

Approved by Ops. Com. on 03/04/2009



Guidelines on Project Completion Reporting



QUALITY ASSURANCE AND RESULTS DEPARTMENT (ORQR)



Guidelines on Project Completion Reporting

1. Definition and Purpose

1.1 Project Completion Reports (PCR) are among the final milestones of project implementation and the culmination of regular supervision. PCRs are an essential form of self-assessment and constitute the link between project management and evaluation. They are the Bank's preferred tool to show concrete results to its shareholders and accumulate knowledge within the institution.

1.2 The Bank prepares a PCR for each operation it finances. The PCR summarizes the project's contribution to development outcomes. It assesses (a) the degree to which the project achieved its development objective and delivered outputs as set out in the appraisal report; (b) prospects for the project's sustainability; and (c) the Bank and Borrower performance, including compliance with relevant safeguards and cross-cutting policies. It provides quantitative data to substantiate these assessments, and identifies key lessons learned related to the achievement of outcomes.

1.3 The Bank elaborates PCRs jointly with the Borrower, recognizing that the results of every project are a function of both the Bank's and the Borrower's performance. The Borrower provides quantitative data on outputs and outcomes achieved, shapes the analysis, frames the conclusions within the broader strategic context, and contributes to rating the Bank and the Borrower performance.

2. Eligibility and Timing

(a) Public Sector Operations

2.1 A PCR is required for each public sector operation approved by the Board.

2.2 PCRs must be prepared within six (6) months from the date a project reaches 98% cumulative disbursement rate.

2.3 PCR preparation can be initiated as soon as a project has disbursed 85% of its resources if, in the judgment of the task manager, the majority of activities are significantly completed and the majority of outputs and outcomes are visible.



2.4 In order to guarantee that timeliness is respected, Resident Representatives (Res. Reps.) ensure that when clearing the terms of reference for supervision missions for projects that have reached the eligibility threshold, due consideration of the possibility of setting the PCR process in motion is taken.

2.5 A PCR is not prepared for (a) a loan that fails to become effective or is canceled before significant implementation is initiated; (b) technical assistance projects below UA 1 million; (c) project preparation facilities; (d) quick disbursing emergency operations; and (e) studies.

2.6 In addition:

- (a) projects that are closed but never reached the 98% disbursement rate require a PCR. Timeliness will be measured against actual closing date;
- (b) projects that have more than one financing source (loan and grant) become eligible when the combined disbursement rate of all sources reaches the disbursement thresholds; and
- (c) for Policy Based Lending Operations (PBLs), a PCR is due six (6) months after the last disbursement, irrespective of the number of tranches and the timing of disbursement.

(b) Private Sector Operations

2.7 An Extended Supervision Report (XSR) is required for each private sector operation approved by the Board.

2.8 For non-financial projects, a XSR is due 18 months after the project's last disbursement in order to ensure that it has generated a sustained period of operating revenues, reflected in at least one set of its audited financial statements covering at least 12 months of operating revenues generated.

2.9 For financial intermediary operations, a XSR is due 18 months after the intermediary's final disbursement of sub-loans (or sub-investment in the case of equity fund projects).

3. Content and Format

3.1 The PCR focuses primarily on project outputs and outcomes, and presents a brief assessment of the process to achieve them. The PCR format recognizes that certain aspects of project design and implementation are the responsibility of both Bank and Borrower. On these aspects, the respective performances of Bank and Borrower are assessed separately.

3.2 The excel template contains all necessary guidance to the user.

3.3 While maintaining the same approach and focus, the master template will be adapted to policy based lending operations, technical assistance operations, and private sector lending.



4. Responsibilities

4.1 The responsibility for timely PCR preparation lies with the Sector Departments. Regional Departments assist Sector Departments in ensuring that adequate forward planning is undertaken in order to respect PCR timeliness for eligible operations.

4.2 The Bank prepares PCRs jointly with the Borrower. TM have the responsibility to inform the Borrower from early stages of project preparation that a joint PCR is required by the Bank. The extent of Borrower's involvement, as well as Bank's efforts to encourage it, is described in the PCR. Good practice dictates that the PCR process is included in the project implementation plan.

4.3 The project's task manager has the responsibility to ensure that a PCR is prepared on time, and may delegate this responsibility, with the approval of his/her manager. Delegation to field office staff is encouraged.

4.4 Field office staff are in a unique position to lead PCR preparation. Res. Reps. must ensure that at least 40% of PCRs for each field office in any given year are prepared by field staff. PCR preparation is an integral part of the work programs of field office staff. Field office staff have the responsibility to identify opportunities for PCR preparation that match their own skills.

4.5 Task teams are encouraged to undertake joint PCRs with development partners when appropriate. Joint PCRs should identify the contribution of the Bank to the results of the operation. When this contribution can not be isolated, clear reasons should be provided.

4.6 The Quality Assurance and Results Department (ORQR) monitors, reports on, and discloses, sectors' compliance with these PCRs guidelines.

5. Processing

(a) Mission

5.1 The PCR Team Leader prepares the mission terms of reference for approval by the Sector Manager. The Team Leader prepares the TOR jointly with the implementing agency, consulting with representatives of the beneficiaries and other stakeholders. Mission TOR are cleared by Res. Reps. Good practice dictates that TOR should also be shared with the Regional Director.

(b) First Draft

5.2 The draft PCR is cleared by the SM within 10 (ten) working days of the end of the PCR mission.



(c) Peer Reviewing

5.3 The draft PCR is sent to peer reviewers (minimum of two) for comments. At least one peer reviewer must be located in a field office. For larger number of peer reviewers, good practice dictates that a mix of sector and non-sector staff is desirable.

5.4. All comments should be received and incorporated within 5 (five) working days. In the unlikely event that comments are not received on time, the PCR moves to the next processing step. When comments are not received on time, a clear statement is made in the section of the PCR that describes the PCR process, including the names and positions of the peer reviewers that failed to deliver on time.

(d) Clearance and Approval

5.5 The Sector Manager sends the document to RD for clearance. The RD clears the document within 5 (five) working days of reception.

5.6 If the RD fails to either (i) clear the PCR within 5 (five) working days; or (ii) make specific comments to the task team to be incorporated into the report, the PCR is considered cleared by the RD.

5.7. The SD ensures that the comments received from the RD are incorporated into the document, and submits the PCR to the sector VP for final approval. SD/VP approval of PCR for Board distribution is done within 3 (three) days of reception.

(e) Posting and Distribution

5.8 The Sector Department sends the PCR to CLSU for translation and to pcr@afdb.org at the same time (in the original language). Posting and assessment of PCR timeliness is based on reception by this e-mail address.

5.9 SEGL puts the PCR in both languages in DARMS and distributes a copy to the Board for information.

(f) Discussion of Findings

5.10 Once the PCR is cleared by the SD and the RD, a Country Team meeting can be held at the discretion of the RD to discuss findings of the PCR. A Country Team meeting is not mandatory, yet encouraged. At the minimum, approved PCRs should be circulated to Country Team members by e-mail for information.

6. Mainstreaming Lessons Learned

6.1 The Bank's ability to learn, record and share lessons is a crucial determinant of the quality of its operations. PCRs are the primary tool to highlight these lessons. SDs



ensure that lessons learned from previous operations in the sector feed into new cycles of projects. RDs ensure that lessons learned from previous operations in the country (ies) and in the region are taken into account in new operations.

6.2 The review process for new operations ensures that lessons from past operations are identified and taken into account. Peer Reviewers are encouraged to bring lessons from past operations and suggest ways to include them in new projects. Readiness Reviews conducted by ORQR carefully assess whether lessons learned have or have not been incorporated into new operations. Country Teams are the guardians of this accumulated knowledge and play a prominent role in guaranteeing good quality at entry through dynamic lesson learning.

6.3 Good practice dictates that a follow-up operation should not be appraised unless the PCR of the prior operation is completed.

7. Ex-post Evaluation

7.1 OPEV reviews the quality of each PCR produced by the Bank. The review of PCRs results in a “PCR Evaluation Note” for each PCR that assesses the objectivity of the performance ratings, the pertinence of lessons/recommendations, and a general quality assessment.

8. Disclosure

8.1 The Bank discloses all PCRs that it produces, unless a written request from the Borrower not to do so is received within 7 (seven) working days of PCR internal posting.

