## TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. Introduction ............................................................................................................................................. 1

II. Workshop Format................................................................................................................................... 3

III. Key Issues/Themes Raised by Participants: ......................................................................................... 4

IV. Consultation Sessions: ......................................................................................................................... 5
    A. Day One: Session 1: Introduction and Climate Setting ................................................................. 5
    B. Day One: Session 2: Development Process of ISS..................................................................... 5
    C. Day Two: Session 1: Introduction of the day’s Agenda and Opening of the meeting.............. 6
    D. Day Two: Session 2: Presentation of Operational Safeguards and Breakout Session: .... 7
    E. Day Three: Session 1: Presentations by Group reporters .............................................................. 7
    F. Day Three: Closing Remarks........................................................................................................... 7

V. Next Steps................................................................................................................................................ 9

Annex 1: List of Participants ....................................................................................................................... 10

Annex 2: Welcome Remarks by AfDB EARC Director ............................................................................ 15

Annex 3: Statement of Official opening of meeting by Director in the Ministry of Environment and Mineral Resources ................................................................................................. 19

Annex 4: Group Presentations ................................................................................................................... 22

Annex 5: Agenda of Regional Consultations on Integrated Safeguards System ................................. 27
STAKEHOLDER GROUP/ (S): MULTISTAKEHOLDER

Location of consultation: Nairobi, Kenya
Date: April 11-13, 2012.

I. INTRODUCTION

The African Development Bank Group (AfDB) has itself committed to revising and updating its policies and procedures for environmental and social safeguards. The Integrated safeguard System (ISS) draws from existing Bank policies and introduces a set of new Operational Safeguards (OSs), which are a set of brief and focused policy statements that clearly set out the operational requirements with which Bank-financed operations must comply. The purpose of this consultation process was to enable key stakeholders to seize the opportunities for their involvement in the design of banks integrated safeguards system and to express their views and comments.

The bank undertook the consultations with the following three specific objectives to:

- Improve the overall quality and relevance of the integrated Safeguards system;
- Promote a common understanding of the safeguards objectives, principles and requirements and;
- Correct formulation of the safeguard policy statement.

The views and contributions of the wide range of stakeholders will be used with the following objectives:

- Improve the content and clarity of the current proposal;
- Increase operational efficiency;
- Ensure ownership by borrowers; and
- Establish mechanism for compliance, monitoring and reporting.

This report provides account of the first of the five regional consultation sessions that was held in Nairobi, Kenya for the East African countries from 11 to 13 April, 2012. The workshop was attended by 55 participants, representing a broad range of stakeholder groups, which ensured the inclusiveness of the process and the engagement of key stakeholders with
varying interests and affiliations. Figure 1 shows the breakdown of the participating stakeholders per affiliation. The workshop also included three participants from Somaliland, and two participants from the newly African state, Southern Sudan. For the names and titles of attendees, please see the list of participants in Annex 1.

Figure 1: Stakeholder participation – East Africa Regional Consultation by sector

**African Development Bank Participants and Roles:**

- Anthony Nyong (Ph.D.), Division Manager, Quality Assurance and Results Department, ORQR (moderator/mission leader)
- Mbarack Diop (Ph.D.), Chief Safeguard Policy Officer (presenter/moderator)
- Annah Rutebuka, Principal Social Safeguards Officer (presenter)
- Eskender A. Zeleke, Senior Environmental Safeguard Officer, (presenter)
- Hela Selmi, Workshop Assistant (program coordinator)
II. WORKSHOP FORMAT

The consultation were co-chaired by the Mr. Gabriel Negatu, AfDB East Africa Resource Center (EARC) Director (please see Annex 2 for the full remark), Dr. Anthony Nyong, AfDB, Compliance and Safeguards Division Manager (ORQR.3) and on behalf of Mr. Ali D. Mohamed, the Minster of the Environment, Ms. Agnes C. Yobterik Director of Programs, Projects and Strategic Initiatives in the Ministry of Environment and Mineral Resources, Kenya who opened the meeting and expressed her delightment to be part of the great effort that AfDB was embarking on. The consultations were also opened to representatives of the government, civil society organizations, trade unions, academics regional institutions for applied research and private sector representatives. Please see Annex 3 for the full opening remark by Ms. Agnes C. Yobterik.

The consultation was structured as follows: (a) two opening plenary presentations on “Development of the Integrated Safeguards System” and on “Overview and Principles of Operational Safeguards”; (b) three breakout sessions to discuss and present the five OSs and to gain views of the participants on the questions outlined in the terms of reference for the breakout session. The reports of the breakout groups were discussed at the final plenary session please see the recommendations made by the groups in Annex 4. Please see the agenda in Annex 5.
III. KEY ISSUES/THEMES RAISED BY PARTICIPANTS:

- Safeguards are necessary for private and public projects but the focus must be on capacity building rather than on conditionality of loans. Capacities for environmental management should be assessed not only in the public but also in the private sector. The AfDB must actively participate in environmental monitoring and supervision during project implementation;
- The AfDB should always balance the short term and long term trade-offs between development and environmental sustainability.
- Assistance in lifting out of poverty millions of people living in Africa must continue being acknowledged as the core development challenge of the AfDB to which the new ISS should contribute to achieve. Environmental and social protection in the AfDB’s support to regional member countries (RMCs) should focus on promoting sustainable development;
- Institutional frameworks and governance in countries needs to be strengthened to underpin environmental sustainability;
- The AfDB should mobilize more financial resources for the environment and also increase access to funding for civil society organisations;
- The AfDB should find ways of using country systems and harmonize its safeguards polices with the RMCs environmental and social policies;
- There is need to align environmental safeguards with other safeguards being prepared by other Multilateral Development Banks (MDB) to ensure that they are consistent with other MDBs safeguards.
IV. CONSULTATION SESSIONS:

A. DAY ONE: SESSION 1: INTRODUCTION AND CLIMATE SETTING

An introduction of the participants by name and where they come from was conducted and all key people who would be contact/point persons during the three days were introduced. At the beginning of the session Dr. Mbarack Diop, AfDB, Chief Safeguard Policy Officer explained the three days consultative meeting with a review of the tentative agenda. All participants were encouraged to actively engage and participate to allow optimum achievement of the meeting’s intended purpose.

Welcome Remarks: In his opening and keynote address Mr. Gabriel Negatu, AfDB EARC Director was glad to welcome the participants to the consultations and highlighted the AfDB’s commitment to see to it that the set objectives and outcomes of the three day meeting were incorporated in the final ISS document as with the various meetings set for all other regions. He further emphasized that this is the “perfect time to engage with all stakeholders and let the word harmonization go out” as he called the various stakeholder groups to contribute ideas that will strengthen the applicability of the system to their own countries and communities.

The public debate as well as specialized sessions which have been facilitated by Dr. Anthony Nyong, AfDB, Compliance and Safeguards Division Manager embraced among other considerations the introduction of OSs in biodiversity and ecosystem services, principles for the improvement of labour conditions in AfDB funded projects as well as social considerations regarding the full integration of human rights principles, especially around issues related to involuntary resettlement and indigenous people.

B. DAY ONE: SESSION 2: DEVELOPMENT PROCESS OF ISS

The brief development process of the proposed OSs was presented by Dr. Mbarack Diop, AfDB, Chief Safeguard Policy Officer (please see for the full presentation in Annex 4). In his presentation he stressed that OSs are: …statements on what the Bank requires from borrowers
and clients with regards to environmental and social assessment of potential operations …’ they include:

- OS 1: Environmental Assessment – broad oversight;
- OS 2: Involuntary Resettlement: Land Acquisition, Population Displacement and Compensation;
- OS 3: Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services;
- OS 4: Pollution Prevention and Control, Green House Gases, Hazardous Materials, Waste and Resources Efficiency;
- OS 5: Labor Conditions, Health and Safety.

C. DAY TWO: SESSION 1: INTRODUCTION OF THE DAY’S AGENDA AND OPENING OF THE MEETING

Dr. Anthony Nyong, AfDB, Compliance and Safeguards Division Manager welcomed all participants to the day’s agenda. He went ahead to invite Ms. Agnes C Yobterik Director of Programs, Projects and Strategic Initiatives in the Ministry of Environment and Mineral Resources to officially open the meeting.

Ms. Agnes C Yobterik expressed her delightment to be part of the great effort that the AfDB was embarking on and apologized on behalf of the Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Environment and Mineral Resources Mr. Ali D. Mohamed, CBS, for not attending the previous day due to matters of national importance. She further explained that she would be making the statement by the Permanent Secretary on his behalf; please see the details of Ms. Agnes’s remark in Annex 3.
D. DAY TWO: SESSION 2: PRESENTATION OF OPERATIONAL SAFEGUARDS AND BREAKOUT SESSION:

Following the presentations made by the AfDB environmental and social safeguard specialist, three breakout sessions were organized based on the participant’s interest and experience. The participants spent the second half day evaluating each OS. The three sessions were:

**Group 1: Environmental Impact Assessment:** This session covered issues related to the requirements and management of the environmental assessment process by relating the ISS which will govern Bank interventions and country systems,

**Group 2: Social development issues** including resettlement, gender, labor standards, human rights, consultation and disclosure in terms of the adoption as mandatory of their principles and associated constraints and benefits with regard to the decision-making on appropriate and adequate level of due diligence for Bank-funded operations.

**Group 3: Environment and biodiversity issues** including critical habitats, mainstreaming of climate change into the ISS vs. adoption of a standalone safeguard on climate change.

E. DAY THREE: SESSION 1: PRESENTATIONS BY GROUP REPORTERS

The participants resumed at a plenary session to report on their findings, comments and recommendations they made on each OS. The detail comments and recommendations made on each OS are attached in Annex 4. Following the presentation by a reporter selected from each group a discussion on the various recommendations were held.

F. DAY THREE: CLOSING REMARKS

In his Closing Remarks, Dr. Nyong termed the entire three days as productive and praised the diligence with which participants contributed during the various sessions. He found it unfair to say that Africa did not have capacity yet the achievements of this consultation meeting
proved that the statement is wrong by how thoroughly participants had reviewed the ISS and the expertise everyone brought on board.

He was optimistic of the upcoming regional consultation meetings within Africa and hoped that all the detailed comments and material gathered shall be distributed amongst those participating in the spirit of full disclosure.

He however, explained that though inclusivity was vital, the document could not be perfect to allow everyone’s view be adopted lest it proves impossible to implement. Hence he expressed that the aim was to come up with a final document that was able to meet the needs of the people in question without necessarily being biased.

With this he thanked everyone again and welcomed all to take advantage of the pre-arranged game drive to the Nairobi National Park and further invited Michael Ouko of Day Mu Travel to hand out the itinerary for the drive.
V. NEXT STEPS

- The participants expressed appreciation to the Bank for involving them from the outset in the development of the new ISS;
- They looked forward to their continued involvement as the ISS is developed and implemented.
## ANNEX 1: LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>ORGANIZATION</th>
<th>CONTACT INFORMATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>Dr. Getachew Demeke</td>
<td>Center for Development Consulting</td>
<td><a href="mailto:getachew@cdchet.com">getachew@cdchet.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>Kibur Gehanna</td>
<td>PanAfrica Chamber of Commerce and Industry</td>
<td><a href="mailto:kghenna@yahoo.com">kghenna@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>Yonas T/Micael</td>
<td>Ethiopian Environmental Protection Agency</td>
<td><a href="mailto:yonastekelemichael4@gmail.com">yonastekelemichael4@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>Lamin Barrow</td>
<td>AfDB Ethiopian Filed Office</td>
<td><a href="mailto:1.barrow@afdb.org">1.barrow@afdb.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>Mr. Ali D. Mohammed CBS</td>
<td>Ministry of Environment and Mineral Resources</td>
<td><a href="mailto:psoffice@environment.go.ke">psoffice@environment.go.ke</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>Dr. Ayub Macharia</td>
<td>NEMA</td>
<td><a href="mailto:dgnema@nema.go.ke">dgnema@nema.go.ke</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>Mr. Niall O' Connor</td>
<td>WWF</td>
<td><a href="mailto:pkinanu@wwfesarpo.org">pkinanu@wwfesarpo.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>Mr. Ali Kaka</td>
<td>IUCN</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ali.kaka@iucn.org">ali.kaka@iucn.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>Mrs. Emma Greatrix</td>
<td>Wetland International</td>
<td><a href="mailto:egreatrix@wetlands-africa.org">egreatrix@wetlands-africa.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Djibuti</td>
<td>Abdoulkader Oudoum Abdallah</td>
<td>Ministère de l'Habitat, de l'Urbanisme, de l'Environnement et de l'Aménagement du Territoire</td>
<td><a href="mailto:gueddan@hotmail.com">gueddan@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Djibuti</td>
<td>Ali BARREH</td>
<td>Directeur de la société ECOVISION.Sar</td>
<td><a href="mailto:alibarre2@yahoo.fr">alibarre2@yahoo.fr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Position/Role</td>
<td>Email/Contact Information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Djibouti</td>
<td>Dr. Amar ABDO</td>
<td>ONG Djibouti Nature</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ammarmmed@yahoo.com">ammarmmed@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>Margaret Aanyu</td>
<td>NEMA</td>
<td><a href="mailto:info@nemaug.org">info@nemaug.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>Dr Charles Walaga</td>
<td>The Executive Director</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ccwalaga@yahoo.com">ccwalaga@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>Mr. Gideon Badagawa,</td>
<td>Executive Director Private Sector Foundation</td>
<td><a href="mailto:psfu@psfuganda.org.ug">psfu@psfuganda.org.ug</a>;<a href="mailto:gbadagawa@psfuganda.org.ug">gbadagawa@psfuganda.org.ug</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>Mr David Steven Mugabi,</td>
<td>DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL SUPPORT SERVICES</td>
<td><a href="mailto:mugabisd@gmail.com">mugabisd@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Rwanda</td>
<td>Kamarade N.A. Immy</td>
<td>Chamber of Women Entrepreneurs</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ccwalaga@yahoo.com">ccwalaga@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Comores</td>
<td>Fatima Madi Mlatamou</td>
<td>Directrice association AMIE</td>
<td><a href="mailto:mlatamou_fatima@yahoo.fr">mlatamou_fatima@yahoo.fr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>Dr Dereje Alemayehu</td>
<td>Christian Aid</td>
<td><a href="mailto:nairobi@christian-aid.org">nairobi@christian-aid.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Madagascar</td>
<td>Ms Fanjambola Yolande</td>
<td>Femmes de Madagascar</td>
<td><a href="mailto:camaralandy@yahoo.fr">camaralandy@yahoo.fr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Somaliland</td>
<td>Abdirahman Mohamoud Aideed</td>
<td>RDF (Research and Development Foundation)</td>
<td><a href="mailto:rdf.somaliland@gmail.com">rdf.somaliland@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Somaliland</td>
<td>Abdikarin Mohamoud Deria</td>
<td>Pastrolar Programme SOLPA</td>
<td><a href="mailto:abdikarinmderia@yahoo.com">abdikarinmderia@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Madagascar</td>
<td>Monsieur Hajavola</td>
<td>Representative from Madagascar Field Office</td>
<td><a href="mailto:h.rakotondrazaka@afdb.org">h.rakotondrazaka@afdb.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Position/Institution</td>
<td>Email</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Madagascar</td>
<td>Madame Josielle Onisoa RAFIDY, Directeur Général</td>
<td>Fédération des Chambres de Commerce et d’industrie de Madagascar</td>
<td><a href="mailto:dg.fcci@cci-madagascar.org">dg.fcci@cci-madagascar.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Madagascar</td>
<td>Monsieur Jean Roger RAKOTOARIJ AONA</td>
<td>Representative of Ministry of Environment</td>
<td><a href="mailto:jr.rakotoarijaona@gmail.com">jr.rakotoarijaona@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Sudan</td>
<td>Dr. Nouredin Abdalla</td>
<td>Sudanese Climate Change Network</td>
<td><a href="mailto:nour58@yahoo.com">nour58@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Sudan</td>
<td>Dr. Imad-eldin A. Ali Babiker</td>
<td>Ministry of Environment</td>
<td><a href="mailto:imadaa@gmail.com">imadaa@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Rwanda</td>
<td>Dr. Rose Mukankomeje</td>
<td>Rwanda Environmental Management Authority</td>
<td><a href="mailto:dgrema@gmail.com">dgrema@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>Mr. Estifanos Gebru</td>
<td>Ethiopian Electric Power Corporation</td>
<td><a href="mailto:estif_gebru@yahoo.com">estif_gebru@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Djibouti</td>
<td>Mr. Ismael Diallo Lamarala</td>
<td>Electricité de Djibouti (EDD)</td>
<td><a href="mailto:dialloedd@gmail.com">dialloedd@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Tunisia</td>
<td>Karim Trabelsi</td>
<td>Coordonnateur de la Coalition de la Société Civile sur la BAD</td>
<td><a href="mailto:krimtrabelsi@yahoo.fr">krimtrabelsi@yahoo.fr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Sudan</td>
<td>MENSAH, ANDOH OBED</td>
<td>AFDB</td>
<td><a href="mailto:a.mensah@afdb.org">a.mensah@afdb.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Rwanda</td>
<td>Mr. Hanington Namara</td>
<td>Rwanda Private Sector</td>
<td><a href="mailto:info@psf.org.rw">info@psf.org.rw</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Rwanda</td>
<td>Mr. NGENDAND UMWE Jean Claude</td>
<td>NGO Network</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ccoaib29@rwanda1.com">ccoaib29@rwanda1.com</a> and/or <a href="mailto:ngendandumwe08@yahoo.fr">ngendandumwe08@yahoo.fr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Rwanda</td>
<td>MAKONNEN Negatu</td>
<td>RWFO</td>
<td><a href="mailto:n.makonnen@afdb.org">n.makonnen@afdb.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Organization</td>
<td>Email</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Rwanda</td>
<td>Mrs. Mugwaneza Jacqueline</td>
<td>Rwanda Bankers Association</td>
<td><a href="mailto:jacky@rba.rw">jacky@rba.rw</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Sudan</td>
<td>Ms. Ilham Naseem Hammad</td>
<td>Sudanese Businessmen &amp; Employers Federation</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ilhamnaseem@yahoo.com">ilhamnaseem@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Sudan</td>
<td>Mr. Philip Ajack Boldit</td>
<td>Ministry of Finance and Macroeconomic planning Directorate</td>
<td><a href="mailto:philipboldit@yahoo.com">philipboldit@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>Sudan</td>
<td>Mr. Samuel Taban Yousief</td>
<td>Ministry of Electricity and Dams</td>
<td><a href="mailto:souziel@hotmail.com">souziel@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>Southern Sudan</td>
<td>Mr. Victor Wurda Lo Tombe</td>
<td>Ministry of Electricity and Dams</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ywurda@yahoo.com">ywurda@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>Tanzania</td>
<td>LIKORINGO/ELINASI MONGA</td>
<td>Tanzania Forest Conservation Group (TFCG)</td>
<td><a href="mailto:emonga@tfcg.or.tz">emonga@tfcg.or.tz</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>Milka Isinta</td>
<td>Kenyan Union of Domestic Workers</td>
<td><a href="mailto:misinta@yahoo.com">misinta@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>Sena Kanyinke</td>
<td>Indigenous Peoples of Africa Coordinating Committee (IPACC)</td>
<td><a href="mailto:kanyinke@yahoo.com">kanyinke@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>Maurice Odhiambo</td>
<td>Jamaa Resources Initiatives</td>
<td><a href="mailto:oumaodhiambo@gmail.com">oumaodhiambo@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>Tunisia</td>
<td>Eskender A. Zeleke</td>
<td>AFDB</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>Tunisia</td>
<td>Selmi Hélia</td>
<td>AFDB</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>Tunisia</td>
<td>Anthony Nyong</td>
<td>AFDB</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>Tunisia</td>
<td>Mbarack Diop</td>
<td>AFDB</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>Tunisia</td>
<td>RUTEBUKA, MUJA</td>
<td>AFDB</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANNAH</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>Klemm/Joshua</td>
<td>Organization: Bank Information Center (BIC)</td>
<td><a href="mailto:jklemm@bicusa.org">jklemm@bicusa.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ANNEX 2: WELCOME REMARKS BY AFDB EARC DIRECTOR

Welcome remarks to the Regional Consultations on the Integrated Safeguards System

AFRICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK GROUP

Welcome remarks to the Regional Consultations on the Integrated Safeguards System
Dear colleagues,
Distinguished participants,
Ladies and Gentlemen,

- The consultative workshop on the Bank’s Integrated Safeguards System (ISS) offers me a great opportunity to express you my appreciation and gratitude for accepting to participate in this consultation process.

- On the behalf of the Dr. Donald Kaberuka President of the African Development Bank, it is my pleasure to welcome you all in this beautiful city.

- This consultation on our Safeguards System is an opportunity for us to engage a real dialogue with so experienced and dedicated people as well as Bank staff on the design process of our Safeguards policies. This process involves together African countries, development organizations and experienced practitioners that have successfully applied environmental assessments into African sustainable development endeavors.

- The consultations are an important milestone toward the Paris Declaration and Accra Agenda on Aid Effectiveness. They are a concrete step that embodies the principles of harmonization and alignment on environmental, social and climate safeguard systems.

- The Integrated Safeguards System embodies improved operational safeguards and revamped environmental and social assessment procedures – in line with international best practices.

- The ultimate goal for the Bank is to strengthen environmental governance and institutions, help screen and green country and regional development strategies, and mainstream climate change, key social considerations for inclusive and sustainable development. In line with this goal, the Bank has committed to help its regional member countries to mainstream as biodiversity and ecosystem services into national and regional policies, programs and projects.

- Through an Integrated Safeguards System, we can empower national institutions to pave the way for stronger environmental governance.
But this is only possible with strong country public and private sectors and civil society stakeholders’ participation. This is particularly important as the Bank seeks to bring coherence between aid effectiveness and its corporate strategy.

- The African Development Bank remains committed to the climate change agenda for Africa. This comes as a complementary efforts to what has been achieved so far in terms of poverty alleviation and efforts to create conditions for Africa’s sustainable development. The environment is a global public good, therefore, developing countries must be supported to adequately address climate change challenges which constitute an additional burden on already degraded and resource depleted African environments.

- As you may know, Africa has the smallest carbon footprint in the world and is one of the most vulnerable continents. For most African countries, the overwhelming challenge of climate change is how to deal with the adverse impacts through adaptation while contributing to global efforts to reduce greenhouse gas emissions. AfDB endeavors to provide coherent support to member countries within the Integrated Safeguards System by linking environmental and social sustainability with efforts to deal with climate change in implementing adaptation and mitigation measures as well as securing adequate finance for Africa.

- Adverse impacts of climate change are already becoming visible – affecting major parts of the economies in African countries. They are pushing back efforts at development and meeting the MDGs. Yet, Africa has huge opportunities to invest in clean and green growth, sustainable development and adaptation to climate change.

- The AfDB is already playing its role as a catalyst for more funding for African countries in their endeavor to safeguard against climate change. AfDB is assisting African countries to prepare and implement programmes and projects that mainstream climate change and unleash the mitigation potential. It enhances African countries’ ownership of the resources and investments necessary to deal with climate change. Only further cooperation and leadership will enable us to make real contributions towards vibrant African economies and communities for generations to come.
AfDB as the leading development Bank for this continent requests your individual as well as collective engagement to secure the sustainable future of Africa. This can be achieved only if and when we make sure our common endeavors are economically viable, ecologically sound, and socially beneficial. This is the rationale for us to fully and transparently collaborate with countries as well as Civil Society and Private Sector to design world class safeguards that will lead us toward sustainable development.

I wish you full success in engaging in a transparent and inclusive debate in the forthcoming days and also a lot of joy and discovery in this marvelous city.
ANNEX 3: STATEMENT OF OFFICIAL OPENING OF MEETING BY DIRECTOR IN THE MINISTRY OF ENVIRONMENT AND MINERAL RESOURCES

STATEMENT BY THE PERMANENT SECRETARY, MINISTRY OF ENVIRONMENT AND MINERAL RESOURCES, Mr. ALI D. MOHAMED, CBS, DURING THE OCCASION OF REGIONAL CONSULTATION FOR EAST AFRICA ON BANKS INTEGRATED SAFEGUARDS SYSTEM, 12TH APRIL, 2012.

All protocols observed, the distinguished participants were welcomed to Nairobi and to the very important conservative workshop in order to discuss the integrated safeguards system (ISS) being developed by the African Development Bank, this was done on behalf of the government of Kenya.

It was noted that all present were aware that Kenya was endowed with a unique environment of diverse landscapes which were attractive, valuable and formed a resource base for their economic and social development. In addition, that the economies of the East African Community countries largely depended on environmental resources and undermining the importance of proper management of the environment was a precursor to social disintegration, economic collapse and ecological instability in the region. It was therefore their responsibility to ensure that environmental sustainability was made an Agenda of every planning procession in the region.

Also, In spite of the distinctive features, the environment was a natural resource capital that was the base of livelihoods and foundation contributing immensely to the National Economy. Unfortunately, the immense value was not being taken into account in the national planning which was a collective responsibility.

In addition, the environment was exceptionally cross cutting because it impacted on all other economic sectors including, Agriculture, Tourism, Energy, Livestock, Fisheries and Manufacturing. In this regard, it was imperative that this critical natural capital which leverages all drivers of the economic and social development should be mainstreamed in all sectors. It was incumbent upon all present to adopt approaches to embrace sustainable utilization to secure benefits for all generations, both present and future. The environment was under immense pressure despite its strategic role. It was therefore upon them to manage it sustainably for their benefit today and for the benefit of the generations to come.
It was agreed that Environmental degradation was one of the greatest threats facing the country today, and indeed the region. This was due to high completion for resources arising from demand by a rapidly increasing population, expansion of the economy and failure to observe the principles of sustainable utilization of resources. Other emerging Challenges included climate change and variability whose impact was already being experienced in terms of frequent intense floods and extended droughts. This had not only adversely affected key strategic drivers of the economy such as agriculture, water, health and energy sectors, but also posed a major challenge in Adaptation of strategies and setting intervention priorities. Unless most if not all challenges were addressed, it would be very difficult for everyone to realize the objectives and aspirations of Kenya’s Vision 2030 and the Millennium Development goals.

The mounting of the consultative workshop on integrated safeguards system had come at a time when they needed to reflect and interrogate the way they did business with their environment. Having been informed that the consultative workshop in Integrated Safeguard system was the first of its kind the speaker commended the bank for organizing the workshop. The forum provided an excellent opportunity to review the numerous safeguard policies, which at times has caused confusion and attendant delays in compliance by the borrowers and beneficiaries of donor support. I was therefore expected that having harmonized and integrated safeguards system would greatly enhance compliance and contribute to improved disbursements.

The speaker was aware that integrated Safeguards system (ISS) draws from the banks existing policies and are aimed at setting out the operational requirements which bank financed operations must comply. This would ensure that the environment was safeguarded whilst facilitating economic development and social wellbeing which were core pillars to achieving sustainable development. He noted that the (ISS) had very detailed operational Safeguards (Oss) which clearly established robust environmental and social requirements with which the bank expected the borrowers or clients to comply. Of interest to the ministry, were issues covered in the operational safeguards such as environmental and social assessments, involuntary resettlement: Land Acquisition, population displacement and compensation, biodiversity and Eco system services among others which were key to sustainable environment management.

He urged all who were present to look at the suggested operational Safeguards (Oss) to see ascertain relevance to the region and alignment to existing positions.
The initiative by ADB would help strengthen the activities being spearheaded by different actors; government, private sector and civil society organizations to mainstream environmental consideration in all developmental planning. In this regard, the ministry of Environment and Mineral Resources within that framework environmental law (EMCA 1999) had developed Environmental Impact assessment and Environment Audits regulations which required developers to comply with before commencement of any major program or projects. These regulations allowed identification of any negative environmental impacts and proposed mitigation measures to minimize any harm. The ministry was also in the process of finalizing the strategic environmental assessment (SEA) which would go a long way in assessing the impact of programmes and projects on the environment. These environmental regulations were not to be seen as anti-development or punitive, as was often the perception. In essence they provided for environmental safeguards from adverse effects of development.

The workshop provided a good opportunity for everyone to air their views on the safeguards and to improve the quality of the document and relevance of the Integrated Safeguards System. It was also an opportunity for stakeholders to understand and own the document for ease of implementation of the Integrated Safeguard systems (ISS) system in the region.

The speaker concluded by congratulating the African Development Bank Group for organizing the workshop. It was his hope that the process would mark the beginning of such forums for regular reviews of their procedures and guidelines with a view to harmonization with national provisions

Finally he wished their continued fruitful deliberations and thanked them. Upon completion of the speech reading Madam Agnes was invited to attend the following session as her contribution would highly appreciated.
ANNEX 4: GROUP PRESENTATIONS

Group 1: OS 1: Environmental and Social Assessment. This overarching OS governs the process of determining a project’s environmental and social category and the resulting Environmental and Social Assessment requirements. The requirements cover the scope of application, categorization, use of Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment (SESA) and Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) where appropriate, Environmental and Social Management Plans, climate-change vulnerability, public consultation, community impacts, treatment of vulnerable groups, including indigenous peoples, and grievance procedures. It consolidates the policy commitments set out in the Bank’s policy on the environment. It also updates the requirements to take advantage of best practice among the MDBs on a number of operational issues.

Review Comments on OS 1: Operational Safeguard on Environment and Social Assessment

Introductory Remark

✓ In view of realizing Bank operations in sustainable manner the efforts of the Quality Assurance and Results Department of the Bank in coming up with this Operational Safeguard as part and parcel of ISS

✓ Note has been made that the safeguard address scope, categorization, vulnerability, global issue of concerns such as climate change, transboundary impacts among others

1. Introductory Remark

a. During the discussion however, participants found that the document/procedure lacks to address some of the elements that need to be given due considerations. Some of the methodologies/requirements which would have importance to effectively implement OS are not addressed/omitted

b. In view of complementing and enhancing the quality, operational efficiency of the safeguard the following general and specific comments and/or suggestions are made
c. Due to time constraints the participants are unable to exhaustively scrutinize it. Thus it my great belief that the chairman will give some time air out their reflection and/or otherwise.

2. General Comments

a. Definitions of some terms such as environment, indigenous people, ESMF, Hazardous material, environment need to be made at the beginning of the report, i.e. in acronyms

b. Specific criteria which would be employed for setting place of Bank’s development endeavor in one of the specified category of the Bank

c. The general and specific objectives that are set in places are not addressed by taking into consideration of SMART, i.e. Specific, measurable, achievable, reliable and timely.

d. All other OSs lacks to address the above said objectives. In other OSs the description starts with aims rather than objectives. This makes it inconsistent.

General Comments

✓ In order to make the operational safeguard effective, the Bank is required to develop generic and specific methodologies/guidelines (application instruments) such as Cost Benefit Analysis, GIS, etc.

✓ The safeguard needs further editorial work

✓ In the safeguard policy statement/ or procedure inclusion of provision that state the importance of giving due consideration of both mitigation and adaptation measure

✓ The principle of synergizing and harmonizing EMSF by taking into consideration of countries experience is not set in place

Group 2: OS 2: Involuntary Resettlement: Land Acquisition, Population Displacement and Compensation. This OS consolidates the policy commitments and requirements set out in the Bank’s policy on involuntary resettlement and incorporates a number of refinements designed to improve their operational effectiveness. In particular, the OS embraces comprehensive and forward-looking notions of livelihood and assets, to account for their social and
cultural dimensions, as well as their economic ones. It also adopts a progressive understanding of community and common property that emphasizes the crucial need to maintain social cohesion, community structures and the social inter-linkages that common property provides. The OS highlights the fundamentals of the Bank’s existing involuntary resettlement policy, namely the need to provide compensation at full replacement cost; the importance of achieving resettlement that improves standards of living, income-earning capacity, and overall means of livelihood; and the need to ensure that potential aspects of social considerations, such as gender and age, do not disadvantage particular project-affected people.


OS 3: Operational Safeguard on Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services

Recognized:

✓ The effort of AFDB to have a sustainable development with preservation habitats and biodiversity

✓ The critical area of intervention on biodiversity

✓ Our big natural resources is the biodiversity

✓ The vulnerability of developing countries in front of the investments

The weakness points are following as:

✓ Not sufficient infrastructures for economic and ecology evaluating the biodiversity (what is the value?)

✓ The biodiversity aspect is adjusted and not included in decision-making

✓ Don’t consider the impact of project on Human and Animal regarding diseases and biodiversity

✓ The monitoring of biodiversity is not included in project management

✓ This OS should also align with Nairobi Convention on Marine Ecosystem

✓ The experiences of different countries in pollution Prevention and control
They recommended that:

✓ **The bank should** support the National governments with Capacity building on biodiversity assessments so as to ensure quality and meaningful assessments

✓ To Set up an surveillance system (including human and animal) in each project as part of monitoring/evaluation

✓ To include the environment component at conception stage for helping the decision-makers to find out an alternative solution in case that the biodiversity has not been respected.

✓ To have a baseline on animal and human existing diseases before project begins

✓ This OS should also align with Nairobi Convention on Marine Ecosystem

**OS 4: Operational Safeguard on Pollution Prevention and Control, Greenhouse Gases,**

They recognize that:

✓ The bank is interested in big polluting industries (extraction industry for gas; oil and mining; large infrastructure projects; projects that have an impact on the environment and on communities such as projects that use agrochemicals)

✓ The issue of pollution prevention and Control need to be more effective

✓ Several countries haven’t yet identified the GHG and have limited capacity of measuring them

✓ The weakness in Emergency preparedness and response (Government & private)

**We recommend**

✓ The Bank need to be a true African Bank by pioneering best practices in Africa: for example for extractive industries (mainly oil and gas) the Bank should demand best technology available in the industry to be considered by borrowers
To develop a Partnership Public Private for setting up a mechanism for pollution preventing and controlled risks to human health and the environment.

All projects should comply with the multilateral environmental agreement.

More details required in clarifying some topics such as the scope of emergency preparedness.

It also be useful for the bank to consider cradle to grave accounting (i.e. full project cycle) by assessing project impacts at different stages.

A more robust and meaningful consultation would greatly enhance the effectiveness of these safeguard.
ANNEX 5: AGENDA OF REGIONAL CONSULTATIONS ON INTEGRATED SAFEGUARDS SYSTEM

DAY 1: PLENARY SESSION ON INTEGRATED SAFEGUARDS SYSTEM

09.00 – 10.00  Registration of participants / Coffee offered
10.00 to 10.15 Welcome remarks by Regional Director
10.15 to 10.30 Opening by Government Official from Host Country
10.30 to 11.00 Coffee Break and Group photo
11.00 to 11.30 Presentation: Development of the Integrated Safeguards System
11.30 to 12.30 Discussion
12.30 to 14.30 Lunch Break
14.30 to 15.00 Presentation: Overview and Principles of Operational Safeguards
15.00 to 16.00 Discussion
16.00 to 16.30 Coffee Break
16.30 to 17.30 Wrap up of Day 1 and planning of Day 2 Group sessions

DAY 2: GROUP SESSIONS ON THE 5 (FIVE) OPERATIONAL SAFEGUARDS

09.00 to 09.30  Warm up and orientation/ Coffee offered
09.30 to 10.15 Presentation of Operational Safeguards (3 parallel sessions)
  • Group 1: OS1: Environmental and Social Assessment
  • Group 2: OS2: Involuntary Resettlement, OS5: Labor Conditions, Health and Safety
  • Group 3: OS3: Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services, and OS4: Pollution Prevention and Control
10.15 to 12.30 Group discussions and comments on Operational Safeguards
12.30 to 14.30 Lunch Break
14.30 to 14.45 Group Report 1 on OS1: Environmental and Social Assessment
14.45 to 16.00 Discussion
16.00 to 16.15 Coffee Break
16.15 to 16.30 Group Report 3 on OS3: Biodiversity and OS4: Pollution Prevention and Control
16.30 to 17.30 Discussion

DAY 3: GROUP SESSIONS CONTINUED AND PLENARY CLOSING CEREMONY
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>09.00 – 09.15</td>
<td>Group Report 2 on OS 2: Involuntary Resettlement and OS5: Labor conditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09.15 to 10.30</td>
<td>Discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.30 to 11.00</td>
<td><strong>Coffee Break</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.00 to 11.30</td>
<td>Closing ceremony</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.30 to 12.00</td>
<td>Press briefing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.00 to 14.00</td>
<td><strong>Lunch Break</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.00 to 18.00</td>
<td>Guided Tour of Host City</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>