

# PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT (PCR)

## A. PROJECT DATA AND KEY DATES

### I. BASIC INFORMATION

<b>Project Number :</b> P-SL-IAZ-001	<b>Project Name:</b> Rehabilitation of Basic and Non-Formal Education and Vocational Skills Education Project (Education III)	<b>Country:</b> Republic of Sierra Leone	
<b>Lending Instrument (s):</b> - ADF Loan No. 2100150006965; Grant No. 2100155001864		<b>Sector:</b> Education	<b>Environmental Classification:</b> 2, Req. Mitig. Meas.
<b>Original Commitment:</b> UA 15,000,000 <b>Grant UA</b> 1,000,000 <b>GoSL:</b> UA 1.58 million	<b>Amount Cancelled:</b> UA 529,192.54	<b>Amount Disbursed:</b> (Loan) UA 14,470,807.46 (Grant) UA 1,000,000 GoSL: UA 889,242	<b>% Disbursed:</b> 96.47% on the Loan and 100% on the grant
<b>Borrower:</b> The Government of Sierra Leone			
<b>Executing Agency:</b> Programme Co-ordination Unit, Ministry of Science and Technology (MEST)			
Co-financers and other External Partners: The World Bank jointly financed the project and contributed an IDA grant totaling USD 20 million. Nonetheless, under the Education Sector Plan (ESP) (2007 – 2015) other sources of funding are being contributed to stimulate the on-going plan for both capital and recurrent expenditures. While most donors and development partners are engaged in direct funding projects aligned under the ESP, the EFA-FTI Catalytic Funds caters for basic education. Some of these include the Islamic Development Bank, UNESCO and UNICEF. The EFA-FTI funds have similar components like the ADF, which are civil works, curriculum development related activities (teachers' professional development, materials development), and capacity building. Currently, UNICEF is the lead for the development partners supporting the sector. UNICEF was also instrumental in the strengthening of capacity, which including hiring of the Deputy Director for Planning and a statistician as well as support for the design and development of a comprehensive Education Sector Capacity Development Strategy, initiatives that complemented the Education III project's support for EMIS and institutional strengthening activities.			

### II. KEY DATES

<b>Project Concept Note Approved by Ops. Com. Not Applicable (NA)</b>	<b>Appraisal Report Approved by Ops Com: 2002</b>	<b>Board Approval: 16.10.2002</b>	
Restructuring(s): A corrigendum to the appraisal report was drafted. In it, details were provided in regards to the changes of funding sources from DfID to the World Bank in support of the project's capacity building activities. The activities were to amount to USD 2 million. The reason for this change was due to the development of DfID's new strategy for aid financing, which impacted Sierra Leone in the education sector. Instead of direct assistance provision, DfID prioritized general budgetary support, with a particular focus on governance and the PRSP processes.			
	<b>Original Date</b>	<b>Actual Date</b>	<b>Difference in Months [effective date-original date]</b>
<b>EFFECTIVENESS</b>	December, 2002	August 25, 2003	8 Months
<b>MID-TERM REVIEW</b>	December, 2004	November 24 – December 10, 2005	12
<b>CLOSING</b>	31 December. 2007	30 September. 2010	33 months

### III. RATINGS SUMMARY

CRITERIA	SUB-CRITERIA	RATING
PROJECT OUTCOME	Achievement of Outputs	3
	Achievement of Outcomes	3
	Timeliness	2
	<b>OVERALL PROJECT OUTCOME</b>	<b>3</b>
BANK PERFORMANCE	Design and Readiness	3
	Supervision	3
	<b>OVERALL BANK PERFORMANCE</b>	<b>3</b>
BORROWER PERFORMANCE	Design and Readiness	3
	Implementation	3
	<b>OVERALL BORROWER PERFORMANCE</b>	<b>3</b>

### IV. RESPONSIBLE BANK STAFF

POSITIONS	AT APPROVAL	AT COMPLETION
Regional Director		F. Perrault
Sector Director	Ms. Z. El Bakri	Agnes Soucat
Sector Division Manager	R. Cressman	Boukary Savadogo
Task Manager	Margaret Kilo	Abdi Younis
PCR Team Lead		Maria Mdachi
PCR Team Members		Kwasi P. Agyeman (Consultant Architect)

## B. PROJECT CONTEXT

Summarize the rationale for Bank assistance. State

- the development challenge addressed by the project,
- the borrower's overall strategy to meet this challenge,
- the Bank's activities in this /these countries and in the sector during the year and its performance, and
- ongoing activities financed by the Bank and other external sources that complement, duplicate, or relate to this project

-Cite the relevant sources. Comment on the strength and coherence of the rationale.

**[300 words maximum. Any additional narrative about the project's origin and background, if needed, should be presented in Annex 6: Project Description]**

The Education III or Sababu project was an emergency response on the part of the Government of Sierra Leone for poverty reduction and readiness for social and economic reconstruction, in meeting the expectations of a people emerging from the devastation of war. Within the parameters of the Draft Interim Poverty Reduction Strategy phase (I-PRSP) through 2002 and also for the medium term phase of PRSP (2003-2005), education played a pivotal role in providing immediate capacity building for girls and boys, young women and men in acquiring skills and training necessary to resource the development sector. At the same time, after more than a decade of rebel war, education provided the opportunity to bring life to normalcy for the many out-of-school girls and boys, teachers and the communities at large in strategically developing human capital for a nation working towards reconstruction and self-sufficiency. Reports of the Multiple Cluster Indicators Survey (MICS) and the National School Survey in 2001 revealed the extensiveness of the damage of the war on the sector. Some of the challenges are not limited to, but mainly include the following:

- a) The school aged population was estimated at 1,000,000, yet 30 per cent of these were unable to access Junior Secondary School (JSS), and for those who did, 30 per cent of them did not reach Senior Secondary School (SSS) Education; also only 10 per cent of those in SSS education were able to access tertiary education;
- b) Capacity at all levels of the education system was weak in order to effectively and efficiently deliver quality education services; they also lacked essential working tools;
- c) Education infrastructure was affected in all districts, but with varying degrees; 70 per cent of these structures (classrooms, administrative blocks, workshops and laboratories) and furniture were destroyed;
- d) Most teachers had fled the country or were displaced; 42 per cent of primary school teachers were unqualified; 30 per cent of JSS teachers were untrained and unqualified;
- e) Pupil/textbook ratio was assessed at 5:1 in grade 1; for science textbooks in other grades the ratio recorded at 8:1.

The project was jointly prepared with the World Bank and DfID, although the latter withdrew its commitment due to change of aid financing modality for the sector from direct to budgetary support.

## C. PROGRAMME OBJECTIVES AND LOGICAL FRAMEWORK

### 1. State the Project Development Objectives) (as set out in the appraisal)

Sector Objective: The identified sector goal for the project was to assist the Government of Sierra Leone with the rehabilitation of basic and non-formal education skills training.

Specific objectives of Education III: Specifically, the project's objectives were to implement an emergency response for basic education, vocational skills training (VST) and functional literacy needs for the restoration of normalcy in the sector and strengthen national capacity for efficient delivery of education services.

### 2. Describe the main project components, indicating how each will contribute to the achievement of project objectives

The project comprised of the following three components which were in line with Draft I-PRSP (2002) and succeeding PRS (2003-2005) priority areas for the sector :

**Component 1. Rehabilitation of Basic Education, Vocational Skills Training and literacy: Partnership Programme** – which includes national construction/rehabilitation of basic education facilities and amenities (water supply and latrines) , provision of standard sets of furniture/equipment as well as core teaching and learning materials for primary and junior secondary schools using Service Providers as implementers. This set of activities contributed towards the restoration of basic education after the rebel war, including provision of technical/vocational training centers for the young girls and boys for middle level skills acquisition and teachers' housing as an incentive for teachers.

**Component 2. Institutional Strengthening, Capacity Building and Outreach** – comprising of training activities for the different levels of the education system in order to build the capacity needed for provision of quality delivery of services, which had been lost as a result of the rebel war. This includes at the policy level, the development of the sector's vision and operational strategy; skills and competencies building of key staff at the center; strengthening of information management (EMIS) for capturing the girls and boys, and female and male education managers at all levels of the system for proper planning and management of the system and resources; School Management Committees (SMCs) in order to support education development and governance at that local level of the education system as well as sustained mechanisms of maintenance of the basic education facilities. The project also included a communication's outreach strategy for all the communities where the project was operational. ADF funding covered a total of 7 districts out of 14, while the IDA funding covered the other half.

**Component 3. Supports to Project Management** – activities under this component are geared towards maintaining and improving capacity for quality delivery and performance of key project stakeholders in the direct management of the project. This includes, applying best practices in the main areas of the project.

**3. Provide a brief assessment (up to two sentences) of the project objectives along the following three dimensions. Insert a working score, using the scoring scale provided in Appendix 1.**

PROJECT OBJECTIVES DIMENSIONS		ASSESSMENT	WORKING SCORE
<b>RELEVANT</b>	a) Relevant to the country's development objectives	The goals and objectives of the project were compatible with the people of Sierra Leone's priorities as identified in the Interim PRSP of 2001; the NEMP as well as the Bank's Country Strategy Paper and Education Policy of 2000.	4
<b>ACHIEVABLE</b>	b) Objectives deemed achievable with project inputs and expected timeframe.	The project objectives were deemed achievable in light of the prevailing policy environment and willingness for restoring education back to normalcy. However, given the context of the country's post-conflict, capacity to undertake the identified project components, including familiarity/adherence to Bank procurement and disbursement procedures and project management resulted into a 33 months delay in implementation.	3
<b>CONSISTENT</b>	c) Consistent with the Bank's national or regional strategy	Education III project objectives conformed with the Bank group's Education Policy 2000 and the Country Strategy Paper (CSP) 1999-2001 for Sierra Leone	4
	d) Consistent with the Bank's general priorities	The project was fully consistent with the Bank's general priorities. The project was formulated and appraised using the Bank's Education Sector Paper (ESP)	4

**4. Summarize the logical framework. In the absence of a logical framework, complete the table below, stating the overall objective of the project, the main components of the project, the main activities of each component, and the expected outputs and outcomes, as well as the indicators for measuring outcomes. Add additional rows for components, activities, outputs or outcomes, if necessary.**

Components	Activities	Expected Outputs	Expected Outcomes	Indicators
<b>Component 1:</b>  Partnership Program Rehabilitation of Basic Education, Vocational Skills Training and Literacy Programmes	Primary schools, JSS and CECs and TVCs reconstructed, rehabilitated or expanded and fully operational; under qualified primary school teachers trained and instructors at technical and vocational centres provided literacy and skills training. Textbooks supplied to primary schools and JSS.	Rehabilitation/reconstruction of 185 primary schools, 30 JSS and 40 Community Education Centres (CECs) and Vocational Training Centres (VTCs), 138 Teachers' housing. Furniture tools, and equipment, textbooks: pupil ratio reduced from 5:1 to 3:1 by 2006	Improvement of education quality; <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Expanded enrolments of school aged girls and boys;</li> <li>- School learning environment meeting quality minimum of standards;</li> <li>- 1 pupil: 1 core textbook provision and use;</li> <li>- 50 per cent of school going girls and boys achieve national minimum learning standards;</li> <li>- Employability/self-reliability of 50 per cent of these achievers</li> </ul>	% children of school going age attending school increased; Number of teachers recruited in remote areas increased; Number of youth becoming self-employed through acquisition of skills increased
	Provision of in-service primary and JSS teacher training,	4,000 under-qualified teachers were to be trained by ADF		Quality teaching attained Source: Supervision and Monitoring reports by Inspectorate and Quality Assurance

<p><b>Component 2:</b> Institutional Strengthening, Capacity Building and Outreach</p>	<p>Development of vision and strategy Support to MEST plan to enhance capacity for project management, implementation and sustainability Production/distribution of manuals for accelerated in-service teacher training Establishment of school management committees School maintenance plan developed and focal points in SMCs trained for minor maintenance All institutions in project equipped for preventive maintenance</p>	<p>Technical assistance to improve planning, procurement management and financial management. Establishment of an Educational management and Information System (EMIS) Training of 'unqualified and untrained teachers' (UUTs) in the education system Establishment of School Management Committees in primary schools Consultancy services to establish indicators on Vocational Skills Training (VST) Outreach and sensitisation</p>	<p>Effective and efficient quality service delivery of education at all levels</p>	<p>Availability of financial management skills at MEST</p>
<p><b>Component 3:</b> Project Management</p>	<p>Management of Project was by Project Coordination Unit</p>	<p>The management structure of the PCU impacted positively on MEST and the project implementers including the Service Providers and the contractors for civil works.</p>	<p>Effective and efficient quality management and delivery of the Education III project</p>	<p>Quality of progress reports increased Project costs within limits</p>
<p><b>LOGICAL FRAMEWORK DIMENSIONS</b></p>		<p><b>ASSESSMENT</b></p>		<p><b>WORKING SCORE</b></p>
<p><b>LOGICAL</b></p>	<p>a) Presents a logical causal chain for achieving project development objectives.</p>	<p>The framework clearly identified the activities to be undertaken and linked them to expected outputs and outcomes in reasonable and logical manner with regards to the achievement of project objectives</p>		<p>4</p>
<p><b>MEASURABLE</b></p>	<p>b) Expresses objectives and outcomes in a way that is measurable and quantifiable.</p>	<p>Objectives regarding project outputs were expressed in a way that was measurable and quantifiable but there were challenges with the setting up of EMIS</p>		<p>2</p>
<p><b>THOROUGH</b></p>	<p>c) States the risks and key assumptions.</p>	<p>These were well enumerated in the framework and helped in devising strategies utilized during implementation. However, mitigation measures were not effective leading to implementation delays.</p>		<p>3</p>


## D. OUTPUTS AND OUTCOMES

### I. OUTPUTS OR RESULTS ACHIEVED

In the table below, assess the achievement of actual vs. expected outputs for each major activity, based on the logical framework in Section C. Score the extent to which the expected outputs were achieved. Calculate the weighted scores as an approximate proportion of project activity costs. The overall weighted score will be auto-calculated as the average of weighted working scores. Override the auto-calculated score, if desired, and provide justification.

KEY ACTIVITIES		Working Score	Proportion of Project Costs in percentage (as mentioned in the appraisal report)	Weighted Score (auto-calculated)
Expected Outputs	Actual Outputs			
<p><b>COMPONENT 1:</b> Rehabilitation of Basic Education, Vocational Skills Training and Literacy Programmes-Partnership Programme Rehabilitation/reconstruction of 185 primary schools, 30 JSS and 40 Community Education Centres (CECs) and Vocational Training Centres (VTCs), 138 Teachers' housing. Furniture tools, and equipment supplied. Textbooks and teaching and learning materials supplied</p>	<p>Rehabilitation/construction of 98 primary schools, 54 JSS, 8 VTCs' and 12 teachers' housing (duplex) completed with VIP latrines and boreholes . Furniture supplied to primary schools and JSS. Tools and equipment for various trades including carpentry, masonry, plumbing, motor-bike mechanics, tailoring, hairdressing, catering and office equipment supplied to VTCs.</p>	3	83.4	2.502
<p><b>COMPONENT 2:</b> Provision of in-service primary teacher training for unqualified and untrained teachers, Training of MEST personnel, Establishment and strengthening of 160 School Management Committees (SMCs), School Maintenance Programme, Outreach and Sensitisation</p>	<p>Finance and Procurement Management Unit were set up and trained staff of MEST in procurement  170 SMCs established</p>	3	13.4	0.402

<b>COMPONENT</b> Project Management by PCU	<b>3:</b> PCU able to undertake procurement and financial management of project, technical reviews of sub-projects and monitor and supervise project activities	3	3.2	0.096
<b>OVERALL OUTPUT SCORE</b> [corresponds to the sum of weighted scores]				3

 Check here to override the calculated score


<b>Provide justification for overriding the auto-calculated score</b>	
<b>Insert the new score or re-enter the auto-calculated score</b>	

## II. OUTCOMES OR RESULTS ACHIEVED

<p>1. Using available monitoring data, assess the achievement of expected outcomes. Import the expected outcomes from the logical framework presented in Section C. Score the extent to which expected outcomes were achieved. The overall outcome score will be auto-calculated as an average of the working scores. Override the auto-calculated score, if desired, and provide justification.</p>		
OUTCOMES		Working Score
Expected	Actual	
<p><b>Component 1:</b></p> <p>Improvement of education quality;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Expanded enrolments of school aged girls and boys;</li> <li>- School learning environment meeting quality minimum of standards;</li> <li>- 1 pupil: 1 core textbook provision and use;</li> <li>- 50 per cent of school going girls and boys achieve national minimum learning standards;</li> <li>- Employability/self-reliability of 50 per cent of these achievers</li> </ul>	<p>By 2010, Sierra Leone has taken a number of policy formulations in support for improvement of education quality. These include Education Act (2004); White Paper that subsequently informed National Education Policy (both 2010); National policies for Technical and Vocational Education and Training and Teacher Training and Development also of 2010.</p> <p>Consequently, with an enabling policy environment, the project has contributed towards enrolment of an estimated 1.5 million girls and boys at primary level (based on 2004 census; and 1.3 million estimation from the school census of 2006/7)) and 850,000</p>	3

	<p>potential students for Junior and Senior Secondary Schools, as well as VTCs, with the newly rehabilitated/constructed facilities (constructing 91 primary schools and rehabilitating 7. As regards to the JSS, 47 were constructed and 7 were rehabilitated. In addition, 25 administration buildings, 12 staff houses, 7 VSTCs were constructed and 1 VSTC was rehabilitated) and provision of teaching and learning materials (about 4.7 million textbooks were supplied, exceeding the intended 1 pupil: 1 core set of textbooks and ensuring supply of every school aged child at primary level, to include even those in the private sector) and equipment.</p> <p>The project had yet to ascertain the impact on overall learning achievement with standardized test scores through the national examination results.</p> <p>In the originally conceptualization of the project, ILO would have supported the tracking/follow-up of VTC graduates into the world of work, linking with prospective employers (private and public). By the completion of the project, this had not taken place and efforts to meet with the relevant office were not fulfilled.</p>	
<p><b>Component 2:</b></p> <p>Effective and efficient quality service delivery of education at all levels</p>	<p>The commitment to provide free compulsory primary and junior secondary education to every Sierra Leone girl and boy of school age entails having a robust human resource to deliver these services. The project has contributed towards teachers' professional development by providing to 4,050 teachers (3,507 primary and 543 JSS) in ADB districts. Another 3,947 received training using IDA resources. 210 School Management Committees (SMCs) were trained in ADB districts with 75% of them receiving mobilisation grants. A study on income generating skills recommended information and indicators on Vocational Skills Training (VST) to be linked to the EMIS. Curriculum and modules for skills in agriculture, construction, catering, carpentry,</p>	<p>3</p>

	<p>hairdressing, motor-bike mechanics, plumbing and tailoring have been validated awaiting publication. MEST personnel trained in procurement and financial management, budget formulation and audit. Establishment and operation of EMIS within the Planning Directorate. Latest school census completed in November 2010, pre-editing and data entry in progress.</p> <p>The teacher-pupil ratio (primary education) is about 50:1. The proposed baseline set for this ratio was from 55 pupils for 1 teacher, reduced to 30 for primary and JSS; which was an ambitious target given the post-rebel era.</p>	
<p><b>Component 3</b></p> <p>Effective and efficient quality management and delivery of the Education III project</p>	<p>Management was by a PCU made of 5 technical staff and 4 financial and procurement staff. Project management was assisted by a Financial Management and Procurement Unit within the MEST. Three (3) staff including the Project Director, National Technical Coordinator and Partnership program Coordinator were financed by IDA and Capacity Building Co-ordinator and Vocational and Skills Development Specialist were financed by ADF.</p>	4
<p><b>OVERALL OUTCOME SCORE</b> [Calculated as the average of working scores]</p>		3

 Check here to override the calculated score

**Provide justification for over-riding the auto-calculated score**

**Insert the new score or re-enter the auto calculated score**

**2. Other outcomes:** Discuss additional outcomes not planned in the logical framework, and which mostly concern cross-cutting issues (gender, for example). Discuss

The project appraisal document did not make concerted effort and focus on gender. Based on the availed document there is lack of sex disaggregated data to monitor progress in terms of access of the girl and boy child, as well as track the participation of women in the sector from the school level to the top managerial position. Nonetheless, MEST did make effort to support girls at JSS level emanating from poor households with fees and uniform requirements. The project also employed a female manager as the project coordinator and initiatives were taken to get on board female WMAS and contractors. As for the environment component, individual SPs were responsible to addressing environmental issues within their project sites. Such that for Concern (international NGO) school design facilities took into account the typology of the locations and included railing and pathways. Furthermore, to facilitate access for the children to schools, Concern also constructed local bridges and feeder paths from the community to schools.

**3. Risks to sustained achievement of outcomes. State the factors that affect, or could affect, the long-run or sustained achievement of project outcomes. Indicate any new action or institutional change recommended to help sustain outcomes. The analysis should draw on the sensitivity analysis in Annex 3 if relevant.**

The project's targets included primary schools and JSS attaining Basic Operational Level (BOL) meaning each school having at least 50% of primary school teachers trained, schools with more than 150 students having a principal and every classroom being equipped with a basic set of teaching aids. The project was meant to provide the basic facilities and human capacity to operate the education system in a country fresh from war. With growing political, social and economic stability, there is a need to further strengthen the education infrastructure and keep pace with the growing population (estimated at 1.8 per cent (2004 Census)) and ensure equitable access and learning opportunities to all school aged girls and boys, as well as young people for skills development and training. Moreover, there is also a shortage of adequate and qualified capacity starting from the center, down to the school level. These include teachers, school managers and with the recent decentralization thrust, more capacity is needed at the local governance to undertake education development in those areas. The sector has no gender policy and strategy, to ensure that gender issues and concerns are addressed.

While the achievement of outcomes for quality education improvement is apparent through infrastructure support, including education management efficiency through capacity building strategies and project management; these can be affected if resourcing (human and financial) is unpredictable and not forthcoming to sustain gains.

In this regard, the system is vulnerable to poor quality of teaching and instruction. Likewise, some of the infrastructures such as primary schools and the 8 Vocational and Skills Training Centres are still not functional because there is either no management or no furniture, tools and equipment. The maintenance of the school buildings could be compromised because the preventive maintenance plans, toolboxes for all rehabilitated schools and artisan toolkits were not provided. Government should take steps to involve the local councils in the maintenance of the buildings to prevent their degradation.

UNICEF is supporting MEST by developing a comprehensive education sector capacity assessment. The results of this work should facilitate the Government in having a strategic plan for resourcing the sector at the different levels given what is available and what is needed to make the system functional. The assessment also links with the gap in managing the information system of the sector and inadequate teacher training development. These are now being addressed through hiring of human capacity as well as development of a teacher training policy, plan and strategy, which started in 2010.

## **E. PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS FOR IMPLEMENTATION**

**1. State the extent to which the Bank and the Borrower ensure that the project is commensurate with the Borrower's capacity to implement it by designing it appropriately and by putting in place the necessary implementation arrangements. Consider all major design aspects, such as: extent to which lessons learned from previous policy-based lending operations in the country were taken into account (please cite key PCRs); the extent to which the project was informed by robust analytical work (please cite key documents), how well**

**the Bank and Borrower assessed the capacity of the implementing agencies, - scope of consultations and partnerships, economic rationale for the project, and - provisions made for technical assistance**

**[250 words maximum. Any additional narrative about implementation should be included in Annex 6 entitled: Project Description]**

The project was an emergency response intervention jointly prepared and co-financed with the World Bank to contribute to structural readjustments in the Education sector as part of national reconstruction efforts at the end of the war. The project design was informed by the poverty alleviation dimension of the country's strategy for national reconstruction as well as the government's Draft Interim Poverty Reduction Strategy (I-PRSP) both in the transition phase through 2002 and also for the medium term from 2003-2005. The project design was also consistent with the government's National Education Master Plan (NEMP) 1997-2006 and its commitment to Education For All (EFA) by 2015 and fully in line with the Bank's Country Strategy Paper for 2002-2004. In the appraisal report, the Service Provider concept for project implementation which articulated and synthesized the identification of education sector problems at the grassroots through international and national NGOs in close collaboration with district education offices, chiefdoms and district councils was innovative and provided the right channels of communication between the communities and the Project Co-ordinating Unit (PCU). This approach ensured that the proposals sent to the PCU for implementation through the Service Providers were 'home-grown,' relevant and consistent with the various district education plans and also enhanced community ownership. The far-reaching impact of the institutional strengthening facet of the project design is exemplified by the fact that the Financial and Procurement Management Agent procured by IDA to support the PCU in finance and procurement also trained staff and assisted in establishing a Finance and Procurement Management Unit (FPMU) within the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MEST).

Despite these good intentions, the reality check on the ground indicated a need for further ensuring that capacity is sustained due the weak nature inherited as a result of the rebel war. This did create unpredictability on the both fronts, the government as well as the project, in sustaining available talent.

**2. For each dimension of project design and readiness for implementation, provide a brief assessment (up to two sentences). Insert a working score, using the scoring scale provided in Appendix 1.**

PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS FOR IMPLEMENTATION DIMENSIONS		ASSESSMENT	WORKING SCORE
<b>REALISM</b>	a) Owing to its complexity, the project is underpinned by an analysis of the country's capacity and political commitment	The Government of Sierra Leone's general policy direction in the education sector in 2002 was guided by the Interim Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (I-PRSP) of June 2001 and the National Education Master Plan (NEMP) 1997-2006 which focused on increased enrolment, retention rates and quality of basic education. The context of a post war reconstruction era required an emergency response from both Government and the donor community. Consequently, the onus of project implementation fell on NGOs which were already established and familiar with the terrain in the districts as a result of humanitarian work executed during the war. Government institutions at the time, were weak and could not have effectively responded to the challenges	4

<b>RISK ASSESSMENT</b>	b) Project design includes adequate risk analysis and mitigation measures analyses.	Given the context of the timing of the project, risk analysis and mitigation measures were a bit less predictable because of the uncertainties relating to stability and low capacity in governmental and non-governmental institutions.	3
------------------------	---	--	---

<b>USE OF COUNTRY SYSTEMS</b>	c) Financial management, procurement, monitoring and/or other systems are based on those already in use by government and/or other partners.	The project was co-financed by ADF and IDA and was managed and monitored by staff of the Project Co-ordination Unit and implementation partners. The financial management, procurement and monitoring systems of the financing partners were applied during project implementation. This parallel use of the structures was thought feasible at the time of the project implementation, given the fact that there were no systems in place.	3
-------------------------------	--	---	---

<b>For the following dimensions, provide separate working scores for Bank performance and Borrower performance:</b>			<b>WORKING SCORE</b>	
			<b>Bank</b>	<b>Borrower</b>

<b>CLARITY</b>	d) Responsibilities for project implementation were clearly defined	The appraisal report prescribed the use of Service Providers who were either international or national NGOs already present in the districts for project formulation and execution so as to ensure ownership of the projects by the various communities. Construction management consulting firms known as Works Management Agents (WMAs) and Supervising Agents (SA) were all part of the project delivery chain. The Project Coordination Unit (PCU) was to manage the partnership mechanisms by which service providers were to submit school grant proposals for Project Steering Committee approval.	3	3
----------------	---	---	---	---

<b>PROCUREMENT READINESS</b>	e) The documents needed for implementation (document on specifications, design, procurement, etc.) are ready at appraisal.	The Programme Operations Manual (POM) provided detailed guidelines for all parties involved in the implementation of the project. It described the project structure, operational/implementation guidelines as well as available inputs and resources to implement the project successfully. It also prescribed detailed financial, accounting and procurement procedures.	3	3
------------------------------	--	--	---	---

<b>MONITORING READINESS</b>	f) Monitoring indicators and plans are adopted	The supervision and review processes included a thorough assessment of the project's achievements against targets set in the project log frame matrix, implementation schedule and project detailed costs. A joint mid-term review of the	3	3
-----------------------------	--	---	---	---

		project was carried out in 2005 by ADF, IDA and MEST. Joint supervision missions were also fielded during project implementation. The Programme Operations Manual (POM) designed for the Education III project described all necessary procedures for implementation including financial management, procurement, disbursement and supervisory and reporting responsibilities. In addition, the joint donor reviews, the Project Steering Committee and the District Education Offices also contributed to project monitoring.		
<b>BASELINE DATA</b>	g) Collection of baseline data is completed or is underway	A baseline survey was conducted in collaboration with all stakeholders in 2001-2. The report was however not available for referencing and analysis during the PCR mission	2	2

## F. IMPLEMENTATION

**1. State the major characteristics of project implementation with reference to: adherence to schedule, quality of constructions and other works, performance of consultants, effectiveness of Bank supervision, and effectiveness of Borrower oversight. Determine to what extent the Bank and the Borrower ensured adherence to safeguard measures.**

**[300 words maximum. [Any additional narrative about implementation should be included in Annex 5: Project Description]**

The project had a strong partnership background based on existing partnerships between MEST and other education stakeholders mainly non-governmental organisations (NGOs) and Community Based Organisations (CBOs) for delivery of services instead of using a centrally managed approach. The project became effective in August 2003 followed by first disbursement in December 2003. By the joint mid-term review in November/December 2005 project implementation was estimated at 8%. The slow rate of implementation was due to i) the procurement procedures which did not conform to the emergency response context of the project; ii) lack of capacity of Service Providers (SPs), Work Management Agents (WMAs) and civil works contractors leading to difficulty in understanding the Bank's procurement and financial procedures; iii) the intricacies involved in the preparation of valuations for work done and preparation of certificates for payment leading to the phasing out of Supervising Agents (SAs); iv) difficult access to sites in remote areas compounded by a six-month rainy season, and v) delays in the provision of counterpart funds by Government. In 2005, number of primary schools, JSS schools, teachers' houses and VSTCs to be constructed was further scaled down to fit into the budget. This included omitting the functional literacy components through Community Education Centers (CECs) and Strategic Planning for the Sector. Both activities would have better contributed towards the project's overall outcomes given the capacity issues for the sector and nation as a whole. The high inflation rate had also caused price increases of construction materials and other project inputs. Initially contractors were overstretched with one contractor handling as many as 8 sites. In 2006-7, class 3 contractors were phased out and only class 1 and class 2 contractors were allowed to bid leading to higher contract sums.

Despite all these obstacles, the project succeeded in constructing 91 primary schools and rehabilitating 7. As regards to the JSS, 47 were constructed and 7 were rehabilitated. In addition, 25 administration buildings, 12 staff houses, 7 VSTCs were constructed and 1 VSTC was rehabilitated. About 4.7 million textbooks were supplied and some 4,000 teachers were trained by ADF. Bank supervision averaged 1.5 a year over a period of 7 years. A Financial and Procurement Management Agent (FPMA) was contracted to provide 2 specialists in finance and procurement to strengthen capacities of MEST in procurement and financial control. Three senior staff of MEST were trained in procurement but were later transferred to other ministries. The project closing date was originally 31 December 2007, but this was changed on three occasions and the final closing date was 30 September 2010.

**2. Comment on the role of other partners (donors, NGOs, enterprises, etc.). Assess the effectiveness of co-financing arrangements and of donor coordination, if applicable.**

The World Bank was the only donor partner and provided a grant of US\$ 20 million under a parallel financing arrangement for project execution in 7 of the 14 districts. There were a number of joint supervision missions including the mid-term review. The NGOs and Community Based Organisations were the Service Providers for project implementation and charged a management fee of 10% for their services.

**3. Harmonization. State whether the Bank made explicit efforts to harmonize instruments, systems and/or approaches with other partners.**

The Project Operations Manual (POM) constituted the only medium for harmonisation of systems. It prescribed detailed operational and implementation guidelines for all parties involved in project implementation.

4. For each dimension of project implementation, assess the extent to which the following criteria were met. Provide a brief assessment (up to two sentences) and insert a working score, using the scoring scale provided in Appendix 1.

PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION DIMENSIONS		ASSESSMENT		WORKING SCORE
<b>TIMELINESS</b>	a) Extent of adherence to the original closing date. If the number on the right is: below 12, 4 is scored; between 12.1 and 24, 3 is scored; between 24.1 and 36, 2 is scored; above 36.1, 1 is scored.	Difference in months between original closing date and effective closing date or date of completion of 98% of disbursement	The project closing date was extended thrice to June 2009, June 2010 and finally, September 2010.	2
		33 months		
<b>BANK PERFORMANCE</b>	b) Bank enforced:			
	Environmental Safeguards	The project was classified as a category 2 project in the appraisal report with little impact on the environment.		3
	Fiduciary Requirements	Audit reports for the years 2004, 2005, 2006, 2007, 2008 and 2009 have been submitted. The audit report for 2010 is expected to be submitted to the Bank by March 31 <sup>st</sup> , 2011.		3
	Agreement reached in the context of the project	The Bank accepted to lend support to Government's efforts by partially financing the 'Rehabilitation of the Basic Education..' project with the World Bank. The Bank met fully the terms and conditions of the loan agreement.		3
	c) The Bank provided quality supervision in terms of skills mix and practicality of solutions	The Bank supervision missions averaged 1.5 a year but the skills mix was inadequate. Moreover, the high staff turnover of Bank staff (Task Managers) affected the smooth running of the project. In addition, the logical framework (indicators and targets) was never revised after the mid-term review of Nov/Dec 2005.		3
d) Bank provided quality management oversight	Adequate responses to various problems and challenges were provided by management at headquarters during project implementation.		3	
<b>BORROWER PERFORMANCE</b>	Environmental Safeguards	The project had a limited environmental impact.		3
	Fiduciary Requirements	Government faced challenges with respect to making available counterpart funding. Government contributions amounted to		3

		about 55% of sum budgeted. The expenditure was mainly on operating costs and civil works. All audit reports from 2004 to 2009 were submitted. The audit report for 2010 is expected by the end of March 2011.	
	Agreement reached under the project	The Borrower's contribution to the project amounting to about 14% of local costs was earmarked for construction and operating costs	3
	f) Borrower was responsive to Bank supervision findings and recommendations	The Borrower was responsive to the recommendations and findings the supervision missions made.	3
	g) Borrower collected and used monitoring information for decision making	Data was collected by the Project Coordination Unit (PCU) in collaboration with Service Providers (SPs) and closely monitored on the output indicators; civil works, in-service teacher training, textbook distribution, School Management Committee training and capacity building activities.	3

## G. COMPLETION

1. Was the PCR delivered on a timely basis, in compliance with Bank policy?			
Date 98% disbursement attained (or closing date, if applicable)	Date PCR sent to pcr@afdb.org	Difference in months	WORKING SCORE (Auto-calculated) Si l'écart est égale ou inférieur à 6 mois, la note est de 4. Si l'écart est supérieur à 6 mois, la note est de 1. If the difference is 6 months or less, a 4 is scored. If the difference is more than 6 months, the score is 1.
NA	17/02/2011		

**Briefly describe the PCR Process. Describe the Borrower's and co-financers' involvement in producing the document. Highlight any major differences of opinion concerning the assessments made in this PCR. Describe the team composition and confirm whether a site visit was undertaken. Mention any major collaboration with other development partners. State the extent of field office involvement in producing the report. Indicate whether comments from Peer Reviewers were received on time (provide names and positions of Peer Reviewers).[150 words maximum]**

i) The PCR team was composed of an education specialist (team leader), a consultant architect and the Project Coordination Unit (PCU) of the Ministry of Education Science and Technology (MEST). The team visited a total of 23 project sites in all the 7 ADF project districts and held discussions with the 2 Deputy Ministers, the Permanent Secretary, the Chief Education Officer, the Deputy Director of Planning and the Education Sector Plan Coordinator in MEST, the Finance and Development Secretaries in the Ministry of Finance and Economic Development (MFED). The mission also held consultations with the Education Partners Group represented by UNICEF District Education Officers as well as Service Providers and Work Management Agents.

## H. LESSONS LEARNED FROM THE ASSESSMENT

- i) The Bank's support to an emergency situation in a post war recovery era should have taken the form of a grant and not a loan since state institutions were weak and income generation and revenue collection at the time of the Bank's intervention was minimal. The weak finances of the state were evidenced by the fact that it was difficult on the part of the GoSL to make available regularly of counterpart funds expected during project implementation.
- ii) To prevent delays in project implementation, the Bank's Rules and Procedures for procurement of goods and works should have been customized to conform to the emergency response and post-war recovery context of the project. Contractors for civil works could have been recruited more rapidly by the Service Providers (SPs) through National Shopping if the ADF ceiling for National Shopping had been at a more appropriate level. Procurement of civil works contractors using National Competitive Bidding procedures was slow and cumbersome because of the low capacity of the SPs.
- iii) One of the major challenges revealed at the onset of project implementation was the low capacity of the Service Providers. A capacity assessment of these stakeholders should therefore have been carried out before project implementation. Such a study would have revealed the low capacity of the Service Providers and the project should have included capacity building activities that would enhance and strengthen the implementers during the duration of the project cycle for a smooth project implementation and exiting.
- iv) The project design was complex in regards to management and implementation structures (Project Coordination Unit (PCU), Service Providers (SP), Contractors, Works Management Agents (WMAs) and Supervising Agents (SAs), including clarity of the roles of these, which led to a certain level of confusion among stakeholders. As a post-Mid Term implementation of the recommendations, revisions were led to the management/implementation structures with the PCU taking lead as the coordinator and phasing out of the SAs as a middle level structure.
- v) For effective supervision of civil works, the project districts should have been grouped into 3 zones based on proximity and a resident engineer appointed for each zone.
- vi) The project matrix and hence log-frame were not reviewed after the MTR. Hence, linkages to outcomes and impact to the education sector should have been better articulated as to what was initially drafted. The fact that there is no functioning EMIS makes it even more challenging to quantify the Bank's contribution for human development in Sierra Leone.
- vii) The project had protracted implementation challenges leading to a number of extensions. The PCR team was told (and this was also confirmed by those present in the FO) that the initial project cycle dates differed between the two Banks (World Bank and ADB) in their documentation as it was a joint project. And hence, when the ADB sought to make an amendment of the dates, the ADB system (SAP) treated it as an extension. No record regarding this issue has been found, but it is worth noting for re-occurrence in future projects.

## I. PROJECT RATINGS SUMMARY

All working scores are auto-generated by the computer from the relevant section in the PCR

CRITERIA	SUB-CRITERIA	WORKING SCORE
	Achievement of outputs	3
	Achievement of outcomes	3
	Timeliness	2
	<b>OVERALL OUTCOME SCORE</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>BANK PERFORMANCE</b>	Project objectives are relevant to country development objectives	4
	Project objects are achievable with project inputs and in the expected time frame	3
	Project objectives are consistent with the Bank's country or regional strategy	4
	Project objectives are consistent with the Bank's general priorities	4
	The logical framework presents a logical causal chain for achieving project objectives	2
	The Objectives and outcomes, as presented in the logical framework, are measurable and quantifiable	2
	The logical framework states key risks and assumptions	3
	The country's capacity and political commitment are commensurate with the complexity of the project	4
	Project design includes adequate risk analysis	3
	Financial management, monitoring and/or other systems are based on those already in use by government and/or other partners.	3
	Responsibilities for project implementation are clearly defined	3
	Documents needed for implementation (specifications, design, procurement documents, etc.) are ready at appraisal	3
	Monitoring indicators and monitoring plans have been adopted	3
	Collection of baseline data is completed or underway	2
	<b>DESIGN AND READINESS SUB-SCORE</b>	<b>3</b>
	<b>Supervision:</b>	
	Bank enforced:	
	Environmental Safeguards	3
	Fiduciary Requirements	3
Agreements concluded under the project	3	
Bank provided quality supervision in the form of skills mix and practicality of solutions	3	
Bank provided quality management oversight	3	
The PCR was delivered on a timely basis		
<b>SUPERVISION SUB-SCORE</b>	<b>3</b>	
<b>OVERALL BANK PERFORMANCE SCORE</b>	<b>3</b>	

<b>BORROWER PERFORMANCE</b>	Responsibilities for project implementation are clearly defined	3
	Documents needed for implementation (specifications, design, procurement documents, etc.) are ready at appraisal	3
	Monitoring indicators and monitoring plan have been approved; baseline data collection has been completed or is underway	3
	<b>PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS SCORE</b>	<b>3</b>
	<b>Implementation</b>	
	Borrower complied with:	
	Environmental Safeguards	3
	Fiduciary Requirements	3
	Agreements reached under the project	3
	Borrower was responsive to Bank supervision findings and recommendations	3
	Borrower used monitoring information for decision-making	3
	<b>IMPLEMENTATION SUB-SCORE</b>	<b>3</b>
	<b>OVERALL BORROWER PERFORMANCE SCORE</b>	<b>3</b>

## J. PROCESSING

STEP	SIGNATURE AND COMMENTS	DATE
Sector Manager Clearance	Dr. B. SAVADOGO	11 January 2011
Regional Director Clearance	Mr. F. J. M. PERRAULT	7 February 2011
Sectoral Director Approval	Dr. A. SOUCAT	3 February 2011

## Annex 1

### Bank Inputs

Mission Type	Date	No. of Persons	Composition
Appraisal	February 2002	3	Education Analyst 2 UNESCO Consultants
Follow-up	June 2002	2	Socio-economist Architect
Supervision	27 October-8 November 2003	2	Education Analysts
Supervision	8-19 July 2004	2	Infrastructure Specialist Education Analyst
Supervision	27 October-15 November 2004	2	Infrastructure Specialist Education Analyst
Joint Mid-Term Review	24 November-10 December 2005	3	Education Analyst Socio-economist Procurement Specialist IDA Team
Supervision	1-12 October 2006	1	Education Analyst
Supervision	8-22 May 2006	1	Education Analyst
Supervision	6-16 May 2008	2	Education Analyst Infrastructure Specialist
Joint Supervision	20-31 October 2008	2	Education Analyst IDA Team Leader
Supervision	16-30 March 2009	2	Education Analyst Social Sector Specialist
Supervision (SLFO)	23 November-10 December 2009	3	Country Program Officer Social Sector Specialist Infrastructure Specialist
Supervision	14-17 April 2010 02-05 May 2010	4	Education Analyst Social Sector Specialist Country Program Officer Infrastructure Specialist
Supervision	15-25 September 2010	2	Education Analyst Social Sector Specialist
PCR Mission	06-17 December 2010	2	Education Analyst Consultant Architect

## Annex 2

### FINANCIAL TABLES

#### Sources of Finance

##### Sources of Finance (UA millions)

Source	Foreign	Local	Total Costs	% of Total
ADF	5.04	9.96	15.00	42.9%
GoSL		1.50	1.50	4.3%
TAF	1.00	-	1.00	2.9%
GoSL	-	0.05	0.05	0.1%
WB	9.05	8.31	17.36	49.7%
GoSL	-	0.03	0.03	0.1%
Total	15.09	19.85	34.94	100%
%Total	42.0%	58.0%	100.0%	

##### Project Cost by Component and Source of Finance (UA millions)

PROJECT COMPONENTS	ADF	TAF	WB	GoSL	TOTAL	% of Total Costs
I. Rehab of School system	13.35	-	13.80	1.19	28.34	81.1%
II. Institutional Support	1.14	1.00	2.50	-	4.64	13.3%
III. Project Management	0.51	-	1.06	0.39	1.96	5.6%
Total	15.00	1.00	17.36	1.58	34.94	100%
% Total	42.94%	2.86%	49.68%	4.52%	100%	

##### Actual Disbursement of Loan per Year in UA

Years since Approval	Amount Disbursed (UA) Loan	Cumulative disbursement	Cumulative as % of total (UA 15 million)
2003	577,309.88	577,309.88	3.84%
2004	-	577,308.88	3.84%
2005	635,356.95	1,212,666.83	8.08%
2006	737,077.30	1,949,744.13	13.00%
2007	828,222.07	2,777,966.20	18.52%

2008	5,654,062.67	8,432,028.87	56.21%
2009	2,335,701.18	10,767,730.05	71.78%
2010	3,703,077.41	14,470,807.46	96.47%

## **Annex 3**

### List of Supporting Documents

1. Project Appraisal Report
2. Quarterly Progress Reports
3. Audit Reports
4. ADB-Project Files and Records
5. National Education Policy 2010, MEYS, GoSL
6. Design and Development of a Comprehensive Education Sector Capacity Development Strategy (Draft), commissioned by UNICEF Sierra Leone, undertaken by Education for Change (Ltd) (2010)
7. World Bank Implementation Completion Report of the project (May, 2010)
8. Comprehensive Stakeholders' Workshop Report, May 2010.

## Annex 4

### Additional Information on Education III Project

#### 1. PROJECT BACKGROUND

The eleven year civil war in Sierra Leone ended in 2001 leaving behind massive destruction in virtually all regions of the country. The education sector was deemed to have had considerable infrastructural damage. The provision of education services in rural and underserved areas was considered a priority in the Transitional Support Strategy (TSS) for 2002-3 prepared by the World Bank and the ADB's appraisal report prepared in 2002. A National School Survey was conducted in 2001 to determine the status of education and the results reflected the daunting challenges facing the sector. The school aged population was estimated at 1,000,000, yet 30 per cent of these were unable to access JSS, and for those who did, 30 per cent of them did not reach Senior Secondary School (SSS) level of education; also only 10 per cent of those at SSS level of education were able to access tertiary education;

- Capacity at all levels of the education system was weak in order to effectively and efficiently deliver quality education services; they also lacked essential working tools;
- Education infrastructure was affected in all districts, but with varying degrees;
- 70 per cent of these structures (classrooms, administrative blocks, workshops and laboratories) and furniture were destroyed;
- Most teachers had fled the country or were displaced;
- 42 per cent of primary school teachers were unqualified;
- 30 per cent of Junior Secondary School teachers were untrained and unqualified;
- Pupil/textbook ratio was assessed at 5:1 in grade 1; for science textbooks in other grades the ratio recorded at 8:1

Within this context, the country lacked adequate resources in order to implement previously planned priorities for the sector due to the war and debt servicing burden. Hence, both the acquired ADF loan and grant complemented national efforts and commitments as proposed through the NEMP of 1997 - 2006, EFA by 2015, Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) on education and Bank's Country Strategy Paper for 2002 - 2004. While the loan revamped dilapidated education infrastructures through reconstruction/rehabilitation of schools, technical/vocational education training centers, provision of in-service teacher training, supply of teaching and learning materials as well as redeployment incentives for teachers through teachers' housing; the grant supported the area of capacity development and technical assistance. The project was jointly prepared with the World Bank and DfID, although the latter withdrew its commitment due to change of aid financing modality for the sector from direct to budgetary support.

#### 2. PROJECT OUTPUTS AND OUTCOMES

*Component I: Rehabilitation of Basic Education, Vocational Skills Training and Literacy: Partnership Programme*

2.1 The project design prescribed the partnership approach between the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MEST) by then and other education stakeholders, for delivery of services which included full and partial education package support to primary and junior secondary schools.

Full education package support consisted of construction/rehabilitation of school infrastructure, provision of furniture, supply of a set of core subject textbooks (mathematics, english, science and social studies) for each pupil, in-service training of teachers and training of School Management Committees (SMCs). Partial education package excluded construction/rehabilitation and furniture items.

Rehabilitation of Basic Education, VST Training and Literacy

Progress Achieved:

2.2 Under this activity 560 (460 primary and 100 Junior Secondary Schools (JSS)) schools and 40 Community Education Centers (CECs) and VTCs were to be rehabilitated or newly constructed. Of this total, 185 primary schools, 30 JSS and the 40 CECs and VTCs were to be supported by ADF resources, while the IDA funds were to support construction works in 250 primary and 50 JSS schools. Government resources were to assist 25 primary and 20 JSS schools. Due to the increased costs and price hike of construction materials, as well as weak capacity of contractors to adhere to procurement and disbursement procedures for the works being tendered, the initial project construction items were revised. The items for implementation using ADF resources were amended to be 98 primary schools and 54 JSS, 8 VTCs and 12 duplex teachers' housing. As noted, support for CECs, though a critical element for literacy skills building, had to be eliminated and therefore does not feature as part of the project implementation. See table 2 below.

Table 2: School buildings and facilities supported by ADF funds

No. and type of building	At Appraisal	Revised by Ministry	Actual	Output
Primary Schools	185	98	98	-87
JSS Schools	40	54	54	+14
CECs and VTCs	40	8	8	-32
Teachers' Housing	113	-	12	-101

Design, quality and effectiveness of project execution (Component 1)

2.3 Initially, Service Providers (SPs), Work Management Agents (WMAs) and Supervising Agents (SAs) were in charge of project execution. Implementation was slow because the capacity of the SPs was weak and some of the SPs signed contracts for several sites but did not have the logistics to effectively run those sites. In addition, the SAs had to certify work done before payment could be effected leading to delays. At project MTR, the PCU was assigned the task of re-assessing the 13 SPs and 3 WMAs. After the exercise, the scope of civil works for each SP which averaged 12 per contract, was reduced to 6 to ensure that the SPs were not overburdened. Some of the SPs which did not qualify for additional civil works allocations because of lack of capacity were asked to continue with the soft components such as training and supply of furniture and textbooks. The existing WMAs took over more civil works from SPs to speed up project implementation. The transition from SPs to WMAs for civil works execution took several months because approval procedures were delayed. Other causes of the delays in civil works execution was the lack of understanding of

the Bank's procurement rules and procedures leading to the re-launching of several tenders. Several contracts of employment were terminated (some twice) and the tendering process re-launched. The SPs were paid a management fee of 10% on their contracts.

#### Provision of In-services primary teacher training

2.4 This activity was designed to cater for the provision of capacity development of unqualified and untrained teachers who need to man the project schools. Initial thinking around this activity was to accelerate the upgrading of the skills and competencies of the available teachers on the ground to use quality teaching and learning methodologies. This would have eased accreditation and qualifications of these teachers within the education system.

Progress achieved. Under the ADF project, 4,050 (3,507 for primary level and 543 for JSS) teachers were trained and teachers manuals were made available.

UNICEF has been instrumental in assessing the impact of the activity for overall teaching and learning. A study was commissioned by the organization and the results demonstrated that teachers found the materials developed for their capacity building were relevant and effective in their day to day interaction in the classrooms. A follow-up of this included MEST under the Education Sector Plan (ESP) to replicate the initiative and develop a National Teachers' Professional Development Strategy.

#### Provision of textbooks, teaching and learning materials at Basic Education level

2.5 Under this activity 1,200,000 textbooks and teaching and learning materials (TLMs) were to be provided to primary and JSS schools, and VTCs.

#### Progress achieved:

To date about 4.7 million textbooks, comprising of 1,200,000 sets for primary schools and 230,000 sets for JSS schools, were procured under the project in three phases at a total cost of UA 3.25 million. The distribution of the books is also complete. The target of one set of books for each student at the project school has not only been reached, but all primary school students throughout the country have now one set of books each. This provision includes even private schools. Stakeholders mentioned the effort of the PCU in putting a well-documented system for the distribution and recommend that it is used for replication under the ESP implementation.

#### Component II: Institutional Strengthening of Capacity Building and Outreach

2.6 This project component was designed to address the structural and institutional challenges that the sector was facing during the post-war era. Since the project rationale placed poverty reduction at the center, education was identified as an immediate means and tools through which this can be implemented. To this effect, at both levels, policy and local, capacity was needed to effectively implement, manage and monitor the delivery of services for the education sector as well as the project activities. Henceforth, capacity building activities were aimed at strengthening MEST personnel in carrying out strategic planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the sector. This included the development of a management information system (EMIS); training of teachers for quality skills and competencies; empowering of school communities through organizing them to managed education development, including a maintenance programme of facilities and finally VST programme. A rigorous outreach and sensitization programme was envisaged to communicate appropriate messages on how the beneficiaries can access availed services offered by the project.

Progress achieved:

Capacity Building of MEST

2.7 A number of MEST staff received training in and outside the country. Areas in which training was provided include procurement, finance and educational assessment. An EMIS consultant, recruited through UNESCO, has worked with the Planning Division to assist the MEST in establishing an EMIS and statistical booklet for the education sector. A first output was produced 2006/7; which was followed by a draft of the 2008/9. Due to capacity limitations, the second piece of work was not published and needed more refinement. The consultant was not awarded a further contract. UNICEF agreed to support the hiring of a Deputy Director for Planning as well as statistician in order to move forward on the agenda and ensure institutional strengthening of EMIS. The draft of the EMIS booklet is now under review and is expected to be **completed early 2011**.

Establishment of School Management Committees (SMCs)

2.8 The project aimed to support the development of a strategy and a plan of action to establish 393 SMCs at primary schools. As per the last supervision mission, it was reported that 495 SMCs (210 in ADB Districts and 285 in IDA districts) have completed training. The number of SMCs trained was higher than the planned figure due to the extra training provided by two SPs using their own resources.

3. CROSS CUTTING ISSUES

Impact on Poverty Reduction

3.1 The project has been able to provide essential education facilities, amenities, supplies and equipment and capacity building of those who are to deliver and manage the new education system, in a country that was in a post-war environment and under reconstruction.

3.2 For nearly a decade Sierra Leone has ranked at or near the bottom in the UNDP Human Development Ranking. This is a wake-up call in light of Sierra Leone's commitments for pro-poor social and economic strategies as enshrined in the PRSP I and the current PRSP II, with an agenda for change, education continues to be a key driver for economic growth. The peoples of Sierra Leone have the opportunity to build on the lessons learnt from Education III project and provide a road map for strategic development of the human resource, within a stable social and economic environment.

3.3 Reliable data has been a challenge, but available data suggest that there has been significant improvement between 2000 and 2007, however, there remains at least 30% of school aged children out of school. Children are completing their examinations at the ends of the learning cycle and yet performance is weak. There continues to prevail disparities based on gender, location, household wealth which poses serious implications for the aforementioned implementation of PRSP and meeting the agenda for change.

3.4 As witnessed by the mission team, the availed expanded facilities are not enough to absorb all school aged girls and boys in communities which there were to support. But they have served as a catalyst for demand for educational services and delivery. While access may have been partially addressed by Education III, but there is a need to ensure equitable and quality provisions which demand a continued supply of resourcing from the Government and other partners.

3.5 The country is endowed with richness in the sectors of fishery, mining and agriculture just to mention a few. The education institutions need to go beyond the limited skills of carpentry and tailoring and create centers of excellence for science and technology within. Strong public private partnerships need to be established to enable innovation, research for industrial development. There is recognition of the benefits enhanced skills and competencies for the world of work and entrepreneurship, and that these are a pre-requisite for economic self-reliance and hence reduction of poverty.

3.6 This is further exacerbated by Sierra Leone's young population base, with just over 40 per cent of the population which is less than 15 year old; and around 34 per cent between 15 and 34 years old. Accordingly, the DHS of 2008 account for low literacy levels 74 % female and 55 % male. This consists of an age cohort that consists of the bulk of the population, who also lack adequate skills for a decent livelihood.

3.7 Reduction of poverty for the Sierra Leone would entail addressing these issues.

The mission of the PCR noted the consensus from Education and Finance on the need for identifying a new project in line with ADF 12. This new project would focus on strengthening education quality through continued capacity development of key stakeholders in the sector and putting into place a human resource base that will deliver the required services.

3.8 UNICEF support in this area is a potential platform to be explored as a base for new support. At the same time, Sierra Leone is ensure that beginning at the early grade levels, competencies and skills are geared towards attainment of educational outcomes for young scientist women and men who will create and run Sierra Leone's economy. The RTI had at the beginning of the project conducted Early Grade Reading Assessment (EGRA); there may be a need to look into another impact assessment initiative to include mathematics and science for early grade and assessment.

#### Impact on Gender

3.9 The project appraisal document did not make concerted effort and focus on gender. Based on the availed document there is lack of sex disaggregated data to monitor progress in terms of access of the girl and boy child, as well as track the participation of women in the sector from the school level to the top managerial position. Nonetheless, in country progress has been made in advocating for the increased participation of women, recognizing that the teaching force is only represented by 30 per cent of female at primary level and 20 per cent at JSS level. No specific policy and strategy have been developed as of yet for the sector, but there has been a policy for support to girl-children in their participation at JSS through financial support for school fees, uniform and textbooks.

The project recruited a female as project director and took steps to encourage female SPs and WMAs. The mission takes note of the Bank in making a gender profile for the country. The exercise commenced during the same period the PCR mission was being undertaken.

#### Aid Coordination

4.0 The Education Sector in Sierra Leone is not yet operating within a full sector wide approach. The capacity gaps in the sector play an important role in allowing the Government to take the lead in coordinating development partners working in the sector, aligning themselves with the ESP as a central planning tool. There exists two main organs for coordinating partners in education development. These include the Education Partners Forum, which is chaired by the Minister. Concern, IRC, Save the Children are among the key partners in this forum as international NGOs. The main outputs of this forum have been the development of the ESP and National Education Policy. The second organ is called

Education Stakeholders Forum, which includes UNICEF and local and international NGOs. The forum meets every two months.

4.1 The PCR mission has noted that these fora do provide a lobbying mechanism for continued provision of increased shares of contribution towards the sector. Recently, it was noted that the Government budget has had to be revised in order to make a fair proportion of allocation to education, which seemed to compete with infrastructure, energy and water for the 2011 budget. The development of a new Education Policy is an opportunity for renewed energy and further strengthening of the capacity gaps for devolving powers from the central to the local.

4.2 While the Government may not have identified education as a priority for a new ADF project under ADF 12, given the magnitude of continued need to embrace gains from Education III and competing priorities for emerging sectors under PRSP II, Sierra Leone may need to continue and seeking opportunities on the same. The Bank remains engaged in seeking ways to support the GoSL's education sector plan.

## 5. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 The Rehabilitation of Basic and Non-Formal Education and Vocational Skills Training project, also popularly known as the SABABU project was conceived during the end of the rebel war in Sierra Leone. Though the original intention of the project was to provide an educational strategy through literacy and skills for disarming child and youth soldiers in order to bring peace, security and restoration into the country; the idea has transcended beyond those borders and has acquired a national scale of education for development. Due to the extensive damage of the war on the social and economic spheres, the project began with these challenges face on. Compounded to these, there was lack of functional Government structures and low capacity for project implementation, including the civil works. A partnership programme was designed in order to meet the required educational service delivery needed during this particular phase. Service Providers, who mainly constituted NGOs and CBOs active during the war and providing humanitarian support were engaged for the project's implementation. The setting up of the partnership as well as putting in place institutional capacity and the management structures for the project has resulted in a delay for the project's completion by 33 months.

5.2 At mid-term review of the project, the number of primary schools, JSS schools, teachers' houses and VSTCs to be constructed was further scaled down to fit into the budget. The high inflation rate had caused price hike of construction materials and other project inputs. Amidst all these obstacles, the project has succeeded in constructing 91 primary schools and rehabilitating 7. As regards to the JSS, 47 were constructed and 7 were rehabilitated. In addition, 25 administration buildings, 12 staff houses, 7 VSTCs were constructed and 1 VSTC was rehabilitated. More than 4,000 under qualified and untrained teachers were trained. Support for Community Education Centers and literacy were eliminated to pave way for the immediate priorities of getting middle level capacity skills functional as quickly as possible. The target of one set of core textbooks for each student in the project schools was attained and exceeded, all primary school students throughout the country have one set of books each, including those in private schools. The School Management Committees training has managed to rally all partners working on teacher training and harmonization is being done for one consolidated manual for wider scaling-up. The "Agenda for Change" requires education as a foundation for the development agenda as well as for poverty reduction. Education III project has closed and has left an established platform for a new horizon in development; that of reaching better heights through education, science and technology.