

# PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT (PCR)

## A. PROJECT DATA AND KEY DATES

### I. BASIC INFORMATION

|   |   |   |   |
|---|---|---|---|
| Project Number :<br>P-TZ-IAE-003  | Project Name: Alternative Learning and Skills Development Project | Country: Tanzania   |   |
| Lending Instrument (s): - ADF Loan Agreement () Grant Agreement           |   | Sector:<br>Technical/Vocational Education                         | Environmental Classification: III                           |
| Original Commitment:<br>Loan UA 5,560,000<br>Grant UA 1,010,000           | Amount Cancelled:<br>Loan UA 34,786.81<br>Grant UA 125,868.84     | Amount Disbursed:<br>Loan UA 5,525,213.19<br>Grant: UA 884,131.16 | % Disbursed: % on the loan<br>Loan: 99.37%<br>Grant: 87.53% |
| Borrower: Government of Tanzania  |   |   |   |
| Executing Agency: Ministry of Education and Vocational Training, Zanzibar |   |   |   |
| Co-financers and other External Partners: None.                           |   |   |   |

### II. KEY DATES

|  |  |                                 |  |
|--|--|---------------------------------|--|
| Project Concept Note Approved by Ops. Com. Not Applicable (NA) | Appraisal Report Approved by Ops Com: NA | Board Approval: 31 October 2000 |  |
| Restructuring(s): None   |  |                                 |  |
|  | Original Date                            | Actual Date                     | Difference in Months<br>[effective date-original date] |
| EFFECTIVENESS  | April 30 2001                            | December 24, 2001               | 7  |
| MID-TERM REVIEW  | NA                                       | NA                              | 0  |
| CLOSING  | October 30, 2006                         | June 28, 2009                   | 32 months  |

### III. RATINGS SUMMARY

| CRITERIA             | SUB-CRITERIA                        | RATING   |
|----------------------|-------------------------------------|----------|
| PROJECT OUTCOME      | Achievement of Outputs              | 3        |
|                      | Achievement of Outcomes             | 3        |
|                      | Timeliness                          | 2        |
|                      | <b>OVERALL PROJECT OUTCOME</b>      | <b>3</b> |
| BANK PERFORMANCE     | Design and Readiness                | 3        |
|                      | Supervision                         | 3        |
|                      | <b>OVERALL BANK PERFORMANCE</b>     | <b>3</b> |
| BORROWER PERFORMANCE | Design and Readiness                | 2        |
|                      | Implementation                      | 3        |
|                      | <b>OVERALL BORROWER PERFORMANCE</b> | <b>3</b> |

#### IV. RESPONSIBLE BANK STAFF

| POSITIONS               | AT APPROVAL | AT COMPLETION                              |
|-------------------------|-------------|--|
| Regional Director       | NA          | D. Gaye                                    |
| Sector Director         | A. Matega   | Thomas Hurley                              |
| Sector Division Manager | T.Z. Sakala | Sunitra Pitamber                           |
| Task Manager            | K. Khoudari | Abdullahi Yahie                            |
| PCR Team Lead           |             | Abdullahi Yahie                            |
| PCR Team Members        |             | Kwasi P. Agyeman<br>(Consultant Architect) |

# PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT (PCR)

## B. PROJECT CONTEXT

Summarize the rationale for Bank assistance. State

- the development challenge addressed by the project,
  - the borrower's overall strategy to meet this challenge,
  - the Bank's activities in this /these countries and in the sector during the year and its performance, and
  - ongoing activities financed by the Bank and other external sources that complement, duplicate, or relate to this project
- Cite the relevant sources.

Comment on the strength and coherence of the rationale.

[300 words maximum]. Any additional narrative about the project's origin and background, if needed, should be presented in Annex 6: Project Description]

According to the Zanzibar Education Sector Review (1995), the Net Enrollment Rate at the basic education level was below 50% indicating that more than half the number of children aged 7-16 were not attending school. From the total number of children entering Standard 1, less than 50% completed Standard VII. The highest percentage of dropouts was found at Standard VII and Form 1 (11% and 18% respectively). Furthermore, 71% of the children did not continue after Form 2, the final stage of basic education. School leavers at Form 2 level are insufficiently equipped for meeting the demands of the labour market or for self-employment, necessitating the need for vocational training programs.

Since the traditional approach within the mainstream school setting lacked the capacity to provide schooling for all, the Government of Zanzibar decided to accord high priority to the development of alternative basic education with emphasis on girls. The alternative learning structures contributed to literacy including numerical skills and basic education for dropouts and out of school children who have never been enrolled in the formal school system due to limited classroom space, poverty and negative attitudes of parents towards education. The project was formulated within the framework of the Zanzibar Education Master Plan and borrowed from the tenets of the Education II project which provided complementary basic education for out of school children and Adult Literacy in Non-formal Education under the Complementary Basic Education in Tanzania (COBET) and Community Based Adult Education (CBAE) Program. The Alternative Learning and Skills Development project in Zanzibar was designed to fill the gap in non-formal education in Zanzibar specifically on the islands of Unguja and Pemba.

Other Bank projects in the sector include the Small Entrepreneurs Loan Facility (SELF I) in mainland Tanzania which was largely successful and is now entering the second phase SELF II. In terms of micro-finance coverage the SELF project is similar to Business Incubator and micro-credit components of the Alternative Learning and Skills Development Project in Zanzibar which provides linkages between skills development and the business environment in Zanzibar and loans for young entrepreneurs and women groups from the micro-credit fund.

# PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT (PCR)

## C. PROGRAMME OBJECTIVES AND LOGICAL FRAMEWORK

### 1. State the Project Development Objectives) (as set out in the appraisal report)

**Project Objective:** i) to improve the quality of training, non-formal education and to link education with the labour market needs. ii) to assist the out of school youth achieve basic and secular education; iii) to enhance self-employment of the youth through the promotion of business incubator activities.

### 2. Describe the main project components, indicating how each will contribute to the achievement of project objectives

The project comprised the following five components:

**Component I: Development of Alternative Learning:** This component was to cater for children between ages 9-14 who were never enrolled and drop-outs in the formal education system to attend special classes in the Alternative Learning Centre and later depending on performance be mainsreamed into the formal education system or acquire skills from the Skills Development Centres. A three storey Alternative Learning Centre was to be constructed, furnished and equipped and courses in literacy and numerical skills offered. **Component II: Establishment of Skills Development Centres:** Two new Skills Development Centres were to be constructed, furnished and equipped and several courses such as masonry, electrical installations etc taught over a period of 2-3 years. The centres were to absorb children who could not be enrolled in the formal basic education system and also retrain unemployed youth and drop-outs from the formal system. Mwanakwerekwe Vocational Training School was to be rehabilitated and expanded and Mikunguni Technical Secondary School was expected to be equipped with a computer center.

**Component III: Development of Business Incubators:** The component sought to develop linkages between training and entrepreneurship, and promote self-employment. Business incubators were to be established in the 2 skills development centres to equip students with entrepreneurial skills before graduation. The component was to help Womens' co-operatives acquire skills in income generating activities. The micro-credit fund was to provide loans to self-employed graduates of the skills development centres, MFIs and SACCOS.

### 3. Provide a brief assessment (up to two sentences) of the project objectives along the following three dimensions. Insert a working score, using the scoring scale provided in Appendix 1.

| PROJECT OBJECTIVES DIMENSIONS |   | ASSESSMENT  | WORKING SCORE |
|-------------------------------|---|---|---------------|
| RELEVANT                      | a) Relevant to the country's development objectives                         | The project was based on supporting the Zanzibar Education Strategy (1996-2006) which sought to equip the youth, girls and schools drop-outs with the appropriate knowledge, skills, values and attitudes to enable them join the labor market in order to improve the quality of their life at individual, family and community levels and eventually reduce poverty levels in Zanzibar. | 4             |
|                               | b) Objectives deemed achievable with project inputs and expected timeframe. | The project objectives were very pertinent to basic education challenges of Zanzibar and the inputs particularly the Business Incubator initiative was expected to promote self-employment among at least 20% of never enrolled youth and dropouts within 5 years after acquiring vocational skills from the Alternnative Learning and Skills Development Centres.                        | 4             |
| CONSISTENT                    | c) Consistent with the Bank's national or regional strategy.                | The project was fully consistent with ADF VIII, the CSP for Tanzania (1999-2001) and the Bank's Education Sector Policy to support non-formal education, human resources development and poverty reduction  | 4             |
|                               | d) Consistent with the Bank's general priorities.                           | The project was consistent with the Bank's general priorities namely, human resource development, poverty reduction and gender equality.  | 4             |

4. Lay out the logical framework. In the absence of a logical framework, complete the table below, stating the overall objective of the project, the main components of the project, the main activities of each component, and the expected outputs and outcomes, as well as the indicators for measuring outcomes. Add additional rows for components, activities, outputs or outcomes, if necessary.

| COMPONENT   | ACTIVITY  | EXPECTED OUTPUTS  | EXPECTED OUTCOMES  | INDICATORS TO BE MEASURED   |
|---|---|---|--|---|
| <b>Component 1:<br/>Development of<br/>Alternative Learning</b> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* Construction, furnishing and equipping of non-formal educational facilities.</li> <li>* Training of qualified teachers in special teaching methods on different skills and trades that are in demand in the labor market.</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* Alternative Learning Centre constructed, furnished and equipped. By the year 2005, 43.3% of never enrolled children engaged in alternative education programs, 56.7% of dropouts engaged in alternative education program, increase in number of successful small scale income generating activities</li> <li>* Teaching staff for the centre trained and deployed</li> <li>*</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* Enhanced alternative learning opportunities for never enrolled children and drop-outs especially girls.</li> <li>*</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>*Gross enrollment ratio.</li> <li>Net enrollment ratio,</li> <li>Net Intake ratio,</li> <li>completion rates, drop out rates and the gender parity index.</li> </ul> |
| <b>Component 2: Skills<br/>Development Centres</b>              | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* Construction, furnishing and equipping of skills development facilities</li> </ul>   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* Two (2) Skills Development Centres(SDCs) constructed, furnished, equipped and operational. An existing vocational training centre expanded.</li> <li>* Three (300) graduates produced annually.</li> <li>* More youth to acquire vocational skills so as to make them more relevant to labor market needs.</li> </ul>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>More youth will lead more meaningful lives as a result of their being gainfully employed.</li> </ul>                            | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* Completion rates, gender parity index and Statistical data from the Commission of Labour and Ministry of Planning and Investment</li> </ul>                        |

|   |  |   |   |  |
|---|--|---|---|--|
| <b>Component 3:<br/>Development of Business Incubator</b> | Development of the Business Incubator in 2 SDCs. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* Business Incubators established in SDCs.</li> <li>* Improved linkages between training and the labour market.</li> <li>* More youth to acquire entrepreneurial skills</li> <li>* Availability of micro-credit</li> <li>* Increase in possibility of youth being employable or self-employed and generating income</li> </ul> | More youth will engage in small business ventures to generate income leading to a reduction in unemployment, social tensions and crime among the youth. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* Statistical data from the Commission of Labour and Ministry of Planning and Investment</li> </ul> |
| <b>Component 4:<br/>Institutional Strengthening</b>       | IEC activities and capacity building             | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* Creation of documentation centres in 3 parent ministries</li> <li>* Training and study tours in Statistics and Information Management for staff members of relevant ministries</li> </ul>  | More accurate statistics and information will be available  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* Statistical data from the Commission of Labour and Ministry of Planning and Investment</li> </ul> |
| <b>Component 5: Project Management</b>                    | Project implementation and management            | Strengthening of Education II, Project Implementation Unit to implement the Alternative Learning and Skills project in Zanzibar.  | Efficient implementation of project activities  | Project activities completed and executed by closing date of project.  |

5. For each logical framework dimension, provide a brief assessment (up to two sentences) of the extent to which the logical framework has contributed to the achievement of the objectives mentioned below. Insert a working score, using the scoring scale provided in Appendix 1. If no log frame exists, attribute a score of 1 to this section.

| LOGICAL FRAMEWORK DIMENSIONS |  | ASSESSMENT   | WORKING SCORE |
|------------------------------|--|--|---------------|
| LOGICAL                      | a) Presents a logical causal chain for achieving project development objectives.   | The framework clearly identified the activities to be undertaken and linked them to expected outputs and outcomes in reasonable and logical manner with regards to the achievement of project objectives | 3             |
| MEASURABLE                   | b) Expresses objectives and outcomes in a way that is measurable and quantifiable. | Objective regarding institutional development was expressed in a manner that is measurable and quantifiable.   | 3             |
| THOROUGH                     | c) States the risks and key assumptions.   | These were well enumerated in the framework and helped in devising strategies utilized during implementation for project objectives accomplishment to a large extent.                                    | 3             |

# PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT (PCR)

## D. OUTPUTS AND OUTCOMES

### I. OUTPUTS OR RESULTS ACHIEVED

In the table below, assess the achievement of actual vs. expected outputs for each major activity, based on the logical framework in Section C. Score the extent to which the expected outputs were achieved. Calculate the weighted scores as an approximate proportion of project activity costs. The overall weighted score will be auto-calculated as the average of weighted working scores. Override the auto-calculated score, if desired, and provide justification.

| KEY ACTIVITIES   |  | Working Score | Proportion of Project Costs in percentage (as mentioned in the appraisal report) | Weighted Score (auto-calculated) |
|--|--|---------------|--|----------------------------------|
| Expected Outputs   | Actual Outputs   |               |  |                                  |
| <p><b>COMPONENT 1:</b><br/>DEVELOPMENT OF ALTERNATIVE LEARNING:<br/>* 1 storey building with 12 classrooms, storerooms, preparation rooms and offices furnished and equipped.<br/>* Qualified teachers to be assigned by the Ministry of Education to receive orientation courses on special teaching methods for 2 months.<br/>* Under technical assistance, specialists will train teachers at the Alternative Learning Centre for 2 months.</p> | <p>* 2-storey building with 16 classrooms, computer room, library, offices and auxiliary facilities furnished and equipped.<br/>* 35 teachers trained of whom 28 are women.<br/>* Cumulative enrolment of 1,239 of whom 340 are girls.<br/>* A total of 211 students graduated since inception of which 65 are girls.<br/>* 1,132 community members of whom 51% are women benefited from short/long term courses in AIDS, life skills, social studies, Islamic studies, domestic science, computer literacy and law.</p>                 | 4             | 7  | 0,28                             |
|  | <p>A consultant recruited at beginning of project, designed curriculum and trained teachers. Another consultant recruited for evaluation at end of project recommended merging of the teaching of literary and numerical skills with skills development and the development of functional literacy.</p> <p>* Owing to the delay in opening the Skills Development Centers, the Alternative Learning Centre introduced skills development in electricity/electrical installations, computer literacy, laundry services and carpentry.</p> |               |  |                                  |

|  |   |   |    |      |
|--|---|---|----|------|
| <p><b>COMPONENT 2</b><br/>DEVELOPMENT OF SKILLS CENTRES</p> <p>* Construction of furnished and equipped classrooms, workshops, student hostels, cafeteria, administration block and staff housing for Mkokotoni, Unguja and Vitongoji, Pemba Skills Development Centres.</p>   | <p>* Two (2) Skills Development Centers with a combined capacity of 600 students (30% boarders) constructed, furnished and equipped but not yet operational.</p> <p>* 10 classrooms, 2 libraries, 2 computer rooms, 2 administration blocks, 2 staff rooms, 7 staff houses, 2 cafeteria and 6 hostel facilities to accommodate 408 students.</p> <p>* 22 workshops comprising 2 automotive, 2 masonry, 2 electronics, 2 refrigeration and air-conditioning, 2 welding, 1 handicraft and weaving, 2 plumbing, 2 food processing and catering, 1 painting and decoration, 2 cattle sheds, 2 chicken sheds and 2 crop farming and horticulture workshops. * Business Incubator facilities established and about 80 graduates (20% of 400 enrolled) who opt for self-employment will benefit from micro-credit facilities.</p> <p>*Vocational Training School rehabilitated and expanded and a Secondary/Technical school equipped.</p> | 3 | 50 | 1,5  |
| <p><b>COMPONENT 3</b><br/>BUSINESS INCUBATOR AND MICRO-CREDIT</p> <p>* Promotion of the notion of firm creation</p> <p>* Help the SDC graduates under the best technical and financial conditions</p> <p>* Develop a set of good linkages between the training sector and the economic environment</p> <p>* Help interested Women's co-operatives develop income generating enterprise</p> | <p>* Incubator activities will commence after the commissioning of the SDCs and graduation of first batch of students. * Some 19 Micro-Finance Institutions have obtained loans amounting to Tsh. 1,248,000,000 from the project's micro-credit facility and have subsequently lent to groups and individuals. Direct beneficiaries who have obtained loans so far number 6,333 of which 70% are women. * The average loans range from Tsh. 200,000 to 1,000,0000 (\$150-\$770) and repayment rates are 100%. * The credit scheme has created employment opportunities in sectors including poultry farming, small scale industries, sea weeds farming and petty trading.</p>   | 3 | 26 | 0,78 |

|   |   |   |   |      |
|---|---|---|---|------|
| <p><b>COMPONENT 4</b><br/> <b>INSTITUTIONAL STRENGTHENING</b><br/> * The IEC activities will focus on sensitization of parents, religious leaders and communities and create awareness about socio-economic issues such as the benefits of education, hygiene, nutrition, laws relating to women and children, reproductive health, HIV/AIDS and micro-credit.<br/> * Capacity building, upgrading and equipping of documentation centres in the Ministry of Education (MoEVT), Ministry of Labour, Youth, Women and Children Development (MoLYWCD) and Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs (MoFEA)</p>        | <p>* The documentation centres in the MoEVT, MoLYWCD and MoFEA were completed in 2005. The Ministry of Education constructed a 3 storey building with more than 70 offices from resources for the PIU rehabilitation and construction of the Documentation Centre; similarly, Ministries of Finance and Economic Affairs and Labor also acquired 40 and 25 offices using the resources allocated for the construction of the DCs. The PIU organised a sensitisation and awareness video program on national television for the youth particularly girls to encourage them to join the alternative learning program.</p>   | 4 | 9 | 0,36 |
| <p><b>COMPONENT 5</b><br/> <b>PROJECT MANAGEMENT</b><br/> * The PIU for the Education II project on both the Mainland and Zanzibar to be strengthened to manage and implement planned activities.<br/> * Furnished and equipped additional office space to be provided within the Ministry of Education.<br/> * Under technical assistance, Architect/Engineer to be engaged for 12 months to assist in recruiting design and supervision consultants for the Skills Development Centres and the Alternative Learning Centre.<br/> * One 4x4 vehicle, 2 double cabin pick-ups and 2 motor-cycles were procured.</p> | <p>* The PIU was fully staffed and implemented the project successfully. This was primarily attributed to unfettered Government support and staff commitment and dedication though they were not paid allowances comparable to that paid to other Bank financed projects. The PIU staff were trained through workshops and refresher courses in project planning and management. Some of the staff of the PIU have been maintained to sustain the implementation of activities including business incubator and microfinance after the official closing date of the project. Because the PIU was integrated into Department of Planning and Policy, the technical and managerial skills of its staff were significantly enhanced. As a result, the PIU staff have been deployed to implement a 42 million dollar World Bank funded education project in Zanzibar. All donor funded education projects in Zanzibar are now</p> | 4 | 8 | 0,32 |

|   |   |  |  |          |
|---|---|--|--|----------|
|   | implemented by the department and no PIUs are established. This is a major achievement in the advent of the Paris Aid Effectiveness declaration which endorsed the alignment to and use of country systems. |  |  |          |
| <b>OVERALL OUTPUT SCORE</b> [corresponds to the sum of weighted scores] |   |  |  | <b>3</b> |

 Check here to override the calculated score

|   |  |
|---|--|
| <b>Provide justification for overriding the auto-calculated score</b> |  |
| Insert the new score or re-enter the auto-calculated score            |  |

## II. OUTCOMES OR RESULTS ACHIEVED

1. Using available monitoring data, assess the achievement of expected outcomes. Import the expected outcomes from the logical framework presented in Section C. Score the extent to which expected outcomes were achieved. The overall outcome score will be auto-calculated as an average of the working scores. Override the auto-calculated score, if desired, and provide justification.

| OUTCOMES  |   | Working Score |
|---|---|---------------|
| Expected  | Actual  |               |
| * Enhanced alternative learning opportunities for never enrolled children and drop-outs especially girls. | The Alternative Learning Centre (ALC) enrolled over the last 3 years 1,239 youths (340 are girls) out of a target population of drop-outs which stood at 20152 in 2008. This low outreach is due to the low enrolment capacity of ALC-about a 400 a year. It should be also noted that ALC is the only center in Zanzibar and is based in Unguja while most of the target population are in rural areas. As a result, they are unable to regularly commute or settle in Unguja due to low family incomes. So far 211 have graduated (30% are girls). In addition, the ALC provided local communities suitable facilities to organize workshop for training sensitization and awareness raising on courses ranging from AIDS, Family Planning, Community Driven Development. In total 1,132 community members of whom 51% are women have benefited from evening classes in law, computer literacy and adult education. The ALC is financially autonomous and generates income to maintain the facility and meet its own running cost which will make it sustainable in the long run. The Alternative Learning Centre (ALC) has been able to absorb only 10% of the never enrolled and drop-outs over the last 3 years. There is therefore the need to replicate the ALC in order to deepen the outreach of the center. Out of the loan and grant savings, the PIU was able to construct a smaller ALC in one of the poorest districts in Pemba Island. | 3             |
| * More youth to acquire vocational skills so as to make them more relevant to labor market needs.         | The two (2) Skills Development Centres have enrolled a total of 400 youths for the academic year starting in January 2010. The first set of graduates from the 2 Skills Development Centres will be ready for the job market in 2 or 3 years time. However, since the business incubator and micro-credit dimension of the project has been delayed, the success of the graduates in industry either as employees or self-employed can only be measured in the next 3-5 years.  | 3             |

|   |   |                 |
|---|---|-----------------|
| <p>* Improved linkages between training and the labour market, availability of micro-credit, more youth to acquire entrepreneurial skills so as to be self-employed or be competitive in the labour market.</p> | <p>-19 Micro-Finance Institutions have obtained loans amounting to Tsh. 1,248,000,000 from the project's micro-credit facility and have subsequently lent to groups and individuals. Direct beneficiaries who have obtained loans so far number 6,333 of which 70% are women. Repayments have been regular and it is anticipated that the scheme could generate interest on loans amounting to USD 100,000 which could then be paid into the revolving fund. Loan sizes vary between Tshs. 200,000 and Tsh. 1,000,000.</p>  | <p>3</p>        |
| <p>More accurate statistics and information available for managing figures on employment rates etc.</p>   | <p>Documentation centres set up in 3 parent ministries in 2005. IEC activities on sensitization and awareness programs on television to encourage the youth especially girls to join alternative training programs. The Education Management Information Systems (EMIS) is being revised with the support of SIDA and UNESCO.</p>   | <p>3</p>        |
| <p>* Efficient implementation of project activities</p>   | <p>The PIU was established as an integral part of the Department of Planning and Administration and has proven to be effective and efficient in managing project resources. The high quality of construction/workmanship and value for money was mainly due to the high standards set by the Unit for contractors. While completing all proposed project activities, The PIU was able to generate savings which were utilized to build additional facilities such the Pemba ALC. The project resources also leveraged additional funds from the treasury which enable the respective ministries to transform the proposed Documentation Centers into full-fledged office block through forced account. This provided the Ministries adequate and suitable working environment which significantly enhanced the productivity of their staff. This creative approach became an example which is emulated by other ministries. Having trained most of the staff, the Department is now used to implement other donors funded project such as the World Bank and SIDA of Sweden. This is in full conformity with the Paris Declaration on Aide Effectiveness which endorses harmonization and alignment to country systems.</p> | <p>3</p>        |
| <p><b>OVERALL OUTCOME SCORE [Calculated as the average of working scores]</b></p>   |   | <p><b>3</b></p> |

Check here to override the calculated score

|   |  |
|---|--|
| <p><b>Provide justification for over-riding the auto-calculated score</b></p> |  |
| <p>Insert the new score or re-enter the auto calculated score</p>             |  |

**2. Other outcomes: Discuss additional outcomes not planned in the logical framework, and which mostly concern cross-cutting issues (gender, for example). Discuss**

The Alternative Learning Centre (ALC) is now a community centre and hosts social events. Evening classes organized in the Alternative Learning Centre (ALC) has made great strides in training 1,132 community members (51% of them being women) in computer literacy, law and adult literacy. The ALC is financially autonomous and has so far generated an income of TZS 49,544,428 (USD 40,000). The ALC in Unguja instigated the construction of a temporary 4 classroom ALC in Pemba with funds from the Special Fund and Government. A single (1) storey permanent ALC is under construction from Government resources. Instead of the originally proposed renovation of PIU offices and Documentation Centers (DC), the Ministry of Education utilized the allocation for new construction by building the foundation and ground floor of a 2 storey building which housed the PIU and the documentation centre. Later on SIDA and the Government provided funds to complete the building which has more than 70 offices.

The example was emulated by the Ministry of Finance which used its allocation for the DC to construct the foundation and ground floor of a building which was later completed and now has 40 offices while the Ministry of Youth used its allocation to build a documentation centre and additional space to accommodate offices. The project was able to lay the foundation for reforms in the TVET sector leading to the creation of the autonomous Zanzibar Vocational Training Authority (VTA) and the introduction of competency based training and certification. The VTA is responsible for all vocational training both public and private. The VTA will be resourced through a Skills Development Levy of 5% to be paid by all employers in the public and private sectors on behalf of all employees starting in the year 2010.

The visibility of the project outputs attracted the attention of other development partners. The Commonwealth Education Trust in United Kingdom (UK) expressed interest to support the SDC by providing technical assistance. The Government of Iran invited the heads of the two SDCs to undertake a study tour on vocational training centers in Iran. Iran also committed to provide technical assistance in vocational education and training in Zanzibar. In addition, A German NGO in Hamburger promised to second the SDCs retired technical assistance personnel (Directors of VETA in Germany) to strengthen the management of the centers.

**3. Risks to sustained achievement of outcomes. State the factors that affect, or could affect, the long-run or sustained achievement of project outcomes. Indicate any new action or institutional change recommended to help sustain outcomes. The analysis should draw on the sensitivity analysis in Annex 3 if relevant.**

The current project addressed less than 10% of the needs identified by the original study. As a result, if additional Alternative Learning Centers and Skills Development Centers are not constructed in the remaining regions the status quo will remain and serious regional and population inequities will persist. Given that the initial pilot intervention has produced significant positive result, It is imperative, therefore, that the momentum need to be sustained and a follow-up phase of the project is prepared.

# PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT (PCR)

## E. PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS FOR IMPLEMENTATION

1. State the extent to which the Bank and the Borrower ensure that the project is commensurate with the Borrower's capacity to implement it by designing it appropriately and by putting in place the necessary implementation arrangements. Consider all major design aspects, such as: extent to which lessons learned from previous policy-based lending operations in the country were taken into account (please cite key PCRs); the extent to which the project was informed by robust analytical work (please cite key documents), how well the Bank and Borrower assessed the capacity of the implementing agencies, - scope of consultations and partnerships, economic rationale for the project, and - provisions made for technical assistance

[250 words maximum. Any additional narrative about implementation should be included in Annex 6 entitled: Project Description]

The project design was informed by the 'Terms of Reference' of a concept paper prepared by the PIU and the Adult Education Department and an action plan prepared after a workshop attended by key stakeholders in non-formal education comprising UNESCO, UNICEF and AfDB and inspired by the Complementary Basic Education for Out-of - School-Children and Adult Literacy in Non-Formal Education which was being implemented on the Mainland under the Education II project. The design was comprehensive and embraced all elements leading to the realisation of the project's objective particularly with respect to human resource development and poverty reduction. The flexibility of the design particularly with respect to the micro-credit fund has permitted the granting of loans to micro-finance institutions while waiting for the first products of the business incubator in the 2 skills development centres to access loans after graduation. The appraisal report clearly identified sector problems, the various stakeholders involved and outlined implementation modalities and as a result, implementation was not characterised by any serious challenges although the Alternative Learning dimension of the project was the first of its kind in Zanzibar.

2. For each dimension of project design and readiness for implementation, provide a brief assessment (up to two sentences). Insert a working score, using the scoring scale provided in Appendix 1.

| PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS FOR IMPLEMENTATION DIMENSIONS |  | ASSESSMENT   | WORKING SCORE |
|--|--|--|---------------|
| REALISM  | a) Owing to its complexity, the project is underpinned by an analysis of the country's capacity and political commitment                     | The implementation of the Government of Zanzibar's Alternative Learning and Skills Development project focusing on human resource development and poverty reduction among the youth is justified by societal perceptions leading to a lack of interest in enrolment and the high drop-out rate from the formal system.   | 4             |
| RISK ASSESSMENT  | b) Project design includes adequate risk analysis and mitigation measures analyses.  | Because of community prejudices towards formal education, the success of the sensitisation drive was critical if the project was to attain the expected results. The sustainability of the micro-credit scheme will depend on ensuring higher repayment of loans. This would require close follow-up of clients. The adequate funding, equipping and staffing of the documentation centers is also critical if reliable statistics and data are to be generated. | 3             |
| USE OF COUNTRY SYSTEMS                                     | c) Financial management, procurement, monitoring and/or other systems are based on those already in use by government and/or other partners. | The project was executed and monitored by a PIU constituted by staff of the Planning and Policy department of the Ministry of Education and Vocational Training. The PIU adhered to the financial and procurement guidelines of the Bank.  | 2             |

| For the following dimensions, provide separate working scores for Bank performance and Borrower performance: |  |  | WORKING SCORE |          |
|--|--|--|---------------|----------|
|  |  |  | Bank          | Borrower |
| <b>CLARITY</b>   | d) Responsibilities for project implementation were clearly defined  | Programme delivery arrangements were followed as prescribed in the appraisal report.   | 3             | 3        |
| <b>PROCUREMENT READINESS</b>   | e) The documents needed for implementation (document on specifications, design, procurement, etc.) are ready at appraisal. | The documents referred to were not ready at appraisal.   | 2             | 2        |
| <b>MONITORING READINESS</b>  | f) Monitoring indicators and plans are adopted   | There was no reliable database at the commencement of the project from which to generate monitoring indicators and plans. However, the PIU effectively supervised and monitored the project. | 2             | 2        |
| <b>BASELINE DATA</b>   | h) Collection of baseline data is completed or is underway   | The appraisal report did not provide for the collection of baseline data. No baseline data was collected.  | 2             | 2        |

# PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT (PCR)

## F. IMPLEMENTATION

1. State the major characteristics of project implementation with reference to: adherence to schedule, quality of constructions and other works, performance of consultants, effectiveness of Bank supervision, and effectiveness of Borrower oversight. Determine to what extent the Bank and the Borrower ensured adherence to safeguard measures.

[300 words maximum. [Any additional narrative about implementation should be included in Annex 5: Project Description]

The project was approved in October 2000, but because of a delay in loan effectiveness, first disbursement was effected in February 2002, some 15 months later. The initial closing date was in October 2006, but there was a time overrun of 32 months with the project finally closing in June 2009. With respect to civil works the output was exceeded by some 30% because of the cost-effectiveness of project execution. The situation was similar for the two (2) Skills Development Centers. The Alternative Learning Centre was originally supposed to be a single storey building but owing to the local contractor's initiative and prudent management of resources, another floor was added. The Alternative Learning Centre (ALC) commenced operations in September 2006 and has the potential to enrol 600 students who attend classes in 2 shifts. The ALC has so far produced more than 200 graduates. As a result of challenges with the curriculum which was too theoretical, different curricula were developed for different age groups. Skills development was introduced to maintain the interest of the youth and prevent the incidence of drop-outs.

The Alternative Learning Centre is now playing the role of a Community Learning Centre where community members benefit from long/short term courses in HIV/AIDS, life skills, computer literacy and law. The Alternative Learning program was scaled up by the construction of a smaller ALC in Pemba through the initiative of Government. The Skills Development Centers which are supposed to produce at least 300 graduates annually have been completed and will become operational in January 2010. Instruction in the SDCs will be based on appropriately designed curriculum that correspond to Zanzibar's needs in 33 vocational disciplines including crop farming, fishing, eco-tourism, hotel industry and electronics developed by a consultant in consultation with instructors from vocational training institutions based in Zanzibar. Since the SDCs have not yet produced any graduates the revolving fund in the amount of UA 100,000 and UA 36,000 for the BI in Unguja and Pemba respectively, have been used for micro-finance operations. The documentation centers (DCs) in the three parent Ministries and Pemba were completed in 2005. All ministries transformed the DCs into full-fledged office blocks and headquarters. The structures provide modern facilities which brought together ministry departments that were scattered in various parts of town. It also provided good working environment which significantly increased their productivity. For instance, instead of the originally proposed PIU offices and the DC, the Ministry of Education utilized the allocation provided by the project to construct a three floor building with more than 70 offices. The Ministries of Finance and Employment also made similar arrangements and were able to acquire more than 40 offices. These arrangements became a model in Zanzibar which is being replicated by other Ministries. For instance the Ministry of Health made a similar arrangement under the ADF financed Health II Project.

A womens' trust fund and life savings group, MFIs and SACCOS have been granted loans worth Tshs.1.2 billion. These micro-finance institutions have provided loans averaging between Tshs. 260,000 (USD 200) and Tsh.1,000,000 (USD 770) to about 6,333 clients of which 70% are women. The Bank's supervision of the project was regular and the impact was good. The Borrower showed a lot of interest and commitment to the project exemplified by the fact that the Government of Zanzibar has exceeded its financial commitment to the project by 30% from UA 730,000 to UA 940,000.

2. Comment on the role of other partners (donors, NGOs, enterprises, etc.). Assess the effectiveness of co-financing arrangements and of donor coordination, if applicable.

There was no co-financing. However, SIDA provided funds to complete the Ministry of Education building started with funds for renovating the PIU and the Documentation Centre. Other donors including UNESCO, UNICEF and USAID have supported government in the education and micro-finance sectors.

3. **Harmonization.** State whether the Bank made explicit efforts to harmonize instruments, systems and/or approaches with other partners.

Since this was a project not a program, the concept of harmonization was not applicable. The Bank all the same participated in the Zanzibar Education Sector Committee quarterly meetings.

4. For each dimension of project implementation, assess the extent to which the following criteria were met. Provide a brief assessment (up to two sentences) and insert a working score, using the scoring scale provided in Appendix 1.

| PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION DIMENSIONS             |   | ASSESSMENT  |   | WORKING SCORE |
|---|---|---|---|---------------|
| TIMELINESS                                    | a) Extent of adherence to the original closing date. If the number on the right is:<br>below 12, 4 is scored;<br>between 12.1 and 24, 3 is scored;<br>between 24.1 and 36, 2 is scored;<br>above 36.1, 1 is scored. | Difference in months between original closing date and effective closing date or date of completion of 98% of disbursement  | The project closing date was extended to June 2008 and finally June 2009. The later came at a time when 90% of the activities were completed and the project has to wait for the delivery of equipment and their inspection before submitting withdrawal applications to the Bank. A number of tenders had to be also re-advertized due to poor response. | 2             |
|   |   | 32 months   |   |               |
| BANK PERFORMANCE                              | b) Bank enforced:   |   |   |               |
|   | Environmental Safeguards  | The project was classified as category 3. There was therefore no need for any particular environmental measures.  |   | 3             |
|   | Fiduciary Requirements  | Fifty percent (50%) of expenditures from the Special Account were to be justified and audit reports submitted before replenishment. Bank regularly replenished special account. This was facilitated by the ontime response of TZFO.                |   | 3             |
|   | Agreement reached in the context of the project   | The Bank accepted to lend support to the Government of Zanzibar's Education Master Plan (ZEMAP) which identified never enrolled children and out of school children as a special target group.  |   | 4             |
|   | c) The Bank provided quality supervision in terms of skills mix and practicality of solutions   | The skills mix of Bank supervision composed of socio-economists, infrastructure specialists and financial management specialists was adequate. The Bank, through TZFO was responsive and flexible in accommodating innovative Government proposals. |   | 3             |
| d) Bank provided quality management oversight | The Bank provided quality management oversight through follow-ups after missions. On the ground presence of the Bank improved response time in resolving problems and providing adequate support to the PIU.        |   | 3   |               |

|                             |   |   |   |
|-----------------------------|---|---|---|
| <b>BORROWER PERFORMANCE</b> | Environmental Safeguards  | Adequate toilet and sanitation facilities were provided in the institutions built.  | 3 |
|                             | Fiduciary Requirements  | The compilation of justifications for replenishment and submission of audit reports was timely.   | 4 |
|                             | Agreement reached under the project   | The Borrower was to provide evidence that six months after the start of the academic year 2010, following completion of construction of the two Skills Development Centres, an experienced local financial NGO had been appointed to manage micro-credit activities.  | 3 |
|                             | f) Borrower was responsive to Bank supervision findings and recommendations | Borrower was responsive to Bank supervision findings and recommendations.   | 3 |
|                             | g) Borrower collected and used monitoring information for decision making   | The Alternative Learning programme was evaluated and the results will be used to revise the curriculum. An assessment of micro-finance was carried out and as a result credit facilities were extended to Savings and Credit Co-operatives (SACCOS) which had a higher membership as opposed to the 3 MFIs in Zanzibar. | 4 |
|                             |   |   |   |

# PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT (PCR)

## G. COMPLETION

### 1. Was the PCR delivered on a timely basis, in compliance with Bank policy?

| Date 98% disbursement attained (or closing date, if applicable) | Date PCR sent to pcr@afdb.org | Difference in months | <b>WORKING SCORE</b><br>(Auto-calculated)<br>Si l'écart est égale ou inférieur à 6 mois, la note est de 4. Si l'écart est supérieur à 6 mois, la note est de 1. If the difference is 6 months or less, a 4 is scored. If the difference is more than 6 months, the score is 1. |
|---|-------------------------------|----------------------|--|
| 30th June 2009  |                               |                      |  |

**Briefly describe the PCR Process. Describe the Borrower's and co-financers' involvement in producing the document. Highlight any major differences of opinion concerning the assessments made in this PCR. Describe the team composition and confirm whether a site visit was undertaken. Mention any major collaboration with other development partners. State the extent of field office involvement in producing the report. Indicate whether comments from Peer Reviewers were received on time (provide names and positions of Peer Reviewers).**

**[150 words maximum]**

The PCR team was composed of a socio-economist, consultant architect and the deputy Project Manager. The team visited all the project sites in Unguja and Pemba including the ALC in Rahaleo, two Skills Development Centers in Mkokotoni and Vitongoji, the Mwanakwerekwe Skills Development Centre and documentation centres in the Ministries of Education, Finance and the Ministry of Labor, Youth, Women and Children Development. The mission held discussions with MFIs and SACCOS and reviewed documents in project files and collected data from the MoEVT. Comments were received from the following Peer Reviewers on time: Mr. J. Cunha, YP Socio-economist; Mrs. B. Ba-Diagne; Chief Health Analyst; J. Mochache, Principal Architect.

## H. LESSONS LEARNED FROM THE ASSESSMENT

**Summarize key lessons for the Bank and the Borrower suggested by the project's outcomes**

**[Maximum 300 words. Any other comments about implementation shall be presented in Annex 6: Project Description]**

- (i) Alternative learning (non formal education) based on standard classes teaching regular curriculum of numeracy and literacy will not attract or retain youth school drop outs unless combined with skills acquisition.
- (ii) It is found that it would be more efficient had the contracts for the Technical Service for the "specification of type of machinery" and Design and Supervision for the "layout of workshops" would have been combined and awarded to one firm instead of two firms. The fact that the latter had to wait the other to complete his work before commencing own assignment resulted in significant delays.
- (iii) In using country systems, two additional important lessons were observed: (a) Staff Recruited for a PIU with limited life duration is not sustainable and would undermine harmonization and alignment to country systems; (b) Empowering the Executing Agency and promoting Flexibility in procurement modes such as use of Forced Account instead of international competition has the potential of enhancing efficiency and timely delivery of services to target clients. The ALC and the Documentation Centers were constructed using forced account and were completed three years before the closer of the project.

# PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT (PCR)

## I. PROJECT RATINGS SUMMARY

All working scores are auto-generated by the computer from the relevant section in the PCR.

|                                       |  |          |  |
|---------------------------------------|--|----------|--|
|                                       | Achievement of outputs   | 3        |  |
|                                       | Achievement of outcomes  | 3        |  |
|                                       | Timeliness   | 2        |  |
|                                       | <b>OVERALL OUTCOME SCORE</b>   | <b>3</b> |  |
| <b>BANK<br/>PERFORMANCE</b>           | Project objectives are relevant to country development objectives  | 4        |  |
|                                       | Project objects are achievable with project inputs and in the expected time frame  | 4        |  |
|                                       | Project objectives are consistent with the Bank's country or regional strategy   | 4        |  |
|                                       | Project objectives are consistent with the Bank's general priorities   | 4        |  |
|                                       | The logical framework presents a logical causal chain for achieving project objectives                                       | 3        |  |
|                                       | The Objectives and outcomes, as presented in the logical framework, are measurable and quantifiable                          | 3        |  |
|                                       | The logical framework states key risks and assumptions   | 3        |  |
|                                       | The country's capacity and political commitment are commensurate with the complexity of the project                          | 4        |  |
|                                       | Project design includes adequate risk analysis   | 3        |  |
|                                       | Financial management, monitoring and/or other systems are based on those already in use by government and/or other partners. | 2        |  |
|                                       | Responsibilities for project implementation are clearly defined  | 3        |  |
|                                       | Documents needed for implementation (specifications, design, procurement documents, etc.) are ready at appraisal             | 2        |  |
|                                       | Monitoring indicators and monitoring plans have been adopted   | 2        |  |
|                                       | Collection of baseline data is completed or underway   | 2        |  |
|                                       | <b>DESIGN AND READINESS SUB-SCORE</b>  | <b>3</b> |  |
|                                       | <b>Supervision:</b>  |          |  |
|                                       | Bank enforced:   |          |  |
|                                       | Environmental Safeguards   | 3        |  |
|                                       | Fiduciary Requirements   | 3        |  |
|                                       | Agreements concluded under the project   | 3        |  |
|                                       | Bank provided quality supervision in the form of skills mix and practicality of solutions                                    | 3        |  |
|                                       | Bank provided quality management oversight   | 3        |  |
|                                       | The PCR was delivered on a timely basis  | 1        |  |
| <b>SUPERVISION SUB-SCORE</b>          | <b>3</b>   |          |  |
| <b>OVERALL BANK PERFORMANCE SCORE</b> | <b>3</b>   |          |  |

|                                 |  |          |
|---------------------------------|--|----------|
| <b>BORROWER<br/>PERFORMANCE</b> | Responsibilities for project implementation are clearly defined  | 3        |
|                                 | Documents needed for implementation (specifications, design, procurement documents, etc.) are ready at appraisal         | 2        |
|                                 | Monitoring indicators and monitoring plan have been approved; baseline data collection has been completed or is underway | 2        |
|                                 | <b>PROJECT DESIGN AND READINESS SCORE</b>  | <b>2</b> |
|                                 | <b>Implementation</b>  |          |
|                                 | Borrower complied with:  |          |
|                                 | Environmental Safeguards   | 3        |
|                                 | Fiduciary Requirements   | 4        |
|                                 | Agreements reached under the project   | 3        |
|                                 | Borrower was responsive to Bank supervision findings and recommendations   | 3        |
|                                 | Borrower used monitoring information for decision-making   | 4        |
|                                 | <b>IMPLEMENTATION SUB-SCORE</b>  | <b>3</b> |
|                                 | <b>OVERALL BORROWER PERFORMANCE SCORE</b>  | <b>3</b> |

## J. PROCESSING

| STEP                        | SIGNATURE AND COMMENTS | DATE |
|-----------------------------|------------------------|------|
| Sector Manager Clearance    |                        |      |
| Regional Director Clearance |                        |      |
| Sectoral Director Approval  |                        |      |

Bank Inputs

| Mission Type | Date   | No. of Persons | Composition   |
|--------------|--|----------------|---|
| Appraisal    | March/April 2000   | 3              | Education Analyst<br>Architect<br>Micro-credit specialist |
| Supervision  | 19 <sup>th</sup> -30 <sup>th</sup> November 2001             |                | Socio-economist<br>Consultant Architect                   |
| Supervision  | 27 <sup>th</sup> May-8 <sup>th</sup> June 2002               |                | Socio-economist   |
| Supervision  | 20 <sup>th</sup> -31 <sup>st</sup> December 2002             |                | Socio-economist<br>Consultant Architect                   |
| Supervision  | 5 <sup>th</sup> -9 <sup>th</sup> May 2003                    |                | Socio-economist   |
| Supervision  | 8 <sup>th</sup> -19 <sup>th</sup> December 2003              |                | Socio-economist   |
| Supervision  | 14 <sup>th</sup> -19 <sup>th</sup> September 2004            |                | Socio-economist   |
| Supervision  | 20 <sup>th</sup> June -8 <sup>th</sup> July 2005             |                | Socio-economist   |
| Supervision  | 3 <sup>rd</sup> -17 <sup>th</sup> August 2006                | 1              | Socio-economist   |
| Supervision  | 20 <sup>th</sup> December 2007 -4 <sup>th</sup> January 2008 | 2              | Socio-economist<br>Procurement Specialist                 |
| Supervision  | 24 <sup>th</sup> August-6 <sup>th</sup> September 2008       |                | Socio-economist<br>Social Sector Specialist (TZFO)        |
| Supervision  | 17 <sup>th</sup> -27 <sup>th</sup> December 2008             |                | Socio-economist<br>Social Sector Specialist (TZFO)        |
| Supervision  | 6 <sup>th</sup> -16 <sup>th</sup> June 2009                  | 1              | Socio-economist   |

## FINANCIAL TABLES

Sources of Finance (in million UA)

| Source | F.E. | L.C. | Total | % Total |
|--------|------|------|-------|---------|
| ADF    | 3.48 | 2.08 | 5.56  | 76.1%   |
| TAF    | 0.64 | 0.37 | 1.01  | 13.8%   |
| GoE    | 0.00 | 0.73 | 0.73  | 10.0%   |
| TOTAL  | 4.12 | 3.18 | 7.30  | 100     |

Project Cost by Component (in million UA)

| Component   | In million UA |       |
|---|---------------|-------|
| I. Development of Alternative Learning Skills     | 0.49          | 6.7%  |
| II. Establishment of Skills Development Centres   | 3.52          | 48.2  |
| III. Development of Business Incubator Facilities | 2.03          | 27.8% |
| IV. Institutional Strengthening                   | 0.64          | 8.76% |
| V. Project Management                             | 0.52          | 7.1%  |
| Total Cost  | 7.30          | 100%  |

Actual Disbursement of Loan per Year in UA

| Years since Approval | Amount Disbursed (UA) Loan | Cumulative disbursement | Cumulative as % of total (UA 5.56 million) |
|----------------------|----------------------------|-------------------------|--|
| 2002                 | 394,251.68                 | 394,251.68              | 7.09%                                      |
| 2004                 | 308,378.90                 | 702,630.58              | 12.63%                                     |
| 2005                 | 222,710.37                 | 925,340.95              | 16.64%                                     |
| 2006                 | 1,799,994.92               | 2,725,335.87            | 49.0%                                      |
| 2007                 | 705,847.94                 | 3,431,183.81            | 61.71%                                     |
| 2008                 | 1,288,711.22               | 4,719,895.03            | 84.89%                                     |
| 2009                 | 805,318.16                 | 5,525,213.19            | 99.37%                                     |

Actual Disbursement of Grant per Year in UA

| Years since Approval | Amount Disbursed (UA) Loan | Cumulative disbursement | Cumulative as % of total (UA 1.01 million) |
|----------------------|----------------------------|-------------------------|--|
| 2002                 | 77,968.84                  | 77,968.84               | 7.72%                                      |
| 2003                 | 169,875.35                 | 247,844.19              | 24.53%                                     |
| 2004                 | 161,848.26                 | 409,692.45              | 40.56%                                     |
| 2005                 | 198,863.83                 | 608,556.28              | 60.25%                                     |
| 2006                 | 52,150.52                  | 660,706.80              | 65.41%                                     |
| 2007                 | 55,954.20                  | 716,661.00              | 70.95%                                     |
| 2008                 | 163,223.24                 | 879,884.24              | 87.11%                                     |
| 2009                 | 4,246.92                   | 884,131.16              | 87.53%                                     |

STATISTICS ON POPULATION OF ADOLESCENT YOUTH, TRANSITION RATES, GERs AND NERs

Table 1: POPULATION AND ENROLMENT IN PRIMARY SCHOOLS FOR AGE GROUP 7-13 (in 2000, 2006, 2007)

| YEAR | POPULATION     |        |        | ENROLMENT |        |        |         |        |       |        |        |        | SUMMARY |      |
|------|----------------|--------|--------|-----------|--------|--------|---------|--------|-------|--------|--------|--------|---------|------|
|      | AGE GROUP 7-13 |        |        | PUBLIC    |        |        | PRIVATE |        |       | TOTAL  |        |        | GER     | NER  |
|      | MALE           | FEMALE | TOTAL  | MALE      | FEMALE | TOTAL  | MALE    | FEMALE | TOTAL | MALE   | FEMALE | TOTAL  |         |      |
| 2000 | 88809          | 88193  | 177002 | 82025     | 77436  | 159461 | 1822    | 1830   | 3652  | 83847  | 79266  | 163113 | 92,2    | 71,0 |
| 2006 | 103094         | 102498 | 205592 | 100984    | 100090 | 201074 | 3510    | 3699   | 7209  | 104494 | 103789 | 208283 | 93,8    | 75,7 |
| 2007 | 103909         | 102755 | 206664 | 104368    | 105219 | 209587 | 5741    | 5491   | 11232 | 110109 | 110710 | 220819 | 104,6   | 83,9 |

Table 2: POPULATION AND ENROLMENT IN SECONDARY SCHOOLS FOR AGE GROUP 14-17 (in 2009)

| YEAR | POPULATION      |        |        | ENROLMENT |        |       |         |        |       |       |        |       |
|------|-----------------|--------|--------|-----------|--------|-------|---------|--------|-------|-------|--------|-------|
|      | AGE GROUP 14-17 |        |        | PUBLIC    |        |       | PRIVATE |        |       | TOTAL |        |       |
|      | MALE            | FEMALE | TOTAL  | MALE      | FEMALE | TOTAL | MALE    | FEMALE | TOTAL | MALE  | FEMALE | TOTAL |
| 2009 | 56715           | 56345  | 113060 | 35242     | 38410  | 73652 | 1813    | 2493   | 4306  | 37055 | 40903  | 77958 |

Table 3: TRANSITION RATES TO FORM 3 (TO MEASURE FORM 2 DROP-OUT RATE FOR FORM 2)

| Year | No. of students who sat for Form 2 exams |        |       | No. of students who were selected to join Form 3 |        |       | Transition Rate % |        |       |
|------|--|--------|-------|--|--------|-------|-------------------|--------|-------|
|      | Male                                     | Female | Total | Male   | Female | Total | Male              | Female | Total |
| 2000 | 4867                                     | 4488   | 9355  | 1614   | 1346   | 2960  | 33,2              | 30,0   | 31,6  |
| 2005 | 6474                                     | 7081   | 13555 | 3044   | 3315   | 6359  | 47,0              | 46,8   | 46,9  |
| 2008 | 13258                                    | 16594  | 29852 | 7039   | 9043   | 16082 | 53,1              | 54,5   | 53,9  |

Table 4: TRANSITION RATES TO FORM 5 (TO MEASURE DROP-OUT RATE FOR FORM 4)

| Year | No. of students who sat for Form 4 exams |        |       | No. of students who were selected to join Form 5 and Full Technical Certificate |        |       | Transition Rate % |        |       |
|------|--|--------|-------|---|--------|-------|-------------------|--------|-------|
|      | Male                                     | Female | Total | Male  | Female | Total | Male              | Female | Total |
| 2008 | 3821                                     | 3934   | 7755  | 829   | 544    | 1373  | 21,7              | 13,8   | 17,7  |

Transition rate for 2009 was 23%

Table 5: REASONS FOR DROP-OUT IN BASIC SCHOOLS

| DROP-OUT BY REASON SEX AND STANDARD IN BASIC SCHOOLS -<br>OCTOBER, 2004 |           |           |            |           |            |           |            |            |            |           |            |            |            |            |           |            |            |            |            |           |             |             |
|---|-----------|-----------|------------|-----------|------------|-----------|------------|------------|------------|-----------|------------|------------|------------|------------|-----------|------------|------------|------------|------------|-----------|-------------|-------------|
| STANDARD/<br>REASON   | I         |           | II         |           | III        |           | IV         |            | V          |           | VI         |            | VII        |            | OSC       |            | FORM 1     |            | FORM 2     |           | TOTAL       |             |
|   | M         | F         | M          | F         | M          | F         | M          | F          | M          | F         | M          | F          | M          | F          | M         | F          | M          | F          | M          | F         | M           | F           |
| PARENTS SEPARATION  | 5         | 0         | 14         | 8         | 12         | 10        | 10         | 9          | 18         | 7         | 5          | 5          | 1          | 2          | 6         | 3          | 3          | 2          | 2          | 0         | 76          | 46          |
| LARGE NO. OF CHILDREN IN THE FAMILY                                     | 0         | 0         | 0          | 1         | 0          | 0         | 1          | 0          | 3          | 1         | 5          | 1          | 0          | 0          | 3         | 1          | 0          | 0          | 0          | 0         | 12          | 4           |
| MARRIAGE  | 0         | 0         | 0          | 0         | 6          | 0         | 1          | 1          | 0          | 11        | 2          | 18         | 6          | 41         | 3         | 54         | 6          | 40         | 6          | 20        | 30          | 185         |
| PREGNANCY   | 0         | 0         | 0          | 0         | 0          | 0         | 0          | 0          | 0          | 6         | 0          | 11         | 0          | 9          | 0         | 12         | 0          | 16         | 0          | 16        | 0           | 70          |
| DEATH   | 9         | 14        | 8          | 11        | 7          | 8         | 5          | 6          | 6          | 3         | 14         | 4          | 6          | 4          | 3         | 2          | 6          | 0          | 2          | 2         | 66          | 54          |
| EMIGRATION  | 3         | 4         | 2          | 4         | 6          | 3         | 2          | 3          | 1          | 1         | 0          | 2          | 2          | 1          | 0         | 2          | 5          | 2          | 0          | 0         | 21          | 22          |
| GOVERNMENT EMPLOYMENT   | 0         | 0         | 0          | 0         | 0          | 0         | 0          | 0          | 1          | 0         | 0          | 0          | 0          | 0          | 0         | 0          | 0          | 0          | 0          | 0         | 1           | 0           |
| PRIVATE SECTOR EMPLOYMENT   | 0         | 0         | 0          | 0         | 0          | 0         | 1          | 0          | 6          | 0         | 1          | 1          | 2          | 0          | 5         | 0          | 3          | 2          | 4          | 0         | 22          | 3           |
| BUSINESS  | 0         | 0         | 6          | 0         | 7          | 0         | 17         | 6          | 17         | 0         | 18         | 1          | 10         | 4          | 24        | 4          | 14         | 2          | 9          | 0         | 122         | 17          |
| INDISCIPLINE  | 5         | 0         | 12         | 3         | 14         | 8         | 27         | 11         | 17         | 11        | 40         | 16         | 17         | 7          | 40        | 18         | 38         | 13         | 17         | 2         | 227         | 89          |
| HOME DUTIES   | 3         | 1         | 0          | 3         | 3          | 10        | 4          | 5          | 4          | 9         | 4          | 15         | 10         | 3          | 0         | 1          | 2          | 7          | 3          | 0         | 33          | 54          |
| PARENTS IGNORANCE   | 57        | 32        | 61         | 68        | 102        | 47        | 102        | 70         | 71         | 40        | 108        | 68         | 47         | 24         | 57        | 33         | 44         | 41         | 36         | 21        | 685         | 444         |
| OTHERS  | 1         | 1         | 4          | 1         | 15         | 10        | 6          | 6          | 14         | 4         | 8          | 6          | 12         | 6          | 65        | 35         | 39         | 17         | 29         | 16        | 193         | 102         |
| <b>TOTAL</b>  | <b>83</b> | <b>52</b> | <b>110</b> | <b>99</b> | <b>172</b> | <b>96</b> | <b>176</b> | <b>117</b> | <b>158</b> | <b>93</b> | <b>205</b> | <b>148</b> | <b>113</b> | <b>101</b> | <b>##</b> | <b>165</b> | <b>160</b> | <b>142</b> | <b>108</b> | <b>77</b> | <b>1488</b> | <b>1090</b> |

### Additional Information on ALSD Project

#### 1. PROJECT BACKGROUND

1.1 A study conducted in May 1998 identified four main barriers to education in Zanzibar comprising essentially: i) exclusion because of early marriage and early pregnancies; ii) limited infrastructure (especially classrooms) iii) lack of quality and relevance of formal education; and iv) parent/community attitude towards education. In addition, the study discovered that apart from the fact that children in primary and secondary schools were over-aged; the drop-out rate was high. The Education II project which became effective in January 1999, addressed the issue of Complementary Education for Out-of School Children and Adult Literacy in Non-Formal Education focusing on girls and women on the Mainland. The activities included, i) expansion of the Community Based Adult Education (CBAE); and ii) Complementary Basic Education in Tanzania (COBET). In view of the fact that, there was the need to develop similar activities in Zanzibar, an appraisal mission was launched by the Bank in March/April 2000. The appraisal report of the Alternative Learning and Skills Development project was completed in September 2000 within the framework of the findings of the study and the Zanzibar Education Master Plan (ZEMAP) covering the period 1997-2006.

#### 2. PROJECT PREPARATION

The loan agreement for the project was approved on 31<sup>st</sup> October 2000, signed on 30<sup>th</sup> January 2001 and became effective on 24<sup>th</sup> December 2001. The project was subsequently launched and the first disbursement was in February 2002. The initial closing date was 30<sup>th</sup> October 2006, but this was extended twice to 30<sup>th</sup> June 2008, and finally to 30<sup>th</sup> June 2009.

#### 3. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION

3.1 The project's objective at appraisal was to improve the quality of training, non-formal education and to link education with labour market needs through the construction of an Alternative Learning Centre (ALC) and two (2) skills development centres, sensitization of the general public on issues of non-formal education with emphasis on girls. The ALC has performed creditably in its role of teaching 1,239 enrolled youths in literary and numerical skills as prescribed in the appraisal report since its inception. The ALC has however gone further by introducing skills development in its curriculum to introduce a balance between the theoretical subjects (which generate less interest) taught in Alternative Learning Centres and the vocational and practical trades taught in the Skills Development Centres. It has also been transformed into a community centre, generates revenue through the renting of office space and space for social events and is financially autonomous.

3.2 The two (2) Skills Development Centres were completed 2 years behind schedule. The first batch of about 400 students will commence their studies in January 2010. This delay has put on hold the commencement of the business incubator and micro-credit phase of the project until the first batch of graduates are produced. In the interim, micro-finance activities are being implemented through the granting of loans to Savings and Credit Co-operatives, Micro-finance institutions and financial NGOs which serve as intermediaries between the lending authority and the direct beneficiaries whose number has attained 6,333. 70% of these direct beneficiaries are women.

3.3 The outputs of the project went far beyond what was anticipated at appraisal. Funds allocated for the PIU and documentation centres were used to initiate the construction of ministerial blocks for 3 ministries and more than 100 offices were created. The project inspired the construction of a temporary Alternative Learning Centre in Pemba and also a permanent one through government resources. The focus on skills development during project implementation was the catalyst which fast-tracked the creation of the Vocational Training Authority. The Authority will soon benefit from a skills development levy which will enable it have enough resources to establish more skills development centres and maintain the existing ones.

#### 4. PROJECT OUTPUTS AND OUTCOMES

4.1 The project's main target at appraisal was that 10% of out of school youth would have benefited from an Alternative Learning facility by 2005. The increases in the Gross Enrolment Ratio (GER) and the Net Enrolment Ratio (NER) for primary school children aged 7-13 since the year 2000 indicate that the numbers of the never enrolled children is declining. The figures for GER and NER were respectively 92.2 and 71.0 for the year 2000, 93.8 and 75.7 for the year 2006 and 104.6 and 83.9 for the year 2007.

4.2 The overall physical implementation rate of project activities is 98%. This is because the Business Incubator phase of the project has been delayed owing to the delayed completion of the Skills Development Centres. About 44% of the ADF resources were spent on civil works, 4% on furniture and about 10% on equipment.

##### Component 1- Development of Alternative Learning (ALC)

The construction of ALC was completed in April 2006 and became operational in July 2006. The 3 floor building has 16 classrooms, computer room, library, offices and support facilities. The center currently has a total of 35 trained teachers out of whom 28 are women. Cumulative enrolment to date is 1,239 of whom 340 are girls. The centre has produced 211 graduates of whom 30% are girls. Other beneficiaries numbering 1,132 (51.5% women) who attend evening classes are pursuing courses in computing, diploma in law and adult literacy.

##### Component 2- Skills Development Centres (SDC)

The construction of SDCs in Mkokotoni - Unguja and Vitongoji- Pemba have been completed and have received all furniture and equipment. The two centres have a combined capacity of 600 students out of which 30% will be boarders. The centres also comprise 10 classrooms, 2 libraries, 2 computer rooms, 2 administration blocks, 2 staff rooms, 7 staff houses, 2 cafeteria, 6 hostel facilities to accommodate 400 students. The facilities also include 22 workshops of which 2 are automotive, 2 masonry, 2 electronics, 2 refrigeration and air-conditioning, 2 welding, 1 handicraft and weaving, 2 plumbing, 2 food processing and catering, 1 painting and decoration, 2 cattle sheds and 2 chicken sheds and 2 crop farming and horticulture workshops. The two centres will become operational they are expected to produce at least 300 graduates with various skills annually. It is expected that 20% of these graduates could become self-employed through the incubator scheme. A total of 40 teachers instructors have been trained and would be deployed from January 2010.

### Component 3- Business Incubator (BI)

The Business Incubators will be established in the 2 SDCs to offer business advisory services to the would-be graduates. Since the incubators will be functional after the graduation of the first batch of students, the Government has started with the loans for women or co-operatives sub-component of the micro-credit fund. The 19 micro-finance institutions, savings and credit co-operatives and MFIs have lent resources amounting to Tsh. 1,248,000,000 to 6,333 direct beneficiaries. 70% of them are women. The main activities these clients have invested in include poultry, farming, small scale industries, sea weeds farming and petty trading. Considering the high demand for credit, the PIU in close collaboration with the ADF financed SELF project has trained a total of 359 clients who are members of Savings and Credit Co-operative Societies (SACCOS) in Unguja and Pemba island. At the present rate of disbursement, the scheme could generate interest on loans amounting to USD 100,000 per annum.

### Component 4- Institutional Strengthening

The documentation centres (DCs) in the 3 parent ministries and Pemba were completed in 2005. All the project ministries used the resources meant for rehabilitating offices to serve as PIU and DCs to partially finance the construction of ministerial blocks with more than a 100 offices. The DCs in the Ministry of Education and Vocational Education, Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs and the Ministry of Youth, Employment, Women and Children Development are functional. The Information, Education and Communication (IEC) activities of the project included sensitization and awareness programs for the youth particularly girls to encourage them to join the Alternative Learning program.

### Component 5-Project Management

Although the project closed in June 2009, micro-finance activities will continue. The essential staff for micro-finance operations which include a business incubator manager, a micro-credit officer, an accountant and a secretary now constitute the management team for micro-finance operations.

## 5. PROCUREMENT

All procurement activities have been executed. Five (5) vehicles and two (2) motor bikes were procured in addition to furniture and tools and workshop equipment for the PIU, Alternative Learning Centre, the 2 Skills Development Centres, a renovated vocational centre and the 3 documentation centres. The procurement of 2 lots of equipment was delayed. The delivery of tools and equipment was delayed because of a change in shipping arrangements. Computers and accessories were procured and delivered before civil works at the SDCs was completed so alternative arrangements for storage were made until final delivery at the SDCs.

## 6. PROJECT SUSTAINABILITY

The Alternative Learning Centre has been generating revenue from enrolled youth contributions to tuition and renting of office space and halls for social events and is financially autonomous. The centre has so far generated an income of Tsh. 49,544,428 with recurrent expenditure amounting to Tsh. 26,850,928 leaving a bank balance of Tsh. 22,693,500.91. As a result, Government subvention which should have been allocated to the centre had it not been generating revenue could be used to support a skills development centre in a rural area. The creation of the Vocational Training Authority (VTA) augurs well for the future of the Vocational and Skills Development Centres. A regulation on the 5% Skills Development Levy will soon be published. The

revenue generated from the levy made up of contributions from all employers on behalf of their employees will generate revenue which will permit the VTA to actively pursue Government's objective of building a Skills Development Centre in at least every region and also have the resources to maintain the existing centres. The membership of the board of the VTA includes representatives from industry who will advise on the relevance and demand for skills to enable the skills development centres to adjust their curriculum accordingly.

## 7. GENDER AND SOCIAL IMPACT

One of the main objectives of the ALSD project was to accord high priority to the development of out of school complementary basic education with a strong emphasis on girls; encourage the enrolment of girls in the Alternative Learning Centre and Skills Development Centres, reduce their drop-out rate and improve on their performance. With the increase in the Net Enrolment Ratio (NER) for 7-14 year olds from 76.3 in 2005 to 83.9 in 2007 it could be inferred that numbers for never enrolled and dropouts are progressively getting lower. About 40% of the 400 youth enrolled in the Skills Development Centres which will commence training from January 2010 are girls and it is expected that when they graduate they will be absorbed by industry or be self-employed with financial assistance from the micro credit scheme.

## 8. CONCLUSION

The Alternative Learning and Skills Development project which was formulated within the framework of the third component of the Zanzibar Education Master Plan and was to have been completed in June 2005 finally closed in June 2009. Most of the objectives of the project including non-formal education for never enrolled and out of school children have been attained. The Alternative Learning Centre which started as an institution for imparting literary and numerical skills to enrolled youth has expanded its program of study to include skills training. The centre has produced 211 graduates and has a total enrolment since its inception in 2006 of 1239 youths. As part of the Information, Education and Information (IEC) activities, the PIU produced a sensitization and awareness program for the youth particularly girls to generate interest in complementary basic education. The Skills Development Centres will become operational in January 2010 and the first graduates will benefit from the Business Incubator and micro-credit sub-component of the project. Some 19 Micro-Finance Institutions have obtained loans amounting to Tsh. 1,248,000,000 from the project's micro-credit facility and have subsequently lent to groups and individuals. Direct beneficiaries who have obtained loans so far number 6,333 of which 70% are women. Repayments have been regular and it is anticipated that the scheme could generate interest on loans amounting to USD 100,000 which could then be paid into the revolving fund. Although the project is officially closed the PIU has been downsized to continue managing the business incubator and micro-credit sub-component.

The project produced several additional outputs which were not envisaged at its inception. For example, The Alternative Learning Centre (ALC) is now a community centre and hosts social events. Evening classes organized in the Alternative Learning Centre (ALC) has made great strides in training 1320 community members (51% of them being women) in computer literacy, law and adult literacy. The ALC is financially autonomous and has so far generated an income of TZS 49,544,428 (USD 40,000). The ALC in Unguja instigated the construction of a temporary 4 classroom ALC in Pemba with funds from the Special Account All procurement activities have been executed. Five (5) vehicles and two (2) motor bikes were procured in addition to furniture and tools and workshop equipment for the PIU, Alternative Learning Centre, the 2 Skills Development Centres and the 3 documentation centres. The procurement of 2 lots of equipment was delayed. The delivery of tools and equipment was delayed because of a change in shipping arrangements. Computers

and accessories were procured and delivered before civil works at the SDCs was completed so alternative arrangements for storage were made until final delivery at the SDCs.

Instead of the originally proposed PIU offices and Documentation Centre (DC), the Ministry of Education and Vocational Training utilized the allocation to construct the foundation and ground floor of a 2 storey building which housed the PIU and the documentation centre. The example was emulated by the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs which used its allocation for the DC to construct the foundation and ground floor of a building which was later completed and now has 40 offices while the Ministry of Labour, Youth, Women and Children Development used its allocation to build a documentation centre and additional space to accommodate offices. The project also instigated the conception of a permanent three (3) storey ALC which is under construction from Government resources as well as the creation of the Zanzibar Vocational Training Authority which now has under its control the 2 Skills Development Centres constructed by the ALSD project.

List of Supporting Documents

Annex 5

1. Project Appraisal Report
2. Quarterly Progress Reports
3. Audit Reports
4. ADB-Project Files and Records
5. Education Situation Analysis-2007, MoEVT
6. Zanzibar Educational Development Plan
7. Annual Statistical Abstract