

**AFRICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK AFRICAN DEVELOPMENT FUND  
BOARDS OF DIRECTORS**

**Resolution B/BD/2010/10 – F/BD/2010/04  
Amending Resolution B/BD/2004/9 – F/BD/2004/7  
Instituting the Independent Review Mechanism**

Adopted at the 831<sup>st</sup> Meeting of the Board of Directors of the Bank and the 765<sup>th</sup>  
Meeting of the Board of Directors of the Fund, 16<sup>th</sup> June 2010

**THE BOARDS OF DIRECTORS,**

**HAVING REGARD** to the:

- (i) Agreement Establishing the African Development Bank (the "Bank"), in particular Articles 1 (Purpose), 2 (Functions), 4 (Structure), 8 (Special Fund), 13 (Ordinary and Special Operations), 32 (Board of Directors: Powers), 52 (Judicial Proceedings) and 53 (Immunity of Assets and Archives);
- (ii) Agreement Establishing the African Development Fund (the "Fund") in particular Articles 2 (Purpose), 14 (Use of Resources), 26 (Board of Directors: Functions), 31 (Relationship with the Bank), 43 (Legal Process), 44 (Immunity of Assets) and 45 (Immunity of Archives); and
- (iii) Agreement Establishing the Nigeria Trust Fund (the "NTF") in particular Articles I (Establishment and Purpose), II (Utilization of Resources), III (Administration of the Fund); IV (Operating Principles); XV and (Immunities, Exemptions and Privileges);

**CONSIDERING** Management's Proposals on the Amendment of Resolution **B/BD/2004/9 – F/BD/2004/7** on the Establishment of an Inspection Function, contained in Document ADB/BD/WP/2010/08 – ADF/BD/WP/2010/09, ADB/BD/WP/2010/08/Add.1 – ADF/BD/WP/2010/09/Add.1 and ADB/BD/WP/2010/08/Add.2 – ADF/BD/WP/2010/09/Add.2 and the recommendations contained therein;

**NOTING** the importance of establishing a mechanism through which persons adversely affected by projects financed by the Bank, the Fund and the NTF and other Special Funds administered by the Bank (the "Bank Group") can request the Bank Group to comply with its own policies and procedures;

**COGNISANT** of the need to provide detailed rules governing the establishment, procedures and administration of such a mechanism in order to ensure its effective performance;

**HEREBY RESOLVE AS FOLLOWS:**

**Establishment**

1. There is established an independent compliance review and problem solving mechanism (hereinafter called the "Independent Review Mechanism") which shall have the powers and shall function as stated below.

### **Composition of the Independent Review Mechanism**

2. The Independent Review Mechanism (IRM) shall consist of a Compliance Review and Mediation Unit ("CRMU") and a roster of experts (the "Roster of Experts").
3. The CRMU shall be an Organizational Unit of the Bank established in accordance with a Resolution of the Board of Directors of the Bank Group, and shall be the focal Unit of the IRM. The activities of the CRMU shall be managed by an Organizational Unit Head designated as the 'Director, CRMU' (the "Director") who shall be appointed by the President with the concurrence of the Boards of Directors (the "Boards") for a five year term renewable once. The Director shall not have worked for the Bank in any capacity for five (5) years prior to his/her appointment, and shall not work for the Bank in any capacity after his/her appointment for a period of three (3) years following each term of office served.
4. The Roster of Experts shall comprise three (3) individuals (the "Expert(s)") selected in accordance with the Bank's procurement rules applicable to the selection of consultants and appointed by the Boards on the recommendation of the President. The Experts shall be nationals of the member states of the Bank or State participants in the Fund selected on the basis of their knowledge and experience of development in Africa and the operations of multilateral development Banks.
5. The Experts shall be appointed to the Roster of Experts for a non-renewable term of five (5) years, with the exception of the first three (3) Experts who shall be appointed by lot as follows: one for three (3) years, one for four (4) years and one for five (5) years. If an Expert's term expires, at the time the Expert is engaged in a compliance review, the Expert's term shall be extended for such period as may be necessary to complete the compliance review unless the Boards decide otherwise. On the recommendation of the President, in consultation with the members of the Roster of Experts, the Boards shall appoint a Chairperson of the Roster of Experts each time a member of the Roster of Experts is replaced..
6. Executive Directors, Alternate Executive Directors, Advisers, Assistants, any Officer or Staff member of the Bank or persons holding consultant appointments shall not serve on the Roster of Experts until two (2) years have elapsed since the end of their service to the Bank or the Fund. If an Expert is called upon to work for the IRM during his or her term, the Expert shall not be entitled to work for the Bank or the Fund (either as staff member, Bank officer, Executive Director, Alternate Executive Director, Adviser, Assistant or Consultant) for a period of two (2) years after the expiry of his or her term.
7. An Expert shall disclose any conflict of interest and shall be disqualified from participation in the hearing and investigation of any request related to a matter in which he/she has a personal interest or had significant involvement in any capacity.
8. Experts on the Roster of Experts shall be remunerated for work carried out and shall be expected to work on a full-time basis when appointed to serve on a compliance review panel. They shall be guaranteed a minimum of 12 working days per annum. Once they

have been assigned an IRM work, Experts shall receive remuneration at a level to be determined by the Boards, upon the recommendation of the President. The payment shall be equivalent of what is paid by other MBDs for similar officials as adjusted by the Bank Group's Boards from time to time. They shall be reimbursed for their travel and expenses on the same basis as provided in the Bank's Group's Travel Policy for senior management staff. The new remuneration system and rates shall be applicable to contracts with Experts appointed to the Roster as of the date of entry into force of this amended Resolution.

9. In the performance of their functions, Experts shall be officials of the Bank enjoying the privileges and immunities accorded to Bank officials, and shall be subject to the requirement about exclusive loyalty to the Bank and the prescription in Article 38 of the Agreement establishing the African Development Bank and Article 21 of the Agreement establishing the African Development Fund against interference in the political affairs of member states.
10. An Expert may be removed from the Roster of Experts at any time, by a decision of the Boards, for cause. If an Expert appointed to a compliance review panel resigns or is otherwise unable to complete such assignment, the Director shall make a recommendation to the Boards, through the President, on a proposed course of action to ensure the prompt completion of the compliance review.

#### **Powers of the Independent Review Mechanism**

11. The IRM shall receive requests from persons adversely affected by a project financed by a Bank Group entity. Such requests shall be presented to the CRMU by two or more persons (such as, community of persons, an organization, association, society or other grouping of individuals) ("Requestors") or by a qualified representative of the affected persons (as defined in the Operating Rules and Procedures) who demonstrate that their rights or interests have been or are likely to be directly affected by the failure of the relevant Bank Group entity to comply:
  - (i) in the case of a sovereign guaranteed project financed by any of the Bank Group entities, with any of its operational policies and procedures in respect of the design, appraisal and/or implementation of such project; and
  - (ii) in the case of a private sector or non-sovereign guaranteed project financed by any of the Bank Group entities, with the social and environmental policies and safeguards of such projects.

The alleged non-compliance may include situations where the Bank Group entity is alleged to have failed in its follow-up on the borrower's obligations under loan agreements with respect to the applicable policies and procedures.

12. The CRMU shall ensure that before a request for compliance review or problem-solving is treated, the request has been dealt with by the Management of the Bank and Management has failed to demonstrate that it has followed, or is taking adequate steps to follow the relevant policies and procedures. The CRMU shall also satisfy itself that the alleged violation of the relevant policies and procedures is not frivolous, and is of a material character.

**Function of the Independent Review Mechanism**

13. The IRM shall perform both compliance review and problem-solving functions. The problem-solving function shall be undertaken by CRMU and used where complaints or grievances can also, or alternatively, benefit from problem-solving techniques to assist in resolving the underlying issues. Such problem-solving techniques may include independent fact-finding, mediation, conciliation, dialogue facilitation, and may include the best customary practices.
  
14. The IRM shall be activated when the CRMU accepts the complaint (the "Request") after it is satisfied that all requisite criteria have been fulfilled. In considering Requests under paragraph 11 above, the CRMU shall not receive:
  - (i) Complaints relating to actions which are within the responsibility of other parties, including the borrower or potential borrower, and which do not involve any action or omission on the part of the relevant Bank Group entity;
  - (ii) Complaints against procurement decisions by the Bank Group or a borrower of a Bank Group entity from suppliers of goods and services financed by or expected to be financed by a Bank Group entity under a financing agreement, or from losing tenders for the supply of any such goods and services, which will continue to be addressed under existing procedures;
  - (iii) Complaints about fraud or corruption;
  - (iv) Complaints about matters before the Administrative Tribunal of the Bank;
  - (v) Complaints about matters before other judicial review or similar bodies;
  - (vi) Frivolous or malicious complaints, or complaints motivated by an intention to gain competitive advantage;
  - (vii) Requests related to matters over which the CRMU, a Panel, the President or the Boards has/have already made a recommendation or reached a decision after having received and reviewed a Request, unless justified by clear and compelling new evidence or circumstances not known at the time of the prior Request;
  - (viii) Complaints relating to the adequacy or unsuitability of Bank Group policies or procedures;
  - (ix) Complaints relating to private sector or other non-sovereign guaranteed projects except in instances of an alleged breach of the agricultural, education, health, gender, good governance or environmental policies of the Bank Group.
  
15. The IRM shall seek the advice of the Bank's General Counsel and Legal Department on matters related to the Bank's rights and obligations with respect to a Request under consideration.

## **Procedures**

16. Requests shall be in writing and shall state all the relevant facts including the harm suffered by or threatened to affected parties by the alleged act or omission of the Bank Group entity in contravention of its applicable policies and procedures. The Requests should to the extent possible explain the steps already taken to deal with the issue, as well as the nature of the alleged actions or omissions and shall specify the actions taken to bring the issue to the attention of Management and Management's response to such action.
17. The Director shall conduct a preliminary review to determine whether a Request is a *bona fide* request within fourteen (14) days of the receipt of the Request. The Director shall promptly inform the Boards, the President and the operational departments responsible for the project upon registering a Request that is determined to be eligible for either a compliance review or a problem-solving exercise.
18. Within twenty-one (21) days of being notified of a Request, Management shall provide the CRMU with evidence that it has, or intends to comply with the Bank Group's relevant policies and procedures. If there is no response from Management within twenty-one (21) days the CRMU shall notify the Boards and the President accordingly and send a copy to Requestors.
19. The CRMU may request clarification from Management on its response and set a time for the receipt of the additional information. Within twenty-one (21) days of receiving Management's additional response or the expiry of the time limit for receipt of the additional response, the CRMU shall undertake and conclude a problem-solving exercise or together with the IRM Experts determine the eligibility of the Request for a compliance review. If the Request is found eligible, the Director and the IRM Experts shall make a recommendation for a compliance review to the Boards or to the President where the Request relates to a project that has not been approved by the Boards. In case of a deadlock in determining eligibility, the Director of CRMU shall have the casting vote.
20. If the Director determines that a Request may be handled through a problem-solving exercise, he or she shall invite all relevant parties to participate in the exercise. The Director may use a variety of problem-solving techniques including best customary practices in the problem-solving exercise including, without limitation, mediation, conciliation, dialogue and facilitation.
21. If a problem-solving exercise is not successfully concluded within a period of three (3) months from commencement or by consent of the parties, the Director may recommend such remedial action as he deems appropriate to the Boards or to the President where the Request relates to a project that has not been approved by the Boards. Such recommendation may include the undertaking of an assessment of eligibility of a compliance review for the relevant project by the Director and the Experts.
22. Where the Director determines, following the conclusion of a problem-solving exercise or otherwise, that there is prima facie evidence the affected parties have been harmed or threatened with harm by a Bank Group-financed project due to the failure to follow the relevant policies and procedures of a member of the Bank Group, the Director and the IRM Experts shall, within thirty (30) days of such determination assess the eligibility of the Request for a compliance review. If determined eligible, they shall submit a report

recommending a compliance review of the relevant project to: (a) the Boards of Directors; or (b) the President, with a copy to the Boards, if the Request relates to a project that has not been approved by the Boards. The recommendation shall include draft Terms of Reference of the compliance review which shall be undertaken by the Panel comprising the three IRM Experts, and if considered necessary, complemented with consultant specialists in the relevant fields of expertise..

23. In considering a recommendation for a compliance review, the Boards of Directors or the President, as the case may be, shall either: (a) approve the recommendations(s) on a 'no-objection' basis; or (b) remit the request to the Director and the IRM Experts to reassess the recommendation regarding the draft Terms of Reference with a new recommendation, if any, being submitted to the President or the Boards as the case may be. Any decision by the President on the recommendations of the Director concerning a compliance review shall be immediately communicated to the Boards.
24. The Panel shall conduct the compliance review in accordance with the approved Terms of Reference. The Experts on the Panel shall each have one (1) vote and decisions of the Panel shall be taken by simple majority. The CRMU shall provide administrative and technical support to the Panel.
25. The Panel shall report its findings and recommendations to the Boards or to the President where the Request relates to a project that has not been approved by the Boards. The Boards or the President as the case may be, shall decide whether or not to accept the findings and recommendations of the Panel. Any decision by the President shall be immediately copied to the Boards.
26. The findings and recommendations of the Panel shall be based only on facts relevant to the Request and shall be impartial. The Panel may not recommend the award of compensation or any other benefits to any person, entity or government beyond that which may be expressly contemplated in a relevant Bank Group policy.

### **Reports**

27. The Director shall prepare, within thirty (30) days of the conclusion of the problem-solving exercise, a report on the exercise and its outcome and shall provide the report to the parties in the problem-solving exercise, to the Boards and to the President. Interim progress reports may be submitted by the Director to the Boards and the President for information.
28. The Panel shall report its findings and recommendations of the compliance review within thirty (30) days of the conclusion of a compliance review to the Boards or to the President where the Request relates to a project that has not been approved by the Boards, and to the requestors.
29. The CRMU, or the person(s) otherwise charged with the responsibility, may monitor the implementation of any solution agreed upon in a problem-solving exercise or any remedial changes to the relevant Bank Group's policies or procedures or to the implementation of the relevant Bank Group-financed project. Such persons shall submit the monitoring report to the Boards or to the President where the Request relates to a project that has not been approved by the Boards. Any monitoring report to the President shall be immediately copied to the Boards.

30. Subject to the provisions of the Bank Group's Disclosure of Information Policy, the reports of the CRMU and the Panel and the decisions of the Boards and the President on all Requests shall be communicated to the Requestor and all other interested parties and shall be made public by the Bank Group.
31. The Director shall prepare, in consultation with the Experts, an annual report describing the activities of the CRMU during the preceding year. The annual report shall be submitted to the Boards and to the Boards of Governors for information. The annual report shall be published by the Bank Group.

### **Review**

32. The Boards shall review the experience of the IRM established by this Resolution after three (3) years from the date of the effectiveness of the IRM, which date shall be that of the appointment of the Director, thereafter every four (4) years, or as otherwise decided by the Boards.

### **Operating Rules and Procedures**

33. The Boards have approved the amended Operating Rules and Procedures of the Compliance Review and Mediation Unit of the Independent Review Mechanism, which shall complement the operational provisions contained in this Resolution.