CONTENTS

List of Acronyms .................................................................................................................. 1

I. Introduction ........................................................................................................................ 2

II. The Consultation Process .................................................................................................. 4
   A. Plenary session .................................................................................................................. 4
   B. Breakout Sessions ......................................................................................................... 7

III. Key Recommendations .................................................................................................... 9
   A. OS 1: Environmental and Social Assessment ................................................................. 9
   B. OS2: Involuntary Resettlement, Land Acquisition, Displacement and Compensation ...... 9
   C. OS3: Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services ..................................................................... 10
   D. OS4: Pollution Prevention and Control, GHG, Hazardous Materials and Resource Efficiency ............................................................................................................................... 10
   E. OS5: Labor Conditions, Health and Safety ..................................................................... 10

IV. Conclusion ........................................................................................................................ 11

Annex 1: List of Participants ................................................................................................. 12
Annex 2: Group 1: Environmental and Social Assessment ..................................................... 14
Annex 3: Group 2: Involuntary Resettlement, Labour conditions, Health and Safety ............ 17
Annex 4: Group 3: Biodiversity, Ecosystem Services; Pollution prevention and control, GHG emissions and Resources Efficiency ........................................................................................................ 19
Annex 5: Closing Remarks .................................................................................................... 20
## LIST OF ACRONYMS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ADF</td>
<td>African Development Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AfDB</td>
<td>African Development Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSO</td>
<td>Civil Society Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESAP</td>
<td>Environmental and Social Assessment Procedures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESIA</td>
<td>Environmental and Impact Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESMF</td>
<td>Environmental and Social Management Framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESMP</td>
<td>Environmental and Social Management Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESMS</td>
<td>Environmental and Social Management System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GCI</td>
<td>General Capital Increase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GHG</td>
<td>Greenhouse Gas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISS</td>
<td>Integrated Safeguards System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OS</td>
<td>Operational Safeguards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAP</td>
<td>Resettlement Action Plans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RMC</td>
<td>Regional Member Country</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SESA</td>
<td>Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I. INTRODUCTION

During the 12th replenishment of the African Development Fund (ADF XII) and the General Capital Increase (GCI) processes in 2010, and at the request of shareholders, the African Development Bank (AfDB) committed itself to the revision and upgrading of its environmental and social safeguards system and procedures by preparing and adopting an Integrated Safeguards System (ISS) and by promoting the mainstreaming of climate change considerations into its safeguards’ review and compliance process.

The African Development Bank (AfDB) has embarked on a three day consultative forum including civil society organizations, private sector representatives and government in the West Africa Region, on its Integrated Safeguards System (ISS).

The objective of the consultation was to allow key stakeholders to seize the opportunities available for engagement in the design of the AfDB’s ISS and for expression of their views and comments. It was also aimed at consulting with experienced professionals working on environmental and social safeguard issues and to agree on the best way forward in the design of the ISS.

The ultimate aim is to help clients understand the AfDB’s lending principles as well as guidelines for project planning, management, execution, supervision and evaluation.

The regional consultation for the West Africa region that was held between 15 and 17 May 2012 in Abuja, Nigeria commenced with the opening address delivered by Dr. Jare Adejuwon of the Department of Climate Change, Federal Ministry of Environment, Nigeria. He welcomed all participants and thanked the AfDB for organising the event, acknowledging the importance of the meeting as it also seeks to address climate change challenges within the West Africa region. He expressed confidence that at the end of the forum, stakeholders would come up with resolutions that will enable both parties to carry out their duties with regards to the ISS and its related Operational Safeguards (OSs).

Resident Representative of AfDB in Nigeria, Mr. Ousmane Dore on behalf of the President Dr. Donald Kaberuka, welcomed all participants to the three day consultative workshop for West Africa on the ISS. In his welcome address, Mr. Dore spoke on the purpose of the consultative forum in highlighting the three (3) key objectives of the workshop which are, i)
Improving the overall quality and relevance of the proposed ISS, ii) Promoting a shared understanding of safeguard objectives, principles and requirements, and, iii) guiding the formulation of the safeguard policy statement. In addition, he expressed the Bank’s commitment to supporting developmental projects in the continent while addressing climate change.

II. THE CONSULTATION PROCESS

The consultation was held in plenary and group sessions. The list of participants who attended that Regional consultation can be found in Annex 1, and the participation by sector is shown in Figure 1 below.

![Stakeholder participation](image)

Figure 1: Stakeholder participation – West Africa Regional Consultation by sector

A. PLENARY SESSION

In the first plenary session, two presentations were made by the Bank’s Safeguards specialists

**Principles guiding the design of the ISS**

The first presentation made by Dr. Mbarack Diop focused on the principles guiding the design of the ISS. In his presentation, Dr. Diop extensively explained that the need for an ISS arose due to a “lack of clear integrated operational, environmental and social requirements easily understood” by stakeholders. Hence, he highlighted the following areas of interest which were expected to be tackled by the meeting:

- The need for development effectiveness as requested by the Paris Declaration;
- The need to consolidate the Bank’s existing safeguards polices;
- The need to counter the effect of multiplicity of policies;
- Mainstreaming of climate change considerations;
- Lessons learnt from current Environmental and Social Assessment Procedures (ESAP), and international best practices;
He further reiterated that the objective of the ISS policy is to draft relevant Bank Policy commitments, requirements, procedures, and guidance into one integrated system. This would provide clarity to borrowers and clients on practical procedures.

The presentation was followed by a plenary discussion that raised the following questions of concern:

- The design of the ISS should base on Africa’s realities marked by the dependence of national economies on exports;
- With regards to climate change, the ISS should deal both with climate vulnerability and Greenhouse Gas (GHG) mitigation, it is important to note that while GHG mitigation is important for the international community, climate vulnerability and adaptation need to be given high priority in the ISS. Having a dedicated OS on climate change was seen as an option;
- Education and skills development are important issues that also need to be considered in the ISS;
- Issues related to the management of international waters should also be considered;
- The issues of involuntary resettlement can be sorted out, taking into account the fact that in Africa, governments own lands;
- Issues related to corruption are yet to be considered in the ISS design;
- The need for the Bank to make sure that the gender barrier does not prevail in cases where landed properties are owned by men and where cultural (patriarchal) laws are powerful;
- The need to build on best practices developed in Civil Society Organisations (CSOs) in Africa, for instance the social audits done by CSOs in many African countries, including Mali, Ghana, and Senegal;
- The importance of ISS alignment with country systems, as there are many best practices in the Regional Member Countries (RMCs), for instance the creation of a national account to coordinate environmental and social studies in Mali. Also, the ISS is an opportunity to strengthen the national environment agencies which are very weak in Africa;
- The importance of compensation in the involuntary resettlement process, especially the need to better define who pays for compensation, and to better communicate with the people affected by the Bank-financed operations;
• Given the importance of public consultation for the ownership and success of projects by communities, this issue has to be given high priority; this also includes the full disclosure of information. One option would be to dedicate an OS on public consultation;
• Implementation, Monitoring and Supervision are key elements for a successful ISS.

**Principles and requirements for the Operational Safeguards**

The second presentation made by Mr. Al Hamdou Dorsouma was on the principles and operational requirements for the selected five (5) Operational Safeguards. The 5 OSs are elaborated in Box 1 below.

**Box 1: Operational Safeguards**

| OS1: Environmental Assessment | This Operational Safeguards provides a broad oversight that frames the environmental and social assessment processes, including the refinement of the categorization requirements and process; the importance of Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment (SESA); Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA); the Environmental and Social Management Plan (ESMP); the Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF); the Environmental and Social Management System (ESMS). This OS 1 also addresses the issues of climate vulnerability, public consultation; definition of project’s area of influence, etc. This OS 1 was seen as a good entry point for the ISS, as it paved the way for the other OS. |
| OS2: Involuntary Resettlement, Land Acquisition | This operational safeguard takes into account: the social, cultural and economic dimensions of livelihoods and assets; crucial need to maintain social cohesion, community structures and social linkages through common property; compensation on full replacement cost/not market values; improvement of standards of living over involuntary; and other social considerations like gender, age, religion, sexual orientation do not disadvantage particular project affected people. This OS was described as very detailed and comprehensive enough to address the difficult issues related to resettlement and land in the African context characterized by the ownership of lands by states and the lack of legal status in many cases. The quality of resettlement is key to the success of Bank-financed projects. |
| OS3: Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services | This operational safeguard refers to the principles and objectives of the United Nations Convention on Biological Diversity (UNCBD) and focuses on the issues of modified, natural and critical habitats, on the requirements to address impacts on ecosystem services; and the importance of applying the Mitigation Hierarchy (Avoid, Minimize, Reduce, Restore, Offset and Compensate). The OS is very relevant, given that most of Africa’s socioeconomic development is based on the use of natural capital, including biodiversity and ecosystem services. |
| OS4: Pollution Prevention and Control, Green House Gases, Hazardous Materials, Waste and Resources Efficiency | This operational safeguards refers to the World Bank Group Environment, Health and Safety Guidelines, and it addresses the need for inclusion of waste, hazardous materials, resources efficiency, the application of the related international conventions; the importance of GHG emissions while ensuring developmental effectiveness. While important, it has been suggested that this OS will not only depend on World Bank’s standards. Instead, the Bank and RMCs should synchronise these standards with other standards, including their own standards, bearing in mind that Africa should develop using available energy sources and available and affordable technologies. |
| OS5: Labor Conditions, Health and Safety | This Operational Safeguard adopts the Standards of the International Labor Organisation (ILO) which include workers conditions; rights and protection against abuse or exploitation; the importance of Workers organizations; the need to avoid child or force labor; and the requirements for occupational health and safety. This OS was seen to be the thorough one, as it deals with very sensitive issues. |
After the second presentation, several observations were made on:

- While all of these 5 OSs are relevant for Africa, the cost implications of their implementation are to be well considered as well as the need to reduce the transaction costs of ISS requirements. In order to facilitate the conduct of environmental and social studies, the Bank’s Project Preparation Facility needs to be reinforced and made widely known and available;
- To ensure implementation of the ISS and the OSs, it is important to provide some incentives and penalties to encourage and enforce borrowers and contractors to apply them; for instance the implementation of ESMPs should be part of bidding documents by contractors;
- Amenities such as markets and schools should be provided in locations people are resettled in;
- The Bank must consider quality and capacity in project execution;
- The need to consider the cost of environmental and social safeguards, as environmental projects are expensive and capital intensive;
- To ensure quality of environmental and social studies, it is important to make sure that qualified consultants are recruited to execute jobs; responsibility has to be shared between the clients and the Bank;
- The need to better consider and manage risks, particularly environmental and climate risks;
- While issues like gender, religion and others are relevant in a project, it is always necessary to bear in mind that this is all about development and not humanitarian assistance;
- Emerging issues in Africa such as the use of Genetical Modified Organisms and biofuels need to be considered;
- The AfDB is to be commended for conducting studies. However, the Bank must insist on compliance, because most of the time, contractors do not comply once they are on site.

B. BREAKOUT SESSIONS

After the plenary session discussions, participants were organized into three (3) groups to have indepth discussions on the five (5) Operational Safeguards presented above. Issues that were discusses during the group discussions and recommendations given thereafter are found in Annex 2, 3 and 4 of this report. Each group was asked to come up with recommendations and findings based on their discussions.
Group one (1) looked into the OS1 on Environmental and Social Assessment, while Group two (2) went through the OS2 on Involuntary Resettlement, as well as OS5 on Labor Conditions, Health and Safety.

Group three (3) worked on OS3 on Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services, and on OS 4 related to Pollution Prevention and Control, Greenhouse Gas Emissions and Resource Efficiency.

The outcomes from the 3 breakout sessions are summarized as key recommendations as below. Detailed group reports are attached in annex.
Regional Consultation on the Bank’s Integrated Safeguards System – West Africa

III. KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

After the presentation the floor was open for discussion, and participants responded with various views and recommendations on the Bank’s operational system. The comments and views on each of the five (5) Operational Safeguards are presented below:

A. OS 1: ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL ASSESSMENT

- There is a need to have under OS 1, a full section on Implementation and Monitoring as these are key for the success of the ISS and the other Operational Safeguards. There is also a need to make financial resources available for technical teams in charge of the Implementation, monitoring and evaluation of environmental programs;
- It is very important in this OS to specify to what extent and to what kind of Bank’s operations the different types of environmental and social assessments will be required. Therefore, the technical guidelines that are meant to be developed have to deal with this level of detail;
- There should be detailed description of projects with baseline information on prevailing environmental and social conditions as it affects the people and their environment;
- There is a need to take into consideration all aspects of environmental flows, including issues such as water, wind, sedimentary flows etc.

B. OS2: INVOLUNTARY RESSETTLEMENT, LAND ACQUISITION, DISPLACEMENT AND COMPENSATION

- The Bank needs to clearly specify the compensation benefit of tenants occupying project affected properties that they do not own;
- Information regarding resettlement should be made available to project affected persons in an appropriate manner such as through community leaders;
- To avoid delays in project implementation, the Bank should ensure that the borrower fully implements the Resettlement Plan before the commencement of projects. A better treatment of the OS 2 with appropriate mechanisms in place will also make sure project beneficiaries and local communities cannot suffer from Bank-financed projects;
- Though resettlement issues are often treated under RMCs’ regulations, the Bank has an important role to play. The design of ISS offers an opportunity for Bank’s full involvement
in resettlement, in putting in place appropriate mechanisms and dedicated staff to ensure implementation, as these issues delay project implementation. The implementation of the Resettlement Action Plans (RAPs) should fully involve local communities.

**C. OS3: BIODIVERSITY AND ECOSYSTEM SERVICES**

- The need to cover marine biodiversity and coastal erosion are relevant to this Operational Safeguard and should be clearly stated in the documentation;
- With regards to invasion of alien species, adequate measures should be put in place to tackle such challenges;
- Consideration of biodiversity issues in natural forest management and plantation development is very crucial for safeguards;
- Deforestation and land degradation as well as natural resources management are critical issues that need to be included in this OS.

**D. OS4: POLLUTION PREVENTION AND CONTROL, GHG, HAZARDOUS MATERIALS AND RESOURCE EFFICIENCY**

- Trans-boundary consideration of pollution is vital, especially the need for pollution prevention policies for coastal areas, water and surface water;
- The need for institutional support in African countries to address these issues;
- The monitoring of these issues will need to include a variety of stakeholders, including governments, CSOs and private companies;
- Transparency, political stability and consistency are important for good project implementation and resolution of pollution damages.

**E. OS5: LABOR CONDITIONS, HEALTH AND SAFETY**

- All Companies involved in project implementation should respect host country regulations;
- Regarding health and safety provisions, the Bank should include penalties for non-compliance;
- The Bank should ensure that both local and foreign workers are treated equally;
- The need to provide, where appropriate, external medical care for local workers severely injured when working for a Bank-financed project.
IV. CONCLUSION

After the three day consultation, the participants made recommendations on how to improve the ISS design process, by expressing their concerns about critical issues to be further considered in the ISS and its related OSs. The participants to this regional consultation in West Africa applauded the Bank for organising the event and for transparently proposing such a clear and focused document for their consideration, in a transparent manner.

A joint group of CSOs, private sector and government representatives expressed their gratitude to the African Development Bank for the Regional Consultative Forum, praying that the views and contributions generated from the meeting would be put to proper use by the Bank, and further expressed the desire to see this happen as often as events change in the sub-region.

Dr. Mbarack Diop, Chief Safeguard Policy Officer, on the behalf of the AfDB thanked all participants, expressing his sincere gratitude to the Abuja field office for making the event a successful one.

Dr. Jare Adejuwon, on the behalf of the Federal Government of Nigeria, thanked the African Development Bank for the three day consultation (closing remarks are in Annex 5 of this report). He reiterated that the government of Nigeria recognizes that a failure to mainstream climate change into development planning will pose great challenges towards attaining her MDG targets. He urged African countries to promote a socio economically compliant “green economy”.

This consultative workshop shows the relevance of applying a holistic approach that helps foster sustainable development in Africa where the need for environmental and social protection is indissociable from achieving sustainable development goals.
### ANNEX 1: LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Names</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Contact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Eugene H. Shannon</td>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Eugene2006shannon@yahoo.com">Eugene2006shannon@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hon. David Wiles</td>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td><a href="mailto:davidlwiles@yahoo.com">davidlwiles@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hon. Emmanuel W. Bropleh</td>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Emmanbropleh2005@yahoo.com">Emmanbropleh2005@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Ambrose Wureh</td>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td><a href="mailto:acwureh@yahoo.com">acwureh@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Boubacar DIAKITE</td>
<td>Mali</td>
<td><a href="mailto:diakebouca@gmail.com">diakebouca@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Diakite Kaba</td>
<td>Mali</td>
<td><a href="mailto:mkdadescom@yahoo.fr">mkdadescom@yahoo.fr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs. Bagakoyo Traore Aminata</td>
<td>Mali</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Traore2000@.fr">Traore2000@.fr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Raoufou M. Badarou</td>
<td>Benin</td>
<td><a href="mailto:badaraouf@yahoo.fr">badaraouf@yahoo.fr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M. Pierre d’ Alcantara Zocli</td>
<td>Benin</td>
<td><a href="mailto:pzaocli@fa-afrique.org">pzaocli@fa-afrique.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M. Sagbo Josea</td>
<td>Benin</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ntongmu@yahoo.com">ntongmu@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Chabi Seke Morakpai</td>
<td>Benin</td>
<td><a href="mailto:mchabiseke@yahoo.fr">mchabiseke@yahoo.fr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Thimothee Dabire</td>
<td>Burkina Faso</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Thimothee.dabire@cci.bf">Thimothee.dabire@cci.bf</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Desire Ouedrago</td>
<td>Burkina Faso</td>
<td><a href="mailto:desireouedraogo@yahoo.fr">desireouedraogo@yahoo.fr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Charles Dalla</td>
<td>Burkina Faso</td>
<td><a href="mailto:alladch@yahoo.fr">alladch@yahoo.fr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Isaac Yabre</td>
<td>Burkina Faso</td>
<td><a href="mailto:yabrosis@gmail.com">yabrosis@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs. Braganca Costa Kassi</td>
<td>Sao Tome and Principe</td>
<td><a href="mailto:karisscosta@hotmail.com">karisscosta@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Elba Do Esprito Santo Eduardo</td>
<td>Sao Tome and Principe</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Eduardoelba93@hotmail.com">Eduardoelba93@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Do Santos Pereira Emidio</td>
<td>Sao Tome and Principe</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Emidio-p@hotmail.com">Emidio-p@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Fredua Agyman</td>
<td>Ghana</td>
<td><a href="mailto:freduaagyeman@hotmail.com">freduaagyeman@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Dennis Nchor</td>
<td>Ghana</td>
<td><a href="mailto:dennisnchor@yahoo.com">dennisnchor@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Joe Asamoh</td>
<td>Ghana</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Joe.smh@gmail.com">Joe.smh@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Abochie Delali</td>
<td>Ghana</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Delali23@ymail.com">Delali23@ymail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Sada Kne</td>
<td>Senegal</td>
<td><a href="mailto:saakane@yahoo.fr">saakane@yahoo.fr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Boubacar Seck</td>
<td>Senegal</td>
<td><a href="mailto:congad@orange.sn">congad@orange.sn</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Moctar Diaw</td>
<td>Senegal</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Moctar_diaw@yahoo.fr">Moctar_diaw@yahoo.fr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs. Lucy Tonya Essa</td>
<td>Sierra Leone</td>
<td><a href="mailto:lucyessa@yahoo.com">lucyessa@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. David J Allieu</td>
<td>Sierra Leone</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Davidj.allieu@yahoo.com">Davidj.allieu@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Andrew Turay</td>
<td>Sierra Leone</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Andrew.turay@addaxbioenergy.com">Andrew.turay@addaxbioenergy.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Email</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Ousan M.S. Yabo</td>
<td>Gambia</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Yabo1948@yahoo.com">Yabo1948@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Omar Jobe</td>
<td>Gambia</td>
<td><a href="mailto:omarjobe@yahoo.fr">omarjobe@yahoo.fr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Bulli Dibba</td>
<td>Gambia</td>
<td><a href="mailto:bondibba@gmail.com">bondibba@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Muhammed Jagana</td>
<td>Gambia</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Djiwa Mohamed</td>
<td>Togo</td>
<td><a href="mailto:oyedjiwa@hotmail.fr">oyedjiwa@hotmail.fr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Gouthon Enselme</td>
<td>Togo</td>
<td><a href="mailto:gensemle@yahoo.fr">gensemle@yahoo.fr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Adessou Sena</td>
<td>Togo</td>
<td><a href="mailto:adessousena@yahoo.fr">adessousena@yahoo.fr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. P.C. Njoku</td>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Njjokupci@yahoo.co.uk">Njjokupci@yahoo.co.uk</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Sani Y. Bello</td>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td><a href="mailto:byankuzo@yahoo.com">byankuzo@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Bokar Toure</td>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td><a href="mailto:b.o.toure@afdb.org">b.o.toure@afdb.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Itua Eugene Otaigbe</td>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td><a href="mailto:eugeneitua@yahoo.com">eugeneitua@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Jare Adejuwon</td>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Jareadejuwon@yahoo.com">Jareadejuwon@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. I. Tolami</td>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td><a href="mailto:tolami234@yahoo.com">tolami234@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Ogbata Oluchi</td>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Ogboluchi@yahoo.com">Ogboluchi@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Cisse Mareclin</td>
<td>Cote d'Ivoire</td>
<td><a href="mailto:zmarcelin@hotmail.com">zmarcelin@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Loukou Koffi Julas</td>
<td>Cote d'Ivoire</td>
<td><a href="mailto:readeco@yahoo.fr">readeco@yahoo.fr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Ladouyou Siabahi Edouard</td>
<td>Cote d'Ivoire</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ladouyou@cgeci.org">ladouyou@cgeci.org</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ANNEX 1: GROUP 1: ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL ASSESSMENT

Terms of reference

- Guide the formulation of the Operational Safeguard;
- Review and enhance objectives, principles and requirements;
- Improve the overall quality and relevance.

Adoption of the methodological approach

- Election of the Chairman: **M. Ouedraogo Désiré** from Burkina Faso and two rapporteurs **M. Marcelin Cisse** from Côte d'Ivoire and **M. Moctar Diaw** from Senegal;
- Brainstorming on the comprehension of the TORs;
- Review the objectives if needed;
- Chapter by chapter in other words topics by topics.

OS 1. Operational Safeguard on Environmental and Social Assessments

OS1. Sauvegardes opérationnelles relatives aux évaluations environnementales et sociales

Define what is meant by environmental and social assessment (Definition worldwide accepted)

Introduction and general objectives (remove the brackets in the French version)

Specific objectives

- **Etat des lieux/Situation analysis** (Project description, Baseline informations details prevailing on environmental and Social conditions)
- **Evaluation des impacts/Impact Assessment**
- **Mesures d’atténuation/mitigation measures**
- **Information et Participation du Public/Information and Public participation**
- **Identification des risques/Risks identification/analysis**
- **Gestion des risques/Environmental and Social Risks management**
- **Renforcement des capacités/ Capacity building**
- **Monitoring and Evaluation**

Scope of application (accepted as it is)

Environmental and Social Assessment

- Insert a point taking into account the national legislations and procedures regarding environmental and social assessment processes
Regional Consultation on the Bank’s Integrated Safeguards System – West Africa

- Paragraph 6: In the French version la Banque "requiert" instead of "exige"
- Paragraph 7: In the French version, there is a need to replace “dépistage” by “analyse préliminaire” as elsewhere in the French version (paragraph 15)
- Paragraph 10: enhance positive impact of optimal alternative instead of enhance positive impact
- Insert a Paragraph on "Implementation monitoring and evaluation of environmental management programmes at various stages of the projects" or "Programme de suivi et surveillance environnemental". Dans ce cadre, il serait souhaitable d’insérer un point sur les mécanismes de mise à disposition des ressources financières à l’équipe chargé du suivi (in addition, there is a need to insert mechanisms with a view to making the financial resources available for technical teams in charge of the Implementation, monitoring and evaluation of environmental programmes)
- Taking into account the practicability of subsidiary principles (Principe de subsidiarité) in case of lack of national legislations

Project Screening and Categorization

- Paragraph 15 : Incidence is preferred to risque in the french version. The sentence will then be "il y aura une incidence environnementale et sociale considerable"
- Category 1: Last sentence, French version: l’EIES devra comprendre l’évaluation sociale nécessaire à la préparation du PAR INTEGRAL (enlever « pourrait être limité»
- Category 3 : (accepted as it is)
- Category 4 : (accepted as it is)

Scope of environmental and social assessment

- Paragraph 21: replace “dépistage” by “analyse préliminaire” in the French version
- Paragraphs 21 and 22 should be merged and captured under the Scope of Application

Environmental flows (Water, Wind, Sedimentary flows, etc)

- This paragraph doesn't take into consideration all aspects of environmental flows (water should just be an example)

Patrimoine culturel

- In the French version, "Faire mention de la consultation publique ou participative au lieu de divuligation"  I need English version here pls.

Impact on communities

- Remplacer les mots ‘divulguer ou divulgation par “diffuser ou diffusion” dans la version Française
Additionnel Recommandations

1. Trans-boundary consideration of biodiversity and pollution issues is vital to coastal areas.
2. Catastrophic and disasters issues related to Pollution of storage water
3. Pollution prevention policies for water and surface water
4. Management of pollution in coastal areas cross border project
5. Watershed management and protection in biodiversity issues.
6. The Bank needs to add other beneficiaries in addition to borrowers and clients.
7. Capacity building for all stakeholders, private, public, NGO's/CSO etc. All stakeholders should be strengthened to enable continuity and sustainability.
8. The need for conformity with national legislations or convention signed by countries. Speaking on the rules that are on paper, and not on ground, the group urges the Bank to ensure that rules are not just on paper but followed up as expected. There is need for the Bank to lay emphasis on the issue of transparency. It should be clearly stated in the document to give credence to the process.
ANNEX 2: GROUP 2: INVOLUNTARY RESETTLEMENT, LABOUR CONDITIONS, HEALTH AND SAFETY

Chairman: Dr. Andrew Turay
Rappatuer; Ernest Adikwu & Ladouyou Sibahi Edouard
Group : 11 members

Preamble

• Group two congratulates the AfDB in its efforts to provide guidelines for the preparation of an integrated safeguard system for the implementation of projects in the sub region.

• We also thank them for such a consultative meeting held with different stakeholders that play key roles in project implementation. We hope that this engagement will continue in the future.

• In principle, we agree with most of what has been highlighted in the guidelines but we admonish the Bank to continue to review these guidelines as situations change in the Region.

• The Group has the following recommendations and observations:

• OS-2: we recommend that the formatting of the introduction be changed as follows:
  
  • 1. The specific objectives are to be numbered;
  
  • 2. The Bank should fully explain the terms: Physical and economic displacement in detail in the document rather than in footnote.

• We recommend that the second paragraph under this heading be placed under Consultation and Participation

Project Design:

Compensation procedure

• *The Bank needs to clearly specify the compensation benefit of tenants occupying project affected properties that are not owned by them.*
• **Recommendation**

• *The bank should ensure that Affected persons are given ample time for relocation after compensation.*

• To avoid delays in project implementations, the Bank should ensure that the borrower fully implements the Resettlement Plan before the commencement of projects.

• *In the situation where a local worker is severely injured and needs external medical attention, the group recommends that the project should be able to provide such care.*

• *The Bank should find a way of ensuring that both local and foreign workers are treated equally.*

• **Thank You.**
ANNEX 4: GROUP 3: BIODIVERSITY, ECOSYSTEM SERVICES; POLLUTION PREVENTION AND CONTROL, GHG EMISSIONS AND RESOURCES EFFICIENCY

SO 3. Sauvegardes opérationnelles relatives à la Biodiversité et aux services écosystémiques
SO 4. Sauvegardes opérationnelles relatives à la prévention et le contrôle de la pollution, les Gaz à effet de serre, les matières dangereuses et l'utilisation efficiente des ressources

Participants:
Président: Ghana: Fredua AGYEMAN, MINISTRY OF ENVIRONMENT
Rapporteur: Benin: Josea S. DOSSOU-BODJRENOU (Nature Tropicale ONG)
Membres:
Nigeria : Eugene O. ITUA, SRAdEv
Gambie : Muhammad M JAGANA
Cote d'Ivoire : Koffi Jules LOUKOU, FEREADD

Méthodologie
Lecture et commentaires sont faits sur le plan général du document. Ensuite, il est allé paragraphe par paragraphe pour l'approfondissement.

Recommandations
- Renforcement des capacités des parties prenantes au niveau institutionnel (états, société civile, privés);
- Continuité des actions en mettant en place des points focaux (état, société civile par pays);
- Gestion des projets au niveau des pays doit se faire avec des équipes stables qui ne doivent pas muter de façon arbitraire et non politique ou tribaliste…;
- Il faut beaucoup plus de transparence depuis l’élaboration du projet jusqu’à sa finalisation, son financement et la mise en œuvre par les parties prenantes.

merci beaucoup
ANNEX 3: CLOSING REMARKS

Closing Remarks by Dr. Jare Adejuwon, Department of Climate Change, Federal Ministry of Environment at the end of the Regional Consultation for Western Africa on African Development Bank’s Integrated Safeguards System, Abuja, Nigeria, 17 May 2012.

The Federal Government of Nigeria would like to thank the African Development Bank for organizing this consultative forum among the five regions including the civil society organizations. During our deliberations, we have extensively discussed issues bordering on how the Bank would integrate safeguards into its existing operational system in order to ensure focused development programmes, effective implementation and quality outputs.

2. Given the intensity of our discussion in this meeting, we (both the organizers and the participants) are aware, more than ever before that integrating operational safeguards, with respect to environmental and social assessment, involuntary resettlement and biodiversity and ecosystem services while factoring in climate change activities, is a pathway to successful investments plan geared towards the development of our region by the African Development Bank.

3. The entire world community is unanimous that urgent action needs to be taken at all levels to reverse the causes of climate change. Hence, Africa must not be left behind. We should develop our abundant renewable energy resources to enhance energy efficiency, sustain our forests, and ensure efficient and rational use of water resources. We should all embark on ‘Green Economy’ that is socio-economic compliant.

4. The Government of Nigeria fully recognizes that failure to factor climate change and social and environmental safeguards into development planning and decision making will be one of the greatest single challenges towards the attainment of MDG targets.

5. Nigeria as a member of the international community is fully committed to playing its part as demonstrated by the fact that climate change and environment are key pillars
in our National Development strategies. We pledge our support to translate this positive initiative by working together with you to provide support to our own communities to address some of the most pressing environmental challenges that our region faces today.

6. To the African Development Bank – the organizer of this Forum, the distinguished participants have done their bit and offered inputs with respect to the discourse in the last three days. I am sure they would be honoured and compensated for their contributions and inputs if the Bank would consider their recommendations for adoption in your operational system to foster sustainable development in our region.

7. Once again, the Federal Ministry of Environment would like to thank the organizer for giving us the opportunity to be part of this event. We also thank the distinguished participants for coming to Nigeria. To some of us who have taken time to see the city, the security situation is not as bad as it is being reported. Government is taken every step to address the situation and very soon, it would become a thing of the past. If you still have time before your departure, please treat yourself to the glooming evening of Abuja.

8. I wish all of you safe trip back to your various countries. BON VOYAGE