

PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT (PCR)

A. PROJECT INFORMATION AND KEY DATES

Project Reference P-MR-IA0-002	Project Name National Education System Development Programme Support Project (PNDSE)	Country Islamic Republic of Mauritania	
Lending Instrument(s) ADF Loan		Sector Social Sector / Education Sub-sector	Environmental Classification gory II
Initial Commitment UA 8,293,000	Amount Cancelled	Amount Disbursed UA 7,318,526	% Disbursed 88.25 %
Borrower Ministry of Economic Affairs and Development (MAED)			
Executing Agency(ies) Directorate of Education and Training Projects (DPEF) of the Ministry of National Education			
Co-financiers and other External Partners Government: UA 5,900,000; IDA : UA 500,000			

II. KEY DATES

Project Concept Note Approved by Ops. Com. NA	Appraisal Report Approved by Ops. Com. NA	Board Approval 28-Nov-01	
Restructuring			
	Original Date	Actual Date	Monthly Gap [Actual date-Original date]]
EFFECTIVENESS	20-Oct.-02	First disbursement: 31-Jan.- 03	3 months
MID-TERM REVIEW	1-Fev-04	NA	NA
CLOSING DATE	31-Dec.-07	31-March-10	27 months (>2 yrs.)

III. SCORE SUMMARY

CRITERIA	SUB-CRITERIA	SCORE
PROJECT OUTPUT	Results Attainment	3
	Output Attainment	3
	Schedule Compliance	2
	OVERALL PROJECT OUTPUT	3
BANK PERFORMANCE	Design and Preparation Status	3
	Supervision	3

	OVERALL BANK PERFORMANCE	3
BORROWER PERFORMANCE	Design and Preparation Status	3
	Implementation	3
	OVERALL BORROWER PERFORMANCE	3

IV. PROJECT OFFICERS AT THE BANK

DUTIES	AT APPROVAL	AT COMPLETION
Regional Director	Mr. BISI OGUNJOBI	Mr. I. LOBE- DOUMBE
Sector Director	NA	BOUKARY SAVADOGO, OIC OSHD
Project Leader	NA	Mr. NADAB HATHOURA MASSISSOU
PCR Team Leader	NA	Mr. NADAB HATHOURA MASSISSOU
Members of the PCR Team	NA	Mrs. LEILA K. JAAFOR, Social Development Specialist, ADB Field Office in Morocco (MAFO) Mrs. ODILE MORNET-CARIOU, Education Consultant, OSHD2

B. PROJECT BACKGROUND

Summarize the rationale for the Bank's assistance. State:

- the development challenge addressed by the project;**
- Borrower's overall strategy to meet such challenge;**
- Bank's activities in this/these country(ies) and in this sector over the past year and performance; and**
- On-going activities financed by the Bank and other external sources which complement, overlap with or are relevant to, this project.**

Please state the sources involved. Comment on the strength and relevance of such rationale.

[At most 300 words. Any other relevant statement on project origin and background should be presented, if necessary, in Annex 6 entitled: Project Description].

Development challenge addressed by the project – The project deals with poverty reduction through the development of vocational higher education, which meets the requirements of the productive sector. While the agro-pastoral sector accounts for 19% of GDP, there are no appropriate training institutions at the intermediate and higher levels. Generally, the higher education sector faces the following challenges: i) inadequate infrastructure to cope with ever-increasing student population (around 130% between 1985 and 1999: 12,912 students as compared to 5542); ii) weak enrolment in science and technical disciplines: 8% against 62% for legal and economic sciences, 28% for arts and social sciences and 10% for other disciplines; iii) low female enrolment (28%) and especially in technical and vocational disciplines (13.25%). In light of the foregoing, the project aims at improving i) technical and vocational training through the design of short-term vocationalized training courses and Research and Development; ii) female enrolment through

sensitization campaigns and the construction of a separate female university hostel on the Rosso campus. Indeed, the absence of all-female university hostels is one reason parents are reluctant to send their daughters far away from home.

Borrower's overall strategy to meet such challenge - The National Education Sector Development Programme (PNDSE) is a ten-year sector-based reform strategy (2001- 2010) prepared by Mauritanian authorities. It aims to remedy the shortcomings noted in the functioning of the educational system and to foster the productivity and increased competitiveness of the national economy. It covers the entire national education system, from early childhood through to higher education, with administrative and pedagogic management and strategic organization and stewardship of education.

The upgrade and extension of the Rosso Institute, to whose establishment the Bank contributed in 1989, should provide Mauritania with an advanced-level institute of technology that offers short-term vocationalized training courses in agriculture. This mechanism should develop the skills necessary to meet the country's needs with regard to social aspects, production and economic development.

Bank's activities in this/these country(ies) and in this sector over the past year – The ADB's portfolio in Mauritania has dwindled. In October 2010, the 9 public sector operations account for a global net commitment of UA 26 million and are distributed in 3 sectors as follows: water and sanitation (77%), agriculture and rural development (17%), finance (6%). In the education sector, the ADB has funded the Education Sector Support Programme (PADSE 2000-2006: UA 5.92) under the PNSDE (2001-2010) which aimed at i) offsetting regional inequalities, ii) attaining universal primary education against a backdrop of population growth iii) improving basic and secondary education quality (first cycle), and iv) putting in place school system management and directing tools. The closing of the PNDSE should make it possible to renew the portfolio and improve overall performance.

On-going activities financed by the Bank and other external sources which complement, overlap with or are relevant to, this project – The PNDSE, a country strategy dedicated to the education sector, also receives financial support from IDA, UNICEF, IDB, the French Cooperation system, OPEC, and AFSED. The World Bank and AFD are deeply involved in vocational training.

Sources: Appraisal Report, supervision reports, Portfolio Review Report of November 2009.

C. PROJECT OBJECTIVES AND LOGICAL FRAMEWORK

1. State the Project Development Objective(s) (as set out in the Appraisal Report)

At the sector level, the project aims to develop human resources with a view to enhancing economic competitiveness and service quality and performance and eradicating the root causes of poverty. The specific project objective is to diversify the supply of education, improve the quality of teaching and research for the training of intermediate technical personnel (senior technicians) and senior experts (engineers) in agro-pastoral activities, forestry and food technology.

2. Describe the main project components and indicate how each will contribute to the attainment of project objectives

The project has 4 (four) components as follows:

Component 1 – Development of Basic Infrastructure (ISET of Rosso)

The objective of this component is to diversify the supply of higher education training by creating vocational disciplines and to meet the demand for skilled human resources in the forestry, agricultural and pastoral fields. The conversion of the former Rosso High School into a new institution called "Advanced Institute of Technology" (ISET) should increase intake capacity. Activities under this component are hinged on the establishment of basic infrastructure on a surface area of about 47 ha, specifically:

- i) rehabilitation of existing infrastructure and construction of additional buildings adapted to the role of the establishment. The construction of all-female hostels takes into account Mauritania's cultural specificities. Such measures are reassuring to parents whose concern is to preserve the social ethos, and should consequently increase the female enrolment rate;
- ii) funding of furniture (office furniture for administrative staff, furnishing lecture rooms, beds and

tables for dormitories, modern bookcases), technological equipment (laboratory, computer hardware), documentary resources (creation of a pool), and transportation, as well as kitchen utensils and sports ground equipment. The contribution of educational technology should foster the utilization of technology for teaching and learning to demonstrate and illustrate special courses, for the design of teaching aids and for the dissemination of such media beyond the confines of training institutions.

Component 2 – Institutional Capacity Building

This component aims at the reform of the framework for governance and management of higher education through the implementation of 3 (three) activities, namely:

- i) revision of the regulatory framework for institutions of higher learning and the statutes governing teaching staff: the administrative and legislative framework reform should seek greater autonomy for tertiary institutions in their daily management and running. New statutes governing teaching staff and researchers, and new financing mechanisms have been formulated.
- ii) adoption of good governance measures: the governance of Universities and tertiary Institutions such as ISET hinges on the establishment of a ‘management committee’ and ‘scientific councils. These mechanisms are intended as safeguards to ensure better use of the autonomy allowed in the areas of education, recruitment for the establishment of results-based management, particularly through assessment of the performance of teaching supervisors, researchers, administrative officers and research and training programmes. In addition, the project envisages a statistical mechanism within ISET for systematic collection of data by type for regular publication. To that end, training will be provided in modular programme design and performance standards defined.
- iii) formulation of vocational training and research programmes for ISET: modular training programmes that incorporate information technologies.

Component 3: Support to Research-Development and Educational and Technological Innovations

Activities under this component are aimed at improving the quality and relevance of education and research, as follows:

- i) the establishment of a National Research Support Fund (FNARS) aimed at encouraging innovation, excellence and the search for appropriate solutions to concrete development problems. The aim is also to increase the volume of scientific publications while ensuring their quality and utility. The Research Support Fund will be financed by ADF (UA 500,000 i.e. 40%), IDA (40%) and the Government (20%). The provisions laid down in the Utilization Manual ensure that at least 30% of the research programmes and projects focus on women’s key development concerns. Research subventions will be awarded, on the basis of competition, to research teams working in the education departments, Higher-level professional schools and, Learning centers. ii) the creation of ‘Enterprise incubators’ as laboratories for nurturing new ideas, technological innovations and future enterprises. They should also act as a point of confrontation between the requirements of economic operators and small-scale producers with ideas and the creativity of teachers, researchers and other designers. iii) the development of an agricultural experimentation plot (20 ha).
- iv) Sensitization campaigns will be organized to promote the entrance of girls into institutions of higher learning and their choice of technical and science subjects, while parents are encouraged to send girls to hostels. Furthermore, the sensitization campaign, conducted in conjunction with the Secretariat of State for Women’s Welfare, Literacy, the Ministry of National Education and the Ministry of Communications, will inform, mobilize and sensitize parents, community leaders, associations and associations of women and youths. Sensitization to STD/AIDS is carried out in collaboration with the Secretariat of State for Women’s Welfare, the Ministry of Health and specialized NGOs, given the risks involved in the project area v) The Outreach

Programme of support to neighboring communities will provide technical guidance mainly to women's cooperatives on the improvement of cropping techniques with a view to contributing to the diversification, increased productivity and competitiveness of their products.

Component 4: Support to the Project Management Structure

The objective of this component is to build the management capacity of the Directorate of Education and Training Projects (DPEF), so as to enable it to suitably facilitate the monitoring, appraisal and co-ordination of project activities.

- i) Furniture and Equipment: Funds have been earmarked for additional furniture for the support staff recruited under the project, the procurement of information technology equipment and a cross-country (4-wheel drive) vehicle for supervision and technical inspection missions of the teams.
- ii) Technical Assistance: technical assistance will be required from an international expert to prepare the curricula and define specifications for education equipment, and from an architect or civil engineer to draw the architectural plans and supervise works. 2 foremen recruited locally will assist him
- iii) Operating: funds will be set aside for benefits, fuel, repairs and maintenance of the DPEF vehicle, auditing expenses as well as for the training of the project leader and accountant.

3. Provide brief assessment (up to two sentences) of the project objectives, along the following 3 dimensions. Insert a working score, using the scoring scale provided in Appendix 1.

PROJECT OBJECTIVE DIMENSIONS		ASSESSMENT	SCORE
RELEVANT	a) Relevance to the country's development priorities;	The PNDSE support project is in line with i) Education Sector Development Strategy formulated by Government for the 2001-2010 period ; ii) the Poverty Reduction Strategic Framework (PRSF) , iii) the Mauritania Integrated Agricultural Development Programme (PDIAM) : this project meets a concern of the Government and economic operators of the agriculture and stock breeding sector, iv) the Mauritania National Gender Mainstreaming Strategy (SNIG) .	4
ACHIEVABLE	b) Objectives deemed feasible, given contributions to the project and expected timeframes.	Given the delays recorded in previous projects, deadlines have been deemed to be too unrealistic. The project does not take account of the time required for the conduct of technical studies, and, the increased number of activities by component renders the project complex, entailing the risk of dispersion.	2
CONSISTENT	c) Compliant with the Bank's national or regional strategy.	The project fully ties in with the Country Strategy Paper (CSP 2000- 2002) through the various education, health and human resource development components.	4
	d) Compliant with the Bank's overall priorities.	The project is consistent with the Global Education Sector Assistance Strategy . Its aim is to offset regional disparities in school infrastructure, develop technical education,	4

		and enable training supply to better meet job market requirements. By supplying skilled human resources, the Rosso ISET contributes to the development of comparative advantage for the productive sector which should usher Mauritania into world trade. In addition, the project is compliant with the priorities of the Bank's Gender Action Plan (2004-2007 and 2009-2011). Girls' access to scientific, technical and vocational courses at the tertiary level has been facilitated by the construction of all-female hostels. Finally, the project is relevant to the private-sector support policy : the enterprise incubators provided for under ISET are aimed at fostering technologically innovative enterprises.	
--	--	--	--

4. Summarize the logical framework. Where it does not exist, complete the table below, indicating the overall project objective, the major components of the project, the major activities of each component and their expected outputs, outcomes and indicators for measuring achievement of outcomes. Add additional rows for components, outcomes and outputs, if necessary.

COMPONENTS	ACTIVITIES	OUTCOMES	EXPECTED OUTPUTS	MEASURABLE INDICATORS
Component 1 - Development of Basic Infrastructure (Rosso ISET)	Activity 1 - Rehabilitation / construction of ISET (Rosso)	Outcome 1 - Technical studies conducted - Rehabilitation of former premises- Construction of school and residential buildings accepted - Construction of an access ramp (road) to ISET - works monitoring and supervision	Output 1 - - Infrastructure operational and of good quality - the ISET setting is a factor of attraction for both teachers and students - enrolment of girls is facilitated by the construction of a separate hostel with a capacity of 124 beds - Maintenance of buildings is ensured on a sustainable basis - 20% yearly increase in applications for enrolment in ISET accounting for 30% of high school graduates	- rate of rehabilitation and construction of premises, - rate of increase in applications for enrolment in ISET;
	Activity 2 – Furniture and	Outcome 2 -- office furniture	Output 2 - - Furniture makes for quality	Rate of delivery of furniture

	equipment	for administrative staff, school furniture,- furniture for the research and documentation centre - dormitory furniture (beds and tables), - kitchen equipment and sports ground equipment	working and living environment	
	Activity 3 - Documentary equipment	Outcome 3 – Procurement of documentary resources	Output 3 – As a result of documentary resources, pedagogic teams and students alike have access to updated reference systems for scientific research	Rate of delivery of documentary resources
	Activity 4 - Technological equipment	Outcome 4 - study on technological equipment conducted - procurement of IT and technological equipment, Institute connected, laboratory equipment	Output 4 – utilization of technology for teaching and learning processes, for demonstrations, and illustration of special courses, for the design of teaching aids and for the dissemination of such media beyond the confines of training institutions.	- rate of equipping of rooms with computers - number of computers per student, - percentage of courses with a page on the ISET website
	Activity 5 – Transportation facilities	Outcome 5 – Procurement of a cross-country vehicle, and school buses	Output 5- Access to ISET facilitated	Rate of procurement of transportation means
Component 2 – Institutional Capacity Building	Activity 1 – Studies on the regulatory framework for: - tertiary institutions;-	Outcome 1 - conduct and validation of studies (intermittent technical	Output 1 – - Tertiary education system decentralized and financially semi-autonomous; - The status of the	- rate of full-time employment administrative and education supervisory staff,- rate of employers’

	higher education staff	assistance for a 3-month period) - decree to reform the administrative and legislative framework of institutions - decree on new statutes governing teaching staff, and related financing mechanisms	teacher-researcher reviewed and upgraded.	contribution to the operating budget,- establishment of Management Committees and Scientific Councils, production of statistics, - fields of study defined
Component 2 - Institutional Capacity Building (cont'd)	Activity 2 – Operating: establishment of ISET (statutes, organization and structure in force)	Outcome 2 - - Decree to establish ISET, a public administrative institution of higher learning and research ISET has legal personality as well as administrative, financial, pedagogical and scientific autonomy - current management organs: Board of Directors, Management Committee, Pedagogic, Scientific and Research Council, Disciplinary Council - current executives : Director, Dean of studies, Secretary-General - the Ministry allocates an	Output 2 - - Scientific and technical committees implement performance-based management - Qualified and experienced administrative and education supervisory staff, - At least 50% of which are full time - ISET has adequate financial resources to carry out its trainee programmes	- publication of the establishment decree - appointment of executive and management bodies, - budget allocated by Ministry of Higher Education - % of budget from the provision of services - % of full-time staff - % of part-time teachers

		annual budget of MRO 600 million - at least 30% of operating budget sourced from provision of services		
Activity 3 Design of training programmes	Outcome 3 - Studies relating to training programmes: technical assistance for formulation of modular programmes - training courses include information technology for both teaching and apprenticeship - programmes have been vocationalized: the proportion of “case study” courses account for at least 60% s	Output 3 - - ISET’s training programmes reputed for quality: training modules are experimented, evaluated and updated through an iterative process -training programmes instill a culture of entrepreneurship, and the spirit of initiative and creativity - 70% of students are enrolled in short courses - student retention rate reaches at least 70% per field - programmes have been vocationalized: - 80% of those trained are recruited in jobs that match their field of specialization - At least 50% of economic operators and rural development institutions satisfied with the performance of those trained	- % of students enrolled in short courses, - rate of pupil retention per field, - % of those trained that are recruited in jobs that match their field of specialization - % of economic operators and rural development institutions satisfied with the performance of those trained	
Activity 4 – Establishment of results-based management mechanisms	Outcome 4 - Design of a statistical system of collection of gender-disaggregated data - Weighted continuous	Output 4 - the production of gender-disaggregated statistics makes for precise monitoring of enrolment - regular publication of university statistics - acknowledgement	- obtain statistics from the institution - teacher resignation rate	

		assessment of students - Teacher performance assessment - Assessment of all stakeholders (gardeners, technicians)	of academic performance is an incentive to students - management by teacher and other staff performance promotes the quality of services and teaching excellence	
	Activity 5 – Training	Outcome 5 - Technical Assistance for 6 P/months for training of department and subject field managers, further training of administrative staff in budget management, planning and programming.	Output 5 – Results-based management of ISET fosters efficiency in administrative services	Rate of administrative staff trained
Component 3: Support to Research- Development and Educational and Technological Innovations	Activity 1 - Establishment of the National Scientific Research Support Fund (FNARS) aims to encourage innovation, excellence and the search for appropriate solutions to concrete development problems.	Outcome 1 - - Establishment of the National Research Support Fund financed by ADF (UA 500,000 i.e. 40%), IDA (40%) and the Government (20%), - design of a manual of procedures specifying eligibility criteria for resources. Financing granted on a competitive basis to research teams working in education departments, Institutions of Higher Learning and Research	Output 1 - - Launching of research applied to Mauritania’s issues - increase in the volume of scientific publications while ensuring their quality and relevance. - at least 30% of research programmes and projects focussing primarily on women’s development concerns.	- A “National Research Commission” and “Specialised Technical Committees” (STC) will be set up to manage the “National Scientific Research Support Fund” (FNARS), - number of projects approved - rate of project abandonment - number of final reports submitted - percentage of research programmes and projects focussed primarily on women’s development concerns, FNARS sustainability strategy formulated,

		Centres. The FNARS is managed by a National Research Commission comprising technical scientific committees		- rate of increase in the volume of scientific publications with due quality and relevance ensured
Activity 2 - Creation of enterprise incubators	Outcome 2 - - Conduct a study for the creation of enterprise incubators - technical assistance, supervision, organisation of services and activities for enterprises will be entrusted to two supervisors (design engineers) for duration of 18 person/months. - Establishment of a Revolving Fund	Output 2 – - The creation of ‘Enterprise incubators’ should nurture technological innovations and the establishment of enterprises. They should also act as a meeting point of the requirements of economic operators and small-scale producers and the ideas and creativity of teachers, researchers and other designers. - At least 10 pilot projects or experiments (activity-research-teaching) conducted within the framework of “enterprise incubators”	- number of pilot projects or experiments selected during the first year, - annual growth rate of the number of projects	
Activity 3 - Development of the experimental agricultural scheme	Outcome 3 - The workshops, experimental farms and specialized laboratories are equipped and operational	Output 3- The experimental agricultural scheme allows for vocationalization of students, gets them involved in research procedure and encourages innovation.	Rate of utilization of experimental farm per field of study, number of research works per year	
Activity 4 - Sensitization to	Outcome 4 - - Sensitization	Output 4 - - The MEN conducts a	- girls enrolment rate at ISET,	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - girls' enrolment at higher education level, especially in the scientific and technical fields, encourage parents to send girls to hostels - STD/AIDS 	<p>campaign to promote the entrance of girls into tertiary level science institutions g, conducted in conjunction with the relevant ministries.</p> <p>Besides girls, the drive will target parents, community leaders, associations and groups of women and youth;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Sensitization to STD/AIDS conducted given high risk in project area. - formulation of a sustainable communication strategy 	<p>sustainable communication strategy</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Increased awareness of STD/AIDS - Formulation of a medium-term strategy that makes for sustainable sensitization campaigns 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - issuance of a sensitization progress report, - communication strategy
<p>Component 3 - Support to Research-Development and Educational and Technological Innovations (cont'd)</p>	<p>Activity 5 - Outreach programme – support to local communities</p>	<p>Outcome 5 -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Allocation of some space on the project demonstration area to women. - Provide them with technical supervision in their activities 	<p>Output 5 -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 5% annual increase in the number of “Outreach Programs” for surrounding rural communities. - Diversification of production, increased productivity and competitiveness of products through improvement of cropping techniques. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Improved management and use of marketing channels - Women achieve economic self-reliance and develop business culture 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Number of “Outreach Programs” for neighbouring rural communities during first year, - 5% annual rate of increase in the number of beneficiaries, - turnover growth rate for cooperatives which benefited from the programmes, - percentage of women beneficiaries

Component 4: Support to the Project Management Unit	Activity 1 – Furniture and equipment	Outcome 1 - - Additional furniture purchased for the support staff recruited under the project, - procurement of information technology equipment and a cross-country vehicle	Output 1 – The capacities of the DPEF are strengthened; the procurement of a cross-country vehicle allows for the conduct of supervision and technical inspection missions	- frequency of supervision missions in the course of the works
	Activity 2 - Technical assistance	Outcome 2 - - Recruitment of an international expert to prepare the curricula and define specifications for requisite education and technical equipment, - Recruitment of an architect or civil engineer to draw the architectural plans and supervise works. - 2 foremen recruited locally will assist the architect	Output 2 – Teaching programmes and curricula of high quality	recruitments conducted
	Activity 3 - Operating	Outcome 3 - Funds are set aside for: - benefits, fuel, repairs and maintenance of the DPEF vehicle, and other general expenses, - auditing expenses, - training of project leader and accountant.	Output 3 - DPEF produces high quality field work, --- audit reports, which are submitted on a yearly basis, are compliant with ADB directives, - progress reports quarterly	Number and quality of audit reports and progress reports

5. For every dimension of the logical framework, briefly indicate (in not more than two sentences) the extent to which the logical framework contributed to achieving the under-mentioned objectives. Rate the appraisal by using the scoring scale provided in appendix 1. If no logical framework exists, score this section as a 1 (one).

CHARACTERISTICS OF THE LOGICAL FRAMEWORK		APPRAISAL	SCORE
LOGICAL	a) Expect a logical sequence to the achievement of the project's development objectives.	The logical framework is specified but incomplete. The component activity / outcome / output logical sequence is not detailed. The document does not lay down in-depth conditions for sustainability of funded activities.	3
MEASURABLE	b) Quantify the objectives and outputs.	Some outputs are quantified. However, the time frame for realization of outputs (short-, medium-, long-term) is not stated. Some outputs are not justified (proportion of girls enrolled at ISET increased from 10 to 75%). In addition, owing to delays, outputs are not achievable as at the date of the completion report	2
DETAILED	c) State the key risks and assumptions.	Two key risks identified: delays and academic isolation stemming from the remote location of ISET of Rosso. However, political risk not mentioned (Cf. Annex 6). The lack of financial visibility continues to hinder the development of ISET. Finally, there is poor communication between the project and the DPEF: the ADB has not received official invitations to coordination meetings with the other economic and financial partners.	2

D. OUTCOMES AND OUTPUTS

I. OUTCOMES OBTAINED

In the table below, for each main activity, assess the actual vs. expected outcomes. Import the expected outcomes from the logical framework in Section C. Score the extent to which the expected outcomes were achieved. Weight the scores by the activities' approximate share of project costs. Weighted scores are auto-calculated by the computer. The overall outcome score will be auto-calculated as the sum of the weighted scores. Override the auto-calculated score, if desired

MAIN ACTIVITIES		Appraisal Score	Share of project costs in percentage (as stated in the Appraisal Report)	Weighted Score(auto-calculated)
Expected Outcomes	Actual Outcomes			
Component 1 Outcome 1 - Technical studies conducted - Rehabilitation of former premises - Construction of school and residential buildings, and acceptance	- delay in construction works: actual start-up in January 2007 (scheduled for March 2003). "Groupement mauritano-tunisien" selected. EGB/TP/SBF registered poor performance in the completion of administrative and technical documents, poor internal	2	34.42	0.69

<p>- Construction of an access ramp (road) to the ISET - Supervision and monitoring of works carried out</p>	<p>organization, failed to commit the requisite human and material resources; - flawed works specifications in the initial contract, leading to poor finishing - rehabilitation: defects detected: paint swellings due to poor preparation of surfaces, air conditioning not working. - construction: woodwork gnawed by termites; RMN : numerous cracks in the tarmac (poor quality materials and implementation), poor sanitation. - access ramp completed in November 2009 - works supervised by SCET Tunisie inspection consultancy and the assistant architect of the contracting authority.</p>			
<p>Component 1 Outcome 2 - office furniture for administrative staff, school furniture, - furniture for the Research and Documentation Centre, - furniture for hostels (beds and tables), - kitchen and sports ground equipment</p>	<p>Procurement of furniture and equipment</p>	4	11.32	0.45
<p>Component 1 Outcome 3 Procurement of documentary resources</p>	<p>58% of documentary resources delivered</p>	2	0.08	0.00
<p>Component 1 Outcome 4 - study on technological equipment conducted - procurement of</p>	<p>- study on requisite educational equipment conducted by CIDE - procurement of 70 computers with high-speed connection</p>	4	9.77	0.39

information technology and technological equipment, connection of the Institute, laboratory equipment				
Component 1 Output 5 - Procurement of a cross-country vehicle, and school buses	procurement of a cross-country vehicle, and 2 buses	4	2.83	0.11

Component 2 Outcome 1-- conduct and validation of studies (intermittent technical assistance for a 3-month period) - decree to reform the administrative and legislative framework of institutions - decree to reform the new statutes governing teaching staff, and new financing mechanisms	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - study conducted by Tecsalt International on the regulatory framework of institutions of higher learning - study conducted by CIDE on the status of teaching staff of the education sub-sector. - validation of studies by representatives of the university and teachers' union, signing of the order to organize higher education on 20 February 2006. Adoption by the Council of Ministers of the decree on the organization and functioning of the University of Nouakchott on 26 July 2006. Adoption of decrees relating to the status of university teaching staff and researchers and of teaching hospitals on 30 August 2006, and to the status of technology teachers on 6 September 2006. - study on the "enterprise incubators" conducted by C2W International 	4	0.20	0.01
Component 2 Outcome 2 - Decree to establish ISET, a public,	- decree to establish the ISET on 2 April 2009 <i>However:</i>	2	0.20	0.00

<p>administrative institution of higher learning and research - ISET has legal personality as well as administrative, financial, pedagogical and scientific autonomy - current management organs: Board of Directors, Management Committee, Pedagogic, Scientific and Research Council, Disciplinary Council - current executives: Director, Dean of studies, Secretary-General - the Ministry allocates an annual budget of MRO 600 million - at least 30% of the operating budget sourced from the provision of services</p>	<p>- in reality, the ISET does not have the legal personality and financial autonomy which should be granted under a programme contract with the Ministry of Secondary and Higher Education - the Ministry of Higher education did not validate the ISET's strategic plan for 2009 - 2014 - the executive and deliberative bodies have not been appointed - the budget allocated by the Ministry of Higher Education stands at MRO 360 million compared to MRO 600 million expected - the share of services provided stands at 10%: this percentage is relatively high, given the meagre budget of the Ministry</p>			
<p>Component 2 Outcome 3 - Studies relating to training programmes: technical assistance for the design of modular programmes - training courses include information technology for both teaching and apprenticeship - programmes have been vocationalized: the proportion of "case study" courses account for at least 60% of vocational subjects</p>	<p>- Work executed by CIDE, contracted to participate in the design of modular training programmes, deemed satisfactory - training courses include information technology with respect to teaching aids and communication with students - % of school time devoted to practical training: first year 20%, second year 50%, third year 80%.</p>	4	1.87	0.07
<p>Component 2 Outcome 4 - Design of a statistical system of gender-based data collection - Weighted continuous</p>	<p>- Statistical system operational - teachers undergo performance assessment process. They are required to present the teaching</p>	4	0.40	0.02

<p>assessment of students - Teacher performance assessment - Assessment of all stakeholders (gardeners, technicians)</p>	<p>methodology for each course, as well as their oral remarks. In order to work on their teaching skills, teachers were filmed and the outcomes discussed collectively. Performance assessment affects all stakeholders of the ISET: from the gardener, responsible for filling in a daily sheet concerning his/her plot, through the student to the teacher.</p>			
---	---	--	--	--

<p>Component 2 Outcome 5 - Technical Assistance for 6 months/P for the training for department and branch managers, further training for administrative staff in budget management, planning and programming.</p>	<p>Technical assistance replaced by training courses: the administrative staff of the ISET (33 persons) attended a one-week training course in Tunisia and Morocco in March 2009, for the purpose of acquiring in-depth managerial and scientific skills. In addition, the staff in charge of the laboratories (14 persons), handling and equipment received 15-day training in Senegal. Furthermore, 113 higher education teachers attended a one-month training course financed by ADB and IDA on: management, the teaching of Arabic, biology, thermodynamics, private law, etc.</p>	3	9.86	0.30
<p>Component 3 Outcome 1 - Establishment of FNARS financed by the ADF (UA 500,000 i.e. 40%), IDA (40%) and the Government (20%), - design of a manual of procedures specifying eligibility criteria for resources. Financing</p>	<p>Establishment of the FNARS financed by the ADF (UA 500,000 i.e. 40%), IDA (40%) and the Government (20%) on 16 May 2005. A manual of procedures specifying eligibility criteria for fund resources has been designed. Out of the 22 research projects selected, 5 researchers abandoned their</p>	3	8.51	0.26

<p>is granted on a competitive basis to research teams working in education departments, Institutions of Higher Learning and Research Centres. The FNARS is managed by a National Research Commission comprising technical scientific committees</p>	<p>research work after receiving their first financing, while 17 researchers have submitted their second interim report and 9 the final report. 8 final reports are still awaited.</p>			
---	--	--	--	--

<p>Component 3 Outcome 2 - Conduct a study for the creation of enterprise incubators - technical assistance, supervision, organisation of services and activities for enterprises will be entrusted to two supervisors (design specialists) for a duration of 18 person/months. - Establishment of a Revolving Fund</p>	<p>C2W International consultancy (Tunisia) was recruited for a 3-month period to ensure the creation, supervision and organization of the “enterprise incubator nursery” (4th quarter of 2009). However, the “enterprise incubator” was not created, given that the working capital earmarked was allocated to the construction of the ramp to ISET from the future Bogue-Rosso road. Consequently, ISET did not receive the technical assistance intended for the actual creation of the incubator.</p>	2	2.41	0.05
<p>Component 3 Outcome 3 - Workshops, experimental farm and specialized laboratories are equipped and operational</p>	<p>Studies for the development of the experimental farm were conducted by Tasmin/ID consultancy. The experimental farm should allow for agricultural research, demonstration, dissemination of new irrigation techniques. Owing to an unsuccessful bid launched at the end of the project, the experimental farm has not been developed.</p>	2	3.18	0.06

<p>Component 3 Outcome 4 - Sensitization campaign to promote the entrance of girls into scientific institutions of higher learning, conducted in conjunction with the relevant ministries. Besides girls, the drive will target parents, community leaders, associations and groups of women and youths; - Sensitization to STD/AIDS conducted on account of the risky project area - formulation of a sustainable communication strategy</p>	<p>- Sensitization campaign conducted by Women’s Science and Development NGOs and SSF in November 2009; it targeted girls enrolled in private and public secondary institutions through objective “chats”: i) sensitization of girls to the importance of enrolling in the scientific, technical and vocational fields, ii) showcasing the ISET of Rosso. 8900 girls sensitized in 178 secondary institutions including 122 at Nouakchott. Radio and TV spots, visual aids (brochures, stickers) carried out in collaboration with target groups and then broadcast. - Sensitization to STD/AIDS conducted in November 2009 by the NGO SSF covered both the school and non school populations of Rosso, through “chats”. 3000 persons participated, production of video and paper aids in conjunction with target groups. 10000 persons listened to radio messages through the Rosso FM radio.</p>	3	1.00	0.00
<p>Component 3 Outcome 5 - Allocation of some space in the project demonstration area to women. - Providing them with technical supervision in their activities</p>	<p>The funds meant for extension programmes were not paid. However, during its first year of operation, ISET embarked on two programmes beneficial to the neighbouring communities, namely: the carbonization of coal, 15 additional units of which should be replicated, and the development of food technologies for a women’s fruit cooperative.</p>	3	0.67	0.02

Component 4 Outcome 1 - Additional furniture or the support staff recruited under the project, - procurement of computer equipment and a cross-country vehicle	Procurement of additional furniture (1 living-room set, 2 bookcases) and equipment (computer unit, laptop, photocopy machine), procurement of a cross-country vehicle	4	0.91	0.04
Component 4 Outcome 2 - Recruitment of an international expert to prepare the curricula and define specifications for requisite technical teaching equipment, - Recruitment of an architect or civil engineer to draw the architectural plans and supervise works. - 2 foremen recruited locally will assist the architect	- CIDE, the Canadian consulting firm, participated in the preparation of curricula - architect assisting contracting authority has been recruited - however, the DPEF did not recruit any foreman	3	0.41	0.01
Component 4 Outcome 3 Funds are set aside for: - benefits, fuel, repair and maintenance of the DPEF vehicle, and other general expenses, - auditing expenses, - training of project leader and accountant	- project leader and accountant trained in 2008 - audits conducted on a regular basis. Reports for 2008 and 2009 reviewed - half-yearly rappers produced with exception of those for December 2009 and March 2010.	3	5.26	0.16
OVERALL SCORE FOR OUTCOMES [corresponds to the weighted score totals]				3

Check here to override auto-calculated score

Give reasons for overriding auto-calculated score

II. OUTPUTS

1. Using the monitoring data available, assess expected outputs for each major activity. Import the expected outputs from the logical framework in Section C. Score the extent to which the expected outputs were achieved. Weight the scores by the activities' approximate share of project costs. Weighted scores are auto-calculated by the computer. The overall output score will be auto-calculated as the sum of the weighted scores. Override the auto-calculated score, if desired, and provide justification.


OUTPUTS		Appraisal Score
Expected	Actual	
<p>Component 1 Output 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Infrastructure operational and of high quality - the ISET setting is a factor of attraction for both teachers and students - sustainable maintenance of buildings - Increase in ISET enrolment applications to the tune of 20% per year and accounts for about 30% of high school graduates 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Learning environment – ISET of Rosso is reputed for the attention given to the learning environment, especially to university hostels. The construction of an all-female hostel (with a 124-bed capacity) is a determining factor for parents in allowing their daughters to pursue university studies. - Of the 126 students enrolled for the first academic year 2009-2010 (i.e. 4.9% of high school graduates), 22 were girls. This figure reflects: i) the overall low enrolment of the first batch in ISET, ii) the low participation of girls in the sciences, iii) the reluctance of parents to send their daughters far away from home. This reality calls for sensitization campaigns. However, the girls have recorded an outstanding 100% retention rate: the 20 cases of drop-outs were all boys. - The proportion of girls enrolled in ISET was expected to increase from 10 to 75%. However, this increase is absolutely unrealistic in the short term, given the weak presence of women in higher education, the reluctance of parents to send girls far away from their family homes, the limited accommodation capacity of university hostels. Furthermore, it is ethically unjustified. 	3
<p>Component 1 Output 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Furniture make for quality working and living environment 	The quality of students' working environment far exceeds n Mauritanian standards.	4
<p>Component 1 Output 3</p> <p>As a result of documentary resources, pedagogic teams and students alike have access to updated reference systems for scientific research</p>	ISET lacks the reference systems needed for teaching and learning. The purpose of a digital library is to offset this inadequacy.	2
<p>Component 1 Output 4</p> <p>Utilization of technology for teaching and learning to demonstrate and illustrate special courses, for the design of teaching</p>	ICTs are omnipresent in the learning, teaching and dissemination process. Students are familiarised with technologies, which are a daily working tool.	4

aids and for the dissemination of such media beyond the confines of training institutions.		
Component 1 Output 5 - Access to the ISET facilitated	ISET has constructed an access ramp. However, given that the Bogue-Rosso road is not completed, access to the ISET is still very difficult, which denotes poor coordination at the local level.	2
Component 2 Output 1 - The tertiary education system is decentralised and financially semi-autonomous; - The status of the teacher-researcher is reviewed and upgraded.	- In spite of decrees relating to higher education, ISET is not administratively and financially autonomous. - The teacher-researchers of ISET receive compensation equivalent to double the normal salary for the Ministry: this allowance serves as incentive for teachers to settle at Rosso. Despite such salary increment, the status of teachers is uncertain: they are hired on a one-year contract, given that the Ministry of Higher Education failed to validate budget statements.	2
Component 2 Output 2 - Scientific and technical committees implement a performance-based management - The administrative and education supervisory staff are qualified and experienced, - at least 50% are full-time employees - ISET has enough financial resources for the implementation of its programmes	- In the absence of designated institutional bodies, the quality of financial and scientific management depends entirely on the motivation of administrative and education supervisory teams. This state of affairs weakens the institution. The lack of financial resources impedes the fulfilment of ISET's mission, namely training, research and extension in the agro-pastoral and food sectors. Such shortcomings undermine ISET's institutional viability. - The administrative staff is trained and employed full-time. - the operating budget of ISET, which stands at MRO 350 million (compared to MRO 600 million provided for), does not allow for the implementation of experimental programmes in accordance with its requirements of excellence. Additional costs (food, miscellaneous maintenance, various scholarships), resulting from a two-fold increase in enrolment as schools resume, will undermine the financial viability of ISET.	1
Component 2 Output 3 - ISET's training programmes are outstanding for their quality: training modules are tested, evaluated and updated through an iterative process - training programmes instil a culture of	The efficiency of programmes cannot be appraised, given the recent opening of ISET in January 2010. The students selected have just completed their first year in school. The first batch to be awarded a vocational bachelor's degree will graduate in 2012. The	3

<p>entrepreneurship, and the spirit of initiative and creativity</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 70% of students are enrolled in short courses - Pupil retention rate reaches at least 70% per field - programmes have been vocationalized: - 80% of those trained are recruited in jobs that match their field of specialisation - At least 50% of economic operators and rural development structures satisfied with the performance of those trained 	<p>pioneer class to be awarded a master's degree will graduate in 2014. The ADB may then conduct an ex-post appraisal.</p>	
<p>Component 2 Output 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the production of gender-based statistics makes for precise monitoring of enrolment - regular publication of university statistics - acknowledgement of academic performance is an incentive to students - management by teacher and other staff performance promotes the quality of services and teaching excellence 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - ISET keeps accurate statistics (abandonment...) - In spite of difficult beginnings due to parasitic diseases (malaria), the students performed satisfactorily during the first year. - The continuous assessment of teachers helps to improve on their teaching skills. Teaching quality is excellent. 	3
<p>Component 2 Output 5 – The results-based management of the ISET makes for efficiency of administrative services</p>	<p>Resource management is effective. Some investment expenditure financed with operating expenditure (agricultural equipment, particularly).</p>	3
<p>Component 3 Output 1 –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Research applied to Mauritania's issues is launched - increase volume of scientific publications while ensuring their quality and utility. - at least 30% of research programmes and projects focus primarily on women's development concerns. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The FNARS has helped to launch research in themes applicable to Mauritania's problems. The huge number of projects submitted (70 projects), linked to about 400 teacher-researchers, reveals Mauritania's research potentials. - The percentage (30%) of research programmes devoted primarily to women's development concerns has not been attained. - The Directorate of Scientific Research has not made any proposal regarding the sustainability and reorientation of this fund, pending the publication of the "scientific research sector policy". - Inefficiency due to poor validation of research findings, lack of synergy amongst programmes, limited involvement of experienced researchers in the training of young researchers, low-level of commitment of specialized entities in the scientific support to projects and their financial management, lack of formalization of 	2

	international cooperation and failure to pool technical resources.	
Component 3 Output 2 - The creation of ‘Enterprise incubators should catalyze technological innovations and the incorporation of enterprises. They should also act as a meeting point for the requirements of economic operators and small-scale producers with ideas and the creativity of teachers, researchers and other designers. - At least 10 pilot projects or experiments (activity-research-teaching) within the framework of “enterprise incubators” conducted	Activity not carried out	1
Component 3 Output 3 – The experimental agricultural scheme allows for the vocationalization of students, involves them in research procedures and encourages innovation.	Failure to implement this activity undermines the mission and objectives of ISET, namely training and research.	1
Component 3 Output 4 – - The MEN conducts a sustainable communication strategy -- Increased awareness of STD/AIDS - Formulation of a medium-term strategy that makes for sustainable sensitization campaigns	- Sensitization campaigns to promote the entrance of girls into scientific and technical institutions of higher learning do not allow for measuring the short-term impact. The campaign should be conducted by an iterative process, so as to produce real impact. Consequently, the Ministry of Higher Education should formulate a sustainable communication strategy. - There is a marked increase in the rate of STD/AIDS awareness: 100% of ISET students have been sensitized and screened. The impact of the campaign on the inhabitants of Rosso stems from the permanent presence of the team of Doctors Without Borders in the area. However, the Ministry of Health should establish a partnership with this NGO, with a view to ensuring the sustainability of this action.	2
Component 3 Output 5 – - 5% annual increase in the number of “Outreach Programs” for neighbouring rural communities. - Diversification of production, increase in the productivity and competitiveness of their products through the improvement of cropping techniques. – Better control and use of marketing channels - Women achieve economic self-reliance	- The quantitative appraisal of the extension programme for local communities is not possible, since ISET has only recently been opened (in January 2010). - However, although the payment of funds intended for extension programmes has not been made, ISET stands out for its dynamism and creativity. In addition to the two activities implemented, ISET envisages the development of poultry and fish farming programmes. These programmes are	3

and develop business culture	effective with respect to ownership: they are underpinned by the financial contributions of beneficiaries (training fees, packaging cost), who have embraced self-reliance and entrepreneurship. - Women are the principal beneficiaries, and they demonstrate a strong zeal and willingness to learn.	
Component 4 Output 1 – The capacities of the DPEF are strengthened; the procurement of a cross-country vehicle allows for the conduct of supervision and technical inspection missions	The supervision of works by the DPEF was crucial for the completion of the operation. Indeed, the company, overwhelmed by the sheer magnitude of the works and finishing requirements, almost abandoned the construction site. However, the DPEF should have stepped up its presence by employing the 2 foremen provided for at appraisal.	4
Component 4 Output 2 – The pedagogic procedures and curricula are of high quality	The work carried out by CIDE consultancy, put on contract to participate in the design of curricula, is deemed satisfactory. A list of skills to be mastered by students by the end of the semester (student learning outcome) has been drawn up for each module. Courses have been designed following the skills-based approach. Research activities have been proposed to boost self-reliance, entrepreneurship, and to enable the student to be well versed in the university –level intellectual approach. ISET training programmes are remarkable for their quality and vocationalization trend.	3
Component 4 Output 3 - The DPEF turns in work of high quality reflecting the realities on the ground, audit reports, which are submitted on a yearly basis, are compliant with ADB directives, and progress reports are submitted on a quarterly basis	Quarterly progress reports are compliant with the Bank’s directives. However, the missing progress reports for December 2009 and March 2010 are a cause for concern. The audit reports for 2008 and 2009 should be rectified. The training courses for the project leader and accountant were delayed (2008) and thus could not be beneficial during the project cycle.	3
OVERALL SCORE FOR OUTPUTS [corresponds to the average appraisal score]		3

 **Check here to override the calculated score**

Give reasons for overriding auto-calculated score	
Insert new score or re-enter the auto-calculated score	3

2. ther outputs: Comment on the additional outputs not envisaged in the logical framework, and which bear particularly on cross-cutting issues (e.g. gender).

- **Gender:** The project incorporates the gender issue which is one of the development priorities of government strategies. Indeed, the Ministry of Women's, Children's and Family Welfare (MCPFEF) has formulated a National Gender Mainstreaming Strategy (SNIG) with a view to fostering gender mainstreaming in all public policies.

- **Additional Outputs:**

- i) The structure of ISET of Rosso offers study possibilities to workers and technicians through continuing training sessions.
- ii) The infrastructure of the university hostel is based on the principle of room-sharing. This system is a vector of social cohesion: it encourages boarders from various social and cultural backgrounds to mingle, whereas Mauritania is deeply divided along racial and ethnic lines.
- iii) Opportunities for remuneration, offered to students through scholarship grants or employment, improve their standard of living.
- iv) The creation of a pole of excellence in higher education may have a spill-over effect on the secondary education sector. However, this linkage will require the planning and adoption of specific measures concerning colleges and high schools. According to World Bank statistics, the gross enrolment ratio into the first cycle of secondary education stood at 26.3% in 2004 (24% in 2000). The gross enrolment ratio into the second cycle of secondary education stood at 19.3% in 2004 (14.4% in 2000). As regards gender, girls accounted for only 27.4 % of baccalaureate holders in 2008.
- iv) ISET's technological innovations have a positive environmental impact. The production of coal from bulrush algae has helped to find a fuel substitute and to control alga invasion on backwaters. Generally, ISET boosts ecological awareness (recycling, composting, and utilization of biomass).
- v) ISET contributes to improving the health of the local populations: in addition to STD/AIDS campaigns, ISET carries out integrated control of malaria and parasites.
- v) The achievements of ISET have had a beneficial economic impact on the region whose traditional activities are trade and agriculture. The maintenance of infrastructure will help to diversify local employment in the long run.

3 Risks to sustained achievement of outputs. State the factors that affect, or could affect the long-term or sustained achievement of project outputs. Indicate if any new activity or institutional change is recommended to help sustain outputs. The analysis should draw upon the sensitivity analysis in Annex 3, where appropriate.

Component 1 - Infrastructure The sustainability of ISET's infrastructure requires repair or correction of all defects, particularly carpentry work, painting and RMN by the contractors prior to definitive acceptance of the works. A steady increase in enrolment will require the construction of additional dormitories. To ensure high-standards of teaching and learning, there must be prompt delivery of educational reference materials.

Component 2 – Functioning of ISET (cf. Annex 6) – The Ministry of Higher Education has initiated a reform of the regulatory framework, which is not fully in force. With respect to ISET, the ministry should in particular i) validate ISET's strategic plan in order to ensure its sustainability, ii) appoint the executive and management organs so as to enable a performance-based administrative and academic management (functioning is currently predicated on the presence of the director who is motivated and inspires his teams), iii) allocate the scheduled operating budget (MRO 600 million) so as to defray operating expenses of the school (maintenance of infrastructure, restoration, health services, scholarship grants), iv) validate budget statements corresponding to the positions of teachers (until now, ISET employs teachers on a contract basis, and such uncertainty undermines academic excellence), v) grant educational, administrative and financial autonomy and sign a results-based management contract programme with the State. Autonomy is the shield

needed against political manipulation of the institution. Mauritania may increase ISET's budget once public finance tension has subsided, through an agreement with the IMF scheduled for December 2009. For its part, ISET should strengthen its cooperation with economic stakeholders in the design of curricula with a view to constantly adapting its training courses to job market requirements. ISET should open its doors to countries of the sub-region, so as to step up its revenue from tuition and educational impact.

Component 3 - FNARS - The FNARS helped to revive research in Mauritania, but its design was not sustainable. The Ministry should remedy such design defects by formulating a sustainability strategy. Nevertheless, the fund should seek to improve: i) the focussing of researchers' efforts around research themes that are more in line with the national research policy ii) the appraisal process: a report format should be predefined with a view to facilitating the monitoring/evaluation of the activities of research teams. iii) the strengthening of financial and human resources iv) training components (experienced researchers should be committed to training young researchers), and scientific upgrade of research findings v) intensification of international cooperation, vi) creation of entities specialized in the scientific attendance of projects and their financial management.

Sensitization Campaigns - Sensitization campaigns to promote the enrolment of girls in scientific institutions of higher learning and for STD/AIDS awareness are efficient only as an iterative effort. The Ministries of Higher Education and Health should formulate sustainability strategies. In particular, the implementation report on sensitization campaigns to promote the enrolment of women underscores the need to organize the chats with girls (all girls in secondary schools) as well as families and other stakeholders. Such sensitization campaigns require the speedy development of technical and vocational education in other localities apart from Rosso.

E. PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS FOR IMPLEMENTATION

- 1. Indicate to what extent the Bank and Borrower ascertained that the Project takes into account the Borrower's capacity to implement the project, while ensuring that the project is well designed and that the mechanism necessary for its implementation has been put in place. Analyse all aspects of project design. Issues arising from project design are: whether the project's design takes into account lessons drawn from previous PCRs in the sector or in the country (name a few key PCRs); whether the project is based on serious analytical studies (name a few key documents); whether the Bank and Borrower adequately evaluated the capacity of the executing agencies and project implementation unit, the degree of consultations and partnerships, the project's economic justification and the arrangements made for technical assistance.**
- 2. [Up to 250 words. Any other statement on project implementation should be presented in annex 6 entitled: Project Description]**

Design – The schedule proposed at appraisal was unrealistic: the initial 5-year implementation timeframe was underestimated. The project should have taken into account the timeframe needed for the conduct of technical feasibility studies and the systematic delays inherent in operations. The project comprises an excessive number of components, entailing substantial losses during implementation. The authorities and the DPEF focussed on ISET's infrastructure component, whereas support to the PNDSE comprised a regulatory component whose implementation is not effective, and a yet uncompleted educational / enterprise development / extension component. The current dynamism of ISET rides on the personality of its director, an accomplished biotechnology researcher who has had a rich career in the United States, and not by its structural foundation.

Lessons drawn from previous PCRs in the Sector or Country – In order to overcome procurement red tape and recurrent delays in previous projects, Mauritania has adopted the standard Bidding Documents of the Bank. Moreover, the project provides for ad hoc technical assistance to build the capacities of the Project Implementation Unit (DPEF).

Project's Analytical Foundation – The project ties in with the PNDSE formulated by the Mauritanian

authorities and the Poverty Reduction Strategic Framework. It is based on the Bank's experience in the education sector as well as on a series of studies on the rural sector (training, employment and production issues), restructuring of higher education (BIEF, 1999), the Poverty Reduction Strategic Framework, the PNDSE, and the "Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper" (World Bank and International Monetary Fund, 2001). Design was based on a participatory approach.

Assessing the Capacity of Executing Agencies and the Project Implementation Unit - Project management is carried out by the Directorate of Education and Training Projects (DPEF) under the aegis of the Steering Committee set up to that end. The DPEF has proven experience, acquired through about twenty years in the management of education sector projects for various donors. While it is true that the Project Implementation Unit has qualified staff (a financial administrator and procurement specialist), it should also be acknowledged that the ADB has strengthened its capacities by seconding consultants, including an assistant architect, to the contracting authority. However, the institutional arrangements made by the Mauritanian party for the management and coordination of the PNDSE are excessive and inefficient.

Degree of Consultations and Partnerships – The project was identified by the MEN, based on the needs expressed by economic operators of the food and agricultural sector, and by rural development associations and cooperatives. The programme components and the curriculum were designed using a participatory approach involving: financing bodies, national economic operators including the Federation of economic operators of the agricultural and pastoral sectors, institutions of technology education, political and administrative authorities at the central and regional levels, women's associations, economic and financial partners present at Nouakchott. Furthermore, the mission held working sessions with the national teachers and researchers' community, various working groups involved in the preparation of the National Poverty Reduction Strategy and of the Ten-year Education Programme. However, it has been shown that enterprises should be further involved in the design, monitoring and appraisal of training and research programmes through an on-going process. Appraisal does not identify prospective private partners.

Project's Economic Justification and Technical Assistance Arrangements – The project aims to foster the country's competitiveness through the training of skilled human resources. The advanced training provided at ISET should produce skilled labour capable of stepping up productivity in a sector that accounts for 19% of GDP. More specifically, the objective of the project is to diversify production, develop new techniques and sustain the optimal use of marketing channels in the agro-pastoral and forestry sectors and food technologies. The positive linkage effects on economic development contribute to poverty reduction, as specified in the PRSF.

2. Evaluate briefly each dimension of project design and implementation readiness, (not more than 2 sentences) Rate the appraisal using the scoring scale shown in Appendix 1.

ASPECTS OF PROJECT DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION READINESS		APPRAISAL	Appraisal Score
REALISM	a) Due to its complexity, the project is underpinned by an analysis of the country's capacity and political commitment.	The project ties in with a ten-year national programme (PNDSE), which attests to the commitment of authorities in the education sector. However, the country's capacity to ensure project sustainability is under-estimated.	3
RISK ASSESSMENT AND MITIGATION	b) Project design includes adequate risk analysis	The appraisal document does not mention the risks of political instability in Mauritania over the past decade. And yet, this instability further delayed the signing and led to harmful institutional restructuring with adverse effects.	2
USE OF THE COUNTRY'S SYSTEMS	c) Project procurement, financial management, monitoring and/or other systems are based on systems already in use by the government and/or other partners.	Yes	4

For the under-mentioned aspects, award separate appraisal scores for Bank performance and Borrower performance:			Appraisal score	
			Bank	Borrower
CLARITY	d) Responsibilities for project implementation are clearly defined.	Yes, in spite of the discontinuity with regard to task managers	3	3
PROCUREMENT READINESS	e) Necessary implementation documents (specifications, design, procurement, etc.) were ready at appraisal.	Yes	3	4
MONITORING READINESS	f) Indicators and monitoring schedule are adopted.	Indicators are unrealistic, the monitoring schedule is adopted	3	3
BASELINE DATA	h) Baseline data collection is completed or on-going.	Completed	4	3

F. IMPLEMENTATION

1. State the major characteristics of project implementation with reference to: compliance with schedules, quality of construction or other work, performance of consultants, effectiveness of Bank supervision and effectiveness of Borrower oversight. Assess how well the Bank and the Borrower ensured compliance with safeguards.
2. [At most 300 words. [Any other statement on project implementation should be presented in annex 6 entitled: Project Description]

Schedule Compliance - The delay at project start-up (the loan effectiveness date was 20 October 2002, i.e. 10 months after the date of signature) is due to the authorities' decision to await the validation of the PNDSE as the overall intervention framework for all technical and financial partners. Furthermore, the delay is as a result of the duration of preliminary technical studies relating to construction, equipment and the design of training and research programmes. In addition, the cost estimates for construction works produced by STUDI, an architectural consulting firm, (UM 2,910 billion, i.e. UA 7 461 538 .46) were 3.3 times the allocated budget and accounted for about 90% of the total ADF loan amount (UA 8 293 000).

Consequently, the ADB recommended that the Government review this institution's architectural programme so as to stay within the budget allocated by the project. Finally, the Government increased its financial contribution to the project to UA 5.9 M. The selected Mauritano-Tunisian group, EGB TP/SBF, also recorded delays due largely to its internal organization, lack of exhaustiveness of documents submitted by EGB TP/SBF and non compliance with Bidding Document specifications, to tax credit problems and the lack of an operationalization plan. Hence, the construction/rehabilitation of ISET, scheduled between March 2003 and May 2004, only began on 1 January 2007. Institutional instability caused by military coups (*Cf. Annex 6*) extended the signature deadlines. Recurrent cabinet reshuffles have complicated the implementation and monitoring of activities. Other activities like the FNARS and sensitization campaigns have also been delayed.

Effectiveness of Bank Supervision- The ADB failed to comply with the monitoring/evaluation schedule as specified in the appraisal report. The mid-term review was not conducted; supervision reports are inadequate with respect to frequency and content. The ADB did not participate in the biannual coordination meetings organized by DPEF with the TFPs involved in the sector.

Effectiveness of Borrower Oversight – Borrower oversight is related to the Government’s motivation concerning this project, and most especially regarding ISET of Rosso. The Government’s counterpart contribution, set at UA 1.407 M, (i.e. 14.51% of the total amount) at appraisal, was increased to UA 5.90 M (i.e. 41.6% of the total amount). The DPEF, the contracting authority’s representative, has instituted a weekly monitoring mechanism through a team comprising a technical coordinator and an assistant architect during the various phases of the project. ISET, the beneficiary of the infrastructure, also monitored the works, backing up the works inspection section.

Quality of Construction and other Works - Rehabilitation / construction works executed by the Mauritiano-Tunisian group EGB/TP/SBF are flawed by poor finishing due to the: i) poor quality of building equipment used ii) under-estimated geotechnical difficulties, iii) inadequately skilled workers, iv) unofficial sub-contracting of the electricity, fluids and site development components. The company did not fully realize the magnitude of the operation and the scope of requirements expected. **Performance of Consultants** – The design of curricula as well as the specification of teachers’ profiles and technological equipment for ISET was done by CIDE, a Canadian consultancy. Having requested work of high quality adapted to Mauritania’s realities, ISET is satisfied with the collaboration. The study on the “enterprises incubators”, conducted by the Tunisian consultancy C2W International, has been deemed satisfactory. The study for the development of the experimental farm, conducted by Tasmin, has been validated. The consulting architect assisting the contracting authority, Mr. Cheikh Ahmedou, has produced work of high quality.

2. Comment on the role of other partners (for instance donors, NGOs, enterprises, etc.). Assess the effectiveness of co-financing arrangements and or donor coordination, if applicable.

Under the National Education System Development Programme (PNDSE) formulated by the Mauritanian authorities, the Bank intervenes in conjunction with the other donors (IDA, UNIECF, IDB, French Cooperation, OPEC and AFESD). Hence, the identification of the PNDSE support project was conducted as part of the consultation mission of February 2001, in which the World Bank had been involved. As regards cofinancing, the ADB and IDA contributed up to 40% respectively to the establishment of the National Scientific Research Support Fund (FNARS) (component 3 activity 2), while the Government financed the remaining 20%.

3. Harmonization. State whether the Bank made explicit efforts to harmonize instruments, systems and/or approaches with other partners.

The DPEF initiated a process to harmonize monitoring/evaluation: the Implementation Unit organizes biannual multi-donor review meetings, with a view to considering scheduled and implemented activities. This mechanism, cited as a good example of aid coordination, creates mutual responsibility between the DPEF (beneficiary) and donors. However, the technical and financial partners deplore the systematic absence of the ADB, which could be due to a communication problem between the DPEF and the Bank. The PCR has helped to remedy such problems so that ADB receives the necessary information.

4. For each dimension of project implementation, assess the extent to which the project achieved the following. Provide a brief assessment (up to two sentences) and insert an appraisal score using the scoring scale in Appendix 1.

ASPECTS OF PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION		APPRAISAL		Appraisal score
SCHEDULE COMPLIANCE	a) Level of compliance with projected closing date. If the gap on the right is:	Monthly gap between the projected closing date and the effective closing date or date of attainment of 98%		2
	below 12, score 4 between 12.1 and 24, score 3 between 24.1 and 36, score 2			

	above 36.1, score 1	disbursement	
		27 months (>2 yrs.)	
BANK PERFORMANCE	b) Bank compliance with::		
	Environmental protection measures	The project is classified under environmental category II, given that the expected impact is low and will be easily brought under control by project management. The aim of the project is to improve the institution's living and working environment through the development of green open spaces and a conducive social and educational environment. In the long run, the project, through its training courses, pilot activities and the dissemination of technical know-how, will contribute to a better environmental equilibrium in the context of deterioration of pastures, land saturation, degradation of vegetation cover, soil salinization, prevalence of water-borne diseases which are anomalies, nowadays compounded by migration and the settlement of hitherto nomadic populations in the Southern and South-Eastern regions.	4
	Fiduciary arrangements	The appraisal document specifies the fiduciary arrangements: management mechanisms, disbursements, annual audits and quarterly progress reports.	4
	Project agreements	The ADF loan agreement backs up the appraisal.	4
	c) Bank supervision was satisfactory in terms of the skills mix and the feasibility of solutions.	Yes, Bank supervision was deemed satisfactory, except the agreement for 3-month extensions that prevent contract award and delivery Extensions should be 6 months minimum, even one year.	3
	d) Bank supervision of project management was satisfactory.	Given the absence of mid-term review missions and of supervision missions (2 annual missions recommended), Bank oversight is rated fairly satisfactory	2
BORROWER PERFORMANCE	e) The Borrower complied with:		
	Environmental protection measures	Yes	4
	Fiduciary arrangements	Borrower complies with fiduciary arrangements. The reports for 2008 and 2009 required a corrigendum following misunderstandings between the DPEF and the audit firm.	3
	Project agreements	Yes. Government's counterpart contribution increased from UA1.407 M to UA 5.9 M, since the Government desired to extend the	4

		ISET construction / rehabilitation project	
	f) Borrower was responsive to Bank supervision findings and recommendations	Yes, on the whole	3
	g) Borrower collected and used monitoring information for decision-making	Most Bank recommendations have been implemented.	3

G. COMPLETION

1. Was the PCR submitted on schedule, in compliance with Bank Policy?			
Date project reached 98% disbursement Rate (or closing date, if applicable)	Date PCR was sent to pcr@afdb.org	Monthly gap	APPRAISAL SCORE (generated automatically) If the difference is equal to or less than 6 months, the score is 4. If the difference is above 6 months, the score is 1.
<p>Briefly describe the PCR process. Describe the Borrowers' and co-financiers' involvement in producing the document. Highlight any major differences of opinion concerning the assessments made in this PCR. Describe the team composition and confirm whether a site visit was undertaken. Mention any major collaboration from other development partners. State the extent of field office involvement in producing the report. Indicate whether comments from Peer Reviewers were received on time (provide names and positions of Peer Reviewers) [At most 150 words]</p> <p>The Completion Report preparation mission for this Project (PNDSE) was conducted by Mr. Nadab Hathoura MASSISSOU, Mrs. Odile MORNET-CARIOU, Education Consultant, Education Expert, and Mrs. Leïla JAAFOR KILANI, Social Development Specialist at the Morocco Field Office (MAFO). The mission was fielded from 28 July to 6 August 2010. The DPEF organized a discussion programme and a mission on the site of ISET in Rosso. The Project Management Unit was unable to submit the last two progress reports and the completion report. At the financial level, there is a great disparity between the data submitted by the DPEF and the ledgers of the ADB. Finally, given that the mission was fielded during the school holidays, the beneficiaries (teachers and students) could not be interviewed.</p>			

H. LESSONS LEARNED

<p>Summarize the <u>key</u> lessons the Bank and Borrower may eventually learn from project's outputs.</p> <p>[At most 300 words. Any other statement on project implementation should be presented in annex 6 entitled : Project Description]</p> <p><i>This Appraisal Report contains the conclusions of the Portfolio Review for 2009</i>, relating to the need to: conduct feasibility studies prior to project start-up so as to avoid late project start-up: architectural and technical studies conducted for the construction of ISET delayed the project;</p> <p>i) improve the quality of appraisal reports by providing a more detailed description of the various project components. The logical framework should systematically specify outputs and their rationale, measurable indicators as well as the periods involved;</p> <p>ii) Design mechanisms for sustainability of component outputs. In the case of the PNDSE support project, the sustainability of numerous components is threatened. The establishment of administrative</p>

and educational autonomy (validation of ISET's strategy, validation of budget statements corresponding to the positions of teachers, allocation of an annual budget of MRO 600 million) is imperative, as specified in the appraisal document. Furthermore, the Ministry of Higher Education should formulate a buildings maintenance strategy which may be part and parcel of the programme contract with ISET. Sensitization campaigns to promote the enrolment of girls in scientific institutions of higher learning and STD/AIDS awareness should be repeated and extended nationwide in order to have a real impact. This lesson had already been identified in the PCR of the Education Sector Support Project (PASDE) which indicated that sensitization campaigns to promote the enrolment of girls should be repeated. By the same token, a sustainability strategy should be designed in respect of the National Scientific Research Support Fund (FNARS), with a view to reviving research as applied to Mauritania's problems.

In addition, the appraisal report should:

- iii) **identify local partners upon project design.** Regarding the involvement of economic operators, the appraisal report does not specify any steps for cooperation arrangements between ISET and enterprises. The document does not identify any enterprises likely to cooperate in training design (component 1 activity 4). As concerns the participation of local communities (component 3 activity 5), procedures for selection of /communication with associations have not been specified.
- iv) **present a number of activities that match the Borrower's capacities:** an excessive number of measures detracts from quality (the agricultural experimentation plot and the nursery have not been created, the FNARS is not renewed, sensitization campaigns are not sustainable, and there is no long-term maintenance of infrastructure). The Borrower focussed on infrastructure aspects to the detriment of the effective implementation of reforms and institutional innovations (such as the incubator).

Project implementation should be based on:

- vi) **detailed consideration of costs** proposed in the technical specifications of bidding enterprises with a view to analysing inputs globally (quality of technical expertise and equipment, labour skill-level, etc.) which determine the quality of the final product;
- vii) **close monitoring of works** by the project's consulting engineer: the management unit should take appropriate measures against any poorly-performing enterprise as stipulated in the initial contract;
- viii) **conduct of the training for** the Implementation Unit at the beginning of the project cycle so as to make good use of the skills acquired;
- ix) **implementation of all activities:** the sustainability of the ISET project depends solely on the implementation of all activities informing its scientific coherence and relevance to the challenges identified: development of the productive sector in response to poverty reduction through training that meets the needs of the job market. Hence, the launching of the agricultural experimentation farm and the replenishment of the enterprise incubators fund and the extension fund should be effective as soon as possible. These elements are crucial to the sustainability of ISET. The Project Management Unit and ADB teams should be more demanding concerning the implementation of activities scheduled throughout the project cycle, rather than point out shortcomings at the close of the project.
- x) **improvement of Bank oversight:** in accordance with its policy, the Bank should field two biannual supervision missions and one mid-term review with all project stakeholders (administration, direct beneficiaries, contractors, economic and financial partners, etc.). In addition, the ADB should participate in biannual coordination meetings of economic and financial partners organized by the DPEF.

I. PROJECT SCORE SUMMARY

All appraisal scores are automatically computer-calculated in the relevant section of the PCR

CRITERIA	SUB-CRITERIA	Appraisal score
PROJECT OUTPUT	Achievement of Outcomes	3
	Achievement of Outputs	3
	Schedule compliance	2
	OVERALL SCORE FOR PROJECT OUTPUTS	3
BANK PERFORMANCE	Design and Readiness	
	Project objectives are relevant to the country's development priorities	4
	Project objectives are feasible with the project's inputs and in the expected timeframe	2
	Project objectives are consistent with the Bank's country or regional strategy	4
	Project objectives are consistent with the Bank's overall priorities	4
	The logical framework presents a logical causal sequence for achieving the project's development objectives.	3
	Objectives and outputs, as presented in the logical framework, are measurable and quantifiable	2
	The logical framework presents the risks and key assumptions	2
	The country's capacity and political commitment are commensurate with the project's complexity	3
	The project's design includes adequate risk analysis	2
	The procurement, financial management and monitoring systems and/or other processes are based on those already used by the Government and/or other partners.	4
	Project implementation responsibilities are clearly defined	3
	Requisite project implementation documents (on technical specifications, design, procurement, etc.) are ready at appraisal.	3
	Monitoring indicators and the monitoring schedule are adopted.	3
	Baseline data collection is completed or on-going.	4
	PARTIAL SCORE FOR PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS	3
	Supervision:	
	Bank compliance with:	
	Environmental protection measures	4
	Fiduciary arrangements	4
	Project agreements	4
	Bank supervision was satisfactory in terms of the skills mix and the feasibility of solutions	3
	Bank oversight of project management was satisfactory	2
	The PCR was submitted on a timely basis	0
	PARTIAL SCORE FOR SUPERVISION	3
	OVERALL SCORE FOR BANK PERFORMANCE	3

BORROWER PERFORMANCE	Design and Readiness	
	Responsibilities for project implementation are clearly defined	3
	Requisite project implementation documents (on technical specifications, design, procurement, etc.) are ready at appraisal.	4
	Monitoring indicators and the monitoring schedule are adopted; baseline data collection is completed or on-going.	3
	SCORE FOR PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS	
	Implementation	
	Borrower complied with:	
	Environmental protection measures	4
	Fiduciary arrangements	3
	Project agreements	4
	Borrower was responsive to Bank supervision findings and recommendations	3
	Borrower collected and used monitoring information for decision-making	3
	PARTIAL SCORE FOR IMPLEMENTATION	
	OVERALL SCORE FOR BORROWER PERFORMANCE	

J. PROCESSING

STAGE	SIGNATURE AND REMARKS	DATE
Sector Manager clearance	Mr. BOUKARY SAVADOGO	23 August 2010
Regional Director clearance	Mr. LOBE NDOUMBE	6 October 2010
Sector Director approval	Mr. BOUKARY SAVADOGO, OIC OSHD	8 October 2010

Scoring Scale and Explanations

SCORE	EXPLANATION
4	Very Good- Fully achieved with no shortcomings
3	Good- Most objectives achieved despite a few shortcomings
2	Fair- Partially achieved. Shortcomings and achievements are roughly balanced
1	Poor- Very limited achievement with extensive shortcomings
NA	Not Applicable

Note: The formulas round up or down for decimal points. Only whole numbers are computed.

1. Project Cost and Financing**a. Project Cost by Component in UA**

Components	ADF	National Counterpart Contribution	Total
I- Development of Basic Infrastructure (Rosso ISET)	9 384 290	4 784 067	14 168 357
II- Institution Building	432 791	0	432 791
III- Support to Research Development and Technological Innovations	74 857	40 343	115 200
IV- Support to the Project Management Unit	515 054	57 271	572 325
Total	10 406 992	4 881 680	15 288 673

b. Resources by Source of Financing

Category	ADF*			Government			Total		
	Amount allocated	Amount disbursed	% disbursed	Amount allocated	Amount disbursed	% disbursed	Amount allocated	Amount disbursed	% disbursed
Goods	2 592 000.00	2 591 070.05	99.96	420 000	10 000	2.38	3 012 000.00	2 601 070	86.36
Works	3 110 000.00	3 112 394.58	100.08	5 070 000	5 050 000	99.61	8 180 000.00	8 162 395	99.78
Services	2 172 000.00	1 515 135.47	69.76	410 000	90 000	21.95	2 582 000.00	1 605 135	62.17
Operating	419 000.00	99 925.89	23.85	0	0		419 000.00	99 926	23.85
Total	8 293 000.00	7 318 525.99	88.25	5 900 000	5 150 000	87.29	14 193 000.00	12 468 526	87.85

** Extracted from ledgers*

2. Bank Contributions. State the key team members and their duties during preparation and supervision. Provide a consolidated list of preparation, supervision and completion missions in chronological order. Enter the date and scores awarded by the previous supervision report.

Mission	Start Date	End Date		
<i>Identification</i>	Feb.-01		Education Analyst	
<i>Preparation</i>	May-01		Education Analyst	
<i>Appraisal</i>	Aug-01		Education Analyst, Gender Specialist, and Consulting Architect	
<i>Supervision</i> 6	1	09.09.2002	23.09.2002	Education Expert
	2	09.12.2002	24.12.2002	Education Expert
	3	26.06.2003	17.07.2003	Education Expert
	4	17.06.2004	29.06.2004	Education Expert
	5	28.08.2005	11.09.2005	Education Expert
	6	13.12.2005	23.12.2005	Education Expert
	7	13.08.2006	27.08.2006	Education Expert
	8	04.02.2007	18.02.2007	Education Expert
	9	03.04.2008	17.04.2008	Education Expert
	10	05.03.2009	12.03.2009	Education Expert
<i>Portfolio Review</i>	28.09.2009	08.10.2009	<i>The portfolio review of November 2009 awarded the total score of 2.34</i>	
<i>Completion</i>	28.07.2010	06.08.2010	Education Economist	

6 Project Description. Key factors not considered in the general framework but which have impacted project design and implementation. These factors, both positive and negative, may comprise: climate and weather conditions, political changes, contract or personal issues, technical issues, procurement processes and interactions with other partners. If any of these factors is significant enough to impact appraisal scores, it should be mentioned in the framework, and referred to the current annex.

II OUTPUT 3. Threats to Outputs sustainability

Due to ESIT's institutional weakness (absence of administrative and financial autonomy, institutional organs still not appointed, allocated budget falling short of initial amount, non validation of budget statements corresponding to the positions of teachers), the current functioning of ISET hinges on the personality and motivation of its director. ISET's sustainability will depend on its official structuring.

F. IMPLEMENTATION

Political upheavals (military coups) have given rise to institutional instability detrimental to the project: signature timeframes have been extended considerably and recurrent cabinet reshuffles have complicated the implementation and monitoring of activities.

Budget squeezes have caused a reduction in the budget allocated to ISET (MRO 350 million against MRO 600 million scheduled). This shortage has led to difficulties in the implementation of ISET's strategic plan.

Acronyms

ADB	:	African Development Bank
ADF	:	African Development Fund
AFD	:	French Development Agency
AFESD	:	Arab Fund for Economic and Social Development
BD	:	Bidding Documents
BIEF	:	International Bureau of French Publishing
DES	:	Directorate of Higher Education
DPEF	:	Directorate of Education and Training Prprojects
DRS	:	Directorate of Scientific Research
FNARS	:	National Scientific Research Support Fund
IDA	:	International Association for Development
IsDB	:	Islamic Development Bank
ISSET	:	Advanced Institute of Technological Education
MAED	:	Ministry of Economic Affairs and Development
MAFO	:	Morocco Field Office
MCPFEF	:	Ministry of Women's, Children's and Family Welfare
MEN	:	Ministry of National Education
MEN	:	Ministry of National Education
MFTP	:	Ministry of Employment, Technical and Vocational Training
MRO or UM:		Mauritania Ouguiya (Mauritanian currency)
NGO	:	Non-Governmental Organization
OPEC	:	Organization of Petroleum-Producing Countries
PCR	:	Project Completion Report
PNDSE	:	National Education System Development Programme
PRSF	:	Poverty Reduction Strategic Framework
RMN	:	Roads-Miscellaneous Networks (electricity, water, sewage, telephone, etc.)
SNIG	:	National Gender Mainstreaming Strategy
STD/AIDS	:	Sexually Transmitted Diseases/AIDS
TFP	:	Technical and Financial Partners
UA	:	Unit of Account
UNICEF	:	United Nations Children's Emergency Fund
WB	:	World Bank

Supporting Documents *ADB*

- Appraisal Report, September 2001
- Portfolio Review, November 2009
- Supervision Reports
- Ledgers
- Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment: an Updated Gender Plan of Action (UGPOA) 2009-2011
- Strategy for Higher Education, Science and Technology

Borrower

- National Education System Development Programme, 2001-2010
- Poverty Reduction Strategic Framework (PRSF), 2001
- National Gender Mainstreaming Strategy (SNIG)
- Mauritania Integrated Agricultural Development Programme (PDIAM)
- Available progress reports (reports for December 2009 and March 2010 have not been prepared)
- Implementation of the ADF Loan and the National Counterpart Fund
- Framework Memorandum of the Education Sector Macro-finance, 2011-2020
- Report on the National Scientific Research Fund by the international committee responsible for the evaluation of research projects, July 2008
- Strategic Plan of the ISET of Rosso, 2009-2014
- Decree to establish ISET, 2 April 2009

Contractors

- Final report on the execution of works by SCET Tunisia and MCGT Mauritania
- NGO mission reports on sensitization campaigns to promote the enrolment of girls
- Completion report on works at ISET of Rosso by the assistant architect to the contracting authority, M. Cheikh Ahmedou
- C2W reports on the creation of the Rosso incubator (diagnostic report and final report)
- CIDE's report on the design of curricula, identification of teachers and technological equipment
- Audit reports

Technical and Financial

Partners

- Framework memorandum for operations in Mauritania (2008-2010)- AFD Group
- Mauritania's Country Strategy Paper, 2008-2011 – World Bank

LIST OF CONTRACTS SIGNED UNDER THE LOAN

Date	CONTRACT No.	Description	Component	Beneficiary	Procurement	Amount in UM	Amount in Foreign Exchange	Amount in UA	Currency
25/08/2002	015/00/DPEF/DJ	Recruitment of Project Leader	IV	Med Ahmed Djegu�	Short List CV	12,000,000		37,400.45	MRO
17/09/2003	122/119/DPEF	Conduct of technical studies (ISET) of Rosso	I	STUDI international	L.L Short List	112,034,324	351 370	298 646.88	�
03/02/2004	158/004/DPEF	Design of regulatory framework ESUP	II	Tecsuit. International	L.L Short List	73,014,480	386 320	201 159.09	SCAN
30/12/2003	145/180/DPEF	Revision of status of higher education staff	II	CIDE	L.L Short list	39,908,570	220 000	114 555.29	SCAN
27/01/2004	159/009/DPEF	Design of ISET curricula	I	CIDE	L.L Short List	69,065,813	359 250	187 063.58	SCAN
		Specifications of technical and educational equipment							
25/11/2003	130/139/DPEF	Audit of financial statements	II	NET AUDIT	L.L Short List	6 882 000	6,882,000	18301.49	MRO
10/05/2005	289/54/DPEF	Procurement of DPEF Vehicles	IV	CGA Nissan	ICB	18,890,000	18,890,000	58,439.62	MRO
06/02/2006	380/OO2/DPEF	Monitoring of construction works for ISET	II	SCET Tunisia	Shopping		154.550		e
15/02/2006	/06/DPEF/PNDSE	Replacement of Project Leader	II	Debbe Ould Sidy Zeine	Short List CV	14.400.000		37,382.20	MRO
03/03/2006	389/10/CCM/ DPEF/PNDSE/06/FAD	Recruitment of firm to audit financial records	II	Net Audit	L.L Short List	10,670,000			MRO
09/10/2006	425/157/CCM DPEF/PNDSE/FADII/06	Award of contract for the construction of ISET of Rosso	III	Grpt SBF/EGB TP	ICB	2,647,848,046			EUR/MRO
08/01/2007	444/DPEF/PNDSE/07/FADII	Recruitment of a firm to Supervise the construction of works at ISET	II	SECO/COTEM	L.L Short List	22,000,000		52380	MRO
02/02/2007	452/CDM/ DPEF/PNDSE/FADII/07	Recruitment of a firm to audit financial statements for the 2006 and 2007 fiscal years	II	AFRIC Audit	L.L Short List	10,670,000			MRO
17/10/2007	511/CDM/ DPEF/PNDSE/2007/BAD	Recruitment of a consulting architect assisting the contracting authority regarding the construction of ISET of Rosso	II	Cheikh Ahmedou Ould Med Moctar	Short list	13,500,000		32142	MRO

17/10/2007	511/CDM/ DPEF/PNDSE/2007/BAD	Recruitment of a firm for the Study on the Development of the agricultural experimentation farm at ISET of Rosso	II	Tasmim / ID Conseils	Short List	17,028,500		40,544	MRO
03/11/2008	571/154/CCM/DPEF/PNDSE/08	Procurement of documentary resources	I	CELF	ICB		EUR 117,991.75	111,115,898	EUR
23/12/2008	572/172/CCM/DPEF/PNDSE/08	Procurement of agro-pastoral implements (batch 2)	I	FSE	ICB		EUR 131,877.48	124,192.45	EUR
23/12/2008	573/175/CCM/DPEF/PNDSE/08	Procurement of chemicals and culture media (batch 5)	I	VWR International	ICB		EUR 47176,52	44,427,355	EUR
23/12/2008	574/179/CCM/DPEF/PNDSE/08	Procurement of kitchen and restaurant equipment (batch 9)	I	CDI	ICB	42,779,400		106,859.8	UM
31/12/2008	575/171/CCM/DPEF/PNDSE/08	Procurement of laboratory instruments (batch 1)	I	VWR International	ICB		EUR 469,304.66	441,956.39	EUR
31/12/2008	576/173/CCM/DPEF/PNDSE/08	Procurement of physics and mechanics instruments (batch 3)	I	CSGS	ICB		CAD 482,680.41	305,877,023	Dollar Canadian
31/12/2008	577/174/CCM/DPEF/PNDSE/08	Procurement of laboratory consumables and implements (batch 4)	I	VWR International	ICB		EUR 223691.04	210.655,667	EUR
31/12/2008	578/176/CCM/DPEF/PNDSE/08	Procurement of office furniture and equipment, class rooms, canteen and sports equipment	I	ACIA	ICB		EUR 259067,35	243.970,458	EUR
31/12/2008	579/177/CCM/DPEF/PNDSE/08	Procurement of computer hardware (batch 7)	I	IDS	ICB	62,260,776.9		155.522,858	UM
31/12/2008	580/178/CCM/DPEF/PNDSE/08	Procurement of pilot equipment for Technology Hall (batch 8)	I	CSGS	ICB		CAD 843785,13	534.710,916	CAD
18/02/2009	591/19/CCM/DPEF/PNDSE/08	Procurement of equipment for the agricultural experimentation farm		SOGECOR		135,979,900			MRO
10/05/2009	395/615/CDM/DPEF/PNDSE/09	Development of the enterprise incubators		2 CW International				EUR 89,820	EUR
03/08/2009	623/CDM/DPEF/PNDSE/09	Sensitization campaigns for HIV/STDs and the enrolment of girls		SSF		14,570,300			MRO
07/01/2010	649/CCM/DPEF/PNDSE/10/BAD	Delivery of 2 school Buses for ISET	ISET	Toyota	NCB	31 293 874			MRO
09/02/2010	660/09//CCM/DPEF/PNDSE/10/BAD	Supply of transmission system for ISET	ISET	Top Technologie	NCB	31 087 434			MRO
07/02/2010	661/10/CCM/DPEF/PNDSE/10/BAD	Wireless network system for ISET	ISET	CDI	NCB	22 327 893			MRO
07/02/2010	659/007/DPEF/PNDSE/2010/BAD	Audit of project accounts for 2008-2009	ISET	Net Audit	NCB	9 600 000			MRO