

AFRICAN DEVELOPMENT FUND



COMPLETION REPORT
BASIC EDUCATION STRENGTHENING PROJECT
BURKINA FASO

(PROJECT No. P-BF-IA0-004 LOAN No. 21001500002029)

HUMAN DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

June 2009

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
Currency Equivalents, Weights and Measures, Fiscal Year, Acronyms and Abbreviations, List of Annexes, Basic Data, Project Matrix and Executive Summary	(i-xi)
1 <u>INTRODUCTION</u>	1
2 <u>PROJECT OBJECTIVES AND FORMULATION</u>	1
2.1 Project Objectives	1
2.2 Project Description	2
2.3 Project Formulation	3
2.4 Project Preparation and Appraisal	3
2.5 Negotiation and Approval	3
3. <u>PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION</u>	4
3.1 Effectiveness and Start-Up	4
3.2 Modifications	4
3.3 Implementation Schedule	4
3.4 Reporting	5
3.5 Procurement of Goods and Services	5
3.6 Costs, Sources of Financing and Disbursements	5
4 <u>PROJECT PERFORMANCE</u>	6
4.1 Operational Performance	6
4.2 Institutional Performance	8
4.3 Management and Organisational Effectiveness	9
4.4 Staff Strengthening, Training and Development	10
4.5 Performance of Consultants	10
4.6 Performance of Contractors	11
4.7 Performance of Suppliers	12
5 <u>SOCIAL AND ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT</u>	12
5.1 Social Impact	12
5.2 Environmental Impact	13
6. <u>SUSTAINABILITY</u>	13
7. <u>PERFORMANCE OF THE BANK AND THE BORROWER</u>	14
7.1 Performance of the Bank	14
7.2 Performance of the Borrower	15
8. <u>OVERALL PERFORMANCE AND RATING</u>	15
9. <u>CONCLUSIONS, LESSONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</u>	15
9.1 Conclusions	15
9.2 Lessons	16
9.3 Recommendations	17

This report has been prepared by Mr. Felix Bongjoh, Chief Education Expert, OSHD.2, and two Consultants, following their completion mission to Burkina Faso from 18 November to 2 December 2008. Inquiries on this document should be referred to Mr. Thomas Hurley, Director, OSHD (Ext. 2046), and Mr. Boukary Savadogo, Division Manager, OSHD.2 (Ext. 3169).

CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

At Project Appraisal
(August 1997)

At Project Completion
(Burkina Faso, PCR, December 2008)

UA 1 =	CFAF 791.008	UA 1 =	CFAF 705.300
CFAF 1 =	UA 0.001264209	CFAF 1 =	UA 0.001417836

WEIGHTS AND MEASURES

Metric System

FISCAL YEAR

January - December

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

IL	:	Initial Literacy
ARC	:	Action-Réflexion-Culture (publication)
ADB	:	African Development Bank
PIO	:	Project Implementation Office
BET	:	Engineering Firm
CEAP	:	Elementary Teaching Aptitude Certificate
PIU	:	Project Implementation Unit
CPAF	:	Centre de promotion d'alphabétisation (Literacy Development Centre)
CPR	:	Centre de promotion rurale (Rural Development Centre)
IBD	:	International Bidding Documents
DCMP	:	Direction centrale des marchés publics (Central Public Procurement Directorate)
DEP	:	Direction des études et de la planification (Research and Planning Directorate)
DGINA	:	Direction générale de l'institut national d'alphabétisation (General Directorate of the National Literacy Institute)
DPEF	:	Direction de la promotion de l'éducation des filles (Directorate for the Advancement of Girls' Education)
DPEBA	:	Direction provinciale de l'enseignement de base et de l'alphabétisation (Provincial Directorate of Basic Education and Literacy)
DREBA	:	Direction régionale de l'enseignement de base et de l'alphabétisation (Regional Directorate of Basic Education and Literacy)
ADF	:	African Development Fund
FCB	:	Basic Further Training
FONAENF	:	Fonds national pour l'alphabétisation et l'éducation non formelle (National Literacy and Non-Formal Education Fund)
IDA	:	International Development Association
MARA	:	Ministère de l'agriculture et des ressources animales (Ministry of Agriculture and Animal Resources)
MAHRH	:	Ministère de l'agriculture, de l'hydraulique et des ressources halieutiques (Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Fishery Resources)

MEBA	:	Ministère de l'enseignement de base et de l'alphabétisation (Ministry of Basic Education and Literacy)
MESSRS	:	Ministère des enseignements secondaire supérieur et de la recherche Scientifique (Ministry of Secondary, Higher Education and Scientific Research)
SREF	:	Service de la promotion de l'éducation des filles (Girls' Education Division)
GER	:	Gross Enrolment Ratio
UA	:	ADB/ADF Unit of Account
UNESCO	:	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation

LIST OF ANNEXES

	<u>Number of Pages</u>
Annex 1: Map of Burkina Faso	1
Annex 2: Sources of Information	1
Annex 3: Estimated and Actual Costs by Category of Expenditure	1
Annex 4: Actual and Estimated Loan Disbursement Schedule	1
Annex 5: Project Implementation Performance and Bank Performance	1
Annex 6: Impact on Development	2
Annex 7: Matrix of Recommendations and Follow-Up	2
Annex 8: Disbursement Schedule of Project Revolving Fund	1
Annex 9: Estimated and Actual ADF and National Counterpart Funds per Year	1
Annex 10: List of Key Contracts	8

BASIC PROJECT DATA

1. Project Name : Basic Education Strengthening Project (Education IV)
2. Loan Number : 2100150007112
3. Borrower : Burkina Faso
4. Guarantor : Burkina Faso
5. Beneficiary : Ministry of Education
6. Executing Agency : Project Implementation Office within the Ministry of Secondary, Higher Education and Scientific Research

A. LOAN

ADF	<u>Estimate at Appraisal</u>	<u>Actual</u>
1. Amount (UA million) :	16.50	16.25
2. Interest Rate :	NA	
3. Service Charge :	0.75 % per annum	
4. Repayment Period :	50 years	
5. Grace Period :	10 years	
6. Loan Negotiation Date :	23 and 24 June 1997	
7. Loan Approval Date :	16 July 1997	
8. Loan Signature Date :	5 September 1997	
9. Loan Effectiveness Date :	3 December 1998	
Government	2.00	2.29

B. PROJECT DATA

1. Project Cost (in UA million)

Total Cost (UA million)	Estimated Cost			Actual Cost		
	<u>F.E.</u>	<u>LC</u>	<u>Total</u>	<u>F.E.</u>	<u>LC</u>	<u>Total</u>
	16.00	2.50	18.50	16.25	2.29	18.54

2. Financing Plan (UA million)

Source of Financing	Amount Estimated at Appraisal	Actual Expenditure
ADF	16.50	16.25
Government	2.00	2.29
TOTAL	18.50	18.54

3. Actual Date of First Disbursement : 22 April 1999
4. Actual Date of Last Disbursement : 22 September 2008
5. Commencement of Project Activities : April 1999
6. Date of Completion of Project Activities : July 2008

C. PERFORMANCE INDICATORS

1. Total Disbursed : UA 16.25 million
Amount Cancelled : Nil
Unused Balance : UA 0.25 million
2. Slippage on Schedule
- Slippage on Effectiveness : 15 months
- Slippage on Completion Date : 79 months
- Slippage on Last Disbursement : 84 months
- Number of Extensions of Last Disbursement
Deadline : 4
3. Project Implementation Status : Completed (95%)
4. Verifiable Indicators in relation to Allocation of Expenditure Categories:
A. Goods : 95 % Implemented
B. Works : 90 % Implemented
C. Services : 98 % Implemented
D. Operating Costs : 120 % Implemented
5. Institutional Performance
Bank Group : Satisfactory
Government : Unsatisfactory
6. Performance Building Contractors : Unsatisfactory
Performance of Consultants : Satisfactory
Performance of Suppliers : Satisfactory

D. MISSIONS

Type	No. of Persons	Composition*	Dates
Preparation	3	EE/C-AR/C-EE	1995
Appraisal	2	EE /AR/C-EE	1997
Technical Supervision /01	2	SE/AR/C-EE	from 16 to 28/03/1998
Technical Supervision/02	2	EE/AR/C-EE	from 28/10 to 13/11/1999
Technical Supervision/03	2	EE/AR/EEC	from 06 to 20/06/2000
Technical Supervision/04	3	EE	from 11 to 16/07/2000
Technical Supervision/05	1	AR	from 09 to 19/12/2000
Technical Supervision/06	2	AR/EE	from 04 to 18/06/2001
Technical Supervision/07	1	EE	from 14 to 25/11/2001
Technical Supervision/08	2	AR/ES	from 18/06 to 05/07/2002
Technical Supervision/09	1	DO	from 23/11 to 15/12/2002
Financial Supervision	1	DO	from 22 to 30/04/2003
Technical Supervision/10	2	EE/C-AR	from 11 to 19/07/2003
Technical Supervision /11	3	EE/AR/EEC	from 25/01 to 09/02/2004
Technical Supervision/12	2	EE/AR	from 11/09 to 01/10/2004
Portfolio Review/13	6	EE/AR/C	from 29/10 to 09/11/2004
Technical Supervision/14	2	AR/SE	from 28/03 to 15/04/2005
Technical Supervision/15	1	EE	from 19/09 to 06/10/2005
Technical Supervision/16	1	EE	from 19/06 to 01/07/2006
Technical Supervision/17	2	EE/AR	from 21 to 30/11/2007
PCR	3	EE/C-AR/EEC	from 18 to 02/12/2008

*EE: Education Expert; C-EE: Consultant-Education Expert; AR: Architect; C-AR: Consultant-Architect; DO: Disbursement Officer; HE: Health Expert; SE: Socio-Economist.

E. DISBURSEMENTS (UA million)

<u>ADF</u> : Amount Approved	:	UA 16.50 million
Amount Cancelled	:	Nil (there is a balance of UA 0.25 million, representing yet unpaid commitments)
Net Loan Amount	:	UA 16.50 million

Year	Estimate at Appraisal	Actual Expenditure	% Disbursed
1997	2.81	0.00	0.0 %
1998	3.91	0.00	0.0 %
1999	6.88	0.27	2.4 %
2000	4.40	1.13	6.1 %
2001	0.50	2.26	12.2 %
2002	0.00	2.77	14.9 %
2003	0.00	3.27	17.7 %
2004	0.00	3.06	16.5 %
2005	0.00	1.76	9.6 %
2006	0.00	3.04	16.4 %
2007	0.00	0.96	5.2 %
2008	0.00	0.02	0.1 %
Total	18.50	18.54	100.3 %**

** Owing to Government spending more than budgeted.

Total Disbursed	:	UA 18.54 million
Unutilised Balance	:	UA 0.25 million
Amount Cancelled	:	Nil

F. LIST OF KEY CONTRACTS : See Annex10

PROJECT MPDE LOGICAL FRAMEWORK MATRIX AS DESIGNED AT APPRAISAL AND DEVELOPED AT COMPLETION

BURKINA FASO

**EDUCATION IV PROJECT
Completion Date: September 2006**

HIERARCHY OF OBJECTIFS	OBJECTIVELY VERIFIABLE INDICATORS		MEANS OF VERIFICATION	ASSUMPTIONS
	At Appraisal	At Completion		
<u>Sector Goal</u>				
1. Contribute to the development of human resources	<p>1.1 Drop in illiteracy rate from 80% in 1996 to 60% in 2006 with primary school gross enrolment ratio rising from 38% in 1995/96 to 70% in 2006.</p> <p>1.2 Twenty-six laboratories in 2000 and computer science taught in 15 educational institutions.</p>	<p>1.1.1 The gross illiteracy rate rose from 78.8% in 1996 (of which 88% were women) to 89.6% in 2007 (of which 79.8% were women); the GER rose from 44% in 2001 to 72.5% in 2007/08, representing a 34-point increase in the 1996 GER</p> <p>1.2.1 The project built 10 laboratories, which are used to teach science to students of the public secondary schools. However, 4 institutions out of 5 do not have any computer laboratories.</p>	<p>1.1.1.1 Report of the Research and Planning Directorate of MEBA</p> <p>1.2.1 Bank missions and the PIO and DEP/MESSRS reports</p>	
<u>Project Objectives</u>				
1. Develop basic education and improve its quality.	<p>1.1 About 3,300 additional pupils enrolled in primary school.</p> <p>1.2 The primary school enrolment ratio rising from 38% in 1995/96 to 50% in 2001 and repetition rate to drop from 20% in 1994 to 14% in 2001.</p> <p>1.3. Primary school teachers (12 994) given the required teacher training, primary schools (3293) equipped with teaching aids and 12 Regional Directorates providing regular pedagogical guidance to teachers.</p>	<p>1.1.1 About 3,300 additional students enrolled in primary school through the construction and equipping of 24 school complexes.</p> <p>1.2.1 GER of 85.7% in 2007/08 (81.7% for girls). NER of 59.4% (55.6% for girls and 63% for boys); the repetition rate rose by 9 points from 29% in 2007/08.</p> <p>1.3.1 A total of 3.165 teachers retrained, 3293 schools were equipped with teaching materials and 12 DREBA received vehicles to enable them provide regular pedagogical guidance to teachers.</p>	<p>1.1.1 Mission reports of the PIO and the MEBA Research and Planning Directorate.</p> <p>1.2.1 MEBA/DEP 2007/08 Directory</p> <p>1.3.1 Reports of the MEBA Research and Planning Directorate and MEBA.</p>	<p>1.1.1.1 Bid invitations for the construction of the schools are issued and the contracts are awarded and executed.</p> <p>1.2.1.1 Under-qualified teachers are retrained; pedagogical guidance is provided regularly and teaching material is supplied to the schools.</p> <p>1.3.1.1 The Regional Directorate of Basic Education is given the necessary funds and DREBA is provided vehicles.</p>
2. Strengthen professional, scientific and technical education	<p>2.1 About 1,536 students given adapted vocational education, 1,320 additional students receive scientific</p>	<p>2.1.1 Vocational education is currently not being dispensed as the technical and industrial workshops for the vocational secondary schools</p>	<p>2.1.1 Reports of the PIO and of the Research and Planning Directorate of MESSRS.</p>	<p>2.1.1.1 The contracts for the construction of the vocational schools are executed and the</p>

HIERARCHY OF OBJECTIFS	OBJECTIVELY VERIFIABLE INDICATORS	MEANS OF VERIFICATION	ASSUMPTIONS
	<p>education and 660 additional students attend computer classes.</p> <p>2.2 Classes properly dispensed at the Ouagadougou Technical College and modular training system experimented in technical and vocational secondary schools.</p>	<p>are not yet operational; 10 laboratories were built, making it possible to receive 75 students per room while the 15 computer laboratories enabled the holding of computer classes.</p> <p>2.2.1 The classrooms planned were built, but are already falling into disrepair given the large number of students per class; the modular system was tested but has not yet been rolled out.</p>	<p>computer labs are built.</p> <p>2.2.1.1.1 The required technical assistance is recruited.</p>
3. Strengthen the training of young rural farmers.	3.1 About 1,750 youth trained in the Rural Development Centres (CPRs).	3.1 A total of about 1,090 youth were trained in the CPRs (long and short-term training).	3.1.1 Reports of the PIU and the Permanent Secretariat for the Support of Young Farmers.
4. Strengthen women's education	<p>4.1 About 2,000 young girls trained at the Niassan CPR and the primary school GER for girls rises from 30% in 1995/96 to 50% in 2001.</p> <p>4.2 About 40,000 women to receive literacy education and women's illiteracy rate dropping from 85% in 1995/96 to 70% in 2001.</p>	<p>4.1.1 About 405 girls were trained at the Niassan CPR during project implementation and the GER for girls rose up to 81.7% in 2007/08.</p> <p>4.2.1 A total of 7,257 people, including 5,837 women, received Initial Literacy training (IL) and Basic Further Training (FCB), during project implementation, and women's illiteracy rate dropped from 88% in 1996 to 79.8% in 2007.</p>	<p>4.1.1.1 Reports of the PIU and the Permanent Secretariat for the Support of Young Farmers.</p> <p>4.2.1.1 Idem</p>
Outcomes			
1. Twenty-five school complexes built and equipped and 6,000 primary school teachers retrained.	1.1. Existence of premises and application by teachers of new teaching methods.	1.1.1 The 25 school complexes are functioning, but apart from the 3,165 teachers trained no action has been undertaken to extend the training to other teachers.	1.1.1 PIO, DEP/MEBA and Bank mission reports.
2. About 2,495 schools equipped with teaching materials; 2 vocational secondary schools, 10 laboratories, 10 computer laboratories, 4 classrooms and fence wall of the Ouagadougou Secondary Technical School built.	2.1 Improved performance of students, vocational education adapted to the country's needs, and scientific, technological and technical education strengthened.	2.1.1 The completion rate for primary education is 40.9%, but technical and professional education have not yet been strengthened as the technical and vocational workshops of the vocational secondary schools are not operational owing to the lack of electricity. The fence wall and 4 classrooms of the Ouagadougou Secondary Technical School have been built and the 15 computer laboratories built are operational.	2.1.1.1 DEP/MEBA and Bank mission reports

HIERARCHY OF OBJECTIFS	OBJECTIVELY VERIFIABLE INDICATORS		MEANS OF VERIFICATION	ASSUMPTIONS
3. The modular training system is designed and experimented.	3.1 Modular training system s applied in the institutions selected for experimentation.	3.1.1 The system was designed and applied in the pilot institutions.	3.1.1 PIO and Bank mission reports.	3.1.1.1 Technical assistance is recruited.
4. A new CPR is built and a production centre is transformed into a CPR; 1 other production centre is transformed into a CPR for girls; 100 literacy centres built.	4.1 Existence of buildings	4.1.1 The two CPR (Bissiri and PK 60) were built and are operational, but the Bapla CPR and the literacy centres have still not been completed.	4.1.1.1 Bank missions and reports of the Permanent Secretariat for the Support of Young Farmers.	4.1.1.1.1 The contracts are executed.
5. Following personnel are trained/retrained: Five maintenance technicians, 10 physics teachers, 10 natural science teachers, 4 secondary technical teachers.	5.1 Report on training; Teachers properly dispense classes and conduct practicals in laboratories; industrial technology teachers of the secondary technical schools efficiently teach electronic classes.	5.1.1 Three maintenance technicians, 90 teachers and 6 instead of 4 industrial technology teachers were trained and are teaching correctly.	5.1.1.1 PIO reports and Bank missions.	5.1.1.1.1 The training institutions are identified and contracts concluded.
6. About 40,000 women attend literacy classes and 3,750 youth, including 2,000 girls, are trained at the CPR.	6.1 The women concerned read, write and can count.	6.1.1 About 7,257 women received Initial Literacy training (IL) and Basic Further Training (FCB) and a total of 840 youth were trained in the CPR.	6.1.1.1 PIO and INA General Directorate reports.	6.1.1.1.1 The literacy centres and CPRs are built, and apply the new programmes.
7. Six (6) professional staff trained in computer science.	7.1 PIO professionals use computers to produce their reports and keep project accounts.	7.1.1 The 6 professionals, including 3 from the PIU, received computer training and acquired sound knowledge of standard software (word processing, Excel, etc.).	7.1.1.1 PIO report and Bank mission.	7.1.1.1.1 Training contracts are executed.
ACTIVITIES	Budgetary Resources (UA million)	Budgetary Resources (UA million)		
	ADF GOV TOTAL % ADF	ADF GOV TOTAL % ADF		
1.Undertake works (schools, secondary technical schools, CPRs, and literacy centres),	Goods 7.33 0.18 7.51 97.6%	Goods 7.33 0.51 7.84 93.5	Disbursement statement and audit reports.	Government and ADF resources are made available to the project.
	Works 6.77 0.39 7.16 94.6%	Works 6.76 0.76 7.52 89.9%		
2. Provide training	Services 0.92 0.12 1.04 88.5%	Services 0.92 0.13 1.05 87.6%		
3. Procure equipment and furniture.	Op. 1.48 1.31 2.79 53.0%	Op. 1.24 0.89 2.13 58.2%		
4. Recruit technical assistance.	Total 16.50 2.00 18.50 89.2%	Total 16.25 2.29 18.54 87.6%		
	% 89.2 10.8 100	% 87.6 12.4 100		

* Project completion date: September 2006 – This date corresponds to the actual physical completion date for virtually all the works, except those affected by defaulting contractors and outstanding payments.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. Education IV, the subject of this completion report, is the fourth Bank Group-financed operation in the sector in Burkina Faso. With a total cost of UA 18.50 million, the project, approved on 16 July 1997, was financed from an ADF loan of UA 16.50 million and a Government contribution of UA 2.00 million.

2. The specific objectives were to develop basic education while improving its quality; develop vocational, scientific and technical education; strengthen the training of young rural farmers; and, lastly, develop adult women's education. The project comprised the following five components: (i) support to basic education; (ii) strengthening of vocational, scientific and technical education; (iii) support to the training of young rural farmers; (iv) strengthening of women's education; and (v) project management.

3. Approved on 16 July 1997, the Loan Agreement was signed on 5 September 1997 and became effective on 3 December 1998. The implementation schedule was not adhered to for the following reasons: delay in loan effectiveness, lack of familiarity with Bank rules and procedures, dispersal of sites countrywide, weak logistical capacity of contractors, lengthy delays in the processing and approval of certain documents by the Bank and frequent change of project officers. Upon completion, the project cost, net of taxes and duties, was estimated at UA 18.53 million. The Bank disbursed an amount of UA 16.22 million (87.5% in foreign exchange) and UA 2.34 million (12.5%) in local currency. The Government contributed UA 2.34 million or 12.5% of the total project cost.

4. The objectives of improving teaching and learning conditions through the construction and rehabilitation of infrastructure, equipping the schools with furniture, equipment, teaching manuals and material, training of teachers and the literacy and agricultural training of rural young adults were largely achieved. The number of primary school pupils went up from 705,925 to 1,742,439 in 2008. As such, a rising trend in enrolment was observed in the project's target regions. At appraisal, the Séno and Poni provinces had gross enrolment ratios of 12% and 22%, respectively. The construction of 75 classrooms in 25 school complexes made it possible to provide the population with more than 3,300 places, which helped to improve access. In the secondary schools, the science laboratories provided the students enable them to carry out practical exercises during their Physics and Life and Earth Science classes. The project addressed illiteracy in rural areas and 7,257 women benefited from functional literacy classes, thus bringing down the illiteracy rate from 88% in 1996 to 78.8% in 2007.

5. At the institutional level, the project's contribution helped to build the action capacity of various departments, the PIO, the Research and Planning Departments of the ministries in charge of education and the Regional Directorates of Basic Education and Literacy (DREBA) through the logistics provided under the project, namely: vehicles, computer equipment and laboratory equipment.

6. However, in spite of the positive project outcomes, a number of problems need to be addressed, particularly that of the unfinished vocational secondary schools, whose technical and industrial sections are still not operational owing to non-completion of the electrical installations (the contract for the completion of Ouahigouya vocational secondary school electrification was signed on 22 April 2009 and notified on 6 May 2009; for the Fada N'Gourma school, the authorisation to sign the contract was issued on 18 March by the Minister of Economy and Finance) and of the 100 permanent literacy training centres.

7. The performance of the consultants is considered satisfactory, but that of the consultants responsible for works supervision and control is deemed unsatisfactory. The contractors' performance is unsatisfactory owing to the large number of contracts that were cancelled because of their weak logistical capacity and the lengthy delays of up to 45 months beyond the stipulated deadlines. The performance of the suppliers was, however, satisfactory. The Bank's performance is satisfactory (2.5) overall, while that of the Borrower is unsatisfactory (1.8), but the project's impact on development is satisfactory (2.93).

8. Several important lessons have been learnt from the implementation of the project, and the analysis and summary of the various project documents obtained on the ground and at the Bank. The first is that, assigning specific components to different ministries created monitoring and coordination difficulties between the PIO and the Departments concerned by those components, and it would have been more appropriate to recruit agricultural training and literacy specialists instead of setting up an autonomous unit. The second is that, setting up a PIU in a ministry other than the PIO's supervising ministry created leadership issues between the two management units. Thirdly, the dispersal of sites and the multiplicity of components resulted in poor visibility of the project and posed problems in the implementation of the construction components assigned to contractors, who did not have adequate logistical capacity to carry them through. Fourthly, the failure to factor into the construction lots all the heavy and very costly equipment as well as furniture, to facilitate their delivery, installation and handing over to the vocational schools, created coordination problems between the suppliers of equipment and the construction contractors.

9. The recommendations are:

A. For the Bank:

- i) For future projects, take measures to ensure that operations are focused and components are better targeted to facilitate implementation and management and enhance project impact and visibility;
- ii) Pursue and develop for future projects a policy of preventive maintenance of facilities and equipment; and
- iii) Make provision for a revolving fund (RF) with a ceiling of between UA 150,000 and UA 200,000, so as to generate quarterly replenishments and thus avoid the accumulation of supporting documents, RF replenishment delays and other related problems.

B. For the Government:

- i) Complete, using the national counterpart funds: a) the electrification of the Ouahigouya and Fada N'Gourma vocational secondary schools so as to allow operation of the equipment required for the commencement of the training activities for the six new industrial courses; b) works for the 100 CPAF and Bapla CPR;
- ii) Ensure maintenance of school facilities, equipment and furniture by earmarking a budget and bringing all stakeholders on board in order to ensure sustainability;

- iii) Improve the prototype of schools to be built with precise technical specifications, including relevant instructions for consulting firms, in order to obtain proper sustainability, smooth operation and land reserves for future extensions;
- iv) Ensure that the technical specifications require that architects and contractors are better integrated into the communities where schools are located;
- v) in preparing technical specifications for locally-manufactured furniture, pay special attention to features that would guarantee its durability and take into account all local constraints so as to avoid rapid deterioration and increase the sustainability of project gains;
- vi) Submit to the Bank the project audit for FY 2007; and
- vii) Make provision for adequate goods or works allotments so as to avoid multiple contracts and extensions of deadlines for implementation of various components.

I. INTRODUCTION

1.1 The Bank started operations in Burkina Faso in 1975 and has since financed five education projects. The first education sector project, approved in 1979, was financed to the tune of UA 6.15 million and involved the training of young farmers. The second operation, involving the strengthening of primary and secondary education and rural training, worth UA 11.97 million, was approved in 1985 and completed in 1994. A third project, Primary and Secondary Education Quality Improvement Project (Education III), was approved in 1981 for an amount of UA 9.21 million and completed in 1996. In 1997, ADF approved the Education IV Project, the subject of this completion report, for an amount of UA 16 million. Subsequently, Education V Project, which became effective in 2005 while the project preceding it had not yet been completed, was approved in 2003. It is being financed on an ADF loan and an ADF grant of UA 12 million and UA 5 million, respectively.

1.2 The previous projects and Project IV have progressively and chronologically strengthened the education sector and, right from the very first operation, provided education in rural areas and supported the economy with new production centres as well as human resources for socio-economic development. These projects have definitely helped to provide more primary and secondary schools and thus facilitated access to education while improving its quality through the construction of science laboratories in secondary schools.

1.3 The current education project is a continuation of the previous three, aimed at developing and improving the quality of basic education, so as to consolidate the gains and resolve the problems confronting the Burkinabe educational system.

1.4 This Education IV Project Completion Report has been prepared from the findings of the Bank mission fielded to Burkina Faso in November 2008. It is based on the data provided by the PIO and the Bank, as well as interviews with officials of the various departments of the Ministries responsible for education (MESSRS and MEBA) and the Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Fishery Resources (MAHRH) involved in the implementation of various components of the project and heads of the institutions that have benefited from the project's support. Annex 2 provides the list of sources of information consulted.

II. PROJECT OBJECTIVES AND FORMULATION

2.1 Project Objectives

2.1.1 The sector goal of the project was to contribute to developing skilled human resources on the scale required by the country to promote economic growth. The specific objectives were to develop and improve the quality of basic education; develop vocational, scientific and technical education; strengthen the training of young rural farmers; and, lastly, develop adult women's education.

2.2 Project Description

2.2.1 At appraisal, the project spanned a four-year period and had four components with the following outcomes:

2.2.2 Support to basic education: The project was to build 25 school complexes covering a surface area of 400 m², or 75 classrooms comprising three classrooms per complex, students' latrines, three teachers' housing units, a school canteen, a store, a headmaster's office and a borehole. These complexes, and about 2 495 primary schools were to be equipped with furniture and teaching materials. In addition, 12 regional basic primary education and literacy directorates were to be provided with logistics for the supervision of teachers. In-service training for teachers was also planned, and a total of 600 teachers were to undergo retraining.

2.2.3 Strengthening of vocational, scientific and technical education: As part of this component, 2 vocational secondary schools, (Ouahigouya and Fada N'Gourma), 10 science laboratories, 15 computer rooms, 4 classrooms, a store and the fence wall of the Ouagadougou secondary technical school were to be built. Procurement of furniture and equipment for the facilities was also envisaged. Furthermore, 20 teachers were to be trained in the sciences. Support staff for scientific and technical education were to undergo training; specifically, 10 laboratory assistants and 5 maintenance technicians were to be trained. For secondary technical education, 4 teachers of the Ouagadougou secondary technical school as well as 15 computer science teachers were to be retrained and a modular training system designed.

2.2.4 Support to the training of young rural farmers: For the implementation of this component, it was envisaged that a new rural development centre (CPR) would be built and a production centre transformed into a CPR. To make them operational, furniture and equipment were to be procured. It was also planned that 950 young farmers would be trained in a year instead of 2 years. To that end, the new programme was to have been designed right from the commencement of works. Furthermore, four sessions yearly were to be organised for 800 farmers.

2.2.5 Strengthening of women's education: It was planned to transform the Niassan production centre into a CPR for girls and to build 100 women's literacy centres. Furniture and equipment were also to be procured. Furthermore, 2,000 young rural girls were to receive agro-pastoral training and 40,000 women literacy education. To that end, 100 literacy instructors were to be retrained and awareness programmes for relatives organised in 9 provinces of the country.

2.2.6 Project Implementation Office: Activities under this component included the procurement of furniture and additional equipment for the proper functioning of the PIO and the PIU. Equipment to be procured comprised two 4WD vehicles, three vehicles, two micro-computers and two photocopiers. Training was to be provided by 6 IT professionals. Technical assistance, services were to be procured for project account auditing and for the installation of the project's computerised management information system.

2.3 Project Formulation

2.3.1 Although efforts had been made under previous projects in the sector to expand access to education, the Burkinabe educational system was still beset by both quantitative and qualitative problems. The Government adopted the Framework Law on Education, passed by Parliament in May 1996, with the strategic objective of ultimately educating all the children in the country, teaching a maximum number of adults to read and write and training rural youth to substantially improve agro-pastoral production.

2.3.2 With a view to providing education for all, the Government of Burkina Faso drew up a 10-year Education Plan, whose objectives included developing access to formal and non-formal basic education, particularly literacy for women, reducing regional disparities and improving the quality and relevance of basic formal and non-formal education. With respect to secondary education, the objective was to develop science education and vocational and technical education by boosting the intake capacity while improving the internal and external efficiency of the system by rectifying the regional disparities and the inequality of access between girls and boys.

2.4 Project Preparation and Appraisal

Identified by the Government during an ADF supervision mission in 1994, the project was prepared in March-April 1995 by an ADF/UNESCO mission and appraised by ADF in February 1997, as part of the assistance requested by the Government of Burkina Faso from multi-lateral and bi-lateral partners for implementation of priority actions determined by its education policy, which would enable it to train the human resources it needs to promote sustainable social development.

2.5 Negotiations and Approval

Negotiations between ADF and the Government were held on 23 and 24 June 1997. The Government obtained the following changes during the negotiations: (i) Addition of the strengthening of the Burkina Teacher Training College radio service and clarification concerning the 950 youth to be trained and the setting up of 300 of them. For this activity, the Bank was required to monitor the mechanism for repayment of the loans granted the youth in order to ensure that the system of allocation of equipment to graduating students is pursued; (ii) Training of secondary school teachers should be provided in the field of natural sciences rather than mathematics; (iii) Also the General Directorate of Secondary Education and the Department of Inspections and Education Personnel Training were included in the training programme; (iv) With respect to the other conditions, it was specified that the list of maintenance committee members would be given to ADF 3 months after the opening of the schools; (v) Concerning the procurement of goods and services, it was agreed that the IT management of the project would be entrusted to UNESCO; (vi) With regard to disbursement procedures, the direct payment and revolving fund methods were selected; (viii) Concerning the Loan Agreement, the parties agreed that the loan would close on 31 December 2002; and (ix) Lastly, the list of localities in which 100 literacy centres were to be built would be attached to the report. The project was approved on 16 July 1997, and the related loan agreement was signed on 5 September 1997 and became effective on 3 December 1998.

III. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION

3.1 Effectiveness and Start-Up

3.1.1 In addition to the General Conditions, the granting of the loan was subject to the following conditions precedent to loan effectiveness: i) provide ADF with evidence of the commitment to set up maintenance committees for the primary schools to be built in the villages; ii) provide ADF with evidence of the re-designation of the Project Implementation Office within the Ministry of Secondary, Higher Education and Scientific Research as the Executing Agency of the project; iii) provide evidence of the setting up of a project coordinating committee; and iv) provide ADF with evidence of the opening of a project account in a local commercial bank, into which will be deposited the loan resources for operating the project. In terms of other conditions, the Borrower also had to: i) submit to ADF, at the commencement of construction works for the schools, the list of the members of the maintenance committees created in the villages where primary schools were to be built; i) submit to ADF for approval, at the commencement of construction of the CPRs, the new training programme to be implemented in the CPRs and which was to last 12 months; iii) communicate to ADF, in September each year, a status report on the previous year's girls' school enrolment in the country, highlighting in particular, admission, enrolment, repetition, dropout and promotion rates at the different levels of the education system; and iv) submit to ADF, six months before completion of the works for construction of the laboratories and computer science classrooms, the list of 10 laboratory assistants and 15 teachers to be assigned to the institutions concerned.

3.1.2 The conditions precedent to loan effectiveness were fulfilled between 4 June 1998 and 16 July 1998, a total of 10 months after the signing of the loan. The Government passed, chronologically, four decrees relating to the conditions precedent. The other conditions were gradually met according to the project's pace of implementation.

3.2 Modifications

3.2.1 A few minor modifications were made during implementation, but they were not significant enough to alter the structure of the project, which remained the same from commencement to completion. There was only a resizing of the project component indicators following difficulties in achieving the numerical objectives envisaged. These included a reduction of the number of teachers to be retrained, from 6,000 to 3,800; the four maintenance technicians by UNESCO were finally trained abroad; the indicator for the number of young farmers to be trained went down from 950 to 400 to take account of the need to equip them; and Bissiri CPR was replaced by that of PK 60.

3.3 Implementation Schedule

3.3.1 According to the initial timetable, it was estimated that the project would be implemented over 4 years, starting from June 1997. This timeframe was not adhered to and implementation spanned 10 years owing to slippage caused mainly by: (i) the late recruitment of the PIO and PIU staff; (ii) the lengthy loan approval procedure by the Burkinabe National Assembly; (iii) delay in fulfilment of conditions precedent to loan effectiveness and of the other conditions, which delayed payment of the first tranche of the revolving fund; (iv) lack of familiarity with Bank rules and procedures and public procurement methods; (v) the dispersal of sites countrywide; (vi) weak logistical capacity of

contractors (vii) lengthy delays in the processing and approval of certain documents by the Bank, frequent change of project task manager by the Bank, and (viii) the Bank's relocation to Tunis in 2003.

3.4 Reporting

3.4.1 According to the terms of the Loan Agreement, the Borrower was required to submit quarterly status reports, which were submitted as requested. In all, the Borrower submitted twenty-nine (29) quarterly status reports up to September 2006. The reports were of satisfactory quality and quite comprehensive, with the exception of a few operational details missing that would have given a clearer picture of the project's progress. They were generally submitted in a timely manner. The Government submitted a completion report upon the recruitment of a consultant. This report was not consistent with the format recommended by the Bank's Operations Manual; it was incomplete and the PCR mission team found it difficult to use.

3.4.2 The project audit was performed during the implementation period, as required by the Loan Agreement. In all, seven (7) audit reports were produced by external auditors recruited for that purpose. The Bank made comments on each audit report. For FY 2007, despite an amendment was made to the contract of the last audit firm, the services have still not been provided due to lack of funds. At this stage, in the light of certain irregularities observed during the completion mission, it is recommended that a detailed audit of the entire project be performed taking into account the 2007 audit that was not conducted. On the whole, the remarks made in the audit reports have enabled the PIO and the Bank to take remedial measures needed for implementation of the project.

3.5 Procurement of Goods and Services

3.5.1 Procurement of goods, services and works was conducted in keeping with procedures set forth in the Loan Agreement. However, the process from the issuing of bid invitations to the analysis of bids, the Bank's no objection and the award of contracts was sometimes lengthy. At the start of the project, the lack of familiarity with the Bank's rules and procedures for procurement of goods and services by the officials involved in management of the project led to the rejection of certain documents transmitted to the Bank for its "no objection", thus holding up the Bank's approval or disbursement, which subsequently delayed the commencement of certain project activities.

3.5.2 The procurement method selected for the construction of the 100 literacy and training centres (CPAFs) turned out to be inappropriate due to the dispersal of the sites over several provinces and the low cost of those facilities (on average CPAF 2,000,000, or about UA 2,528 per centre). It would have been judicious to involve the village associations, international NGOs such as Aide et Action and Ecoles Sahel, as well as small local contractors and UNICEF, which have experience in such community-based activities.

3.6 Costs, Sources of Financing and Disbursements

3.6.1 The total project cost, net of taxes, was estimated at UA 18.50 million, of which UA 16 million (86.5%) in foreign exchange and UA 2.5 million (13.5%) in local currency. The actual project cost, net of taxes, amounted to UA 18.53 million, of which UA 16.22 million (87.5%) in foreign exchange and UA 2.34 million (12.5%) in local currency.

3.6.2 The Bank disbursed a total amount of UA 16.22 million (98.3% of the ADF loan granted) and the Government contributed UA 2.34 million (about 12.5% of the total project cost). The actual cost and expenditure schedule by source of financing are shown in Annex 3.

3.6.3 The project's national counterpart funds were slightly higher than the amount estimated (2.5%). However, the irregular replenishment of the project's special account and the counterpart funds caused delays in project implementation and led to the temporary suspension of construction works for the school facilities, as well as postponement of certain training activities for lack of availability of resources from the project's revolving fund.

3.6.4 Over the 10 years of project implementation, only 8 disbursements replenished the revolving fund with amounts ranging between UA 110,369.62 and UA 579,837.26, whereas the first request for replenishment of the revolving fund, made in 1999 was UA 122,492.77. Having significant sums in the revolving fund made it possible for the PIO to use the ongoing project's resources to finance certain activities of the new Education V Project. It can be seen from the table in Annex 8, that there was only one disbursement during certain years of the project's implementation (1999, 2003, 2004 and 2005), two for 2001 and 2002 and no replenishment of the RF in 2000, 2006 and 2007.

IV. PROJECT PERFORMANCE

4.1 Operational Performance

4.1.1 Most of the school facilities planned under the project were only partly built on the 152 project sites; they comprised 25 school complexes, 10 laboratories, 2 vocational colleges, 12 computer training centres, 100 CPAFs and 3 CPRs. The 25 school complexes were opened in 2004. The student-teacher ratio stands at 50:1 on average for primary schools – a relatively high ratio compared to the average ratio in Sub-Saharan Africa, where the ratio is about 45:1. Project performance by component is summarised below.

Support to Basic Education

4.1.2 This component was 100% completed. The 25 school complexes and 24 productive boreholes were drilled. All the equipment and furniture for the project were procured and delivered. The schools are operational and the 75 classrooms providing 3,300 additional places have really contributed to increasing the intake capacity in the elementary schools in the project areas. All the complexes have boreholes (except for one, whose borehole has remained unproductive after several attempts), latrines and canteens. These canteens now provide lunch for the students who hitherto had to walk two to five kilometres home during the lunch break. The productive boreholes produce sufficient water for the schools, and even the surrounding areas. All these facilities were completed, furnished and occupied. All the schools are complete with offices, storerooms, kitchens, administrative blocks, latrines for students and staff and water supply.

4.1.3 In terms of training, while the target of 6,000 teachers earmarked for in-service training could not be reached, 52% of the number, i.e., 3,165 confirmed teachers and trainees, including 1,747 women underwent continuing training in French, arithmetic and early learning activities in the form of practical lessons in class. This in-service training helps improve the quality of teaching, as teachers acquire new teaching methods and techniques.

Teacher in-service training was buttressed by School Radio broadcasts throughout the period of training, and the publication of the ARC bulletin. An immediate impact of this effort was the 98.6 % success rate in the Certificate (*Certificat d'aptitude pedagogique-CEAP*) exam for teachers who had been retrained, as against 80.12% for teachers in regions not covered by the project.

Strengthening Vocational, Scientific and Technical Training

4.1.4 The completion rate for works under the secondary school science sub-component was 95%, considering that the 10 science laboratories, 15 computer rooms and other buildings under the project were all built. These rooms are operational as the laboratories and computer rooms are being used by the beneficiaries. The training planned under this component was achieved beyond expectations. Ninety teachers, including 13 women in all, underwent further training in Life and Earth Sciences and Physics, instead of the 20 planned under the project. The 10 laboratory assistants underwent theoretical and practical training as planned, 3 instead of 5 technicians were trained abroad in IT equipment maintenance and 150 workers from the 15 beneficiary high schools (teaching and administrative staff) were trained in office automation.

4.1.5 Works under the technical and vocational training sub-component were executed to a level of 60% only, because the electrical systems in the new buildings were not completed, just like in the old buildings under the rehabilitation, extension and construction component. With the termination of the electrical contract owing to the financial incapacity of the contractor, the classrooms, and especially the technical workshops built are still not operational. Failure to complete the electrical installations, comprising the low-voltage transformer, and electrical and lighting devices for the vocational schools made it impossible to install the equipment procured by the project for the workshops built. Training activities could thus not be started for the six new industrial disciplines in the Ouahigouya and Fada high schools (Mechanics, Electro-technical, Electricals, Auto-Electricals and Agro-industry). Consequently, the objective to train young technicians was not achieved. The contract for the completion of the electrification of the Ouahigouya vocational secondary school was signed on 22 April 2009 and notified on 6 May 2009. The signing of the contract for the Fada N'Gourma vocational secondary school was authorized on 18 March 2009 by the Minister of Economy and Finance. The works will thus be funded by the Burkinabe government. Furthermore, six F2 (industrial technology) teachers instead of the five initially planned underwent training abroad.

Support to Training of Young Rural Farmers

4.1.6 All the training under this component has taken place. Seven hundred and ninety-three young farmers out of the 800 planned underwent the short-term training organised in the CPRs. The two-year long-term training organised according to the new 12-month programme drawn up by the Ministry of Agriculture was organised for 297 youths from the Bissiri and PK 60 CPRs. The number of youth to be trained was pared down from 950 to 450 to take into account the need to equip all the outgoing ones.

4.1.7 For several reasons, and following Bank approval, the PK 60 CPR was replaced by that of Ougarou. The Bissiri CPR construction works carried out by COPIAFAX were beset with problems similar to those of the CPAFs, for which COPIAFAX was also the contractor. Following the termination of the firm's contract, the works were entrusted to EKDI. The

works have now been completed and handed over. The furniture of this CPR was put into storage at the Kombisiri Provincial Directorate of Agriculture and Water Resources, for delivery upon final acceptance of the works. Regarding the rider to the contract on the water supply works for the two CPRs, owing to inadequate ADF funds, Bank approval was not obtained. The Bank requested the Government to provide the project with a budget extension. The execution rate of this component is 95%.

Strengthening of Women's Education

4.1.8 The Niassan production centre, earmarked by the project for transformation into a CPR, received alternative financing, and the Bapla production centre was proposed instead for transformation into a CPR for young girls. However, the works have still not been completed, following termination of the contract after default by DIPAMA et Freres (EDF). As at the time of this completion mission, works are still incomplete. However, the furniture for the Bapla CPR has been received and delivered.

4.1.9 The implementation rate of this component currently stands at 77%. The buildings and equipment have not been entirely completed. At completion, the 100 CPAFs planned by the project had not entirely been completed, with the works at the excavation, foundation and chaining stages, as the case may be. The two contracts were awarded to COPIAFAX (70% of the CPAFs) and to EZIF (30%). Following default by the firms selected, the contracts were terminated. Reimbursement of the amounts paid to the firms is in process, following unsuccessful international competitive bidding. The Bank has given approval for national competitive bidding. The Bank approved the proposals for the award of lots subject to financing from Government resources. Up until the closing of the loan, none of the CPAFs had been completed. The furniture procured and distributed in the villages to host the CPAFs is used for the literacy activities planned and other purposes as well.

4.1.10 The project was to have trained 2,000 young girls in agro-pastoral skills and provide literacy training for 40,000 women. On completion, it was noted that only 266 producers, including 135 women, had undergone short-term training in the following areas: farming and market-gardening, 89 (including 47 women), livestock farming, 89 (including 31 women), handicrafts and other income-generating activities (32 women) and cooperatives, 57, (including 25 women). In addition, 270 young girls underwent long-term training. The literacy programme trained only 7,257 out of the 40,000 planned at appraisal.

4.1.11 Project Management: The equipment, furniture and training planned for the PIO have all been procured. To date, this component has been executed at a rate of 120%, following the approval of the four extensions made to the final disbursement deadline.

4.2 Institutional Performance

4.2.1 Compared to the situation at appraisal, the borrower's institutional performance saw significant improvement. The analysis made of the problems identified in the formal and informal sectors at the time of project preparation and appraisal proved to be relevant. The project addressed these constraints by building primary school classrooms, two vocational schools, 10 laboratories, 15 computer labs, and two CPRs for men and two for women. The project further provided training for teachers and staff of MEBA and MESSRS, as well as to school principals, and literacy programme facilitators. It also provided the facilities with equipment and furniture.

4.2.4 The procurement of vehicles for the regional directorates of MEBA facilitated supervision activities and improved the quality of inspection. Computer training helped improve report presentation. Inspectors are now better organised and work more efficiently. Particularly, the management skills of Ministry Education staff were upgraded in line with the design criteria of the project.

4.2.5 At appraisal, the absorption capacity of the system was limited. In 1995, 705,925 children were enrolled in primary school, compared to 1,742,439 in 2008. The number of learners and teachers has been increasing. In 2008, the teacher-pupil ratio was 57:1. Although the system is under intense population pressure, the construction of the 25 school complexes providing 3,300 places has contributed to improving access to education.

4.2.6 Since the project started, developments in the sub-sector have largely been in line with the project's outputs. The long-term strategic objective of the educational system is to enrol every child in the country, teach as many adults as possible to read and write, and train rural youths to significantly increase agro-pastoral yields. This explains the focus on basic knowledge acquisition, with increasing emphasis on the sciences and practical disciplines in secondary schools. With regard to the facilities, the newly built classrooms in these deprived areas constitute a step in the right direction to offer equal opportunity in education. The additional facilities built will also alleviate problems with the in-take capacity.

4.2.7 Although the 100 CPAFs were not built, the project did tackle the problem of illiteracy among women in the provinces in question. In all, 7,257 women underwent functional literacy training. Illiteracy rate among women dropped from 88% in 1996 to 79.8% in 2007. For agricultural training, the numbers expected were not achieved, as the Bapla CPR had not been completed.

4.2.8 The logistics provided under the project contributed to building the capacities of the PIO, the research and planning departments of the Education Ministries and the regional education directorates for basic education and literacy. The logistics included vehicles, computer equipment and laboratory equipment. The project is fully integrated into the country's educational system and is generally working to achieve the strategic objective of facilitating access to quality at all levels of the educational system, with a view to empowering the people to foster socio-economic development.

4.3 Management and Organisational Efficiency

4.3.1 One of the conditions precedent to loan effectiveness was to renew the appointments of the staff of the PIO and detach it from the DEP of the MESSRS, making it an autonomous unit attached to the General Secretariat of this Ministry. Another condition was to create a PIU within the Ministry of Agriculture and Animal Resources, which would emanate from the young farmers' training project (the country's first education project). The 10-member PIO team remained until the end of the project. The PIU was set up as planned, and comprised 11 persons. These units had to maintain functional relations for the execution of the activities assigned them. In addition to these management units, a coordination committee was set up and comprised the representatives of the ministries concerned by the project. According to the investigations of the PCR mission, the committee functioned normally and met regularly. It was however unable to resolve the institutional problems between the PIU and the PIO, as outlined below.

4.3.2 During the project implementation, the parallelism between the PIO and the PIU was over-pronounced leading to hints of dual leadership practices that were not in line with the indivisibility of project management, since the decree governing the two implementation units, were not backed by implementing decrees giving precise instructions on their respective scopes of power. These dual leadership issues were the main cause of the delays in the implement of some activities such as the construction of the 100 CPAFs and supervision of the construction and training activities of the CPRs. A specialist in agricultural training and another in functional literacy should have been recruited for the PIO, to be responsible essentially for the training component of young rural farmers and women's education strengthening, rather than a PIU, which would eventually impede the achievement of the specific objectives for informal training.

4.4 Staff Upgrading, Training and Retraining

4.4.1 The refresher courses organised for primary school teachers (3,165 confirmed teachers, including 1,747 trainees) contributed to improving the quality of teaching by affording teachers new teaching techniques and methods.

4.4.2 Ninety teachers, including 13 women received additional training in life and earth sciences and physics, instead of 20, as initially planned by the project. This far exceeds the estimates at appraisal. The 10 laboratory assistants recruited by MESSRS underwent theoretical and practical training as planned. Three instead of five technicians were trained abroad in computer equipment maintenance and 150 workers from the 15 beneficiary secondary schools (teaching and administrative staff) were trained in office automation. The entire staff is at post and is contributing to the improvement of the quality of education.

4.4.3 Under the project, 102 literacy centre facilitators and 52 supervisors were retrained in the five provinces concerned. They conducted literacy campaigns involving 7,257 people. The staff is available to assist FONAENF in future campaigns. These literacy campaigns contributed to the drop in the illiteracy rate from 88% in 1996 to 79.8% in 2007.

4.4.4 The project further helped to train various categories of workers, who acquired new skills and built on old ones. These workers include Project Implementation Office staff, who were trained in the use of the Procedures Manual, the accounting plan and a management software.

4.5 Performance of Consultants

4.5.1 In all, 12 contracts were signed for the engineering designs, and monitoring and supervision of the works. The engineering designs for the design, monitoring and supervision of the school construction works (school complexes, vocational schools, laboratories, computer labs and CPRs) were carried out by three national engineering firms.

4.5.2 The site visits revealed some errors made in the design of the working surface, laboratory jars and gas installations. The kitchen of the school complex also had problems with smoke expulsion. The gas installations in the laboratories do not work and do not even meet security standards (water pipes and taps in place of gas materials). The tanks of the laboratory working surfaces are inappropriate and not in line with security standards. Wash basins with PVC evacuation pipes were installed instead of the appropriate tanks and evacuation pipes for this type of installation, which is subject to degradation because of the reagents and other chemicals.

4.5.3 The project managers chose the wrong finishing materials, namely: false ceiling, cupboard doors and shelves in plywood, which are now infested with termites. Most of the door and window locks of the classrooms and latrines are inappropriate and of poor quality. The premature degradation of some of the facilities visited is a clear indication of the poor choice of materials used. This undermines the sustainability of the project's outputs. The maintenance costs for these facilities are bound to be very high.

4.5.4 The surfaces of some of the facilities (computer and science laboratories etc.) are well below the standards set in the appraisal report, giving rise to complaints from students and teachers, who are compelled to divide the class into several groups for lessons and practicals, because of the high class numbers.

4.5.5 The performance of the three consulting firms was deemed satisfactory by the Government, despite some errors and omissions during the design phase and a few problems noted during the monitoring and supervision of works, namely, long delays (23 months) while some of the works are still incomplete (Bapla CPR and the electrical installations for the Ouahigouya vocational school). Based on these problems and observations, the performance of the three consulting firms was deemed unsatisfactory.

4.5.6 A national engineering firm installed and supervised the productive boreholes. Some of these boreholes became unproductive because the underground water-table dried up fast; others dried up during the dry season, when there was no water, and operated only during the rainy season when the level of the water table rose. At other sites, the boreholes were not operating because the solar energy pumps installed had broken down and were awaiting maintenance and/or repair. The performance of the engineering firm was deemed satisfactory on the whole by Government, because the boreholes were installed.

4.5.7 Five individual consultants monitored the construction works of the 100 CPAFs. Each consultant had a geographical lot with a number sites varying between 10 and 30 CPAFs. Local laterite stone was to be used for the construction of the CPAFs, but was not available at several of the sites. Changes therefore had to be authorised during the project implementation; however, none of the CPAFs was completed and the performance of the five individual consultants was therefore deemed unsatisfactory.

4.5.8 The performance of the national consultants involved in the project's training activities was deemed satisfactory on the whole.

4.6 Performance of Contractors

4.6.1 The school construction programme had earmarked the construction of 25 school complexes, 10 laboratories, 15 computer laboratories, the extension of one secondary technical school, the construction of two vocational schools and one CPR, the rehabilitation of two other CPRs and the construction of 100 CPAFs.

4.6.2 Sixty contracts were signed with 34 contractors for the execution of these works. Only 12 of these (i.e., 20% of the total) complied with the contractual deadlines; 39 contractors (i.e., 65% of the total) failed to meet the deadline; seven contracts (i.e., about 12% of the total contracts signed) were terminated and two contracts (about 3% of the total) were not completed. The works under these 60 contracts were greatly delayed by one to 45 months, owing to the poor logistical capacity of the companies, which could not cope with the long distances between the sites.

4.6.3 Some of the contractors, namely, COPIAFAX, EZIF, EIEF, SAEL and EDF performed rather poorly, with an implementation rate of 8 to 87% at most.

4.6.4 The quality of work performed by the contractors was deemed satisfactory on the whole by Government, despite problems with planning, technical supervision, finishing, and the logistical and financial capacity. The quality of works could have been better, had the companies had the logistics and qualified personnel needed to ensure better monitoring and supervision of the works, as well as a solid financial base. Owing to the significant delays, the contractors' performance is considered unsatisfactory.

4.7 Performance of Suppliers

4.7.1 For the procurement of furniture for the project, the PIO signed nine contracts with six different suppliers; and for the procurement of equipment, 42 contracts were signed with 25 companies and two Regional Directorates (Centre/South and East) of the MAHRH (for supply of inputs for the Bissiri and PK 60 CPRs).

4.7.2 Some suppliers did not complete their services. For instance, heavy equipment for the vocational school workshops had still not been installed even after final acceptance. The tables for the computer labs, for example, are too low for the chairs, while those for the computer labs of the secondary technical school are too large for the room.

4.7.3 The school furniture and equipment were supplied even before completion of the construction of the classrooms, laboratories and literacy centres. The quality of the furniture for the classrooms and literacy centres could have been better, had the technical requirements and bid specifications been more precise and stringent in terms of quality.

4.7.4 The specifications for the supply of some laboratory equipment should have included delivery, as well as a small stock of spare parts for the maintenance of the equipment, which was not available on the local market. The performance of the six furniture suppliers was deemed satisfactory on the whole, as they were able to meet delivery deadlines. The performance of the 25 equipment suppliers was equally deemed satisfactory.

4.7.5 The school manual suppliers had no difficulty in meeting the contract obligations because they had the copyright and authorisations from the publishers of the manuals. The performance was deemed satisfactory on the whole.

V. SOCIAL AND ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT

5.1 Social Impact

5.1.1 Despite the difficulties in implementation, the project had a positive impact on the educational system, as attested by the Burkinabe children's increased access to quality primary education. The numbers have been on the rise in the regions targeted by the project. At appraisal, the Seno and Poni provinces had GER (gross enrolment ratios) of 12% and 22% respectively. At the time of this report, the GER had reached 45.1% (girls 43.9) and 73.1 (girls 69.1). At the same time, for the two provinces concerned by the schooling complex construction components, these ratios represented 71.8% (with 71.4 for girls) and 90.4% (89.3 for girls). However the net enrolment ratios are 37.9 for Seno and 61.2% for Poni. At the national level, primary school GER went from 38% for 1995/1996 to 85.7% for 20007/2008. The national GER for girls is 81.7%.

5.1.2 For the first cycle of secondary schooling, the national GER rose from 10% in 1994/1995 to 20.3% in 2004/2005, edging up to 22.9% in 2006/2007. For the second cycle, the GER was 80% for 2004/06 and 9.3% for 2006/07. This shows that the construction and rehabilitation works under Components I and II largely contributed to improving education access by increasing the gross enrolment rates, especially for girls, in the two most educationally deprived provinces. This significant social impact helps in developing responsible and better educated human resources for the country's growth. Moreover, the supply of teaching materials, teacher in-service training, and the remarkable improvement in teaching conditions have all had a positive impact on the quality of teaching. The repetition rate in primary schools also reduced from 13% in 2003 to 12% in 2005/2006, compared to 18.8% in 2000/2001 and 20% in 1994/1995. Villages that had no classrooms now have them.

5.1.3 Education IV Project has helped to raise awareness about the need to send girls to school. Overall, the project has contributed to increasing girls' enrolment rate in the project areas, as stated above. Furthermore, the latrines built in the schools have enabled girls to attend school without any fears about toilet facilities. Many of these girls have also acquired new skills to help them participate effectively in the country's development process. As future mothers also, they are better armed to monitor the basic education and health of their children. They are more capable of undertaking income-generating activities and thereby contributing to the fight against poverty.

5.1.4 In terms of enrolment, the project helped to train 7,716 learners, including 5,837 women, 108 facilitators and 52 supervisors. These adults acquired reading, writing and numeracy skills to help them manage their economic activities and get integrated into modern economy. The training of young rural farmers in crop and livestock farming and the cottage industry at the rural promotion centres helped provide the country with young farmers, with skills in modern production techniques. The immediate impact is the contribution to the fight against poverty in the rural areas through the reduction of food insecurity among vulnerable groups. The fact that most of the contracts were won by Burkinabe firms is a boost to the national economy.

5.2 Environmental Impact

5.2.1 Classified as Category II at appraisal, the project was expected to have very little or hardly any adverse impact on the environment, which was indeed the case. The measures planned at appraisal included: (i) construction of school facilities (classrooms, laboratories, etc.) that met the requisite hygiene and sanitation standards for the physical features of the sites selected; (ii) techniques to prevent erosion, gullyng and rainwater stagnation; and (iii) laboratory waste taken into account when building a water treatment system by lagooning, based on the quantity of the drainage effluents.

5.2.2 These instructions were generally adhered to, but in some cases, the recommended standards were not met. For instance, the treatment system by lagooning for laboratory waste could be improved. On the whole, the project contributed to improving the environment around the schools.

VI. SUSTAINABILITY

6.1 Some of the school facilities have design problems, namely: the classrooms, science laboratory, computer laboratory and the school canteen. Several of the facilities are

encountering problems with water seepage from the rainwater evacuation channel. The classrooms are badly lit, with poor ventilation. The school canteens do not have interior chimneys, and smoke from the wood and charcoal ovens and stoves could lead to rapid deterioration of the facilities, endangering the lives of workers by causing respiratory problems and poisoning.

6.2 The gas installations in the laboratories do not work and do not even meet security standards (water pipes and taps in place of gas equipment). The tanks of the laboratory working surface are inappropriate and sub-standard. Wash basins with PVC evacuation pipes were installed instead of the appropriate tanks and evacuation pipes for this type of installation, which is subject to degradation because of the reagents and other chemicals. The project managers chose the wrong finishing materials, namely: false ceiling, cupboard doors and shelves in plywood, and door and window locks in the classrooms; and the latrines are inappropriate and of poor quality.

6.3 It was observed that, generally, the facilities built were deteriorating and aging fast; and particular care should be taken for future projects. Also, the dimensions and form of the locally manufactured furniture do not suit the various uses of the classrooms (practicals, and group work).

6.4 The facilities of the vocational schools are still not operational and this calls for urgent government intervention. The contract for completing the electrification works of the Ouahigouya vocational secondary school was signed on 22 April 2009 and notified on 6 May 2009; for Fada N’Gourma, the authorisation to sign the contract was given on 18 March 2009 by the Ministry of Economy and Finance. The unutilised and badly stored furniture at the CPAFs is not being put to its proper use. The number of students per classroom (normal and specialized) is over 50 in most cases; this contributes to rapid deterioration of the facilities. Moreover, the room size (classrooms, computer laboratories, science laboratories and literacy centres) is too small for the number of learners. This, of course, will affect the sustainability of the project.

6.5 On account of the above, measures should be taken to first and foremost ensure adherence to appropriate technical specifications and secondly, upgrade the maintenance system, by allocating an adequate budget for the activities planned. Furthermore, stakeholders such as NGOs, school heads and parents should be involved in the implementation; with the entire process decentralized, so as to ensure the sustainability of the investments (buildings, equipment and furnishing).

VII. PERFORMANCE OF BANK AND BORROWER

7.1 Bank Performance

7.1.1 In all, the Bank carried out 17 technical supervision missions (including one portfolio review) and one financial supervision mission for the project - an average of 1.7 supervisions per annum. The first mission took place in 1998 (before loan effectiveness), one in 1999, i.e., 24 months after the first supervision mission. The mid-term review mission did not take place. More regular supervision at the start of the project would have helped solve the problems concerning the establishment of the PIO and PIU. While the supervision missions were appropriate in terms of composition and duration, they failed to provide timely answers to the problems with the construction of the 100 CPAFs, the Bapla CPR, and installation of the

electrical system for the vocational schools. This made it impossible to operate the equipment of the technical and vocational workshops within the prescribed period. The signing of the relevant contracts on State resources will help to complete the electrification of the schools and start the training in mechanics, electro-technical, auto-electricals and agro-industry.

7.1.2 The Bank missions helped to find solutions to other technical implementation problems such as studies and supervision, construction of the schools, laboratories, computer labs, CPRs, bidding documents, status reports, and national counterpart funds. The Bank's interpretation of the priorities and problems of the sector and the project conditions was appropriate. At evaluation, the risks were analysed, the report processing phases followed, and the supervision reporting was in line with the requirements of the Operations Manual. The performance of the Bank is therefore deemed satisfactory.

7.2 Performance of Borrower

7.2.1 The Borrower took ten and half years to implement the project, whose implementation had been planned to cover four years. The Borrower encountered some difficulties which caused the delays in the execution of some components and inadequate supervision of some construction works, including the CPAFs, which are still uncompleted. All these problems have led to defects in the works, waterproofing problems in the false ceilings, the Tuy-hounde science laboratory not being connected to the water tower supply, etc. The Borrower did not take the necessary measures to ensure timely completion of the electrification of the vocational schools. This is necessary for operating the workshop equipment. This situation prevented the start of training activities of six new industrial sections of the Ouahigouya and Fada N'Gourma vocational secondary schools. As was stated in paragraph 4.1.5, the Government took measures to remedy the situation. Nonetheless, the Borrower's performance is still deemed unsatisfactory.

VIII. OVERALL PERFORMANCE AND RATING

The initial project objectives and activities were implemented overall. However, those relating to the construction of two vocational secondary schools, the 100 CPAFs and Bapla CPR were only partially achieved. For all these reasons, the project's implementation performance, as detailed at Annex 5, is unsatisfactory (1.8). However, the Bank's performance during the project cycle is satisfactory (2.5), while the rating for the impact on development, which is detailed at Annex 6, is satisfactory (2.93).

IX. CONCLUSION, LESSONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

9.1 Conclusion

9.1.1 Education IV Project, which aims at the construction of primary and secondary school facilities, the training of teachers and ministry staff and the training of young rural farmers and women's literacy education, had a positive impact in view of the outcomes obtained in relation to the objectives set at appraisal. The project helped to improve school conditions in the areas it covered and increase the number of pupils enrolled in the first year of primary school. Added to this, the increases in the gross enrolment ratios in the provinces concerned were from 12 and 22 for 1995/96 to 45.1 and 71.8% in 2007/08 respectively. The GER for the entire country went up from 38% in 95/96 to 81.7% in 2007/08. Furthermore, the project contributed to the further training of teachers, which, coupled with the supply of teaching material, helped improve the quality of primary and secondary education as well as technical and vocational education.

9.1.2 The design of the project effectively addressed the needs identified from the start. Its implementation helped to resolve key problems such as the lack of classrooms, science laboratories, computer rooms, low numbers of new enrolments and low enrolment ratios in the project areas and countrywide, lack of teaching material and inadequate school furniture experienced by the education systems of these provinces.

9.2 Lessons

In light of the observations outlined above, a number of lessons for future projects are presented below:

- (i) Assigning specific components to different ministries created monitoring and coordination difficulties between the PIO and the Departments concerned by the components;
- (ii) The creation of two coordinating units not integrated in the same ministry created dual leadership issues between the PIO of the Ministry of Education and the PIU of the Ministry of Agriculture and caused delays and poor supervision of the construction of the CPAFs, which were still uncompleted at the time of project completion;
- (iii) It would have been more appropriate to just strengthen the PIO with an agricultural training specialist rather than set up the PIU to manage the agricultural component of the project, and duplication and leadership issues between the two management units (PIO and PIU) would thus have been avoided;
- (iv) The dispersal of sites and multiplicity of components resulted in poor visibility of the project and difficulties in the construction of facilities assigned to contractors, who did not have adequate logistical capacity to complete the contracts obtained;
- (v) It would have been judicious to involve the village associations, international NGOs such as Aide et Action and Ecoles Sahel, as well as UNICEF, which have experience in community-based activities such as construction of small literacy rural outreach centres;
- (vi) The higher the ceiling for the revolving fund (RF) the greater the risks and the longer the delays in the replenishment of RF, often stemming from the lack of supporting documents and eligible expenditure;
- (vii) The projects with very huge components should be designed more realistically so as to avoid mitigated results such as literacy education for 7,257 women instead of the 40,000 envisaged at appraisal;
- (ix) In future, operations should be directed to fewer areas to allow for more effective monitoring;

- (x) For better design of operations, avoid including components that can be formulated into agricultural training projects into classic education projects; and
- (xi) The overoptimistic design of a project can generate unrealistic expectations, largely account for initial low disbursement rates.

9.3 Recommendations

In light of the implementation of this project, the following is recommended:

- (i) For future projects, take measures to ensure that operations are focused and components are better targeted to facilitate implementation and management and enhance project impact and visibility;
- (ii) Pursue and develop for future projects a policy of preventive maintenance of facilities and equipment; and
- (iii) Make provision for a revolving fund (RF) with a ceiling of between UA 150,000 and UA 200,000, so as to generate quarterly replenishments and thus avoid the accumulation of supporting documents, RF replenishment delays and other related problems.

B. For the Government:

- i) Complete, using the national counterpart funds: a) the electrification of the Ouahigouya and Fada N’Gourma vocational secondary schools so as to allow operation of the equipment required for the commencement of the training activities for the six new industrial courses; b) works for the 100 CPAF and Bapla CPR;
- ii) Ensure maintenance of school facilities, equipment and furniture by earmarking a budget and bringing all stakeholders on board in order to ensure sustainability;
- iii) Improve the prototype of schools to be built with precise technical specifications, including relevant instructions for consulting firms, in order to obtain proper sustainability, smooth operation and land reserves for future extensions;
- iv) Ensure that the technical specifications require that architects and contractors are better integrated into the communities where schools are located;
- v) in preparing technical specifications for locally-manufactured furniture, pay special attention to features that would guarantee its durability and take into account all local constraints so as to avoid rapid deterioration and increase the sustainability of project gains;
- vii) Submit to the Bank the project audit for FY 2007; and
- vii) Make provision for adequate goods or works allotments so as to avoid multiple contracts and extensions of deadlines for implementation of various components.

MAP OF BURKINA FASO EDUCATION IV PROJECT

COUNTRY MAP



This Map was provided by the African Development Bank exclusively for the use of the readers of the report to which it is attached. The names used and borders shown do not imply on the part of the Bank and its members any judgment concerning the legal status of a territory nor any approval or acceptance of these borders.

BURKINA FASO
EDUCATION IV PROJECT

SOURCES OF INFORMATION

1. Project Appraisal Report
2. Project Completion Report prepared by Government
3. Project quarterly status reports
4. Aide memoires and project supervision mission reports by the Bank
5. MEBA and MESSRS school statistics
6. Interviews with project implementers and beneficiaries.

BURKINA FASO

EDUCATION IV PROJECT

ESTIMATED AND ACTUAL COSTS BY CATEGORY OF EXPENDITURE

Estimated Costs by Categories of Expenditure (UA million)

Category	DESIGNATION	ADF	Gov.	TOTAL	% ADF
A.	Goods	7.33	0.18	7.51	97,6%
B.	Works	6.77	0.39	7.16	94,6%
C.	Services	0.92	0.12	1.04	88,5%
D.	Operating Costs	1.48	1.31	2.79	53,0%
TOTAL		16,50	2.00	18.50	89.2%
%		89.2%	10.8%	100.0%	

Actual Costs by Category of Expenditure (UA million)

Category	DESIGNATION	ADF	Gov.	TOTAL	% ADF
A.	Goods	7.33	0.51	7.84	93,5%
B.	Works	6.76	0.76	7.52	89,9%
C.	Services	0.92	0.13	1.05	87,6%
D.	Operating Costs	1.24	0.89	2.13	58,2%
TOTAL		16.25	2.29	18.54	87.6%
%		87.6%	12.4%	100.0%	

BURKINA FASO
EDUCATION IV PROJECT

Estimated and Actual Loan Disbursement Schedule

**Estimated Disbursement Schedule by Source of Financing
(UA Million)**

Year	ADF	Gov.	TOTAL	%
1997	2.61	0.20	2.81	15,2%
1998	3.51	0.40	3.91	21,1%
1999	6.21	0.67	6.88	37,2%
2000	3.85	0.55	4.40	23,8%
2001	0.32	0.18	0.50	2,7%
TOTAL	16.50	2.00	18.50	100,0%
%	89.2%	10.8%	100.0%	

**Actual Disbursement Schedule by Source of Financing
(UA million)**

Year	ADF	Gov.	TOTAL	%
1997			0.00	0.0%
1998			0.00	0.0%
1999	0.12	0.15	0.27	1.4%
2000	1.10	0.03	1.13	6.1%
2001	2.13	0.13	2.26	12.2%
2002	2.34	0.43	2.77	14.9%
2003	2.69	0.58	3.27	17.7%
2004	2.75	0.31	3.06	16.5%
2005	1.47	0.31	1.78	9.6%
2006	3.04	0.00	3.04	16.4%
2007	0.56	0.41	0.97	5.2%
2008	0.02	0.00	0.02	0.1%
TOTAL	16.22	2.34	18.56	100.3%
%	87.4%	12.6%	100.3%	

**BURKINA FASO: EDUCATION IV PROJECT
PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION AND BANK PERFORMANCE**

PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION PERFORMANCE

Component Indicators	Rating	Remarks
1. Adherence to General Time Schedule	1	The project became effective 15 months after signing. The slippage on the timetable was 6 and-a-half years. Nonetheless, the initial objectives were achieved upon completion.
2. Adherence to Cost Schedule	1	The cost of the CPAFs was underestimated
3. Compliance with Covenants	3	The loan conditions were fully met. The Borrower fulfilled the conditions precedent to loan effectiveness four months after signature of the loan.
4. Adequacy of Monitoring, Evaluation and Reporting	2	Project implementation was fraught with flaws in project implementation, designs, and site monitoring and control. Audits were nonetheless performed and quarterly status reports produced on time.
5. Satisfactory Operations	2	The project achieved its initially defined objectives and contributed to increased GER and quality education. However, the 100 CPAFs were not completed on time as well as the Bafla CPR and electrical installations for the two vocational schools needed for the development of the technical and industrial courses (the contract for the completion of Ouahigouya vocational secondary school electrification was signed on 22 April 2009 and communicated on 6 May 2009; and for the Fada N'Gourma school, the authorisation to sign the contract was issued on 18 March by the Minister of Economy and Finance).
TOTAL	9	
Overall Assessment of Implementation Performance	1.8	Unsatisfactory

BANK PERFORMANCE

Evaluation Criteria	Rating	Remarks
1. At Identification	1	The Bank did not participate in project identification
2. At Preparation	3	The Bank participated in the preparation of the project with UNESCO in March -April 1995
3. At Appraisal	3	The project was appraised in February 1997 by an ADF mission. The objectives identified were consistent with the Human Resource Development Plan and the Framework Law on Education as well as the Bank's sector policy. The activities selected were relevant. However, the components for the training of young farmers and strengthening of women's education could have been formulated into a specific project to be executed by the Ministry of Agriculture. Their inclusion created institutional leadership issues that adversely affected implementation as the implementation unit was external to the PIO. The construction costs of the CPAFs were underestimated.
4. At Supervision	3	In all, seventeen (17) technical supervision missions (including a portfolio review) and one financial supervision mission were fielded by the Bank during project implementation, (or on average 1.7 supervisions per year). Supervision was regular, but the problems with completion of the construction of CPAFs, the Bafla CPR and electrical installations for the vocational schools did not receive any special attention from the mission staff. The supervision reports were consistent with requirements, and the composition and duration of missions were generally satisfactory. Often, only one expert visited the project.
TOTAL	10	
Overall Assessment of Bank Performance	2.5	Satisfactory

**BURKINA FASO
EDUCATION IV PROJECT
IMPACT ON DEVELOPMENT**

Evaluation Criteria	Rating	Remarks
<u>Relevance and Achievement of Objectives</u>		
(i) Macro-economic Policy	N/A	
(ii) Sector Policy	3	The project's objectives were consistent with the country's Human Resource Development Programme and with the Bank's education sector policy.
(iii) Physical Outputs (including Production)	2	The outputs envisaged at appraisal were largely achieved, with the exception of the 100 CPAFs, the Bapla CPR and electrical installations for the Fada and Ouahigouya vocational schools.
(iv) Financial Aspect	3	The counterpart funds were paid regularly.
(v) Poverty Reduction, Social and Gender Impact	4	The project contributed to poverty reduction through the increased primary education GER and the development of scientific and secondary education. The GER for girls increased in the project area and a significant number of women underwent literacy education.
(vi) Environment	3	The school compounds are clean and the latrines contribute to the clean surroundings of the schools.
(vii) Private Sector Development	4	The project was beneficial to the national economy. The majority of suppliers and contractors were Burkinabe.
(viii) Other	N/A	
Sub-total	19	
2. Institutional Development		
(i) Institutional Framework, including Restructuring	3	The PIO staff were reassigned to Project V. However, the dual leadership issues created by the existence of the PIU hampered project implementation.
(ii) Financial and Management Information Systems (including Audit Systems)	3	The accounting and financial management system put in place was satisfactory for management of the project. Audits were performed. Some information needs to be clarified by the Bank.
(iii) Technology Transfer	4	The computer equipment procured enabled the students and staff of the education ministries to master current software. The statistical information system is efficient. The school map is computerised with integrated statistical data.
(iv) Staffing by qualified persons (including rotation), training and counterpart staff	3	The essential PIO staff is still at post. The capacity of teachers and laboratory and maintenance technicians has been strengthened through the training courses locally and abroad.
Sub-Total	13	
3. Sustainability		
Continued Borrower Commitment	2	If nothing is done to put in place a training policy for Parent Teacher Associations in preventive maintenance and servicing project outputs will not have a sustainable lifespan. Some of the facilities

Evaluation Criteria	Rating	Remarks
		are already in an advanced state of disrepair.
Environmental Policy	3	The policy of building improved latrines in the schools contribute to respect for the environment
Institutional Framework	3	MEN structures are being strengthened.
Technical Viability and Staffing	2	The viability of the facilities and equipment is compromised by the lack of maintenance programme and responsible institutions (highly inadequate role of departmental directorates) and by population pressure.
Financial Viability, including Cost Recovery Systems	3	Funds for maintenance and servicing made available to school principals, but this appears inadequate. Family and local community participation must be sought more effectively.
Economic Viability	N/A	
Continued Operation and Maintenance (availability of funds to cover recurrent costs, foreign exchange, spare parts, workshops, etc.)	2	The Government covers recurrent expenditure, but the funds appear insufficient due to the extent of construction defects.
Sub-Total	15	
4. Economic Internal Rate of Return	N/A	
TOTAL	47	
Overall Assessment of Outcome	2.93	Satisfactory

BURKINA FASO
EDUCATION IV PROJECT
MATRIX OF RECOMMENDATIONS AND FOLLOW-UP ACTIONS

Main Findings/Conclusion	Recommendations	Follow-up Actions	Responsibility
<p><u>Formulation & Project Rationale</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Component, Training of Young Rural Farmers, should not have been included in the project. • The dispersal of construction sites posed problems for the contractors and engineering firms. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Avoid including components that could be formulated into agricultural training projects into classic education projects for better design of operations. <p>In future, direct operations to fewer areas to allow for more effective monitoring.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • During the preparation of other projects, it would be judicious for the Bank to avoid such projects. <p>The Government must opt for the development of adjoining regions in order to avoid the dispersal of project sites.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Bank</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Government</p>
<p><u>Project Implementation</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The construction of 100 CPAFs is not completed, as is also the case for the Bapla CPR and the electrical installations for the vocational schools. • The classrooms are poorly lit, with a defective ventilation system, etc. • The facilities built are fast falling into disrepair • Poor choice of building materials by contractors. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Make the necessary arrangements for the completion, in 2009, of the facilities required for non-formal training and the development of the technical and industrial courses. • Improve the prototype of schools to be built with precise technical specifications. • During preparation of technical specifications ensure that there is greater sustainability and consideration of all local constraints. • Take necessary measures to ensure that technical specifications require from architects and contractors that they are better integrated into the communities where schools are located. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Government should finance from its own resources the completion of the 100 CPAFs, the Bapla CPR and the electrical installations for the vocational schools. • Process documents received at the Bank for no objection, and during supervision missions the Bank should ensure rigorous compliance with recommendations. • Idem • Idem 	<p style="text-align: center;">Government</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Government/Bank</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Government/Bank</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Government/Bank</p>
<p><u>Compliance with Loan Conditions and Covenants</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Completion of the audit for FY 2007 still pending. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Perform audit for FY 2007. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ask Government to conduct overdue audit. 	<p style="text-align: center;">Government</p>
<p><u>Performance Evaluation and Project Outcomes</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The construction works are completed with the exception of the 100 CPAFs, the Bapla CPR and the electrical installations of the vocational schools 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complete activities pending at closing of loan, with counterpart funds. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Government must submit to the Bank to a final report on the implementation of works on facilities that are yet to be completed. 	<p style="text-align: center;">Government/Bank</p>

<u>Sustainability</u>			
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The buildings have been constructed, but there are problems with the finishing. Maintenance is not adequately ensured by parents and the Government.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Put in place an efficient system and mechanism to ensure the maintenance and sustainability of the facilities acquired and the equipment.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Discuss the issue with the Government during project preparation missions.	Government

DISBURSEMENT SCHEDULE FOR PROJECT REVOLVING FUND

DATE	ORDER N°	CONTRACTOR'S NAME	REQUEST N°	PAYMENT		AMOUNT (in UA)
				F.E.	AMOUNT	
27/04/1999	RF N° 1	Revolving Fund				122 492,77
12/03/2001	RF N° 2	Revolving Fund	F/BFA/2001/0418	€uro	154 249,27	110 369,62
04/09/2001	RF N° 3	Revolving Fund	F/BFA/2001/1562	€uro	555 788,80	395 109,59
09/04/2002	RF N° 4	Revolving Fund	1/F/BF/2002/05105	JPY	48 334 697,00	291 332,58
26/09/2002	RF N° 5	Revolving Fund	1/F/BF/2002/07431	JPY	62 307 593,00	385 259,25
06/06/2003	RF N° 6	Revolving Fund	1/F/BF/2003/10684	JPY	87 699 613,00	521 555,83
26/04/2004	RF N° 7	Revolving Fund	1/F/BF/2003/14472	JPY	91 356 839,00	579 837,26
22/06/2005	RF N° 8	Revolving Fund	1/F/BF/2003/14472	€uro	268 119,35	221 716,34
<u>TOTAL</u>						<u>2 627 673,24</u>

ESTIMATED AND ACTUAL ANNUAL DISBURSEMENT OF ADF AND COUNTERPART FUNDS

Estimated Expenditure Schedule (UA million)

Year	ADF	Gov.	TOTAL	%
1997	2.61	0.20	2.81	<i>15.2%</i>
1998	3.51	0.40	3.91	<i>21.1%</i>
1999	6.21	0.67	6.88	<i>37.2%</i>
2000	3.85	0.55	4.40	<i>23.8%</i>
2001	0.32	0.18	0.50	<i>2.7%</i>
TOTAL	16.50	2.00	18.50	100.0%
%	89.2%	10.8%	100.0%	

Actual Project Expenditure/Year (UA million)

Year	ADF	Gov.	TOTAL	%
1997			0.00	<i>0.0%</i>
1998			0.00	<i>0.0%</i>
1999	0.12	0.15	0.27	<i>1.4%</i>
2000	1.10	0.03	1.13	<i>6.1%</i>
2001	2.13	0.13	2.26	<i>12.2%</i>
2002	2.34	0.43	2.77	<i>14.9%</i>
2003	2.69	0.58	3.27	<i>17.6%</i>
2004	2.75	0.31	3.06	<i>16.5%</i>
2005	1.47	0.31	1.78	<i>9.6%</i>
2006	3.04	0.00	3.04	<i>16.4%</i>
2007	0.56	0.41	0.97	<i>5.2%</i>
2008	0.02	0.00	0.02	<i>0.1%</i>
TOTAL	16.22	2.34	18.56	100.0%
%	87.4%	12.6%	100.0%	

LIST OF KEY CONTRACTS

CONTRACTORS/SUPPLIERS

		Slippage	:	7 months and 7 days
Contract	:	N° 125/2002/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE / PIU		
Name	:	E S S M F		
Type	:	CPAF furniture		
Signature Date	:	8/07/2002		
Amount	:	CFAF 53 002 844 excl. taxes & duties		
Estimated Duration	:	3 months		
Commencement Date	:	6/09/2002		
Completion Date	:	Final acceptance on 06/3/2004		
Actual Duration	:	5 months		
Slippage	:	2 months		
Contract	:	N° 2006/055/MFB/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB		
Name	:	Alpha Diffusion		
Type	:	Supply of LPF and LPO furniture		
Signature Date	:	02/3/2006		
Amount	:	CFAF 99 365 986		
Estimated Duration	:	4 months		
Commencement Date	:	01/4/2006		
Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 20/03/07		
Actual Duration	:	10 months 20 days		
Reason	:	Delayed payment of mobilisation fee		
Contract	:	N° 88/2001/MEF/MESSRS/PE IV/ADB		
Name	:	CICA-B		
Type	:	Supply of 23 vehicles		
Signature Date	:	21/05/01		
Amount	:	CFAF 485 654 340 excl. taxes & duties		
Estimated Duration	:	2 months		
Commencement Date	:	11/06/01		
Completion Date	:	Accepted on 21/06/01		
Actual Duration	:	10 days (the vehicles were already in stock)		
Contract	:	N° 174/2001/MEF/MESSRS BEPE IV/ADB		
Name	:	CGE		
Type	:	Supply of LTO material and equipment		
Signature Date	:	7/10/2001		
Amount	:	CFAF 204 947 799 excl. taxes & duties		
Estimated Duration	:	6 weeks		
Commencement Date	:	15/11/2001		
Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 4/09/2002		
Actual Duration	:	9 months 21 days		
Contract	:	N° n°02/2003/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB		
Name	:	Pierron Entreprise		
Type	:	Supplies and equipment for 15 computer rooms		
Signature Date	:	26/12/2002		
Amount	:	CFAF 188 199 663 excl. taxes & duties		
Estimated Duration	:	89 days		
Commencement Date	:	08/01/2003		
Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 16/4/2004		
Actual Duration	:	13 months 8 days		
Contract	:	N° 14/2003/MFB/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB		
Name	:	Pierron Entreprise		
Type	:	Supplies and equipment for 15 computer rooms (lot 2)		
Signature Date	:	27/01/03		
Amount	:	CFAF 178 340 663 excl. taxes & duties		
Estimated Duration	:	89 days		
Commencement Date	:	06/02/2003		
Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 16/4/2004		
Actual Duration	:	14 months 10 days		
Slippage	:	11 months 11 days		
Contract	:	N° 161/2003/MFB/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB		
Name	:	CGE 01 BP 1 337 Ouagadougou 01		
Type	:	Supply of equipment for PK 60 and Bissiri CPR		
Signature Date	:	21/08/2003		
Amount	:	CFAF 238 491 750 excl. taxes & duties		
Estimated Duration	:	6 weeks		
Commencement Date	:	30/10/03		
Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 06/10/2004		
Actual Duration	:	11 months 6 days		
Slippage	:	9 months 6 days		
Contract	:	N° 204/2003/MFB/MESSRS/SG/BEPE/PIU		
Name	:	COGEFA		
Type	:	Supply of equipment for the 3 CPR, as well as for the 304 youths, the 2nd batch CPR graduates		
Signature Date	:	28/11/03		
Amount	:	CFAF 75 413 660 excl. taxes & duties		
Estimated Duration	:	2 months		
Commencement Date	:	10/3/04		
Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 06/10/2004		
Actual Duration	:	7 months		
Slippage	:	5 months		

LIST OF KEY CONTRACTS

Reason : See PIU

Contract : N° 001/2004/MFB/MESSRS BEPE IV/ADB
Name : ALPHA DIFFUSION
Type : Supply, installation and commissioning of computer room equipment and materials
Signature Date : 30/12/2003
Amount : CFAF 140 934 405 excl. taxes & duties
Estimated Duration : 90 days
Commencement Date : 02/01/2004
Completion Date : Provisional acceptance on 02/7/04
Actual Duration : 6 months
Slippage : 3 months

Contract : N° 279/2005/MFB/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB
Name : Pierron Education
Type : Supply, installation and commissioning of various equipment for vocational schools (Lots 1&2)
Signature Date : 06/10/05
Amount : CFAF 332 066 246 excl. taxes & duties
Estimated Duration : 150 days
Commencement Date : 22/11/2005
Completion Date : Provisional acceptance on 18/04/2007
Actual Duration : 16 months 26 days
Slippage : 11 months 26 days
Reason : The contractor did not install or commission the equipment, which was delivered very late

Contract : N° 2006/054/MFB/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB
Name : Alpha Diffusion
Type : Supply and installation of computer and audio equipment for LPOs and LPFs
Signature Date : 02/3/2006
Amount : CFAF 216 051 565 excl. taxes & duties
Estimated Duration : 4 months
Commencement Date : 01/4/2006
Completion Date : Accepted on 20/03/07
Actual Duration : 11 months 20 days
Slippage : 7 months 20 days

WORKS

Contract : N°128/2000/MEF/MESSRS/ PE IV/ADB
Name : EBOMAF
Type : Construction of Kongoussi, Djibo, Bousseé and Gourcy laboratories
Signature Date : 31/07/2000
Amount : CFAF 179 159 205 excl. taxes & duties
Estimated Duration : 5 months
Commencement Date : 21/08/2000
Completion Date : Provisional acceptance on 4/05/2002
Actual Duration : 20 months 13 days
Slippage : 15 months 13 days
Reason : Financial incapacity of contractor. Can only continue works upon receipt of payments by the Bank

Contract : N°129/2000/MEF/MESSRS/PE IV/ADB
Name : Burkina Ouvrages
Type : Construction of Marien Gouabi, Saaba and Houndé laboratories
Signature Date : 31/07/2000
Amount : CFAF 144 632 037 excl. taxes & duties
Estimated Duration : 5 months
Commencement Date : 21/08/2000
Completion Date : Provisional acceptance on 20/06/2002
Actual Duration : 22 months
Slippage : 17 months
Reason : Financial incapacity of contractor. Can only continue works upon receipt of payments by the Bank

Contract : N°134/2000/MEF/MESSRS/PE IV/ADB
Name : ESOF
Type : Construction of Boulsa, Bogandé and Tenkodogo laboratories
Signature Date : 2/08/2000
Amount : CFAF 144 455 787 excl. taxes & duties
Estimated Duration : 5 months
Commencement Date : 21/09/2000
Completion Date : Provisional acceptance on 30/10/2003
Actual Duration : 37 months

Contract : N°136/2000/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB
Name : CWE

LIST OF KEY CONTRACTS

Type	:	Sinking of 27 productive boreholes with curb-stone and pumps	Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 13/03/2003
Signature Date	:	7/08/2000	Actual Duration	:	23 months
Amount	:	CFAF 134 416 738 excl. taxes & duties	Slippage	:	17 months
Estimated Duration	:	60 days	Reason	:	Supply difficulties and suspension due to rainy season
Commencement Date	:	12/03/2001	Contract Name	:	N°58-/2001/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB
Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 30/06/2002	Type	:	EBOMAF
Actual Duration	:	15 months	Signature Date	:	19/03/2001
Slippage	:	12 months	Amount	:	CFAF 175 847 876 excl. taxes & duties
Reason	:	Delay resulting from single borehole at Gangaol site, which was unproductive after several attempts	Estimated Duration	:	6 months
Contract Name	:	N°55/2001/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB	Commencement Date	:	12/04/2001
Type	:	Construction of Touka-Bayel, Tandakoye, Dambini, Boundoré, Garol-galolé and Batibougou school complexes (Lot n°1)	Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 4/06/2002
Signature Date	:	19/03/2001	Actual Duration	:	13 months
Amount	:	CFAF 178 930 971 excl. taxes & duties	Slippage	:	7 months
Estimated Duration	:	6 months	Reason	:	Suspension during rainy season and delay in resumption
Commencement Date	:	12/04/2001	Contract Name	:	N°59/2001/MEF/MESSRS/PE IV/ADB
Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 20/06/2003	Type	:	EIEF
Actual Duration	:	38 months	Signature Date	:	19/03/2001
Slippage	:	32 months	Amount	:	CFAF 154 462 912 excl. taxes & duties
Reason	:	Financial incapacity coupled with rainy season	Estimated Duration	:	6 months
Contract Name	:	N°56-2001/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB	Commencement Date	:	12/04/2001
Type	:	Construction of Gangaol, Lamdamaol, Kargoussi, Dandégou school complexes (Lot n°2)	Completion Date	:	Termination order signed on 12/04/2002, for inability to complete site
Signature Date	:	19/03/2001	Actual Duration	:	12 months
Amount	:	CFAF 160 488 526 excl. taxes & duties	Slippage	:	6 months
Estimated Duration	:	6 months	Contract Name	:	N°90/2001/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB
Commencement Date	:	12/04/2001	Type	:	CGE
Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 26/02/2002	Signature Date	:	21/05/01
Actual Duration	:	10 months	Amount	:	CFAF 34 551 432 excl. taxes & duties
Slippage	:	4 months	Estimated Duration	:	2.5 months
Reason	:	Delay due to rainy season	Commencement Date	:	11/06/01
Contract Name	:	N°57-2001/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB	Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 20/06/2002
Type	:	Construction of Kassita, Nambi, Kompi, Tampouor, Dakpole school complexes (Lot n°4)	Actual Duration	:	12 months
Signature Date	:	19 /03/2001	Slippage	:	9.5 months
Amount	:	CFAF 205 274 929 excl. taxes & duties	Reason	:	Delay stemming from late wall facing bricks order and student strike
Estimated Duration	:	6 months	Contract Name	:	N°89/20001//MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB
Commencement Date	:	12/04/01	Type	:	CGE

LIST OF KEY CONTRACTS

Type	:	Construction of LTO classrooms	Type	:	Construction of Bissiri CPR
Signature Date	:	21/05/01	Signature Date	:	11/04/2002
Amount	:	CFAF 68 955 960 excl. taxes & duties	Amount	:	CFAF120 433 473 excl. taxes & duties
Estimated Duration	:	4.5 months	Estimated Duration	:	4.5 months
Commencement Date	:	11/06/01	Commencement Date	:	1/10/2002
Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 18/05/2002	Completion Date	:	Terminated on 19/11/04
Actual Duration	:	11 months	Actual Duration	:	25 months 19 days
Slippage	:	6.5 months			
Reason	:	Delay stemming from late wall facing bricks order and student strike	Contract	:	N°064/2002/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB
			Name	:	E S J
			Type	:	Construction of Bissiri CPR
Contract	:	N°2006-120/MFB/MESSRS/BEPE/PIU	Signature Date	:	11/04/2002
Name	:	EKDI	Amount	:	CFAF188 988 837 excl. taxes & duties
Type	:	Completion of Bissiri CPR	Estimated Duration	:	4 months
Signature Date	:	08/05/06	Commencement Date	:	1/10/2002
Amount	:	CFAF80 924 248 excl. taxes & duties	Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 29/04/2005
Estimated Duration	:	4 months	Actual Duration	:	30 months
Reason	:	Lack of PIU archives	Slippage	:	26 months
			Contract	:	N°0065/2002/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB
			Name	:	ECHA
Contract	:	N°204/2001/MEF/MESSRS/SG/BEPE/PIU IV/ADB	Type	:	Construction of CPR
Name	:	COPIAFAX-BURKINA	Signature Date	:	11/04/2002
Type	:	Construction of 70 CPAFs	Amount	:	CFAF 121 019 973
Signature Date	:	26/11/2001	Estimated Duration	:	5 months
Amount	:	CFAF150 474 620 excl. taxes & duties	Commencement Date	:	1/10/2002
Estimated Duration	:	3 months	Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 15/02/05
Commencement Date	:	22/04/2002	Actual Duration	:	4 months 15 days
Completion Date	:	Terminated on 20/8/2004			
Actual Duration	:	28 months	Contract	:	N°183/2002/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB
Slippage	:	25 months (works uncompleted)	Name	:	SA EL
Reason	:	See PIU	Type	:	Construction of Ouahigouya vocational school; electricity (Lot B 5)
			Signature Date	:	7/10/2002
Contract	:	N°205/2001/MEF/MESSRS/SG/BEPE/PIU IV/ADB	Amount	:	CFAF188 416 213 excl. taxes & duties
Name	:	EZIF	Amendment n°1	:	CFAF 19 608 467 excl. taxes & duties
Type	:	Construction of 30 CPAFs	Total	:	CFAF 208 024 680 excl. taxes & duties
Signature Date	:	26/11/2001	Estimated Duration	:	12 months
Amount	:	CFAF 65 014 114 excl. taxes & duties	Commencement Date	:	25/11/2002
Estimated Duration	:	3 months	Completion Date	:	Contract terminated on 20/9/05
Commencement Date	:	22/04/2002	Actual Duration	:	34 months
Completion Date	:	Terminated on 20/8/2004	Slippage	:	22 months
Actual Duration	:	39 months			
Slippage	:	33 months (works uncompleted)	Contract	:	N°184/2002/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB
See PIU	:		Name	:	S C D
Contract	:	N°063/2002/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB			
Name	:	COPIAFAX			

LIST OF KEY CONTRACTS

Type	:	Construction of Ouahigouya vocational school (lot B1)	Type	:	Construction of Ouahigouya vocational school (lot B2)
Signature Date	:	7/10/2002	Signature Date	:	7/10/2002
Amount	:	CFAF 481 819 790 excl. taxes & duties	Amount	:	CFAF 186 241 952 excl. taxes & duties
Amendment n°1	:	CFAF 64 604 442 excl. taxes & duties	Amendment n°1	:	CFAF 15 874 447 excl. taxes & duties
Total	:	CFAF 546 424 232 excl. taxes & duties	Total	:	CFAF 202 116 399 excl. taxes & duties
Estimated Duration	:	8 months	Estimated Duration	:	10 months
Commencement Date	:	25/11/2002	Commencement Date	:	25/11/2002
Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 22/03/2005	Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 22/03/2005
Actual Duration	:	26 months	Actual Duration	:	28 months
Slippage	:	18 months	Slippage	:	18 months
Reason	:	Relocation of ADB leading to delayed payments, Amendment after remarks by MESSRS inspectors and initial underestimation of work quantities by consulting firm	Reason	:	Relocation of ADB leading to delayed payments, Amendment after remarks by MESSRS inspectors and initial underestimation of work quantities by consulting firm
Contract	:	N°185/2002/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB	Contract	:	N°188/2002/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB
Name	:	SA EL	Name	:	P.P.I.
Type	:	Construction of Fada vocational school (lot A5)	Type	:	Construction of six (06) water towers and two positive boreholes
Signature Date	:	7/10/2002	Signature Date	:	7/10/2002
Amount	:	CFAF177 821 524 excl. taxes & duties	Amount	:	CFAF 210 668 915 excl. taxes & duties
Amendment n°1	:	CFAF18 684 103 excl. taxes & duties	Estimated Duration	:	3 months
Total	:	CFAF 196 505 627 excl. taxes & duties	Commencement Date	:	25/11/2002
Estimated Duration	:	12 months	Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on30/06/2003
Commencement Date	:	25/11/2002	Actual Duration	:	7 months
Completion Date	:	Works accepted on 13 March 2007	Slippage	:	4 months
Actual Duration	:	52 months	Contract	:	N°189/2002/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB
Slippage	:	40 months	Name	:	VMAP
Reason	:	Financial incapacity of contractor	Type	:	Construction of Fada vocational school (Lot A4 – Wood and metal work
Contract	:	N°186/2002/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB	Signature Date	:	7/10/2002
Name	:	S C D	Amount	:	CFAF 59 055 089 excl. taxes & duties
Type	:	Construction of Ouahigouya vocational school (lot B3)	Amendment n°1	:	CFAF 8 251 711 excl. taxes & duties
Signature Date	:	7/10/2002	Total	:	CFAF 67 306 801 excl. taxes & duties
Amount	:	CFAF 479 475 625 excl. taxes & duties	Estimated Duration	:	5 months
Amendment n°1	:	CFAF 54 182 362 excl. taxes & duties	Commencement Date	:	25/11/2002
Total	:	CFAF 533 657 988 excl. taxes & duties	Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 28/7/05
Estimated Duration	:	10 months	Actual Duration	:	32 months
Commencement Date	:	25/11/2002	Slippage	:	27 months
Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 22/03/2005	Reason	:	Relocation of ADB leading to delayed payments, Amendment after remarks by MESSRS inspectors and initial underestimation of work quantities by consulting firm
Actual Duration	:	28 months	Contract	:	N°190/2002/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE
Slippage	:	18 months	Name	:	VMAP
Reason	:	Relocation of ADB leading to delayed payments, Amendment after remarks by MESSRS inspectors and initial underestimation of work quantities by consulting firm	Type	:	Construction of Ouahigouya vocational school (lot B4)
Contract	:	N°187/2002/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB	Contract	:	N°190/2002/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE
Name	:	S C D	Name	:	VMAP
			Type	:	Construction of Ouahigouya vocational school (lot B4)

LIST OF KEY CONTRACTS

Signature Date	:	Wood and metal work	Type	:	Construction Fada vocational school (lot A1)
Amount	:	7/10/2002	Signature Date	:	7/10/2002
Amendment n°1	:	CFAF 61 444 286 excl. taxes & duties	Amount	:	CFAF 354 827 830 excl. taxes & duties
Total	:	CFAF 8 385 108	Amendment n°1	:	CFAF 29 046 027 excl. taxes & duties
Estimated Duration	:	CFAF 69 829 394 excl. taxes & duties	Total	:	CFAF 383 873 857 excl. taxes & duties
Commencement Date	:	11 months	Estimated Duration	:	2 months
Completion Date	:	25/11/2002	Commencement Date	:	25/11/2002
Actual Duration	:	Provisional acceptance on 27/7/05	Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 28/7/05
Slippage	:	32 months	Actual Duration	:	4 months
Reason	:	21 months	Slippage	:	2 months
	:	Relocation of ADB leading to delayed payments,	Reason	:	Late response of water and forestry services
	:	Amendment after remarks by MESSRS inspectors and		:	for selection of plant species to be protected at earthworks
	:	initial underestimation of work quantities by consulting		:	site
	:	firm		:	
Contract	:	N°191/2002/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB	Contract	:	N°194/2002/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB
Name	:	B E G E P	Name	:	EBOMAF
Type	:	Construction of Fada vocational school - DWS (lot A6)	Type	:	Construction of Fada vocational school (lot A3)
Signature Date	:	7/10/2002	Signature Date	:	7/10/2002
Amount	:	CFAF 70 776 082 excl. taxes & duties	Amount	:	CFAF 372 634 488 excl. taxes & duties
Estimated Duration	:	10 months	Amendment n°1	:	CFAF 48 738 264 excl. taxes & duties
Commencement Date	:	25/11/2002	Total	:	CFAF 421 372 752 excl. taxes & duties
Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 12/8/05	Estimated Duration	:	10 months
Actual Duration	:	32 months	Commencement Date	:	25/11/2002
Slippage	:	22 months	Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 22/9/05
Reason	:	24 months	Actual Duration	:	34 months
	:	Relocation of ADB leading to delayed payments,	Slippage	:	24 months
	:	Amendment after remarks by MESSRS inspectors and	Reason	:	Relocation of ADB leading to delayed payments,
	:	initial underestimation of work quantities by consulting		:	Amendment after remarks by MESSRS inspectors and
	:	firm		:	initial underestimation of work quantities by consulting
	:			:	firm
Contract	:	N°192/2002/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB	Contract	:	N°206/2002/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB
Name	:	E C H A	Name	:	S.E.E.E - CI
Type	:	Construction of Fada vocational school (Lot A2)	Type	:	Construction of Ouahigouya vocational school – DWS (lot
Signature Date	:	7/10/2002		:	B6)
Amount	:	CFAF 319 556 775 excl. taxes & duties	Signature Date	:	17/10/2002
Amendment n°1	:	CFAF 10 725 623 excl. taxes & duties	Amount	:	CFAF 69 876 873 excl. taxes & duties
Total	:	330 282 388. excl. taxes & duties	Estimated Duration	:	12 months
Estimated Duration	:	7 months	Commencement Date	:	25/11/2002
Commencement Date	:	25/11/2002	Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 22/03/2005
Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 28/7/05	Actual Duration	:	28 months
Actual Duration	:	32 months	Slippage	:	16 months
Slippage	:	25 months	Reason	:	Relocation of ADB leading to delayed payments,
Reason	:	Relocation of ADB leading to delayed payments,		:	Amendment after remarks by MESSRS inspectors and
	:	Amendment after remarks by MESSRS inspectors and		:	initial underestimation of work quantities by consulting
	:	initial underestimation of work quantities by consulting		:	firm
	:	firm		:	
Contract	:	N°193/2002/MEF/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB		:	
Name	:	E C H A		:	

LIST OF KEY CONTRACTS

Contract	:	LC n°005/2003/MESSRS/SG/BEPE IV ADB	Contract	:	N°173/2003/MFB/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB
Name	:	ECMDY BP 102 Djibo	Name	:	Espace Afrique International
Type	:	Electrical connection works for Djibo secondary sch.	Type	:	Construction of Bakon, Gourma, Téhéni Sud, Bobéra and Poni school complexes
Signature Date	:	16/07/2003	Signature Date	:	01/10/2003
Amount	:	CFAF 982 284 CFAF excl. taxes & duties	Amount	:	CFAF 195 037 285 excl. taxes & duties
Estimated Duration	:	1 month	Estimated Duration	:	5 months
Commencement Date	:	31/07/2003	Commencement Date	:	24/11/2003
Completion Date	:	Final acceptance on 17/6/2005	Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 22/10/2004
Actual Duration	:	4 months	Actual Duration	:	11 months
Slippage	:	3 months	Slippage	:	6 months
Reason	:	Slow administrative processes of Sonabel concessionaire	Reason	:	Weak capacity of contractor and delay from rainy season
Contract	:	LC n°006/2003/MESSRS/SG/BEPE IV/ADB	Contract	:	N°207/2003/ MFB/MESSRS/ BEPE/CEPE
Name	:	Entreprise DELWENDE BP 70 Djibo	Name	:	EDF
Type	:	Water connection works for Djibo sec. school laboratory	Type	:	Construction Bapla CPR building
Signature Date	:	16/07/2003	Signature Date	:	28/11/2003
Amount	:	CFAF 933 887 excl. taxes & duties	Amount	:	CFAF 114 884 794 excl. taxes & duties
Estimated Duration	:	1 months	Estimated Duration	:	5 months
Commencement Date	:	31/07/2003	Commencement Date	:	26/01/2004
Completion Date	:	30/08/2003	Completion Date	:	Terminated on 06/12/2005
Actual Duration	:	1 month	Actual Duration	:	23 months
Slippage	:		Slippage	:	18 months
Contract	:	145/2003/MFB/MESSRS/SG/BEPE IV/ADB	Contract	:	N°2006-120/MFB/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB
Name	:	AL-KO INTERNATIONAL	Name	:	EKDI
Type	:	Repair and rehabilitation of PK 60 CPR – lot N°2	Type	:	Completion of Bissiri CPR
Signature Date	:	08/08/2003	Signature Date	:	8/5/06
Amount	:	68 856 096 CFAF excl. taxes & duties	Amount	:	80 924 248 CFAF excl. taxes & duties
Estimated Duration	:	4 months	Estimated Duration	:	4 months
Commencement Date	:	16/12/03	Commencement Date	:	20/5/2006
Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 21/9/2004	Completion Date	:	20/9/2006
Actual Duration	:	9 months	Actual Duration	:	4 months
Slippage	:	5 months		:	
Contract	:	N°146/2003/MFB/MESSRS/SG/BEPE IV/ADB	Contract	:	N°2007/119/MFB/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB
Name	:	PPI – BF 01 BP 2 306 Ouagadougou 01	Name	:	Général E-CO SARL
Type	:	Execution of water supply works and construction of Bissiri and PK 60 CPR generator room (Lot n°1)	Type	:	Supply and installation of roof windows and execution of supplementary works at Fada
Signature Date	:	08/08/2003	Signature Date	:	28/02/2007
Amount	:	CFAF 68 180 973 excl. taxes & duties	Amount	:	CFAF 50 907 068 excl. taxes & duties
Amendment n°1	:	CFAF 8 433 677 excl. taxes & duties	Estimated Duration	:	3 months
Total	:	CFAF 76 614 652 excl. taxes & duties	Commencement Date	:	2/5/2007
Estimated Duration	:	4 months	Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 25/7/2007
Commencement Date	:	16/12/03	Actual Duration	:	3 months
Completion Date	:	Provisional acceptance on 22/9/2004		:	
Actual Duration	:	9 months		:	
Slippage	:	5 months		:	
Reason	:	See PIU		:	

LIST OF KEY CONTRACTS

B.60	:	N° LC 19/2003/MESSRS/BEPE IV/ADB
Name	:	ESOF
Type	:	Water and electrical connection of Boulsa, Bogandé and Tenkodogo laboratories (regularisation)
Signature Date	:	18/12/2003
Amount	:	CFAF 1 839 498 excl. taxes & duties
Estimated Duration	:	2 months
Commencement Date	:	18/12/2003
Completion Date	:	Final acceptance on 09/12/2004
Actual Duration	:	12 months
Slippage	:	10 months
Reason	:	Slow administrative processes of ONEA and SONABEL concessionnaires and weak financial capacity of contractor

SERVICES

Contract	:	N°08/2000/MEF/MESSRS/PE IV/ADB
Name	:	AFRIQUE ARCHI
Type	:	Engineering design, assistance and works implementation supervision of Fada and Ouahigouya vocational schools
Signature Date	:	14 January 2001
Amount	:	CFAF 91 547 000 excl. taxes & duties
Estimated Duration	:	24 months (8 months for engineering designs and 16 months for works supervision)
Commencement Date	:	14/2/2000
Completion Date	:	Valid supervision contract. The SAEL contract was terminated on 13 March 2007 and the 2 nd contractor, SOGETEL, recruited could not continue work due to lack of financial resources caused by non-repayment of EP IV resources, retained to finance certain EP V activities
Slippage	:	60 months (uncompleted activity)
Reason	:	See explanation above
Actual Duration	:	7 months

Contract	:	CP N°2004/001/MEBA/MESSRS/PE IV/ADB
Name	:	FONAENF
Type	:	Women's literacy in Houet, Boulgou, Ganzourgou, Sanguié and Séno provinces
Signature Date	:	26/7/04
Amount	:	CFAF 50 159 061 excl. taxes & duties
Estimated Duration	:	6 months
Completion Date	:	Final report submitted on 15/3/2006