

A. PROJECT DATA AND KEY DATES

I. BASIC INFORMATION

Project Reference 2100150000096	Project Name Education Project III	Country Republic of Benin	
Loan Instrument(s) Loan Agreement		Sector Education	Environmental Category N.A
Initial Commitment UA 8 000 000	Amount Cancelled UA 13 835.06	Amount Disbursed UA 7 986 164.94	% Disbursed 99.83 %
Borrower Government of the Republic of Benin			
Executing Agency(ies) [Mention the key ministries, project implementation units, civil society agencies and organisations responsible for the project implementation] Ministry of Secondary Education, Technical and Vocational Training, Ministry of Preschool and Primary Education, Ministry of Culture, Literacy and Adult Education, Project Implementation Office, Monitoring and Coordination Committee.			
Co-financiers and Other External Partners [Mention all other sources of finance and amounts, technical assistance and other sources utilised under the project: Nil			

II. KEY DATES

Project Concept Note approved by the Operations Committee. NA	Appraisal Report approved by the Operations Committee. NA	Approval by the Board of Directors October 1997	
Restructuring(s) NA			
	Initial date	Actual date	Difference in months [between actual date and initial date]
EFFECTIVENESS	05 February 1998	29 June 1999	17 months
MID-TERM REVIEW	Not Applicable	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
CLOSURE	31 December 2002	31 December 2008	72 months

III. RATINGS SUMMARY

CRITERIA	SUB-CRITERIA	RATINGS
PROJECT OUTCOME	Achievement of Outcomes Major difficulties in the implementation of civil works, greater efficiency in training activities	2
	Achievement of Outputs The impact of training is satisfactory	2
	Adherence to Schedule The implementation schedule was not adhered to	0
	OVERALL PROJECT OUTPUT	1.66
BANK PERFORMANCE	Design and Preparation Status The sizing of the project implementation unit is not appropriate.	2
	Supervision Supervision missions were organised, but certain weaknesses noted during project implementation were not corrected.	2
	OVERALL PERFORMANCE OF THE BANK	2
BORROWER PERFORMANCE	Design and Preparation Status The lessons learnt from the two previous projects were not adequately taken into account in expanding the project area.	1.5

	Implementation Excessive delays in project implementation	1
	OVERALL PERFORMANCE OF THE BORROWER	1.25

IV. BANK STAFF RESPONSIBLE

FUNCTIONS	AT APPROVAL	AT COMPLETION
Regional Director	P. AFRIKA	J. LITSE
Sector Director	R. CRESSMAN	T.HURLEY
Project Manager	J.E. PORGO	G. BAYEMI
PCR Team Leader		G. BAYEMI
Members of PCR Team		G. BAYEMI, I. BOUKARI, Z. KONE

PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT (PCR)

B. PROJECT CONTEXT

Summarize the rationale for Bank assistance. Text:
-What development challenge the project addresses
-the Borrower's overall strategy for addressing it,
-Bank activities in the country (ies) and in this sector over the past year and how they performed, and
-ongoing Bank and other externally financed activities that complement, overlap with or relate to this project.
Please cite relevant sources. Comment on strength and coherence of the rationale [not more than 300 words]. Any other statement on the project origin and history should, if necessary, be given in Annex 6 entitled 'Project Description'.]

The Borrower prepared this project to meet the development challenges, in particular weak human resource training and qualifications, as well as the high illiteracy rate, especially of the female population. These two challenges slow down economic development.

The Borrower's overall strategy to address these challenges consists in improving the intake capacity of primary and secondary education, strengthening the agricultural and industrial technical education structures, the literacy structures and improving the quality of teaching aids and of supervisory staff (inspectors, teachers, laboratory assistants, literacy instructors, educational planners) through training and retraining, as well as through development of new syllabuses for junior technical schools. The Borrower requested the technical and financial assistance of the Bank to implement this strategy.

The Bank also intervened in the Education Project IV, which should have been completed in 2008. But this operation has been delayed with a disbursement rate below 10% as at end February 2009.

The Bank also intervened in the Human Resource Development Programme (PDRH), whose physical implementation rate was 75% in November 2008. The disbursement rates at this time were: 46.9% on ADF loan, 87.96% on ADF grant, 26.8% for the OPEC funds and 64.42% for the Beninese counterpart funds.

Many external donors intervene in the education sector in Benin, particularly in the field of girls' education (Cf. Annex 5).

C. PROJECT OBJECTIVES AND LOGICAL FRAMEWORK

1. State the project development objective(s) (as presented in the appraisal Report)
The development objective of Education Project III is: Contribute to the strengthening of human resource

training.			
2. Describe the major project components, indicating how each of them will contribute to achieving the project objectives.			
<p><u>Component 1</u>: Improvement of the quality of primary education</p> <p>The expected outcomes from this component are the supply of common teaching aids to 2 954 primary schools, 410 000 physical science textbooks for the elementary and middle levels, as well as teachers' handbooks. In terms of human resources, the project was to retrain 115 inspectors, 250 educational advisers and 2 800 primary school teachers, and train 10 new inspectors and educational planners.</p> <p><u>Component 2</u>: Improvement of the quality of science education at the general secondary level.</p> <p>Under this component, it was planned to build 30 new laboratories and rehabilitate 48 others, train 34 laboratory assistants, retrain 78 science teachers for 134 general secondary schools and drill 10 boreholes for 10 schools.</p> <p><u>Component 3</u> : Development of Agricultural, Technical and Industrial Education</p> <p>At project appraisal, it was planned to construct and equip a multi-purpose agricultural training centre at Akodeha (Come commune), two computer rooms at the Coulibaly Technical High School, annex in Kpondéhou (Cotonou), complete the teaching classrooms of the same school and train 3 inspectors, 3 teachers, 6 assistant teachers and 1 laboratory assistant; to revise the syllabus of the junior technical high school and procure 2 vehicles.</p> <p><u>Component 4</u> : Promotion of Women's Education</p> <p>Under this component, the project was to organise sensitisation campaigns for parents, girls and teachers in order to promote the education of girls, establish a girls' education promotion service, construct and equip 100 literacy centres, train one (01) literacy teacher in education planning, retrain 78 literacy teachers and every year teach 8800 women to read and write, and supply 2 vehicles.</p>			
3. Provide a brief assessment (up to two sentences) of the project objectives along the following 3 dimensions: rate the assessment using the scale provided in Appendix 1.			
PROJECT OBJECTIVES DIMENSIONS		ASSESSMENT	WORKING SCORE
RELEVANT	a) Relevant to the country's development priorities	The project is in line with the development priorities of the country	4
ACHIEVABLE	b) Objectives deemed achievable in view of the contributions of the project and the estimated deadlines.	The wide territorial spread of the facilities to be constructed constitutes an obstacle to achievement of all the outcomes within the timeframe.	3
CONSISTENT	c) Consistent with Bank country or regional strategy	The project is in line with the Bank's support strategy for the country.	4
	d) Consistent with the general priorities of the Bank	The project is consistent with the priorities of Bank activities.	4

4. Draw up the logical framework. In the absence of a logical framework, complete the table below, indicating the overall project objective, the key project components, the key activities of each component and the expected outcomes and outputs, as well as the indicators for measuring the achievement of outputs. You may create additional rows for the components, activities, outcomes or outputs, if necessary.

COMPONENTS	ACTIVITIES	OUTCOMES	EXPECTED OUTCOMES	MEASURABLE INDICATORS
Component 1 Contribute to making primary education efficient.	Supply of teaching aids and teaching guides.	Common teaching aids to 2 954 primary schools, 410 000 physical science textbooks	The repeater rate was reduced from 27% in 1995 to about 10% and the dropout rate from 10% in 1995 to 5% in 2002	Educational statistics
	Staff training (teachers, inspectors and educational advisers)	115 inspectors, 250 educational advisers and 2 800 primary education teachers were retrained and 10 new inspectors trained.	The advancement rate increased from 63% in 1995 to 90% in 2002.	Educational statistics
Component 2 Contribute to the development of science education in secondary schools.	Construction/Rehabilitation and equipping of secondary school facilities.	Construction of 30 new laboratory rooms. Rehabilitation of 48 other classrooms in progress.	The existing laboratories have been rehabilitated and new ones built.	Number of laboratory rooms built and rehabilitated.
	Staff training (teachers, inspectors and laboratory assistants)	Training of 34 laboratory assistants and retraining of 78 science teachers.	Teachers have practical experience in secondary schools with their students.	Number of science teachers with laboratory experience.
Component 3 Contribute to the increase in the intake capacity for technical, agricultural and industrial education.	Construction/Rehabilitation and equipping of technical and vocational education facilities.	Construction and equipping of the education facilities of Coulibaly Technical High School Annex in Kpondehou (Cotonou). Construction of Akodeha agricultural techniques high school (LTA) in progress.	The following new streams have been introduced in Coulibaly Technical High School: roofing-carpentry, plumbing and sanitary works wall/floor coverings and tiling, electricity, refrigeration and air conditioning	Number of new technical education streams.
	Staff training (teachers and inspectors)	7 inspectors trained and 5 junior technical education syllabuses prepared.	Inspection missions and reports.	Number of teachers inspected.
Component 4 Contribute to raising the educational levels of women.	Construction and equipping of literacy facilities.	45 literacy centers constructed and equipped.	Women's illiteracy rate is reduced from 84% in 1996 to 70% in 2002.	Educational statistics
	Organisation of sensitisation campaigns for parents, girls and teachers to promote girls' education.	Awareness campaigns for parents, girls and teachers organised.	The gross enrolment rate of girls in primary education rose from 52% to 65% and, in secondary education, from 12% to 17% between 1996 and 2002.	Educational statistics

5. For each dimension of the log frame, briefly indicate (up to two sentences) of the extent to which the log frame achieved the following Insert a working score using the scoring scale in Appendix 1. In the absence of a logical framework, give this section a rating of 1 (one).

LOG FRAME DIMENSIONS	ASSESSMENT	WORKING SCORE
LOGICAL	a) Envisage a logical, causal sequence for the achievement of the project development objectives.	A causal chain exists for the achievement of the project development objective. 4
MEASURABLE	b) State measurable and quantifiable objectives and outputs.	The objectives and results are measurable and quantifiable. 4
THOROUGH	c) State the key assumptions and risks	Generally, the key assumptions and risks are identified, excepting the working conditions of the literacy instructors and the teacher/pupil ratio for the literacy education of 13 200 learners per year. 3

D. OUTCOMES AND OUTPUTS

I. ACHEIVEMENT OF OUTPUTS

In the table below, assess achievement of actual vs. expected outputs for each major activity. Import the expected outputs from the log framework presented in Section C. Rate the implementation rate of the expected outcomes. Calculate the weighted ratings as an approximate proportion of the cost of the project activities. The sum of the weighted ratings will automatically be displayed and will correspond to the sum of the weighted ratings. If you wish, disregard the automatically calculated rating and justify.

KEY ACTIVITIES		Assessment Rating	Proportion of project costs in percent (as mentioned in the Appraisal Report)	Weighted Rating (automatically generated)
Expected Outputs	Actual Outputs			
1. The repeater rate dropping from 27% to about 10%, the dropout rate from 10% to 5% and the advancement rate rising from 63% to 90% between 1995 and 2002	The repeater rate is 11.35%, the dropout rate 9.22% and the advancement rate 79.23% in 2002	3	35.89	1.0767
2. Construction of 30 new laboratory rooms and rehabilitation of 48 other rooms.	25 laboratory rooms have been built (83%) and 37 rehabilitated (77%).	2	20.67	0.2067
3. About 370 additional students attending agro-pastoral and computer courses and 3 technical education inspectors trained.	Over 100 students attend industrial and computer courses and 7 education inspectors have been trained.	2	27.89	0.8367
4. A department in charge of promoting girls' education been established and 100 literacy centres built	A department in charge of promoting girls' education has been established and 45 literacy centres have been built.	2	10.00	0.1
Overall output score [score is calculated as sum of weighted scores				2

Tick here to override the auto-calculated score

Provide justification for overriding the auto calculated score r

Insert the new score or re-enter the autocalculated score

2

II. ACHEIVEMENT OF OUTCOMES

1. Using the available monitoring data, assess the achievement of the <u>expected outputs</u> . Import the expected outputs of the logical framework presented in Section C. Rate the implementation of the expected outputs. The overall output rating will be automatically calculated and will correspond to the average of the assessment ratings. Disregard the automatically calculated mark, if you wish, and justify.		
OUTPUTS		Assessment Rating
Estimate	Actual	
1.	The common teaching aids have been delivered to 2 954 primary schools	Yes 4
2.	2 800 teachers, 115 inspectors and 250 educational advisers retrained	5 000 introductory course teachers 250 educational advisers and 90 inspectors have been retrained. 15 new inspectors have been trained. 4
3.	48 laboratory rooms rehabilitated and 3 new ones built and equipped.	60 laboratory rooms built/rehabilitated and equipped and 18 in progress. 3
4.	78 natural science and physics teachers retrained.	Yes 4
5.	34 laboratory assistants trained.	laboratory assistants trained 4
6.	1 multi-purpose agricultural training centre built and equipped.	Ongoing 1
7.	2 computer rooms and 4 workshops (general engineering, automobile mechanics, civil engineering, and topography-electronics) built and equipped.	Yes 4
8.	3 technical and vocational education inspectors trained.	The inspection capacity has increased with the training of 7 inspectors compared to one (01) previously. 4
9.	A department to promote girls' education established within MENRS.	Yes, the reports for these activities exist for 2000-2008 4
10.	100 literacy centres built and equipped.	45 centres are active and operational, and the others are ongoing. 2
11.	78 literacy teachers retrained and 13 200 persons, of which 800 women, can read and write.	78 literacy teachers have been retrained and an annual average of 2630 people were given literacy education from 1999 to 2003 2
OVERALL OUTPUTS RATING [corresponds to the sum of the weighted ratings]		2.72

Check here to disregard the auto-calculated rating

Give the reasons for disregarding the auto-calculated mark

Enter the new rating or re-enter the auto-calculated rating

2.72

2. Other outputs: Comment on the additional outputs not envisaged in the logical framework, and focused mainly on cross-cutting issues (gender, for example)

The project has helped establish a department for promoting girls' education. This department is committed to the sensitisation campaign of parents. It has resulted in the literacy education of adults, 67.17% of whom are women.

3. **Threats to the viability of the outputs achieved.** Highlight factors that affect, or could affect the project outputs or their viability in the long term. Mention any new activity, or institutional change, possibly recommended to ensure viability of the outputs. The analysis should draw on the sensitivity analysis in Annex 3, if relevant.

E. PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS FOR IMPLEMENTATION

1. Indicate the extent to which the Bank and the Borrower have ensured that the project has taken into account the borrower's implementation capacity by providing good project design and establishing the required implementation mechanism. Analyse all aspects related to project design. The design-related issues are: to what extent did project design take into consideration the lessons learnt from previous PCRs in the sector or in the country? (Mention some key PCRs); is the project based on serious analytical studies? (mention some key documents); to what extent did the Bank and the Borrower appropriately assess the capacity of the executing agencies and that of the project implementation unit; extent of consultations and partnerships, economic justification of the project and the arrangements made for technical assistance (no more than 250 words). Any other remarks on implementation should be presented in Annex 6 titled: **Project Description**]

The design of Education Project III only partly took into account the experience of previous projects supported by ADF in the education sector. These previous projects focused on the construction of Pobe and Natitingou comprehensive schools (project completed in 1991). The first project was supplemented by a second (billed for completion in December 1997) on the construction and equipping of Bohicon comprehensive school. The Education Project III appraisal report indicates that, among other aspects, the performance audit report for the first project reveals that the performance of the executing agency was satisfactory. This satisfactory report of the first two projects led the designers of Education Project III to maintain the Project Executing Office that was in place. This option did not adequately take into consideration the fact that the scope of the first two projects was limited to two localities for the first and one locality for the second, while Education Project III is national in scope, comprises more activities and is therefore more complex.

PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS FOR IMPLEMENTATION DIMENSIONS		ASSESSMENT	WORKING SCORE	
REALISM	a) Owing to its complexity, the project is subject to an analysis of the country's capacity and its political commitment.	The project complexity is consistent with the country's capacity and political commitment.	4	
RISK ASSESSMENT AND MITIGATION	b) The project design takes the risks analyzed adequately into account.	The risks have been identified.	3	
USE OF COUNTRY SYSTEMS	c) The procurement, financial management, monitoring and/or other systems are based on the systems already used by the Government and other partners.	The system in force in the country is based on that recommended by the project.	4	
For the following dimensions, give separate assessment ratings for Bank performance and the borrower performance:			Assessment Rating	
			Bank	Borrower
CLARITY	d) Responsibilities for project implementation are clearly defined.	The responsibilities are clearly defined.	4	4
PROCUREMENT READINESS	e) Implementation documents (specifications, design and procurement documents, etc.) are ready at appraisal.	The implementation documents were ready at appraisal.	4	4

MONITORING READINESS	f) The indicators and monitoring plan are adopted.	The monitoring-evaluation indicators are agreed.	4	4
BASELINE DATA	h) Baseline data collection is completed or ongoing.	The baseline data was available	4	4

F. IMPLEMENTATION

1. Give the key project implementation characteristics of the following aspects: adherence to schedules, quality of the construction and other works, performance of the consultants, efficacy of Bank supervision and Borrower's monitoring. Determine to what extent the Bank and the borrower ensured compliance with the safeguards. (no more than 300 words). [Any other remarks on implementation should be presented in Annex 6 entitled: Project Description]

The project became effective 17 months behind schedule and was closed 0 6 years behind schedule. The Bank disbursed UA 7,986,164.94 out of UA 8,000,000 on ADF loan, i.e. 99.83% and cancelled the balance of UA 13835.06. The Government disbursed, from its internal resources and those of the HIPC initiative, CFAF 7,487,441,104 representing 917.68% of CFAF 815,907,000 estimated at appraisal. At project close, the infrastructure component was not completed. The Annex at Kpondehou, the 60 laboratory rooms and 45 literacy centres commissioned are acceptable. The project provided the equipment and vehicles, trained human resources, implemented 05 new syllabuses of the junior technical high school and established a department for the promotion of girls' education (Cf. Annex 6). The performance of the consultants in charge of training and audits is satisfactory. That of the two consultants responsible for the civil works is unsatisfactory. The Bank organised 16 missions, i.e. an average of one mission and a half per annum. The performance of the Bank is satisfactory. Despite the delay of 6 years, the Government has not yet completed the activities and the counterpart funds have largely exceeded the budget estimate. The performance of the Borrower is unsatisfactory. (Cf. Annex 5).

2. Comment on the role of other partners (donors, NGO, contractors, etc.). Assess, if necessary, the efficacy of the co-financing and donor coordination modalities.

Not applicable

3. Harmonization: Indicate whether the Bank explicitly applied itself to harmonizing the instruments, systems and/or methods with the other partners.

Not Applicable

4. For each aspect of project implementation, show to what extent the project achieved the objectives hereunder. Make a brief assessment (no more than two sentences) and give an assessment rating in accordance with the scale in Appendix 1.

ASPECTS RELATED TO PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION		ASSESSMENT	ASSESSMENT RATING
TIMELINESS	a) Extent of compliance with the planned closing date. If the gap on the right is below 12, rating of 4 between 12.1 and 24, rating of 3 between 24.1 and 36, rating of 2 above 36.1, rating of 1	The last disbursement deadline initially scheduled for 31 December 2002, was postponed to 31 December 2008, i.e. six years' slippage on the estimated date in the Loan Agreement.	0
BANK PERFORMANCE	b) Bank complied with		
	Environmental safeguards	The project did not require special measures	n/a
	Fiduciary Requirements	The project funds were fully disbursed	4
	Project codefendants	The conditions of the agreement were partially fulfilled	2
	c) Bank supervision was	The average of missions is one mission	3

	satisfactory in terms of the combination of skills and the practicality of solutions.	and half per annum with a good combination of skills.	
	d) Bank supervision of project management was satisfactory.	The supervision of project management by the Bank is acceptable.	3
BORROWER PERFORMANCE	e) The Borrower complied with:		
	Environmental protection measures	The project did not require special measures.	N.A
	Fiduciary provisions	The Government exceeded the budgetary estimates owing to delays in providing the fund.	1
	Agreements signed under the project.	The conditions of the agreement were partially fulfilled.	2
	f) The borrower was attentive to the conclusions and recommendations made by the Bank project supervision missions.	Bank recommendations were not always implemented.	1
	g) The borrower collected and used for decision making, the information drawn from the monitoring process.	Monitoring-evaluation was not efficient.	1

G. COMPLETION

1. IS THE PCR DELIVERED ON A TIMELY BASIS, IN COMPLIANCE WITH BANK POLICY?

Date project reached 98% disb. Rate of closing date if applicable)	Date PCR was sent to pcr@afdb.org	Difference in months	ASSESSMENT RATING (automatically generated) If the difference is equal to or less than 6 months, the rating is 4. If more than 6 months, the rating is 1.
n/a		6	4
<p>Briefly describe the PCR process. Describe the Borrower's and co-financiers' involvement in producing the document. Highlight any major differences of opinion concerning the assessments made in this PCR Describe the team composition and confirm whether a site visit was undertaken. Mention any major collaboration from other development partners. State the extent of field office involvement in producing the report. Indicate whether comments from peer Reviewers were received on time (provide names and positions of Peer Reviewers (100 words maximum).</p>			
<p>The PCR team comprised two consultants: one Education Expert and one Architect. The Borrower provided significant support. The mission conducted interviews with the Minister of Secondary Education and Technical and Vocational Training in charge of the project, his Technical Adviser responsible for project monitoring and the Chairperson of the Steering Committee, on the project outputs and improvement of social projects management. The mission had several working sessions with the PIU and the heads of the services benefiting from the project activities. It also visited the Akodeha Agricultural High School (Cf. mission work programme, Annex 7).</p>			

H. LESSONS LEARNT FROM THE APPRAISAL

Summarize the key lessons the Bank and the Borrower suggested by the project's outcomes. [300 words maximum]. Any other additional narrative about lessons learned, if needed, must be placed in Annex 6: Project Narrative".

The recruitment of a reduced staff through a call for applications and evaluated on the basis of a performance contract would contribute to the improving project management;

The sector approach has numerous advantages, in particular the participation of all the Central Directorates of Education in the implementation of project activities. This is essential in order to facilitate ownership and real institutional anchoring - engines of project success and sustainability;

The countrywide distribution of civil works activities is a major obstacle to the implementation of this component. The civil works programme of future projects should limit the geographical area of the project, especially as several donors intervene in the sector;

Non involvement of the local communities, decentralised structures and grassroots organisations in the implementation of certain straightforward activities handicaps the achievement of objectives;

Great importance should be given to the choice of procurement methods, depending on the activities and their implementation areas;

Flexibility in decision-making by both the Bank and the Borrower during project implementation makes for greater efficiency in the achievement of the expected outcomes (cf. Annex 5).

I. PROJECT RATINGS SUMMARY

All working scores and ratings are auto generated by the computer from the relevant section in the PCR

CRITERIA	SUB-CRITERIA	Working score
PROJECT OUTCOME	Achievement of outputs	2
	Achievement of outcomes	3
	Timeliness	0
	OVERALL PROJECT OUTPUT RATING	2.5
BANK PERFORMANCE	Design and Readiness	
	The project objectives are relevant to the development priorities	4
	The project objectives could in p be achieved with the projects inputs and in the expected time frame.	3
	The project objectives are consistent with the Bank's country or regional strategy.	4
	The project objectives are consistent with the general priorities of the Bank.	4
	The logical framework envisages a logical causal sequence for the achievement of the project development objectives.	4
	The objectives and outputs, as presented in the logical framework, are measurable and quantifiable.	4
	The logical framework presents key assumptions and risks	2
	Project complexity was matched with country capacity and political commitment.	3
	The project design includes adequate risk analysis.	2
	Project procurement, financial management, monitoring and/or other systems were based on those already in use by government and/or other partners.	3
	The project implementation responsibilities are well defined.	4
	Necessary implementation documents (e.g., specifications, design, procurements, etc.) are ready at the time of the appraisal.	3
	The monitoring indicators and monitoring plan were agreed upon during design	4
Baseline data was available or collected during design.	4	

	PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS SUBSCORE		3.42
	Supervision:		
	Supervision:		
	Bank complied with		N.A
	Environmental safeguards		3
	Fiduciary Requirements		2
	Project covenants		3
	The quality of Bank supervision was satisfactory in terms of combination of skills and practicality of solutions		3
	SUPERVISION SUB-SCORE		2.75
	OVERALL BANK PERFORMANCE SCORE		2.96
BORROWER PERFORMANCE	Design and Readiness		
	Responsibilities for project implementation are clearly defined.		4
	Necessary implementation documents (e.g., documents on specifications, design, procurements, etc.) are ready at evaluation time.		3
	The monitoring indicators and monitoring plan are agreed upon and baseline data are available or are being collected.		2
	PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS SCORE		3
	Implementation		
	The Borrower complied with the:		
	Environmental protection measures		N.A
	Fiduciary requirements		1
	Agreements signed under the project		2
	The Borrower was attentive to the conclusions and recommendations made by the Bank under the project supervision.		2
	The Borrower's decisions are based on the information drawn from monitoring missions.		2
IMPLEMENTATION SUB-SCORE		1.75	
OVERALL BORROWER PERFORMANCE SCORE		2.70	

J. PROCESSING

STEP	SIGNATURE AND COMMENTS	DATE
Sector Manager clearance	Boukary SAVADOGO	10 June 2009
Regional Director clearance		
Sector Director approval	Thomas HURLEY	10 June 2009

BREAKDOWN OF FINANCING BY EXPENDITURE CATEGORY AT APPRAISAL

		(In Million UA)			
	Categories	ADF	Govt.	Total	%
A	Studies and supervision	0.15	0.00	0.15	1.66
B	Construction/Rehabilitation	2.20	0.70	2.90	32.22
C	Furniture	0.19	0.00	0.19	2.11
D	Equipment	4.05	0.00	4.05	45
E	Training	0.78	0.00	0.78	8.67
F	Technical Assistance	0.42	0.00	0.42	4.67
G	Operation	0.21	0.30	0.51	5.67
	Total	8.00	1.00	9.00	100

Govt. : Government

**ADF LOAN DISBURSEMENTS
ACTUAL EXPENDITURE BY CATEGORY (IN UA)**

		(In UA)			
	Categories	Estimated Amounts	Disbursed Amounts	Difference	% utilised
A	Studies and Supervision	150,000	88,952.70	61047.30	59.30
B	Construction/Rehabilitation	2200,000	1,659,983.83	540,016.17	75.45
C	Furniture	190,000	250,940.83	- 60,940.83	132.07
D	Equipment	4,050,000	4,170,765.81	- 120,765.81	102.98
E	Training	780,000	1,042,810.12	- 262,810.12	133.69
F	Technical Assistance	420,000	317,645.13	102,345.87	75.63
G	Operating Cost	210,000	455,066.52	- 245,066.52	216.70
	Total	8,000,000	7,986,164.94	13,835.06	99.83

**DISBURSEMENTS OF GOVERNMENT COUNTERPART
ACTUAL EXPENDITURE BY CATEGORY (IN CFAF)**

		(In CFAF)			
	Categories	Estimated Amounts	Committed Amounts	Disbursed Amounts	% disbursed
A	Studies and Supervision	0	187,196,826	187,196,826	Not projected
B	Construction/Rehabilitation	571,134,900	3,470,169,102	2,935,243,712	513.93
C	Furniture	0	131,144,573	120,153,371	Not projected
D	Equipment	0	268,233,862	2,194,717,607	Not projected
E	Training	0	35,064,475	32,256,251	Not projected
F	Technical Assistance	0	6,650,000	6,650,000	Not projected
G	Operation	244,772,100	610,523,735	610,523,735	249.43
	Total	815,907,000	7,008,982,573	5,981,258,740	733.07

MISSIONS ORGANISED BY BANK EXPERTS

N°	Mission	Date	No. of days	No. of persons.	Composition
1	Identification				
2	Preparation/ Appraisal	11 to 26/ 5/1997	16	4	Senior Education Analyst and 3 consultants
3	Supervision	22/8 to 04/ 9/1999	28	2	Chief Education Analyst and one Consultant Architect
4	Supervision	06 au 17/ 6/2000	12	1	Chief Education Analyst
5	Supervision	12 to 20/ 12/2000	9	1	Chief Education Analyst
6	Supervision	9 to 14/ 8/2001	6	1	Chief Education Analyst
7	Supervision	10 to 31/ 8/2002	44	2	Education Expert and School Infrastructure Consultant
8	Supervision	19/3 to 04/ 4/2003	42	1	Architectural Expert
9	Supervision	27/10 to 09 /11/2003	28	2	Chief Education Analyst and Architect Expert
10	Supervision	04 to 16/ 6/2004	13	1	Chief Education Analyst
11	Project Audit	28/3 to 08/ 4/2005	24	2	
12	Supervision	19/6 to 01/ 7/2005	76	4	Education Expert. Architect Expert, Health Expert and consultant
13	Supervision	17 to 24/ 12/2005	12	1	Education Expert
14	Financial supervision	09 to 20/1/2006	12	1	Disbursement Officer
15	Supervision	29/11 to 15/12/2006	34	2	Education Expert and Architect
16	Portfolio Review	09 to 28/2/2007	72	5	OSHD, OSAN.2, OINF3, GECL.1, OWAS1 and ORWA Experts
17	Supervision	05 to 17/11/2008	39	3	Principal Education Analyst ETFP Consultant and Architect Consultant
18	Completion Report	15/2 to 03/3/2009	35	2	Education Consultant and Architect Consultant

ECONOMIC AND FINANCIAL ANALYSIS

At project appraisal, the economic and financial analysis was limited to description of the origin of the financings of the education sector. The analysis was also made in cost/benefit terms. The actions in favour of girls' education and in particular women's literacy education were interpreted as likely to improve the design and implementation capacity of socially viable and economically profitable programmes and projects. The establishment of educational facilities was analysed as capable of enabling the youths to undertake, individually or through cooperatives, income-generating activities that would improve their living conditions.

The economic and financial rates of return were not determined at appraisal. At closure, the economic and financial rates of return can therefore not be compared to those that should have been determined at appraisal.

From an economic standpoint, the project is beneficial in the long run, as it will help train human resources, whose employability is improved, thereby ensuring greater economic efficiency. More specifically, the economic benefits are:

- Creation of direct jobs: 115 secondary school inspectors, 78 literacy teachers; 74 laboratory assistants; teachers for the 16 classes that will function in the Akodeha agricultural technical high school and Kpondhou high school;
- Improvement of the incomes of many farmers and stockbreeders who will be trained in Akodeha agricultural technical school, illiterate women and men who will be taught to read and write; and
- Creation of conditions for greater diversification of the economy through the training of experts in the agro-pastoral and industrial sectors.

With regard to the financial return for the beneficiaries, the overall situation, as well as the situations of components 2, 3 and 4 show positive net present values (NPV)¹, which are, however, much higher for the expenditure estimated at appraisal than for the actual expenditure at project closure. The internal rates of return (IRR) are higher than the cost of the project resources. The detailed situation is as follows:

- Component 1 and Component 5: there is no immediate financial return for the beneficiaries.
- The whole project: NPV at closure (5242.4 million), IRR (5.5%); NPV at appraisal (10 582.5 million), IRR (16.53%).
- Component 2: NPV at closure (484.1 million), IRR (3.17%); NPV at appraisal (1587.7 million), IRR (16.06%).
- Component 3: NPV at closure (2508.5 million), IRR (6.21%); NPV at appraisal (3997.8 million), IRR (13.31%).
- Component 4: NPV at closure (7506.2 million), IRR (77.55%); NPV at appraisal (8040.2 million), IRR (139.4%).

¹ The discounting is done at the rate of 8% over 13 years.

SOURCES OF INFORMATION

N°	Title of Document	Sources
1	Project Appraisal Report, July 1997	PIO/ADF
2	Loan Agreement, February 1998	PIO/ADF
3	Reports on the Training Components	PIO
4	Disbursement Tables and Ledger	PIO/ADF
4	Status Reports	PIO
6	Audit Reports	PIO
7	Aide memoire of Bank missions	PIO
8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Literacy mission reports. Period 2006 to 2008, Directorate of Literacy and Adult Education/Education Project IV, 2006. - Joint mission report: Directorate for the Promotion of Girls' Education and Education Project IV in the Departments of Donga and Atacora, Mrs. Romaine CHEKETE, January 2008. - Joint mission reports: Directorate for the Promotion of Girls' Education and Education Project IV, implemented under Girls' Education, from 21 to 27 January 2008 and from 03 to 10 February 2008, and from 09 to 23 March 2008, by Mrs. Clémence S. FATOKE - Reports of missions organised in September 2007 under Girls' Education, by the Directorate for the Promotion of Girls' Education, comprising 03 mission reports, 2000, 2005 and 2006 statistics, as well as the tables of the gross enrolment rates. 	PIO
9	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Report of the retraining of teachers of preparatory courses in the new syllabuses (NPE) - Report on training in the use of the new natural sciences (SVT), physics, chemistry and technology (PCT) laboratory equipment. . - Report of the training of 39 laboratory assistants of the physics and natural science laboratory of high schools and colleges in Benin (2nd year) - Report of the retraining of inspectors, educational advisers and primary education introductory course (CI) teachers. (April – May 2000) 	PIO
10	- 2006-2007 Statistical Yearbook, Ministry of Primary and Secondary Education, SSGI/DPP	PIO
11	- Booklet of the 2008 sensitisation and information campaign on girls' education in Benin entitled 'Toute les filles a l'école' (All the Girls at School')	PIO
12	- Report of the site visit to the literacy centres in July, 2008.	PIO

PROJECT JUSTIFICATION

Project Context The project has a technical as well as socio-economic justification. Technically, it aims to strengthen human resource training by reducing the general illiteracy rate, increasing the gross primary enrolment rate and the internal efficiency of primary and secondary education. It also aims to help develop science education in the general secondary. In technical education, the project seeks to increase the intake capacity of agricultural and industrial technical education, improve the quality of the junior secondary school syllabus and finally help raise the standard of women's education by improving the level of girls' primary and secondary education, thereby reducing the illiteracy rate, especially of women. From the socio-economic point of view, the strengthening of human resource training will in general help provide the economy with more competent human resources capable of ensuring greater productivity. The strengthening of training will also increase women's participation in economic activities and promote poverty reduction.

Other donors intervene in the education sector in Benin: United Nations organisations (World Bank, UNICEF, and United Nations Fund for Population Activities), bilateral cooperation organisations (USAID, DANIDA, JICA, KONINKRIJK DER NEDERLANDEN, and AFD) and many NGOs. These other donors intervene in primary and secondary education, especially in the areas of school structures, education assistance through the provision of educational supplies and specific actions in favour of girls' education. They intervene as well through functional literacy actions, actions to support the training of teachers, etc. These actions sometimes cover the whole territory or are limited to a region, a Department or a locality. These various actions in some cases complement Bank action, but in other cases they are similar, which necessitates a greater coordination effort by the authorities of the country during the implementation of education programmes and projects.

Implementation :The actual project implementation schedule slipped quite considerably from that adopted at the signing of the project owing to conflicts that arose several times between the Borrower and the Bank over the appointment of the PIU team, leading to suspensions of disbursements, the difficulty the Government had mobilising additional funds and overruns of the estimated costs. The procurement of goods, works and services was in keeping with Bank Rules of Procedure and complied with the methods stipulated in the Loan Agreement, but the project encountered cost overruns that resulted in it financing expenditure categories like studies and supervisions, equipment, training and technical assistance that were initially to be financed by the Bank..

Lessons Learnt: Overall, the project outcomes are mixed. While activities related to furniture and services were fully implemented, those related to equipment and works remain uncompleted nine years after the start of the operation. Further to the lessons drawn in Chapter H above, the mission recommends the implementation of the following measures: *To the Borrower* : i) Carefully select the institutional anchors of future projects and ensure the involvement of all the central and decentralised structures in the identification and actual implementation of projects; ii) Systematically involve the local communities in the implementation of projects under the ongoing decentralisation process, in order to guarantee the sustainability of project achievements; iii) Show flexibility in decision making to facilitate achievement of the expected outcomes; v) See to the completion of all ongoing civil works; vii) Submit the project completion report no later than 30 June 2009. *To the Bank*: i) Encourage the Borrower to promptly fulfil the loan and grant conditions; ii) Show flexibility in decision-making during the implementation of projects to facilitate achievement of the expected results; iii) Promptly process documents, especially the payment requests; iv) Ensure the implementation of the outstanding activities.

REPUBLIC OF BENIN
LIST OF CONTRACTS EXECUTED BY EDUCATION PROJECT III

No.	Suppliers	Nationality	Purpose of contract	Method	Initial amount in CFAF	ADF Share	Govt. Share	Implementation
GOODS								
1	PIERRON EDUCATION	French	Supply of common teaching aids for primary schools	ILC	1 204 560 200	1 204 560 200		100%
2	EDITIONS NATHAN	French	Supply of physical science textbooks of first grade and second grade in the Republic of Benin;	ILC	863 197 000	863 197 000		100%
3	SOCAR BENIN	Beninese	Supply of transport equipment	LCB	142 900 857	142 900 857		100%
4	G2I EQUIPEMENT	Beninese	Procurement of computer and teaching equipment as well as furniture	LCB	12 211 200	12 211 200		100%
5	COGEMA	Beninese	Internal furniture for AKODEHA, Furniture for the annex of Coulibaly Technical High School in Kpondéhou; science laboratory and literacy centres	ICB	304 575 142	193 435 673	111 139 469	100%
6	SOCAR BENIN	Beninese	Supply of transport equipment for PIU	LCB	119 627 168		119 627 168	100%
7	PIERRON EDUCATION	French	Supply of equipment for the science laboratories of secondary schools	ICB	2 173 909 317	1 203 094 293	970 815 024	100%
8	ACIA	French	Equipment for the annex of COTONOU Commercial Technical School (LTC)	ICB	1 226 972 661	122 697 266	1 104 275 395	100%
WORKS								
1	COMOBE	Beninese	Extension works of the premises of the Directorate of Education Project III	LCB	24 899 960		24 899 960	100%
2	SHOKAP	Beninese	Supplementary extension works of Coulibaly technical high school, Kpondéhou annex	LCB	157 442 325	157 442 325		100%
3	SBEE	Beninese	Electricity and water supply works on the construction site of Akodéha agricultural technical school (Mono)	LCB	128 837 657	128 837 657		21%
4	DYJESCK	Beninese	Extension works of Coulibaly Technical School	LSI	232 192 774	176 141 438	56 051 336	100%
5	DYJESCK	Beninese	Construction and rehabilitation of the science laboratories of secondary schools.	ICB	596 185 614	452 266 407	143 919 207	100%
6	SISOCO	Beninese	Construction of 45 literacy centres in the northern departments	ICB	179 272 530	179 272 530		100%
7	BETON SERVICE ET MAPOLO	Beninese	Construction and rehabilitation of science laboratories	ICB	558 650 109	558 650 109		100%
8	Entreprise Saint Etienne	Beninese	Additional construction works of Akodéha agricultural technical school	LCB	735 839 811		735 839 811	53%
			Amending agreement N°1		232 132 824		232 132 824	

REPUBLIC OF BENIN
LIST OF CONTRACTS EXECUTED BY EDUCATION PROJECT III

N°	Suppliers	Nationality	Purpose of contract	Mode	Initial amount In CFAF	ADF Share	Govt. Share	Execution
9	DYJESCK	Beninese	Supplementary internal and external improvement works of Coulibaly technical high school, Kpondéhou annex	LCB	270 744 945		270 744 945	100%
10	DYJESCK	Beninese	Amendment 1 on the supplementary internal and external improvement works of Coulibaly technical high school, Kpondéhou annex	Over-the counter	51 719 851		51 719 851	100%
11	TRENITY COMPANY	Beninese	Construction works of 55 literacy centres	ICB	391 445 197		391 445 197	30%
12	UDECTO	Togolese	Construction of Akodéha agricultural technical high school	ICB	1 391 399 383	119 059 228	1 272 340 155	77%
12'			Amending agreement 1		134 931 904		134 931 904	
13	FADOU L TECHNIBOIS	Beninese	Construction and rehabilitation of the science laboratories of secondary schools	ICB	150 000 000		150 000 000	100%
14	FADOU L TECHNIBOIS	Beninese	Amending agreement 1 on the construction and rehabilitation of the science laboratories of secondary schools		244 410 254		244 410 254	50%
SERVICES								
1	CINCAT INTERNATIONAL	Beninese	Technical supervision and coordination of the construction works of the science laboratories.	LIS	40 583 482	17 653 815	22 929 667	77%
2	CINCAT INTERNATIONAL	Burkina be	Architectural design, engineering studies, supervision and monitoring of the construction works of Akodeha ATHS	LIS	100 229 825	43 599 974	56 629 851	66%
3	AFRIQUE OMNITECH	Beninese	Architectural design, engineering studies, supervision and monitoring of the construction works of Coulibaly technical high school	LIS	41 000 000	17 835 000	23 165 000	100%
4	CABINET ARCHITECTURE DU SOLEIL	Beninese	Architectural design, engineering studies, supervision and monitoring of the construction works of the literacy centres in the Republic of Benin	LIS	48 191 750	20 963 411	27 228 339	45%
5	CIDE	Canadian	Revision of the syllabuses of junior technical and vocational education	LIS	554000 \$ can	554000 \$ can		100%
6	CIDE	Canadian	Training of the technical and vocational education teachers and inspectors along with the inspectors of primary education.	LIS	251 827 596	222 111 939	29 715 657	100%
7	IPE	French	Training of one DNAEA official in adult education planning	Over-he counter	13 400 000	13 400 000		100%

REPUBLIC OF BENIN
LIST OF CONTRACTS EXECUTED BY EDUCATION PROJECT III

N°	Suppliers	Nationality	Purpose of Contract	Mode	Initial amount in CFAF	ADF Share	Govt. Share	Execution
8	BENAUDIT CONSULTEX	Beninese	Performance of full financial audit of Education Project III accounts	LLS	10 515 000	10 515 000		100%
9	LA REFERENCE	Beninese	Introduction of an efficient management system in Education Project III	LLS	6 650 000	6 650 000		100%
10	BENIN CONSULT	Beninese	Studies and supervision of the construction works of positive boreholes with water tower in six secondary schools and Akodéha agricultural technical high school	LLS	13 544 300	13 544 300		100%
11	CABINET PROJECTION	Beninese	Topographical surveys of the site of Lokossa tertiary technical school	LCB	8 632 880	8 632 880		100%
12	CABINET PROJECTION	Beninese	Topographical surveys of the site of Djougou agricultural technical college	LCB	9 015 200	9 015 200		100%
13	CABINET PROJECTION	Beninese	Topographical surveys of the site of Savalou agricultural technical college	LCB	8 400 774	8 400 774		100%
14	CNERTP	Beninese	Geotechnical studies for the construction of Akodéha agricultural technical high school	LLS	7 759 302		7 759 302	100%
15	SAFECO		Performance of a comprehensive financial audit of Education Project III account 2002-2004	LIC	15 750 000		15 750 000	100%
16	COFIMA	Beninese	2005 and 2006 audit of Education Project III	LIC	7 210 000	7 210 000		100%
17	ECCO-GC	Beninese	Supervision of the outstanding construction/rehabilitation works of JSS science laboratories under Education Project III	LLS	7 995 000		7 995 000	46%
18	HOMOCONS ULTIO	Beninese	Writing of the completion report of Education Project III	LLS	5 820 000		5 820 000	Not started

PREPARATION OF THE COMPLETION REPORT OF EDUCATION PROJECT III IN BENIN
MISSION WORK PROGRAMME

Date	Activities	Place
Monday 16 February 2009	Initial contact meeting with PIU officials Search for and utilisation of available documents	Porto-Novo (PIO)
Tuesday 17 February 20 09	Search for and utilisation of available documents	Porto-Novo (PIO)
Wednesday 18 February 2009	Search for and utilisation of available documents	Porto-Novo (PIO)
Thursday 19 February 2009	Meeting with PIU Manager and her collaborators Search for and utilisation of available documents	Porto-Novo (PIO)
Friday 20 February 2009	Search for and utilisation of available documents	Porto-Novo (PIO)
Saturday 21 February 2009	Search for and utilisation of available documents	Porto-Novo (PIO)
Monday 23 February 2009	Meeting with the Minister of Secondary Education and TEVT (technical education and vocational training)	Continuo
	Meeting with the Director of Literacy Education and his collaborators	Continuo
	Meeting with the General Manager of Investments and Development Finance (DGAIFD) and the Manager in charge of canvassing for financings	Continuo
Tuesday 24 February 2009	Meeting with the Director of Secondary Education	Porto-Novo
	Meeting with the Director of Primary Education	Porto-Novo
	Meeting with the physics Inspector in charge of training	Porto-Novo
Wednesday 25 February 2009	Utilisation of available documents	Porto-Novo (PIO)
Thursday 26 February 2009	Site visit to Akodeha ATHS	Akodeha
	Meeting with the Director of technical education	Cotonou
	Meeting with the Director of programming and assessment	Cotonou
	Meeting with the General Director of Investments and Development Finance (DGAIFD)	Cotonou
Friday 27 February 2009	Meeting with the Director of the inspectorate of teaching and technical education.	Cotonou
	Meeting with literacy education teachers	Cotonou (stade de l'amitié)
Saturday 28 February 2009	Search and utilisation of available documents	Porto Novo
Monday 2 March 2009	Meeting at the office of the Minister of Secondary and Education and FTP	Cotonou
	Finalisation of the draft checklist	Porto Novo
Tuesday 3 March 2009	Meeting with the Directorate for the Promotion of Girls' Education	Porto-Novo
	Wrap-up meeting, signing of the checklist	Cotonou
Wednesday 4 March 2009	Departure for Tunis	

APPENDIX 1

Rating Scale and Corresponding Assessments

SCORE	EXPLANATION
4	Highly satisfactory - Perfect implementation, no fault
3	Satisfactory – Most of the objectives are achieved, despite some shortcomings
2	Average – Project partly successful. Almost as many outcomes as shortcomings
1	Average - Project partly successful. Almost as many outcomes as shortcomings
NA	Not applicable

N.B.: The formulas are corrected to the nearest decimal point. For all the calculations, only whole numbers are used.

LIST OF ANNEXES

Mandatory Information

1. Project cost and financing

- a. Project costs by component
- b. Resources by source of finance

2. Bank contributions: Mention key members of the team as well as their duties during preparation, supervision and completion in a chronological order. Provide the date and the ratings awarded by the last supervision report.

3. Economic analysis (ERR) and financial analysis, if applicable. Recalculate the economic rates of return based on the costs and benefits at completion and compare them with the estimates at appraisal. Break down by component, where relevant. Analyse the sensitivity of ERR to the key assumption. Submit a financial analysis of the project beneficiaries.

4. Last procurement plan

5. List of supporting documents

Optional Information

6. Project description. Key factors not taken into account in the general rating scale, but which affected project design and implementation. These factors, positive or negative, might include: climate and weather conditions, political changes, contract and staff issues, technical issues, procurement processes and interactions with other partners. If any of these factors is significant enough to affect the assessment ratings, it should be mentioned in the scale, with cross-reference to this annex.