

PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT (PCR)

A. PROJECT DATA AND KEY DATES

I. BASIC INFORMATION

Project Reference P-CV-IAH-001	Project Name: Education Sector Institutional Support Project	Country : Republic of Cape Verde	
Lending Instrument (s) GRANT NUMBER: 2100155003168 of 11/10/2004		Sector EDUCATION	Environmental Category Category III
Original Commitment UA 1,000,000	Amount Cancelled UA 31,825.43	Amount Disbursed UA 968,174.57	% Disbursed 96.82 %
Borrower: Government of Cape Verde			
Executing Agency (ies) [List the main Ministries, Project Implementation Units, Agencies and civil society organisations responsible for implementing project activities.] Ministry of Education and Higher Education, Project Implementation Unit, Directorate General of Planning			
Co-financers and Other External Partners As co-financier, the Government disbursed UA 102,141.40 (representing 9.50% of the project cost instead of the estimated 5%).			

II. KEY DATES

Project Concept Note Approved by Ops. Com. N/A	Appraisal Report Approved by Ops. Com. N/A	Board Approval 29/09/2004
Restructuring(s)		

	Original Date	Actual Date	Difference in Months [Actual-Original Date]
EFFECTIVENESS	January 2005	17 August 2005	7
MID-TERM REVIEW	June 2006	17-26 January 2007	7
CLOSING	31 December 2008	30 June 2010	18

III. RATING SUMMARY

CRITERIA	SUB-CRITERIA	RATING
PROJECT OUTCOME	Achievement of Outputs	4
	Achievement of Outcomes	4
	Timeliness	3
	OVERALL PROJECT OUTCOME	3
BANK PERFORMANCE	Design and Readiness	3
	Supervision	3
	OVERALL BANK PERFORMANCE	3
BORROWER PERFORMANCE	Design and Readiness	3
	Implementation	4
	OVERALL BORROWER PERFORMANCE	3

IV. RESPONSIBLE BANK STAFF

POSITIONS	AT APPROVAL	AT COMPLETION
Regional Director	N/A	Mr. F. PERRAULT
Sector Director	Mrs. Z. EL BAKRI	Mr. B.SAVADOGO (OIC)
Sector Division Manager	Mr. N. SAFIR	Mr. B.SAVADOGO
Task Manager	Mrs. E. DIA	Mrs. R. TRAORE
PCR Team Leader		Mrs. TRAORE
PCR Team Members		Education Specialist (Consultant)

B. PROJECT CONTEXT

Summarize the rationale for Bank Assistance. State:

- what development challenge the project concerns,
- the Borrower's overall strategy for addressing it,
- Bank activities in this country (ies) and sector over the past year and how they performed, and
- ongoing Bank and other externally financed activities that complement, overlap with or relate to this project.

Please cite relevant sources. Comment on the strength and coherence of the rationale.

300 words maximum.

Any additional narrative about the project's origin and history, if needed, must be placed in Annex 6: Project Narrative

When the project was appraised, Cape Verde's education system was facing three major challenges. The first concerned the quantitative insufficiency, but especially the qualitative shortcomings of teachers and personnel responsible for school management, education monitoring and inspection. The second concerned the uneven distribution of infrastructure and educational resources as well as inadequate geographic equity. The third was a lack of institutional capacity to implement distance training as well as the weak technical capacity of the Educational Radio to disseminate messages to teachers. To address these challenges, the Government adopted the National Sector Development Strategy for the 2003-2012 period and the Education for All National Action Plan (EFA/NAP), the main objective of which is to address the quantitative insufficiency and qualitative shortcomings of teachers and personnel responsible for school management, education monitoring and inspection. This PAIES project, which is the fourth project financed by the Bank Group in the Education Sector is a continuation of the Bank's previous interventions (Education I: Institutional Support for the Education Project Study, the 2nd was the PRESE and the 3rd the EDU Project). The PAIES took into account the activities of the other partners which focused on primary and secondary school infrastructure and consequently on human resource development (one of the Government's priorities), by developing distance training through the use of NICT. The PAIES was the Bank's only project in the implementation phase in the Education Sector.

C. PROJECT OBJECTIVE AND LOGICAL FRAMEWORK

1. State the Project Development Objective (s) (as set out in the Appraisal Report)
<p>The project sector goal is to help improve the quality of integrated basic education through the training and strengthening of human resources involved in the education process.</p> <p>The specific objective is to improve the educational management and supervision framework, as well as the qualifications of basic education teachers in order to develop this sub-sector's human resources.</p>
2. Describe the <u>major</u> project components and indicate how each will contribute to achieving the Project Development Objectives
<p>The project concerns distance training through the use of new information and communication technologies. It comprises two components:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">(i) National Distance Training Capacity Building, and(ii) Project Management <p>Component I: Aims to build the capacity of national structures, which will be involved in the distance training process and enable them to create a distance-training system for teaching, administrative and educational inspection and supervision personnel. It also aims to provide the employment sector with a pool of better qualified and consequently more productive human resources. To achieve its objectives, this component is divided into four (4) sub-components as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">(a) <i>Sub-component I: Provision of Additional Equipment and Staff Training for the Educational Radio (ER) and Resource Centres (RC):</i><p>The purpose of this sub-component is to provide additional equipment for structures participating actively in the project and train and sensitize staff. This entails building the capacity of the ER to prepare and broadcast educational programmes and teaching aids for distance training;</p>(b) <i>Sub-component II: Sensitisation and training of national staff on distance training methodologies and content</i> permits sensitisation and training of staff of national structures involved in training on distance training methodologies and content;(c) <i>Sub-component III: Identification of training needs of the education sector and preparation of a distance training plan for teaching, administrative and educational supervision personnel: This sub-component aims to identify needs and prepare a distance training plan; and</i>(d) <i>Sub-component IV: Preparation of teaching aids and implementation of the distance training programme aimed at building the capacity of inspectors by preparing teaching aids.</i> <p>Component II: Project Management</p> <p>This component is mainly aimed at supporting project management. Its purpose is to provide the Project Implementation Unit with the necessary human, financial and material resources to manage project activities.</p>

3. Provide a brief assessment (up to two sentences) of the project objectives along the following 3 dimensions. Insert a working score, using the scoring scale provided in Appendix 1.

PROJECT OBJECTIVES DIMENSIONS		ASSESSMENT	WORKING SCORE
RELEVANT	a) Relevant to the country's development priorities.	The project objectives are consistent with the Education For All National Action Plan (EFA/NAP) and the sector development strategy which focuses on human resource development (2003-2012). This priority is confirmed in the Poverty Reduction and Growth Strategy Paper	4
ACHIEVABLE	b) Objectives could in principle be achieved with the project inputs and in the expected timeframe.	The objectives were achievable with the project inputs and within the expected timeframe.	4
COHERENT	c) Consistent with the Bank's country or regional strategy.	The objectives are consistent with the Bank's Education Policy, which attaches special importance to strengthening basic education.	4
	d) Consistent with the Bank's corporate priorities.	The Project is consistent with ADF IX guidelines, in particular those relating to the use of grants and capacity building, but especially with the 2002-2004 CSP which focuses on capacity building in the social sectors and improved quality of education and learning.	4

4. Lay out the log. frame. If a log. frame does not exist, complete the table below, indicating the overall project development objective, the major project components, the major activities of each component and their expected outputs and outcomes, and indicators for measuring the achievement of outcomes. Please add additional rows for components, activities, outputs or outcomes if needed.

OBJECTIVES	DESCRIPTION	Estimated at Appraisal	Expected Outcomes	Outcome Indicators to be Measured
Sector Goal	Help improve the quality of integrated basic education through training and strengthening of human resources involved in the educational process	The repeat rate for primary school pupils falls from 13% to 5% between 2003 and 2008;	Education quality is improved	Repeat rate
		The primary to secondary education advancement rate is up by 25% between 2004 and 2010	External efficiency is enhanced	Advancement rate
		100% of basic education teachers have received teacher training by 2010	Human resources are developed	Number of basic education teachers trained

Project Objectives	Improve the educational management and supervision framework as well as the qualifications of integrated basic education teachers in order to contribute to human resource development	The Educational Radio broadcasting network and reception quality are improved by 2006	Improvement of the broadcasting network and quality of the Educational Radio	Number of teachers trained
		The in-service training capacity of the Teacher Training Institute is built up by 2007	In-service training capacity of the Teacher Training Institute built up.	
		The in-service training capacity of the College of Education is built up by 2007	In-service training capacity of the College of Education built up	
COMPONENTS	ACTIVITIES	EXPECTED OUTPUTS	EXPECTED OUTCOMES	INDICATORS TO BE MESURED
Component 1: Building National Distance Training Capacity and Training of Teaching, Administrative and Education Supervision Staff.				
Sub-Component 1 <i>Provision of additional equipment, and staff training for ER and Resource Centres</i>	Provision of equipment	Educational Radio strengthened with additional equipment	ER equipment procured and broadcasts prepared.	Number of islands receiving ER broadcasts
		Three resource centres are equipped	Resource centres equipped with IT and multi-media equipment	List of equipment procured
	Staff sensitisation	ER staff sensitised on and trained in distance training issues.	All staff sensitised on and trained in distance training issues	Number of people sensitised
Sub-Component 2 <i>Sensitisation and training of national staff on distance-training methodologies and content</i>	Training of supervisory personnel	Supervisory staff and basic education teachers are trained	Staff of central and decentralised structures informed of and sensitised on distance training methodologies and content.	Number of officials of central structures sensitised.
		Ten officials from the Ministry and decentralised structures participated in six (6) weeks intensive training	Training abroad was carried out	Number of officials trained abroad

		abroad		
Sub-Component 3 <i>Identification of Education Sector training needs and preparation of distance training plan for teaching, administrative and education supervision staff</i>	Identification of training needs	Basic education sector training needs identified	Education sector training needs identified	Study and Survey Reports available
	Preparation of a training plan	A distance training plan is prepared	The training plan is prepared	The distance training strategy document is available
Sub-Component 4 <i>Preparation of teaching aids and implementation of the distance training programme</i>	Training of supervisory personnel	21 inspectors, 80 centre managers, 150 school heads and 1400 basic education teachers receive distance training	Training of supervisory staff and basic education teachers is effective.	Numbers of inspectors, centre managers, school heads and basic education teachers trained.
Component II <i>Programme Management</i>	Strengthening of the Unit	Effective building of employees' capacity	IT training of employees carried out	Number of employees with IT training
	Recruitment of a specialist in distance training methodologies and content.	One specialist in distance training methodologies and content recruited	Improved monitoring of training	Training assessment report

5. For each dimension of the log. frame, provide a brief assessment (up to two sentences) of the extent to which the log. frame achieved the following objectives. Insert a working score, using the scoring scale provided in Appendix 1. If no log. frame exists, score this section as a 1 (one).

LOG FRAME DIMENSIONS		ASSESSMENT	WORKING SCORE
LOGICAL	a) Presents a logical causal chain for achieving the project development objectives.	The activities, outputs and indicators are linked by a causal relationship for achieving the project objective. However, the sub-components were not implemented chronologically.	3
MEASURABLE	b) Expresses objectives and outcomes in a way that is measurable and quantifiable.	Some indicators were realistic and measurable but others were somewhat qualitative and difficult to measure.	3
THOROUGH	c) States the risks and key assumptions.	The log. frame presents a small number of assumptions. Furthermore, it is difficult to distinguish between the assumptions and risks	2


D. OUTPUTS AND OUTCOMES

I. ACHIEVEMENT OF OUTPUTS

In the Table below, assess the achievement of expected vs. actual outputs for each major activity. Import the expected outputs from the log. frame in Section C. Score the extent to which the expected outputs were achieved. Weight the scores by the activities' approximate share of project costs. The overall output score will be auto-calculated as the sum of the weighted scores. Override the auto-calculated score, if desired, and provide justification.

MAJOR ACTIVITIES		Working Score	Share of Project Costs in %(As stated in Appraisal Report)	Weighted Score (auto-calculated)
Expected Outputs	Actual Outputs			
A 10 member Technical Steering Committee set up; 45 Ministry officials sensitised on distance training	A 12 member committee set up 43 officials sensitized and trained	4	2.86	0.1144
Equipment and knowledge requirements identified and the National Distance Training Plan prepared	The equipment list and National Distance Training Plan prepared	4	3.81	0.1524
03 Educational Radio technicians and 06 resource centre technicians trained in audio-visual production	10 technicians trained in audio-visual production.	4	18	0.72
03 Educational Radio technicians and 06 resource centre technicians are given computer training	18 technicians are given computer training.			
10 officials of the Ministry, Educational Radio and different training institutions are trained abroad in distance training methodologies and content	12 officials comprising 8 from the PI, 2 from the ER and 2 from the ISE were trained in Portugal in distance training methodologies and content			

<p>The Educational Radio is provided with additional computer and audio-visual equipment</p> <p>03 Resource Centres are equipped with additional computer and audio-visual equipment</p>	<p>The Educational Radio was strengthened with computer and audio-visual equipment. 10 additional relay antennae procured to expand the ER coverage area.</p> <p>7 resource centres and 3 PI schools (Praia, Mindelo and Assomada) equipped with computer and audio-visual equipment</p>	4	38.09	1.5236
<p>Teaching aids prepared for training courses</p> <p>21 education inspectors, 80 centre managers, 150 school heads and 1400 teachers are trained</p>	<p>5,000 manuals produced by PI under the aegis of the Bank, cassettes and CDs of the courses prepared by the Educational Radio.</p>	4	4.76	0.1904
	<p>21 education inspectors, 160 centre managers and school heads and 1510 teachers trained during the first phase, and 1800 teachers and 438 others trained during the second phase (a total of 3744 teachers trained).</p>	4	13.33	0.5332
<p>OVERALL OUTPUT SCORE [score is calculated as the sum of weighted scores]</p>				3

 Check here to override the autocalculated score

<p>Provide justification for over-riding the auto-calculated score</p>	
<p> </p>	
<p>Insert the new score or re-enter the autocalculated score</p>	3

II. ACHIEVEMENT OF OUTCOMES/EFFECTS

1. Using available monitoring data, assess the achievement of <u>expected outcomes</u> . Import the expected outcomes from the log. frame in Section C. Score the extent to which the expected outcomes were achieved. The overall outcome score will be auto-calculated as an average of the working scores. Override the auto-calculated score, if desired, and provide justification.		
OUTCOMES		Working Score
Expected	Actual	
ER equipment procured and broadcasts prepared	The Educational Radio was strengthened with computer and audio-visual equipment. Ten (10) additional relay antennae were procured in order to expand the ER coverage area. Thus, educational radio broadcasts are received daily by the teachers in all the islands thanks to these relay antennae.	4
Resource centres provided with computer and multi-media equipment	7 resource centres and 3 PI schools were equipped with computer and audio-visual equipment	4
Training abroad carried out	12 instead of the originally estimated 10 officials of central and decentralised structures were trained in Portugal in distance training methodologies and content.	4
Training plan prepared	The distance training strategy paper was drafted by a consultant and is available	4
Continuing training capacity of the Teacher Training Institute increased by 2007	160 PI centre managers and school heads were trained	4
Training of supervisory personnel and basic education teachers carried out	21 education inspectors received training from Portuguese inspectors, and 3744 teachers were trained in distance training out of the originally estimated 1400	4
OVERALL OUTCOME SCORE [Score is calculated as an average of the working scores]		4

 Check here to override the calculated score

Provide justification for overriding the auto-calculated score	
Insert the new score or re-enter the autocalculated score	

2. Additional Outcomes: Comment on the project's additional outcomes not captured in the log. frame, including cross-cutting issues (e.g. gender).

Discussions with Government authorities, civil society as well as with pupils showed that the project's social impact was positive. Indeed, since the broadcasting of education for citizenship by Educational Radio, the awareness and receptiveness of teachers nationwide have been raised, resulting in a positive attitude change regarding teaching practices. This behavioural change is currently influencing teachers and pupils who have undergone distance training. Regarding gender, women are strongly represented in the teaching profession with the proportion of female personnel standing at 65.3% in basic education. The project has preserved these gains by ensuring equitable participation of men and women in the different training activities, in particular training abroad, with women making up the majority of those trained (9 out of 12). Similarly, while girls in Cape Verde are not disadvantaged in terms of either the education provided or its quality, by improving the quality of teaching, the project has led to an increase in the girls' completion rate, thereby improving their chances of advancement to secondary education.

Lastly, it was noted that in all the islands, more women were trained than men. Indeed, 60% of the 3744 primary school teachers trained under the project were women. Therefore, the knowledge assimilated during the training will have a positive impact on children's futures and, consequently, on the entire country.

3. Risks to sustained achievement of outcomes. State the factors that affect, or could affect, the long-run or sustained achievement of project outcomes. Indicate if any new activity or institutional change is recommended to help sustain outcomes. The analysis should draw upon the sensitivity analysis in Annex 3, if relevant.

The Government should pursue financing of the recurrent costs of the project (operating costs of the resource centres) in order not to undermine the project's sustainability. Maintaining the Educational Radio and Resource Centre equipment is necessary as well as updating of the recording studio software. Furthermore, the in-service training of the teachers trained, and especially their retraining, must be carried out regularly to prevent any loss of the teaching knowledge and methods learnt. Furthermore, the Government could revise the pupils' textbooks in order to ensure the sustainability of education for citizenship.

E. PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS FOR IMPLEMENTATION

1. State the extent to which the Bank and the Borrower ensured the project was commensurate with the Borrower’s capacity to implement by designing the project appropriately and by putting in place the necessary implementation arrangements. Consider both design aspects (inputs) and actual outcomes. Design aspects include: extent to which project design took account of the lessons learned from previous PCRs in the sector or the country (please cite key PCRs); whether the project was informed by robust analytical work (please cite key documents); how well Bank and Borrower assessed the capacity of the executing agencies and Project Implementation Unit; and provisions made for technical assistance. Project outcomes include the extent to which the project was completed on time and activities were implemented as designed.

[250 words maximum. Any additional narrative about implementation should be included in Annex 6: Project Narrative]

At the project design stage, the Bank and Borrower drew upon the main lessons from the Bank’s previous interventions, namely the projects (Institutional Support for Education Project Study, the PRESE and the EDU Project). They also took into account the activities of the other partners, which focused on primary and secondary school infrastructure, and especially on quality and equity-related issues, particularly the poor qualifications of teachers that had a negative impact on the system’s internal efficiency. Thus, the project design was based on Government’s policy to develop the country’s human resources, which was consistent with the PAIES objective of creating the conditions for enhancing the internal and external efficiency of the education system. Consequently, the activities retained will help to develop human resources (a Government priority) by developing distance training using NICTs. It is worth noting that the project was prepared using a participatory approach with a wide range of partners (donors, MEN and Ministry of Finance central and decentralized structures, supervisory personnel and teachers).

In accordance with the Grant Agreement, the PIU was designated as project executing agency responsible for overall project management, the recruitment, supervision and monitoring of all project activities. In light of its experience, the PIU is responsible for managing two of the Ministry’s other projects, namely the ABEDA project for the construction of two secondary schools and the Secondary Education Strengthening Project financed by the OPEC Fund.

2. For each dimension of project design and readiness for implementation, provide a brief assessment (up to two sentences). Insert a working score, using the scoring scale provided in Appendix 1.

PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS FOR IMPLEMENTATION DIMENSIONS		ASSESSMENT	Working Score
REALISM	a) Project complexity is matched with country capacity and political commitment.	The project is not complex in its design and is in keeping with the Government’s policy commitment. However, it was underpinned by an analysis in the identification, preparation and appraisal phases based on the experience of countries which have used distance education and, especially, on the country’s sector strategy.	3
	b) Project design		

RISK ASSESSMENT AND MITIGATION	includes adequate risk analysis.	It takes into consideration the risks that were obvious at the design stage.	3
USE COUNTRY SYSTEMS	c) Project procurement, financial management, monitoring and/or other systems are based on those already in use by government and/or partners	Bank procedures were used for all project procurements. However, regarding financial management, the project did not have accounting software and used Microsoft Excel. Local tools were used to monitor training.	2

For the following dimensions, provide separate working scores for Bank performance and Borrower performance:			Working Score	
			Bank	Borrower
CLARITY	d) Responsibilities for project implementation are clearly defined.	Responsibilities were clearly defined on the Bank's side and for the other structures involved in project management	4	4
PROCUREMENT READINESS	e) Necessary implementation documents (e.g. specifications, design and procurement documents, etc.) are ready at appraisal.	The project implementation, procurement and disbursement arrangements are those set out in the Grant Agreement. Bidding documents were ready upon signature of the Grant Agreement.	4	4
MONITORING READINESS	f) monitoring indicators and monitoring plan are agreed upon.	The overall indicators were defined but the monitoring/evaluation strategy was not put in place	2	2
BASELINE DATA	h) Baseline data are available or are being collected.	There was little baseline data at project appraisal. The Planning Directorate has recently begun to collect complete statistical data yearly on the educational system.	3	3

F. IMPLEMENTATION

<p>1. State the major characteristics of project implementation with reference to: adherence to schedules, quality of construction or other work, performance of consultants, effectiveness of Bank supervision and effectiveness of Borrower oversight. Assess how well the Bank and Borrower ensured compliance with safeguards.</p> <p>[300 words maximum. [Any additional narrative about implementation should be included in Annex 6: Project Narrative]</p>
<p>The actual project implementation schedule differs significantly from the one agreed upon at appraisal. At appraisal, the project implementation period was to extend from January 2005 to 31 December 2008. Since the effective project closing date was 30 June 2010, the effective project duration was 5 years and 5 months.</p>

The difference of one and a half years between the original grant closing date and its actual closing date is due to two extensions to the deadline for last disbursement. The first extension was agreed upon by the Bank to enable the Unit to use the project cost balance to implement the project extension phase. The second was used to replenish the revolving fund to pay distance training costs for 1800 teachers (countrywide extension of training, i.e. 15 instead of the originally planned four municipalities) and the 2008, 2009 and 2010 audits.

Overall, performance of consultants and suppliers was deemed satisfactory. The mission noted that the Bank's procedures were also complied with.

The Bank's performance was also satisfactory. The Bank carried out seven supervision missions, including a mid-term review, i.e. an average of about 1.5. Its flexibility facilitated document processing, especially as virtually all the documents submitted to the Bank were in Portuguese.

After three years of implementation, the Borrower had by the project completion date already completed 100% of project activities despite the project's eleven-month slippage on effectiveness. The Project Steering Committee regularly held its monthly meetings. With the extension phase, about 1800 additional teachers were trained. Finally, the Government honoured all its commitments regarding mobilization of the counterpart funds, which it doubled during implementation.

The project was classified under Environmental Category III since no construction work was planned and its implementation was not expected to have any negative impact on the environment. On the other hand, the project has had a positive environmental impact by facilitating dissemination of messages to the population on environmental protection by the Educational Radio.

2. Comment on the role of other partners (donors, NGOs, contractors, etc.). Assess the effectiveness of co-financing arrangements and of donor coordination, if applicable.

The Government is the sole project co-financer and has complied with its commitments: counterpart funds were always released in a timely manner, in higher than required amounts (about UA 102,141 instead of the estimated UA 50,000), which represents an outstanding performance.

There was close coordination with the interventions of other development partners, especially in the context of the Education For All National Action Plan. The project took into account the activities of the other partners as a basis for implementing complementary actions and preventing duplication, especially with regard to the training of primary school teachers. Monthly meetings are held at the DGPOG (Ministry of Education) and Directorate-General for Cooperation at the Ministry of Finance to discuss all donors' interventions.

3. Harmonisation. State whether the Bank specifically attempted to harmonise instruments, systems and/or approaches with the other partners.

At project design, the Bank met with all Cape Verde's technical and financial partners operating in the country with a view to coordinating their interventions. Consultations were also held with the task managers of sector projects financed by different donors operating in Cape Verde, with a view to discussing the experiences of such projects and opportunities for synergy and complementarity. These discussions also continued during the project supervision missions. Thus, the establishment of the distance training system facilitated by ADF financing provided support to the distance training programme for secondary education teachers under the Education Project financed by the OPEC Fund, since the College of Education was closely involved in the ADF Project as a beneficiary of the proposed training courses and member of the Technical Steering Committee (TSP).

4. For each dimension of project implementation, assess the extent to which the project achieved the following objectives. Provide a brief assessment (up to two sentences) and insert a working score, using the scoring scale provided in Appendix 1.

PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION DIMENSIONS		ASSESSMENT		Working Score
TIMELINESS	a) Adherence to planned closing date. If the deviation to the right is:	Difference in months between original closing date and actual closing date of 98% disbursement rate	There was 18 months' difference but it should be noted that all the activities planned in the appraisal report had already been completed within the timeframe, that is, in December 2008. Given the undrawn balance, the deadline for last disbursement was extended twice.	3
	below 12, score 4 between 12.1 and 24, score 3 between 24.1 and 36, score 22 above 36.1, score 1	18 months		
BANK PERFORMANCE	b) Bank complied with:			
	Environmental safeguards	Environmental Category III project. Since no construction or civil works were planned, project implementation did not produce any negative impact on the environment. Accordingly, no mitigative measures were necessary.		4
	Fiduciary requirements	Overall, fiduciary requirements were complied with. Since 2007, audit reports were received and validated except for the 2008 report which is being validated by the Bank. The audit documents for 2009 and 2010 are being reviewed but the major weakness of the project was the absence of a computerized project accounting system.		2
	Project Covenants	The Bank honoured its commitments as stipulated in the Loan Agreement but it gave a six-month deadline for approving the conditions of effectiveness which had already been fulfilled, because of a language problem since the documents submitted were written in Portuguese.		3
	c) Bank provided quality supervision in the form of skills mix provided and practicality of solutions.	For the most part, the supervision missions comprised one education expert since the project was solely based on training and sensitisation. A disbursement or procurement officer should have been included once or twice.		3
d) Bank provided quality management oversight.	The audit reports were validated by the Bank and the recommendations properly monitored. However, it was noted that no financial mission was carried out during project implementation.		3	
e) Borrower complied with:				

BORROWER PERFORMANCE	Environmental Safeguards	Since the project provided for no construction work, no environmental measures were planned. The dissemination by Educational Radio of messages to the population on environmental protection had a positive environmental impact.	4
	Fiduciary Requirements	The audit reports were produced but sometimes behind schedule. The Government fulfilled and even exceeded its counterpart fund commitments.	2
	Project Covenants	The Government complied with the conditions precedent to grant effectiveness. These types of conditions were rapidly fulfilled. However, about 5 months were required to fulfil one of the conditions.	3
	f) Borrower was responsive to Bank supervision findings and recommendations	The Government always ensured the timely implementation of supervision recommendations.	4
	g) Borrower collected and used monitoring information for decision making.	Information concerning teacher numbers was collected by the project from the General Directorate of Planning and Cooperation and the Teacher Training Institute via the PIU training specialist, and used in distance training courses	2

G. COMPLETION

1. Was the PCR provided on time, in accordance with the Bank's policy?			
Date of 98% disbursement rate (or closing date, if applicable)	Date PCR mailed to pcr@afdb.org	Difference in months	WORKING SCORE (auto-calculated) If the difference is equal to or less than 6 months, the score is 4. If the difference is greater than 6 months, the score is 1.
96.82% as at 30 June 2010 (closing date)		6	4

Briefly describe the PCR process. Describe the Borrower's and cofinancer's involvement in producing the document. Highlight any discrepancies concerning the assessments made in this PCR. Describe the team composition and whether an insight mission was undertaken. Mention any major collaboration with other development partners. State the extent of field office involvement in producing the report. Indicate whether comments from peer reviewers were received on time (provides names and positions of peer reviewers).

[150 words maximum]

The PCR was jointly prepared by the Government of Cape Verde and the ADB. The completion mission included a socio- economist from the Bank's Senegal Regional Office (SNFO) and a consulting education expert. The mission was assisted by the project team for field visits, as well as meetings initiated by the Teacher Training Institute. During these visits, the PCR team met with the beneficiaries and officials of the Ministry of Education, the Ministry of Finance and the Teacher Training Institute, the Educational Radio in Praia (Santiago Island) and the Islands of Sao Vicente and Santo Anton to better appreciate the realities and outputs. The discussions showed that the project had successfully achieved its objectives and met the needs of the teachers and the population. Lastly, the document was prepared by SNFO and reviewed by the project team as well as the structures involved in its preparation, prior to its transmission to Tunis.

H. LESSONS LEARNED

Summarize key lessons for the Bank and Borrower suggested by the project's outcome.

[300 word maximum. Any additional narrative about lessons learned, if needed, must be placed in Annex 6: Project Narrative]

On completion, a number of lessons may be drawn from the PAIES project in terms of design, implementation and monitoring, in particular:

- i) Good communication between the executing agency and the Bank resulted in smooth project implementation;
- ii) The availability in FFCO. 2 of a Portuguese-speaking disbursement officer could have improved communication with the project executing agency and especially shortened the time taken to process payment and revolving fund requests (most of the invoices are in Portuguese);
- iii) The timely provision of resources may facilitate the smooth implementation of the training programme and in particular prevent extensions;
- iv) The installation of accounting software could have facilitated and improved the accounting system and especially the project fiduciary framework; and
- v) The establishment of an operational monitoring and evaluation system that takes into account the outcome indicators and sources of verification presented in the log. frame could make it possible to assess the project's impact.

I. PROJECT RATINGS SUMMARY

All working scores are auto-generated by the computer from the relevant section in the PCR

CRITERIA	SUB-CRITERIA	Working Scores
PROJECT OUTCOME	Achievement of outputs	4
	Achievement of outcomes	4
	Timeliness	3
	OVERALL PROJECT OUTCOME SCORE	3
BANK PERFORMANCE	Design and Readiness	
	Project Objectives are relevant to country development priorities	4
	Project Objectives could in principle be achieved with the project inputs and in the expected time frame	4
	Project Objectives are consistent with the Bank's country or regional strategy	4
	Project Objectives are consistent with the Bank's corporate priorities	4
	The log. frame presents a logical causal chain for achieving the project development objectives.	3
	The log. frame expresses objectives and outcomes in a way that is measurable and quantifiable	3
	The log. frame states the risks and key assumptions	2
	Project complexity is matched with country capacity and political commitment	3
	Project design includes adequate risk analysis	3
	Project procurement, financial management, monitoring and/or other systems are based on those already in use by government and/or other partners.	2
	Responsibilities for project implementation are clearly defined	4
	Necessary implementation documents (e.g. specifications, design and procurement documents) are ready at appraisal	4
	Monitoring indicators and monitoring plan are agreed upon	2
	Baseline data are available or are being collected	3
	PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS SUB-SCORE	3
	Supervision:	
	Bank complied with:	
	Environmental Safeguards	4
	Fiduciary Requirements	2
	Project Covenants	3
	Bank provides quality supervision in the form of skills mix provided and practicality of solutions	3
	Bank provided quality management oversight	3
	The PCR was available on time	4
	SUPERVISION SUB-SCORE	3
	OVERALL BANK PERFORMANCE SCORE	3
	BORROWER PERFORMANCE	Design and Readiness
Responsibilities for project implementation are clearly defined		4
Necessary implementation documents (e.g. specifications, design and procurement documents) are ready at appraisal		4
Monitoring indicators and monitoring plan are agreed upon and baseline data are available or are being collected		2
PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS SCORE		3
Implementation		
Borrower complied with:		
Environmental Safeguards		4
Fiduciary Requirements		3
Project Covenants		3
Borrower was responsive to Bank supervision findings and recommendations		4
Borrower collected and used monitoring information for decision-making		2
IMPLEMENTATION SUB-SCORE		3
OVERALL BORROWER PERFORMANCE SCORE		3

J. PROCESSING

STEP	SIGNATURE AND COMMENTS	DATE
Sector Manager Clearance	Boukary SAVADOGO	25/08/2010
Regional Director Clearance	F. PERRAULT	10/09/2010
Sector Director Approval	Boukary SAVADOGO, OIC OSHD	24/09/2010

APPENDIX 1

Scale for Working Scores and Ratings

SCORE	EXPLANATION
4	Very Good Fully achieved with no shortcomings
3	Good Mostly achieved despite a few shortcomings
2	Fair Partially achieved. Shortcomings and achievements are roughly balanced
1	Poor Very limited achievements with extensive shortcomings
NA	Not applicable

N.B.: The formulae are rounded up or down for decimal points. Only whole numbers are computed.

1. PROJECT COST AND FINANCING

1.1 *Project Financial Implementation*

A. Project Implementation by Component

Components	Estimated Cost in UA million	In %	Actual Cost in UA	In %
Component I	916,926.00	87.32%	950,729.09	88.82%
Component II	133.074.00	12.67%	119,586.48	11.18%
Total Project Cost	1,050,000.00	100%	1,070,315.57	100.00%

Grant implementation by component indicates in the above Table that the project complied with the provisions of the Appraisal Report. The financial implementation of Component 1 represents 88.82% of expenditure. For Component 2 (mainly focused on project management), the implementation stands at 11.88%, whereas the appraisal estimates projected 87.32% and 12.67% of the total project cost for these two components, respectively.

B. *Implementation by Expenditure Category and by Year*

	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	Total
Expenditure Categories							
A. Goods			128,324.05	104,458.59			232,782.64
B. Services	31,376.53	7,971.74	132,153.23	224,946.86	159,333.50	63,613.37	619,395.23
C. Operation	23,155.95	14,182.19	17,200.10	49,775.28	113,824.24		218,137.76
Total Cost	54,532.48	22,153.93	277,677.38	379,180.73	273,157.74	63,613.37	1,070,315.57

The above Table presents the expenditure made on behalf of the project by category. It is worth noting that the services category is the most significant, with a cumulative total of UA 619,395.23 in view of the project's objective which focuses on human resource development. As at December 2008, the original date for last disbursement, it was noted that there was a significant undrawn balance. This was the result of exchange rate gains due to the favourable rate of the Cape Verdean Escudos to the UA over the period. Furthermore, many activities were overestimated since the PIU often succeeded in recruiting consultants or suppliers for lower than the estimated amounts (conclusion of an agreement with the Portuguese Inspectorate for example with the result that few project resources were used to implement the training sub-component for Cape Verde inspectors. Only the living expenses of the Portuguese inspectors were paid for by the Project).

C. Implementation by Source of Financing

Source of Financing	Estimated Financing		Actual Financing		Actual/Estimated (in %)
	In UA	In % of total cost	In UA	In % of total cost	
ADF	1,000,000	95	968,174.57	90.50	96.82
Government	50,000	5	102,141.00	9.50	204.00
Total	1,050,000	100.00	1,070,315.57	100.00	101.93

The above Table presents the estimated and actual project financing by source of financing. On project completion, the total amount disbursed on the ADF grant was UA 968,174.57, representing 96.82 % of the total project cost, below the estimate. The undisbursed grant amount is UA 31,825.43, representing the payment of audits for 2008, 2009 and the first six months of 2010. In contrast, Government counterpart funds amounted to UA 0.05 million, i.e. CVE 6,677,700 (in May 2004 the UA/CVE exchange rate was UA 1 = CVE 133.554). The Government regularly disbursed its counterpart funds which amounted to UA 102,141.40, representing 9.50 % of the total project costs and showing that the Government's contribution had almost doubled.

1.2 Administrative and Financial Monitoring

In accordance with the Grant Agreement, the Project Implementation Unit (PIU) was designated as the project executing agency with overall responsibility for project management, the recruitment of technical assistance and supervision/monitoring of all project activities. In addition to the Project, the Unit managed 3 of the Ministry's other projects (those of ADF, OPEC and ABEDA). The PIU comprises a coordinator, a training specialist, a financial manager, an accountant, an administrative assistant and a driver. Financial management was carried out by the financial manager, while management of the PI training fund pursuant to an agreement between the PI and the Government fell within the remit of the project accountant.

Financial and Administrative Procedures Handbook: the project has no administrative, accounting and financial procedures handbook. The Appraisal Report waived the need for it, stating that the Bank's reference such as 'Guidelines for the Preparation of Financial Reports and Review of Project Accounts' and the 'Disbursement Handbook' would be made available to the project accountant.

Accounting Software: the project was implemented without using any known accounting software (it used Microsoft Excel that the Bank's internal audit had considered acceptable for accounting entries). However, acceptable professional accounting software should have been purchased to improve the fiduciary framework.

Production of Periodic Financial Reports: three finalised audit reports were submitted to the Bank. The first report covering the 2005-2006 period was prepared in 2007. The Ernst & Young

audit firm in Dakar recruited in July 2007 audited the project accounts for 2007 and 2008. The Bank considered the 2008 audit incomplete. It must be finalised and submitted to the Bank. Regarding the 2009 audit of accounts, the Project has already contacted the Bank with a request for an amendment for the conduct of the audit by Ernst & Young.

D. Actual Project Expenditure from the ADF Grant in UA

Years	Estimate at Appraisal	Actual Disbursements	% Grant Disbursed	Actual Cumulative Disbursed Amounts	Cumulative % of Grant Disbursed
2005	614,400.00	31,376.53	3.14%	31,376.53	3.14%
2006	182,400.00	7,971.74	0.80%	39,348.27	3.93%
2007	211,200.00	260,477.28	26.05%	299,825.55	29.98%
2008		352,578.28	35.26%	652,403.83	65.24%
2009		252,157.37	25.22%	904,561.20	90.46%
2010		63,613.37	6.36%	968,174.57	96.82%
TOTAL	1,000,000.00	968,174.57	96.82%		

Table D presents annual Grant disbursements as at 28/06/2010. It shows that in 2007, 2008 and 2009, disbursement levels were high at 26.05%, 35.26% and 25.22% respectively, i.e. amounting to 65.24% of the total project cost. These years correspond to the implementation of activities relating to distance training and the procurement of teaching materials and equipment for the Educational Radio and Resource Centres necessary to implement the activities. To date, there is an outstanding 3.1% to be disbursed, representing the payment for the 2008, 2009 and 2010 accounts audit.

Conclusion and Recommendations

Overall, the project financial management was satisfactory and complied with the Bank's rules of procedure. The project could have been more efficient had there been a computerised accounting system. While project disbursements were never suspended, disbursement delays inconvenienced the beneficiaries of distance training. The deadline for the project's last disbursement had to be extended for a second time to process the final replenishment of the revolving fund in order to address the situation. In addition, the change in the system for managing external funds has aggravated the problem. Since March 2010 when the revolving fund was disbursed by the Bank, the teachers have not received their allowances.

For future projects, we recommend:

- Preparation of a specific project procedures handbook;
- Production of financial reports according to the project structure (categories and components); and
- Installation of a computerised accounting system.

Bank Missions (Bank Contributions)

No	Mission	Dates	No. Of People	Composition
1	Identification	22 April to 12 May 2002	1	Education Expert
2	Preparation	19 to 31 July 2004	1	Education Expert
3	Appraisal	4 to 14 Feb. 2004	1	Education Expert
4	Launching	7 to 18 March 2005	2	Education Expert/Disbursement Officer
5	Supervision	28 November to 6 December 2005	1	Education Expert
6	Supervision	12 to 20 June 2006	1	Education Expert
7	Mid-term Review	17 to 26 Jan. 2007	1	Education Expert
8	Supervision	21 January to 01 February 2008	1	Education Expert
9	Supervision	02 to 12 September 2008	2	Education Experts
10	Supervision	09 to 13 February 2009	2	Education Expert/Socio-Economist
11	Supervision	June 2009	1	Education Expert
12	Completion	21 June to 2 July 2010	2	Socio-Economist/Education Expert (Consultant)

ANNEX 3

RATINGS AT LAST SUPERVISION (June 2009)

INDICATORS	RATINGS					
	Preceding Reports				This report 09.02.2009	
	12.06.2006	17.01.2007	21.01.2008	02.09.2008		
A. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION						
Compliance with loan conditions precedent to entry into force	2	2	2	2	2	
Compliance with General Conditions	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
Compliance with Other Conditions	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
B. PROCUREMENT PERFORMANCE						
Procurement of Consultancy Services	2	2	3	3	3	
Procurement of Goods and Works	N/A	1	2	2	3	
C. FINANCIAL PERFORMANCE						
Availability of Foreign Exchange	3	2	3	3	3	
Availability of Local Currency	3	3	3	3	3	
Disbursement Flows	2	2	3	3	3	
Cost Management	N/A	2	2	2	2	
Performance of Co-Financers	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
D. ACTIVITIES AND WORKS						
Adherence to implementation schedule	2	1	2	3	3	
Performance of Consultants or Technical Assistance	3	2	3	3	3	
Performance of Contractors						
Performance of Project Management	2	1	2	2	3	
E. IMPACT ON DEVELOPMENT						
Likelihood of achieving Development Objectives	3	3	3	3	3	
Likelihood that benefits will be realized and sustained beyond completion	3	3	3	3	3	
Likely contribution of the project towards an increase in living standards	3	3	3	3	3	
Current Rate of Return	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
F. OVERALL PROJECT ASSESMENT						
Current Supervision Average	2.55	2.08	2.62	2.69	2.85	
Current Trend over time						2.56

RATINGS: 3 = Highly Satisfactory, 2 = Satisfactory, 1 = Unsatisfactory, 0 = Highly Unsatisfactory, ' ' = Not applicable

ANNEX 4**LIST OF SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS (SOURCES OF INFORMATION)****LIST OF SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS (SOURCES OF INFORMATION)**

Doc. No	Document	Sources
1	Project Appraisal Report prepared by the Bank in October 1996	ADB
2	- Project Loan Agreement (ADB)	
3	Education Statistical Yearbooks for 2004 to 2009	DGPOG
	National Development Plan (2002-2005)	PIU
4	Strategic Options Documents (April 2006)	Teacher Training Institute
5	- Supervision Reports and/or aide-memoires of project supervision missions prepared by ADB: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• November -December 2005• May-June 2006• January 2007• February 2008• September 2008• February 2009• June 2009	PIU
6	Education Project II Completion Report	PIU
	Distance Training Reports; Training Strategy Paper	PIU, Teacher Training Institute
7	PAIES Activity Reports	PIU
8	Audit Reports	PIU
9	Bank's Ledger	Bank

Estimated and Actual Project Implementation Schedule

ACTIVITIES	Estimated Dates	Actual Dates	Comments
Board Presentation	September 2004	29/09/2004	NTR
Effectiveness	January 2005	17 August 2005	8 months
Launching Mission	January 2005	8 March 2005	3 months
Establishment of the Distance Training Technical Steering Committee	January 2005	25 Sept. 2005	9 months
Recruitment of the international consultant for national sensitisation on distance training	February – June 2005	December 2005	+ 6 months
Award of contracts for ER and Resource Centre equipment	February – July 2005	December 2005	+ 5 months
National sensitisation on distance training	August 2005	July 2007	+ 24 months
Training abroad on methodologies and the development of distance training content and programmes	October – November 2005	August-Sept. 2006	+ 10 months
Training abroad for technicians in audio-visual production	October – November 2005	August-Sept. 2006	+ 10 months
Recruitment of the international consultant for identification of training needs, as well as the preparation and implementation of a distance training plan	June – October 2005	Dec. 2005	+ 3 months
Recruitment of project audit firm	August – November 2005	May 2007 – x 2008	+28 months
National training of technicians on IT	January 2006	March 2008	+27 months
Identification of training needs in the basic and secondary education sector	January - February 2006	February 2006	+1 month
Preparation of the distance training plan for the basic and secondary education sectors	March– April 2006	February 2006	- 1 months
Preparation of distance training teaching materials for teaching, administrative and education supervision and monitoring personnel	May 2006 – December 2006	Oct. – June 2007	+16 months
Distance training for teaching, administrative and education supervision and monitoring personnel	January – November 2007	Jan. – Nov. 2008	12 months
Mid-Term Review	June 2006	Jan. – February 2007	+6 months
Audits	First quarter of 2005 to 2008	June 2008	2009
Supervision Missions	July 2004 – July 2007	Nov - 2005 – June 2009	+17 months
End of Project Activities	December 2008	June 2010	+30 months

IMPLEMENTATION STATUS

COMPONENT I : NATIONAL DISTANCE-TRAINING CAPACITY BUILDING			
A. GOODS	Implementation Status	Implementation Rate	COMMENTS
1. Educational Radio Equipment			
a. Multimedia Centre	Completed	100%	
b. Production Centre	Completed	100%	
c. Reporting Equipment	Completed	100%	
d. FM Broadcasting	Completed	100%	11 additional relay antennae procured
2. Resource Centre Equipment			
a. Multimedia Centre	Completed	233.33%	7 instead of 3 resource centres equipped
b. Production Centre	Completed	100%	
c. Reporting Equipment	Completed	100%	
B. SERVICES			
1. Strengthening of Educational Radio			
a. Training abroad in audio-visual production	Completed	100%	Carried out locally
b. Local IT training	Completed	100%	
2. National Distance Training Sensitisation	Completed	100%	
a. Training			
b. Technical Assistance	Completed	100%	
3. External training course on distance training content and methodologies	Completed	120%	12 instead of 10 officials took part in this training
4. Identification of needs and preparation of distance training plan	Completed	100%	The Training Plan Strategy Paper designed
5. Preparation of distance learning teaching materials (inspectors and managers)	Completed	100%	Carried out by the Portuguese inspectors (see above)
6. Preparation of distance training teaching materials (teachers)	Completed	100%	
a. Technical Assistance	Completed	100%	
b. PI Package	Completed	100%	
7. Distance training (Inspectors and Managers)	Completed	100%	Carried out using a face-to-face approach (e-room)
a. Training	Completed	100%	
b. Technical Assistance	Completed	100%	2 Portuguese inspectors carried out the training under the Agreement between Cape Verde and Portugal
8. Distance Training (Teachers-PI)			
a. Training	Completed	267.4%	3744 teachers trained instead of the planned 1400
b. Technical Assistance	Completed	100%	
c. IP package	Completed	150%	Two cohorts instead of one trained
Component II: PROJECT EXECUTING AGENCY			
A. SERVICES			
1. Audit	Completed	75%	2009 Audit + 6 months 2010 outstanding
B. Operating Costs			
1. Salaries and Allowances	Completed	100%	
2. Management Costs	Completed	100%	

PROJECT NARRATIVE

A. Context

1. Implementation of the sector reform under the 1990 Framework Law on National Education enabled Cape Verde to make great strides in the development of its education system, especially with regard to increased access. However, despite these efforts, problems remained relating to the quality of education and geographical equity in terms of access. In order to preserve the achievements of the past decade and create adequate conditions for strengthening the internal and external efficiency of the educational system, the Government, as expressed in its sector development strategy for the 2003-2012 period, opted to focus on human resource development by training teaching, administrative and education control and supervision personnel. In view of Cape Verde's island status, the Government decided to turn to new information and communication technologies to partially meet the country's training needs, with the ultimate aim of improving cost effectiveness.

2. The proposed project, which is in keeping with the thrusts of the 2002-2004 CSP, focuses on human resource development as a key factor of sustainable development through institutional capacity building in distance training. It also complies with ADF-IX guidelines, especially those relating to capacity building and the use of grants. This project focuses on the training of trainers - a key factor for achieving the EFA objectives.

B. Design

3. The project was prepared and appraised under the Education for All National Action Plan (EFA/NAP) in the context of the Millennium Development Goals (MDG). It was necessary to: (i) consolidate and develop basic education; (ii) improve the quality of integrated basic education; (iii) strengthen equity and combat regional disparities; and (iv) consolidate partnerships with social organisations. The project was prepared using a participatory approach with a wide range of partners (donors, central and decentralised structures of MEN, the Ministry of Finance, education supervisors and teachers. Past interventions in the education sector were also taken into account, in particular those that focused on primary and secondary school infrastructure, and the training of teachers in these subsectors. However, with regard to training, there has been rising interest in distance training through the use of NICTs. The key objective is to address both the quantitative insufficiency and qualitative shortcomings of teachers and those in charge of school management, education monitoring and inspection, identified as major constraints facing the sector.

C. Implementation

4. The actual project implementation schedule differs significantly from the one adopted at project appraisal. At appraisal, the project implementation period was expected to extend from January 2005 until 31 December 2008. This was adhered to, despite 11 months' slippage on effectiveness since all the originally planned activities were completed in December 2008. Given that the actual project closing date was 30 June 2010, effective project duration was 5 years and 5 months.

5. The difference of one and a half years between the original and actual closing dates was due to two extensions of the deadline for last disbursement. The Bank agreed to the first extension to enable the Implementation Unit to use the project cost balance to implement the project extension phase. The second extension made it possible to carry out a final replenishment of the revolving fund to enable

payment of the cost of providing distance training to 1800 teachers (countrywide extension of training, i.e. 15 municipalities instead of the four originally planned) as well as the cost of the 2008, 2009 and 2010 audits.

6. The slippage on grant effectiveness affected the implementation schedule. In general, the slippage was between 6 to 30 months, but the recruitment of a consultant who prepared a strategy paper helped to make up for part of the delay since he singlehandedly carried out three activities merged into one following revision of the TORs by the Unit with Bank approval.

7. Overall, the consultants' performance was deemed satisfactory. The rules of procedure were complied with, even though for some procurements, the PIU sought the support of an international consultant to propose a shortlist of training facilities abroad. All the requests for proposals were issued to recruit the services of technical assistance and of national institutions for implementing project activities (for instance the preparation and setting up of a distance training plan).

8. The equipment suppliers performed satisfactorily. On the whole, contracts were complied with and the quality of the equipment delivered was high. The mission also noted that the Bank's procedures had been complied with.

9. Overall, the Bank's performance was deemed satisfactory. It fielded seven supervision missions including one mid-term review, i.e. an average of 1.5. The first mission was carried out in May 2005 and the last in June 2009. This is acceptable since all project activities have been completed since November 2009. The extension was agreed upon to allow the payment of expenditure made during the project extension phase. While project disbursements were never suspended, Bank payment delays did, however, remain long (3 months on average), especially for revolving fund replenishment requests, sometimes because not all the expenses were correctly justified, or simply due to communication difficulties with the disbursement officers: in this respect, it should be noted that the penultimate revolving fund request submitted in March 2009 was only disbursed in August 2009. The same applied to the final request submitted in December 2009, which was only disbursed in May 2010 following a 6-month extension of the project. However, all payments to consultants and suppliers were effected as planned.

10. The project duration was 5 years instead of 3 as originally planned in the appraisal report. However, after three years of implementation and by the project closing date, the Borrower had carried out 100% of the activities contained in the appraisal report. This is outstanding performance. It established a new PIU to achieve the teacher training objectives and improve the quality of education. The Educational Radio is operational and has been strengthened in terms of equipment and training of teachers responsible for running it. It currently covers the entire national territory following the procurement of new relay antennae to cover the shadow zones. The Teacher Training Institute was also strengthened with the initial and in-service training of teachers. Education for citizenship was introduced in the primary education sub-sector. The General Inspectorate also benefited from the project in terms of equipment and building the capacity of inspectors to enable them to perform their daily duties for school heads. Secondary education is also interested in this new subject area. The Borrower's performance is deemed satisfactory. Lastly, the Government has honoured its commitments concerning mobilization of the counterpart funds which were doubled during project implementation.

11. **Management and Organisational Effectiveness:** in accordance with the Loan Agreement, the PIU was designated as the Project Executing Agency responsible for overall project management, recruitment of technical assistance and supervision and monitoring of all project activities. It was to work under the authority of the erstwhile GEP (which subsequently became the DGPOG) and in close

collaboration with the Teacher Training Institute to implement the distance-training programme for basic education teachers and education supervision staff at the Ministry of Education.

12. All the planned project activities were successfully completed. Indeed, despite a late start-up (10 months), the PIU implemented virtually all the training and procurement activities planned, and distributed the equipment delivered.

Moreover, the project received support from the Technical Steering Committee (TSC) which met frequently (2 to 3 times a month). Its decisions facilitated implementation of the activities. The mission noted that the PIU's decision to recruit a single consultant instead of the 6 consultants originally planned in the appraisal report resulted in considerable savings for the project in terms of time and money. A salutary decision was the preparation of the strategy paper by the international consultant, which made it possible to organise all the classroom and distance training activities.

13. Monitoring/Evaluation: no performance contract was established for the project team. The monitoring/evaluation system mostly consisted of complying with the objectives retained at project preparation and included in the matrix. The latter were all achieved and the extension phase was approved to use the undrawn balance on the Grant. Therefore, the objectives were significantly exceeded. To date, eleven activity reports have been submitted to the Bank, with the most recent covering the June to December 2008 period. During the January 2008 supervision mission, it was decided by mutual agreement with the Bank, to prepare bi-annual reports instead of the usual quarterly reports, because of the low volume of outstanding activities mainly consisting of teacher training. This frequency has been adhered to.

D. SOCIAL AND ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS

Social Impact

The project has had positive social impacts, which may be measured at three levels: (i) quality; (ii) behaviour; and (iii) gender.

12. The activities initiated under the project have had a highly positive impact and have made it possible to improve the quality of the education system and develop human resources capable of making a more conscious contribution to the country's development. Indeed, the project trained 3,744 primary school teachers instead of the 1,400 originally planned, 160 centre managers and primary school heads as well as 21 education system inspectors. The new tools and materials procured by the project for the Educational Radio with countrywide coverage helped to improve working conditions in the education sector and, in particular, revitalised this facility of the Ministry of Education. The latter ensured the continuity of in-service training with the use of the radio as a resource in training teachers throughout the territory of Cape Verde, including the remote islands. This has enhanced the quality of education, developed confidence among teachers, but especially heightened awareness of rights and duties as a result of the dissemination of themes which address society's current problems.

13. Distance training has had a positive impact on academic results and consequently on the quality of education as confirmed in discussion with several beneficiaries. The dropout rate fell from 2.10% to 2.8% between 2005 and 2008, while the repeat rate dropped from 14.1% to 11.6% over the same period. The same positive trends were observed regarding the advancement rate to secondary education (increase from 80.8% in 2005/2006 to 82.4% in 2006/2007 and 2007-2008).

14. Furthermore, radio dissemination of education for citizenship has raised teacher awareness

and receptiveness. It was noted that, at national level, there was a positive attitude towards teaching practices. This behavioural change is currently influencing the students of teachers who underwent distance training. The islands' inhabitants' have adopted the message.

15. With regard to gender, it was noted that women are strongly represented in the teaching profession and account for 65.3% of basic education personnel. The project has always endeavoured to preserve these gains by ensuring equitable participation of men and women in the different activities planned, in particular training abroad. This condition was fulfilled with a majority of women (9 out of 12) participating in training abroad. Similarly, while girls in Cape Verde are not disadvantaged regarding either the education provided or its quality, by improving the quality of teaching, the project has led to an increase in the girls' school completion rate, thereby improving their chances of advancement to secondary education.

16. Finally, it was noted that in all the islands, more women were trained than men. Indeed, 60% of the 3744 primary school teachers trained under the project were women. Therefore, the knowledge assimilated during the training will have a positive impact on the future of children, the family and the nation.

E. Lessons Drawn from the Evaluation

17. Project implementation did not encounter any particular difficulties and was, in fact, satisfactory. In three years, the activities planned at project appraisal were all completed. The balance on project funds was used for an extension to carry out a second phase of distance training. However, the following lessons may be drawn following the analysis and synthesis of the different project documents and meetings with the beneficiaries:

- i) Good communication between the executing agency and the Bank resulted in smooth project implementation;
- ii) The availability in FFCO. 2 of a Portuguese-speaking disbursement officer could have improved communication with the project executing agencies and, especially, shorten the time taken to process payment and revolving fund requests (most of the invoices are in Portuguese);
- iii) The timely provision of resources may facilitate the smooth implementation of the training programme and, in particular, prevent extensions;
- iv) The installation of accounting software could have facilitated and improved the accounting system, especially the project fiduciary framework; and
- v) The establishment of an operational monitoring and evaluation system that takes into account the outcome indicators and sources of verification presented in the log. frame could make it possible to assess the project's impact.