHU) and 10 boreholes; activities executed in Atlantique, Atacora, Borgou and Zou Districts.	- Of the 51 classrooms planned, 33 have been received in 12 districts of the national territory. Of the 10 school canteens planned, 2 have been received. The shortcomings stem from failure of one contractor. - Of the 20 Village Health Units (VHU) planned, 14 have been received. - Of the 10 boreholes planned at appraisal, 5 have been built.	2	5.07	0.10
Component 2 Output 2 – Training of 20 birth attendants	The training of birth attendants was replaced with the training of 40 village health workers (VHW) to operate the VHUs.	3	0.12	0.00
Component 2	- Construction: 8 Social Promotion	2	4.80	0.10

<p>Output 3 - - Construction / rehabilitation of 8 SPCs in Atlantique, Borgou, Ouémé and Zou</p>	<p>Centres (SPCs) were received provisionally in August-September 2009 in Abomey (Zou), Aplahoué (Couffo), Athiémé (Mono), Zè (Atlantique), Kopargo (Donga), Natitingou (Atacora), Pèrèrè (Borgou) and Kandi (Alibori) towns. The project area only partially corresponds to the initial target areas. The facilities set up are of poor quality; drainage facilities were not included; worksites were not cleaned. The CPS are not connected to the power grid and do not necessarily have access to water.</p> <p>- Equipment supplied, except for vehicles because the financial crisis led the contractor to review prices.</p>			
<p>Component 2 Output 4 – - Retraining of 30 social assistants and training of 30 female community workers in home and social economics, hygiene, maternal and child health (MCH), family planning and environmental health; - Adoption of the Persons and Family Code not later than August 2002; - Awareness-raising campaign and training for the population, especially women (2 million), on women's rights, the persons and family code, MCH, nutrition, hygiene and family planning by NGOs, and continued by 250 trained community relay officers.</p>	<p>- Training initially planned is replaced by workshops, deemed more relevant, in: (i) home economics, nutrition and infant care for 22 female social workers; (ii) collection and processing of statistical data for 21 social technicians; and (iii) community readaptation for 12 social work controllers; - Persons and Family Code adopted on 24 August 2004, i.e. two years late; - Conduct of awareness-raising campaigns on the Code: 78 social technicians, 47 media experts and 85 opinion leaders. - Training of 241 community relay officers to raise community awareness on the Code, hygiene, malaria, HIV/AIDS, reproductive health...</p>	3	2.25	0.07

<p>Component 2 Output 5 - Construction and equipment of 2 new apprenticeship centres in Niki and Pahou (intake capacity of 250 trainees, including 100 boarders) to provide vocational training to out-of-school youth, drop-outs, unemployed adults and craftsmen. Fields of specialisation: (i) Nikki: embroidery, weaving, dyeing, leathercraft, cattle rearing, fish farming, vegetable farming; (ii) Pahou: refrigeration, air conditioning, plumbing, ornamental metal work, welding, metal construction work, stockbreeding and vegetable farming. - Operating costs of the centres defrayed by the State, local councils, associations, revenue from production centres and counterpart training costs paid by the youth.</p>	<p>- Nikki centre handed over, the furniture has been supplied and the equipment should be supplied at the end of September. However, it has some operational difficulties: (i) all the infrastructure has not yet been set up for want of financial resources. The boarding facilities were not built. As such, the centre is losing its regional scope; (ii) the centre is not connected to the water and electricity networks. The envisaged solution is to provide the centre with a power generator on national funds; (iii) Delayed publication of the test administered by the Directorate for the Recruitment of State Employees (DRAE) under the Ministry of Public Service. - The Pahou centre has not been completed (implementation rate is 85%); the furniture has been supplied on the sites and received, equipment has been supplied on an external site. - Equipment: The vehicles have not been supplied due to a price review caused by the financial crisis.</p>	1	8.39	0.08
<p>Component 2 Outcome 6 - - Retraining of trainers; - Technical assistance of 6 P/M to conduct the prospective study on rural employment.</p>	<p>- Programmes and training Preparation of 7 programmes and training of 18 trainers by CANATEC. AC programmes were adapted to the local economic environment. The Pahou centre provides training in metal construction, refrigeration, air-conditioning and plumbing, while the Nikki centre provides training in dressmaking, embroidery, fish farming, leather craft and weaving. - Technical assistance Study on rural employment conducted by the firm Benin Consulting Group (BeCG)</p>	3	4.33	0.13
<p>Component 2</p>	<p>Although the fund was supposed to be</p>	1	2.80	0.03

<p>Output 7 – A start-up fund (CFAF 350 million = UA 0.41 million) makes it possible to launch graduates of the apprenticeship centres into business. Each graduate receives CFAF 700,000, of which CFAF 600,000 as loan for the procurement of tools and equipment necessary for the conduct of productive activities. The graduates have to pay training costs of CFAF 100,000. Priority is given to women. The fund is managed by the federation of agricultural credit unions. Monitoring by: Department of Vocational Development, Coordination of New Employment Initiatives and Projects (CIPEN), CAA.</p>	<p>managed by FECECAM, the government requested for a change of service provider and signed an agreement with PADME (Support Programme for Micro-Enterprises Development) whose mandate is consistent with the management of said funds. Pending the graduation of those trained at the Pahou and Nikki centres, the Bank has authorized the granting of equipment credit to eligible craftsmen (74 selected craftsmen). However, PADME has not transmitted its annual action plan to the ADB for finalization of payments. The start-up fund is therefore not yet operational. The rate of credit proposed to PADME seems to be too low.</p>			
<p>Component 2 Output 8 - - Construction and equipment of 150 classrooms for primary schools (in Atacora, Borgou and Mono Districts) and 4 general secondary schools (GSS) (4 classrooms in each of the following districts: Atacora, Borgou, Atlantique, Mono); - Construction and equipment of a centre for young girls in</p>	<p>- Of the 150 primary school classrooms planned, 138 have been received. However, the site development plans were reduced in scope, given the reduction in available funds; - The centre for young girls in Ouidah was built but of reduced size compared with the initial plans: Of the 300 places budgeted, 150 were provided; drainage facilities (VRD) were not provided, the residences of the director and supervisor were eliminated from the plan. - GSS built in Kandi (Alibori), Kotopounga (Atacora), Oungbègamè (Zou) and Azové (Couffo): modules of</p>	2	19.76	0.40

<p>Ouidah to improve secondary education for young girls.</p>	<p>4 classrooms, 2 laboratories, guard room. However, certain elements such as the fences and 4 pitches (football, handball, basket ball, volleyball) were deleted from the plan. Although these facilities were programmed in the PIP, the shortage of public resources led to postponement of the investment.</p> <p>The works were also plagued by delays. - Furniture and equipment received.</p>			
<p>Component 2 Output 9 - (OPEC financing)</p> <p>- Protocol Agreement certifying OPEC commitment; - Construction / rehabilitation and equipment of 23 health centres, including 5 CSSPs and 18 CCSs (Mono, Atlantique and Atacora Districts);</p>	<p>- OPEC Protocol Agreement transmitted; - Of the 23 health centres planned on OPEC funding, works on 9 health centres were abandoned, 3 have not been started. The enterprise Dyjesck commenced works on own funds without a start-up advance. The Government has requested for a reallocation of the OPEC fund to finance the implementation of this contract. HCs built in Atacora-Donga, Mono-Couffo and Atlantique-Littoral as planned in the appraisal report. - Furniture and equipment received.</p>	2	22.52	0.45

<p>Component 2 Output 10 - Training of 36 paramedics and 60 sanitation workers in INMES, 20 officials of AOMPCS centres trained at the National Healthcare Institute (INMES);</p> <p>- Malaria control: 268 health workers, 200 community relay officers, 20 laboratory technicians trained. Health centres provided with 77 diagnostic kits and 24 laboratory kits, production of IEC media: 1000 posters on coma, mosquito nets, chemoprophylaxis;</p> <p>- AIDS control: 200 community relay officers trained (targeted areas Dogbo, Djakotomey, Lokossa, Aplahoué, Savalou); IEC media - 10,000 leaflets and 10 broadcasts per year in national languages.</p>	<p>Training - 36 paramedics (12 State-registered nurses, 12 State-registered midwives, 12 laboratory technicians), and 60 sanitation workers, 20 heads of AOMPCES centres trained;</p> <p>- support to the NACP and NMCP for a period of 6 months.</p> <p>Planned training using counterpart funds was not conducted (that of 200 community relay workers, 268 health workers and 20 laboratory technicians)</p> <p>Equipment Equipment for the health centres was supplied.</p>	2	2.79	0.06
--	--	---	------	------

<p>Component 3 Outcome 1 – Technical assistance: 60 S/M for administration/management, 20 S/M for auditing of accounts, 60 S/M for procurement, 10 S/M to establish an accounting system; 60 S/M for the architect;</p>	<p>Technical assistance provided in management and administration, procurement and civil engineering. Due to extension of the ADF and TAF loans, the government defrays the costs generated by maintenance of such technical assistance and the consultancy firm ALMEGA BTP, responsible for supervising uncompleted construction works on socio-educational and community infrastructure.</p> <p>- Successive audits of the programme were conducted by the following firms: FIDEXCA (2002 and 2003), CONSEIL DIAGNOSTIC MANAGEMENT (2004 and 2005), FIDEXCA (2006, 2007 and 2008), recruited from a shortlist. The ADB is still waiting for the Government to provide the report for FY2009 and the closure report.</p>	3	7.07	0.21
<p>Component 3 Output 2 - - Additional equipment, furniture and material, purchase of cars for the ministries (Education, Health, Family, Planning); - Salaries of sector coordinators (Education, Health,</p>	<p>- Full procurement of the furniture, additional equipment and four 4x4 vehicles budgeted for the structures (MENRS, MSP, MPSF, MPDEAP) and the main coordination team. One vehicle was lost through an accident.</p>	3	5.11	0.00

Family, Planning), Main Coordinator, office staff salaries (2 secretaries, 6 drivers, 1 messenger), office rental costs.				
OVERALL OUTPUT SCORE [Score is calculated as the sum of weighted scores]		2		
		Check here to override the auto-calculated score		
Provide justification for over-riding the auto-calculated score				
Insert the new score or re-enter the autocalculated score		2		

II. ACHIEVEMENT OF OUTCOMES

1. Using available monitoring data, assess the achievement of expected outcomes. Import the expected outcomes from the log. frame in Section C. Score the extent to which the expected outcomes were achieved. The overall outcome score will be auto-calculated as an average of the working scores. Override the auto-calculated score, if desired, and provide justification.

OUTCOMES		Working score
Estimates	Actual	
Component 1 Outcome 1 – MFSN’s material capacity is enhanced	The central structures are equipped with IT equipment but the decentralized services and SPCs are not equipped.	2
Component 1 Outcome 2 – MFSN’s capacity is enhanced; it has an intervention plan accompanied by a monitoring/evaluation plan, and gender-sensitive social statistics	The technical assistance report presents the conditions not yet fulfilled but necessary for the sustainability of the statistics system: recruitment/training of a network administrator, extension of the system to all the district directorates of the Ministry and SPCs; building the material capacity of the SPCs (electrification, connection to the network, IT equipment). However, the MFSN did not acquire the statistical tool: for want of a financial allocation, it did not implement a human resources training plan, which includes the district directorates.	1

	Furthermore, the SPCs were not connected to the electric grid and are still deprived of IT equipment: data cannot be transmitted to the central services. These difficulties hamper the efficiency and sustainability of activities implemented.	
Component 1 Outcome 3 – Material capacity of MENRS	The central structures are equipped with IT hardware. Not so the decentralized services and schools.	2
Component 1 Outcome 4 – - MENRS' human capacity is enhanced; - MENRS has a TEVT strategic plan; - MENRS has a system to collect, process, and disseminate statistical data, and school mapping which ensures the equitable geographical distribution of schools and teachers based on enrolments.	- Technical assistance of 60 S/M conducted to establish a school statistics system and monitoring/evaluation of ministry activities: less efficient activity due to the difficulties encountered in the use of the software caused by the lack of IT equipment in the district directorates of the ministries concerned and lack of vocational training. Data cannot reach the central directorates. Furthermore, the splitting of the Ministry of Primary and Secondary education into two distinct ministries threatens the sustainable implementation of the statistical system, not only in network terms but also in terms of the training of competent HR. - Preparation of experimental school mapping in the Abomey-Calavi district and the methodology needed for its extension to the national level. Directors of central and decentralized services were sensitized and trained. Less efficient activity since it did not lead to preparation of school mapping at the national level due to lack of IT equipment. - Technical education and training master plan: less efficient activity since it did not lead to preparation of a TVE policy and the ACs are not operational. - The trained inspectors were distributed all over the national territory, but their number is still not sufficient. The structural deficiencies of the pedagogical inspection services remain an obstacle to the quality of education provided in schools.	2
Component 1 Outcome 5 – Construction of the DRH increases the efficiency of the ministry	The DRH has not yet been built.	1

<p>Component 1 Outcome 6 - - The human capacity of the MH is enhanced; - The MH has an intervention framework coupled with a monitoring/evaluation plan</p>	<p>IDECOM assisted the Ministry of Health in the design, planning and coordination of activities. Polarization of the debate on unconstructed infrastructure and lack of equipment has undermined the impact of technical assistance.</p>	<p>2</p>
<p>Component 2 Outcome 1 - - Infrastructures and training ensure access to the Common Social Minimum (CSM) : access to health centres within 5 km; - School canteens improve the nutritional status of children.</p>	<p>- The partial construction of infrastructure affects the output obtained. - The canteens were built based on the needs expressed in council development plans: they are not systematic. Given the positive impact of canteens on the school enrolment and retention rates, it would be judicious to promote their construction. Meals are served free of charge. In a bid to ensure the financial sustainability of the canteens, the institution of co-payment could be considered.</p>	<p>2</p>
<p>Component 2 Outcome 2 – - Decline in maternal death and infant mortality; - Control of population growth.</p>	<p>Commissioning of the VHUs led to community awareness-raising on health problems: disease prevention, first aid, recognition of the major childhood diseases, monitoring of women in pregnancy and childbirth. These activities should help to curb maternal death, neonatal and infant mortality rates (MDG 4 and 5). Specific statistics for precise project areas are unavailable. At the national level, infant mortality reduced drastically, standing at 67‰ in 2006 (UNICEF statistics). Nevertheless, the progress made is not enough to achieve the MDG target. Atacora, Donga and Alibori Districts have the highest rates. The maternal mortality rate in 2006 stood at 397 per 100,000 live births but is not enough to achieve the MDG target.</p>	<p>2</p>
<p>Component 2 Outcome 3- - Women’s capacity to participate in development is increased through improvement of their educational, economic, health and legal conditions. About 4800 additional women attend the SPCs and about 5000 children benefit from nutrition monitoring - Construction of the SPCs enables women to improve their knowledge of management of the micro-credits granted to them.</p>	<p>While the four centres of North Benin became operational, the four centres in the South were closed. The provisional reception period was not used to detect any defects. The lack of connection to electricity networks and of boreholes makes it impossible to operationalise certain SPCs. Modification of the SPCs project site poses a problem because the ADB does not seem to have taken note of these changes and because the distribution of SPCs over a vast area of the national territory (7 regions instead of 4): (i) does not make it possible to have a measurable social impact; (ii) reduces the integrated dimension of the project (triple area of intervention: education, health, gender and</p>	<p>2</p>

	development). Statistics on attendance at these centres and their impact have not been prepared. The initial objective of increasing knowledge of micro-credit management was not pursued.	
Component 2 Outcome 4 - - The rights of women, persons and the family are applied, such that women and the family are better protected. - CDUs become the primary actors in the improvement of social wellbeing.	- Sensitization campaigns were used to apply the code: polygamy prohibited, preparation of a civil status. The training of opinion leaders as community relay officers leads to a tenfold increase in the dissemination of the Code. However, these actions have to be extended through a national dissemination plan, translation of the code into national languages, inclusion of the code in school curricula, establishment of a network of focal points and identification of obstacles to the concrete implementation of the CDPF The CDPF is still insufficiently applied: in its MDG report, the UNDP underscores the need to secure greater commitment from political authorities at the highest level. Besides, associations (Women in Law and Development in Africa) insist on the training of all court presidents, traditional and religious leaders, and civil status registrars. - The Ministry of Family and National Solidarity deplores the cessation of awareness-raising campaigns since 2005, whereas they are supposed to be conducted regularly. The government did not conduct a general assessment of CDPF application.	2
Component 2 Outcome 5 – Production sector demand is addressed, thanks to the training centres. Access to such training is facilitated for beneficiary out-of-school youth and dropouts. About 500 additional youth are trained each year.	The Nikki and Pahou centres are not operational. As concerns the Nikki centre, the lack of boarding facilities and problems connecting to the water and electricity networks undermine short-term sustainability. The Bank mission recommends urgent operationalisation defrayed by the national budget. Construction of the Pahou apprenticeship centre was abandoned in October 2009 because the contractor went bankrupt.	1
Component 2 Outcome 6 - The training is of good quality, the drop-out rate is low. - The study on rural employment finetunes the TEVT strategic framework	- The training of trainers is inefficient because the Nikkin and Pahou apprenticeship centres were not operational. - The recommendations of the study confirm the relevance of the vocational training centres. All centres financed by the ADB and Denmark are not fully operational.	1

<p>Component 2 Outcome 7 – Start-up fund improves access rate to employment. 500 youths develop productive activities</p>	<p>The start-up fund is not created. No graduate or craftsman benefits from the fund.</p>	<p>1</p>
<p>Component 2 Outcome 8 -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Infrastructure construction increases the gross enrolment ratio (GER) in the project regions, such that regional inequalities are reduced; - About 9,045 additional pupils are admitted annually into primary schools; - About 650 additional students are admitted annually into secondary schools; - The GER in primary schools rises from 75.8% in 1998 to 85.5% in 2004 (GER for girls from 59.7% to 69.5%); - The GER in secondary schools rises from 14.6% in 1998 to 20% in 2004 (GER for girls rises from 9.24% to 13% in 2004). 	<p>Given the growing demand resulting from free primary education, the supply of schools is still largely insufficient in terms of: (i) the construction of additional infrastructure; (ii) recruitment of teachers (the pupil-teacher ratio in public education rose from 48.3 in 1994 to 50 in 2005); (iii) regional disparities.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The construction sites for GSSs differ from those planned at appraisal: selection of the Alibori, Kandi and Atacora Districts is justified by their low enrolment ratios. However, the relevant changes can be made at the expense of integration of the educational component with the gender/development and health components. - The sector coordination team cannot provide a precise and quantified assessment of the returns from infrastructure construction. In primary education, the gross enrolment ratio (GER) for girls in 2005 stood at 78% in Atacora / Donga (total GER 90%), 67% in Borgou / Alibori (total GER 70%), and 109% in Mono / Couffo (total GER 127%). Secondary education is overwhelmed by the flow of students from primary schools. 	<p>2</p>
<p>Component 2 Outcome 9 – Construction of health centres leads to improvement of health indicators (infant mortality and maternal death). The educational, health and legal operations of the programmes make it possible to control population growth, reduce maternal death and infant mortality, giving women a greater role in improving the lives of households.</p>	<p>The non-completion of 5 health centres because of failure to pay a start-up advance on OPEC funds undermines the efficiency of the health centres. At the national level, infant mortality fell by 15% between 2006 and 2001 to 125/10000. Nevertheless, the progress made is not enough to achieve the MDG target. Atacora, Donga and Alibori Districts have the highest rates. The maternal death rate in 2006 stood at 397 per 100,000 live births but is not enough to achieve the MDG target.</p>	<p>2</p>
<p>Component 2 Outcome 10 -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Human resource training at the health centre leads to improvement of indicators; - Percentage of malaria cases in total consultations drops from 34% in 1998 to 20% in 2004; - Of total HIV/AIDS transmissions, the rate of sexually-transmitted cases declines from 92% to 40%. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The proposed indicators are not standard. Nevertheless, it is obvious that malaria was the main disease in 2006: it represents 39.7% of diseases reported at consultations in health units. The situation is disturbing in certain project areas such as Mono, Alibori, Bourgou, Ouémé and Littoral - In 2005, HIV was mainly transmitted sexually 	<p>1</p>

	(92% of cases). The national prevalence rate is 1.2%. The districts with a prevalence rate of over 2% are: Couffo, Mono, Atlantique, Littoral and Ouémé.	
Component 3 Outcome 1- - Thanks to building the technical of the project implementation unit, activities are implemented successfully; - The unit produces quarterly, annual and completion reports; - The financial management of the project is consistent with Bank rules.	- The recruitment of only one civil engineering assistant to monitor the 120 works sites was insufficient; - The monthly and quarterly progress reports were prepared regularly. The completion report, which has been partially drafted, will be concluded upon closure of the OPEC fund on 31 December 2010; - Project management is consistent with Bank rules but the audits are delayed.	2
Component 3 Outcome 2- - The sector coordinators and the implementation unit carry out management and monitoring/evaluation work involving field visits	- The salaries of office staff are low. - Despite the resources provided (vehicles), the coordinators are not conducting enough supervision missions. Their limited technical capacity does not allow for monitoring/evaluation work that is based on quantified outputs and outcomes.	1
OVERALL OUTPUT SCORE [Score is calculated as an average of the working scores]		2

Check here to override the auto-calculated score

Provide justification for over-riding the auto-calculated score

Insert the new score or re-enter the autocalculated score

2

2. Additional outcomes: Comment on the project's additional outcomes not captured in the log. frame, including cross-cutting issues (e.g., gender).

Environment: The training of community relay workers has made it possible to promote environmental advocacy within the communities. Operationalisation of the Apprenticeship Centres could raise environmental awareness.

3. Risks to sustained achievement of outcomes. State the factors that affect, or could affect, the long-run or sustained achievement of project outcomes. Indicate if any new action or institutional change is recommended to sustain outcomes. The analysis should be based on the sensitivity analysis in Annex 3, if relevant.

Although most of the activities were implemented, the outcomes for PDRH were limited.

Component 1 -

The Directorates of Forward Planning and Programming (DPPs) of the sector ministries took little advantage of the technical assistance

of Component 1 aimed at developing their capacity. The lack of training and equipment for decentralised services undermined the implementation of statistics systems: such services are unable to collect data and transmit it to the central services. The monitoring/evaluation units of the social ministries were not systematically created. In the education sector, the school mapping experiment in Abomey-Calavi region was not extended to the rest of the national territory. With regard to technical and vocational training, the master plan has remained a dead letter. Nevertheless, these two projects had been recommended by all the TFPs. The gender problem was not taken into consideration in the design of planning / monitoring-evaluation / statistics systems (lack of gender-sensitive indicators) in health and education.

The administration has been inefficient from the institutional standpoint: the DPPs (UNDP, *MDG Report*, July 2009) are not subject to a performance contract (specifying objectives, output and expected outcomes) with the State. The politicisation of administrative officials creates bottlenecks and technical teams are not trained due to frequent staff turnover. Institutional instability increases the risk of loss of material, human and technical capacity. For example, splitting the Ministry of Primary and Secondary Education (MEPS) into two distinct ministries (the Ministry of Nursery and Primary Education (MEMP) and the Ministry of Secondary and Vocational Education (MESFP)) undermined the sustainability of establishing a statistics system, not only in terms of networks, but also in terms of training competent human resources.

Component 2 -

The ageing of buildings and no renovation of old structures poses a problem of sustainability of infrastructure maintenance by sector ministries. Infrastructure set up under the PDRH suffered from exchange rate volatility that affected OPEC and ADF funds and from inflation. This exogenous data caused a shortage of financial resources. The initial site development plans were reduced and the quality of works was affected. As such, elements that determine the viability of sites (e.g. drainage) were sometimes eliminated (SPC and the Athiéme health centre). The absence of boarding facilities (apprenticeship centre) or their reduction (Ouidah College) call into question the relevance of such infrastructure. Water and electricity supply remain unreliable.

Many facilities are currently closed because of lack of recruitment (health infrastructure) and no connection to the electricity and water supply networks (AC, SPC). The operationalisation of this infrastructure would make it possible to improve outcomes.

Education:

Primary Education: The primary education infrastructure construction policy increased the intake capacity and improved quantitative indicators (the GER rose from 92.9% in 2006 to 109% in 2009, exceeding the 107% target set in the PDDSE; the GER for girls was 104%). Nevertheless, the qualitative indicators are alarming and undermine outcomes (cf. Annex 6). It is regrettable that the construction of classrooms in primary and secondary schools was not accompanied by systematic community measures (canteens, etc.) that motivate parents to send their children to school.

General secondary education: *The expected outcomes of infrastructure construction are threatened by pupil flows generated by free primary education. Furthermore, the sector is faced with the problem of teachers' qualifications. The quantitative indicators are alarming: the percentage of girls in the first cycle (37% in 2009) declined by 2 points compared to 2008 and remained below target. In the second cycle, the percentage of girls fell by 8 points compared to 2008.*

Employment and vocational training: Completion works on the two apprenticeship centres (finishing, construction of boarding facilities, connection to the electricity and water networks) determine their impact. At project completion, the technical and vocational training sector remains under-developed. Enrolments are declining. The technical and vocational education master plan has not been operationalized. Mechanisms for collaboration with the private sector to define training are inadequate. The financing plan for the centres is not well thought out even though it is a crucial element to their sustainability.

Start-up fund: The Government of Benin should institute the start-up fund for supporting the creation of IGAs. Without this fund, the

impact of the apprenticeship centres may be undermined.

Gender and development:
The MDG report underscores the need to reinforce the effective application of the Persons and Family Code and the commitment of the authorities. The awareness-raising campaigns, which have not been conducted since 2005, need to be carried out regularly to ensure the sustainability of outcomes. Additional actions such as inclusion of the Code into school textbooks and curricula should be further consolidated. The training courses (community-based readaptation, collection and processing of statistical data, home economics, nutrition and child care) make it possible to improve the social services provided to women.

E. PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS FOR IMPLEMENTATION

1. State the extent to which the Bank and the Borrower ensured the programme was commensurate with the Borrower's capacity to implement by designing it appropriately and by putting in place the necessary implementation arrangements. Consider all major design aspects, such as: Questions related to design are the following: Consider all major design aspects, such as extent to which project design took into account lessons learned from previous PCRs in the sector or the country (please cite key PCRs); whether the project was informed by robust analytical work (please cite key documents); how well Bank and Borrower assessed the capacity of the implementing agencies and/or Project Implementation Unit; scope of consultations and partnerships; economic rationale of project; and provisions made for technical assistance. [250 words maximum. Any additional narrative about implementation should be included in Annex 6: Project Narrative.]

Design – Project design took the Borrower's needs and capacity into account. Nevertheless, the timeframe proposed at appraisal was unrealistic: the initial implementation period of 4.75 years was underestimated. The appraisal report shows some inconsistencies between the initial description and the detailed description of activities (e.g. the number of DPP employees trained in the Ministry of Primary and Secondary Education and Vocational Training).

Multisector project: The design of a multisector project is complex: it presupposes coordination and ownership by the various ministries at the central and district levels. However, the appraisal document does not tackle the district level. Furthermore, the superposition of two social welfare networks, one managed by the Ministry of Health (health centres, village health units), and another by the Ministry of Family and National Solidarity (social welfare centres) is hardly sustainable for Benin's public finances.

Decentralised services: Inclusion in the project of technical, material and human capacity-building for decentralized services was not sufficient.

Gender: The gender dimension, which cuts across all activities, was nevertheless not systematically integrated and appraised.

Infrastructure: The cost of the infrastructure set up under the PDRH was very high: the possibility of kickbacks exchanged between the administration and the contractors cannot be ruled out.

The lessons learnt from previous PCRs in the sector or in the country were factored into the project design.

Assessment of the capacity of the executing agencies and the project implementation unit - The project unit was too small for the scope of activities planned. The civil engineering assistant was responsible for monitoring 120 construction sites. The technical capacity of sector monitoring/evaluation teams was insufficient. The technical ministries carried out sector coordination (cf. Annex 6).

Degree of consultations and partnerships – The PDRH was identified in 1998 by the Government of Benin through a consultative and participatory approach with civil society, NGOs and the majority of donors. The lack of precise information on the administrative partners met does not make it possible to assess the quality of the participatory approach.

Economic justification of the project and the technical assistance measures taken – The project makes a direct contribution to poverty reduction (in 1998, poverty affected 67% of the rural population) through human resource training (cf. Annex 6), focusing on initial and vocational training as well as social (sensitization to the Persons and Family Code) and health (awareness-raising on AIDS, malaria, hygiene, etc.) aspects.

2. For each dimension of project design and readiness for implementation, provide a brief assessment (up to two sentences). Insert a working score, using the scoring scale provided in Appendix 1.

PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS FOR IMPLEMENTATION DIMENSIONS		APPRAISAL	Working score
REALISM	a) Project complexity is matched with country capacity and political commitment.	The limited institutional capacity of Benin's technical ministries calls for greater State investment in and commitment to human resource training and definition of development strategies.	1
APPRAISAL RISK ASSESSMENT AND MITIGATION	b) Project design includes adequate risk	Three (3) risks identified: (i) coordination difficulties between the 5 ministries and the coordination unit; (ii) delays in the disbursement of national counterpart funds; and (iii) provision of staff needed to operate the infrastructure. Although the risks were identified, they have affected the project cycle and its efficiency. Nevertheless, the appraisal report overlooked 2 major risks: (i) administrative bottlenecks that cause delays (especially at the DNMP and CAA); and (ii) the fragility of Beninese contracting firms.	2
USE OF COUNTRY SYSTEMS	c) Project procurement, financial management, monitoring and/or other systems were based on those already in use by government and/or other partners	Yes. Despite public procurement reform, the procurement system is still characterised by red tape in the National Procurement Directorate and Autonomous Sinking Fund. Furthermore, widespread corruption between the various services undermines transparency in the processing of files (cf. Annex 6).	2

For the following dimensions, provide separate working scores for Bank performance and Borrower performance:			Working score	
			Bank	Borrower
CLARITY	d) Responsibilities for project implementation are clearly defined.	Yes, as concerns the ADB, despite the discontinuation of task managers. As concerns the Borrower, the role of sector ministries in monitoring activities, especially the construction of activities in the field, is not clearly defined.	4	2
PROCUREMENT READINESS	e) Necessary implementation documents (e.g. specifications, design, procurement documents) are ready at appraisal.	Yes. The project implementation unit states that the procurement costs for goods and works were unrealistic.	3	3
MONITORING READINESS	f) Monitoring indicators and monitoring plan are adopted.	The ADB monitoring plan is unrealistic. The Government is unable to provide information for the specified indicators.	4	1
BASELINE DATA	(g) Baseline data collection has been completed or is underway.	The ADB completed data collection. The data is partial. The Borrower's final completion report will be transmitted to the ADB end December 2010, on the OPEC loan closing date.	3	2

F. IMPLEMENTATION

1. State the major characteristics of project implementation with reference to: timeliness, quality of construction or other work, performance of consultants, effectiveness of Bank supervision, and effectiveness of Borrower oversight. Assess how well the Bank and the Borrower ensured compliance with safeguards.

[300 words maximum. Any additional narrative about implementation should be included in Annex 6: Project Narrative.]

Timeliness – Commencement of the project, planned to last for 57 months, was delayed by 17 months. Such delays stemmed from various reasons:

- (i) Timeframe for ratification and implementation of loan agreements.
- (ii) Recurrent difficulties in the disbursement of counterpart funds.
- (iii) Administrative bottlenecks throughout the entire procurement chain (13 months on average). The delays occur during approval of the bidding documents and analysis reports by the DNMP and the ADB, and during signature of the contracts by the CAA. These bottlenecks constitute a handicap to the timely consumption of credits.

(iv) Slow progress of work due mainly to the limited technical, organisational and financial capacity of contractors dealing with sites that are far-flung with reduced accessibility.
(iv) Revision of the OPEC fund lists of goods and services: The conduct of activities required a reallocation of the list of goods and services financed with OPEC funds. Such reallocation led to delays in the construction of health centres.

Efficiency of ADB supervision – The ADB did not respect the monitoring/evaluation scheduled as set out in the appraisal report: the number of supervision missions was below 2/year. Given the average mission duration of 13 days, comprising travel plus 11 field days, it was not possible to monitor the construction of far-flung and inaccessible infrastructure. The mid-term review was replaced by a portfolio improvement mission (Sector Portfolio Improvement Plan).

Efficiency of supervision by the Borrower - The coordination unit did not take note of the reduction in allocations from the ADF and OPEC funds following the exchange rate volatility experienced since PDRH appraisal.

Quality of the structures and other works – The quality of works was affected by the insufficient monitoring of work sites by the quality control firm ALMEGA BTP and the civil engineering assistant from the Management Unit. Additional resources were said to have been needed because the sites were far-flung and had limited access. Many construction defects in some worksites and a lack of rigour in the application of technical prescriptions were noted. The reduction in allocations due to exchange rate volatility led to the elimination of elements crucial to the long-term sustainability of the sites such as drainage structures and the curtailment of the scope of initial projects. Once completed, the worksites were not cleaned up.

2. Comment on the role of other partners (e.g. donors, NGOs, contractors, etc.). Assess the effectiveness of co-financing arrangements and of donor coordination, if applicable.

The OPEC contribution of USD 5,580,000 financed activities related to the health sub-component in Components 1 and 2, excluding expenditure on village health units (VHUs). To date and according to information available to the Bank, OPEC credit financed expenditure to the tune of USD 4,563,910, corresponding to a disbursement rate of 79.8%. Payments for additional activities should raise the disbursement rate. Although OPEC was supposed to finance construction works on the MSP's DRH building, the works were finally carried out with PIP 2009 funding. Coordination between OPEC and the ADB was undermined by lack of communication: the Government informed the ADB late about the extension of the ADB loan. In future, the institutions should step up their collaboration.

3. Harmonization. State whether the Bank made explicit efforts to harmonize instruments, systems and/or approaches with other partners.

The ADB does not participate in TFP consultative forums for the education and health sectors. Some TFPs even created a common budget fund (cf. Annex 6) in the education sector in order to harmonise their interventions under the Education Sector Ten-Year Development Plan (PDDSE 2006-2015) defined as the governmental strategic framework. The absence of an ADB office in Benin affects its involvement and consequently its visibility.

4. For each dimension of project implementation, assess the extent to which the project achieved the following. Provide a brief assessment (up to two sentences) and insert a working score, using the scoring scale provided in Appendix 1.

PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION DIMENSIONS		APPRAISAL		Working score
TIMELINESS	a) Extent of project adherence to the original closing date. If the number on the right is:	Difference in months between original closing date and actual closing date or date of 98% disbursement.	Closing date 31/12/2005 Actual closing date: 30/09/2010	1
	b) below 12, "4" is automatically scored between 12.1 and 24, "3" is automatically scored between 24.1 and 36, "2" is automatically scored beyond 36.1, "1" is automatically scored			
		57		
BANK PERFORMANCE	b) Bank complied with:			
	Environmental Safeguards	The programme is classified under Environmental Category II. - Environmental monitoring is conducted for all activities; - Rural community awareness-raising on environmental issues is organised through: (i) training in environmental hygiene; (ii) drinking water supply; - The training programmes of the apprenticeship centres (ACs) should help to preserve the environment (household waste management, construction of latrines, agriculture, handicrafts, etc.). However, this component could not be implemented because the ACs were not operational.		2
	Fiduciary Requirements	The appraisal report sets out the fiduciary requirements: the management and disbursement requirements, the annual preparation of audit reports and of quarterly and annual reports as well as a completion report.		3
	Project Covenants	The ADF loan and TAF grant agreements as well as the OPEC loan agreement accompany the appraisal report.		3
	c) Bank provided quality supervision in the form of	The ADB did not manage "no-		2

	skills mix provided and practicality of solutions.	objection” requests diligently. The extensions belatedly requested by the Borrower and granted by the ADB could not be put to full advantage because of reduced time-limits.	
	d) Bank provided quality management oversight.	The ADB did not detect project management problems (failure to consider exchange rate volatility).	2
BORROWER PERFORMANCE	e) Borrower complied with:		
	Environmental Safeguards	Yes.	3
	Fiduciary Requirements	- Successive audits of the programme were conducted by the following firms: FIDEXCA (2002 and 2003), CONSEIL DIAGNOSTIC MANAGEMENT (2004 and 2005), FIDEXCA (2006, 2007 and 2008), recruited from a shortlist. The ADB is still waiting for the Government to provide the report for FY2009 and the completion report.	3
	Project Covenants	Benin’s contribution of UA 1.88 million financed construction works, furniture, training, technical assistance and operating costs. Despite delays, counterpart funds were fully disbursed. Since OPEC funds were exhausted, the Government undertook to finance additional expenditure.	2
	f) Borrower was responsive to Bank supervision findings and recommendations.	Late implementation of recommendations.	2
	g) Borrower collected and used monitoring information for decision making.	Yes, overall.	2

G. COMPLETION

1. Is the PCR delivered on a timely basis, in compliance with Bank policy?			
Date project reached 98% disbursement rate (or closing date, if applicable)	Date PCR was sent to pcr@afdb.org	Difference in months	WORKING SCORE If the difference is 6 months or less, a 4 is scored. If the difference is 6.1 or more, a 1 is scored(auto-calculated)
Briefly describe the PCR Process. Describe the Borrower’s and co-financers' involvement in producing the document. Highlight any			

major differences of opinion concerning the assessments made in this PCR. Describe the team composition and confirm whether a site visit was undertaken. Mention any major collaboration from other development partners. State the extent of field office involvement in producing the report. Indicate whether comments from Peer Reviewers were received on time (provide names and positions of Peer Reviewers).

[150 words maximum]

The completion report preparation mission for this project (PDRH) was led by Mr. Nadab Hathoura MASSISSOU, Project Officer and Mission Head, a Consultant Architect and an Education Consultant. The mission lasted from 19 September to 3 October and the team held discussions with Mr. Natonde AKE, Minister of Secondary, Technical and Vocational Education. The unavailability of representatives of the PDRH unit affected the organisation of the mission. The Coordinator, who was appointed in 2010 as the national coordinator of the computerised permanent electoral list (LEPI), was partially available. The absence of the accountant due to illness and of a driver made it difficult to obtain data and to move around. The school equipment reception mission of 21 to 25 September mobilised the accounting assistant and sector coordinator from the Ministry of Nursery and Primary Education. Nevertheless, the Coordinator transmitted a partial completion report to the mission. While in the field, the ADB team visited the boarding facility for young girls in Ouidah, the health centres in Tangbo-Djevie and Kpinnou, the village health unit in Wawata, the Pahou Apprenticeship Centre and the Kpinnou Social Promotion Centre (Athiéomé).

H. LESSONS LEARNED

Summarize key lessons for the Bank and the Borrower suggested by the project's outcomes. [300 words maximum. Any additional narrative about implementation should be included in Annex 6: Project Narrative.]

Lessons for the ADB

(i) Project design should lead to the definition of a precise monitoring/evaluation framework complete with indicators and create mechanisms for ensuring the sustainability of activities: to that end, the ADB should assess the Borrower's capacity to sustainably operate the services and infrastructure developed under the project.

(ii) In the case of multisector projects, ensure ownership by all stakeholders concerned and the coordination needed to create synergy between central and district services, avoid spreading resources too thinly among the various ministries and on the national territory.

(iii) Involve and build the capacity of decentralized services and local councils to promote ownership and monitoring projects on the ground.

(iv) Analyse the detailed cost of activities and conduct audits, if need be: the high cost of constructed structures raises fears of corruption.

(v) Train coordinators in the Bank's procedures and a culture of evaluation so that management units can be sensitized, not only on the implementation but also on the efficiency of activities.

(vi) Promote the stability of task managers or the full transmission of records in order to improve project monitoring.

(vii) Improve monitoring: Given insufficient number and duration of field missions, it was virtually impossible to diagnose the poor construction quality and notice the non-operationalization of the infrastructure because of failure to recruit staff or no connection to electricity and water networks, etc. The ADB did not detect the project's budget management problem (failure to consider exchange rate volatility).

(viii) Improve communication: The ADB must improve communication with TFPs in order to enhance its management of co-financing arrangements and any requests for extension; participate in existing consultative frameworks for TFPs, the Government, civil society and all the relevant sector stakeholders. To that end, the establishment of a field office would help to step up monitoring (for instance, the establishment of a WB office in Benin has a direct impact on portfolio quality), with greater communication enabling the ADB to rise to the role of adviser to the Government.

Recommendations for the Government:

Concerning the PDRH:

(i) Ensure the completion of activities planned: completion of on-going civil engineering works, operationalization of infrastructure (apprenticeship centres, health centres/ VHUs and closed social welfare centres) and operationalization of the start-up fund.

(ii) Prepare the 2009 audit report, the closure report and finalise the completion report.

Apart from the recommendations set out in the portfolio review (cf. Annex):

(iii) Audit the entire procurement and public expenditure chain to detect administrative bottlenecks (DNMP and CAA), factors hampering credit consumption and the execution of programmed actions, and corruption factors.

(iv) Conduct an anti-corruption drive within the administration.

(v) Streamline social welfare: Benin does not have the financial resources to multiply social networks in terms of infrastructure, equipment and human resources. Synergy or a merger between the Ministry of Health and the Ministry of Family and National Solidarity should be envisaged. The State could also delegate public services to competent associations.

I. PROJECT RATINGS SUMMARY

All working scores and ratings are auto-generated by the computer from the relevant section in the PCR.

CRITERIA	SUB-CRITERIA	Working score
PROJECT OUTCOME	Achievement of outputs	2
	Achievement of outcomes	2
	Timeliness	1
	OVERALL PROJECT OUTCOME SCORE	2
BANK PERFORMANCE	Design and Readiness	
	Project Objectives were relevant to country development priorities.	3
	Project Objectives could in principle be achieved with the project inputs and in the expected time frame.	2
	Project Objectives were consistent with the Bank's country or regional strategy	3
	Project Objectives were consistent with the Bank's corporate priorities	3
	The log frame presents a logical causal chain for achieving the project development objectives.	1
	The log frame expresses objectives and outcomes in a way that is measurable and quantifiable.	2
	The log frame states the risks and key assumptions.	2
	Project complexity was matched with country capacity and political commitment.	1
	Project design includes adequate risk analysis.	2
	Project procurement, financial management, monitoring and/or other processes were based on those already in use by government and/or other partners	2
	Responsibilities for project implementation were clearly defined.	4
	Necessary implementation documents (e.g. specifications, design, procurement documents) are ready at appraisal.	3
	Monitoring indicators and monitoring plan are adopted.	4
	Baseline data was available or were collected during design.	3
	PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS SUB-SCORE	3
	Supervision:	
Bank complied with:		
Environmental Safeguards	2	

	Fiduciary Requirements	3
	Project Covenants	3
	Bank provided quality supervision in the form of skills mix provided and practicality of solutions.	2
	Bank provided quality management oversight.	2
	PCR was delivered on a timely basis	0
	SUPERVISION SUB-SCORE	2
	OVERALL BANK PERFORMANCE SCORE	3
BORROWER PERFORMANCE	Design and Readiness	
	Responsibilities for project implementation are clearly defined.	2
	Necessary implementation documents (e.g. specifications, design, procurement documents) are ready at appraisal.	3
	Monitoring indicators and monitoring plan are agreed upon and baseline data are available or are being collected	1
	PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS SCORE	2
	Implementation	
	Borrower complied with:	
	Environmental Safeguards	3
	Fiduciary Requirements	3
	Project Covenants	2
	Borrower was responsive to Bank supervision findings and recommendations.	2
	Borrower collected and used of monitoring information for decision-making.	2
	IMPLEMENTATION SUB-SCORE	2
OVERALL BORROWER PERFORMANCE SCORE	2	

J. PROCESSING

STEP	SIGNATURE AND COMMENTS	DATE
Sector Manager Clearance	Mr. BOUKARY SAVADOGO	18/10/2010
Regional Director Clearance	Mr. JANVIER LITSE	30/05/2011
Sector Director Approval	Ms. AGNES SOUCAT	30/05/2011

APPENDIX 1

Scoring scale and correspondence

SCORE	EXPLANATION
4	Highly satisfactory – Perfect implementation, flawless
3	Satisfactory – Most of the objectives have been attained despite a few shortcomings
2	Average – Project partially completed The outcomes almost equal the shortcomings
1	Unsatisfactory – Very few achievements and serious shortcomings
NA	Not Applicable

N.B: Figures are rounded up to the highest or lowest decimal. For the calculations, only whole numbers are retained.

LIST OF ANNEXES

<p>Mandatory information</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Project cost and financinga. Project cost by component b. Resources by source of financing 2. Contributions of the Bank. Cite the main members of the team as well as their duties during preparation and supervision. Provide a consolidated list of preparation, supervision and completion missions in chronological order. Provide the date and scores given by the last supervision report. 3. Economic analysis (ERR) and financial analysis, where applicable. Recalculate the economic rate of return based on costs and benefits at completion and compare them estimates made at appraisal. Distribution by component, if need be. Analyse ERR sensitivity to key assumptions. Present a financial analysis of the entities benefitting from the project. 4. Last procurement plan. 5. List of supporting documents

Optional Information

6. Project description. The main factors not considered in the general matrix but which affected project design and implementation. These factors, both positive and negative, could comprise: climate and meteorological conditions, political changes, contractual or personal issues, technical issues, the procurement process and interaction with other partners. If any of these factors is significant enough to affect the appraisal score, this should be mentioned in the matrix, and presented in the current annex.

Project Cost and Financing
 2. Costs and Expenditure by
 Category (in UA)

EXPENDITURE CATEGORIES	ESTIMATE (in UA)						ACTUAL					
	ADF	TAF	OPEC	GVT	TOTAL	% Cat	ADF (UA)	TAF (UA)	OPEC (USD)	GVT (UA)	TOTAL	% Cat
A - GOODS	2.38	-	0.55	0.47	3.40	17.5%	1.09	-	0.62	0.18	1.89	11.4%
B - WORKS	4.32	-	4.18	0.41	8.91	45.8%	4.84	-	2.81	0.56	8.21	49.4%
C - SERVICES	2.56	2.00	0.85	0.79	6.20	31.8%	2.07	2.00	1.02	0.26	5.36	32.2%
D. OPERATION	0.75	-	-	0.21	0.96	4.9%	0.28	-	-	0.88	1.16	7.0%
E. MISCELLANEOUS	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Total cost	10.00	2.00	5.58	1.88	19.46	100.0%	8.28	2.00	4.45	1.880	16.61	100.0%
Percentage	51.4%	10.3%	28.7%	9.7%	100.0%		49.8%	12.0%	26.8%	11.3%	100.0%	
Percentage disbursed							82.8%	100.0%	79.8%	100.0%	85.4%	
Amount disbursed							8.26	2.00	4.56		14.83	
Undisbursed amount							1.74	-	1.02		2.75	

Costs and Expenditure by
 Category (in UA)

COMPONENT	ESTIMATE (in UA)						ACTUAL					
	ADF	TAF	OPEC	GVT	TOTAL	% Cat	ADF (UA)	TAF (UA)	OPEC (USD)	GVT (UA)	TOTAL	% Cat
Institution building	1.49	1.10	0.59	-	3.17	17.4%	1.24	1.25	0.80	-	3.29	19.8%
II. Improving community access to basic services	7.75	-	3.79	1.37	12.91	70.7%	6.30	0.09	3.65	0.56	10.60	63.8%
III. Program implementation	0.77	0.90	-	0.51	2.18	11.9%	0.74	0.67	-	1.32	2.73	16.4%
Total cost	10.00	2.00	4.37	1.88	18.26	100.0%	8.28	2.01	4.45	1.880	16.62	100.0%
Percentage	54.8%	11.0%	24.0%	10.3%	100.0%		49.8%	12.1%	26.8%	11.3%	100.0%	
Percentage disbursed							82.8%	100.5%	101.8%	100.0%	91.1%	

ADB Contributions

<i>Type of mission</i>	<i>Starting date</i>	<i>End date</i>	<i>Duration, including travel days</i>	<i>Composition</i>
Identification mission	1998			Consultative and participatory approach with civil society, NGOs and most donors such as IDA, AFD, USAID, European Union, UNDP, UNICEF, UNFPA, UNESCO, WHO, OPEC and the German Foundation Hans Siedel. This preparation/assessment was partly financed by Swiss Cooperation.
Preparation mission	Feb. 2009			
Appraisal mission	22.08.1999	04.09.1999	14	Mr. J.E PORGO, Chief Education Analyst and consultants
Supervision mission	04.06.2004	16.06.2004	12	
Supervision mission	10.12.2004	23.12.2004	13	
Supervision mission	19.06.2005	04.07.2005	16	
Supervision mission	19.12.2005	24.12.2005	6	
Supervision mission	29.11.2006	14.12.2006	16	
Portfolio improvement mission (Sector Portfolio Improvement Plan)	15.02.2007	02.03.2007	16	
Supervision mission	05.11.2008	17.11.2008	12	
Supervision mission	15.04.2009	30.04.2009	16	Mr. Gabriel AYEMI, Education Expert

Supervision mission	10.12.2009	20.12.2009	11	Mr. Massissou N. HATHOURA
Completion mission	19.09.2010	03.10.2010	15	Mr. Massissou N. HATHOURA, Project Officer and M. Jerome TABIRI, Consultant Architect, and Ms. Odile MORNET-CARIOU, Education Consultant

Duration in number of days, including travel days.

Supporting documents

Component 2

<i>Activity 1</i>	Technical control of construction works on socio-educational and health infrastructure – Final Report LOT 1 (SOCOTEC);
<i>Activity 1</i>	Technical control of construction works on socio-educational and health infrastructure – Final Report LOT 2 (SOCOTEC);
<i>Activity 1</i>	Final report: Quality control and commissioning of materials (CNERTP)
<i>Activity 2</i>	Training of 40 community relay officers in reproductive health, May 2008
<i>Activity 3</i>	Report on the training of 22 social service workers in home economics and childcare, December 2008
<i>Activity 3</i>	Report on the training of 21 social technicians in the statistical data collection and processing, October 2008
<i>Activity 3</i>	Report on the retraining of 15 community social work controllers, August 2008
<i>Activity 4</i>	Report on training workshops for the dissemination of the Persons and Family Code to opinion leaders, February 2006
<i>Activity 4</i>	Report on training workshops for the dissemination of the Persons and Family Code to social technicians, February 2006
<i>Activity 4</i>	Report on training workshops for the dissemination of the Persons and Family Code to
<i>Activity 6</i>	Rural employment status, Stage 1 and 2 report
<i>Activity 9</i>	Final Report on control and supervision of construction work on 23 district health centres and the administrative building of the Directorate. of Human Resources under the Ministry of Health – January 2010 (ALMEGA-BTP)

3. LIST OF CONTRACTS EXECUTED BY THE HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME (PDRH)

No.	Supplier	Nationality	Purpose of Contract	Mode	Initial Amount in CFAF	ADF share in CFAF	OPEC share in CFAF	TAF share in CFAF	GVT share in CFAF	Execution in %
GOODS										
1	CAPALIA IDF	BENIN	Contract No.135/MCPPD/DC/SG/DGRHP /DPPD of 23/09/2003 to supply furniture for various components (tables and chairs)	Local competitive bidding	36 184 706	20 270 935	15 134 376		779 395	100%
2	NDC GROUP	BENIN	Contract No.137/MCPPD/DC/SG/DGRHP/DPPD of 23/09/2003 to supply furniture for various components (cupboards and storage units)	Local competitive bidding	16 326 101	11 627 118	4 338 983		360 000	100%

3	COMOVEP SARL	BENIN	Contract No.133/ MFE/ DNMP/SP of 05/06/2006 to supply furniture (office chairs and desks)	Local competitive bidding	5 600 400	1 825 200	3 775 200			100%
4	SOCAR BENIN	BENIN	Contract No.090/ MCCAG-PD/DC/SG/DGRHP/ DPPD/PDRH of 01/09/2003 to supply vehicles	International competitive bidding	243 925 000	216 275 000	27 650 000			100%
5	CONSTRUCTION & EQUIPEMENTS	BENIN	Contract No.117/MCPPD/DC/SG/DGRHP/DPPD/ PDRH of 23/09/2003 to supply audiovisual, office and IT equipment	International competitive bidding	191 789 429	163 173 398	28 616 032			100%
6	PIERON	BENIN	Contract No.880/MEF/MPDEAP/DNMP/SP of 05/09/2008 to supply socio-educational and community infrastructure - Lot Eq3 Laboratory equipment for GSSs P	International competitive bidding	201 944 155	201 944 155				100%
7	COMOVEP SARL	BENIN	Contract No.883/MEF/MPDEAP/DNMP/SP of 05/09/2008 to supply socio-educational and community infrastructure Lot Eq6 Medical equipment for VHUs COMOVEP	International competitive bidding	93 552 565	93 552 565				100%
8	MARVEL	BENIN	Contract No.876/MEF/MPDEAP/DNMP/SP of 05/09/2008 to supply equipment for 23 health centres - Lot EQ2 Household electrical appliances, IT and office equipment MARVEL	International competitive bidding	30 723 143		30 723 143			100%
9	ACIA	BENIN	Contract No.873/MEF/MPDEAP/DNMP/SP of 05/09/2008 to supply equipment for 23 health centres - Lot EQ2 Household electrical appliances, IT and office equipment ACIA	International competitive bidding	207 867 021		207 867 021			100%
10	EKF	BENIN	Contract No.711/MEF/MPDEAP/DNMP/SP of 14/07/2008 to supply furniture for EPP in the North EKF	International competitive bidding	63 545 832	63 545 832				100%
11	NDC GROUP	BENIN	Contract No.766/MEF/MPDEAP/DNMP/SP of 25/07/2008 to supply furniture to EPP and VHUs NDC GROUP	International competitive bidding	14 942 818	14 942 818				100%
12	MASCIDI	BENIN	Contract No.702/MEF/MPDEAP/DNMP/SP of 14/12/2009 to supply teaching equipment to primary schools	International competitive bidding	218 753 191	218 753 191				100%

13	MASCIDI	BENIN	Contract No.711/MEF/MPDEAP/DNMP/SP of 17/12/2009 to supply equipment to the apprenticeship centres	International competitive bidding	203 777 190	203 777 190				100%
<i>SUB-TOTAL 1</i>					<i>1 528 931 551</i>	<i>1 209 687 402</i>	<i>318 104 754</i>	<i>0</i>	<i>1 139 395</i>	
WORKS										
14	KODEIH AND CIE	BENIN	Contract No.256//MDEF/MDEF/DNMP/SP of 12 July 07 Lot 1-1 Construct 18 modules of 3 classes + office-storerooms in Atlantique, Littoral, Ouémé and Plateau Districts	International competitive bidding	389 276 285	389 276 285				100%
15	GROUP MAISON ET TRAVAUX	BENIN	Contract No.255//MDEF/MDEF/DNMP/SP of 12 July 2007 Lot 1-2 Construction 17 modules of 3 classes + office-storerooms in Atacora, Donga and Alibori Districts	International competitive bidding	325 059 924	325 059 924				
16	ETENOC-BTP	BENIN	Contract No.263//MDEF/MDEF/DNMP/SP of 12 July 2007 Lot 1-3 Construct° 15 modules of 3 classes +office-storerooms in Mono, Couffo and Collines Districts	International competitive bidding	375 917 661	375 917 661				100%
17	CTBM	BENIN	Contract No. 258//MDEF/DNMP/SP of 12 July 2007 + Amendment Lot 1-4 Construction of the General Education Secondary School in Kandi and Kotopounga	International competitive bidding	335 706 054	335 706 054				100%
18	MMC TOGO	BENIN	Contract No.254//MDEF/MDEF/DNMP/SP of 12 July 2007 Lot 1-5 Construction of the General Education Secondary School in Oungbegamè and Azonvè	International competitive bidding	299 207 046	299 207 046				100%
19	CGC TOGO	BENIN	Contract No.261/MDEF/MDEF/DNMP/SP of 12 July 2007 Lot 1-6 Construction of the Girls Centre at Ouidah	International competitive bidding	586 942 609	586 942 609				100%
20	MMC TOGO	BENIN	Contract No.251//MDEF/MDEF/DNMP/SP of 12 July 2007 Lot 1-7 Construction of the	International competitive bidding	356 240 024	356 240 024				100%

21	CTBM	BENIN	Social Promotion Centres in Zè, Abomey, Aplahoué and Athiémé Contract No.260/MDEF/MDEF/DNMP/SP of 12 July 2007 + Amendment No. 01 Lot 1-8 Construction of the Social Promotion Centres in Copargo, Natitingou, Kandi and Pèrèrè	International competitive bidding	460 965 295	460 965 295				100%
22	KOGNOSSA ET FILS	BENIN	Contract No. 262//MDEF/MDEF/DNMP/SP of 12 July 2007 Lot 1-9 Construction of the Nikki Apprenticeship Centre	International competitive bidding	252 066 077	252 066 077				100%
23	MULTI TRANS BENIN	BENIN	Contract No. 252//MDEF/MDEF/DNMP/SP of 12 July 2007 Lot 1-10 Construction of the Pahou Apprenticeship Centre	International competitive bidding	222 779 926	222 779 926				90%
24	CMS	BENIN	Contract No. 259//MDEF/MDEF/DNMP/SP of 12 July 2007 Lot 1-11 Construction of 06 modules 3 classes + office-storerooms, canteens & 4 VHUs in Atacora, Donga, Borgou and Alibori Districts	International competitive bidding	271 534 830	98 027 014			173 816 507	60%
25	TRENTY COMPANY	BENIN	Contract No. 257//MDEF/MDEF/DNMP/SP of 12 July 2007 Lot 1-12 Construction of 05 modules 3 classes + office-storerooms, 03 canteens & 05UVS in Mono, Couffo and Atlantique Districts	International competitive bidding	241 832 320	87 304 087			154 233 528	80%
26	KODEIH AND CIE	BENIN	Contract No. 0250//MDEF/MDEF/DNMP/SP of 12 July 07 Lot1-13 Construct° 06 modules 3 classes + office-storerooms, 03 canteens and 11 VHUs in Zou and Collines Districts	International competitive bidding	311 584 262	112 485 293			199 969 098	98%
27	TRENTY COMPANY	BENIN	Contract No. 253//MDEF/MDEF/DNMP/SP of 12 July 2007 Lot 1-14 Sinking of 05 large-diameter wells in Kérou, Kalalé, Karimama, Bantè and Za-Kpota,	International competitive bidding	48 350 000	48 350 000				100%
28	DYJESCK SARL	BENIN	Contract No. 1023/MDEF/MDEF/DNMP/SP of 08/10/2008 Construction of 23 health centres and DRH building Lot 2-3	International competitive bidding	785 475 974		785 475 974			100%

29	DYJESCK SARL	BENIN	Contract No. 1022/MDEF/MDEF/DNMP/SP of 08/10/2008 Construction of 23 health centres and DRH building - Lot 2-6	International competitive bidding	760 934 225		760 934 225			45%
30	MAPOLO	BENIN	Contract No.1024/MDEF/MDEF/DNMP/SP of 08/10/2008 Construction of 23 health centres and DRH building - Lot 2-4	International competitive bidding	581 189 992		581 189 992			90%
31	GMT	BENIN	Contract No.1025/MDEF/MDEF/DNMP/SP of 08/10/2008 Construction of 23 health centres and DRH building - Lot 2-5	International competitive bidding	382 856 743		382 856 743			0%
SUB TOTAL 2					6 987 919 247	3 950 327 295	2 510 456 934	0	527 135 018	
SERVICES										
32	CFPEEN INFRE	BENIN	Contract No.048/ MCCAG-PD/DC/SG/DGRHP/DPPD/ PDRH of 27/03/2003 on the training of 24 (twenty-four) secondary education inspectors	Directly negotiated contract	130 000 001	130 000 000				100%
33	SOCOFEP	BENIN	Contract No.089/ MCPPD/DC/SG/DGRHP/DPPD/ PDRH of 01/09/2003 to train MFPSS employees in development planning, cooperative economics, gender and development and social mobilisation	Limited international shopping	42 743 110	42 743 110				100%
34	IDECOM LLC	BENIN	Contract No.091/ MCPPD/DC/SG/DGRHP/ DPPD/ PDRH of 01/09/2003 to provide technical assistance to MFPSS for the design, monitoring and evaluation of activities, and for the collection, processing and dissemination of gender-disaggregated social data.	Limited international shopping	548 035 600	82 205 340	465 830 260			100%
35	ALMEGA BTP	BENIN	Contract No.092/MCPPD/DC/SG/DGRHP/DPPD / PDRH of 01/09/2003 on architectural and technical studies and supervision of construction works on socio-educational and community infrastructure AMENDMENT NO.	Limited international shopping	251 760 000	251 760 000				100%

			1 of CFAF 44 250 000 (excluding tax)							
36	IDECOM LLC	BENIN	Contract No.093/ MCPPD/DC/SG/DGRHP/ DPPD/ PDRH of 01/09/2003 to provide technical assistance to MSP	Limited international shopping	53 420 000		53 420 000			100%
37	AFRIQUE ETUDES	BENIN	Contract No.103/ MCPPD/DC/SG/DGRHP/ DPPD/ PDRH of 23/09/2003 to train MSP employees in programming, planning, budgeting and monitoring	Limited international shopping	74 280 000		74 280 000			100%
38	ALMEGA BTP	BENIN	Contract No.104/MCPPD/DC/SG/DGRHP/DPPD / PDRH of 23/09/2003 on architectural and technical studies and supervision of construction works on 23 health centres and the Directorate of Human Resources	Limited international shopping	131 950 000		131 950 000			85%
39	AFRIQUE ETUDES	BENIN	Contract No.106/ MCPPD/DC/SG/DGRHP/DPPD/ PDRH of 23/09/2003 to provide technical assistance to the MEPS in setting up an efficient system for collecting, processing and disseminating school statistics, monitoring/evaluation of activities and preparation of school mapping	Limited international shopping	222 812 000		222 812 000			100%
40	SOCOFEP	BENIN	Contract No.108/MCPPD/DC/ SG/DGRHP/ DPPD/ PDRH of 23/09/2003 to train MEPS employees in the collecting, processing, producing and disseminating school and university statistics; education planning; monitoring/evaluation of activities; record-keeping; preparation, implementation,	Limited international shopping	130 077 337	130 077 337				100%

			control and monitoring of programme budgets; human resources management; information systems; and administrative techniques.							
41	SOCOFEP	BENIN	Contract No.109/MCPPD/DC/SG/DGRHP/ DPPD/PDRH of 23 September 2003 to provide technical assistance to the PDRH Coordination Unit and an amendment of CFAF 70 796 250, net of taxes, and an amendment of CFAF 85 940 800, inclusive of taxes.	Limited international shopping	814 355 550			529 742 250	284 613 300	100%
42	FIDEXCA	BENIN	Contract No. 76/MFE/ MCPPD/ DC/CNMP/SP of 17/05/2004 to recruit a firm to audit PDRH accounts for fiscal years 2002 and 2003	Limited international shopping	10 001 000	10 001 000				100%
43	CNERTP	BENIN	Contract No. 326/MFE/ MCPPD/ CNMP/SP of 24/11 /2004 to conduct foundation soil studies for construction works on socio-educational and health infrastructure	Limited international shopping	46 108 000	46 108 000				100%
44	CNERTP	BENIN	Contract No. 321/MFE/ MCPPD/ CNMP/SP of 24/11 /2004 to conduct foundation soil studies LOT 2 HEALTH	Limited international shopping	8 948 200		8 948 200			85%
45	CNERTP	BENIN	Contract No. 100/MFE/ MCPPD/ CNMP/SP of /2004 to conduct foundation soil studies SE TOTCHANGNI	Limited international shopping	9 466 200		9 466 200			85%

46	SOCOTEC	BENIN	Contract No. 322/ MFE/MCPPD/ CNMP/SP of 24/11/2004 to conduct decennial control of construction works on socio-educational and health infrastructure	Limited international shopping	51 265 000	51 265 000				100%
47	SOCOTEC	BENIN	Contract No.009/ MFE/MCPPD/ CNMP/SP of 24/11/2004 to conduct decennial control of construction works on 23 health centres and the DRH building	Limited international shopping	31 960 000		31 960 000			85%
48	TECSULT	BENIN	Contract No. 110/MFE/MCPPD/ CNMP/SP of 23/05/2005 to recruit a firm to prepare technical education master plans in Benin	Limited international shopping	135 000 000			135 000 000		100%
49	BeCG	BENIN	Contract No. 113/MFE/MCPPD/ CNMP/SP of 23/05/ 2005 to recruit a firm to conduct a study on the rural employment situation	Limited international shopping	251 310 000	251 310 000				100%
50	CNERTP	BENIN	Contract No.92/MFE DNMP/SP of 07/04/ 2006 to conduct geotechnical assessment of construction work on socio-educational and health infrastructure	Limited international shopping	123 540 000	123 540 000				100%
51	CNERTP	BENIN	Contract No. 91/MFE DNMP/SP of 07/04/ 2006 to conduct geotechnical assessment of construction work on 23 health centres and the DRH building	Limited international shopping	70 060 000		70 060 000			85%
52	FIDEXPERT	BENIN	Contract No. 94/MFE DNMP/SP of 14/06/ 2006 to define accounting procedures	Limited international shopping	15 715 000	15 715 000				100%
52	CNERTP	BENIN	Contract No.608/MCEPDEAP/ DNMP/SP of BENIN CONSULTING GROUP	Limited international shopping	165 460 000		165 460 000			100%
53	CANATEC	BENIN	Contract No. 623/MEF/MPDEAP/ DNMP/SP of 24/06/2008 to train trainers from the Pahou and Nikki Apprenticeship Centres	Limited international shopping	261 900 000	161 900 000		100 000 000		100%

53	CDM CONSULTANTS	BENIN	Contract No. 134/MFE/DNMP/SP of 05/06/2006 to recruit a firm to audit PDRH accounts for fiscal 2004 and 2004	Limited international shopping	14 873 869	14 873 869				100%
53	INMES	BENIN	Contract No. 105/MCPPD/DC/G/DGRHP/DPPD/PDRH of 03/10/2003 to train 36 paramedics, 12 State-registered nurses, 12 State-registered midwives and 12 laboratory technicians	Directly negotiated contract	71 992 800				71 992 800	100%
53	INMES	BENIN	Contract No. 107/MCCAG-PD/DC/SG/DGRHP/DPPD/PDRH of 23/09//2003 to train 14 candidate employees of AOMPCEs selected for training in INMES	Directly negotiated contract	14 000 000				14 000 000	100%
53	ENIAB	BENIN	Contract No. 075/MCCAG-PD/DC/SG/DGRHP/DPPD/PDRH of 17/06//2003 to train 14 candidate employees of AOMPCEs selected for training in ENIAB	Directly negotiated contract	6 000 000				6 000 000	100%
54	ENAAH	BENIN	Contract No. 110/MCPPD/DC/G/DGRHP/DPPD/PDRH of 23/09/2003 to train 60 selected health workers in ENAAH	Directly negotiated contract	90 000 000				90 000 000	100%
55	FIDEXCA	BENIN	Contract No. 238/MFE/DNMP/SP of 28/06/2007 to recruit a firm to audit PDRH accounts for fiscal 2006-2008	Limited international shopping	10 800 000	10 800 000				100%
56	DSF	BENIN	Contract No. 489/MEF/ MPDEAP/DNMP/SP of 30/05/2008 to train 40 community relay officers in reproductive health	Limited international shopping	25 297 560			25 297 560		100%
<i>SUB-TOTAL3</i>					<i>3 813 131 227</i>	<i>1 322 298 656</i>	<i>545 544 400</i>	<i>1 478 682 070</i>	<i>466 606 100</i>	
TOTAL					12 329 982 025	6 482 313 353	3 374 106 088	1 478 682 070	994 880 513	

B PROJECT CONTEXT	
<p>Development challenge addressed by the project: The challenge targeted by the project is poverty reduction, which is the primary objective of the Government's Policy Plan. In 1998, 34% of the population suffered from monetary poverty; poverty particularly affected the rural population: 67% compared to 55% for the urban population. Benin's Human Development Index of 0.378 ranked it 145th in the world and population growth was 3%.</p> <p>Sector challenges:</p> <p>(i) The education sector is characterised by lack of infrastructure in rural primary education (e.g. GER of 50.2% in Borgou and 59.7% in Atacora compared to a national average of 70.5%) and in secondary education (national GER: 14.6%). The system is plagued by low internal efficiency due to a shortage of inspectors and teacher training issues (the internal failings of the educational system are reflected in the high dropout rates of 10% and 11.7% in primary and secondary education). Vocational training mechanisms do not meet the expectations of economic stakeholders.</p> <p>(ii) The health sector is characterised by insufficient infrastructure coverage, causing shortcomings related to: (i) maternal and infant health (mortality rates of 235 and 94 per 100,000 births, poor nutritional status); (ii) control of malaria and HIV/AIDS whose prevalence of 3.8% at the national level could double in rural areas.</p> <p>(iii) Community development is undermined by women's fragile status at the educational, economic, legal and medical level, which hampers their ability to participate in economic development.</p> <p>Bank activities in this country and sector over the last year - Social projects (4) represent 21% of the active portfolio and focus on education (Education IV, UA 12 million), health (development of the Health III system, UA 22 million and the HIV/AIDS control support project, UA 2.7 million) and poverty reduction (UA 11 million). Their performance (2) is below overall performance (2.18) and the disbursement rate is relatively low (32% for an average age of 6.9 years).</p> <p>On-going activities financed by the Bank and other external sources which supplement, duplicate or relate to this project - The WB's social portfolio comprises programmes related to HIV/AIDS control (USD 35 million), malaria control (USD 31 million), health system performance enhancement (USD 22.8 million), poverty reduction (grant of USD 30 million), primary education and education for all through the Fast-Track Initiative (on-going). The European Union intervenes in local development, especially regarding access to basic social services and balanced territorial development (EUR 45 million budgeted over the 2008-2010 period). Bilateral partners (Germany-GTZ, United States-USAID, Belgium, Japan, France, Denmark) also intervene in the community development, vocational training and primary education sectors.</p>	
<p>CHARACTERISTICS OF THE LOGICAL FRAMEWORK (b) Expresses objectives and outcomes in a way that is measurable and quantifiable.</p> <p>Concerning Component II:</p> <p>(i) Education: few target indicators (e.g.: expected number of pupils per teacher, gender-sensitive rates);</p> <p>(ii) Vocational training: few outcome indicators (e.g. % of graduates employed upon completion of studies, % of dropouts, % of girls enrolled in apprenticeship centres, etc.);</p> <p>(iii) Health: the indicators are not very clear: the number of consultations for malaria treatment declines from 34% in 1998 to 20% in 2004. The rate of sexually-transmitted AIDS cases falls from 92% of total infections to 40% over the same period. It would be more judicious to adopt baseline indicators (malaria-related infant mortality rate, HIV/AIDS prevalence rate for the targeted age group);</p> <p>(iv) Poverty reduction: the targets are vague and difficult to measure: the appraisal report targets the reduction of expenditure on medication following the adoption of safe healthy behaviour. The financial gain per household is not estimated.</p>	
<p>D. OUTPUTS AND OUTCOMES</p> <p>3. Risks to sustained achievement of outcomes</p> <p>The completion rate (65%) remains below target (77%). The law on free primary education puts enormous pressure on infrastructure, equipment and teachers. The public sector pupil-teacher ratio deteriorated (from 48.3 in 1994 to 50 in 2005). In 2009, it stood at 48.3 but remains below the PDDSE target (47.1). District disparities (especially in terms of pupil-teacher ratio and allocation of textbooks) are widening. These results reflect a resource allocation problem depending on needs. The lack of school mapping undermines management of the system. The low qualifications of teachers also affect quality. The teachers' qualification ratio deteriorated sharply from 1995 to 2002. In 1995, 87.6% of teachers were qualified; this rate fell to 51.5% in 2002 due to the increase in unqualified community teachers. The 2-year continuous training programme for State contract employees (about 1000 teachers) and the recruitment of fixed-term State employees from among the graduates of National Teachers' Training Colleges (ENI) tends to raise the teachers' qualification ratio.</p>	
<p>E. PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS FOR IMPLEMENTATION, USE OF NATIONAL SYSTEMS</p> <p>Corruption affects administrative procedures. The Project Management Unit reportedly had to pay certain sums to the CAA in order to secure the release of certain files.</p>	
<p>F. IMPLEMENTATION</p> <p>Timeliness – Commencement of the project, planned to last for 57 months, was delayed by 17 months. Such delays stemmed from various reasons:</p>	

(i) Ratification and implementation deadlines for loan agreements (loan signature date: 11 July 2000, effectiveness date: 26 December 2001).

(ii) Recurrent difficulties related to the release of counterpart funds (in 2006, only CFAF 220,000,000 was budgeted out of a financing need of CFAF 817,216,000 and in 2008 only CFAF 400,000,000 out of a financing need of CFAF 462,000,000 was budgeted in the PIP). A number of activities financed 100% with counterpart funds suffered from this situation. This is the case with the training of 268 health workers, 20 laboratory technicians and 200 community relay workers on malaria and AIDS control.

(iii) Red tape observed throughout the procurement chain (the average procurement timeframe is 13 months, from submission of the bidding documents to the ADB for approval up to the signing of contracts). These bottlenecks constitute a handicap to the timely consumption of credit. The delays occur during approval of the bidding documents and analysis reports by the DNMP and the ADB, and during signature of the contracts by the CAA. Given these delays, some firms pre-financed activities, especially technical assistance. Hence, IDECOM/LLC pre-financed technical assistance activities in MSP and MPSF. Similarly, the firm SOCOFEP INC pre-financed long-term training (3 years) in cooperative economics for 2 employees of the Ministry of the Family, Social Welfare and Solidarity (MFPSS), followed by the conduct of 3 other modules (development planning, gender and development, and social mobilization) at the Institut Supérieur Panafricain d'Economie Coopérative (Pan-African Higher Institute for Cooperative Economics, ISPEC).

(iv) Slow progress of works due mainly to: (i) the limited technical, organisational and financial capacity of enterprises; (ii) far-flung sites with reduced accessibility; (iii) payment time-limits for certain bills; and (iii) exogenous causes: excessive rainfall from September-October 2007, cement shortage from January to June 2008 due to priority projects related to the organization of the CEN-SAD summit in Cotonou.

Performance of consultants: The technical ministries encounter difficulties in assessing the quality of consultancy firms that provided technical assistance for Components 1 (design of statistics and planning systems, preparation of a master plan for technical and vocational training) and 2 (rural employment study, preparation of training programmes). Such technical assistance was not followed by any concrete applications.

3. Harmonization.

A Common Budget Fund (FCB) was created by a group of multilateral and bilateral TFPs, to support implementation of the Education Sector Ten-Year Development Plan (PDDSE 2006-2015) defined as the government's strategic framework. It brings together the IDA (administrator of the Fast-Track Initiative), the Kingdom of the Netherlands, the German Development Bank, the Kingdom of Denmark and the French Development Agency. This joint financing arrangement is aimed at implementing the principles of the Paris Declaration, namely greater harmonization of donor practices relating to the implementation of sector support (conditions, implementation arrangements and monitoring/evaluation) and stood at CFAF 49,656,342 for the 2008-2010 period (indicative amount).

H. LESSONS LEARNT

The lessons learnt from the portfolio review are:

- (i) Reduce the time-limits for ratification and implementation of loan agreements;
- (ii) Increase the involvement of sector ministries in the different phases of the project cycle: appraisal, monitoring/evaluation, and preparation of lessons learnt from implementation;
- (iii) Establish performance contracts with project implementation units; the coordinators must be bound by a performance contract with the Government, staff from the units must be better trained on the Bank's procedures and the evaluation culture;
- (iv) Increase the coordination of external aid: The coordination of external aid is the responsibility of the Ministry of Economy and Finance through the Autonomous Sinking Fund and of the Ministry of Forward Planning, Development, Public Policy Evaluation and Coordination of Government Action, through the Directorate General for Investment and Development Financing (DGIFD) and the Directorate General for Development Policy. The role of each structure should be clarified.
- (v) Ensure regular payment of counterpart funds.

Mission Programme

Date	Time	Activity	Place
<i>Sunday 19/09/2010</i>	4:30	Arrival of mission and check-in in a hotel	Cotonou
<i>Monday 20/09/2010</i>	9:00 – 11:00	Working session with PDRH officials	PDRH
	16:00 – 17:00	Meeting with the Director of Financing Forecasts / DGIFD	DGIFD
	17:00 – 18:00	Working session with the ADB focal point in DGIFD and the PDRH Accountant	PDRH
<i>Tuesday 21/09/2010</i>	8:00 – 12:00	Provisional reception of equipment for Lots EQ4 and EQ6 supplied by MASCIDI for Que/Plat Districts	District Directorate of Porto Novo

	15:00 – 18:00	Provisional reception of equipment for Lots EQ4 and EQ6 supplied by MASCIDI for Atlantique and Littoral Districts	District Directorate of Cotonou
	18:30 – 19:00	Working session with the accounting assistant	PDRH
	20:00 – 20:30	Team consultative meeting	Hotel
Wednesday 22/09/2010	8:00 – 9:00	Working session with the PDRH coordinator and the ADB focal point in DGIFD	PDRH
	16:00 – 17:00	Provisional reception of equipment supplied by MASCIDI, Girls Centre in Ouidah, Vocational Training Centre in Pahou	Ouidah
	10:00 – 13:00	Situation meeting at the UNDP	Cotonou
	17:00 – 19:00	Working session with the CAA	CAA
Thursday 23/09/2010	9:00 – 10:30	Ministry of Secondary Education - DRH DFQP Director of Training and Vocational Qualification	Cotonou
	11:00 – 12:00	Working session with the DGIFD (ADB focal point)	Hotel
Friday 24/09/2010	8:30 – 10:00	MESFTP	MESFTP
	10:30 – 11:15	Working session with the enterprise Dyjesck	PDRH
	11:30 – 12:30	Situation meeting at the World Bank	Cotonou
	16:30 – 17:30	Working session with the control firm – Almega BTP	Cotonou
Saturday 25/09/2010	7:30 – 19:00	<i>With the assistance of the civil engineering assistant, visit:</i> - Health centres - Village health unit - Apprenticeship centre	Tangbo-Djevie Wawata Pahou
		Social promotion centre	Kpinnou (Athiémé)
Sunday 26/09/2010	10:00 – 12:00	Study of reports submitted by PDRH	Hotel
	15:00 – 17:00	Working session on the drafting of the aide memoire	Hotel
Monday 27/09/2010	8:30 – 10:30	Working session at the PDRH with the accounting assistant	Cotonou
	11:00 – 12:30	DPP and DRH – Ministry of Health	Cotonou
Tuesday 28/09/2010	9:00 – 17:00	Working session with the Directorate General for Investment and Development Financing and officials of the Education IV project	MESFTP
	16:00	DPP, DRH, Directorate of Statistics – Ministry of Family and National Solidarity	Ministry of Family and National Solidarity

	18:30 – 19:00	Working session with the main coordination team	Hotel
Wednesday 29/09/2010	8:00 – 10:00	Working session with the coordinator and accounting assistant of the PDRH project	Cotonou
	11:00 – 13:00	Working session with the DPP and PDRH coordinator at the Ministry of Nursery and Primary Education	Porto Novo
	15:00 – 17:00	Working session with the coordinator and accounting assistant of the PDRH project	PDRH
	17:00 – 19:00	Drafting of the aide memoire	
Thursday 30/09/2010	17:00 – 19:00	Working session with the PDRH	Hotel
Friday 01/10/2010	9:00 – 10:30	Working session with the PDRH	PDRH
	12:00 – 13:00	Meeting with the DGPD	DGPD
	15:00	Feedback meeting and signing of the aide memoire	DGIFD
Sunday 03 /10/2010		Return to Addis	

Acronyms

List of Acronyms

AC: Apprenticeship Centre

ADB: African Development Bank

AFD: French Development Agency

CAA : Autonomous Sinking Fund / Ministry of Economy and Finance

CCS: Community health complexes

CDPF : Persons and Family Code

CDU : Community development unit

CIPEN : Directorate of Vocational Development, National Coordination of New Initiatives and Jobs

CNRHP : National Commission for Human Resources and the Population

CSSP: Sub-prefecture health complexes

DNPP : National Directorate of Planning and Forward Planning

DPP: Directorate of Programming and Forward Planning

FECECAM : Federation of Agricultural Credit Union Cooperatives

GSS: General secondary school

HDI: Human Development Index

HR: Human resources

IDA : International Development Association

IEC: Information, education and communication

IGA : Income-generating activity

IIEP : International Institute for Education Planning

INFRE : National Institute for Training and Research in Education

INMES : National Medical and Social Institute

ISPEC : Pan-African Higher Institute for Cooperative Economics

MENRS : Ministry of National Education and Scientific Research

MEPS : Ministry of Primary and Secondary Education

MESFTP : Ministry of Secondary Education and Technical and Vocational Training

METFP : Ministry of Technical and Vocational Education, subsequently renamed MESFTP: Ministry of Secondary Education and Technical and Vocational Training

MEUH : Ministry of Environment, Town Planning and Housing

MFSN : Ministry of Family and National Solidarity

MFSN : Ministry of Family and National Solidarity (replaced MPSF: Ministry of Social Security and the Family, which became Ministry of Family and National Solidarity)

MPDEPP - CAG : Ministry of Forward Planning, Development, Public Policy Evaluation and Coordination of Government Action (replaced MPDEAP: Ministry of Forward Planning, Development and Evaluation of Government Action)

MS : Ministry of Health (replaced MSP: Ministry of Public Health)

MSC: Common Social Minimum

PNLS: National AIDS Control Programme

PNLP: National Malaria Control Programme

OPEC : Organization of Petroleum Exporting Countries

P/M: Person per month

PIP: Public Investment Program

SIPSEA : Computerized System for Planning, Monitoring and Assessing Activities in the Ministry of Family and National Solidarity

CPS: Social Promotion Centre

TFPs: Technical and Financial Partners

UA : Unit of Account

UNDP: United Nations Development Program

UNESCO : United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation

WB : World Bank

WiLDAF/FeDDAF : Women in Law and Development in Africa/Femmes, Droit et Développement